

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, December 8, 2020 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE); Kim Huseman (KH); Brian Caldwell (BC) - observer; Jesse Buie (JB) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Andrea Holm (AH); Cameron Small (CS)

Agenda

- Review November 10 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Tall Oil, distilled - Petition sufficiency
- Excluded Methods - Discuss draft document
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **November 10 meeting notes** were accepted as written
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).**
 - The Crops Subcommittee is reviewing one TR (Biochar). Sufficiency is due in a couple weeks.
 - The TRs for Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC)(Handling), zein (Handling), and kasugamycin (Crops), are due to NOP next week. After review, the NOP will send them to the Subcommittees. The TR for ammonia extract (Crops) is due at end of month.
 - The NOP received a new petition for carbon dioxide and will send it to the Crops Subcommittee as soon as it is posted on the AMS website.
- **Tall oil, distilled.** The lead summarized the manufacture and uses that are being petitioned. Tall oil was previously petitioned; however the previous version was a different substance: Crude Tall Oil. The HS found the petition sufficient determined the need for a TR. Members briefly discussed essentiality and that tall oil is on the EPA List 3 inerts, noting the difficulties in reviewing inerts. The NOP added that this material falls at the intersection of the current inerts issue and the recommendation made by the NOSB. Distilled tall oil is on EPA List 3 but is also listed within one of the Safer Choice Program's functional use groups and is listed as exempt from the requirements of a tolerance by the EPA.
- **Excluded Methods.** The lead summarized the work on the excluded methods thus far and suggested engaging the community to determine where the MS should direct its focus. A member added that there is a strong consensus within the organic community that GMOs should not be allowed. A member added that it might be helpful to broaden the questions in the in the next document to address handling as well as crops. The lead asked for feedback on the draft document, specifically on two areas - tone and questions.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

November 10, 2020

Tall Oil, distilled - Assign lead

Excluded Methods - Discuss draft document

December 8, 2020

Tall Oil, distilled (WT/EO) - Petition sufficiency

January 12, 2021

February 9, 2021

March 9, 2021

April 13, 2021

May 11, 2021

June 8, 2021

July 13, 2021

August 10, 2021

September 14, 2021

October 12, 2021

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan		Spr 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	MJ		11.10.20 12.8.20	Spr 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Pet discussion doc	WT/EO	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR.	11.10.20 12.8.20	Spr 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, November 10, 2020 3:00 pm ET**

Attendees: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Wood Turner (WT); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review October 13 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Tall Oil, distilled - Assign lead
- Excluded Methods - Discuss draft document
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **October 13 meeting notes** were approved with modifications to the discussion on public comments.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).**
 - Biochar TR has been received and passed to the Crops Subcommittee for review.
 - There are eleven outstanding TRs. Three are due by the end of the year with the remainder due in January and February.
 - Phosphoric acid petition in Handling). NOP is awaiting guidance from the Handling Subcommittee about a limited scope TR.
 - Hydronium (in Crops). Petition sufficiency is due in December
 - Tall oil. The Materials Subcommittee will determine petition sufficiency after the sanitizer panel, since this may involve inerts.
- **Tall oil, distilled.** WT and EO will co-lead the review for petition sufficiency.
- **Excluded Methods (MJ).** The lead has reached out to stakeholders, including some from the Non-GMO project, as she works on a draft document on excluded methods. The MS will likely post a discussion document for the Spring meeting.
- **Additional items.**
 - The Organic Seed Alliance is hosting a webinar on excluded methods and a member will forward the email with details.
 - Research priorities (RPs). The NOSB will post a discussion document in the Spring. The Materials Subcommittee will reach out to the other Subcommittees to review the previous RPs and modify as needed. The MS also discussed adding an education component into the RPs.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

October 13, 2020

Excluded Methods - discuss

November 10, 2020

Tall Oil, distilled - Assign lead

Excluded Methods - Discuss
 December 8, 2020
 Tall Oil, distilled (WT/EO) - Petition sufficiency
 Excluded Methods - Discuss draft document

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops SE - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	01.10.21	Disc doc Spr 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	MJ		11.10.20 12.8.20	Spr 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603)	WT/EO	Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20.	11.10.20 12.8.20	Spr 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07.14.20 09.08.20 11.10.20	Panel Fall 2020

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, October 13, 2020 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Wood Turner (WT); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Steve Ela (SE)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review September 8 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Excluded Methods - discuss
- Marine materials (EO) - review comments
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **September 8 meeting notes** were accepted as written.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).**
 - A petition for stabilized hydronium was sent to Crops last week.
 - A petition for tall oil was sent to Materials for consideration, and petition sufficiency is due November 3. The MS asked for an extension, until after the Sanitizer panel, since it involves inerts. The MS will discuss this on December 8, and will work on a draft document for January.
 - TR's: Biochar (Crops) under revision by contractor; CPC (Handling) TR deadline was extended; ammonium extract, kasugamycin, and zein due before the end of the year. The remainder of the TRs, which are for sunset reviews, are due in January/February.
- **Excluded Methods (MJ).** The lead reached out to several stakeholders to let them know the NOSB is beginning to work on excluded methods again. She is looking for assistance with lists of emerging technologies, and will pull together a brief summary for NOSB members. Stakeholders, including the plant breeding community, is engaged. The lead will prepare a draft document for discussion, and the MS may have a document ready for the Spring 2021 NOSB meeting.
- **Marine materials (All).** The group discussed public comments, noting that the response from the community is mixed. Consumers, non-profits, conservation groups, and scientists seem to support the proposal, and those opposed to it, or those who asked that it be sent back to the Subcommittee for additional work, were mainly harvesters and industry groups. Certifier comments were mixed.
- **Additional items.**
 - Members discussed the process for the public comment webinars.
 - The Materials Subcommittee suggested that perhaps the PDS could discuss the public comment process in an effort to improve it. The Board would like to hear the full range of perspectives, while minimizing the repetitiveness of comments.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

September 8, 2020

Sanitizer panel update

Excluded Methods - discuss

October 13, 2020

Excluded Methods - discuss

November 10, 2020

Tall Oil, distilled - Assign lead

Excluded Methods - Discuss draft document

December 8, 2020

Tall Oil, distilled - Petition sufficiency

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops SE - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in July	7.28.20 8.11.20	Proposal Fall 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	DM/MJ/DS		06.09.20 07.14.20 09.08.20 10.13.20 11.10.20	Spr 2021
Tall Oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603)	TBD	Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20.	09.08.20 11.10.20 12.8.20	

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07.14.20 09.08.20 11.10.20	Panel Fall 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	5.26.2020 06.09.20 07.14.20 07.28.20 8.11.20	Fall 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 1, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28 - 30, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, September 8, 2020 1:00 pm ET**

Attendees: Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Wood Turner (WT); Jesse Buie (JB) - observer

Absent: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review August 11 meeting notes (All)
- Sanitizer panel update
- Excluded Methods - discuss
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 11 meeting notes** were accepted as is.
- **Sanitizer panel update.** The group discussed additional questions for the panelists. The NOSB is interested in the distinction between uses as equipment/surface cleaners versus uses as a food contact material, as well as resistance and possible cross resistance to antibiotics. The MS will send the two additional questions to the NOP for approval, and will then forward on to the panel.
- **Excluded Methods (MJ).** The lead circulated some ideas, sorted by Subcommittee, for the next iteration of the excluded methods document, and the group discussed the direction of the project. The lead is pursuing feedback from stakeholders on excluded methods in order to focus the next iteration of the document. The intention is to be proactive and to protect organic integrity by keeping abreast of, and perhaps ahead of, biotechnology in the food system, given that it's a rapidly evolving field. The MS could have a discussion document for the Spring 2021 meeting. The MS will discuss more on the next Subcommittee call.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).**
 - TR for Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) for Handling - due in October
 - TR for Biochar for Crops - due in September.
 - The NOP has awarded contracts for five TRs for the following:

Ammonia extract	Crops	Full TR	Petition
Kasugamycin	Crops	Full TR	Petition
Activated charcoal	Livestock	Full TR	Sunset
Kaolin pectin	Livestock	Full TR	Sunset
Mineral oil	Livestock	Limited Scope	Sunset

- The NOP will be awarding contracts for TRs for five more substances:

Zein	Handling	Full TR	Petition
Propylene glycol	Livestock	Full TR	Sunset

Magnesium oxide	Crops	Full TR	Sunset
Ozone	Crops	Full TR	Sunset
Calcium chloride	Crops	Full	Sunset

- The NOP sent the Materials Subcommittee a new petition last week for Distilled Tall Oil. The petition was for both Crops and Livestock as an allowed inert ingredient in pesticide formulations. The NOP noted that Tall Oil was previously petitioned and the NOSB recommended to not list it. It is classified by EPA as an inert. The MS will assess the petition for sufficiency and determine next steps.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

August 11, 2020

Research Priorities (DM) - Discuss proposal /vote

Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal/vote

September 8, 2020

Sanitizer panel update

Excluded Methods - discuss

October 13, 2020

Excluded Methods - discuss draft document

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops SE - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in July	7.28.20 8.11.20	Proposal Fall 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	DM/MJ/DS		06.09.20 07.14.20 09.08.20 10.13.20	Spr 2021
Tall Oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil	TBD	Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 11.3.20	09.08.20	

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07.14.20 09.08.20	Panel Fall 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	5.26.2020 06.09.20 07.14.20 07.28.20 8.11.20	Fall 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28 - 30, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, August 11, 2020 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Wood Turner (WT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review July 14 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Research Priorities (DM) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Chitosan petition
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 14 meeting notes were accepted as written.**
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).**
 - The NOP has 10 call orders out for TR contracts.
 - The ion exchange TR (Handling) is posted on the AMS website.
 - The NOP sent a new chitosan petition to the Materials Subcommittee to determine which Subcommittee (either Livestock or Handling) should review it.
 - The NOP has contracted many TRs this year and has funded more than average.
 - The NOP rejected a petition for magnesium thermophosphate (synthetic) because it does not comply with OFPA.
 - DP and JC partitioned their workload, but will likely continue to overlap with regard to petitions and technical reports. Please copy both on emails.
- **Research Priorities (DM).** The lead summarized the current document, which was posted as a discussion document at the Spring meeting. The MS incorporated comments from stakeholders into the Fall proposal and was responsive to the commenters who suggested the NOSB take a more holistic approach to some of the priorities. A member praised the process of having a discussion document in the Spring, which allows for additional feedback from stakeholders, and streamlines the process when preparing for the Fall meeting. The National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) has inquired about the Research Priorities, as they have incorporated them into their current Request for Proposals (RFPs).

Motion to accept the 2020 NOSB Research Priorities proposal

Motion by: DM

Seconded by: EO

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Marine materials (EO).** The lead updated the Subcommittee members on the most current iteration of the draft document and the group discussed it. The group supported the work and feels confident that the scientific input is solid and supportive, and achieves the next steps in this process to address broader ecosystem issues. Members praised the lead for producing a very comprehensive and thorough

document. The Subcommittee Chair reiterated that the Board and the NOP have a mandate to look at the broader concept of ecosystems services and to think holistically about organic agriculture. The NOP also provided feedback to the Subcommittee and was supportive of the language and goals for the document. Given the length of the document, the MS Chair asked that the lead write an executive summary for other NOSB members who are not on the Material's Subcommittee. The group discussed the potential for rulemaking and the considerations that go into that decision.

Motion to accept the proposal on marine macroalgae and crop fertility inputs

Motion by: EO

Seconded by: DM

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Chitosan petition.** The NOP received a third petition for chitosan. This most recent petition seeks use as a processing aid for the production of livestock feed: a flocculating/coagulating agent. The MS feels that it may be similar to the petitions currently under review by the Crops Subcommittee and because its use is for Livestock, the Livestock Subcommittee should review it. Ideally the Livestock Subcommittee will coordinate with someone from Handling to provide any additional assistance. The NOSB Chair will ask RG to sit in on the next Livestock call to provide guidance about how he conducted a cross Subcommittee review.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

July 28, 2020

Research Priorities (DM) - Discuss proposal/vote

Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal/vote

August 11, 2020

Research Priorities (DM) - Discuss proposal /vote

Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal/vote

September 8, 2020

Sanitizer panel update

Excluded Methods - discuss

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops SE - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in July	7.28.20 8.11.20	Proposal Fall 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A

Excluded Methods	DM/MJ/DS		06.09.20 07.14.20 09.08.20	TBD
------------------	----------	--	----------------------------------	-----

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07.14.20 09.08.20	Panel Fall 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	5.26.2020 06.09.20 07.14.20 07.28.20 8.11.20	Fall 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28 - 30, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, July 14, 2020 1:00 pm ET**

Attendees: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dan Seitz (DS); Jesse Buie (JB) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JD); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY)

Agenda

- Review June 9 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Update on the Sanitizer Panel session for the Fall meeting
- Excluded Methods (DM/MJ/DS) - Discuss
- Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 9 meeting notes** were accepted as written.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP)**
 - Chitosan TR was recently sent to the Crops Subcommittee for sufficiency review.
 - TRs under development and due to NOP in the next few months:
 - Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) for Handling (due back in September)
 - Biochar TR for Crops (due back in Nov)
 - TR requests recently sent out for bids:
 - Ammonia extract (Crops)
 - Kasugamicyn (Crops)
 - Activated charcoal (Livestock sunset)
 - Kaolin Pectin (Livestock sunset)
 - Mineral oil (Livestock sunset)
 - TR request call-orders under development by NOP:
 - Zein (Handling)
 - Propylene glycol (Livestock sunset)
 - Magnesium oxide (Crops sunset)
 - Ozone (Crops sunset)
 - Calcium chloride (Crops sunset)
 - NOP is expecting a couple of new petitions.
- **Marine materials (EO).** The lead discussed recent feedback she received from researchers and industry members, as well as the subsequent modifications to the current draft document based on that feedback. She also noted that there are a couple of items in the document that are still under revision. NOP provided guidance about regulatory language and portions which may be outside of NOPs authority under OFPA. MS members will provide the lead with some additional feedback and the MS will vote on the proposal on the next call.
- **Sanitizer Panel session for the Fall meeting.** The Sanitizer panel was originally scheduled for the Spring 2020 meeting, and was delayed to the Fall in the interest of holding the panel in person rather than virtually. The Subcommittee members discussed options if the NOSB does not meet in person in the Fall. There was unanimous support for holding the panel in the Fall, whether the NOSB meets in person or

not. The group discussed various options for scheduling including holding it at a later date, after the in-person meeting.

- **Excluded Methods (DM/MJ/DS).** The lead received feedback from other NOSB members and stakeholders, and will work towards a discussion document for the Spring 2021 meeting.
- **Additional items.** The MS added a call on July 28.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

June 9, 2020

Marine materials (EO) - Review of process thus far

July 14, 2020

Excluded Methods (DM/MJ/DS) - Discuss proposal
Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal

July 28, 2020

Research Priorities (DM) - Discuss proposal/vote
Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal/vote

August 11, 2020

Research Priorities (DM) - Discuss proposal /vote
Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal/vote

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops SE - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in July	7.28.20	Proposal Fall 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods	DM/MJ/DS		06.09.20 07.14.20	Spr 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07.14.20	Panel Fall 2020

Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	5.26.2020 06.09.20 07.14.20 07.28.20	Fall 2020
------------------	----	---	---	-----------

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, June 9, 2020 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- May 26 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Marine materials - discuss next steps
- Excluded Methods - status/process for updates
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 26 meeting notes** were accepted as is
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).** Members reviewed the status of NOSB work agenda items.

TR reviews (6 with NOSB):

Ion exchange filtration (Handling) - TR sufficiency due 5/10.
Fenbendazole (Livestock Petition) - TR sufficiency due 7/17
Chitosan (Crops Petition) - TR expected late June
Biochar (Crops Petition) - TR expected late September
Cetylpyridinium chloride (Handling Petition) - TR expected late November

Petitions (10 petitions with NOSB under various stages of review; none with NOP):

Cow manure derived biochar (Crops)
Chitosan (Crops, disease control)
Kasugamycin (Crops) - sufficiency determination needed
Paper chain pots (Crops)
Sodium carbonate lignin (Crops)
Ammonia Extract (Crops) - sufficiency determination needed
Fenbendazole (Livestock)
Gellan gum - low acyl (Handling)
Whey protein concentrate (Handling removal) - sufficiency determination needed
Cetylpyridinium Chloride (CPC) (Handling)

- **Marine materials.** The group discussed the draft annotation language for the marine materials proposal, which the lead continues to refine based on feedback from a large group of marine scientists across the US and Canada. The scientists represent a breadth of expertise and points of view. The MS will post a proposal for public comment prior to the Fall meeting.
- **Excluded Methods.** The MS expressed interest in continuing to add to this living document and move it forward for the Fall meeting. The previous NOSB work and documents were circulated to the Subcommittee members and the group discussed differences between gene editing techniques. One member added that her interest is in the area that focuses on the entry point to the food system, and to support that work, has reached out to ~25 stakeholders to gauge interest about which areas the NOSB

should focus on. The primary, and ongoing, question is how far back in the process chain should be considered when evaluating materials with regard to GMOs. The lead emphasized that from a consumer standpoint, it goes all the way back to the beginning. For the near term, the MS would like to narrow down the list of definitions in the Excluded Methods document to prioritize them. A subset of MS members will work on this topic.

- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

May 26, 2020 - Additional call

Marine materials (EO) - review of process thus far

June 9, 2020

Marine materials (EO) - Review of process thus far

July 14, 2020

Excluded Methods (DM/MJ/DS) - Discuss proposal

Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal

August 11, 2020

Excluded Methods (DM/MJ/DS) - Discuss proposal/vote

Marine materials (EO) - Discuss proposal/vote

Research Priorities (DM) - Discuss/vote

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops SE - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in July	8.11.20	Proposal Fall 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	DM/MJ/DS		06.09.20 07.14.20	Fall 2020

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.		Panel Fall 2020

Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	5.26.2020 06.09.20 07.14.20	Fall 2020
------------------	----	---	-----------------------------------	-----------

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, May 26, 2020 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- May 12 meeting notes (All)
- Marine materials
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 12 meeting notes** were accepted as is.
- **Marine materials (EO).** The lead circulated a draft document prior to the call and the members discussed three main areas: 1) the history of public comments, particularly those saying we should look at this issue in the context of all marine materials on the National List, 2) the issue of the precautionary principle, and 3) the roadmap for future action if the MS does or does not go forward with a proposal this fall. Initially the NOSB reviewed Marine Materials across all Subcommittees, then eventually narrowed the scope to address crop inputs and environmental impacts. The MS is considering an annotation of harvest parameters for seaweed used in fertilizer to minimize potential negative environmental impacts.

Members were supportive of the work project, and the annotation, and will move forward with a proposal for the fall to glean additional public comments. Members were generally supportive of moving forward with the specific project without expanding the scope.

The NOP and MS also discussed terminology in the draft regarding Material Evaluation Programs (MEP) versus Material Review Organizations (MROs). The NOP noted that the term MEP, included in the draft annotation, has been used in the Program Handbook to include certifying agents (NOP 5012), although the draft annotation intends to address third-party review organizations that are not certifying agents. NOP also encouraged the language be revised to be clearer that on-site inspections (vs. affidavits) of harvesters are intended, and to provide rationale for that requirement.

A member added that OFPA doesn't include any language about inspection of inputs and/or organic certification of inputs, and it is somewhat unclear if the NOP has the authority to regulate along these lines. NOP will seek additional input regarding authority.

- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

May 12, 2020

May 26, 2020 - Additional call
 Marine materials (EO) - review of process thus far.
 June 9, 2020
 Marine materials (EO) - review of process thus far.
 July 14, 2020
 August 11, 2020
 September 8, 2020
 October 13, 2020
 November 10, 2020
 December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in July	8.11.2020	Proposal Fall 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods	DM/MJ			TBD

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.		Panel Fall 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	5.26.2020	Fall 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, May 12, 2020 1:00 pm ET

