Soap-Based Algicide/Demossers

Crops

1 2 **Identification of Petitioned Substance** 3 4 **Chemical Names:** 67701-09-1 (Potassium salts of fatty acids, C8-18) 5 Lauric acid, potassium salt 10124-65-9 (Potassium laurate) 6 Myristic acid, potassium salt 143-18-0 (Potassium oleate) 7 Oleic acid, potassium salt 63718-65-0 (Ammonium nonanoate) 8 Ricinoleic acid, potassium salt 9 Nonanoic acid, ammonium salt 10 **Other Codes:** 11 Other Name: Potassium salts of fatty acids, C8-18: 266-933-2 12 Potassium salts of fatty acids (EINECS), 079021 (EPA PC Code) 13 Ammonium salts of fatty acids Ammonium salts of fatty acids, C8-C18: 031801 14 (EPA PC Code) 15 **Trade Names:** 16 Axxe Broad Spectrum Herbicide 17 BioSafe Weed Control RTU **CAS Numbers:** 18 19 **Summary of Petitioned Use** The National Organic Program (NOP) final rule currently permits the use of soaps for a variety of purposes 20 21

in organic crop production: Soap-based algicides/demossers (7 CFR §205.601(a)(7)), soap-based herbicides

(7 CFR §205.601(b)(1)), ammonium soaps as animal repellents (7 CFR §205.601(d)) and insecticidal soaps (7

23 CFR 205.601(e)(8)). As an approved algicide/demosser, synthetic soaps salts are permitted for the control

24 of algae and mosses in and around production areas, including walkways, greenhouse surfaces and

25 irrigation systems. This technical evaluation report provides updated and targeted technical information to

26 augment the 1996 Technical Advisory Panel Review on soap-based herbicides for the National Organic

Standards Board's review of these algicidal substances under the sunset process. 27

Characterization of Petitioned Substance

28 29 30

31

22

Composition of the Substance:

- Soap-based herbicides considered in the current technical review include potassium and ammonium salts
- 32 of fatty acids. In general, soap salts consist of a fatty acid component with carbon (C), hydrogen (H) and
- 33 oxygen (O) atoms, as well as potassium (K^+) or ammonium (NH_4^+) counterions. Potassium salts of fatty
- 34 acids (C₁₂-C₁₈ saturated and C₁₈ unsaturated) include individual soap salts such as potassium laurate
- 35 $(C_{12}H_{23}O_2^+ K^-; Figure 1)$, potassium myristate $(C_{14}H_{27}O_2^- K^+)$, potassium oleate $(C_{18}H_{33}O_2^+ K^-)$ and
- 36 potassium ricinoleate (C₁₈H₃₃O₃+ K-). Likewise, ammonium salts of fatty acids include constituent
- 37 compounds ranging in size from eight to 18 carbons in length (US EPA, 2013). Ammonium nonanoate
- 38 (C₉H₁₇O₂- NH₄+), also known as the ammonium salt of pelargonic acid, is the most commonly encountered
- 39 ammoniated fatty acid in commercially available soap-based herbicide products (OMRI, 2014).
- 40 Commercially available soap-based algicides and demossers are typically formulated as mixtures of
- 41 potassium or ammonium salts of fatty acids.

Potassium Laurate Ammonium Nonanoate
$$(C_{12}H_{23}O_2^-K^+)$$
 $(C_9H_{17}O_2^-NH_4^+)$

Figure 1. Soap salts include potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids. Potassium laurate and ammonium nonanoate are example constituents of soap-based herbicides.

Source or Origin of the Substance:

A variety of preparatory methods are employed depending on the desired soap salt composition of a particular algicide formulation. Potassium salts of fatty acids are produced through a process known as saponification, whereby aqueous potassium hydroxide (KOH) is added to fatty acids commonly found in animal fats and plant oils (NPIC, 2001; Nora, 2010). Alternatively, ammonium salts of fatty acids, such as ammonium nonanoate, are produced through the room temperature reaction of aqueous ammonia (NH $_3$) or ammonium hydroxide (NH $_4$ OH) with fatty acids (Reiling, 1962; Dunn, 2010). See Evaluation Question #2 for details regarding the synthesis of potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids, as well as typical sources of fatty acids used in these syntheses.

Properties of the Substance:

Chemical and physical properties are generally available for fatty acids used in the production of soap-based algicides. Soap salts and their corresponding free fatty acids generally exist as colorless solids or liquids (EFSA, 2013), and are formulated as solutions in water when used as algicides. Fatty acids are poorly soluble in water in their undissociated (protonated) form; however, they are relatively water-soluble as potassium (K), sodium (Na), or other salts. The actual water solubility of long-chain fatty acids can be difficult to determine since this parameter is largely influenced by pH, and fatty acids commonly associate for form monolayers or micelles (Rustan & Drevon, 2005). Fatty acids are easily extracted using nonpolar solvents from solutions or suspensions by lowering the pH to form the uncharged carboxyl group (COOH) instead of the carboxylate (COO-) anion. Alternatively, increasing the pH (alkaline conditions) increases the water solubility through formation of the alkali metal salts (i.e., soap). Saturated fatty acids are very stable, whereas unsaturated (C=C bonds) fatty acids are susceptible to oxidation (Rustan & Drevon, 2005).

Nonanoic acid, a low molecular weight constituent fatty acid, is somewhat volatile (vapor pressure = 1.65×10^{-3} mm Hg), but is unlikely to volatilize since its dissociation constant (pKa = 4.9) indicates the substance will exist primarily in its water-soluble (ionized) form under environmental conditions (HSDB, 2008a; EFSA, 2013). Higher molecular weight fatty acids have larger ratios of nonpolar aliphatic regions to the polar carboxylate region, thus making them less water-soluble than low molecular weight acids. Although the vapor pressures of fatty acids generally decrease with increasing molecular weight, higher molecular weight fatty acids have similar dissociation constants as nonanoic acid (e.g., pKa = 5.3 for lauric acid) and should thus behave similarly to nonanoic acid in the environment (HSDB, 2008b).

Specific Uses of the Substance:

Commercially available pesticide products containing potassium, ammonium and sodium salts of fatty acids as the active ingredients are used for a variety of purposes in conventional and organic agriculture. Soap salt products are used as acaricides, algicides, herbicides, insecticides and animal repellents in residential, agricultural and commercial settings. Potassium salts of fatty acids are used as insecticides, acaricides, herbicides and algicides. Specifically, these soap salts control a variety of insects, mosses, algae, lichens, liverworts and other weeds, in or on many crops, ornamental flower beds, house plants, trees, shrubs, walks and driveways, as well as dogs and cats. Ammonium and sodium salts of fatty acids are used as rabbit and deer repellents on forage, grain, vegetable and field crops, in orchards, and on nursery stock, ornamentals, flowers, lawns, turf, vines, shrubs and trees. Ammonium soap salts are also formulated as herbicides to control common annual weeds (US EPA, 2013; US EPA, 1992). The most recent US EPA Environmental Fate and Ecological Risk Assessment for soap salts states that soap salts products may be applied at highly variable rates:

February 27, 2015 Page 2 of 17

88 89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101 102

103

104 105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112113

114

122

Terrestrial application rates are as high as 205 lbs/acre and as low as 1 lb/acre and below. Both potassium and ammonium salts uses have rates greater than 100 lbs/acre. The herbicidal products are generally applied as a spot treatment for weed control and as a broadcast spray or spot treatment for moss control, while the insecticidal products are applied broadcast using ground spray equipment. The high application rates for these products are practical only for spot treatments and usually are not applied to an entire acre but to thoroughly spray all plant (or tree) parts to achieve herbicidal or insecticidal control. Furthermore, the herbicidal products with high rates for moss control are labeled for lawns/turf, exterior building, and paving surfaces; not for agricultural field uses at rates ~10x lower than used for moss control.

The allowable use patterns for specific soap salt formulations are more restricted in organic agriculture. According to 7 CFR 205.601(a)(7), soap salts may be used as algicides and demossers in organic crop production. Unspecified soap salts are also allowed for use as insecticides, acaricides and for mite control (7 CFR 205.601(e)(8)). In addition, soap salts are permitted as herbicides for farmstead maintenance around roadways, ditches, right of ways and building perimeters, and for application to ornamental crops (7 CFR 205.601(b)(1)). Only ammonium salts of fatty acids may be used in organic crop production as large animal repellents. Although not strictly stated in the final rule, it is generally assumed that soap salts used as algicides, herbicides and insecticides consist of potassium or ammonium salts of fatty acids (US EPA, 2013).

Approved Legal Uses of the Substance:

Soap salt products are registered with US EPA as acaricides, algicides, herbicides, insecticides and animal repellents. These substances are intended for residential, agricultural and commercial use. Label-mandated application rates for products containing potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids range from 205 and 104 lb/acre, respectively, on the high end to as low as one lb/acre or less for soap salt active ingredients (US EPA, 2013). According to EPA regulations, C_{12} – C_{18} fatty acids (saturated and unsaturated) potassium salts and ammonium salts of C_8 – C_{18} saturated and C_8 – C_{12} unsaturated higher fatty acids are exempt from the requirement of a tolerance for residues in or on all raw agricultural commodities (40 CFR 180.1068, 40 CFR 180.1284). In addition, 40 CFR 180.910 established a tolerance exemption for residues of ammonium salts of fatty acids and fatty acid salts conforming to 21 CFR 172.863, including potassium salts of fatty acids, when used as inert ingredients in pesticide formulations applied to crops during or after the growing season (i.e., pre- or post-harvest).

