

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

### **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes**

**Tuesday, December 10, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Dave Mortensen (DM), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE); Asa Bradman (AB) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Wood Turner (WT) - observer

**Absent:** Emily Oakley (EO); Lisa de Lima (LD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

#### **Agenda**

- November 12 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (DP)
- Sanitizer panel update (All)
- Excluded Methods - discuss 2020 goals (HB/DM)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

#### **Discussion**

- **November 12** meeting notes were accepted with no changes.
- **TR and Materials Update (DP)**
  - Chitosan petition was sent to the Crops Subcommittee and will be posted on the website soon. The Program is working through some technical issues around getting the petition posted to the website.
  - Whey protein concentrate petition (for removal) is under review by NOP
  - Several other new petitions were recently received and are under NOP review.
  - One TR out for contracting for sodium carbonate lignin. NOP anticipates that it could be back for the spring meeting.
  - There are five TRs in progress, with four of those due back to the Program in the next month (insecticidal soaps, konjac flour, sodium hydroxide, and ion exchange filtration). NOP is waiting for questions on fenbendazole from Livestock. HB will touch base with SB about them.
- **Sanitizer panel update.** The MS is working on organizing a panel for the Spring meeting. Several members suggested potential panelists to ensure there is a breadth of experience and expertise. Members will identify folks and coordinate with each other to discuss further. MA will check with DP about a possible Federal representative.
- **Excluded Methods (HB).** The lead noted that she will transition duties to DM when she rotates off the NOSB in January. In support of that she will introduce him to stakeholders who are engaged in this topic and have provided support. The goal is to put forth a discussion document at the Spring 2020 meeting and a proposal in Fall 2020. HB will develop the next template for the spring.
- **Contamination of farm Inputs.** DM reached out to stakeholders regarding the contamination of farm inputs work agenda item. The scope of the issue was quite broad - water quality, contaminants in manure, etc. The NOP has put this item on hold, but the MS is proposing to put it back on its agenda, perhaps for the Fall 2020 meeting, if they determine it is important. HB and DM will discuss this more on next call.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

November 12, 2019

Explore Sanitizers panel abstract

December 10, 2019

January 14, 2020

Sanitizer panel - discuss potential panelists/charge to panel

Excluded Methods - discuss draft proposal

Marine Materials - discuss draft proposal

Contamination of farm Inputs - discuss.

February 11, 2020

March 10, 2020

April 14, 2020

May 12, 2020

June 9, 2020

July 14, 2020

August 11, 2020

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

**Work agenda**

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	11 12 19	DD Spring 2020
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Excluded Methods	HB	Proposal	TBD	TBD

**Other Projects**

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	11.12.19	Panel Spring 2020

Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling				
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019. Proposal Spr 2020	11.12.19	Spr 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes**  
**Tuesday, November 12, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE)  
**Absent:** Lisa de Lima (LD); Dan Seitz (DS)  
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA)

**Agenda**

- October 8 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (DP)
- Sanitizers - review panel abstract and discuss potential panelists (HB)
- Research Priorities - discuss spring discussion document (DM/all)
- Contamination of Farm Inputs - discuss any next steps?? (all)
- Update on Marine Algae Spring Proposal (EO)
- Excluded Methods - discuss 2020 goals (HB/DM)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **October 8 meeting notes** were approved as is.
- **TR and Materials Update (DP)**
  - **TR status** - five TRs in process, with first drafts due back to NOP mid-November through December:

Insecticidal soaps	Crops	11/18/19
Konjac flour	Handling	11/23/19
Sodium hydroxide	Handling	12/23/19
Ion exchange filtration	Handling	12/23/19
Sodium carbonate lignin	Crops	TBD
Fenbendazole?	Livestock	TBD - awaiting Qs from LS

- **Petitions** - three under review by NOP for completeness (chitosan as pesticide, whey protein concentrate removal, biochar from manure); waiting for NOSB petition sufficiency determination for low-acyl gellan gum and red jalapeno pepper; NOSB deemed two petitions sufficient (fenbendazole, sodium carbonate lignin).
- **Sanitizers (HB)**. The group discussed possible panelists and the abstract/charge for the panel. HB will reach out to NOP for suggestions about other panelists and expertise.
- **Research Priorities (DM/all)**. The MS intends on incorporating the Fall 2019 public comments into the previous research priorities document, making any suggested changes and perhaps adding questions, and reposting it as a discussion document for the Spring 2020 meeting. The goal is to solicit feedback from stakeholders earlier in the review process.

- **Contamination of Farm Inputs (all).** The MS will place this project on hold as this is not a priority for the USDA. The entry in the work agenda table below was removed.
- **Marine Algae Spring Proposal (EO).** The Chair shared feedback from the Fall 2019 meeting regarding the question of developing an annotation vs. requiring certification. The lead will continue to work on this project, and asked for feedback from the other members.
- **Excluded Methods (HB/DM).** Deferred to next call due to lack of time.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

Explore Sanitizers panel abstract

December 10, 2019

January 14, 2020

February 11, 2020

March 10, 2020

April 14, 2020

May 12, 2020

June 9, 2020

July 14, 2020

August 11, 2020

September 8, 2020

October 13, 2020

November 10, 2020

December 8, 2020

**Work agenda**

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	11 12 19	DD Spring 2020
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Excluded Methods	HB		TBD	TBD

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	11.12.19	Panel Spring 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel Fall 2019. Proposal Spr 2020		Spr 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes** **Tuesday, October 8, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB)

**Absent:** Dan Seitz (DS); Lisa de Lima (LD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

### **Agenda**

- September 10 meeting notes (All)
- Contamination of Farm Inputs (DP/all)
- Sanitizer Spring Panel - (HB/all)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **September 10 meeting notes** were approved as is.
- **Contamination of Farm Inputs (DP/all)**. Members discussed the importance of this issue and what the best path forward would be. The NOP is focused on Strengthening Organic Enforcement and fraud prevention and this is not a priority at this time. It will remain on the work agenda and members will discuss at a future meeting.
- **Sanitizer Spring Panel - (HB/all)**. Members discussed the intent and goal of the panel, and what the anticipated result would be. The members also discussed possible panelists. NOP suggested having an expert who could address regulatory aspects.
- **Additional items**. None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous MS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

September 10, 2019

New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.

Sanitizers - discuss panel

Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document

Update on marine algae panel

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

Explore Sanitizers panel abstract

December 10, 2019

## Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	06 17 19 07 30 19 08 13 19	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB		08 13 19	Fall 2019
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document	08 13 19	Fall 2019

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.	09 10 19	TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07 30 19 08 13 19 09 10 19	Panel Spring 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.	07 09 19 07 30 19 09 10 19	Panel Fall 2019



Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes** **Tuesday, September 10, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Lisa de Lima (LD)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA)

### **Agenda**

- August 13 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (MA)
- New work agenda Item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes (all)
- Sanitizers - discuss panel (HB)
- Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document (all)
- Update on Marine Algae Panel (EO)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **August 13 meeting notes** were approved as is.
- **Technical Reports (TRs) and Materials Update (MA). NOP will be sending out bids for three TRs**, all for the Handling Subcommittee: Konjac flour, sodium hydroxide, and ion exchange filtration. The TR for insecticidal soaps in Crops is in development by the contractor.
- **New work agenda Item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes (all).** The group discussed the addition of this project, which was suggested by a stakeholder group. The Chair suggested this might best fit in Handling. Members would like to discuss this further with the stakeholder group to clarify what they are seeking, and the MS will discuss it at the next Executive call.
- **Sanitizers - discuss panel (HB).** The NOSB discussed a panel for the Spring 2020 meeting. Members discussed the scope and charge for the panel and potential panelists. The MS will continue this conversation on the November MS call.
- **Update on Marine Algae Panel (EO).** The MS Chair updated the members about the four panelists that have been invited to sit on the panel.
- **Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document (all).** MS would like to discuss this further with the NOP to clarify the history of the project and to determine what the NOP is seeking. DM and EO will work on this project.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous MS Notes](#)

### **Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

August 13, 2019

Genetic Integrity of Seed (HB). Discuss/vote

Excluded Methods proposal (HB). Discuss/vote

Research Priorities Update (DM). Discuss/vote

September 10, 2019

New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.

Sanitizers - discuss panel

Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document

Update on marine algae panel

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

Explore Sanitizers panel abstract

December 10, 2019

### Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	06 17 19 07 30 19 08 13 19	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB		08 13 19	TBD
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document	08 13 19	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.	09 10 19	TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07 30 19 08 13 19 09 10 19	Panel Spring 2020

Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.	07 09 19 07 30 19 09 10 19	Panel Fall 2019
------------------	----	--	----------------------------------	-----------------

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes** **Tuesday, August 13, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

### **Agenda**

- July 30 meeting notes (All)
- Materials and TR Update (DP)
- Excluded Methods proposal (HB). Discuss/vote
- Genetic Integrity of Seed (HB). Discuss/vote
- Research Priorities Update (DM). Discuss/vote
- Sanitizers
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **July 30 meeting notes** were approved with no changes.
- **Materials and TR Update (DP)**. The TR for paper pots has been posted on the AMS website.
- **Excluded Methods: Induced Mutagenesis and Embryo Transfer in Livestock proposal (HB)**. The lead summarized the current iteration of the proposal and the group moved to a vote.

Motion to accept the excluded methods proposal

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: DS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Genetic Integrity of Seed (HB)**. The lead summarized the document for the group noting that it is a good start. Members discussed the language and made some minor modifications before proceeding to a vote.

Motion to accept the genetic integrity of seed proposal

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: DM

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

**Research Priorities Update (DM)**. The lead summarized the major changes since the last version of the research priorities. The NOSB has added four (4) new research priorities, 3 of them are Crop related.

Motion to accept the 2019 research priorities proposal

Motion by: DM

Seconded by: LD  
 Additional discussion: None  
 Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Sanitizers.** The NOP suggested that the MS convene a panel in Spring 2020 to help inform this work and the MS will not proceed with a document at this time. Members discussed further the need to review sanitizers as a group. The lead noted that the goal was to help inform future NOSB reviews when new sanitizers are petitioned. The MS will provide a verbal update at the fall 2019 meeting and will continue to discuss a panel on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

July 30, 2019 - Additional call

- New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes
- Contamination of Farm Inputs
- Sanitizer Update (HB)
- Research Priorities Update (DM)
- Marine Materials panel (All) - discuss

August 13, 2019

- Genetic Integrity of Seed (HB). Discuss/vote
- Excluded Methods proposal (HB). Discuss/vote
- Research Priorities Update (DM). Discuss/vote

September 10, 2019

- New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.
- Sanitizers - discuss panel
- Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document
- Update on marine algae panel

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

December 10, 2019

**Work agenda**

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	06 17 19 07 30 19 08 13 19	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA

GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB		08 13 19	TBD
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document	08 13 19	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.	09 10 19	TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07 30 19 08 13 19 09 10 19	Panel Spring 2020
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.	07 09 19 07 30 19 09 10 19	Panel Fall 2019

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018

Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes** **Tuesday, July 30, 2019 2:00 pm ET draft**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Absent:** Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Paul Lewis (PL)

### **Agenda**

- July 9 meeting notes (All)
- Materials and TR Update (DP)
- Sanitizer Update (HB)
- Research Priorities Update (DM)
- Genetic Integrity of Organic Seed Update (HB)
- Marine Materials panel - discuss
- Excluded Methods Update (HB)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **July 9 meeting notes** were reviewed and accepted with minor corrections.
- **Materials and TR Update (DP).**
  - The draft TRs for fish-based fertilizers and paper pots & containers were sent to the Crops Subcommittee July 26.
  - The revised TR for ascorbic acid was sent to the Handling Subcommittee July 24.
  - A petition for sodium carbonate lignin was sent to the Crops Subcommittee on July 29. NOP encouraged the subcommittee to put forward a discussion document for the fall meeting, as time permits.
  - A petition to add nonorganic red jalapeño peppers to §205.606 is under review by NOP.
  - There are several petitions currently under review by the Board, including potassium hypochlorite, fenbendazole, and fatty alcohols.
  - NOP received a petition for potassium sorbate as a crop input, and it was returned to the petitioner for additional information.
  - The group discussed the request to add a work agenda item to the Handling Subcommittees work agenda to annotate fish oil. The NOP previously asked that the Subcommittee determine if this overlaps with the liquid fish annotation work agenda. The members indicated that they are not similar and there is not enough overlap, since one is listed for crops use and one if for handling use, and conflating the two might be confusing. The HS is seeking a decision from NOP on moving forward with the work agenda item before the vote on the sunset review, August 6.
- **Sanitizer Update (HB).** The group discussed the best approach moving forward: a panel or technical report (TR). The NOP feels the request is too broad and a technical report would not be successful. NOP is supportive of a panel, which could produce a white paper or written proceedings, and could be a good first step. The group discussed the goals of this project, which they envision would include a comparison and assessment of classes of sanitizers, such as alcohols or chlorine based sanitizers, based on the OFPA criteria. The Materials Subcommittee is seeking a resolution by the Fall 2019 NOSB meeting as to how they are going to move forward.

- **Research Priorities (RPs) Update (DM).** The Materials Subcommittee will vote on the final research priorities proposal on the next call.
- **Genetic Integrity of Seed (HB).** The lead author relayed feedback from commenters regarding the last proposal and the group discussed this feedback in light of the current state of seed testing. The MS intends on putting forth a proposal for the Fall 2019 meeting. The goals of this proposal are 1. Lessen the percentage of GE contamination in seed corn, and 2. Increase transparency so farmers can make informed decisions when purchasing seed. The lead will be discussing this with the Organic Seed Alliance, and the MS will continue the conversation on the next call.
- **Excluded Methods proposal (HB).** The MS will present a proposal at the Fall 2019 meeting that will include embryo transfer in livestock and induced mutagenesis.
- **Marine Materials panel (All).** The MS Chair has discussed this topic with many stakeholders and the NOP, and the MS is moving forward with panelist selection. The MS will invite four (4) panelists who represent a wide swath of the community, including two (2) scientists specializing in marine ecology and seaweed, one (1) certifier, and one (1) harvester. The MS has proposed a broad list of questions and will ask each of the panelists to address those which they feel most qualified to answer.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous MS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

July 9, 2019

July 30, 2019 - Additional call

New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes

Contamination of Farm Inputs

Sanitizer Update (HB)

Research Priorities Update (DM)

Marine Materials panel (All) - discuss

August 13, 2019

New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.

Genetic Integrity of Seed (HB). Discuss/vote

Excluded Methods proposal (HB). Discuss/vote

Research Priorities Update (DM). Discuss/vote

September 10, 2019

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

December 10, 2019

## Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	06 17 19 07 30 19	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB			TBD
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document		TBD

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.	07 30 19	TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07 30 19	Discussion doc Fall 2019
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18. Panel approved by NOP 7/17/2019	07 09 19 07 30 19	Discussion doc /Panel Fall 2019

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes** **Monday, July 9, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Absent:** None

**Guest Speaker:** Patricia Bianchi

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DM)

