For NOSB Meeting: April 2010

Substance: Methionine

A. Evaluation Criteria (Applicability noted for each category; Documentation attached)

1. Impact on Humans and Environment
   - Yes x No ☐ N/A ☐

2. Essential & Availability Criteria
   - Yes ☐ No x N/A ☐

3. Compatibility & Consistency
   - Yes ☐ No x N/A ☐

4. Commercial Supply is Fragile or Potentially Unavailable as Organic (only for 606)
   - Yes ☐ No x N/A ☐

B. Substance fails criteria?
   - Criteria category: 2&3

   Comments: Even though substance fails 2 criteria, industry comment indicated need.

C. Proposed Annotation:

   for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton.

   Basis for annotation: Recommendation from methionine task force, minus the words "calculated as the average pounds per ton."

To meet criteria above: Criteria: __________

Other regulatory criteria: Citation: __________

D. Final Board Action & Vote (State Actual Motion)

Motion: Jeff Moyer Second: Tina Ellor Yes: 10 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1

Provide a summary narrative here or attach a more complete narrative, and attach the original committee recommendation that includes the evaluation criteria checklist:

1—substance voted to be added as “allowed” on National List on National List to § 205.603 with Annotation (if any):

2—substance to be added to “prohibited” paragraph of National List § 205.

3—substance was rejected by vote for amending National List to § 205.

4—substance was recommended to be deferred § 205.

E. Approved by NOSB Chair to transmit to NOP

Daniel G. Giacomini

Date: April 29, 2010

F. NOP Action: Include in FR to amend National List:

Return to NOSB  Reason: ______________

Date: ______________
NOSB COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
Form NOPLIST1. Committee Transmittal to NOSB

For NOSB Meeting: __April 2010__________________ Substance: __Methionine (Livestock Committee motion)

Committee:    Crops  □  Livestock  X  Handling  □  Petition is for: __removal of the annotation date of October 1, 2010 for Synthetic Methionine on the National List § 205.603.

A. Evaluation Criteria (Applicability noted for each category; Documentation attached)  Criteria Satisfied? (see B below)
   1. Impact on Humans and Environment  Yes  X  No  □  N/A  □
   2. Essential & Availability Criteria  Yes  □  No  X  N/A  □
   3. Compatibility & Consistency  Yes  □  No  X  N/A  □
   4. Commercial Supply is Fragile or Potentially Unavailable as Organic (only for 606)  Yes  □  No  X  N/A  □

B. Substance Fails Criteria Category:  _2 & 3_  Comments: _High use levels of synthetic MET does not meet consumer expectations nor follow the principles of organic agriculture. Different management practices and housing strategies are much preferred to purchased inputs in organic farming. Material will still be on the National List, but with a new step down rate of use. The Livestock Committee hopes to stimulate further development and management changes in the organic poultry industry that will meet consumer expectations and organic principles. Along with the Animal Welfare Recommendation that was passed in November 2009, which will eventually include stocking rates for poultry, the committee believes these goals will be met._

C. Proposed Annotation (if any): _to amend 7 CFR § 205.603(d)(1) as follows: DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine-hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine hydroxy analog calcium (CAS # 59-51-8; 63-68-3; 348-67-4)—for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton. After October 1, 2012 at the following maximum levels per ton: Laying and Broiler chickens – 2 pounds per ton; and Turkeys and all other poultry - 3 pounds per ton._

Basis for annotation: To meet criteria above: _X_ Other regulatory criteria: _Citation:_

To meet consumer expectations of organic poultry production, yet allow additional time for the development of natural alternatives to Synthetic Methionine.

D. Recommended Committee Action & Vote (State Actual Motion): _to amend 7 CFR § 205.603(d)(1) as follows: DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine-hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine hydroxy analog calcium (CAS # 59-51-8; 63-68-3; 348-67-4)—for use only in organic poultry production until October 1, 2012, at the following maximum levels per ton of synthetic methionine in the feed ration: Laying chickens – 4 pounds per ton; Broiler chickens – 5 pounds per ton; and Turkeys & all other poultry – 6 pounds per ton. After October 1, 2012 the following maximum levels per ton: Laying and Broiler chickens – 2 pounds per ton; and Turkeys and all other poultry - 3 pounds per ton._

Motion by: Dan Giacomini__  Seconded: Jeff Moyer______  Yes: 5____  No: 0_____  Absent: 3______  Abstain: 0_____

Crops  □  Agricultural  □  Allowed\(^1\)  X
Livestock  X  Non-Synthetic  □  Prohibited\(^2\)
Handling  Synthetic  X  Rejected\(^3\)
No restriction  Commerically Un-Available as Organic\(^1\)  Deferred\(^4\)

1) Substance voted to be added as “allowed” on National List to § 205,______with Annotation (if any)
2) Substance to be added as “prohibited” on National List to § 205,______with Annotation (if any)
   Describe why a prohibited substance:

3) Substance was rejected by vote for amending National List to § 205, 603____Describe why material was rejected

4) Substance was recommended to be deferred because ________
   If follow-up needed, who will follow up ________

E. Approved by Committee Chair to transmit to NOSB:

Kevin K. Engebert ____________________________  February 23, 2010
Committee Chair ____________________________  Date

---

\(^1\)_Commercially Un-Available as Organic
\(^2\)_Prohibited
\(^3\)_Rejected
\(^4\)_Deferred