

# NOSB COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

Form NOPLIST1. Committee Transmittal to NOSB

For NOSB Meeting: March 2007

Substance: Peppers, Chipolte / Jalapeno Pepper

Committee: Crops ☐ Livestock ☐ Handling ☒ Petition is for: Inclusion of Peppers, Chipolte/Jalapeno on the National List § 205.606

A. Evaluation Criteria (Applicability noted for each category; Documentation attached)		Criteria Satisfied? (see B below)		
1. Impact on Humans and Environment		Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
2. Essential & Availability Criteria		Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
3. Compatibility & Consistency		Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
4. Commercial Supply is Fragile or Potentially Unavailable as Organic (only for 606)		Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>

B. Substance Fails Criteria Category: \_\_\_\_\_ Comments: \_\_\_\_\_

C. Proposed Annotation (if any): Material allowed for listing for 3 years from the date of publication

Basis for annotation: To meet criteria above: \_\_\_\_\_ Other regulatory criteria: \_\_\_\_\_ Citation: \_\_\_\_\_  
To allow time for development of certified operators to process this agricultural product organically

D. Recommended Committee Action & Vote (State Actual Motion): Recommend the inclusion of Chipolte/Jalapeno Peppers on the National List § 205.606

Motion by: Julie Weisman Seconded: Andrea Caroe Yes: 5 No: 0 Absent: 0 Abstain: 0

Crops		Agricultural	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Allowed <sup>1</sup>	
Livestock		Non-Synthetic		Prohibited <sup>2</sup>	
Handling	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Synthetic		Rejected <sup>3</sup>	
No restriction		Commercially Un-Available as Organic <sup>1</sup>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Deferred <sup>4</sup>	

1) Substance voted to be added as "allowed" on National List to § 205. 606 with Annotation (if any) for three years from date of publication

2) Substance to be added as "prohibited" on National List to § 205. \_\_\_\_\_ with Annotation (if any) \_\_\_\_\_

Describe why a prohibited substance: \_\_\_\_\_

3) Substance was rejected by vote for amending National List to § 205. \_\_\_\_\_ Describe why material was rejected: \_\_\_\_\_

4) Substance was recommended to be deferred because \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ If follow-up needed, who will follow up \_\_\_\_\_

E. Approved by Committee Chair to transmit to NOSB:

Julie Weisman  
Committee Chair

February 16, 2007  
Date

# NOSB EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR SUBSTANCES ADDED TO THE NATIONAL LIST

**Category 1. Adverse impacts on humans or the environment?**

**Substance - Peppers, Chipolte / Jalapeno**

Question	Yes	No	N/A <sup>1</sup>	Documentation (TAP; petition; regulatory agency; other)
1. Are there adverse effects on environment from manufacture, use, or disposal? [§205.600 b.2]			N/A	Substance is an agricultural product.
2. Is there environmental contamination during manufacture, use, misuse, or disposal? [§6518 m.3]			N/A	
3. Is the substance harmful to the environment? [§6517c(1)(A)(i);6517(c)(2)(A)i]			N/A	
4. Does the substance contain List 1, 2, or 3 inerts? [§6517 c (1)(B)(ii); 205.601(m)2]			N/A	
5. Is there potential for detrimental chemical interaction with other materials used? [§6518 m.1]			N/A	
6. Are there adverse biological and chemical interactions in agro-ecosystem? [§6518 m.5]			N/A	
7. Are there detrimental physiological effects on soil organisms, crops, or livestock? [§6518 m.5]			N/A	
8. Is there a toxic or other adverse action of the material or its breakdown products? [§6518 m.2]			N/A	
9. Is there undesirable persistence or concentration of the material or breakdown products in environment?[§6518 m.2]			N/A	
10. Is there any harmful effect on human health? [§6517 c (1)(A)(i) ; 6517 c(2)(A)i; §6518 m.4]			N/A	
11. Is there an adverse effect on human health as defined by applicable Federal regulations? [205.600 b.3]			N/A	
12. Is the substance GRAS when used according to FDA's good manufacturing practices? [§205.600 b.5]			N/A	
13. Does the substance contain residues of heavy metals or other contaminants in excess of FDA tolerances? [§205.600 b.5]			N/A	

<sup>1</sup>If the substance under review is for crops or livestock production, all of the questions from 205.600 (b) are N/A—not applicable.

**Category 2. Is the Substance Essential for Organic Production? Substance – Peppers, Chipolte / Jalapeno**

Question	Yes	No	N/A <sup>1</sup>	Documentation (TAP; petition; regulatory agency; other)
1. Is the substance formulated or manufactured by a chemical process? [6502 (21)]			N/A	
2. Is the substance formulated or manufactured by a process that chemically changes a substance extracted from naturally occurring plant, animal, or mineral, sources? [6502 (21)]			N/A	
3. Is the substance created by naturally occurring biological processes? [6502 (21)]			N/A	
4. Is there a natural source of the substance? [§205.600 b.1]			N/A	
5. Is there an organic substitute? [§205.600 b.1]		✓		There is currently no organic substitute that meets flavor profile.
6. Is the substance essential for handling of organically produced agricultural products? [§205.600 b.6]			N/A	
7. Is there a wholly natural substitute product? [§6517 c (1)(A)(ii)]			N/A	
8. Is the substance used in handling, not synthetic, but not organically produced? [§6517 c (1)(B)(iii)]	X			
9. Is there any alternative substances? [§6518 m.6]		X		
10. Is there another practice that would make the substance unnecessary? [§6518 m.6]			N/A	

<sup>1</sup>If the substance under review is for crops or livestock production, all of the questions from 205.600 (b) are N/A—not applicable.

**Category 3. Is the substance compatible with organic production practices? Substance – Peppers, Chipolte / Jalapeno**

Question	Yes	No	N/A <sup>1</sup>	Documentation (TAP; petition; regulatory agency; other)
1. Is the substance compatible with organic handling? [§205.600 b.2]			N/A	Substance is an agricultural product.
2. Is the substance consistent with organic farming and handling? [§6517 c (1)(A)(iii); 6517 c (2)(A)(ii)]			N/A	
3. Is the substance compatible with a system of sustainable agriculture? [§6518 m.7]			N/A	
4. Is the nutritional quality of the food maintained with the substance? [§205.600 b.3]			N/A	
5. Is the primary use as a preservative? [§205.600 b.4]		X		
6. Is the primary use to recreate or improve flavors, colors, textures, or nutritive values lost in processing (except when required by law, e.g., vitamin D in milk)? [205.600 b.4]		✓		Used to create regionally authentic flavor profile, not flavor lost in processing.
7. Is the substance used in production, and does it contain an active synthetic ingredient in the following categories:			N/A	
a. copper and sulfur compounds;			N/A	
b. toxins derived from bacteria;			N/A	
c. pheromones, soaps, horticultural oils, fish emulsions, treated seed, vitamins and minerals?			N/A	
d. livestock parasiticides and medicines?			N/A	
e. production aids including netting, tree wraps and seals, insect traps, sticky barriers, row covers, and equipment cleaners?			N/A	

<sup>1</sup>If the substance under review is for crops or livestock production, all of the questions from 205.600 (b) are N/A—not applicable.

**Category 4. Is the commercial supply of an agricultural substance as organic, fragile or potentially unavailable?** [§6610, 6518, 6519, 205.2, 205.105 (d), 205.600 (c) 205.2, 205.105 (d), 205.600 (c)]

**Substance – Peppers, Chipotle / Jalapeno**

Question	Yes	No	N/A	Comments on Information Provided (sufficient, plausible, reasonable, thorough, complete, unknown)
1. <u>Is the comparative description provided</u> as to why the non-organic form of the material /substance is necessary for use in organic handling?	✓			P.2 “Intended Use” and Attachment 1, Page 1, 1 <sup>st</sup> Paragraph. Necessary for formulation of authentically Mexican tasting organic processed foods such as salsas, burritos and soups.
2. Does the current and historical industry information, research, or evidence provided explain how or why the material /substance cannot be obtained organically in the appropriate <b>form</b> to fulfill an essential function in a system of organic handling?	✓			1. P.2 Addresses lack of organic processing of peppers into chipotles. Vaguely addresses cultivation. No specific information is given regarding the cultivation of organic peppers for this purpose.  2. Attachment #7, Page 2, states that “moritas” are a type of pepper commonly used to make chipotle by they are inferior.
3. Does the current and historical industry information, research, or evidence provided explain how or why the material /substance cannot be obtained organically in the appropriate <b>quality</b> to fulfill an essential function in a system of organic handling?	✓			P.2. Conclusion refers to “supplies [being] available that have been appropriately.... Selected...to meet our target layer profile” indicating that quality is an issue.
4. Does the current and historical industry information, research, or evidence provided explain how or why the material /substance cannot be obtained organically in the appropriate <b>quantity</b> to fulfill an essential function in a system of organic handling?	✓			P.2. “Justification” states that “supplies of organic chipotle chili peppers are limited and insufficient....”etc.
5. Does the industry information provided on material / substance non-availability as organic, include ( but not limited to) the following: a. Regions of production (including factors such as climate and number of regions);	✓			Attachment 1, P. 2 describes varieties of peppers from which chipotles are made. Most chipotle is made in Mexico Guatemala. No information is given to indicate that they cannot be grown in more regions. Attachment 1
b. Number of suppliers and amount produced;	X			No evidence to indicate insufficient amount of organic jalapeno being grown. Attachment 1, p.1, Paragraph #2 names one processor of conventional chipotle who makes 1,000 lbs/year. Attachment #7, P.2. states most conventional chipotle produced in Mexico is consumed there.
c. Current and historical supplies related to weather events such as hurricanes, floods, and droughts that may temporarily halt production or destroy crops or supplies;			✓	
d. Trade-related issues such as evidence of hoarding, war, trade barriers, or civil unrest that may temporarily restrict supplies; or			✓	No other issues were mentioned.
e. Are there other issues which may present a challenge to a consistent supply?		✓		