### **Agenda**

- June 17 meeting notes (All)
- Guest speaker from ASC-MSC
- Marine materials/algae panelist discussion (all)
- Materials and TR Update (DP)
- Sanitizer Update (HB)
- Research Priorities Update (DM)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **June 17 meeting notes** were accepted as is.
- **Guest speaker** from Marine Stewardship Council - Aquaculture Stewardship Council (**ASC-MSC**). Patricia Bianchi, Policy Manager of ASC-MSC joined the call to discuss the Marine stewardship council (farm focus), and aquaculture stewardship council (aquaculture and seaweed focus). Ms. Bianchi described how their environmental standards were developed and how they are being measured and verified in practice, and members asked follow-up questions about harvesting and sustainability. Ms. Bianchi offered to forward additional resources to the MS and the Subcommittee would like to reach out again as they continue to work on the Marine Materials project.
- **Marine algae panelist discussion (all)**. The MS members discussed the logistics and desired expertise for a panel on marine materials. The lead suggested a certifier, two marine scientists, and a harvester. The group also discussed the utility of holding two panels – the first of which to discuss harvesting and production, and the second to address environmental concerns. The lead will reach out to previous commenters for additional feedback.
- **Materials and TR Update (DP)**. Deferred to next call.
- **Sanitizer Update (HB)**. Deferred to next call.
- **Research Priorities Update (DM)**. Deferred to next call.
- **Additional items**. None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous MS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

June 17, 2019, Monday. Rescheduled from June 11

July 9, 2019

July 30, 2019 - Additional call

New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.

Contamination of Farm Inputs

Sanitizer Update (HB).

Research Priorities Update (DM)

Marine Materials panel - discuss

August 13, 2019

September 10, 2019

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

December 10, 2019

### Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	06 17 19 07 30 19	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB			TBD
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document		TBD

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.	07 30 19	TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.	07 30 19	Discussion doc Fall 2019
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.	07 09 19 07 30 19	Discussion doc /Panel Fall 2019

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes**

### **Monday, June 17, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Guest:** Bob Durst, Oregon State University (OSU)

**Absent:** Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DM); Paul Lewis (PL)

#### **Agenda**

- May 14 meeting notes (All)
- Sanitizer TR Request - Meet with Bob Durst of Oregon State University (HB)
- MS 2019 Research Priorities - Review last year's MS research priorities to keep/edit/delete/add.
- Marine algae panel - Discuss timeframe, questions, and inviting panelists. (EO)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

#### **Discussion**

- **May 14 meeting notes** were approved as is
- **Sanitizer TR Request.** Bob Durst, Oregon State University Food Science, was invited to provide guidance regarding the Materials' Subcommittee request for a technical report on sanitizers. Dr. Durst is a food scientist who has spent approximately 40 years in both academia and organic agriculture. He has conducted organic food inspections for Oregon Tilth, been involved in materials reviews for CCOF and OMRI, and has written technical reports (TRs), including the TR for the NOSB on citric acid. He also has extensive experience with processing, and the organic industry in general. Dr. Durst expressed his support for the project to develop a tool to compare various types of sanitizers. The group discussed the draft request for a technical report and noted that while a challenging task, would be worthwhile. Members discussed the format of the TR request and perhaps grouping the sanitizers. Dr. Durst will review the questions and provide feedback to the lead.
- **MS 2019 Research Priorities (EO/DM).** Each NOSB Subcommittee is reviewing its previous research priorities and making additions or deletions. The Material's Subcommittee discussed modifications a member proposed. One of the leads will incorporate the suggestions, reformat the document into a narrative, and recirculate it to the MS members.
- **Marine Algae Panel (EO).** The group discussed having a panel at the Fall 2019 meeting. Ideally it would include four experts, and be 1.5 hours long. Each panel member would have approximately 10 minutes for a presentation and then there would be Q & A with the NOSB. Members discussed potential panelists who could represent a breadth of stakeholders. A member suggested inviting an expert to the July 9 MS call to discuss marine materials.
- **Additional items.**
  - The lead is working with stakeholders to develop discussion documents for the fall meeting for two work agenda items: Genetic integrity transparency of seed grown on organic land (formerly Seed purity from GMOs) and Excluded methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer.
  - The MS scheduled an additional call for July 30 and may cancel it if it is unnecessary.
- **The meeting was adjourned**



[Previous MS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

May 14, 2019

June 17, 2019, Monday. Rescheduled from June 11

July 9, 2019

July 30, 2019 - Additional call

New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.

Contamination of Farm Inputs

August 13, 2019

September 10, 2019

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

December 10, 2019

**Work agenda**

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	06 17 19	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB			TBD
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document		TBD

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.		TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19.		Discussion doc Fall 2019
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.		Discussion doc /Panel Fall 2019

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes** **Tuesday, May 14, 2019 2:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Clarissa Mathews (CM); Devon Pattillo (DM)

### **Agenda**

- March 12 meeting notes (All)
- Update on Materials and TRs (CM)
- Marine Materials in Organic Crop Production (EO)
  - - for the open docket
  - - expert panel for fall
- Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling TR Request (HB, EO)
- Research Priorities Fall 2019 (EO, DM)
- Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land for Fall? (HB)
- Excluded Method Determinations Proposal for Fall? (HB)
- New Work Agenda Item Suggestion - "development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes"
- Contamination of Farm Inputs
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **March 12 meeting notes were approved as is**
- **Update on Materials and TRs (CM).**
  - Anticipating the paper pot TR in mid-to-late August.
  - The request for a TR for sanitizers was recently revised and the NOP will send it out for bids
  - Fatty alcohols petition was found sufficient by the Crops Subcommittee
  - Potassium hypochlorite petition in Crops is awaiting sufficiency
  - There are nine (9) other petitions in various stages of review and NOP will forward them when they are complete and ready.
  - The NOP drafted a comparison of the fatty alcohols petitions (the original and the re-petition) and will send that to the both the Crops and Materials Subcommittees.
- **Marine Materials in Organic Crop Production (EO)**
  - NOP will post the Spring document in the open docket for comment once it is open. A Materials Review Organization (MRO) is going to put a link to it in their newsletter directing people to the document.
  - Expert panel for fall. Although time is more limited at the Fall meeting, the lead feels it would be useful to have an expert panel on marine materials. Members supported this idea. The MS emphasized that it is important to convene experts and have enough time for Q & A after the panel. The members want to ensure that they have the breadth of

expertise and viewpoints. A member asked what the goal of the panel is and if there is a path forward? EO will send out questions that were posed via public comment.

- The Materials Subcommittee may consider inviting experts to sit in on Subcommittee calls.
- **Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling TR Request (HB, EO).** The leads revised the TR request and will submit it to NOP soon.
- **Research Priorities Fall 2019 (EO, DM).** The MS Chair explained the process by which the Subcommittees will complete their priorities' lists, so they can get them to the Materials Subcommittee in time to vote on them in July.
  - DM offered to look at what was funded in last round of NIFA grants, and will reach out to National program leaders to summarize grants in progress for OREI, NIFA, SARE, etc.
- **Genetic integrity transparency of seed grown on organic land (HB).** The lead is awaiting information from the Seed Alliance regarding unintended negative consequences. A member emphasized the importance of focusing on the positive aspects in order to move forward. Would like to potentially bring something to the Fall meeting.
- **Excluded method determinations proposal for Fall (HB).** The lead will reach out to stakeholders to determine how to move forward.
- **New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.** Deferred to next call
- **Contamination of Farm Inputs.** Deferred to next call
- **Additional items**
  - Origin of livestock (OOL). NOP and NOSB received many comments at the Spring NOSB meeting. Members asked if there was anything the Board could do to aid the NOP to move this forward. NOP is hoping to get OOL on the Fall unified agenda for the USDA
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous MS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

May 14, 2019

June 17, 2019, Monday. Rescheduled from June 11

New work agenda item suggestion - Development of criteria for evaluating products of fermentation processes.