The US Food and Drug Administration (FDA) classifies "salts of fatty acids" as Generally Recognized As Safe (GRAS) when used in food and in the manufacture of food components (7 CFR 172.863). According to the rule, aluminum, calcium, magnesium, potassium and sodium salts of fatty acids conforming with 21 CFR 172.860 and/or oleic acid derived from tall oil fatty acids conforming with 7 CFR 172.862 are food additives permitted for direct addition to food for human consumption. The listed salts of fatty acids are intended for use as binders, emulsifiers and anticaking agents in various foods. Ammonium salts of fatty acids are not included in the FDA's description of GRAS fatty acid salts.

Action of the Substance:

- Most algicides and demossers are considered contact pesticides because they cause injury to only the cell
- 124 walls or filaments that are exposed to the dissolved algicidal substance with little to no intercellular
- movement (Army Corps, 2012). Limited targeted information is available on soap-based algicides;
- however, the herbicidal and algicidal modes of action for soap salts are presumably related. The following
- 127 paragraph summarizes the mode of action for soap-based herbicides against vascular plants.
- 128 According to US EPA, the general herbicidal mode of action for soap salts involves the disruption of
- 129 photosynthesis through destruction of cell membranes, thereby resulting in plant/algae death (US EPA,
- 130 1992; US EPA, 2013). Formation of the fatty acid salt potassium, ammonium or sodium provides water
- solubility for the fatty acid(s) in the pesticide formulation (NPIC, 2001). The herbicidal mode of action for
- soap salts is generally considered identical to that of the corresponding free fatty acids. For example,
- 133 nonanoic acid (C9, saturated) applied to growing plants in sufficient quantities rapidly dessicates green
- tissue by removing the waxy cuticle of the plant and disrupting the cell membrane, resulting in cell leakage
- and tissue death. Fatty acids and soap salts such as nonanoic acid and ammonium nonanoate are not
- translocated in treated plants and provide no residual weed control. These substances are only effective as
- post-emergent herbicides, providing burndown of broadleaf weeds and most mosses (MMWD, 2010).

February 27, 2015 Page 3 of 17

Combinations of the Substance:

- Relevant pesticide formulations contain active ingredient mixtures consisting of soap salts and other
- substances. Several soap-based herbicide products are co-formulated with the conventional herbicide,
- 141 glyphosate, and therefore would not be allowed for use in organic production. Other ready-to-use soap salt
- insecticides are co-formulated with pyrethrins (0.01–0.24%), limonene (1%) and/or neem oil (0.9%). In
- 143 addition, some fungicidal, insecticidal and miticidal products contain a combination of fatty acid
- potassium salts and elemental sulfur at 0.4%-6.5% in ready-to-use and concentrated formulations.
- Naturally occurring pyrethrins, limonene and neem oil are allowed for use in organic crop production for
- weed control. Aliphatic alcohols, including ethyl alcohol (2–18%) and methanol (1%), as well as propylene
- glycol (37.8%) are listed as other known ingredients in a small number of soap salt products. Both ethyl
- alcohol (CAS # 64-17-5) and propylene glycol (CAS # 57-55-6) are US EPA List 4 inert ingredients (US EPA,
- 2004), and are therefore allowed for use in organic crop production under 7 CFR 205.601(m)(1).
- Labels for currently registered soap salt products list potassium laurate, potassium salts of fatty acids,
- ammonium nonanoate and/or related substances as the active ingredients but do not always include the
- identity of "other ingredients." Product formulations are considered confidential business information, and
- 153 manufacturers of soap-based herbicides, algicides and demossers may occasionally reformulate these
- 154 products. As a result, it is rarely possible to know with certainty the identity of all adjuvants and other
- inert ingredients used in commercially available products.

156 Status

157 158

172

138

Historic Use:

- 159 Although soap has been known and used for centuries, industrial-scale soap production did not fully
- develop in the United States until the second half of the 19th century when personal cleanliness became
- 161 culturally emphasized (Kostka & McKay, 2002). It is unclear how long soap-based herbicides have been
- used in conventional agriculture. However, the first pesticide product containing soap salts as an active
- ingredient was registered in the United States in 1947 (US EPA, 1992). Soap-based herbicides were added to
- the National List of Allowed and Prohibited Substances for use in organic crop production based on the
- NOSB's 1996 Technical Advisory Panel (TAP) Review of the active substance (USDA, 1996).
- 166 The NOSB recommended against the explicit use of ammonium salts of fatty acids as herbicides in organic
- 167 crop production in 2007 and 2008 (USDA, 2007; USDA, 2008). During both reviews, the NOSB voted to
- 168 reject the use of ammonium soap salts due to the availability of numerous alternative weed management
- 169 practices and incompatibility of the substance with the provisions of the Organic Foods Production Act
- 170 (OFPA) for general use on crops or cropland. However, these rulings are not directly relevant to the
- 171 current sunset review of soap salts used as algicides and demossers in operations producing organic crops.

Organic Foods Production Act, USDA Final Rule:

- 173 Synthetically produced soap-based algicides and herbicides are eligible for use in organic production due
- to their listing in Section 2118 of the Organic Foods Production Act of 1990 (OFPA). Specifically, the OFPA
- states that the National List may allow the use of substances that would otherwise be prohibited under
- organic regulations (i.e., synthetics) if the substance contains an active ingredient in the following
- 177 categories: "copper and sulfur compounds; toxins derived from bacteria; pheromones, soaps, horticultural
- oils, fish emulsions, treated seed, vitamins and minerals; livestock parasiticides and medicines and
- 179 production aids including netting, tree wraps and seals, insect traps, sticky barriers, row covers, and
- 180 equipment cleansers" (OFPA 2118(c)(B)(i)).
- The National Organic Program (NOP) final rule currently permits the use of soaps for a variety of purposes
- in organic crop production: Soap-based algicides/demossers (7 CFR §205.601(a)(7)), soap-based herbicides
- 183 (7 CFR §205.601(b)(a)), ammonium soaps as animal repellents (7 CFR §205.601(d)) and insecticidal soaps (7
- 184 CFR 205.601(e)(8)). As an approved algicide/demosser, synthetic soaps salts are permitted for the control
- of algae and mosses in and around production areas, including walkways, greenhouse surfaces and
- 186 irrigation systems. The NOP final rule indicates that ammonium soaps are permitted as large animal

February 27, 2015 Page 4 of 17

- 187 repellents but may not come into contact with soil or the edible portion of crops. Several OMRI-approved
- herbicides/algicides are formulated with ammonium soaps, such as ammonium nonanoate (OMRI, 2014). 188

189 **International**

- 190 Several of the international organizations surveyed have provided guidance on the use of soap-based
- 191 pesticide products in organic production. Among these are regulatory agencies (Canada, Japan and the EU)
- 192 and independent organic standards organizations (Codex and IFOAM). International organic regulations
- 193 and standards concerning soap salts are described in the following subsections.
- 194 Canadian General Standards Board
- 195 The Canadian Organic Production Systems Permitted Substances List provides several use patterns for
- 196 soaps in organic crop and livestock production, as well as organic processing. Section 4.3 – Crop
- 197 Production Aids and Materials – lists "soaps (including insecticidal soaps) consisting of fatty acids derived
- 198 from animal or vegetable oils" as allowed substances. Ammonium soaps are listed in this section for "large
- 199 animal control only; no contact with soil or edible portion of crop allowed." This listing for ammonium
- 200 soaps is also reproduced in Section 6.6 – Processing Aids. Finally, soap-based algicides (demossers) are
- included for use in Section 7.4 Cleaners, disinfectants and sanitizers allowed on food contract surfaces 201
- 202 including equipment provided that substances are removed from food contact surfaces prior to organic
- 203 production (CAN, 2011).
- 204 European Union
- 205 European organic regulations allow the use of soap salts in crop and livestock production as insecticides
- 206 and disinfecting agents. Article 5(1) of Commission Regulation (EC) No 889/2008 states that products
- 207 referred to in Annex II of this regulation may be used in organic production when plants cannot be
- 208 adequately protected from pests and diseases by the prescribed measures in Article 12 (a)(a), (b), (c), and
- 209 (g) of Regulation (EC) 834/2007. Fatty acid potassium salts (soft soap) are allowed for use only as
- 210 insecticides in organic crop production. In addition, Article 23 (4) of 889/2008 states that products listed in
- 211 Annex VI of the regulation – including potassium and sodium soap – may be used for cleaning and
- disinfection of livestock building installations and utensils (EC, 2008). 212
- 213 Codex Alimentarius Commission
- 214 The Codex Alimentarius Commission Guidelines for the Production, Processing, Labeling and Marketing
- 215 of Organically Produced Foods only allows the use of soaps in organic crop production. Specifically, the
- guidelines indicate that only "potassium soap (soft soap)" is an allowed synthetic substance for plant pest 216
- and disease control (Codex, 2013). 217
- 218 Japanese Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
- 219 Similar to the Codex guidelines described above, the Japanese Ministry for Agriculture, Forestry and
- 220 Fisheries permits the use of "potash soap (soft soap)" – which correspond to potassium salts of fatty
- 221 acids – for the control of pests in organic crop production (JMAFF, 2012).
- 222 International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements
- 223 The IFOAM Norms include a number of allowed use patterns for soaps in organic production. Appendix 3
- 224 of the Norms lists soft soap (i.e., potassium salts of fatty acids) as an allowed crop protectant and growth
- 225 regulator. Appendix 4, Table 2 states that potassium and sodium soaps may be used as equipment
- 226 cleansers and equipment disinfectants in food processing if "an intervening event or action" is taken to
- 227 eliminate the risk of food contamination with the substance. Potassium and sodium soaps are similarly
- 228 allowed as substances for pest and disease control and disinfection in livestock housing and equipment
- 229 according to Appendix 5 of the IFOAM Norms (IFOAM, 2014).