Present: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dan Seitz (DS); Jesse Buie (JB) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- April 14 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Excluded Methods - status/process for updates
- Marine materials - discuss next steps
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 14 meeting notes** were accepted as is
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).** Members reviewed the list of work agenda items and discussed the overall review process, for the benefit of the new members.
 - **TR reviews (6 with NOSB):**
 - Sodium hydroxide (Handling Sunset) - Response to HS questions due back mid-May
 - Ion exchange filtration (Handling) - TR Suff due 5/10
 - Lignins (Sodium carbonate lignin) (Crops Petition) - TR Suff due 6/9
 - Fenbendazole (Livestock Petition) - TR expected late May
 - Chitosan (Crops Petition) - TR expected late June
 - Biochar (Crops Petition) - TR expected late September
 - **Petitions: (10 petitions with NOSB, 2 with NOP)**
 - Kasugamycin (Crops Petition) - Mentioned during NOSB mtg, under NOP review
 - Ammonia extract (Crops Petition) - Mentioned during NOSB mtg, under NOP review
 - **NOSB (sufficiency determination needed)**
 - Zein (Handling Petition)
 - Whey protein concentrate (Handling Petition)
 - Cetylpyridinium chloride (Handling Petition)
 - Phosphoric acid (Handling Petition). Pending comments from petitioner.
- **Excluded Methods (MJ/DM) - status/process for updates.** The group discussed the previous work on excluded methods, the process by which these recommendations are codified, and the steps forward. The co-lead asked about assessing Excluded Methods with regard to handling and processing, such as seed modification, manufacturing of colors, etc. MJ will develop a draft document for a future call.
- **Marine materials (EO) - discuss next steps.** The lead noted public comments suggesting that the NOSB review marine materials across Subcommittees. Given the scope and breadth of this project, the MS continues to support the convening of a task force, or other support from NOP. The lead asked for feedback from members about bringing a proposal to the Fall meeting proposing an annotation, or if

they should develop a more comprehensive all-encompassing document. EO will develop a draft document for discussion on the next call.

- **Additional items.** The MS will add an extra call in May to discuss Marine Materials.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

April 14, 2020

May 12, 2020

May 26, 2020 - Additional call

Marine materials (EO) - review of process thus far.

June 9, 2020

Marine materials (EO) - review of process thus far.

July 14, 2020

August 11, 2020

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in July		Proposal Fall 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods	DM/MJ			TBD

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.		Panel Fall 2020

Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	Fall 2020
------------------	----	---	-----------

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, April 14, 2020 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Emily Oakley (EO); Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- March 10 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Public comments - discuss
- Marine materials - discuss
- Sanitizer panel abstract and panelists update (DM/All)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 10 meeting notes** were approved as written
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP)**
 - TRs on ion exchange filtration and lignins were sent to the Handling and Crops Subcommittees, respectively
 - The TR for fenbendazole is due in early May
 - TR for Biochar likely won't be back in time to inform work for fall meeting
 - Zein (HS). Petition under review by Handling
 - Phosphoric acid (HS). Petition under review by Handling
 - NOP is reviewing three new petitions, including one to prohibit liquid ammonia extracts.
 - Sunsets. Because the list of substances due to sunset in 2023 is short, some reviews that would regularly occur in 2022 (i.e., with 2024 sunset dates) will be moved up a year to distribute the sunset review workload. The final list of materials to advance is still under consideration and may include all chlorine materials.
- **Marine materials (EO).** The lead asked the NOP to review the document that the MS developed to solicit feedback from various stakeholders and scientists. NOP indicated that this project may require interagency review, reminded members about OFPA criteria to prohibit nonsynthetic substances, and noted that information about the potential impacts to industry would be helpful. The group discussed many aspects of this project, including groups and organizations with which to engage.
- **Sanitizer panel abstract and panelists update (DM/All).** The sanitizer panel was deferred to the Fall meeting. The NOSB and panelists felt that it was more valuable to hold the panel in person.
- **Additional items.**
 - Members briefly discussed public comments. The MS received a few comments on the Research Priorities.
 - Excluded methods (MJ). A member asked that work on excluded methods continue after the NOSB meeting concludes.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

March 10, 2020

Marine Materials - discuss

Sanitizer panel update

April 14, 2020

May 12, 2020

June 9, 2020

July 14, 2020

August 11, 2020

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	DD Spring 2020
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods	DM/MJ		12.10.20	TBD