Genetic integrity transparency of seed grown on organic land

Contamination of Farm Inputs

July 9, 2019

August 13, 2019

September 10, 2019

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

December 10, 2019

## Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	5 14 19	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB		5 14 19	TBD
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document		TBD

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.		TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18. TR request sent to NOP 02 27 19. Revisions by NOP and MS in progress.	05 14 19	Discussion doc Fall 2019
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.	05 14 19	Discussion doc Fall 2019

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes Tuesday, February 12, 2019 1:30 pm ET draft**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Clarissa Mathews (CM)

### **Agenda**

- Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land
- Proposal Excluded Method Determinations
- Induced Mutagenesis and Embryo Transfer in Livestock
- Marine Materials in Organic Crop Production
- Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling
- Update on Materials and TRs
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land discussion document.** The lead summarized the draft discussion document and the public comments that were submitted to the open docket. The initial intention was to draft a proposal, but the lead felt that based on the need for additional feedback, it is best to have a discussion document for the Spring meeting.

Motion to accept the discussion document on genetic integrity transparency of seed grown on organic land.

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: LD

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded method determinations April 2019 proposal.** The lead reviewed the proposal and the MS members discussed it briefly. After some minor modifications the group moved to a vote.

Motion to accept the proposal on excluded method determinations

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: DM

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document.** The group discussed the draft document and members made suggestions for some structural/formatting changes. The MS is seeking more input from the community on these topics and will post the discussion document for the Spring meeting.

Motion to accept the discussion document on induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock.

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: DS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Marine materials in organic crop production discussion document.** The lead summarized the draft document and asked for additional feedback from members. The document contains public comments from previous iterations, as well as feedback from several stakeholder groups. The lead suggested sending the document to the entire Board as soon as it's finalized to give members additional time to read it before the Spring meeting.

Motion to accept the discussion document on marine materials in organic crop production

Motion by: EO

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Assessing cleaning and sanitation materials used in organic crop, livestock and handling discussion document.** The lead summarized the discussion document. The Subcommittee is looking forward to reading public comment, which they intend on using to develop a TR request.

Motion to accept the discussion document on assessing cleaning and sanitation materials used in organic crop, livestock and handling.

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: DS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Update on Materials and TRs.**
  - The NOP received petitions for the following substances. All are currently under NOP review, and will be sent to the Board when completed, except where noted.
    - Fatty alcohols - a repetition was sent to the Crops Subcommittee yesterday; NOP review indicated there is new information, as the repetition is for use on tobacco only.
    - Sodium carbonate lignin for addition to 205.601j. Originally petitioned in 2011.
    - Gellan gum - re-petition for low acyl form for 205.605(b). The previous submission asked for addition to 205.605(a)
    - Magnesium oxide - resubmission for making buffered lactic acid; petitioned for addition to 205.601 previously; this petition is for addition to 205.605(b).
  - The following TRs are expected soon: Collagen gel (HS), horticultural oils (CS), atropine (LS), xylazine (LS), and malic acid (.). The TR for trace minerals and ascorbic acid are both under NOP review, and should be completed by end of week.
  - A member asked about a potential TR for sanitizers and asked NOP to consider a limited scope TR.
  - A member asked about reviewing substances that may include inerts, and for clarification about how approach a review when they are tasked with only reviewing the individual substance.



- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

January 29, 2019  
 February 12, 2019  
 March 12, 2019  
 April 9, 2019  
 May 14, 2019  
 June 11, 2019  
 July 9, 2019  
 August 13, 2019  
 September 10, 2019  
 October 8, 2019  
 November 12, 2019  
 December 10, 2019

**Work agenda**

<b>Materials Projects</b>	<b>Contact</b>	<b>Notes</b>	<b>Discussed, Voted</b>	<b>Meeting</b>
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - Livestock DM - Crops LD - Handling RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	NA	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	HB/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
<b>GMO Projects</b>	<b>Contact</b>	<b>Notes</b>	<b>Discussed, Voted</b>	<b>Meeting</b>
Protecting the Genetic Integrity of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB	Proposal sent back to MS at Fall 2018 meeting. Reposted for additional comments for Spr 2019	01 29 19 02 12 19	Spr 2019
Excluded Methods Determinations April 2019	HB	Proposal	02 12 19	Spr 2019
Excluded Methods: Induced mutagenesis and embryo transfer in livestock discussion document	HB	Discussion Document	02 12 19	Spr 2019

**Other Projects**

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.		TBD
Sanitizers: Assessing Cleaning and Sanitation Materials Used in Organic Crop, Livestock and Handling	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18	01 29 19 02 12 19	Proposal Spr 2019
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.	02 12 19	Discussion doc Spr 2019

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes** **Tuesday, January 29, 2019 2:00 pm ET draft**

**Attending:** Emily Oakley (EO), Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Vice Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD); Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE)

**Absent:** Dan Seitz (DS)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

### **Agenda**

- Discuss/review notes from December meeting.
- Update on materials and TRs (DP)
- Update on marine materials - Emily
- Update on excluded methods - Harriet
- Update on sanitizers - Harriet
- Proposal genetic integrity transparency - Harriet
- Additional items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **Discuss/review notes from December meeting (All).** The December notes were reviewed by the Subcommittee and there were no changes
- **Update on materials and TRs (DP).** The NOP updated the MS on the status of several petitions and pending TRs. There are eight (8) TRs under review, some of which were received during the government shutdown: Collagen gel/gelatin/casings, Ammonium soaps, Horticultural oils, Atropine, Xylazine, Trace Minerals, Malic Acid, and Ascorbic Acid). NOP is working on reviewing these documents and will send them to the appropriate Subcommittees when its review is complete.
- **Update on marine materials (EO).** Members discussed the status of this project, including feedback from the community, and will revisit it on a future call.
- **Update on excluded methods (HB).** The lead has been talking with a geneticist to help inform the next iteration of the excluded methods document, specifically sections on transposons, embryo transfer, and mutagenesis. Her intention is to have a draft discussion document ready for discussion on the March 12 Materials call, and to post if for the Spring meeting.
- **Update on sanitizers (HB).** The lead is compiling questions to include in the sanitizer document. The MS will post the document and seek public input to help inform the development of a proposal.
- **Genetic integrity transparency proposal (HB).** Members discussed the draft proposal, which contains modifications from the last iteration as well as feedback from public comments. The group discussed additional changes and will vote on the proposal during the next call.
- **Other items:**
  - Fatty alcohols. The NOP received a new petition for fatty alcohols and it is currently under review.
  - Methionine task force presentation in April. The NOSB Chair would like to invite representatives from the methionine task force to give a status update at the Spring NOSB meeting. The NOSB Chair will reach out to NOP to discuss this.

- Celery Powder panel. The Handling Subcommittee discussed the celery powder panel earlier today and is moving towards finalizing a list of potential panelists.
- The NOSB Chair is exploring the possibility of inviting a speaker to the April meeting to talk about excluded methods and how testing is keeping up with the new techniques. She will discuss this with NOP and update the group at a later date.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule (2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday 2:00 ET)**

December 11, 2018 - Cancelled due to shutdown

January 29, 2019

February 12, 2019

March 12, 2019

April 9, 2019

May 14, 2019

June 11, 2019

July 9, 2019

August 13, 2019

September 10, 2019

October 8, 2019

November 12, 2019

December 10, 2019

**Work agenda**

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal <a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>	DM	Subcommittee reps to MS DS - LS DM - CS LD - HS RPs from Subcomm due to MS in July	NA	Fall 2019
Petition and TR tracking	ALL	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Protecting the Genetic Integrity of Seed Grown on Organic Land (formerly Seed Purity from GMOs)	DS, DM, HB	Proposal sent back to MS at Fall 2018 meeting. Reposted for additional comments for Spr 2019	01 29 19	Spr 2019
Excluded Methods Determinations April 2019	HB	Discussion document	03 12 19	Spr 2019

## Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Contamination of Farm Inputs Discussion Document	HB	Moved to Materials from Crops for continued work.		TBD
Sanitizers	HB, EO, AB	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved 03 16 18	01 29 19	Proposal Spr 2019
Marine Materials	EO	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to CS and HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16. Proposal in development 12 06 16. Voted 01 17 17. Referred back to CS and HS at Spr 2017 NOSB meeting. Moved to MS for completion 03 16 18.		Discussion doc Spr 2019

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019