

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, February 13, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Franklin Quarcio (FQ), Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery; Brian Caldwell (BC); Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP); Kyla Smith (KS); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 9, 2024 notes
- Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (WT/All) - discuss/vote
- Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 30, 2024** notes were accepted as written.
- **Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products Discussion Document (NL, FQ, LP, BC).** During the last NOSB meeting, the Materials Subcommittee posted a brief document with questions in the open docket, but this is the first meeting they will present a fully flushed out discussion document. The document includes 4 options for reviewing inerts, as well as a spreadsheet compiled by the NOP Food Technologists listing the inert substances on 4A and 4B. The lead summarized the comments they received previously, and noted there was no consensus. The MS intends on making the process as transparent as possible given the complexity and interest. Members provided feedback on the work-to-date, noting that it is an information-gathering-tool at the moment. The MS voted on the document and will submit it for the Spring meeting.

Motion to accept the discussion document on inert ingredients in pesticide products

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Research Priorities (WT/All).** The group reviewed the lists of priorities from the other Subcommittees. **The lead will finalize the document and recirculate it so members can view the final version before voting via email. (Note: the final vote was tallied and recorded below)**

Motion to accept the discussion document on research priorities

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Technical Report (TR) Update Proposal (MJ).** The group discussed the request by NOP to repost this as a proposal, so stakeholders have one more opportunity to submit feedback. The MS voted on the proposal and will submit it to NOP for the Spring meeting.

Motion to accept the proposal on TR template Updates

Motion by: MJ
Seconded by: NL
Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 30, 2024 Additional call

February 13, 2024

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss/vote

Research Priorities (WT/All) - discuss/vote

Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss/vote

March 12, 2024

April 9, 2024

May 14, 2024

June 11, 2024

July 9, 2024

August 13, 2024

September 10, 2024

October 8, 2024

November 12, 2024

December 10, 2024

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

| Project | National List | Contact | Doc Type | Notes | Scheduled / status | Target meeting |
|---------------------------|---------------|-----------|----------------|--|--------------------|----------------|
| Research Priorities (RPs) | N/A | WT | Discussion Doc | May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): LP/DN Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 01.16.24 | 2.13.24 | Spr 2024 |
| Excluded Methods | N/A | MJ/DN /LP | Discussion Doc | MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23. | 12.12.23 | Fall 2024 |

| | | | | | | |
|---|--------------------|----------------|----------------|--|--|----------|
| Tall oil, distilled | 205.601 205.603 | WT | HOLD | 2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance. | 12.12.23 | TBD |
| Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products | Misc. | FQ, NL, LP, BC | Discussion Doc | June 23, 2023 NOP Memo | 9.12.23 10.10.23 11.14.23 12.12.23 1.9.24 2.13.24 | Spr 2024 |
| Technical Report (TR) Update | N/A | MJ | Proposal | | 1.9.24 1.30.24 2.13.24 | |

Milestones

| Spring 2024 Milestones | Target dates (tentative) | Weeks PTM (prior to meeting) |
|---|--------------------------|------------------------------|
| NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment | ~Nov 17, 2023 | 16 -20 |
| NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 9, 2024 | ~ 10 |
| NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP | Feb 15, 2024 | ~ 9 |
| NOP - Post proposals | Mar 5, 2024 | 7.5 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 3, 2024 | 3.5 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 5, 2024 | 3 |
| Public comment webinars | Apr 23 & 25, 2024 | 1 |
| Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI | Apr 29 - May 1, 2024 | 0 |
| Final recommendations due | May 29, 2024 | 30 days post meeting |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes

Tuesday, January 30 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Franklin Quarcoo (FQ), Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery; Brian Caldwell (BC)

Absent: Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP); Kyla Smith (KS); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 9, 2024 notes
- Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (WT/All) - discuss/vote
- Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Review of the January 9, 2024** notes was deferred due to lack of quorum
- **Technical Report (TR) update (MJ).** The lead circulated a draft document, and the group provided feedback. There were no substantive changes, and the Subcommittee members were supportive of the document as presented. The group discussed the use of the different phrases based on the National List scope: ancillary substances in handling, and excipients and inerts in Crops and Livestock. The MS is seeking additional feedback from stakeholders, and deferred the vote to the February 13 call due to lack of quorum.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 9, 2024

Excluded Methods Discussion Doc (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss

January 30, 2024 Additional call

February 13, 2024

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss/vote

Research Priorities (WT/All) - discuss/vote

Technical Report (TR) update (MJ) - discuss/vote

March 12, 2024

April 9, 2024

May 14, 2024

June 11, 2024

July 9, 2024

August 13, 2024

September 10, 2024

October 8, 2024

November 12, 2024

December 10, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

| Project | National List | Contact | Doc Type | Notes | Scheduled / status | Target meeting |
|---|--------------------|----------------|----------------|--|--|----------------|
| Research Priorities (RPs) | N/A | WT | Discussion Doc | May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): LP/DN Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 01.16.24 | 2.13.24 | Spr 2024 |
| Excluded Methods | N/A | MJ/DN /LP | Discussion Doc | MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23. | 12.12.23 | Fall 2024 |
| Tall oil, distilled | 205.601 205.603 | WT | HOLD | 2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance. | 12.12.23 | TBD |
| Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products | Misc. | FQ, NL, LP, BC | Discussion Doc | June 23, 2023 NOP Memo | 9.12.23 10.10.23 11.14.23 12.12.23 1.9.24 2.13.24 | Spr 2024 |

| | | | | | | |
|---------------------------------|-----|----|----------|--|------------------------------|--|
| Technical Report (TR) Update | N/A | MJ | Proposal | | 1.9.24 1.30.24 2.13.24 | |
|---------------------------------|-----|----|----------|--|------------------------------|--|

Milestones

| Spring 2024 Milestones | Target dates (tentative) | Weeks PTM (prior to meeting) |
|---|--------------------------|---------------------------------|
| NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment | ~Nov 17, 2023 | 16 -20 |
| NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 9, 2024 | ~ 10 |
| NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP | Feb 15, 2024 | ~ 9 |
| NOP - Post proposals | Mar 5, 2024 | 7.5 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 3, 2024 | 3.5 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 5, 2024 | 3 |
| Public comment webinars | Apr 23 & 25, 2024 | 1 |
| Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI | Apr 29 - May 1, 2024 | 0 |
| Final recommendations due | May 29, 2024 | 30 days post meeting |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes

Tuesday, January 9, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Franklin Quarcio (FQ), Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery; Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP); Kyla Smith (KS); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Brian Caldwell (BC)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review December 12, 2023 notes
- Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss
- Excluded Methods TR Template status (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 12, 2024** notes were accepted with modifications.
- **Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC).** The leads developed a spreadsheet as a starting point for the Food Technologists, which they hope will be helpful when evaluating the various scenarios and options for inerts. It includes a summary of stakeholder input, and an explanation of the options, to help focus the possible outcomes. The MS is also interested in hosting a panel on inerts between Board meetings; perhaps in June. They are approaching this project in two phases: Phase 1 will be a discussion document for the Spring 2024 meeting that includes the spreadsheet, and Phase 2 may include some solutions (perhaps grouping the inerts by functional group), and would be presented at the Fall 2024 meeting. A member recalled feedback from public comment suggesting that the inerts be grouped into a different section of the regulations. The MS will discuss further and vote on the next call.
- **Excluded Methods TR Template status (MJ/DN/LP).** The group discussed the TR template status. The templates have been through several iterations, and have been modified with feedback from stakeholders and the Organic Materials Review Institute (OMRI), who currently writes the TRs. The process has been long, and the MS is unanimous in their sentiment that they are ready to be implemented. One member suggested minor edits regarding microorganisms, and the lead suggested it might be better to encourage future Boards to address questions about fermentation. after NOP makes a determination about inerts. The addition of these questions is really about feedstocks, and could be seen as creating policy where none exists. Also, it's not clear how certifiers would use that information. Two other members suggested a question about ancillary substances. The lead will add minor changes and submit the document to the NOP.
Additional Items. Research priorities. The MS will divide the lists in each Subcommittee into two categories: top priorities and ongoing research. This way, it highlights topics for researchers.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

December 12, 2023

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

January 9, 2024

Excluded Methods Discussion Doc (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss

February 13, 2024

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss/vote

Research Priorities (WT/All) - discuss/vote

Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss/vote

March 12, 2024

April 9, 2024

May 14, 2024

June 11, 2024

July 9, 2024

August 13, 2024

September 10, 2024

October 8, 2024

November 12, 2024

December 10, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

| Project | National List | Contact | Doc Type | Notes | Scheduled / status | Target meeting |
|---------------------------|---------------|-----------|----------------|---|--------------------|----------------|
| Research Priorities (RPs) | N/A | WT | Discussion Doc | May 2012 Framework Proposal <u>Subcommittee reps to MS:</u> Handling (HS): LP/DN Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 01.16.24 | 2.13.24 | Spr 2024 |
| Excluded Methods | N/A | MJ/DN /LP | Discussion Doc | MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23. | 12.12.23 | Fall 2024 |

| | | | | | | |
|---|--------------------|----------------|----------------|--|--|----------|
| Tall oil, distilled | 205.601 205.603 | WT | HOLD | 2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance. | 12.12.23 | TBD |
| Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products | Misc. | FQ, NL, LP, BC | Discussion Doc | June 23, 2023 NOP Memo | 9.12.23 10.10.23 11.14.23 12.12.23 1.9.24 2.13.24 | Spr 2024 |
| Technical Report (TR) Update | N/A | MJ | Proposal | | 1.9.24 1.30.24 2.13.24 | |

Milestones

| Spring 2024 Milestones | Target dates (tentative) | Weeks PTM (prior to meeting) |
|---|--------------------------|------------------------------|
| NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment | ~Nov 17, 2023 | 16 -20 |
| NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 9, 2024 | ~ 10 |
| NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP | Feb 15, 2024 | ~ 9 |
| NOP - Post proposals | Mar 5, 2024 | 7.5 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 3, 2024 | 3.5 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 5, 2024 | 3 |
| Public comment webinars | Apr 23 & 25, 2024 | 1 |
| Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI | Apr 29 - May 1, 2024 | 0 |
| Final recommendations due | May 29, 2024 | 30 days post meeting |

