

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call**  
**Tuesday, May 19, 2020, 3:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR); Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA)

**Agenda**

- Review April 7 notes
- Schedule discussion dates for 2022 sunsets
- Determine need for TRs for 2023 sunsets
- Fenbendazole
- Additional items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Notes from April 7** were accepted as written.
- **Schedule discussion dates for 2022 sunsets.** See table below for scheduled dates
- **Determine need for TRs for 2023 sunsets.** The LS will discuss the need for TRs for the 2023 sunsets on the June 2 call.
- **Fenbendazole (SB).** The TR was received by the LS yesterday. Two members, who had the opportunity to look at it, felt it was complete, well balanced, and readable. The LS will discuss sufficiency on the June 16 call.
- **Additional Items.**
  - Members discussed potential research priorities to add to the current document, that was submitted as a discussion document for the Spring meeting. SB will submit a research topic for addition to the Fall list.
  - Members discussed the NOSB spring virtual meeting and provided thoughts and feedback.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

May 5, 2020 - cancelled

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

2023 sunset reviews (ALL) - TR determination

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss review/vote

June 16, 2020

Fenbendazole (SB) - TR sufficiency

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss review/vote  
 July 7, 2020  
 2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB) - discuss review/vote  
 July 21, 2020  
 2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP) - discuss review/vote  
 2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP) - discuss review/vote  
 August 4, 2020  
 August 18, 2020  
 September 1, 2020  
 September 15, 2020  
 October 6, 2020  
 October 20, 2020  
 November 3, 2020  
 November 17, 2020  
 December 1, 2020  
 December 15, 2020

## Work Agenda

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 <b>TR suff due 7.17.20</b> <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2016 NOSB Recommendation</a>	06.16.20	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020		Fall 2020

**\*Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed. **\*Highlight** indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	07.07.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2001 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2011 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">TR 2015</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	06.16.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020

Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

### 2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2015 TR (Electrolytes)</a> 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2017 TR</a> <a href="#">2016/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR- None <a href="#">2003/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR-None <a href="#">2009/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“

Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>	06.02.20	“

### Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR.	N/A	Proposal TBD

CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6			7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.		
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call**  
**Tuesday, April 7, 2020, 3:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR); Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA)

**Agenda**

- Review February 18 notes
- Public comment review
- Assign leads/Determine need to TRs for 2023 sunset substances
- Additional items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Notes from February 18** were accepted as is.
- **Public comment review.** The Subcommittee members discussed the process for reviewing public comments.
- **Assign leads/Determine need to TRs for 2023 sunset substances.** LS members volunteered to lead the reviews for 2023 sunset substances (see table below).
- **Additional Items.** The NOSB Chair provided logistical information about the Spring 2020 NOSB meeting, given that it will be held virtually instead of in person.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

March 17, 2020 - cancelled

April 7, 2020

Public comment review

Assign leads/Determine need to TRs for 2023 sunset substances

April 21, 2020 - cancelled (for public comment webinar)

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020  
 December 1, 2020  
 December 15, 2020

## Work Agenda

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2016 NOSB Recommendation</a>	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020	11.5.19	Fall 2020

\*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

### 2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.20	“



Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2001 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	2.18.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2011 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">TR 2015</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020

Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

### 2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>		Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2015 TR (Electrolytes)</a> 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD		"
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2015 TR (Electrolytes)</a> <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>		"
Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water.	205.603(a)(10)(iii)			Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2017 TR</a> <a href="#">2016/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>		"
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>		
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2015 TR (Mineral Oil)</a> <a href="#">2003/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>		"
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2019 TR (Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2015 TR (Vitamins)</a> <a href="#">2015 TR (Electrolytes)</a> <a href="#">2009/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>		"
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2002/Fall - Rec to ADD</a>		"

Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>		“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2013 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>		“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Spring - Rec to ADD</a>		“

### Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found	N/A	Proposal TBD

				sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.		
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call**  
**Tuesday, February 18, 2020, 3:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR)

**Absent:** Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA)

**Agenda**

- Review February 4 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss
- Additional items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Notes from February 4** were accepted as it.
- **2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS).** The lead summarized the uses of poloxalene, including the International standards. Members discussed the review and will submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020 - cancelled