Evaluation Questions for Substances to be used in Organic Crop or Livestock Production

230

231

Evaluation Question #1: Indicate which category in OFPA that the substance falls under: (A) Does the 232

233 substance contain an active ingredient in any of the following categories: copper and sulfur

234 compounds, toxins derived from bacteria; pheromones, soaps, horticultural oils, fish emulsions, treated

Page 5 of 17 February 27, 2015

seed, vitamins and minerals; livestock parasiticides and medicines and production aids including

netting, tree wraps and seals, insect traps, sticky barriers, row covers, and equipment cleansers? (B) Is

237 the substance a synthetic inert ingredient that is not classified by the EPA as inerts of toxicological

concern (i.e., EPA List 4 inerts) (7 U.S.C. § 6517(c)(1)(B)(ii))? Is the synthetic substance an inert

239 ingredient which is not on EPA List 4, but is exempt from a requirement of a tolerance, per 40 CFR part

240 **180**3

236

254

255

256257

258

259260

261262

263

264

265

266

267268

269

270

271

272

273274

275

241 (A) Soap-based algicide/demossers contain potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids, which are commonly referred to as soaps.

243 (B) According to 40 CFR 180.910, residues of ammonium salts of fatty acids and salts of fatty acids

conforming to 21 CFR 172.863, including potassium salts of fatty acids, are exempt from the requirement of

a tolerance when used as inert ingredients in pesticide formulations applied to crops during or after the

246 growing season (i.e., pre- or post-harvest).

247 Individual constituents of soaps (e.g., 9-octadecenoic acid (9Z)-, potassium salt) and various types of soap

salts (e.g., potassium coconut oil soap, potassium salts of fatty acids (C8-C18 and C18 unsatd.) are

classified as EPA List 4A and 4B inerts of minimal concern (US EPA, 2004a; US EPA, 2004b).

250 <u>Evaluation Question #2:</u> Describe the most prevalent processes used to manufacture or formulate the

petitioned substance. Further, describe any chemical change that may occur during manufacture or

formulation of the petitioned substance when this substance is extracted from naturally occurring plant,

253 animal, or mineral sources (7 U.S.C. § 6502 (21)).

Kostka & McKay, 2002).

A variety of preparatory methods are employed depending on the desired soap salt composition for a particular herbicide/algicide formulation. Potassium salts of fatty acids are produced through a process known as saponification, whereby aqueous potassium hydroxide (KOH) is added to fatty acids found in animal fats and plant oils (NPIC, 2001; Nora, 2010). Specifically, modern sources of potassium soap salts are prepared through the hydrolysis of triglycerides using water under high pressure and temperature in the range of 50 atm and 200 °C (Ball, 2011). A carbonate (CO₃²-) or hydroxide (OH-) salt of an alkali metal (potassium or sodium) is then used to trap the free fatty acids as the corresponding soap salts. Likewise, ammonium salts of fatty acids are produced through the room temperature reaction of aqueous ammonia (NH₃) or ammonium hydroxide (NH₄OH) with fatty acids (Reiling, 1962; Dunn, 2010). Commonly used fats (i.e., triglyceride substances) include coconut oil, sunflower oil, palm oil, tallow and olive oil. Equation 1 depicts the conversion of a fat containing the triglyceride glycerin trilaurate to the corresponding potassium soap salt using potassium hydroxide as the alkali species (Burns-Moguel, 2014;

Equation 1. Potassium soaps are generally produced through the reaction of fats with potassium hydroxide in water. *Adapted from Burns-Moguel*, 2014.

The natural fats and oils used to generate soap salts are composed of mixtures of triglycerides derived from fatty acids of varying chain lengths ranging from 12 to 24 carbons. For example, the majority of fatty acids chains in the triglycerides of olive oil contain 16 or 18 carbons in saturated or unsaturated carbon frameworks (Mailer, 2006). Therefore, the soaps used in pesticide products are mixtures of fatty acid salts having a variety of carbon chain lengths, and generally do not consist exclusively of one soap salt compound (e.g., potassium laurate).

February 27, 2015 Page 6 of 17

286287

288

289

290

291292

293

306

307

Ammonium nonanoate is the most commonly used ammonium soap salt in commercially available

277 herbicide, algicide and insecticide products (US EPA, 2014). Synthetic sources of nonanoic acid can be

industrially prepared through the reaction with of unsaturated hydrocarbons (alkenes) with carbon

279 monoxide (CO) and hydrogen (H₂) in the presence of a transition-metal catalyst (i.e., hydroformylation,

also known as the "oxo process"), by oxidation or ozonation of oleic acid, by oxidation of methylnonyl

281 ketone, or from heptyl iodide using the malonic ester synthesis (HSDB, 2008). A petition submitted to the

NOSB by Falcon Lab, LLC indicates that blowing air through naturally derived oleic acid (sourced from

agriculturally-produced edible fats and oils) provides a 50/50 mixture of nonanoic acid and azelaic acid.

These components are subsequently separated by distillation. Once purified, the isolated nonanoic acid is

treated with an agueous solution of ammonia (NH₃) and stirred at room temperature until full conversion

to ammonium nonanoate is achieved (Smiley & Beste, 2009).

<u>Evaluation Question #3:</u> Discuss whether the petitioned substance is formulated or manufactured by a chemical process, or created by naturally occurring biological processes (7 U.S.C. § 6502 (21)).

According to USDA organic regulations, the NOP defines synthetic as "a substance that is formulated or manufactured by a chemical process or by a process that chemically changes a substance extracted from naturally occurring plant, animal, or mineral sources" (7 CFR 205.2). Although plant oils and animal fats are naturally occurring organic materials, the fatty acid soap salts used in pesticide products are generated through chemical reactions with concentrated aqueous solutions of alkali metal hydroxide (e.g., potassium

294 hydroxide) or ammonium hydroxide. Specifically, potassium and ammonium soap salts are formed via

295 two sequential processes: base-mediated hydrolysis of the triglyceride molecule to release three

equivalents of free fatty acids followed by formation of the corresponding potassium or ammonium soap

salts (Burns-Moguel, 2014; Kostka & McKay, 2002). Commercially available ammonium nonanoate is

formed through the reaction of aqueous ammonia (NH₃) with nonanoic acid (Smiley & Beste, 2009).

Nonanoic acid is a naturally occurring fatty acid; however, sources of nonanoic acid used in pesticide

products are most likely produced synthetically via oxidation and/or ozonation (HSDB, 2008). Based on

the available manufacturing information and NOP definitions, we conclude that potassium and

ammonium salts of fatty acids used as active ingredients in approved herbicide/algicide products are

produced using chemical processes and are therefore synthetic substances. The NOSB previously classified

these substances as synthetic; therefore, soaps are currently included in section 205.601, which only lists

synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production.

<u>Evaluation Question #4:</u> Describe the persistence or concentration of the petitioned substance and/or its by-products in the environment (7 U.S.C. § 6518 (m) (2)).

The environmental fate and transport of soap salt compounds is largely based on experimental information

for the corresponding fatty acids. Indeed, fatty acids—such as nonanoic acid—are weak organic acids that

310 partially or fully dissociate in water to form carboxylate anions under environmentally relevant conditions

311 (MMWD, 2010). Because soap salts are simply the potassium and ammonium salts of the dissociated fatty

acid carboxylate, we will focus on the environmental fate pathways for common fatty acids, including

nonanoic acid (C9, saturated), lauric acid (C12, saturated), and oleic acid (C18, unsaturated), as well as

available fate and transport summaries for ammonium and potassium soaps.

- 315 Based on their physical properties, soaps and fatty acids are expected to interact with both the organic and
- inorganic components of soils. Undissociated fatty acids should have low to practically no mobility in soils
- based on estimated soil organic carbon-water partition coefficients (K_{oc} values) of 1,700 to 340,000 mL/g.
- Based on the pKa values for these three representative compounds (pKa = 4.95–5.3), fatty acids will exist
- almost entirely as the corresponding carboxylate (anionic form) in the environment; anions generally do
- 320 not absorb more strongly to soils containing organic carbon relative to their neutral (undissociated)
- 321 counterparts. Volatilization from moist soil is not an important fate process based on the pKa values
- 322 (HSDB, 2008a; HSDB, 2008b; HSDB, 2008c). Biodegradation is expected to be an important fate process for
- oleic acid in soils based on measured half-lives of 0.2 and 0.66 days in screening tests (HSDB, 2008c).
- Further, aerobic soil half-lives and terrestrial field test half-lives are estimated as less than one day for
- potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids (Thurston County, 2009a; Thurston County, 2009b).
- 326 Soap salts and fatty acids are expected to adsorb to suspended solids and sediment when released to
- 327 bodies of water based on the reported K_{oc} values for representative fatty acids. In addition, the pKa values

February 27, 2015 Page 7 of 17

- 328 indicate that fatty acids will exist almost entirely in carboxylate (anionic) form at environmentally relevant
- 329 pH levels; therefore, volatilization from water surface is an unlikely fate process. Hydrolysis is unlikely for
- 330 fatty acids due to the lack of functional groups that are readily hydrolyzed under environmental
- 331 conditions. Indeed, hydrolysis of potassium salts of fatty acids did not occur over a period of 43 days in a
- 332 registrant-submitted study (US EPA, 2013). The bioconcentration factors (BCFs) for nonanoic acid (BCF = 3)
- 333 and oleic (BCF = 10) suggest the potential for accumulation in aquatic organisms is low. In contrast, the
- 334 BCF of 255 for lauric acid in zebrafish is indicative of bioaccumulation in aquatic organisms (Van Egmond,
- 335 1999). Fatty acids such as lauric acid are readily biotransformed to metabolites, including less polar
- 336 triglyceride molecules, which are natural components of animal diets (Van Egmond, 1999; US EPA, 2013).
- 337 When released to air, fatty acids can exist in both the particulate and vapor phases and are readily
- 338 degraded via photochemical processes. Shorter-chain fatty acids (nonanoic acid) are likely to exist solely as
- a vapor in the atmosphere based on a vapor pressure of 1.65×10⁻³ mm Hg at 25 °C, whereas the vapor 339
- 340 pressures for lauric acid (1.6×10⁻⁵ mm Hg at 25 °C) and oleic acid (5.46×10⁻⁷ mm Hg at 25 °C) suggest that
- 341 longer-chain fatty acids will exist in both the vapor and particulate phases in the atmosphere. Vapor phase
- 342 fatty acids are degraded in the atmosphere by reaction with photochemically produced hydroxyl radicals
- 343 with half-lives ranging from several hours to 1.6 days. Particulate-phase fatty acids will be removed from
- 344 the atmosphere by wet and dry deposition processes. In addition, vapor-phase unsaturated fatty acids —
- 345 such as oleic acid – will be degraded in the atmosphere through reaction with ozone; half-lives of 1.4–2.1
- 346 hours have been calculated for this reaction (HSDB, 2008a; HSDB, 2008b; HSDB, 2008c).
- Evaluation Question #5: Describe the toxicity and mode of action of the substance and of its 347
- breakdown products and any contaminants. Describe the persistence and areas of concentration in the 348
- 349 environment of the substance and its breakdown products (7 U.S.C. § 6518 (m) (2)).
- 350 The acute and chronic toxicity of soap salts is markedly different for land- and water-dwelling organisms.
- 351 Terrestrial animals – including mammals, birds, and insects – are largely unaffected by exposure to even
- 352 high doses of potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids, while aquatic animals are moderately (fish) to
- highly (crustaceans) sensitive to these substances (Thurston County, 2009a; Thurston County, 2009b). This 353
- 354 section summarizes the available information regarding the toxicity of various soap salt formulations.
- 355 US EPA has waived all generic mammalian toxicity data requirements for potassium and ammonium soap
- salts due to the lack of effects at high doses in the available toxicity literature. Indeed, potassium salts of 356
- 357 fatty acids are generally recognized as safe (GRAS) by the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA).
- 358 Laboratory testing has demonstrated that potassium and ammonium soaps are practically non-toxic on an
- 359 acute oral exposure basis with doses lethal to 50% of test rats (LD₅₀ values) of greater than 5,000 mg/kg-
- 360 day (Toxicity Category V). Potassium and ammonium soap salts are broken down in the environment and
- 361 metabolized when ingested in small amounts. Chronic health effects are not anticipated following
- 362 exposure to soap salts by any commonly anticipated exposure routes. However, potassium and
- 363 ammonium soaps are severe eye irritants and mildly irritating to the skin. Further, soaps salts have caused
- 364 reproductive and mutagenic effects when fed to test animals at excessively high doses (US EPA, 2012; US
- EPA, 1992), but are not reported to be carcinogenic by the International Agency for Research on Cancer 365
- (IARC, 2014). 366
- 367 Soap salts are practically non-toxic (Toxicity Category V) to birds and honey bees on an acute exposure
- 368 basis. Potassium and ammonium soaps caused no mortality or sub-lethal effects at doses up to and
- including 2,450 mg a.i./kg body weight (oral, gavage) and 5,620 mg a.i./kg diet (oral, dietary) in upland 369
- 370 game birds and waterfowl. Because birds act as surrogates for reptiles and terrestrial-phase amphibians, it
- 371 is generally assumed that potassium and ammonium soaps are practically non-toxic to reptiles and
- 372 terrestrial amphibians. The acute contact toxicity test in honey bees using potassium and ammonium soaps
- 373 provided a 48-hour LD₅₀ of greater than 100 μ g a.i./bee (μ g = microgram), suggesting that soap salts are
- 374 practically non-toxic to these beneficial insects. Saturating bees with soap solution, on the other hand,
- would likely result in death. While the honey bee is relatively insensitive to insecticidal soaps, soft-bodied 375
- 376 insects such as aphids, whiteflies, and mealy bugs are more susceptible to the toxic effects of soaps (US EPA, 2013). Accordingly, soaps are frequently used as contact insecticides to control many of these pests. 377
- 378 Studies submitted to US EPA for registration of potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids indicate that
- 379 potassium salts are generally more toxic to aquatic organisms than their ammonium counterparts. Based

February 27, 2015 Page 8 of 17

on data from the most sensitive species, potassium soap salts are moderately toxic to freshwater fish and marine/estuarine invertebrates on an acute exposure basis. Concentrations lethal to 50% of test organisms over four days of exposure (96-hour LC₅₀ values) for freshwater rainbow trout (Onchorhynchus mykiss) and the marine/estuarine mysid shrip (Americamysis bahia) are 9.19 mg a.i./L (a.i. = active ingredient) and 1.2 mg a.i./L, respectively, placing potassium soap salts in the moderate toxicity category (US EPA, 2013). Further, potassium soaps are highly toxic to freshwater invertebrates such as the freshwater water flea (Daphnia spp.), with immobility observed in 50% of experimental water fleas exposed to 0.57 mg a.i./L over a two-day period. In contrast, ammonium soaps are classified as slightly toxic to freshwater fish and both freshwater and marine/estuarine invertebrates, and practically non-toxic to marine/estuarine fish on an acute exposure basis.

As registered herbicides and algicides, soaps are toxic to aquatic plants and algae. US EPA recently reviewed nine new industry-sponsored studies on the toxicity of ammonium and potassium soap salts to aquatic plants. Nonvascular plants were typically more sensitive than vascular plants to soap salts. Cell density measurements of the most sensitive species tested – the freshwater diatom (*Navicula pelliculosa*) – were used to determine a 96-hour no observed adverse effect concentration (NOAEC) of 0.39 mg a.i./L for exposure to potassium salts of fatty acids (US EPA, 2013). The corresponding value for exposure of green algae (*Pseudokirchneriella subcapitata*) to ammonium salts of fatty acids was 2.9 mg a.i./L (US EPA, 2013). Because these soap salts rapidly degrade by metabolism, no soap salt residues were detected at the end of these studies (four to seven days in duration).

Evaluation Question #6: Describe any environmental contamination that could result from the petitioned substance's manufacture, use, misuse, or disposal (7 U.S.C. § 6518 (m) (3)).

As stated in the response to Evaluation Question #4, potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids decompose rapidly and do not accumulate or persist in the environment. Further, contact herbicides and algicides such as soap salts must be sprayed directly on the undesirable plant or algal growth to induce toxic effects in the target organisms (US EPA, 2013). Environmental contamination is thus unlikely for normal use of soap-based herbicide and algicide products. Misuse or improper disposal of products containing potassium and ammonium soaps may result in temporary/reversible environmental contamination. Nevertheless, the impacts of soap salt contamination are likely to be minimal due to the propensity for these compounds to rapidly degrade when released to the environment.

Chemicals used during the soap salt manufacturing process may also lead to contamination is released to the environment. Specifically, the strong bases (e.g., potassium hydroxide) used to manufacture soaps also result in the formation of alkaline (high pH) waste byproducts (Burns-Moguel, 2014). In addition, accidental spills of natural fats and oils in large quantities would be problematic for terrestrial and aquatic organisms. Aquatic organisms are particularly sensitive to oils, which cause oxygen depletion in the receiving water body through the formation of films and the metabolic activities of aquatic microorganisms (NOAA, 2010). Drums used to transport soap oils are kept tightly sealed to minimize the likelihood of large volume oil spills (Burns-Moguel, 2014). Accidental spills of chemical reagents are generally unlikely for modern soap producers employing good manufacturing practices and emergency waste interceptors.

<u>Evaluation Question #7:</u> Describe any known chemical interactions between the petitioned substance and other substances used in organic crop or livestock production or handling. Describe any environmental or human health effects from these chemical interactions (7 U.S.C. § 6518 (m) (1)).

Technical information was not identified regarding known chemical interactions between potassium and/or ammonium salts of fatty acids and other substances allowed for use in organic production or handling. The RED (US EPA, 1992) and recent Environmental Fate Assessment (US EPA, 2013) state that soaps of higher fatty acids are not compatible with soluble metallic salts such as zinc, manganese, and iron sulfates, but do not provide further details regarding the likelihood for these interactions. This interaction is potentially problematic in organic crop production since soluble metallic salts are permitted for use as soil amendments/micronutrients when soil deficiency is documented by testing. According to the NOP final rule, sulfate, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, manganese, iron, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt are allowed in organic crop production as micronutrients (7 CFR 205.601(j)(6)(ii)). The available data sources do not describe the potential environmental or health effects resulting from the combination

data sources do not describe the potential environmental or health effects resulting from the combination of these incompatible materials.

February 27, 2015 Page 9 of 17

- 432 Material Safety Data Sheet (MSDS) language for the ready-to-use Safer® Brand Insect Killing Soap with
- 433 Seaweed Extract (2.0% potassium salts of fatty acids) states that the product is incompatible with
- concentrated mineral supplements/fertilizers, strong oxidizers and acids (Woodstream Corporation, 2014).
- 435 Evaluation Question #8: Describe any effects of the petitioned substance on biological or chemical
- 436 interactions in the agro-ecosystem, including physiological effects on soil organisms (including the salt
- index and solubility of the soil), crops, and livestock (7 U.S.C. § 6518 (m) (5)).
- Specific information was not identified for soap salts regarding potential effects on biological or chemical
- interactions in the agro-ecosystem associated with algicide/demosser uses. As discussed in the responses
- 440 to previous evaluation questions, potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids are expected to rapidly
- degrade primarily by microbial action once released to soils. Potassium and ammonium ions are
- 442 incorporated into the soil in addition to organic material produced through microbial degradation of the
- fatty acid component of soap salts. The addition of ammonium ions associated with herbicide treatments
- should be minimal compared to the amount of nitrogen naturally present in soils due to the nitrogen cycle.
- 445 For perspective, the highest application rate for ammonium salts of fatty acids is 205 lb a.i./acre, which
- corresponds to 8.3 lb nitrogen/acre for ammonium nonanoate (8% nitrogen by weight). As a point of
- comparison, legume cover crops such as crimson clover, red clover and Hairy vetch can release any
- where from 70 to 175 pounds of nitrogen per acre to the soil (Ketterings, 2011; Wickline & Rayburn, 2008;
- Duiker & Curran, 2014). Likewise, potassium is required in relatively large amounts for plant growth, and
- 450 the macronutrient is commonly added as part of fertilizer regimens to deficient soils in conventional crop
- 451 production (Rehm & Schmitt, 2002). Based on this analysis, it seems unlikely that use of ammonium and
- 452 potassium soaps will have a significant impact on soil nitrogen and potassium levels.
- Potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids are used as fast acting herbicides, algicides and insecticides.
- 454 Pesticides formulated with ammonium salts control algae, broadleaf weeds (bittercress, chickweed, and
- liverwort), as well as grasses and other weeds (bentgrass, fescue, and wild onion) (Emery, 2014). Further,
- 456 products containing potassium soaps are effective against similar vegetative species, and help control
- mites, aphids, crickets, earwigs, lace bugs, leaf feeding caterpillars and beetles, leafhoppers, mealybugs,
- 458 plant bugs, scale crawlers, thrips, and whiteflies (Woodstream Corporation, 2009). As insecticides and
- 459 miticides, soap salts disrupt the exoskeletons of exposed insects, leading to insect death. It is therefore
- 460 reasonable to assume that soft-bodied insects and other soil organisms including earthworms, mites, and
- grubs are susceptible to the toxic effects of soap-based herbicides and algicides. Indeed, Davis et al. (1997)
- demonstrated that nonanoic acid (C9 fatty acid) has considerable nematicidal activity. It is likely that large-
- volume releases of soap salt solutions to the soil environment would temporarily disrupt local populations
- of beneficial soil insects and microorganisms; however, reports of ecological impairment were not
- 465 identified (US EPA, 2013).
- 466 In addition to the active substances, the manufacture of potassium and ammonium soap salts could lead to
- 467 adverse effects on environmental receptors. Specifically, reaction solutions containing strong bases (e.g.,
- 468 potassium hydroxide) could alter soil pH if released to the terrestrial environment due to improper
- 469 handling and/or disposal of these materials. Drastic changes in soil pH could alter bioavailability of
- 470 macro- and micronutrients for plants and beneficial soil microflora. No reports of contamination due to the
- 471 manufacture of soap-based herbicides and algicides were identified, and the risk of such events is
- 472 minimized when hazardous substances are treated according to state and federal law prior to disposal.
- 473 Information was not identified on the potential or actual impacts of potassium and ammonium soaps
- and/or manufacturing substances on endangered species, population, viability or reproduction of non-
- 475 target organisms and the potential for measurable reductions in genetic, species or eco-system biodiversity.
- 476 Evaluation Question #9: Discuss and summarize findings on whether the use of the petitioned
- 477 substance may be harmful to the environment (7 U.S.C. § 6517 (c) (1) (A) (i) and 7 U.S.C. § 6517 (c) (2) (A)
- 478 (i)).
- 479 Soaps salts essentially behave as the carboxylate anions of fatty acids when released to the environment. In
- general, potassium and ammonium salts of fatty acids decompose rapidly and do not accumulate or persist
- in the environment. Biodegradation in soil and water is expected to be the primary fate process for soaps,
- 482 with measured half-lives of less than one day for most fatty acid salts (Thurston County, 2009a; Thurston

February 27, 2015 Page 10 of 17

- County, 2009b). Particulate phase fatty acid salts will be removed from the atmosphere through wet and
- dry deposition, and unsaturated fatty acid anions will be degraded through reaction with ozone (HSDB,
- 485 2008c). While some fatty acids (e.g., lauric acid) may bioaccumulate in aquatic animals, this process occurs
- naturally through the ingestion of foods containing fatty acids (Van Egmond, 1999). The addition of
- 487 ammonium and potassium ions associated with herbicide and algicide treatments should be minimal
- compared to amounts typically observed in soils due to the nitrogen cycle and breakdown of compost
- 489 materials. Soaps salts are capable of disrupting the exoskeletons of soft-bodied insects, larvae, and other
- soil organisms (e.g., earthworms and nematodes) directly exposed to spray solutions (Davis, 1997; US EPA,
- 491 2013).
- Evaluation Question #10: Describe and summarize any reported effects upon human health from use of
- 493 the petitioned substance (7 U.S.C. § 6517 (c) (1) (A) (i), 7 U.S.C. § 6517 (c) (2) (A) (i)) and 7 U.S.C. § 6518
- 494 **(m) (4)).**

504

505

506 507

- 495 Potassium and ammonium soap salts are practically non-toxic through oral, dermal and inhalation
- 496 exposure routes. Indeed, potassium fatty acid salts are generally recognized as safe (GRAS) by the Food
- and Drug Administration (FDA) due to their presence in numerous food products and additives (US EPA,
- 498 2012). Ingested fatty acids are metabolized through cellular activity, where they are oxidized to compounds
- 499 that are used as an energy source and structural cell components (Thurston, 2009a; Thurston, 2009b). The
- 500 2012 qualitative human health risk assessment rationalized US EPA's decision to waive data requirements
- in accordance with the observed lack of effects at high doses, ubiquity of fatty acids in nature, and
- functionality of the substances in humans:

Fatty acids are normally metabolized by the cells, where they are oxidized to simple compounds for use as energy sources and as structural components utilized in all living cells. Sodium, potassium, and ammonium are normally part of the body's metabolism and electrolyte balance. Oral exposure to soaps is generally self-limiting because the taste of soap is unpleasant. Also, the ammonium soap salts have a notable ammonia odor that is self-limiting.

