

NOSB RECOMMENDED DECISION FORM

Form NOPLIST2. Full Board Transmittal to NOP

For NOSB Meeting: April 2010	Substance: <u>Methionine</u>																								
A. Evaluation Criteria (Applicability noted for each category; Documentation attached) Criteria Satisfied? (see B below)																									
1. Impact on Humans and Environment	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A <input type="checkbox"/>																								
2. Essential & Availability Criteria	Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> N/A <input type="checkbox"/>																								
3. Compatibility & Consistency	Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> N/A <input type="checkbox"/>																								
4. Commercial Supply is Fragile or Potentially Unavailable as Organic (only for 606)	Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>																								
B. Substance fails criteria? Criteria category: <u>2&3</u> Comments: Even though substance fails 2 criteria, industry comment indicated need.	C. Proposed Annotation: _____ <u>for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton.</u> Basis for annotation: Recommendation from methionine task force, minus the words "calculated as the average pounds per ton" To meet criteria above: _____ Criteria: _____ Other regulatory criteria: _____ Citation: _____																								
D. Final Board Action & Vote (State Actual Motion): _____ <u>to amend 7 CFR § 205.603(d)(1) as follows: DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine-hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine hydroxy analog calcium (CAS #-59-51-8; 63-68-3; 348-67-4)—for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton.</u>																									
Motion: Jeff Moyer Second: Tina Ellor Yes: 10 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1																									
<table border="1" style="margin: auto; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Agricultural</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Nonagricultural</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Crops</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Synthetic</td> <td style="padding: 5px; text-align: center;">X</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Not synthetic</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Livestock</td> <td style="padding: 5px; text-align: center;">X</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Allowed¹</td> <td style="padding: 5px; text-align: center;">X</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Prohibited²</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Handling</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">No restriction</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Deferred⁴</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Rejected³</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> </table>		Agricultural		Nonagricultural		Crops		Synthetic	X	Not synthetic		Livestock	X	Allowed ¹	X	Prohibited ²		Handling		No restriction		Deferred ⁴		Rejected ³	
Agricultural		Nonagricultural		Crops																					
Synthetic	X	Not synthetic		Livestock	X																				
Allowed ¹	X	Prohibited ²		Handling																					
No restriction		Deferred ⁴		Rejected ³																					
Provide a summary narrative here or attach a more complete narrative, and attach the original committee recommendation that includes the evaluation criteria checklist:																									
1—substance voted to be added as "allowed" on National List on National List to § 205. 603 _____ with Annotation (if any): _____ <u>for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton.</u>																									
2—substance to be added to "prohibited" paragraph of National List to § 205. _____ Describe why a prohibited substance: _____																									
3—substance was rejected by vote for amending National List to § 205. _____ Describe why material was rejected: _____																									
4—substance was recommended to be deferred § 205. _____ Describe why deferred; if any follow-up is needed. If follow-up needed, who conducts follow-up _____																									
E. Approved by NOSB Chair to transmit to NOP																									
_____ Daniel G. Giacomini Chair	_____ April 29, 2010 Date																								
F. NOP Action: Include in FR to amend National List: Return to NOSB Reason: _____																									
_____ Date																									

NOSB COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

Form NOPLIST1. Committee Transmittal to NOSB

For NOSB Meeting: April 2010

Substance: Methionine (Livestock Committee motion)

Committee: Crops Livestock Handling Petition is for: removal of the annotation date of October 1, 2010 for Synthetic Methionine on the National List § 205.603.

A. Evaluation Criteria (Applicability noted for each category; Documentation attached) **Criteria Satisfied? (see B below)**

- | | | | |
|--|---|--|---|
| 1. Impact on Humans and Environment | Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. Essential & Availability Criteria | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. Compatibility & Consistency | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4. Commercial Supply is Fragile or Potentially Unavailable as Organic (only for 606) | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |

B. Substance Fails Criteria Category: 2 & 3 Comments: High use levels of synthetic MET does not meet consumer expectations nor follow the principles of organic agriculture. Different management practices and housing strategies are much preferred to purchased inputs in organic farming. Material will still be on the National List, but with a new step down rate of use. The Livestock Committee hopes to stimulate further development and management changes in the organic poultry industry that will meet consumer expectations and organic principles. Along with the Animal Welfare Recommendation that was passed in November 2009, which will eventually include stocking rates for poultry, the committee believes these goals will be met.

C. Proposed Annotation (if any): to amend 7 CFR § 205.603(d)(1) as follows: DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine-hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine hydroxyl analog calcium (CAS #-59-51-8; 63-68-3; 348-67-4)—for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton. After October 1, 2012 at the following maximum levels per ton: Laying and Broiler chickens – 2 pounds per ton; and Turkeys and all other poultry - 3 pounds per ton.

Basis for annotation: To meet criteria above: Other regulatory criteria: _____ Citation: _____

To meet consumer expectations of organic poultry production, yet allow additional time for the development of natural alternatives to Synthetic Methionine.

D. Recommended Committee Action & Vote (State Actual Motion): to amend 7 CFR § 205.603(d)(1) as follows: DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine-hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine hydroxy analog calcium (CAS #-59-51-8; 63-68-3; 348-67-4)—for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton. After October 1, 2012 the following maximum levels per ton: Laying and Broiler chickens – 2 pounds per ton; and Turkeys and all other poultry - 3 pounds per ton.

Motion by: Dan Giacomini Seconded: Jeff Moyer Yes: 5 No: 0 Absent: 3 Abstain: 0

Crops		Agricultural		Allowed ¹	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Livestock	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Non-Synthetic		Prohibited ²	
Handling		Synthetic	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Rejected ³	
No restriction		Commercially Un-Available as Organic ¹		Deferred ⁴	

1) Substance voted to be added as "allowed" on National List to § 205._____ with Annotation (if any) _____

2) Substance to be added as "prohibited" on National List to § 205._____ with Annotation (if any) _____

Describe why a prohibited substance: _____

3) Substance was rejected by vote for amending National List to § 205. 603____ Describe why material was rejected

4) Substance was recommended to be deferred because _____ If follow-up needed, who will follow up _____

E. Approved by Committee Chair to transmit to NOSB:

Kevin K. Engebart
Committee Chair

February 23, 2010
Date