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	Panel Fall 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20 03.03.20 4.14.20	Fall 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 29 - 30 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, March 10, 2020 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Emily Oakley (EO); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- February 11 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Marine materials - discuss
- Sanitizer panel abstract and panelists update (DM/All)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 11 meeting notes approved as is**
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP)**
 - Three TRs are under review by the NOSB: Crops - insecticidal soaps (due 3.3.20); Handling - Konjac, and sodium hydroxide (suff due 4.6.20).
 - The TR for Ion exchange filtration is under review by NOP, and the NOP will send it to the Handling Subcommittee as soon as it is ready.
 - There are three TRs in development: Sodium carbonate lignin (CS), Fenbendazole (LD), and chitosan (CS)
 - The NOP is reviewing a couple new petitions including one for zein, which will likely be sent to the Handling Subcommittee. Handling sent questions to the petitioner about whey protein concentrate. The petitioner responded to questions from the HS about low acyl gellan gum and those were forwarded to the HS for review. Handling is also reviewing two other petitions: Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) and phosphoric acid.
- **2023 sunsets, to be reviewed by NOSB in 2021.** There are only 16 substances due to sunset in 2023, and NOP proposed to pull ~18 forward from the next (2024) to balance out the workload. Many are Livestock substances. The Materials Subcommittee agreed that this would be a good idea. TR requests for these substances would be due to NOP by July 2020.
- **Marine materials (EO).** The lead continues to talk with stakeholders and review comments from panelists. She noted that the MS received varied comments based on which stakeholder group they came from: certifiers, producers, or handlers. The next step is to contact researchers/scientists to confirm terminology in the proposal. The MS may have a proposal for Fall 2020. The lead asked for additional discussion time on the Spring meeting agenda (15 minutes) to discuss this more. The NOP remarked that the Handling Subcommittee is also working on a component of marine materials, and was going to reach out to NOAA.
- **Sanitizer panel abstract and panelists update (DM/All).** The lead updated the group about the sanitizer panelists and panel charge. The MS Chairperson will introduce the panelists at the NOSB meeting. The Subcommittee will discuss the order of presentations.
- **Additional items.**
 - Excluded Methods. The MS Chair will send previous work on this topic to the new members, in the interest of keeping the project moving forward.

- The meeting was adjourned.

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

February 11, 2020

March 10, 2020

Marine Materials - discuss

Sanitizer panel update

April 14, 2020

May 12, 2020

June 9, 2020

July 14, 2020

August 11, 2020

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	DD Spring 2020
Petition and TR tracking	HB/DP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods	HB		12.10.20	TBD

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO. AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	Panel Spring 2020

Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019.	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20 03.03.20	Fall 2020
------------------	----	---	--	-----------

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, February 11, 2020 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Emily Oakley (EO); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- MS call times
- January 14 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote
- Sanitizer panel abstract and panelists update (DM/All)
- Marine Materials proposal - discuss/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **MS call times:** The MS Chair thanked the members for agreeing to reschedule the Materials Subcommittee calls to accommodate a teaching conflict for the semester.
- **January 14 meeting** notes were approved with no changes.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP)**
 - TRs - Under review by NOSB
 - Sodium hydroxide sunset review - TR sent to HS on 2/6
 - Insecticidal soaps (CS) and konjac flour (HS) TRs are under review by Subcommittees
 - TRs - In process (with NOP)
 - Chitosan (petitioned for plant disease control) - CS requested a TR and NOP has begun the contracting process
 - Fenbendazole (petitioned for poultry treatment) - TR contract is being finalized
 - Petitions - Currently under review by NOSB
 - HS: Whey protein concentrate; low-acyl gellan gum; cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC); phosphoric acid (605) sent on 1/28
 - LS: Fenbendazole
 - CS: Biochar from cow manure; chitosan; paper chain pots; sodium carbonate lignin
 - No new petitions expected to be sent to NOSB prior to the Spring meeting
 - Update: NOP conveyed to petitioner that HS found the red jalapeno pepper petition insufficient
- **Research Priorities (RPs) (All) - discuss/vote.** The MS Chair summarized the history of the research priorities for the new members, and the group discussed the draft discussion document. Once the NOSB finalizes its recommendations at the Fall meeting, the document is forwarded to various research organizations, including the USDA organic transitions program, National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA), and Agricultural Research Service (ARS). Ideally these entities will review the priorities and incorporate them into their calls for proposals. The MS moved to a vote on the Spring discussion document.

Motion to accept the 2020 research priorities discussion document

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: EO

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Sanitizer panel update (DM/All).** The lead updated the members on the status of the panel and panelists, and provided the history of this work agenda request. The panel will consist of three experts who have a breadth of expertise with sanitizers. Each will have 10-15 minutes for presentations, and then will engage with the NOSB for Q&A. The NOSB developed an abstract for the panelists to scope the goal of the panel. The NOP will send out invitations later this week or early next week.
- **Marine Materials.** The lead summarized the history of this project. In 2015 during the sunset review of several listings for marine algae and marine materials the issue of environmental impacts was raised, as well as other aspects. The NOSB engaged with stakeholders to develop a proposal and held a panel in the Fall 2019 to glean more info. The MS will not put forth a document for the Spring meeting.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

January 14, 2020

February 11, 2020

March 10, 2020

Marine Materials.

Sanitizer panel update

April 14, 2020

May 12, 2020

June 9, 2020

July 14, 2020

August 11, 2020

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

Work agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	DD Spring 2020
Petition and TR tracking	HB/DP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods	HB		12.10.20	TBD

*Discussed. *Voted

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO. AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	Panel Spring 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019. Possible discussion document Spr 2020.	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	Fall 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, January 14, 2020 2:00 pm ET**

Attending: Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE); Emily Oakley (EO); Lisa de Lima (LD); Wood Turner (WT) - observer; Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- December 10 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (DP)
- Research Priorities (All)
- Sanitizer panel update (DM/All)
- Marine Materials update (EO)
- Contamination of farm inputs
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 10 meeting** notes were approved as written.
- **TR and Materials Update (DP).**
 - The NOSB is currently reviewing two draft TRs for sufficiency: insecticidal soaps and konjac flour. The konjac flour TR was contracted by NOP to support the review of the NOSB's recommendation to remove konjac flour from the National List (Fall 2017). The NOP has provided the draft TR to the Board for any feedback. Two TRs for sodium hydroxide (sunset review) and ion exchange filtration will be sent to NOSB soon. The TRs for sodium carbonate lignin and fenbendazole should be completed this spring. The NOP is reviewing several new petitions: shilajit; phosphoric acid as a PH control. The NOSB is working on (various stages): paper chain pots, low-acyl gellan gum, fenbendazole; chitosan for plant disease control; biochar; and cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC).
 - The National List Manager job announcement should post this week or next.
- **Research Priorities (All).** DM will contact each of the Subcommittees (HS, CS and LS) and request they send the research priorities document to the Materials Subcommittee so MS can approve the final discussion document on the February 11 call.
- **Sanitizer panel update (HB/DM/All).** The lead wrote a draft outline with some questions for the panel, using the TR request as a basis, and asked that other members provide input. Members discussed several potential panelists that represent a breadth of expertise including an academic and former organic inspector, and a representative from EcoLab who can speak to sanitizer formulations. The NOSB is seeking feedback about several aspects: Assessing sanitizers with regard to the OFPA criteria, formulations in sanitizers, and the need for sanitizers in food processing for food safety. Ultimately the NOSB is seeking to better understand the currently approved sanitizers so when new ones are petitioned, they better understand how to review them in relation to each other. HB will write a summary for the panel and provide that to EO. Will follow up on Executive call on January 21.
- **Marine Materials update (EO).** The lead summarized the draft discussion document and is seeking additional feedback from stakeholders before finalizing the document for the Spring 2020 meeting. The MS will discuss and vote on the document on the February 11 call.

- **Contamination of farm inputs (DM).** The NOP has put this project on hold, as it is not a priority.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 2:00 ET)

January 14, 2020
 February 11, 2020
 March 10, 2020
 April 14, 2020
 May 12, 2020
 June 9, 2020
 July 14, 2020
 August 11, 2020
 September 8, 2020
 October 13, 2020
 November 10, 2020
 December 8, 2020

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	DD Spring 2020
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Excluded Methods	HB		12.10.20	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	Panel Spring 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019. Possible discussion document Spr 2020	11.12.19 1.14.20 2.11.20	Spr 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020