- Despite the lack of systemic toxicity associated with soap salts, both potassium and ammonium salts of
- fatty acids can lead to various forms of acute irritation. Potassium soaps are classified as corrosive to the
- skin based on severe erythema (skin redness) at both intact and abraded sites, as well as cracking and
- fissuring of epithelial layers. Based on corneal effects, potassium soaps are also considered to be severe eye
- 512 irritants. Ammonium salts of fatty acids are only moderately irritating to the skin, but are corrosive to the
- 513 eyes and may cause permanent eye damage in extreme exposure scenarios (US EPA, 2012). A query of the
- 514 California Department of Pesticide Regulation (CDPR) Pesticide Illness Surveillance Program (PISP) data
- 515 revealed no incidents of acute irritation or systemic poisoning following exposure to products containing
- only soap salts as the active ingredient between 1992 and 2011 (CDPR, 2014).
- 517 Reproductive and mutagenic effects were observed in laboratory animals administered soap salts at high
- doses. Skin reaction, irritability, weight loss and failure to maintain pregnancy were observed in mice
- treated with the highest doses (500 and 5,000 mg/kg-day) during gestation days two through 15. However,
- 520 the incidences of fetal loss, malformations, visceral or skeletal anomalies and skeletal variants were within
- 521 the historical control range (0–4.4%) for young mice in the 500 mg/kg-day dose group. Unscheduled DNA
- 522 synthesis was observed in mouse cells exposed to 35 mg/kg oleic acid, a potential soap salt precursor. In
- 523 addition, chromosomal abnormalities were observed in hamster fibroblasts and the bacterium
- 524 Saccharomyces cerevisiae, treated with 2,500 µg/L and 100 mg/L oleic acid, respectively (US EPA, 2012). The
- 525 international Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) has not listed potassium or ammonium soaps as
- 526 carcinogens (IARC, 2014).
- 527 Evaluation Question #11: Describe all natural (non-synthetic) substances or products which may be
- used in place of a petitioned substance (7 U.S.C. § 6517 (c) (1) (A) (ii)). Provide a list of allowed
- substances that may be used in place of the petitioned substance (7 U.S.C. § 6518 (m) (6)).
- A variety of alternative substances and practices are available for the prevention and control of algae in
- 531 agricultural production areas. Frequent and thorough disinfection is required to prevent algae from
- developing in warm, damp, nutrient rich areas such as greenhouses and walkways. While mosses prefer
- 533 cooler conditions, it grows vigorously in the moist, shady areas with restricted air movement and poor

February 27, 2015 Page 11 of 17

- drainage that also favor the development of algae (Le Strange, 2011). Evaluation Question #12 provides
- details on the manual cleaning and disinfection practices that minimize the occurrence of algae and mosses
- in production areas. According to greenhouse specialists, natural or synthetic disinfectants should be used
- on a routine basis as part of a pre-planting program and throughout the growing season to prevent
- problems with algae and mosses (Pundt, 2013).
- 539 Disinfectant substances are available for the control of existing algae and mosses or when preventative
- 540 measures provide insufficient control. Naturally produced organic acids including vinegar (acetic acid
- 541 active ingredient) and citric acid may be used as pesticides in organic production if the requirements of
- the "crop pest, weed, and disease management practice standard (7 CFR 205.206(e)) are met (OMRI, 2014).
- 543 This standard states that natural substances and synthetic substances approved for use on the National List
- may be used as pesticides when cultural practices (described in Evaluation Question #12) are insufficient to
- 545 prevent or control weeds. The available information indicates that white vinegar (5% acetic acid) or
- 546 commercial patio and path cleaners containing acetic acid may provide satisfactory control of algae and
- 547 mosses (RHS, 2014). Limonene the major component of citrus oil effectively controls several species of
- 548 moss on lawns, roofs, decks, driveways, walkways and fences (Golembiewski, 2008; Cutting Edge
- 549 Formulations Inc, 2014). Highway salt (calcium or sodium chloride) is extremely toxic to algae, mosses and
- weeds when scattered under benches and on walkways (Laemmlen, 1979). All of the substances described
- in this section are non-persistent; therefore, occasional retreatment is necessary for continuous control of
- 552 mosses and algae.
- 553 Disinfectants such as chlorine dioxide, hydrogen peroxide and sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate are
- 554 commonly used to control existing algae in greenhouse settings and allowed for use in organic crop
- 555 production (Pundt, 2013). According to the most recent OMRI product list, commercially available
- products containing soaps, hydrogen peroxide, limonene and sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate are
- allowed for use as demossers and algicides in organic production (OMRI, 2014). For example, the
- 558 OxiDate® product containing hydrogen peroxide (BioSafe Systems LLC, 2010), Moss Avenger Moss &
- 559 Algae Control product containing limonene (Cutting Edge Formulations Inc, 2014) and PAK® 27 Algaecide
- containing sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (Solvay Chemicals Inc, 2012) are OMRI-approved alternatives
- to soap-based demossers/algicides. Further, numerous other commercially available algicides and
- 562 demossers based on these alternative active ingredients are included in the updated OMRI product list
- 563 (OMRI, 2014).

571

573

574

575576

579

580

581 582

584 585

- The following is a comprehensive list of synthetic algicides, disinfectants and sanitizers (including
- irrigation system cleaners) permitted for use in organic crop production that may aid in the prevention or
- 566 control of algae and mosses:

| • Ethanol (CH ₃ CH ₂ OH) | 7 CFR 205.601(a)(1)(i) |
|--|------------------------|
|--|------------------------|

- 568 Isopropanol ((CH₃)₂CHOH) 7 CFR 205.601(a)(1)(ii)
 - Calcium hypochlorite [Ca(ClO)₂] 7 CFR 205.601(a)(2)(i)
 - Chlorine dioxide (ClO₂) 7 CFR 205.601(a)(2)(ii)
 - Sodium hypochlorite (NaClO) 7 CFR 205.601(a)(2)(iii)
- 572 Copper sulfate (CuSO₄) 7 CFR 205.601(a)(3)
 - For use as an algicide in aquatic rice systems; limited to one application per field during any 24-month period
 - Hydrogen peroxide (H₂O₂) 7 CFR 205.601(a)(4)
 - Ozone gas (O₃) 7 CFR 205.601(a)(5)
- 577 o For use as an irrigation system cleaner only
- Peracetic acid (CH₃CO₃H) 7 CFR 205.601(a)(6)
 - o For use in disinfecting equipment, seed, and asexually propagated planting material. Also permitted in hydrogen peroxide formulations as allowed in §205.601(a) at concentration of no more than 6% as indicated on the pesticide product label
 - Soap-based algicide/demossers 7 CFR 205.601(a)(7)
- Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate 7 CFR 205.601(a)(8)
 - Federal law restricts the use of this substance in food crop production to approved food uses identified on the product label

February 27, 2015 Page 12 of 17

592

593 594

595

596

597

598

599

600

601 602

603

604

605

606 607

608 609

610

611

612 613

614

615 616

617

618 619

620

621 622

623

624

625

626

628

629

630

631

632

633 634

635

636

637

In addition to the substances listed above, the available literature indicates that barley straw has been used 586 587 to control algal populations in irrigation ponds and reservoirs. Compounds released from the breakdown of barley in water are algistatic, and thus only prevent the growth of algae. When used in ponds, barley 588 straw must be added to the pond in later winter such that the material will break down and release 589 590 algistatic compounds before algae populations increase during warmer weather. One application of barley

straw can provide up to six months of algae control (Camberato & Lopez, 2010).

Evaluation Question #12: Describe any alternative practices that would make the use of the petitioned substance unnecessary (7 U.S.C. § 6518 (m) (6)).

Both mosses and algae are high moisture requiring plants, which thrive in intermediate light and shade. Not surprisingly, high humidity and standing water are common in greenhouses and other areas where mosses and algae are found. Improving drainage, reducing the amount or frequency of watering and increasing ventilation or air movement can greatly reduce the development of mosses and algae (Laemmlen, 1979). Proper ventilation reduces the moisture level in greenhouses, and can be accomplished using horizontal airflow fans and retractable roof or open roof greenhouse structures (Pundt, 2013). Installing surfaces that dry rapidly and remain dry for several hours between watering events do not favor the development of these species. When constructing walkways and greenhouses, it is helpful to incorporate a slight slope to cement walks or install drainage systems to minimize water accumulation on the surface. The use of porous materials such as gravel and cinders can also be helpful in minimizing the likelihood of algae problems by allowing the top of the walkway to drain and quickly dry after watering. The occurrence of mosses and algae in plant containers is indicative of overwatering, high humidity and/or ceiling droplets due to condensation within the greenhouse structure. Changing the watering protocol (schedule or volume) and ventilation patterns described above can help mitigate conditions leading to algae and moss growth in plant containers (Laemmlen, 1979). Operators should avoid overwatering plants, choose a growing media with appropriate drainage, and water containers only as needed to prevent the growth of moss and algae in greenhouse and nursery settings (Pundt, 2013).

As discussed in the response to Evaluation Question #11, regular cleaning – involving physical weed, debris and soil removal – is essential to avoiding the development of algae and moss. When possible, use wire benches that can be easily disinfected in greenhouses. Bench tops and worktables should be constructed from non-porous surfaces such as laminate that can be easily disinfected (Smith, 2014). Algae tend to grow on the surface of wooden benches creating an ideal environment for other pests, including fungus gnats, shore flies and various plant pathogens. High-pressure power washing can effectively remove dirt and other organic material from the walls and lower surfaces of greenhouses. Surfaces must be kept free of debris and weeds that may serve as nutrient sources for the growth of algae. Like these organic materials, organic fertilizer is used as a food source for developing algae. It is therefore important to avoid excessive fertilizer runoff and water puddles on floors, benches, and greenhouse surfaces (Smith, 2014).

In lieu of chemical controls, it may be necessary to physically remove algae and moss from affected areas. Carefully running a sharp knife and/or a block paving brush along the cracks, or using a pressure washer can effectively dislodge moss from between paving. Proper drainage in the affected area should be established prior to pressure washing to remove algae and moss. Regularly brushing hard surfaces with a stiff broom can help prevent small algae and moss growths from taking hold on hard surfaces. Likewise, raking loose surfaces such as gravel can help remove small deposits and keep these areas free of algae, moss and weeds (RHS, 2014).

627

Algae buildup can become a significant problem in irrigation systems. Whole algae cells and organic residues of algae are generally small enough to pass through the filters of irrigation systems. In some cases, algae transported from the water sources into the irrigation system may promote the formation of aggregates that plug emitters (spouts in drip irrigation systems). In addition, residues of decomposing algae can accumulate in pipes and emitters and support the growth of slime-forming bacteria (Haman, 2014). Reducing the amount of algae in the source water pond is essential to minimizing problems with algae in the lines and components of irrigation systems (Camberato & Lopez, 2010). The following factors influence algae growth in irrigation ponds:

Pond size and depth. Small, shallow ponds (high light and water temperature) facilitate algae growth.

February 27, 2015 Page 13 of 17

639 640

661

- Stagnant water, shallow depth. Limited wave action and movement favors algae.
- High levels of nutrients, especially phosphorus and nitrogen. These nutrients are food sources for algae.

Making physical alterations to the pond can help reduce algae problems. Since nutrients facilitate the

- development of large algae populations, reducing the amount of nitrogen and phosphorus nutrients that
- enter the bond should significantly reduce algae growth. In addition, installing a vegetation filter strip
- around the pond can reduce nutrient runoff into the water source. It may also be helpful to dredge and
- deepen existing ponds or reservoirs that have considerable areas of shallow water. In combination with the
- other control methods, installing an aerator may help reduce algae populations by dispersing and
- fragmenting algae colonies in the pond (Camberato & Lopez, 2010).
- 648 If prevention practices prove insufficient, physically removing filamentous algae growth provides
- immediate control without the introduction of chemical residues to the system. This practice can be
- effective for small-scale nurseries, but larger nurseries may require expensive harvesting equipment to
- 651 remove algae from ponds and reservoirs. It is important to note that all removed material should be
- deposited where the nutrients and algal fragments cannot re-enter the water source. Physical removal is
- not permanent, and therefore repeated removal events may be necessary throughout the growing season
- 654 (Camberato & Lopez, 2010).
- Lastly, biological control measures have also been used for algae control in irrigation ponds and reservoirs.
- Triploid grass carp introduced into ponds will feed on mat forming algae when their preferred food source
- is depleted. However, variable levels of control have been observed using carp (Camberato & Lopez, 2010).
- 658 Biological control is not generally employed in conventional production since chemical controls (e.g.,
- copper compounds) are more effective, but may provide sufficient control of algae populations when used
- in combination with other practices.

References

- Army Corps. 2012. Algaecides. US Army Corps of Engineers. Retrieved December 11, 2014 from
- 663 http://glmris.anl.gov/documents/docs/anscontrol/Algaecides.pdf.
- 664 Ball DW, Hill JW, Scott RJ. 2011. 17.2: Fats and Oils. In The Basics of General, Organic, and Biological
- 665 Chemistry, v. 1.0. Flat World Knowledge. Retrieved December 1, 2014 from
- 666 http://catalog.flatworldknowledge.com/bookhub/reader/2547?e=gob-ch17_s02.
- Ben Ghnaya A, Hanana M, Amri I, Balti H, Gargouri S, Jamoussi B, et al. 2013. Chemical composition of
- 668 Eucalyptus erythrocorys essential oils and evaluation of their herbicidal and antifungal activities. Journal
- of Pest Science 86: 571–577; doi:10.1007/s10340-013-0501-2.
- 670 BioSafe Systems LLC. 2010. Label: OxiDate® Broad Spectrum Bactericide/Fungicide. Retrieved December
- 671 12, 2014 from http://iaspub.epa.gov/apex/pesticides/f?p=PPLS:102:::NO::P102_REG_NUM:70299-2.
- Burns-Moguel A. 2014. Soap: Clean for the Environment or Just Us? Yale National Initiative® to strengthen
- 673 teaching in public schools. Yale University. Retrieved November 26, 2014 from
- 674 http://teachers.yale.edu/curriculum/viewer/initiative 11.05.01 u.
- 675 CAN. 2011. Organic Production Systems Permitted Substances Lists: CAN/CGSB-32.311-2006. Canadian
- 677 cgsb/programme-program/normes-standards/internet/bio-org/documents/032-0311-2008-eng.pdf.
- 678 CDPR. 2011. Pesticide Illness Surveillance Program. California Department of Pesticide Regulation.
- Retrieved December 3, 2014 from http://www.cdpr.ca.gov/docs/whs/pisp.htm.
- 680 Camberato DM, Lopez RG. 2010. Commercial Nursery and Greenhouse Production: Controlling Algae in
- 681 Irrigation Ponds. Purdue Extension. Retrieved December 10, 2014 from
- https://www.extension.purdue.edu/extmedia/HO/HO-247-W.pdf.

February 27, 2015 Page 14 of 17

- 683 Codex. 2013. Guidelines for the Production, Processing, Labelling, and Marketing of Organically Produced
- Foods. Codex Alimentarius Commission. Retrieved November 26, 2013 from
- 685 http://www.codexalimentarius.org/standards/list-of-standards/en/?no_cache=1.
- 686 Cutting Edge Formulations Inc. 2014. Label: Moss Avenger Moss & Algae Control. Retrieved December
- 687 12, 2014 from http://iaspub.epa.gov/apex/pesticides/f?p=PPLS:102:::NO::P102_REG_NUM:82052-6.
- 688 Davis EL, Meyers DM, Dullum CJ, Feitelson JS. 1997. Nematicidal activity of fatty acid esters on soybean
- 689 cyst and root-knot nematodes. Journal of nematology 29: 677.
- 690 Duiker S, Curran B. 2014. Management of Red Clover as a Cover Crop. Penn State Extension. Pennsylvania
- 691 State University. Retrieved December 3, 2014 from http://extension.psu.edu/plants/crops/soil-
- 692 <u>management/cover-crops/management-of-red-clover-as-a-cover-crop.</u>
- 693 Dunn KM. 2010. Scientific Soapmaking: The Chemistry of the Cold Process. Farmville, Virginia, Clavicula Press.
- 694 Chapter 10, page 182.
- 695 EC. 2008. Commission Regulation (EC) No. 889/2008. European Commission. Retrieved November 26,
- 696 2014 from http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2008:250:0001:0084:EN:PDF.
- 697 EFSA. 2013. Conclusion on the peer review of the pesticide risk assessment of the active substance Fatty
- 698 acids C7 to C18 (approved under Regulation (EC) No 1107/2009 as Fatty Acids C7 to C20. EFSA Journal
- 699 11(1): 3023. Retrieved November 25, 2014 from
- 700 http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3023.htm.
- 701 Emery. 2014. Label: Emery Agro 7040 Ready-to-Use (RTU). Emery Oleochemicals, LLC. Retrieved
- 702 December 3, 2014 from
- http://iaspub.epa.gov/apex/pesticides/f?p=PPLS:102:::NO::P102_REG_NUM:87663-5.
- Golembiewski R, Cook t, McDonald B. 2008. 2008 Evaluation of Efficacy of Citrus Oil, Worry Free Moss
- and Algae Control, Garden Safe Moss and Algae Killer, and Lilly Miller Moss-Out Applications to Control
- Lawn Moss. Department of Horticulture. Oregon State University. Retrieved December 11, 2014 from
- 707 <a href="http://horticulture.oregonstate.edu/content/2008-evaluation-efficacy-citrus-oil-worry-free-moss-and-decomposition-efficacy-citrus-oil-worry-fre
- 708 <u>algae-control-garden-safe-moss-and-algae-kil-0</u>.
- 709 HSDB. 2008a. National Library of Medicine, TOXNET. Nonanoic Acid. Hazardous Substances Data Bank.
- 710 Retrieved November 25, 2014 from http://toxnet.nlm.nih.gov/cgi-bin/sis/htmlgen?HSDB.
- HSDB. 2008b. National Library of Medicine, TOXNET. Dodecanoic Acid. Hazardous Substances Data Bank.
- Retrieved November 25, 2014 from http://toxnet.nlm.nih.gov/cgi-bin/sis/htmlgen?HSDB.
- 713 HSDB. 2008c. National Library of Medicine, TOXNET. Oleic Acid. Hazardous Substances Data Bank.
- Retrieved December 2, 2014 from http://toxnet.nlm.nih.gov/cgi-bin/sis/htmlgen?HSDB.
- 715 Haman DZ. 2014. Causes and Prevention of Emitter Plugging in Microirrigation Systems. IFAS Extension.
- 716 University of Florida. Retrieved December 11, 2014 from http://edis.ifas.ufl.edu/ae032.
- 717 IARC. 2014. Agents Classified by the IARC Monographs, Volumes 1-111. International Agency for Research
- on Cancer. Updated 23 October 2014. Retrieved December 2, 2014 from
- 719 http://monographs.iarc.fr/ENG/Classification/.
- 720 IFOAM. 2014. The IFOAM Norms for Organic Production and Processing. International Federation of
- 721 Organic Agriculture Movements. Retrieved November 26, 2014 from http://www.ifoam.org/en/ifoam-
- 722 <u>norms</u>.
- 723 JMAFF. 2012. Japanese Agricultural Standard for Organic Plants (Notification No. 1605). Japanese Ministry
- 724 of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. Retrieved November 26, 2014 from
- http://www.maff.go.jp/e/jas/specific/pdf/833_2012-3.pdf.

February 27, 2015 Page 15 of 17

- 726 Ketterings Q, Kingston J, Czymmek K, Caldwell B, Mohler C, Godwin G. 2011. Nitrogen Credits from Red
- 727 Clover as Cover Crop between Small Grains and Corn. Cornell University Cooperative Extension.
- Retrieved December 3, 2014 from http://nmsp.cals.cornell.edu/publications/factsheets/factsheet60.pdf.
- 729 Kostka K, McKay DD. 2002. Chemists Clean Up: A History and Exploration of the Craft of Soapmaking.
- How Soap Came to be Common in America. Journal of Chemical Education 79(10): 1172–1175.
- 731 Laemmlen F. 1979. Control of Mosses and Algae Under Greenhouse Conditions. MSU Cooperative
- 732 Extension Service. Michigan State University. Retrieved December 11, 2014 from
- http://archive.lib.msu.edu/DMC/Ag.%20Ext.%202007-Chelsie/PDF/e1287.pdf.
- 734 Le Strange M. 2011. Moss and Algae in Lawns, Roofs and Walkways. Master Gardener Newspaper
- 735 Articles. University of California Cooperative Extension. Retrieved December 10, 2014 from
- 736 http://ucanr.edu/datastoreFiles/268-477.pdf.
- 737 MMWD. 2010. Herbicide Risk Assessment. Chapter 7: Pelargonic Acid. Marin Municipal Water District.
- 738 Retrieved November 25, 2014 from http://www.marinwater.org/DocumentCenter/View/252.
- 739 Mailer R. 2006. Chemistry and quality of olive oil. New South Whales Department of Primary Industries.
- 740 Retrieved December 1, 2014 from
- 742 <u>oil.pdf</u>.
- NOAA. 2010. NOAA's Oil Spill Response. Links Between Gulf Hypoxia and the Oil Spill. National Oceanic
- 744 and Atmospheric Administration. Retrieved December 2, 2014 from
- 745 http://www.noaa.gov/factsheets/new%20version/dead_zone_oil.pdf.
- NPIC. 2001. Technical Fact Sheet: Potassium Salts of Fatty Acids. National Pesticide Information Center.
- Retrieved November 25, 2014 from http://npic.orst.edu/factsheets/psfatech.pdf.
- Nora A, Koenen G. 2010. Metallic Soaps. In Ullmann's Encyclopedia of Industrial Chemistry, Wiley-VCH
- 749 Verlag GmbH & Co. KGaA.
- OMRI. 2014. OMRI Products List. Organic Materials Review Institute. Updated November 17, 2014.
- 751 Retrieved November 25, 2014 from http://www.omri.org/omri-lists/download.
- Pundt L. 2013. Managing Algae in the Greenhouse. Integrated Pest Management Program. University of
- 753 Connecticut. Retrieved December 11, 2014 from
- http://ipm.uconn.edu/documents/raw2/Managing%20Algae%20in%20the%20Greenhouse/Managing%2
- 755 0Algae%20in%20the%20Greenhouse.php?aid=197.
- 756 RHS. 2014. Algae, lichens, liverworts and moss on hard surfaces. Royal Horticultural Society. Retrieved
- 757 December 11, 2014 from https://www.rhs.org.uk/advice/profile?pid=418.
- 758 Rehm G, Schmitt M. 2002. Potassium for crop production. University of Minnesota | Extension. Retreived
- 759 December 3, 2014 from http://www.extension.umn.edu/agriculture/nutrient-
- 760 management/potassium/potassium-for-crop-production/.
- 761 Reiling TL, Robert BS. 1962. Anhydrous ammonium soap. Patent # US3053867. Retrieved November 25,
- 762 2014 from http://www.google.com/patents/US3053867.
- Rustan AC, Drevon CA. 2005. Fatty Acids: Structures and Properties. In Encyclopedia of Life Sciences, John
- 764 Wiley & Sons, Ltd, Chichester.
- 765 Smiley RA, Beste CE. 2009. Petition to the National Organic Standards Board: Ammonium Nonanoate –
- 766 Crops. Dated December 22, 2009. Retrieved November 26, 2014 from
- 767 http://www.ams.usda.gov/AMSv1.0/getfile?dDocName=STELPRDC5083576.
- Smith T. 2014. Cleaning and Disinfecting the Greenhouse. Greenhouse Crops and Floriculture Program.
- 769 UMass Extension. The University of Massachusetts Amherst. Retrieved December 11, 2014 from
- 770 http://extension.umass.edu/floriculture/fact-sheets/cleaning-and-disinfecting-greenhouse.

February 27, 2015 Page 16 of 17

- 771 Solvay Chemicals Inc. 2012. Label: PAK® 27 Algaecide (EPA Reg. No. 68660-9). Retrieved December 12,
- 772 2014 from http://iaspub.epa.gov/apex/pesticides/f?p=PPLS:102:::NO::P102_REG_NUM:68660-9.
- 773 Thurston County. 2009a. Review: Potassium salt of fatty acids. Thurston County Health Department.
- Review date: July 20, 2009. Retrieved December 1, 2014 from
- 775 http://www.co.thurston.wa.us/health/ehipm/pdf_fung/fung_actives/Potassium%20salt%20of%20fatty
- 776 <u>%20acids.pdf</u>.
- 777 Thurston County. 2009b. Review: Ammonium salt of fatty acids. Thurston County Health Department.
- 778 Review date: May 8, 2009. Retrieved December 1, 2014 from
- 779 http://www.co.thurston.wa.us/health/ehipm/pdf_terr/terrestrial%20actives/Ammonium%20salt%20of
- 780 <u>%20fatty%20acids.pdf</u>.
- 781 USDA. 2008. NOSB Committee Recommendation for Ammonium Salts of Fatty Acids. USDA National
- 782 Organic Program. Retrieved November 25, 2014 from
- 783 http://www.ams.usda.gov/AMSv1.0/getfile?dDocName=STELPRDC5072645&acct=nopgeninfo.
- 784 USDA. 2007. NOSB Committee Recommendation for Ammonium Salts of Fatty Acids. USDA National
- 785 Organic Program. Retrieved November 25, 2014 from
- 786 <u>http://www.ams.usda.gov/AMSv1.0/getfile?dDocName=STELPRDC5057440</u>.
- 787 USDA. 1996. Technical Advisory Panel Reviews: Soap-based Herbicides Crops. USDA National Organic
- 788 Program. Retrieved November 25, 2014 from
- 789 http://www.ams.usda.gov/AMSv1.0/getfile?dDocName=STELPRDC5103288.
- 790 US EPA. 2014. Pesticide Product Information System (PPIS). US Environmental Protection Agency.
- 791 Retrieved November 25, 2014 from http://www.epa.gov/opp00001/PPISdata/.
- 792 US EPA. 2013. Environmental Fate and Ecological Risk Assessment for the Registration of Soap Salts. US
- 793 Environmental Protection Agency. Retrieved November 25, 2014 from
- http://www.regulations.gov/#!documentDetail;D=EPA-HQ-OPP-2008-0519-0019.
- 795 US EPA. 2012. Soap Salts: Preliminary Risk Assessment to Support Registration Review. US Environmental
- 796 Protection Agency. Retrieved November 25, 2014 from
- 797 http://www.regulations.gov/#!documentDetail;D=EPA-HQ-OPP-2008-0519-0018.
- 798 US EPA. 2004. Inert (other) Pesticide Ingredients in Pesticide Products Categorized List of Inert (other)
- 799 Pesticide Ingredients. Lists 4A and 4B last updated August 2004. Retrieved December 1, 2014 from
- http://www.epa.gov/opprd001/inerts/oldlists.html.
- 801 US EPA. 1992. Registration Eligibility Document (RED): Soap Salts. US Environmental Protection Agency.
- 802 Retrieved November 25, 2014 from
- http://www.epa.gov/opp00001/chem_search/reg_actions/reregistration/red_G-76_1-Sep-92.pdf.
- Van Egmond R, Hambling S, Marshall S. 1999. Bioconcentration, biotransformation, and chronic toxicity of
- 805 sodium laurate to zebrafish (Danio rerio). Environmental toxicology and chemistry 18: 466–473.
- Wickline B, Rayburn E. 2008. Using Crimson Clover to Supply Nitrogen to a Silage Corn Crop. West
- 807 Virginia University Extension Service. Retrieved December 3, 2014 from
- 808 http://www.wvu.edu/~agexten/ageng/Using_Crimson_Clover_to_Supply_Nitrogen_to_a_Silage_Corn_
- 809 <u>Crop.pdf</u>.
- Woodstream Corporation. 2014. Material Safety Data Sheet: Safer® Brand Insect Killing Soap with Seaweed
- Extract II. Retrieved December 2, 2014 from http://www.saferbrand.com/store/outdoor-insect/5118.
- Woodstream Corporation. 2009. Label: Ringer® Aphid-Mite Attack® for Fruits and Vegetables. Retrieved
- 813 December 3, 2014 from
- http://iaspub.epa.gov/apex/pesticides/f?p=PPLS:102:::NO::P102_REG_NUM:36488-36.

February 27, 2015 Page 17 of 17