Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 12, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Tom Chapman (TC); Calvin Walker (CW); Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Dan Seitz (DS) -— sitting in; Jennifer Taylor (JT), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
Absent: Tracy Favre (TF); Francis Thicke (FT)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal Fall 2016 May 2012 Framework Proposal		Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Proposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal/Discussion Document		Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve December 8, 2015 notes
- OWG Update (BR)
- Excluded Methods Terminology (ZS)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of December 8, 2015** were approved with no changes.
- **Organic Working Group update (BR).** Request for applications for the 2016 for Agriculture Research and Extension Initiative (OREI) and Organic Transitions Program grants were released. BR will send links to the Committee members to forward to the organic community. There will be a webinar in February for those who wish to apply. The AC 21 (Advisory Committee on Biotechnology and 21st Century Agriculture) will convene soon for the first time since ~2012. The AC21 was tasked with reviewing co-existence between non-GMO, organic, and bio technology. Its new focus will be to look at ways in which the USDA can elicit voluntary cooperation between biotech and organic farmers.
- **Materials update (LB).**
    - The 2018 sunset TRs will be available soon, likely in the next week or so. Some are currently in revision by the contractors.
    - The next monthly report will be sent January 26.
    - The TR for packaging materials is now in development and should be back in time for a fall review.
- **Excluded Methods Terminology (ZS).** The lead summarized the draft document that was circulated to the Subcommittee and the group discussed it. The document was modified based on public comment received on the last draft. The intention is to bring two documents to the spring 2016 meeting: a proposal and a discussion document. The proposal, which is technically complex, will contain definitions of Genetic Engineering (GE), Genetically Modified Organism (GMO), Modern Biotechnology, Non-GMO, and Synthetic Biology; will address the principles and criteria that will be used in the evaluation of new technologies and terminologies; and seeks to adopt terminology regarding excluded methods. The discussion document seeks to further define terms, but due to the complexity and quickly changing science in this area, may require additional time and input from stakeholders. The MS also discussed the possibility of holding a panel on emerging technologies at the spring 2016 NOSB meeting. The Executive Subcommittee approved the convening of this panel, and the MS members will discuss possible panel members on the next MS call. The lead reviewer noted that she will also be attending an NOP webinar on emerging technologies. A member offered to forward a couple reference documents included in the Excluded Methods Terminology proposal to the Subcommittee members for review on the February 9 call.
- **Seed purity document will** be discussed on the February 9 call.
- Departing NOSB member Calvin Walker emphasized the need to keep research grants and funding at the forefront of the conversation so we can keep Organic issues at the forefront. He also volunteered the availability of land in Louisiana for those interested in using it for organic research.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

December 8, 2015

January 12, 2016

January 26, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday) - canceled

February 9, 2016

Discuss emerging technology panel

Excluded Methods proposal - discuss

Seed Purity discussion doc/proposal.

February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)

March 8, 2016

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016

September 13, 2016

October 11, 2016

November 8, 2016

December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 04, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 9, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
Absent: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal Fall 2016 May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09 16	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve January 12, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)
- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Research Priorities - appoint lead person for 2016
- Seed Purity Discussion Document (ZS).

- Excluded Methods Proposal and Discussion (ZS). Edits and comments welcome
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of January 12** were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).**
    - Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) published a public comment notice for its draft EIS (Environmental Impact Statement) on biotechnology regulations. This is the first step in a long process to amend its biotechnology regulations. A member noted two in-person public comment periods: one in Davis, CA and one in Dallas, TX. Two of the NOSB members will try to attend these.
    - National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) published a request for applications for organic-specific grants. There is a webinar this Thursday (February 11), targeted towards those seeking to apply.
    - National Agricultural Statistics Service (NASS) published a new organic producer survey. The Organic Policy Advisor noted that these surveys help inform policies, crop insurance, etc., and asked the NOSB members reach out to their respective communities and urge them to complete the survey.
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** A new Materials update was sent to the members last week. Since that time the NOP has received a TR for Handling and is expecting several others very soon.
- **Research Priorities.** EO volunteered to be liaison for the Research Priorities, and while not an official member of the Material's Subcommittee, JR offered to mentor her.
- **Seed Purity Discussion Document (ZS).** The lead summarized the draft document which was circulated to members prior to the call. She noted the long history of this project, key ideas from the document, and pointed out the inclusion of the public comment. The members were encouraged to provide feedback about a path forward. The NOP will add some hyperlinks to the document. The MS proceeded to a vote on the discussion document.

  Motion to adopt the discussion document on Next Steps for Improving Seed Purity
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: EO
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded Methods Proposal and Discussion (ZS).** The Chair summarized the proposal portion of the document and noted that the discussion document part is in progress. The lead summarized various portions of the document and asked for feedback and comments. She indicated that she discussed the project with stakeholders at a recent meeting: The Organic Seed Alliance - Organic Seed Growers Conference. The MS is proposing 5 new definitions including one on synthetic biology. The NOSB is potentially going to convene a panel on emerging technologies at the spring NOSB meeting, and will discuss possible panelists during the next MS call. The Chair will also discuss this during the Executive call on Friday February 12. The NOP will follow up with a staff member at the APHIS who had suggestions for other panelists and experts. A member asked about seeking input from colleagues and stakeholders about the draft documents, and

the MS Chair provided guidance to the new members regarding sharing information outside of the NOSB. The MS will vote on this document during the next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

January 12, 2016
January 26, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday) - canceled
February 9, 2016
    Discuss emerging technology panel
    Excluded Methods proposal - discuss
    Seed Purity discussion doc
February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)
    Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies
    Excluded Methods proposal - vote
March 8, 2016
April 12, 2016
May 10, 2016
June 14, 2016
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 23, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal Fall 2016 May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal	02 23	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	02 23	Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve February 9, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Excluded methods proposal - vote
- Excluded methods discussion document
- Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies
- Preliminary discussion of future Work Agenda
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** February 9 were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** No updates since last call
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** No updates since last call
- **Excluded methods proposal (ZS).** The lead summarized the changes that were incorporated into the draft proposal since the last call, and entertained additional feedback from the MS members. The MS is hoping to glean additional information from the expert panel that the NOSB will host at the April 2016 meeting. The proposal was written with distinct sections, to allow the possibility to send pieces of it back to Subcommittee for additional work without delaying the entire proposal. The MS proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to approve the three sections of the proposal as presented to the Subcommittee.
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: TF
  Additional discussion: MA
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded methods discussion document (ZS).** The lead summarized the discussion document and clarified the next steps for the new members. The NOP suggested some clarifying language from the NOSB Policy and Procedures Manual which the lead added. The MS will vote on the document as amended on the call, since the edits were not substantive.

  Motion to adopt the discussion document (version three) on excluded methods
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: EO
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Expert panel on emerging technologies.** The group discussed a list of possible experts for the panel on emerging technologies. The panel will be held during the April 2016 NOSB meeting, is planned to be 1.5 hours long, and will be comprised of 4 panelists with varying expertise. The group discussed the expertise that would be most helpful for a balanced and broad view such as molecular biology, plant breeding, genetics, and plant genomics, as well as someone who could bring an international perspective. Members will discuss and finalize the list on the March 8 call.

- **Preliminary discussion of future Work Agenda.** A member offered to recirculate a list of GMO-related projects and topics that she introduced 4 years ago at the beginning of her Board tenure.

Additionally, she mentioned a proposal that is partially developed that she feels could be completed soon. The members were asked for additional suggestions for work agenda items.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

February 9, 2016

Discuss emerging technology panel
Excluded Methods proposal - discuss
Seed Purity discussion doc

February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)

Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies
Excluded Methods proposal - vote

March 8, 2016

Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies

May 10, 2016
June 14, 2016
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, March 8, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Tom Chapman (TC)
Absent: Tracy Favre (TF)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal	02 23	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	02 23	Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve February 23, 2016 notes
- Materials and TR update (LB)

- Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** February 23 approved with no changes
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** The updated March report was sent to the NOSB last week. The NOP noted that the status for calcium chloride was changed to reflect that the Crops Subcommittee rejected the petition and asked that the Chair send an email confirmation of such.
- **Emerging technologies panel.** The group discussed and finalized the list of candidates for the panel on emerging technologies which will be held during the spring 2016 NOSB meeting. The panel is currently scheduled for Tuesday April 26. The NOP will send the invitations and supporting documents via email this week so the panelists have as much notice as possible.
- **Future work agenda items (ZS).** The former MS Chair circulated a list of possible work agenda items, some of which were previously under consideration by the MS. The members discussed several items including the issue of reviewing materials and the consideration of how far back in the processing chain to look. The lead provided a brief overview to the new members about the OMRI GMO decision tree. Additionally, the MS discussed writing a follow up letter to the one the NOSB sent to the Secretary nearly 5 years ago regarding GMO's and organic agriculture. ZS will draft the letter and distribute it to the members for discussion. The MS will discuss this on the Executive call March 11 and will complete the letter for posting for the fall 2016 NOSB meeting. The group also discussed comments from the Organic Seed Growers and Trade Association (OSGATA) regarding the "principles of organic plant breeding", and discussed some potential questions for the expert panel.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)

Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies

Excluded Methods proposal - vote

March 8, 2016

Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016

September 13, 2016

October 11, 2016

November 8, 2016

December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	Apr 19, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 12, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal	02 23	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	02 23	Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve March 8, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Discuss questions for panel experts (ALL)
- Research priorities (ALL)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** March 8 approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)**
    - The AC21 (Advisory Committee on Biotechnology & 21st Century Agriculture) met last month and are currently tasked with examining how USDA could support joint coexistence plans at the local and regional level. Further information on the meeting is available on the USDA website.
    - The USDA's Office of the Chief Scientist asked NOP to share with the NOSB two studies from the National Academies of Science. One (nearing completion) assessing past experience and future prospects of genetically engineered crops, and the other (soon to be launched) on issues regarding future products of biotechnology and opportunities to enhance capabilities of the biotechnology regulatory system. The first meeting of the new project will occur April 18, 2016.
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** No updates since the last meeting.
- **Discuss questions for panel experts.** The lead author circulated a short list of questions for the panelists and the group discussed them. The MS Chair will introduce the panelists at the meeting and moderate the panel. The panelists will each speak for 10-15 minutes followed by questions from the Board.
- **Research priorities.** The group discussed the research priorities document and how best to develop a robust document going forward. Considerations include: how to modify previous lists to eliminate the items that may have been completed, while retaining the items that are higher priority on the list; how to format the document so it is easily scanned by funders; and if it may be useful to put forth a preliminary document at the spring NOSB meetings which will then be voted on during the fall meeting. The organic Policy Advisor noted that the Organic Farming Research Foundation (OFRF) received a USDA grant to conduct a review of USDA organic projects that have been funded. The MS is interested in having OFRF brief the Board members on their work once it is complete. Several members mentioned that they have had conversations with OFRF seeking ways in which the NOSB and OFRF can intersect. A member felt that OFRF proposals are often too broad for the NOSB but would be interested in having them participate on a call to clarify. With regard to research priorities for handling and processing, the Policy Advisor is still seeking options. A member suggested NIH. The lead author for the research priorities will develop a bulleted list of the research priorities to date, so the group can review it and pare it down based on projects that have been completed or are no longer needed. The liaisons will reach out their respective Subcommittees and urge them to begin discussions about fall research topics.
- **Seed Purity from GMOs**. This project will likely not be a proposal for the fall meeting, as it needs additional work and comments. The lead asked for someone to take over as lead as her NOSB terms ends in January 2017.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

March 8, 2016

Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

Research priorities- review summary

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016

September 13, 2016

October 11, 2016

November 8, 2016

December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 16, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 14, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment webinar	Apr 19, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, May 10, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Jean Richardson (JR) - observer
Absent: Lisa Brines (LB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc		Fall 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Fall 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production	ZS	Letter/proposal		Fall 2016

Agenda

- Approve April 12, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)
- Materials and TR update (DP)
- Discuss Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS) (forwarded to MS April 22)
- Research priorities (ALL) - Review summary
- Review work agenda

- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** April 12 approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** No new updates.
- **Materials and TRs update (DP).** The May Materials report was circulated to the NOSB last week. Members did not have any feedback or comments at this time. The NOP sent a memo to the NOSB this week regarding guidance on treated manure products. This will be added to the Crops Subcommittee work agenda.
- **Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS).** A member asked if the memo from NOP about treated manure (including anaerobic digestate) will affect the current TR for anaerobic digestate that Crops has requested. The current petition is for a specific production method for anaerobic digestate and may not capture the range of methods used to produce anaerobic digestate. Crops will address the topic.
- **Research priorities.** The lead reminded the group about the goal for this document, which is to collect the previous research priorities, eliminate redundancy, update the status of projects, and send it the Subcommittees so they can use it to develop the 2016 Research priorities. She asked for feedback regarding the 2012 and 2013 priorities because they were not listed by Subcommittee. Members discussed additional topics for addition to the research priorities, including those gleaned from public comment received at the April 2016 NOSB meeting, as well as current Board members. A member suggested setting a deadline for receipt of the research priorities lists from each of the Subcommittees.
- **Work agenda.**
    - Excluded Methods. The lead author is consulting with an informal ad hoc group outside of NOSB to work further on excluded methods. The goal is to develop supporting documents that the MS can consult as they work on the proposal for the fall 2016 meeting. The MS intends on bringing two documents to the fall meeting, as it did for the spring 2016 meeting: a discussion document that will contain items that need additional work, and a proposal with definitions and criteria. There are two calls scheduled in June with the ad hoc group.
- **Seed Purity doc.** DS will take the lead for this project, with mentorship from ZS. The MS is considering a request to form a task force; an idea widely supported by stakeholders. Members requested additional input from the NOP about the request: how detailed should it be and what format. The NOSB Chair provided some background about the Livestock Subcommittee's request for a Poultry task force.
- **Other business.** A-dae Briones asked to be added to the Subcommittee as an observer.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

Research priorities- review summary

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Fall timeline coming soon!

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 14, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Briones (AB) - observer
Absent: Betsy Rakola (BR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Lisa Brines (LB)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc		Fall 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Fall 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production	ZS	Letter/proposal		Fall 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve May 10, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Excluded Methods discussion document & ad hoc group progress update (ZS)
- Seed purity task force - review draft request (DS)
- Research priorities (All)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** May 10 were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** The USDA Organic Policy Advisor is currently at the AC21 meeting, where they are discussing next steps in the charge for USDA to support local and regional solutions to coexistence. Discussion documents and transcripts from the meeting will be publicly available soon. The MS Chair will forward the link to the AC21 website.
- **Materials and TRs update (LB).** The NOP recently circulated the June Materials' report and noted a few changes: A new table for the 2019 sunset materials was added; and aquaculture materials were moved to a separate tab. The deadline for submitting TR requests for 2019 sunset materials is mid-July, and the NOP asked that the Subcommittees prioritize the requests as they did before. The Subcommittees scheduled most of the materials discussions for the end of June.
- **Excluded Methods discussion document & ad hoc group progress update (ZS).** The CS Chair is working with an ad hoc group outside of the NOSB on excluded methods. The goal for the group is to develop supporting documents that the MS can consult as they work on the excluded methods proposal for the fall 2016 meeting. The lead will report back to the MS as work progresses.
- **Seed purity task force - review draft request (DS).** ZS and DS will meet offline to discuss this project. The previous lead, who is completing her NOSB term in January, would like to submit the request to the NOP before the end of the fiscal year. The MS will discuss this before the August 12 Executive call (ES), and seek approval from the ES on that call. Depending on the timing and progress, the MS would either mention the task force or could present a verbal report at the fall 2016 NOSB meeting.
- **Research priorities (All).** The group discussed additions or deletions from the previous list of research priorities. A member described the justification and criteria the Subcommittees use when determining which projects to add, and discussed which projects to retain on the list. Seed purity could be moved to a lower priority until the task force moves forward. The group discussed streamlining the document to make it more readable.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

May 10, 2016

Research priorities- review summary

June 14, 2016
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sept 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016