March 17, 2020 - cancelled

April 7, 2020 - Public comment review

April 21, 2020 - cancelled (for public comment webinar)

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

## Work Agenda

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2016 NOSB Recommendation</a>	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020	11.5.19	Fall 2020

\*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

### 2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2001 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	2.18.20	“

Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2011 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">TR 2015</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

### Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	N/A	Proposal TBD

				11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.		
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14)	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12.	N/A	Proposal TBD



(for aquatic animals)				Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.		
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call**  
**Tuesday, February 4, 2019 3:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Agenda**

- Review January 21 notes
- Reassign sunset materials
- Additional items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Notes from** January 21 were accepted without changes.
- **Reassign sunset materials.** NPP volunteered to take over the reviews of two sunset materials: formic acid and strychnine (see table below).
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**[Previous LS Notes](#)**

**Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) – discuss

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) – discuss

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020  
December 15, 2020

## Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2016 NOSB Recommendation</a>	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020		11.5.19	Fall 2020

\*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.2020	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2001 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall – Rec to Renew</a>	2.18.20	“

Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2011 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">TR 2015</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 29 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel)  6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR  7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call**  
**Tuesday, January 21, 2019 3:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Swaffar (AS); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer, Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA)

**Agenda**

- Review January 7 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss
- Additional items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Notes from** January 7 were accepted as is.
- **2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB).** The lead summarized the review and noted its uses. The LS added questions for public comment and will submit the review to the NOP for posting.
- **2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR).** The lead summarized the listing and uses of butorphanol. It is used as a pain med pre-surgery, and commonly used as an antiesthetic.
- **Additional items.** The current sunset reviews will be reassigned to new members on a future call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

**Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss

February 4, 2020

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020  
 July 21, 2020  
 August 4, 2020  
 August 18, 2020  
 September 1, 2020  
 September 15, 2020  
 October 6, 2020  
 October 20, 2020  
 November 3, 2020  
 November 17, 2020  
 December 1, 2020  
 December 15, 2020

### Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2016 NOSB Recommendation</a>	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020		11.5.19	Fall 2020

\*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken



## 2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.2020	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2001 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	2.18.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2011 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">TR 2015</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.20 2.4.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020

Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

### Aquaculture petitions

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel)  6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR  7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call**  
**Tuesday, January 7, 2019 3:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer, Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

**Absent:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair

**Staff:** Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

**Agenda**

- Review December 17 notes
  - 2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss
  - 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss
- Other items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Notes from** December 17 were accepted as written
- **2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB).** The lead summarized the uses of magnesium hydroxide and members suggested minor modifications. The LS will submit the document for posting for the Spring meeting.
- **2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR).** The Livestock Subcommittee had a lengthy discussion about the EPA List 4 inerts listing, which is inactive, and has been for about 8 years. The lead noted that the Executive Committee also discussed this issue on the December call, and NOP is supportive of the NOSB work to rectify the discrepancy. Members discussed the which could include the SCIL list. The group also discussed a memorandum of understanding (MOU). The lead added some questions for public comment and reviewed them with the members. The LS will forward this to NOP for posting for the Spring meeting.
- **2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB).** The lead summarized the draft review including uses and potential GMOs. The LS will add some questions targeted at certifiers about how excipients are reviewed, and if there are any specific excipients that are of more concern than others. The LS will forward this to NOP for inclusion at the Spring meeting.
- **Other items.** The LS submitted questions for the Fenbendazole TR to NOP, who will send to the contractor.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

**[Previous LS Notes](#)**

**Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

December 17, 2019

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss  
 2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss  
 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss  
 Research Priorities discussion document - discuss  
 Fenbendazole disc doc - discuss/vote

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

### Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. <a href="#">2015 TR</a> <a href="#">2016 NOSB Recommendation</a>	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19 1.21.20	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting

Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020	11.5.19 1.21.20	Fall 2020
--------------------------	----------	----	---	--------------------	-----------

\*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2002 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.21.20	"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2007 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.2020	"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2001 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	2.18.20	"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">2011 TR</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	"
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 <a href="#">TR 2015</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	1.7.20	"
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.17.19 1.7.20 1.21.20	"
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	12.3.19	"

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020

NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel)  6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR  7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD