

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, December 17, 2019 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review December 3 notes
- Review fenbendazole questions
- 2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 -Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss
- Research possibilities
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** December 3 were accepted with no changes
- **Review fenbendazole questions.** The LS Chair collated various comments from members into one draft document and the group discussed it. Members suggested a question about human health. The LS will submit this to the NOP for the Spring 2020 meeting.
- **2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide (JB).** The lead summarized the uses of magnesium hydroxide and the group discussed the review. JB will update the document with feedback and the LS will discuss it again on the next call.
- **2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR).** The lead summarized the current status of the inerts review and EPA List 4. The list is now defunct, and the National List does not reflect that. He noted that there was a working group composed of staff from EPA, NOP, and NOSB, that was trying to find a solution to review the List 4 inerts, and also noted that the EPA Safer Choice Program has a review process. The working group has not met in several years. A member asked about an MOU between USDA and EPA, and will discuss this further on the Executive call later today. The LS emphasized the need for a National List Manager.
- **Research possibilities (HB).** The LS discussed the discussion document that the NOSB will submit for the Spring meeting. A member suggested writing a paragraph on both methionine (MET) and parasiticide use for review on the January 7 call. Another member noted that these sounded more like questions for a TR as opposed to a research priority. The due date for each of the Subcommittees will be the end of January, so that the Materials Subcommittee can discuss and vote on it on by the February 11 call.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 3, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (HB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (AS/JB) - discuss

December 17, 2019
 2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss
 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss
 January 7, 2020
 2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss
 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss
 2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss
 January 21, 2020
 2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss
 2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss
 RPs discussion document discussion
 February 4, 2020
 February 18, 2020
 2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss
 March 3, 2020
 March 17, 2020
 April 7, 2020
 April 21, 2020
 May 5, 2020
 May 19, 2020
 June 2, 2020
 June 16, 2020
 July 7, 2020
 July 21, 2020
 August 4, 2020
 August 18, 2020
 September 1, 2020
 September 15, 2020
 October 6, 2020
 October 20, 2020
 November 3, 2020
 November 17, 2020
 December 1, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Spr 2020

Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
------------------------	--	--	--	----------------------------	-----	-----

Other projects

Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020	11.5.19 1.7.20	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.2020	"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	2.18.20	"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20	"
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition	NA	Proposal TBD

				found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, December 3, 2019 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Staff: Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review November 19 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (HB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (AS/JB) - discuss
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from November 19** were accepted with no changes.
- **2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (HB).** The lead provided an overview of the substance's uses in apiculture, its properties, and alternatives. Members discussed levels that might be present in products of apiculture. HB described the label use directions of a formulated formic acid product, specifically the measures included to limit contact with honey/hive products. Another member noted that in the absence of apiculture standards under the USDA organic regulations, substances for organic apiculture do not belong on the National List. Members noted a difference between Canadian organic standards and USDA organic standards. Canadian organic standards state that formic acid may be used after the last honey harvest of the season and shall be discontinued 30 days before the addition of honey supers. HB will update the document and send it back to subcommittee members.
- **2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (AS/JB).** The lead provided an overview of the prohibited substance's uses outside of organic production, and its properties, including its toxicity. JB will add information about international organic standards.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

November 19, 2019

Fenbendazole (AS). Discuss questions for limited scope TR.

December 3, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (HB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (AS/JB) - discuss

December 17, 2019

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 -Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss

RP discussion document discussion

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. No TR requested. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting	
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jul 2020	11.5.19	Fall 2020	

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	2.18.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	“
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, November 19, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Staff: Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review November 5 notes
- Fenbendazole petition (poultry treatment)
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** November 5 were accepted with no changes.
- **Fenbendazole petition (poultry treatment).** Members discussed questions for a limited scope technical report. Two members had circulated questions for consideration, including questions about residues and withdrawal times. Members discussed whether parasites were a prevalent issue. Some members noted a withdrawal period for laying hens/eggs could be problematic for producers.
- **Other items.** The Chair reminded members that finalized sunset/Fall 2019 documents are due to NOP tomorrow.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

November 19, 2019

Fenbendazole (AS). Discuss questions for limited scope TR.

December 3, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (HB) - discuss/vote

2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (AS/JB) - discuss/vote

December 17, 2019

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss/vote

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 -Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss/vote

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss/vote

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss/vote

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss/vote

RP's discussion document discussion.

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss/vote

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020
 April 21, 2020
 May 5, 2020
 May 19, 2020
 June 2, 2020
 June 16, 2020
 July 7, 2020
 July 21, 2020
 August 4, 2020
 August 18, 2020
 September 1, 2020
 September 15, 2020
 October 6, 2020
 October 20, 2020
 November 3, 2020
 November 17, 2020
 December 1, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. No TR requested. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jul 2020		11.5.19	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	2.18.20	"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020

Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, November 5, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review October 1 notes
- Fenbendazole (AS) - discuss proposal
- Assign discussion dates for work agenda items
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from October 1** were accepted as is.
- **Fenbendazole (AS).** The LS discussed requesting a limited scope TR based on feedback and public comment at the Fall NOSB meeting. The TR would not likely be back until mid-February. Members discussed residual levels of fenbendazole based on EPA guidance. A member suggested compiling questions and adding them to the questions the lead has already collated, and will discuss them on a future call. A member added that organic is a process standard and not a testing standard, and it would be useful to keep that in mind as they move forward.
- **Assign discussion dates for work agenda items.** See table and lists below.
- **Other items.** The LS will update the research priorities and will send them to MS by January 21. The public comments from the Fall NOSB meeting will be incorporated into the document.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019 - canceled due to Public comment webinar.

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

Fenbendazole (AS). Discuss questions for limited scope TR.

December 3, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (HB) - discuss/vote

2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (AS/JB) - discuss/vote

December 17, 2019

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss/vote

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 -Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss/vote

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss/vote

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss/vote

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss/vote

RP discussion document discussion.

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss/vote

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. No TR requested. The LS requested a Limited Scope TR XX, XX, XX 2015 TR	11.5.19 11.19.19	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jul 2020		11.5.19	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	2.18.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	“
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020

Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, October 1, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Scott Rice (SR)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review August 20 notes
- Fenbendazole. (AS) - discuss document
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from August 20** were accepted as is
- **Fenbendazole. (AS).** Members discussed the previous decision to not request a TR, and may choose to contract a limited scope TR after all. Members also reviewed public comment that they've received to date. A member reminded the others that the current language in the discussion document limits use of fenbendazole to emergency use only, in the event that other methods have failed. The LS will wait until after the Fall meeting, and after they've heard from stakeholders, before requesting a limited scope TR. The NOP indicated that a TR requested now would likely not be completed until approximately mid-February.
- **Other items.**
 - The LS Chair noted that the NOP re-posted the origin of livestock rule today, October 1 and that the comment period is open for 60 days. Members will reach out to stakeholders to make sure people are aware and make comments.
- **Excluded Methods vaccines.** A member said she has received comments about the proposal on vaccines made with excluded methods. There seems to be a misunderstanding about the language in the proposal, and the LS will work on ways to clarify what the intent was.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

September 3, 2019 - canceled

September 17, 2019 - canceled

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019 - canceled due to Public comment webinar.

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	AS	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. No TR requested. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19 08 06 19	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	08 06 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 18 19	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 18 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	08 06 19	“
DL-Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19. TR found suff 06 04 19.	TR suffic. 06 04 19 07 16 19	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS	N	LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18. Proposal for Fall 2019.	05 21 19 07 16 19	Fall 2019
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19 05 21 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 19 06 18 19	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604	AS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqt modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, August 20, 2019 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Scott Rice (SR); Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Notes from August 6
- Fenbendazole. (AS) - discuss document
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** August 6 were accepted as is.
- **Fenbendazole** (AS). The group discussed the fenbendazole discussion document and additional background information, including FDA research studies regarding parasiticide residues. A member noted that the background information did not address fenbendazole specifically, and is also not necessarily specific to hens. The Livestock Subcommittee chose to submit a discussion document for the Fall 2019 meeting instead of a proposal, while they seek additional information and feedback.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

August 6, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote

2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote

Fenbendazole. (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019 - canceled

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019 - canceled due to Public comment webinar.

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	AS	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. No TR requested. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19 08 06 19	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	08 06 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 18 19	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 18 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	08 06 19	“
DL-Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19. TR found suff 06 04 19.	TR suffic. 06 04 19 07 16 19	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS	N	LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18. Proposal for Fall 2019.	05 21 19 07 16 19	Fall 2019
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19 05 21 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 19 06 18 19	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604	AS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqt modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, August 6, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Scott Rice (SR), Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Notes from July 16
- 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
- Fenbendazole. (AS) - discuss proposal/vote
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from July 16** were accepted as is.
- **2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS).** The lead summarized atropine, which is used mostly for anesthesia in organic. Public comment was supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove atropine from the National List at §205.603

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: SR

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS).** The lead summarized the uses of xylazine, noting that it is used in conjunction with tolazoline in organic livestock. Comments were supportive of relisting, and one commenter indicated that it would be useful to explore alternatives.

Motion to remove xylazine from the National List at §205.603(a)

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Fenbendazole. (AS).** The lead summarized the petition and draft proposal. The 2016 NOSB recommendation that amended the annotation for fenbendazole to clarify its use in organic livestock production has been implemented ([83 FR 66559](#)). The lead will cite the recent rule change and make some modifications to the document based on feedback from members, and recirculate the draft document for review. The Subcommittee will vote via email by no later than August 12. The voting information will be added below once it is complete.

Post-Subcommittee call update: Based on further discussion, the Livestock Subcommittee chose to put forth a petition-discussion document instead of a proposal for fenbendazole.

Motion to accept the discussion document on fenbendazole - for use in laying hens or replacement chickens intended to be laying hens at 7 CFR §205.603 (23)(i)

Motion by: Ashley Swaffar

Seconded by: Sue Baird

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Research Priorities.** The RPs were agreed upon by the members and will be forwarded to the Materials Subcommittee.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

July 16, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote

2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote

2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - discuss/vote

Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods - discuss draft proposal

August 6, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote

2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote

Fenbendazole. (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	AS	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. No TR requested. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19 08 06 19	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation . TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	08 06 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 18 19	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 18 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	08 06 19	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19. TR found suff 06 04 19.	TR suffic. 06 04 19 07 16 19	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS	N	LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18. Proposal for Fall 2019.	05 21 19 07 16 19	Fall 2019
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19 05 21 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 19 06 18 19	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604	AS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, July 16, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Scott Rice (SR), Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Notes from June 18
- 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - discuss/vote
- Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods - discuss draft proposal
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from June 18** were approved as is.
- **2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS).** The LS deferred this discussion to the next call
- **2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS).** The LS deferred this discussion to the next call. One member asked for input from NOP about whether xylazine can be used on food producing animals in the US.
- **2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR).** The lead summarized the material's uses and manufacturing processes, and noted the new TR. Trace minerals are required in animal nutrition. Members discussed previous comments regarding supplementation versus forage.
Motion to remove trace minerals at §205.603
Motion by: SR
Seconded by: AS
Additional discussion: None
Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
- **Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods.** The LS discussed the draft proposal, and modifications that were suggested by other Subcommittee members. Members were supportive of the proposed option for "Allowing all vaccines without any review or consideration if they were produced through excluded methods".
Motion to accept the proposal on excluded methods
Motion by: HB
Seconded by: AS
Additional discussion: None
Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
- **New petition for fenbendazole (AS).** AS volunteered to lead this review and asked if the group would be ready to put forth a proposal for the Fall 2019 meeting. Fenbendazole is being petitioned for use to treat worms in poultry. Alternatives are diatomaceous earth, which the lead noted is not entirely effective. The LS wants to ensure they do due diligence and do not

move forward too quickly, but considering the workload for the Livestock Subcommittee, feels that they can complete a proposal for Fall. The petition was found sufficient and the LS will not request a TR.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous LS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

June 18, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic Acid (JB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
 Research Priorities (HB, SB, AS)

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - discuss/vote
 Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods - discuss draft proposal

August 6, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
 Fenbendazole. (AS) – discuss proposal/vote

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	AS	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. No TR requested. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19 08 06 19	TBD

Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
2021 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	08 06 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 18 19	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 18 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline. TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	08 06 19	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19. TR found suff 06 04 19.	TR suffic. 06 04 19 07 16 19	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS	N	LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18. Proposal for Fall 2019.	05 21 19 07 16 19	Fall 2019
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19 05 21 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 19 06 18 19	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604	AS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqt modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, June 18, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Scott Rice (SR), Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Notes from June 4
- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic Acid (JB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (HB, SB, AS) - vote
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from June 4** were accepted as is.
- **2021 Sunsets: hydrogen peroxide (JB).** The lead summarized uses and previous comments, as well as information from the TR. Hydrogen peroxide is widely used and is considered GRAS (generally regarded as safe)

Motion to remove hydrogen peroxide at §205.603

Motion by: JB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: peracetic acid (JB).** The lead summarized the uses of peracetic acid, as well as the previous review and public comments.

Motion to remove peracetic acid at §205.603

Motion by: JB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB).** The lead summarized the substance, and previous comments. The group discussed the need for methionine at length and proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove DL- Methionine at §205.603

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB).** The lead summarized the draft review and noted a comment from the previous posting about the parasiticides.

Motion to remove (Parasiticide) fenbendazole at §205.603.

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB).** The lead summarized the draft review and noted a comment from the previous posting about the parasiticides.

Motion to remove (Parasiticide) moxidectin at §205.603

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB).** The lead summarized the draft review and comments from the previous posting. Commenters were overwhelmingly in support of retaining vitamins on the National List. Members suggested some modifications to the review and the LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove vitamins at §205.603

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Research Priorities (HB, SB, AS).** Livestock had three previous research priorities. The group discussed the current list and possible additions. One member suggested a research priority for improving pasture to better address the nutritional needs of various species which could help reduce the need for supplementation.
- **Other items.** The lead continues to reach out to goat experts from around the country, and the feedback varies greatly. She will continue to talk to others, but it seems that this may not be a topic area that the NOSB would undertake.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

June 4, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - TR sufficiency

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote

2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium Sulfate (AS) - discuss/vote
 Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion
 Dairy Goat Work Agenda Proposal (HB) - discuss

June 18, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic Acid (JB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
 Research Priorities (HB, SB, AS) - vote

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - discuss/vote
 Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods - discuss draft proposal

August 6, 2019

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
2021 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	07 16	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019

(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 18	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 18	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline. TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	07 16	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture. TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19. TR found suff 06 04 19.	TR suffic. 06 04 07 16	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	05 21 19 07 16 19	
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19 05 21 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 06 18	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604	AS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, June 4, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Scott Rice (SR), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Sue Baird (SB); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Notes from May 21
- 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - TR sufficiency
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium Sulfate (AS) - discuss/vote
- Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion
Dairy Goat Work Agenda Proposal (HB) - discuss
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from May 21** were accepted as is.
- **2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR).** The lead reviewed the TR, noting that it was extensive, and includes a large number of minerals. The TR was found sufficient and the LS will finalize the review on July 16.
- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB).** The lead noted the comments that were received at the Spring meeting. The LS deferred the vote to the next call.
- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB).** The lead noted the comments that were received at the Spring meeting. The LS deferred the vote to the next call.
- **2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB).** The lead summarized comments that were received at the Spring NOSB meeting. The vote was deferred to the June 18 call.
- **2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS).** The lead summarized the uses of iodine and the public comment, and the LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove iodine from the National List at 205.603

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Magnesium Sulfate (AS).** The lead summarized the uses and the public comment, and the LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove magnesium sulfate from the National List at 205.603

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: SR

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Iodine annotation work agenda discussion.** The lead heard from several stakeholders about producing iodine without nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). Iodine has many uses and the group discussed supply and availability. The LS didn't receive much comment at the Spring meeting, and will wait to see what comments are submitted for the Fall 2019 meeting.
- **Dairy goat work agenda proposal (HB).** The lead has reached out to many people but has not been able to locate stakeholders who could provide expertise on dairy goat nutrition. One stakeholder in Vermont offered to reach out to others who perhaps could provide some information about grazing. Unless it's an animal welfare issue, it doesn't seem like there is universal agreement that dairy goat health and the ability to graze are dependent. Additionally, the vast majority of dairy goats do not graze.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

May 21, 2019

Assign leads/determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets (see table below)
Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods (HB). Discussion
Research Priorities Discussion (HB, AS, SB) (Please come with any ideas)
Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion (AS)

June 4, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - TR sufficiency
2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Magnesium Sulfate (AS) - discuss/vote
Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion
Dairy Goat Work Agenda Proposal (HB) - discuss

June 18, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Peracetic Acid (JB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
Research Priorities (HB, SB, AS) - vote

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - discuss/vote
Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods - discuss draft proposal

August 6, 2019

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019
 October 1, 2019
 October 15, 2019
 November 5, 2019
 November 19, 2019
 December 3, 2019
 December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
2021 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	07 02	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 18	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 18	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“

Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	07 02	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19. TR found suff 06 04 19.	TR suff 06 04 07 16	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	05 21 19 07 16 19	
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19 05 21 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 06 18 vote	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604	AS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018

NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, May 21, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Harriet Behar (HB); Scott Rice (SR), Chair; Sue Baird (SB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Notes from May 7
- Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion (AS)
- Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods (HB). Discussion
- Research Priorities Discussion (HB, AS, SB) (Please come with any ideas)
- Assign leads/determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets (see table below)
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from May 7** were approved with the clarification of the acronym DMI: dry matter intake.
- **Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods (HB).** The group discussed options for moving forward with this project based on comments the Board received at the Spring meeting. The lead will develop a draft proposal for discussion for the July 16 call.
- **Research Priorities Discussion (HB, AS, SB).** Members discussed the existing (2018) research priorities and whether to add items. A member suggested adding a topic addressing the comparison of European production to US production, given that Europe doesn't allow methionine.
 - **Dairy Goats.** The lead continues to reach out to various experts and is having a difficult time locating people to provide feedback about dairy goat grazing and dry matter intake. She still intends on writing a work agenda request for discussion on the next call. As for a research priority, the organic regulations say "all ruminants" must have 30% dry matter intake, without differentiating between ruminants.
- The Livestock Subcommittee will continue to fine tune the Research Priorities and vote on them by June 18 so they can forward them to the Materials Subcommittee. The lead will circulate the draft prior to the next call.
- **Assign leads/determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets.** See table below.
- **Iodine annotation work agenda discussion (AS).** Deferred to next call.
- **Other items.**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

May 7, 2019

May 21, 2019

Assign leads/determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets (see table below)

Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods (HB). Discussion

Research Priorities Discussion (HB, AS, SB) (Please come with any ideas)

Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion (AS)

June 4, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - TR sufficiency
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium Sulfate (AS) - discuss/vote
- Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion
- Dairy Goat Work Agenda Proposal (HB) - discuss

June 18, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic Acid (JB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (HB, SB, AS) - vote

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - discuss/vote
- Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods - discuss draft proposal

August 6, 2019

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
2021 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting

Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation . TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	07 02	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 04	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 04	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	07 02	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19.	TR suff 06 04 07 02	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	05 21 19 07 16 19	
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19 05 21 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 06 18 vote	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603	SB		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603	HB		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603			Sunset date TBD (FR Notice 66559) 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604	AS		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018

NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, May 7, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Harriet Behar (HB);

Absent: Scott Rice (SR), Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Notes from March 5
- Review of/reflections on Seattle meeting
- Assign dates for review of sunsets and petitions
- Trace Minerals TR sufficiency due June 14
- DMI for goats
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from March 5** were approved as is.
- **Review of/reflections on Seattle meeting.**
 - **Iodine annotation suggested at meeting.** There was a suggestion was to add the annotation “with no NPEs”. The lead will reach out to stakeholders and veterinarians to follow up.
 - **MethioMax follow up.** Several public commenters mentioned a product called MethioMax which contains minor levels of methionine. The lead will follow up with stakeholders to glean more information.
- **Assign dates for review of sunsets and petitions.** See table below.
- **Trace Minerals TR sufficiency due June 14.** Discussion scheduled for June 4.
- **Dry Matter Intake (DMI) for goats. The Livestock Subcommittee discussed various aspects of the potential work project on grazing requirements for dairy goats. This is a topic that was suggested by several certifiers. The lead provided some background about dairy goats, noting that indicated that it’s difficult to raise goats on pasture as they cannot consume pasture in adequate amounts while producing milk to keep their body in good condition. The lead is waiting for additional feedback. The LS will develop a request to add this to the work agenda and put forth a discussion document to collect public comment.**
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

April 2, 2019

Discuss dairy goats’ work agenda request - cancelled

April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar

May 7, 2019

May 21, 2019

Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods (HB). Discussion

Research Priorities Discussion (HB, AS, SB) (Please come with any ideas)

Iodine Annotation Work Agenda Discussion (AS)

June 4, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - TR sufficiency
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium Sulfate (AS) - discuss/vote
- Dairy Goat Work Agenda Proposal (HB) - discuss

June 18, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic Acid (JB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (HB, SB, AS) - vote

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Trace Minerals (SR) - discuss/vote
- Vaccines Made From Excluded Methods - discuss proposal

August 6, 2019

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold until aquaculture rule is published. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting

Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	07 02	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	06 04	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	06 04	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline. TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found suff 03 05 19	07 02	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture. TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019. TR sent to LS 04 16 19. TR Suff due 06 14 19.	TR suff 06 04 07 02	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	07 16	
Pasture requirements for dairy goats	HB		Work agenda request in development as of April 2019	03 05 19	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Jul 2019	05 21 Discussion 06 18 vote	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603			Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Flunixin	205.603			Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603			Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Poloxalene	205.603			Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Formic acid	205.603			Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Excipients	205.603			Sunset date 1/28/2024 (FR Notice 66559) 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603			Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Strychnine	205.604			Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018

NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, March 5, 2019 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Scott Rice (SR), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Sue Baird (SB); Jesse Buie (JB); Harriet Behar (HB)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Notes from February 19
- 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - TR sufficiency
- 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - TR sufficiency
- Pasture requirements for dairy goats' work agenda request
- Vaccines
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from February 19** were accepted as is.
- **2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS).** The LS found the TR sufficient.
- **2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS).** The LS found the TR sufficient.
- **Pasture requirements for dairy goats work agenda request (HB).** The lead has engaged many stakeholders regarding this issue and the members discussed others to reach out to as they develop a work agenda item. The LS will discuss this on the March Executive call, and will likely seek approval to add it to the work agenda in April.
- **Vaccines made with excluded methods.** A member reached out to several vaccine manufacturers to let them know about the impending public comment period.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 15, 2019 - cancelled due to shutdown

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation

February 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review

2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation

2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB/SR) - Discuss additional information from SR/ACAs

Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss proposal

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal deadline

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation disc doc

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency
 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency
 2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) - Discuss review
 March 5, 2019
 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss TR sufficiency
 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss TR sufficiency
 Pasture requirements for dairy goats' work agenda request
 March 19, 2019 - cancelled
 April 2, 2019
 Discuss dairy goats' work agenda request
 April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
 May 7, 2019
 May 21, 2019
 June 4, 2019
 June 18, 2019
 July 2, 2019
 July 16, 2019
 August 6, 2019
 August 20, 2019
 September 3, 2019
 September 17, 2019
 October 1, 2019
 October 15, 2019
 November 5, 2019
 November 19, 2019
 December 3, 2019
 December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18. TR found insufficient 9 18 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor 10 25 18. Revised TR send to LS 11 30 18. Response due 01 29 19. TR found sufficient 12 18 18	02 05 2019	Spring 2019
Aquaculture Substances				On hold until aquaculture rule is published. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation . TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	02 19 2019	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	12 18 2018	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	02 05 2019	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19. TR found sufficient 03 05 19	02 19 2019	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019	02 19 2019	“

Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018 02 05 2019	“
----------	------------	----	---	---	--------------------------	---

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Use of excluded method vaccines in Livestock production	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	12 18 2018 02 19 2019	Disc doc Spring 2019
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	TBD	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting

Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, February 19, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Scott Rice (SR), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Sue Baird (SB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Harriet Behar (HB)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency
- 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency
- 2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) - Discuss review
- Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation disc doc
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS).** The lead integrated information from the recently received TR into the sunset review and the Livestock deferred TR sufficiency to a future call.
- **2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS).** The lead integrated information about international uses from the recently received TR into the sunset review and the Livestock deferred TR sufficiency to a future call. A member noted that there were few-to-no objections for the continued listing of this substance and that it is critical in livestock.
- **2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR).** The lead summarized the review noting that it's one of the few categorical listings, which includes many minerals. The LS requested a TR which is pending. The LS will add questions about ancillary substances and post the document for public comment.
- **Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation discussion document.** Members briefly discussed the document and moved to a vote.

Motion to accept the vaccines made with excluded methods annotation discussion document

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Other items.** The topic of pasture requirements for dairy goats came up at the Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) training. The LS would like to work on this and will write up a request to add it to the work agenda.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 15, 2019 - cancelled due to shutdown

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review
2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review
2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation

February 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review
2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation
2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - Discuss review
2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB) - Discuss review
2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB/SR) - Discuss additional information from SR/ACAs
Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss proposal

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal deadline

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation disc doc
2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency
2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency
2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) - Discuss review

March 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss TR sufficiency
2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss TR sufficiency
Pasture requirements for dairy goats' work agenda request

March 19, 2019

April 2, 2019

April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar

May 7, 2019

May 21, 2019

June 4, 2019

June 18, 2019

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

August 6, 2019

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18. TR found insufficient 9 18 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor 10 25 18. Revised TR send to LS 11 30 18. Response due 01 29 19. TR found sufficient 12 18 18	02 05 2019	Spring 2019
Aquaculture Substances				On hold until aquaculture rule is published. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation . TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19.	02 19 2019	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	12 18 2018	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	02 05 2019	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19	02 19 2019	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019	02 19 2019	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018 02 05 2019	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	12 18 2018 02 19 2019	Disc doc Spring 2019
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	TBD	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed	NA	Proposal TBD

				sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

			Handling 2006			
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, February 5, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Scott Rice (SR), Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair; Sue Baird (SB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review
- 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review
- Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation
- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB/SR) - Discuss additional information from SR/ACAs
- Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss proposal
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB).** The lead summarized the review and asked that the NOP verify the EU standard and update the link to the recently published rule (NOP 14-05) that annotates methionine. The lead would like to invite a representative from the methionine task force to report out at the Spring NOSB meeting. A member will be attending the methionine task force meeting in the next few weeks and will seek some information from that group.
- **2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB).** The lead summarized the uses of the substance and will make some modifications to the draft document based on feedback from the LS members. The HS will post the review for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB).** The lead summarized the draft review of the substance, including uses and manufacture. The HS will post the review for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB/SR).** One of the leads discussed additional information they received from the NOP and a materials review organization regarding excluded methods. The review includes questions for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB).** The lead summarized the previous reviews and NOP actions for moxidectin. The lead noted that it is considered to be the least toxic of the parasiticides.
- **Oxalic Acid (HB).** The lead summarized the draft proposal, the group discussed it and made some minor modifications to the annotation. Members discussed the lack of apiculture standards and one member noted that they would not vote for this material with no standards in place.

Motion to classify oxalic acid as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to add oxalic acid dihydrate at §205.603(b) “as topical treatment, external parasiticide or local anesthetic as applicable” with the annotation “For use as a pesticide solely for apiculture”

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 1 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS).** Deferred to next call
- **2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS).** Deferred to next call
- **Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation.** Deferred to next call
- **2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR).** Deferred to next call
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 15, 2019 - cancelled due to shutdown

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation

February 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review

2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation

2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB/SR) - Discuss additional information from SR/ACAs

Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss proposal

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal deadline

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation disc doc

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency

2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review/TR sufficiency

2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) - Discuss review

March 19, 2019

April 2, 2019

April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar

May 7, 2019

May 21, 2019

June 4, 2019

June 18, 2019

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

August 6, 2019

August 20, 2019
 September 3, 2019
 September 17, 2019
 October 1, 2019
 October 15, 2019
 November 5, 2019
 November 19, 2019
 December 3, 2019
 December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18. TR found insufficient 9 18 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor 10 25 18. Revised TR send to LS 11 30 18. Response due 01 29 19. TR found sufficient 12 18 18	02 05 2019	Spring 2019
Aquaculture Substances				On hold until aquaculture rule is published. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation . TR due Early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19.	02 19 2019	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	12 18 2018	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	02 05 2019	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov. TR sent to LS 02 04 19. Response due 04 05 19	02 19 2019	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 2019	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019	02 19 2019	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 2018 02 05 2019	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	12 18 2018 02 19 2019	Disc doc Spring 2019
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	TBD	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed	NA	Proposal TBD

				sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

			Handling 2006			
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD