Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 12, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Tom Chapman (TC); Calvin Walker (CW); Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Dan Seitz (DS) -— sitting in; Jennifer Taylor (JT), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
Absent: Tracy Favre (TF); Francis Thicke (FT)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal Fall 2016 May 2012 Framework Proposal		Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Proposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal/Discussion Document		Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve December 8, 2015 notes
- OWG Update (BR)
- Excluded Methods Terminology (ZS)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of December 8, 2015** were approved with no changes.
- **Organic Working Group update (BR).** Request for applications for the 2016 for Agriculture Research and Extension Initiative (OREI) and Organic Transitions Program grants were released. BR will send links to the Committee members to forward to the organic community. There will be a webinar in February for those who wish to apply. The AC 21 (Advisory Committee on Biotechnology and 21st Century Agriculture) will convene soon for the first time since ~2012. The AC21 was tasked with reviewing co-existence between non-GMO, organic, and bio technology. Its new focus will be to look at ways in which the USDA can elicit voluntary cooperation between biotech and organic farmers.
- **Materials update (LB).**
    - The 2018 sunset TRs will be available soon, likely in the next week or so. Some are currently in revision by the contractors.
    - The next monthly report will be sent January 26.
    - The TR for packaging materials is now in development and should be back in time for a fall review.
- **Excluded Methods Terminology (ZS).** The lead summarized the draft document that was circulated to the Subcommittee and the group discussed it. The document was modified based on public comment received on the last draft. The intention is to bring two documents to the spring 2016 meeting: a proposal and a discussion document. The proposal, which is technically complex, will contain definitions of Genetic Engineering (GE), Genetically Modified Organism (GMO), Modern Biotechnology, Non-GMO, and Synthetic Biology; will address the principles and criteria that will be used in the evaluation of new technologies and terminologies; and seeks to adopt terminology regarding excluded methods. The discussion document seeks to further define terms, but due to the complexity and quickly changing science in this area, may require additional time and input from stakeholders. The MS also discussed the possibility of holding a panel on emerging technologies at the spring 2016 NOSB meeting. The Executive Subcommittee approved the convening of this panel, and the MS members will discuss possible panel members on the next MS call. The lead reviewer noted that she will also be attending an NOP webinar on emerging technologies. A member offered to forward a couple reference documents included in the Excluded Methods Terminology proposal to the Subcommittee members for review on the February 9 call.
- **Seed purity document will** be discussed on the February 9 call.
- Departing NOSB member Calvin Walker emphasized the need to keep research grants and funding at the forefront of the conversation so we can keep Organic issues at the forefront. He also volunteered the availability of land in Louisiana for those interested in using it for organic research.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

December 8, 2015

January 12, 2016

January 26, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday) - canceled

February 9, 2016

Discuss emerging technology panel

Excluded Methods proposal - discuss

Seed Purity discussion doc/proposal.

February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)

March 8, 2016

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016

September 13, 2016

October 11, 2016

November 8, 2016

December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 04, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 9, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
Absent: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal Fall 2016 May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09 16	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve January 12, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)
- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Research Priorities - appoint lead person for 2016
- Seed Purity Discussion Document (ZS).

- Excluded Methods Proposal and Discussion (ZS). Edits and comments welcome
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of January 12** were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).**
    - Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) published a public comment notice for its draft EIS (Environmental Impact Statement) on biotechnology regulations. This is the first step in a long process to amend its biotechnology regulations. A member noted two in-person public comment periods: one in Davis, CA and one in Dallas, TX. Two of the NOSB members will try to attend these.
    - National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) published a request for applications for organic-specific grants. There is a webinar this Thursday (February 11), targeted towards those seeking to apply.
    - National Agricultural Statistics Service (NASS) published a new organic producer survey. The Organic Policy Advisor noted that these surveys help inform policies, crop insurance, etc., and asked the NOSB members reach out to their respective communities and urge them to complete the survey.
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** A new Materials update was sent to the members last week. Since that time the NOP has received a TR for Handling and is expecting several others very soon.
- **Research Priorities.** EO volunteered to be liaison for the Research Priorities, and while not an official member of the Material's Subcommittee, JR offered to mentor her.
- **Seed Purity Discussion Document (ZS).** The lead summarized the draft document which was circulated to members prior to the call. She noted the long history of this project, key ideas from the document, and pointed out the inclusion of the public comment. The members were encouraged to provide feedback about a path forward. The NOP will add some hyperlinks to the document. The MS proceeded to a vote on the discussion document.

  Motion to adopt the discussion document on Next Steps for Improving Seed Purity
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: EO
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded Methods Proposal and Discussion (ZS).** The Chair summarized the proposal portion of the document and noted that the discussion document part is in progress. The lead summarized various portions of the document and asked for feedback and comments. She indicated that she discussed the project with stakeholders at a recent meeting: The Organic Seed Alliance - Organic Seed Growers Conference. The MS is proposing 5 new definitions including one on synthetic biology. The NOSB is potentially going to convene a panel on emerging technologies at the spring NOSB meeting, and will discuss possible panelists during the next MS call. The Chair will also discuss this during the Executive call on Friday February 12. The NOP will follow up with a staff member at the APHIS who had suggestions for other panelists and experts. A member asked about seeking input from colleagues and stakeholders about the draft documents, and

the MS Chair provided guidance to the new members regarding sharing information outside of the NOSB. The MS will vote on this document during the next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

January 12, 2016
January 26, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday) - canceled
February 9, 2016
    Discuss emerging technology panel
    Excluded Methods proposal - discuss
    Seed Purity discussion doc
February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)
    Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies
    Excluded Methods proposal - vote
March 8, 2016
April 12, 2016
May 10, 2016
June 14, 2016
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 23, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal Fall 2016 May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal	02 23	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	02 23	Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve February 9, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Excluded methods proposal - vote
- Excluded methods discussion document
- Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies
- Preliminary discussion of future Work Agenda
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** February 9 were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** No updates since last call
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** No updates since last call
- **Excluded methods proposal (ZS).** The lead summarized the changes that were incorporated into the draft proposal since the last call, and entertained additional feedback from the MS members. The MS is hoping to glean additional information from the expert panel that the NOSB will host at the April 2016 meeting. The proposal was written with distinct sections, to allow the possibility to send pieces of it back to Subcommittee for additional work without delaying the entire proposal. The MS proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to approve the three sections of the proposal as presented to the Subcommittee.
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: TF
  Additional discussion: MA
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded methods discussion document (ZS).** The lead summarized the discussion document and clarified the next steps for the new members. The NOP suggested some clarifying language from the NOSB Policy and Procedures Manual which the lead added. The MS will vote on the document as amended on the call, since the edits were not substantive.

  Motion to adopt the discussion document (version three) on excluded methods
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: EO
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Expert panel on emerging technologies.** The group discussed a list of possible experts for the panel on emerging technologies. The panel will be held during the April 2016 NOSB meeting, is planned to be 1.5 hours long, and will be comprised of 4 panelists with varying expertise. The group discussed the expertise that would be most helpful for a balanced and broad view such as molecular biology, plant breeding, genetics, and plant genomics, as well as someone who could bring an international perspective. Members will discuss and finalize the list on the March 8 call.

- **Preliminary discussion of future Work Agenda.** A member offered to recirculate a list of GMO-related projects and topics that she introduced 4 years ago at the beginning of her Board tenure.

Additionally, she mentioned a proposal that is partially developed that she feels could be completed soon. The members were asked for additional suggestions for work agenda items.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

February 9, 2016

Discuss emerging technology panel
Excluded Methods proposal - discuss
Seed Purity discussion doc

February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)

Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies
Excluded Methods proposal - vote

March 8, 2016

Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies

May 10, 2016
June 14, 2016
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, March 8, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Tom Chapman (TC)
Absent: Tracy Favre (TF)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal	02 23	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	02 23	Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve February 23, 2016 notes
- Materials and TR update (LB)

- Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** February 23 approved with no changes
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** The updated March report was sent to the NOSB last week. The NOP noted that the status for calcium chloride was changed to reflect that the Crops Subcommittee rejected the petition and asked that the Chair send an email confirmation of such.
- **Emerging technologies panel.** The group discussed and finalized the list of candidates for the panel on emerging technologies which will be held during the spring 2016 NOSB meeting. The panel is currently scheduled for Tuesday April 26. The NOP will send the invitations and supporting documents via email this week so the panelists have as much notice as possible.
- **Future work agenda items (ZS).** The former MS Chair circulated a list of possible work agenda items, some of which were previously under consideration by the MS. The members discussed several items including the issue of reviewing materials and the consideration of how far back in the processing chain to look. The lead provided a brief overview to the new members about the OMRI GMO decision tree. Additionally, the MS discussed writing a follow up letter to the one the NOSB sent to the Secretary nearly 5 years ago regarding GMO's and organic agriculture. ZS will draft the letter and distribute it to the members for discussion. The MS will discuss this on the Executive call March 11 and will complete the letter for posting for the fall 2016 NOSB meeting. The group also discussed comments from the Organic Seed Growers and Trade Association (OSGATA) regarding the "principles of organic plant breeding", and discussed some potential questions for the expert panel.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday)

Discuss expert panel on emerging technologies

Excluded Methods proposal - vote

March 8, 2016

Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016

September 13, 2016

October 11, 2016

November 8, 2016

December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	Apr 19, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 12, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	02 09	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal	02 23	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	02 23	Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve March 8, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Discuss questions for panel experts (ALL)
- Research priorities (ALL)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** March 8 approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)**
    - The AC21 (Advisory Committee on Biotechnology & 21st Century Agriculture) met last month and are currently tasked with examining how USDA could support joint coexistence plans at the local and regional level. Further information on the meeting is available on the USDA website.
    - The USDA's Office of the Chief Scientist asked NOP to share with the NOSB two studies from the National Academies of Science. One (nearing completion) assessing past experience and future prospects of genetically engineered crops, and the other (soon to be launched) on issues regarding future products of biotechnology and opportunities to enhance capabilities of the biotechnology regulatory system. The first meeting of the new project will occur April 18, 2016.
- **Materials and TR update (LB).** No updates since the last meeting.
- **Discuss questions for panel experts.** The lead author circulated a short list of questions for the panelists and the group discussed them. The MS Chair will introduce the panelists at the meeting and moderate the panel. The panelists will each speak for 10-15 minutes followed by questions from the Board.
- **Research priorities.** The group discussed the research priorities document and how best to develop a robust document going forward. Considerations include: how to modify previous lists to eliminate the items that may have been completed, while retaining the items that are higher priority on the list; how to format the document so it is easily scanned by funders; and if it may be useful to put forth a preliminary document at the spring NOSB meetings which will then be voted on during the fall meeting. The organic Policy Advisor noted that the Organic Farming Research Foundation (OFRF) received a USDA grant to conduct a review of USDA organic projects that have been funded. The MS is interested in having OFRF brief the Board members on their work once it is complete. Several members mentioned that they have had conversations with OFRF seeking ways in which the NOSB and OFRF can intersect. A member felt that OFRF proposals are often too broad for the NOSB but would be interested in having them participate on a call to clarify. With regard to research priorities for handling and processing, the Policy Advisor is still seeking options. A member suggested NIH. The lead author for the research priorities will develop a bulleted list of the research priorities to date, so the group can review it and pare it down based on projects that have been completed or are no longer needed. The liaisons will reach out their respective Subcommittees and urge them to begin discussions about fall research topics.
- **Seed Purity from GMOs**. This project will likely not be a proposal for the fall meeting, as it needs additional work and comments. The lead asked for someone to take over as lead as her NOSB terms ends in January 2017.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

March 8, 2016

Finalize list of expert panelists on emerging technologies

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

Research priorities- review summary

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016

September 13, 2016

October 11, 2016

November 8, 2016

December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 16, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 14, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment webinar	Apr 19, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, May 10, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Jean Richardson (JR) - observer
Absent: Lisa Brines (LB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc		Fall 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Fall 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production	ZS	Letter/proposal		Fall 2016

Agenda

- Approve April 12, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)
- Materials and TR update (DP)
- Discuss Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS) (forwarded to MS April 22)
- Research priorities (ALL) - Review summary
- Review work agenda

- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** April 12 approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** No new updates.
- **Materials and TRs update (DP).** The May Materials report was circulated to the NOSB last week. Members did not have any feedback or comments at this time. The NOP sent a memo to the NOSB this week regarding guidance on treated manure products. This will be added to the Crops Subcommittee work agenda.
- **Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS).** A member asked if the memo from NOP about treated manure (including anaerobic digestate) will affect the current TR for anaerobic digestate that Crops has requested. The current petition is for a specific production method for anaerobic digestate and may not capture the range of methods used to produce anaerobic digestate. Crops will address the topic.
- **Research priorities.** The lead reminded the group about the goal for this document, which is to collect the previous research priorities, eliminate redundancy, update the status of projects, and send it the Subcommittees so they can use it to develop the 2016 Research priorities. She asked for feedback regarding the 2012 and 2013 priorities because they were not listed by Subcommittee. Members discussed additional topics for addition to the research priorities, including those gleaned from public comment received at the April 2016 NOSB meeting, as well as current Board members. A member suggested setting a deadline for receipt of the research priorities lists from each of the Subcommittees.
- **Work agenda.**
    - Excluded Methods. The lead author is consulting with an informal ad hoc group outside of NOSB to work further on excluded methods. The goal is to develop supporting documents that the MS can consult as they work on the proposal for the fall 2016 meeting. The MS intends on bringing two documents to the fall meeting, as it did for the spring 2016 meeting: a discussion document that will contain items that need additional work, and a proposal with definitions and criteria. There are two calls scheduled in June with the ad hoc group.
- **Seed Purity doc.** DS will take the lead for this project, with mentorship from ZS. The MS is considering a request to form a task force; an idea widely supported by stakeholders. Members requested additional input from the NOP about the request: how detailed should it be and what format. The NOSB Chair provided some background about the Livestock Subcommittee's request for a Poultry task force.
- **Other business.** A-dae Briones asked to be added to the Subcommittee as an observer.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

April 12, 2016

May 10, 2016

Research priorities- review summary

June 14, 2016

July 12 2016

August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Fall timeline coming soon!

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 14, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Briones (AB) - observer
Absent: Betsy Rakola (BR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Lisa Brines (LB)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	NA	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc		Fall 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Fall 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production	ZS	Letter/proposal		Fall 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve May 10, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Excluded Methods discussion document & ad hoc group progress update (ZS)
- Seed purity task force - review draft request (DS)
- Research priorities (All)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of** May 10 were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** The USDA Organic Policy Advisor is currently at the AC21 meeting, where they are discussing next steps in the charge for USDA to support local and regional solutions to coexistence. Discussion documents and transcripts from the meeting will be publicly available soon. The MS Chair will forward the link to the AC21 website.
- **Materials and TRs update (LB).** The NOP recently circulated the June Materials' report and noted a few changes: A new table for the 2019 sunset materials was added; and aquaculture materials were moved to a separate tab. The deadline for submitting TR requests for 2019 sunset materials is mid-July, and the NOP asked that the Subcommittees prioritize the requests as they did before. The Subcommittees scheduled most of the materials discussions for the end of June.
- **Excluded Methods discussion document & ad hoc group progress update (ZS).** The CS Chair is working with an ad hoc group outside of the NOSB on excluded methods. The goal for the group is to develop supporting documents that the MS can consult as they work on the excluded methods proposal for the fall 2016 meeting. The lead will report back to the MS as work progresses.
- **Seed purity task force - review draft request (DS).** ZS and DS will meet offline to discuss this project. The previous lead, who is completing her NOSB term in January, would like to submit the request to the NOP before the end of the fiscal year. The MS will discuss this before the August 12 Executive call (ES), and seek approval from the ES on that call. Depending on the timing and progress, the MS would either mention the task force or could present a verbal report at the fall 2016 NOSB meeting.
- **Research priorities (All).** The group discussed additions or deletions from the previous list of research priorities. A member described the justification and criteria the Subcommittees use when determining which projects to add, and discussed which projects to retain on the list. Seed purity could be moved to a lower priority until the task force moves forward. The group discussed streamlining the document to make it more readable.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

May 10, 2016

Research priorities- review summary

June 14, 2016
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sept 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting
Tuesday, July 12, 2016 1:00 pm ET draft

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	08 09	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc		Fall 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Fall 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production	ZS	Letter/proposal		Fall 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve June 14, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Research priorities (EO/All)
- Review draft request for a Seed Purity Task Force (DS/ZS)
- Excluded Methods (ZS) - update
- Report to the Secretary (ZS) - status/update,
- Feedback on NOP's work agenda items (All)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** of June 14, 2016 were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** The AC21 met recently for its second to last meeting and will be submitting its report to the Secretary soon. The Committee will be accepting public comment before and at the next meeting, which is scheduled for September 8-9, 2016.
- **Materials and TRs update (LB).** The NOP distributed the July materials report a couple of weeks ago and asked for any updates for the next iteration.
- **Research priorities (EO/All).** All of the Research priorities have submitted to the Materials Subcommittee, and the lead will synthesize them and resend to the members for feedback and comments. The MS will likely vote on the final document on August 9. The USDA Policy Advisor suggested the NOSB include a 1-2 page executive summary written for a lay audience. The MS will add this piece to the document after the Board votes on the final recommendation at the Fall 2016 NOSB meeting
- **Seed Purity Task Force (DS/ZS).** The leads circulated a draft request asking the NOP to form a task force on seed purity, and asked for feedback from the members. Members suggested some minor edits to the document and will present this to the ES on August 12 for approval. The members discussed a verbal update at the fall meeting to let the stakeholders know it was requested.
- **Excluded Methods (ZS).** The lead author is editing the document and will present it on the next MS call. She noted that like the previous posting, the document will contain two parts: a proposal and a discussion document that will contain subjects needing further work.
- **Report to the Secretary (ZS).** The group discussed the status of this project. The lead will present a draft letter and the group will review it during the next two MS calls. The members discussed the possibility of adding an extra call on August 30 if needed.
- **Feedback on NOP's work agenda items (All).** The NOP requested feedback from the NOSB on the NOP operating plan, but has not yet sent the current draft plan for review. The members will review the NOSB index of recommendations, which includes outstanding projects, while they await the other list. The next MS call is scheduled for August 9, and the group intends on providing feedback before the next Executive Team call. Members suggested several projects that are higher priority for stakeholders, such as classification of materials' guidance and perhaps evaluation of material review organizations, although a member noted the latter is not critical at this time, since there is a mediation process in place. A member recommended coordinating across Subcommittees, as some of the other Subcommittees have projects that may be more critical than the MS ones. The NOP added that the operating plan is partitioned by year, and while some of the projects may not be included in the 2017 plan, they could be added as a priority for a later time. In that vein, a member noted that sodium nitrate is a crucial priority

for the organic community, although it is not included on the 2017 list. The MS will discuss its short list on the next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

June 14, 2016
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sept 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 9, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	08 09	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc		Fall 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	DD + Proposal	08 30	Fall 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production	ZS	Letter/proposal	08 30	Fall 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Approve July 12, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Research Priorities (EO/All) - discuss & vote
- Excluded Methods Proposal (ZS) - Vote?
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** of July 12, 2016 were approved with no changes.

- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).**
    - The Natural Resources Conservation Service (NRCS) and the USDA Farm Service Agency (FSA) are working jointly to develop a network of organic champions at the state or local level to become peer resources for other staff and enhance customer service for organic producers and handlers. The timeline is not flushed out yet, but NOP will keep the NOSB informed.
    - AMS is considering transferring the management of the Cost Share program from AMS/Transportation and Marketing Division to the Farm Service Agency (FSA).). USDA believes FSA's operational model and large field office structure will increase both efficiency and participation.

- **Materials and TRs update (LB).** The August materials report was recently distributed and the NOP asked for any feedback. Of note on the report, the due dates for two overdue TRs were adjusted: Marine plants and algae, and BPA.

- **Research Priorities (EO/All).** The members reviewed the draft document, which includes feedback from the NOP, and made edits as appropriate. The lead author will resend the modified document so the members can review it, and the group proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to accept the Research Priorities document
  Motion by: EO
  Seconded by: TF
  Additional discussion:
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded Methods Proposal (ZS).** The lead briefly discussed the current draft of the document and asked for some feedback so she could proceed with the document for discussion on the next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes
Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)
July 12 2016
August 9, 2016
August 30, 2016 - additional call
Excluded Methods (ZS) - discuss proposal, vote.

5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production - discuss letter
September 13, 2016
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 1, 2016
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sep 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sep 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 30, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tom Chapman (TC); Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Romero-Briones (observer); Harriet Behar (observer)
Absent: Tracy Favre (TF); Jean Richardson (observer); Michelle Arsenault (MA)
Staff: Lisa Brines (LB) - notetaker; Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	EO	Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS TC - HS	08 09	Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	**Contact**	**Notes**	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Disc doc. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc		TBD
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	DD + Proposal	08 30	Fall 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production	ZS	Letter/proposal	09 13	Fall 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL		NA	NA

Agenda

- Approve August 9, 2016 notes
- Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR)

- Materials and TR update (LB)
- Excluded Methods Proposal and Discussion Document (ZS) - Vote?
- 5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production (All)- discuss letter, vote?
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** of August 9, 2016 were approved without changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable USDA update (BR).** No updates at this time.
- **Materials and TRs update (LB).** Next materials report will be out this Friday.
- **Excluded Methods Proposal (ZS).**
    - No changes since last call. Citations will be checked before finalization and a few additions to appendix based on public comment. Definitions and criteria were worked on by ad-hoc group; their names and affiliation will be cited in final document.
    - A member asked a question about the definition of genetic engineering and whether gene editing such as CRISPR technology is explicitly prohibited by the definition. Based on the document, CRISPR would conflict with Criteria #1 and would be an excluded method.
    - There was discussion that when there are questions about new or emerging technologies in the future, they may need to be included on the future NOSB work agenda to determine whether they are excluded methods or not.
    - Some issues may need to be worked out over time once structure is in place, such as GE insects that may come onto organic farms from conventional farms.
    - There was discussion on the definitions of modern biotechnology vs. classical breeding; no changes were made to the definitions.

  Motion to approve the three sections of the excluded methods proposal (Note: the proposal has three sections, to be used in NOP Guidance on Excluded Methods).
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: EO
  Additional discussion: Motion includes 3 sections. The MS discussed that, depending on public comment, they may want divide motion at the NOSB meeting to vote on individual sections if needed.
  Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded Methods Discussion document (ZS).**
    - Change to document includes a new "Note" paragraph at top to clarify intent
    - "Embryo transfer" in flagged in red text since public comments were received on this topic. NOP will change text to normal color for posting.
    - MS received very few comments last time about sections on *Detection and Testing* and *Enforcement*. A related question is included in the NOSB Research Priorities proposal.
    - Transduction needs to be removed from this chart (will be moved to other chart in proposal).
    - Suggestion to add text to clarify to stakeholders that they do not need to comment again if they already provided comments on the earlier posting. This will be added.

- Many items on chart may need individual discussion documents in order to address. There was a suggestion that the MS may want to start with discussion documents on double haploid technology and/or embryo transfer for future work.
- Subcommittee will need to appoint an NOSB member to take over this project as NOSB membership changes. Stakeholder groups are also willing to help continue the work.

Motion to adopt the third discussion document on Excluded Methods
Motion by: ZS
Seconded by: EO
Additional discussion: None
Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production - discuss letter**

  - This agenda item was postponed to the next call. TF is working on edits to the letter, and it will be available in advance of the next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous MS Notes
Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)
August 9, 2016
August 30, 2016 - additional call (1:00 ET)
Excluded Methods (ZS) - discuss discussion document and proposal, vote.
September 13, 2016
5-year report to the Secretary on GMO issues in organic production – discuss letter, vote
October 11, 2016
November 8, 2016
December 13, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 1, 2016
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sep 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sep 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016