

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, December 15, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR), Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Brian Caldwell (BC) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review November 17 notes
- Research Priorities (SB) - discuss priorities for Spring 2021
- 2023 Sunset: Activated charcoal (SR) - Discuss review
- 2023 Sunset: Sodium chlorite, acidified 205.603(a)(28) & 205.603(b)(9) (KH) - Discuss review
- 2023 Sunset: zinc sulfate (JB) - Discuss review
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from November 17** were accepted as written.
- **Research Priorities (SB).** SB circulated the two previous research priorities lists and opened it up to discussion. The LS discussed modifying several of the previous priorities for the Spring 2021 posting. A member asked about GMO persistence in compost and manure, which the Chair noted would be addressed in Crops. Members discussed the methionine research priority, and all agreed that it is critical to keep on the list. The group discussed the process by which the priorities are disseminated to the research community and NOP added that a rep from NIFA may be invited to the Spring meeting to provide an update to the Board and community.
- **2023 Sunset: Activated charcoal (SR).** The lead summarized the uses and manufacture of activated charcoal, noting that it was recently added to the National List based on a recommendation from 2002 and is undergoing its first sunset review. There is a pending technical report that will be available for the Spring meeting.
- **2023 Sunset: Sodium chlorite, acidified 205.603(a)(28) & 205.603(b)(9) (KH).** The lead noted that sodium chlorite was recently added to the National List based on a recommendation from 2002 and is undergoing its first sunset review. The HS will discuss the draft reviews on the next call, January 5.
- **2023 Sunset: zinc sulfate (JB).** The lead summarized the uses, manufacture, and environmental concerns of zinc sulfate, and noted that this is its first sunset review. Zinc sulfate was approved as a way to limit the use of copper and although it can accumulate in soil, is considered more benign than alternatives.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 1, 2020 - cancelled

December 15, 2020

Research Priorities (SB) - discuss priorities for Spring 2021

2023 Sunset: Activated charcoal (SR) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Sodium chlorite, acidified 205.603(a)(28) & 205.603(b)(9) (KH) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: zinc sulfate (JB) - Discuss review

January 5, 2021

2023 Sunset: Sodium chlorite, acidified 205.603(a)(28) & 205.603(b)(9) (KH) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Kaolin pectin (DS) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Propylene glycol (MJ) - Discuss review

January 19, 2021

2023 Sunset: Calcium borogluconate (MJ) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Calcium propionate (SB) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Mineral Oil (SB) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Nutritive supplements (NPP) - Discuss review

February 2, 2021

2023 Sunset: Chlorine materials

Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed (NPP)

February 16, 2021

March 2, 2021

March 16, 2021

April 6, 2021

April 20, 2021

May 4, 2021

May 18, 2021

June 1, 2021

June 15, 2021

July 6, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 3, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 7, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 5, 2021

October 19, 2021

November 2, 2021

November 16, 2021

December 7, 2021

December 21, 2021

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed	205.603/ 205.605	NPP		Petition sent to HS 07.31.20 and MS 8.10.20. LS will lead review in conjunction with Handling. Sufficiency due 09.29.20. The CS asked for additional information from the petitioner 9.15.20. LS sent questions to petitioner in Dec	09.01.20 09.15.20 2.2.21	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS 01.19.21	12.15.20	Spr 2021

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due late Jan/early Feb	12.15.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	1.19.21	"
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	1.19.21	"
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide.	205.603(a)(10)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD 2017 Rec – sunset review	2.2.21	"

(iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite.						
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due late Jan/early Feb	1.5.21	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD 2018 Rec to renew TR due late Jan/early Feb	1.19.21	"
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	1.19.21	"
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	MJ	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due late Jan/early Feb	1.5.21	"
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	1.5.21	"
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	1.5.21	"
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	12.15.20	"

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021

NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, November 17, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair, Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jesse Buie (JB); Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE)

Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Andrea Holm (AH)

Agenda

- Review October 6 notes
- Debrief from Fall meeting
- Schedule 2023 sunset discussions
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from October 6** were accepted as written.
- **Debrief from Fall meeting.** The members had no additional comments about the Fall meeting. NOP indicated that although the NOSB ultimately voted to renew the EPA List 4 Inerts, it will move ahead with an Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) on List 4 Inerts.
- **Schedule 2023 sunset discussions.** See table below for new assignments and for the discussion schedule.
- **Additional items.** Kim Huseman will be the Livestock Chair beginning in December.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

November 3, 2020 - cancelled

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020. May cancel call - nothing scheduled

December 15, 2020

Research Priorities (SB) - discuss priorities for Spring 2021

2023 Sunset: Activated charcoal (SR) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Sodium chlorite, acidified 205.603(a)(28) & 205.603(b)(9) (KH) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: zinc sulfate (JB) - Discuss review

January 5, 2021

2023 Sunset: Kaolin pectin (DS) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Propylene glycol (MJ) - Discuss review

January 19, 2021

2023 Sunset: Calcium borogluconate (MJ) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Calcium propionate (SB) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Mineral Oil (SB) - Discuss review

2023 Sunset: Nutritive supplements (NPP) - Discuss review

February 2, 2021

Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed (NPP)

February 16, 2021

March 2, 2021
 March 16, 2021
 April 6, 2021

**Work Agenda
 Petitioned Substances**

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed	205.603/ 205.605	NPP		Petition sent to HS 07.31.20 and MS 8.10.20. Livestock will lead review in conjunction with Handling. Sufficiency due 09.29.20. The LS will ask additional questions of the petitioner 9.15.20.	09.01.20 09.15.20 2.2.21	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS 01.19.21	12.15.20	Spr 2021

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due late Jan/early Feb	12.15.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	1.19.21	"
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	1.19.21	"

Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD 2017 Rec – sunset review	TBD	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due late Jan/early Feb	1.5.21	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD 2018 Rec to renew TR due late Jan/early Feb	1.19.21	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	1.19.21	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	MJ	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due late Jan/early Feb	1.5.21	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	12.15.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	12.15.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	12.15.20	“

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response	N/A	Proposal TBD

(chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6			7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.		
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, October 6, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jesse Buie (JB);

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review September 15 notes
- Discuss public comments/review roles for Fall meeting
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from September 15** were reviewed and accepted as is.
- **Public comments/review roles for Fall meeting.**
 - The LS Chair suggested timing for discussing various documents, allotting the bulk of the time for the fenbendazole proposal.
- **Public comments. The group discussed comments about fenbendazole and EPA List 4 inerts.** Some commenters expressed concern about residual amounts of fenbendazole in eggs. Stakeholders also provided feedback about List 4 inerts. Some are concerned that it will destabilize the industry. With support from NOP, EPA, and stakeholders, the NOSB will move ahead with its review with the intention of finding a replacement or solution for a list that is no longer supported by EPA, acknowledging that it could take a long time until it is implemented.
- **Additional items.**
 - The Crops Subcommittee is awaiting a response from the petitioner about one of its two chitosan. Since the LS is reviewing chitosan as processing aid in the production of livestock feed, the Subcommittees are working together and sharing information.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

September 15, 2020

Chitosan (processing aid in the production of livestock feed) - petition sufficiency

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020 - cancelled: Comment webinars

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole (Petition to annotate for use in poultry treatment)	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20. TR found sufficient 06.16.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20 07.21.20	Fall 2020
Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed	205.603/ 205.605	NPP		Petition sent to HS 07.31.20 and MS 8.10.20. Livestock will lead review in conjunction with Handling. Sufficiency due 09.29.20. The CS asked for additional information from the petitioner 9.15.20.	09.01.20 09.15.20	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS July 2020	07.07.20	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“

Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 1, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28 - 30, 2020
Sanitizer Panel	Nov 12, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	“

Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, September 15, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jesse Buie (JB); Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review September 1 notes
- Chitosan (processing aid in the production of livestock feed) - petition sufficiency
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** September 1 were accepted as is.
- **Chitosan (processing aid in the production of livestock feed) (NPP).** The lead summarized the petition for the group, noting that there is not much information about the manufacturing process. The LS would like to ask some additional questions of the petitioner regarding the manufacturing process and the need for this material. Members discussed the other chitosan petition in Crops, submitted by the same petitioner, which the Crops Subcommittee sent back for additional information. The lead will review the questions that the Crops Subcommittee sent and may modify or add questions for the Livestock Subcommittee.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

September 1, 2020

Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed - assign lead

September 15, 2020

Chitosan (processing aid in the production of livestock feed) - petition sufficiency

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole (Petition to annotate for use in poultry treatment)	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20. TR found sufficient 06.16.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20 07.21.20	Fall 2020
Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed	205.603/ 205.605	NPP		Petition sent to HS 07.31.20 and MS 8.10.20. Livestock will lead review in conjunction with Handling. Sufficiency due 09.29.20. The CS asked for additional information from the petitioner 9.15.20.	09.01.20 09.15.20	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS July 2020	07.07.20	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“

Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 1, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28-30, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	--------------	--------	-----------------------------	----------------

Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
--------------	----------------	----	---	---	----------	---

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture -	205.611	JR	2011 TR	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP	N/A	Proposal TBD

Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals			(Vaccines made from GMOs)	note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14		
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, September 1, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jesse Buie (JB); Kim Huseman (KH); Rick Greenwood (RG) - observer

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review July 21 notes
- Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed - assign lead/petition sufficiency
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** July 21 notes were accepted as written, via email August 18
- **Chitosan petition (introduction and assignment of lead).** The Livestock Chair introduced a new petition assigned to the Livestock Subcommittee to permit chitosan as a flocculant for manufacturing livestock feed. The petition is available on the NOP website. RG joined the Livestock call to discuss the status of two other petitions for chitosan that are currently under review by the Crops Subcommittee (one for use as a plant disease control and one for use as a flocculant to manufacture crop fertilizers/soil amendments). A technical report was recently completed on chitosan with an emphasis on use for plant disease control (also available on the NOP website). A member noted that the petition claims the amount of chitosan in a final product is minuscule. Members questioned whether chitosan would be used to manufacture organic feed if it were added to the National List. Members will discuss the petition in more detail on the next call. NPP volunteered to take the lead on the review. RG offered to share information learned from the Crop Subcommittee's reviews.
- **Additional items.** The group discussed the fenbendazole proposal and potential options to limit its use (and reduce concerns of residues) through an annotation, such as limiting its use to birds that have not yet begun to produce eggs. The petition is on the agenda for the full Board meeting in October.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

August 18, 2020 - cancelled

September 1, 2020

Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed - assign lead

September 15, 2020

Chitosan (processing aid in the production of livestock feed) - petition sufficiency

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole (Petition to annotate for use in poultry treatment)	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20. TR found sufficient 06.16.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20 07.21.20	Fall 2020
Chitosan - processing aid in the production of livestock feed	205.605	NPP		Petition sent to HS 07.31.20 and MS 8.10.20. Livestock will lead review in conjunction with Handling. Sufficiency due 09.29.20.	09.01.20 09.15.20	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS July 2020	07.07.20	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“

Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28-30, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021

Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD TR due mid-December	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
--------------	----------------	----	---	---	----------	---

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, July 21, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jesse Buie (JB); Kim Huseman (KH); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Jerry

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review July 7 notes
- Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss draft proposal/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss review/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP) - discuss review/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP) - discuss review/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** July 7 notes were accepted as written.
- **Fenbendazole (SB).** The lead discussed the proposal to annotate fenbendazole to include use in poultry.

Classification: Fenbendazole is already on the National List and is classified at synthetic non-agricultural.

Motion to amend the listing for fenbendazole to include at 7 CFR §205.603 (23)(i): fenbendazole - for use in laying hens or replacement chickens intended to be laying hens

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 4 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR).** The lead summarized the previous work on EPA List 4 Inerts, which is a defunct listing that EPA no longer maintains. The Crops Subcommittee is also reviewing this sunset listing. The lead noted that of the ~360 inerts on List 4, approximately 153 are on the EPA Safer Choice List, and if the NOSB were to recommend removal of the listing from the National List, that could leave a number of products that would have to be reformulated. There is wide support to move this project forward, with support from the NOSB, NOP, and the community. Public comment indicated that leaving the defunct listing on the National List stifles innovation and disincentivizes the production of safer, less toxic products.

Motion to remove EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern at §205.603

Motion by: SR

Seconded by: SB

Yes: 2 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP).** The lead summarized the use of formic acid including health and human effects, which, with proper precautions, are minimal. Formic acid is fairly non-toxic, and is used internationally. The Subcommittee and commenters supported relisting.

Motion to remove formic acid at § 205.603

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: SR

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP).** The lead summarized the uses of strychnine as well as previous comments. Strychnine is used as a rodenticide, and is considered a violent substance that causes pain and suffering. Additionally, it is dangerous to mammals and humans. It is listed at 205.602 - prohibited from use in organic agriculture, and the Livestock Subcommittee voted for continued prohibition.

Motion to remove strychnine at § 205.603

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: JB

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

July 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB) - discuss review/vote

Research Priorities (SB) - Additional RP on fenbendazole: Discuss and send to MS

July 21, 2020

Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss draft proposal/vote

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP) - discuss review/vote

August 4, 2020 - cancelled

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole (Petition to annotate for use in poultry treatment)	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20. TR found sufficient 06.16.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20 07.21.20	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS July 2020	07.07.20	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes)	06.02.20	“

				2002/Fall - Rec to ADD		
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed	N/A	Proposal TBD

				sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, July 7, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jesse Buie (JB); Kim Huseman (KH); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review June 16 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB) - discuss review/vote
- Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss draft proposal/vote
- Research Priorities (SB) - Additional RP on fenbendazole: Discuss and send to MS
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from June 16** were accepted as written.
- **2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB).** The lead summarized the uses of magnesium hydroxide and summarized the comments. A member noted that it is in use and is beneficial.

Motion to remove magnesium hydroxide at §205.603

Motion by: JB

Seconded by: KH

Yes: No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Fenbendazole (SB).** The group briefly discussed the draft proposal and will continue the discussion on the next call.
- **Research Priorities (SB).** The LS added one item to the Spring research priorities document regarding the efficacy of natural parasiticides and methodologies compared to Fenbendazole. The new item will be included on the Fall 2020 research priorities proposal the LS will forward to the Materials Subcommittee for vote.
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

June 16, 2020

Fenbendazole (SB) - TR sufficiency

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss review/vote

July 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB) - discuss review/vote

Research Priorities (SB) - Additional RP on fenbendazole: Discuss and send to MS
 July 21, 2020

Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss draft proposal/vote

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP) - discuss review/vote

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20. TR found sufficient 06.16.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20 07.21.20	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS July 2020	07.07.20	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	-------	-----------------------------	----------------

Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020

Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	"
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	"
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	"
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	"
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	"
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	"

Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, June 16, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review June 2 notes
- Fenbendazole (SB) - TR sufficiency
- 2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss review/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss review/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** June 2 were accepted as written.
- **Fenbendazole (SB).** The lead reviewed the TR sufficiency criteria and the TR was deemed sufficient. The lead will inform the NOP and the group will discuss the draft proposal on the next call.
- **2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR).** The lead summarized the use of butorphanol as well as the public comments received at the Spring meeting. He noted that there are no effective alternatives to butorphanol, and the Subcommittee moved to a vote to relist.

Motion to remove butorphanol at §205.603

Motion by: SR

Seconded by: DS

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS).** The lead summarized the use of poloxalene to control bloat, and noted that although there are natural alternatives, they are found to be ineffective, especially for severe cases. Two commenters raised questions but did not offer evidence of alternatives. Members noted that although poloxalene is synthetic it is used infrequently and is important for use on farms.

Motion to remove poloxalene at §205.603

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: NPP

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

June 2, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss review/vote
 2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss review/vote

June 16, 2020

Fenbendazole (SB) - TR sufficiency
 2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss review/vote
 2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss review/vote

July 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB) - discuss review/vote
 Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss draft proposal/vote
 Research Priorities (SB) - Additional RP on fenbendazole: Vote and send to MS

July 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss review/vote
 2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP) - discuss review/vote
 2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP) - discuss review/vote

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20. TR found sufficient 06.16.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS July 2020	07.07.20	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will reqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and	N/A	Proposal TBD

				07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, June 2, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Scott Rice (SR) Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela - observer

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review May 19 notes
- 2023 sunset reviews (ALL) - TR determination
- 2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss review/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss review/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from May 19** were accepted as written.
- **2023 sunset reviews (ALL) - TR determination.** The LS requested TRs for the following 2023 sunset substances.
 - Activated charcoal
 - Kaolin pectin
 - Mineral Oil - L'mtd TR focusing on internal use
 - Propylene glycol
- **2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB).** The lead summarized the Subcommittee review and the public comment from the Spring meeting. The LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove flunixin from 205.603

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: DS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB).** The lead noted that she retained most of the text from the spring review, made some minor modifications, and added public comment. Commenters were overwhelmingly supportive of relisting. The LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove excipients from 205.603

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss review/vote

June 16, 2020

Fenbendazole (SB) - TR sufficiency

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss review/vote

July 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB) - discuss review/vote

Research Priorities (SB) - vote and send to MS

July 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP) - discuss review/vote

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS July 2020		Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	

Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB	L'mtd TR on internal use	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 (TR did not include current use). 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR - 2015 Vitamins TR - 2019 Trace Minerals (Livestock) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB	Y	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB	N	Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061- 51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12.	N/A	Proposal TBD

(for aquatic animals)				Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.		
-----------------------	--	--	--	--	--	--

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, May 19, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR); Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review April 7 notes
- Schedule discussion dates for 2022 sunsets
- Determine need for TRs for 2023 sunsets
- Fenbendazole
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from April 7** were accepted as written.
- **Schedule discussion dates for 2022 sunsets.** See table below for scheduled dates
- **Determine need for TRs for 2023 sunsets.** The LS will discuss the need for TRs for the 2023 sunsets on the June 2 call.
- **Fenbendazole (SB).** The TR was received by the LS yesterday. Two members, who had the opportunity to look at it, felt it was complete, well balanced, and readable. The LS will discuss sufficiency on the June 16 call.
- **Additional Items.**
 - Members discussed potential research priorities to add to the current document, that was submitted as a discussion document for the Spring meeting. SB will submit a research topic for addition to the Fall list.
 - Members discussed the NOSB spring virtual meeting and provided thoughts and feedback.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

May 5, 2020 - cancelled

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

2023 sunset reviews (ALL) - TR determination

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss review/vote

June 16, 2020

Fenbendazole (SB) - TR sufficiency

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss review/vote

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss review/vote
 July 7, 2020
 2022 Sunsets: Magnesium hydroxide (JB) - discuss review/vote
 July 21, 2020
 2022 Sunsets: Formic acid (NPP) - discuss review/vote
 2022 Sunsets: Strychnine (NPP) - discuss review/vote
 August 4, 2020
 August 18, 2020
 September 1, 2020
 September 15, 2020
 October 6, 2020
 October 20, 2020
 November 3, 2020
 November 17, 2020
 December 1, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. TR sent to LS 5.18.20 TR suff due 7.17.20 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	06.16.20	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020		Fall 2020

***Yellow highlight** indicates committee action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	07.07.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.02.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	06.16.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	07.21.20	“

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020

Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite. (ii) Chlorine dioxide. (iii) Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water. (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.603(a)(10)	TBD		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR- None 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 TR-None 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD	06.02.20	“

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR.	N/A	Proposal TBD

CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6			7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.		
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, April 7, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR); Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review February 18 notes
- Public comment review
- Assign leads/Determine need to TRs for 2023 sunset substances
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from February 18** were accepted as is.
- **Public comment review.** The Subcommittee members discussed the process for reviewing public comments.
- **Assign leads/Determine need to TRs for 2023 sunset substances.** LS members volunteered to lead the reviews for 2023 sunset substances (see table below).
- **Additional Items.** The NOSB Chair provided logistical information about the Spring 2020 NOSB meeting, given that it will be held virtually instead of in person.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

March 17, 2020 - cancelled

April 7, 2020

Public comment review

Assign leads/Determine need to TRs for 2023 sunset substances

April 21, 2020 - cancelled (for public comment webinar)

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020
 December 1, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020	11.5.19	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20	“

Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	2.18.20	“
Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020

Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

2023 Sunset Review: TR Requests (July 2020), Summary (Spr 2021), Review (Fall 2021)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Activated charcoal (CAS # 7440-44-0)	205.603(a)(6)	SR		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD		Summary: Spr 2021 Review: Fall 2021
Calcium borogluconate (CAS # 5743-34-0)	205.603(a)(7)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD		“
Calcium propionate (CAS # 4075-81-4).	205.603(a)(8)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD		“
Hypochlorous acid—generated from electrolyzed water.	205.603(a)(10)(iii)			Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2017 TR 2016/Spring - Rec to ADD		“
Kaolin pectin	205.603(a)(17)	DS		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD		
Mineral Oil	205.603(a)(20)	SB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR (Mineral Oil) 2003/Spring - Rec to ADD		“
Nutritive supplements (Injectable trace minerals, vitamins and electrolytes)	205.603(a)21	NPP		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2019 TR (Minerals) 2015 TR (Vitamins) 2015 TR (Electrolytes) 2009/Spring - Rec to ADD		“
Propylene glycol (CAS #57-55-6)	205.603(a)(27)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2002 TR 2002/Fall - Rec to ADD		“

Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(a)(28)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD		“
Sodium chlorite, acidified	205.603(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2013 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD		“
Zinc sulfate	205.603(b)(11)	JB		Sunset date: 1/28/2024 2015 TR 2015/Spring - Rec to ADD		“

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found	N/A	Proposal TBD

				sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.		
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, February 18, 2020, 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR)

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review February 4 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from February 4** were accepted as it.
- **2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS).** The lead summarized the uses of poloxalene, including the International standards. Members discussed the review and will submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020 - cancelled

March 17, 2020 - cancelled

April 7, 2020 - Public comment review

April 21, 2020 - cancelled (for public comment webinar)

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)	SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities	SB	N/A	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020	11.5.19	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	2.18.20	“

Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture Petitions

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Requested	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Aquaculture-CO2, (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	N/A	Proposal TBD

				11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.		
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14)	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	N/A	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12.	N/A	Proposal TBD

(for aquatic animals)				Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.		
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	N/A	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, February 4, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Review January 21 notes
- Reassign sunset materials
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** January 21 were accepted without changes.
- **Reassign sunset materials.** NPP volunteered to take over the reviews of two sunset materials: formic acid and strychnine (see table below).
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) – discuss

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) – discuss

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020
December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	SB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. TR due Mid-May. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Fall 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020		11.5.19	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	1.21.20	“
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.2020	“
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall – Rec to Renew	2.18.20	“

Formic acid	205.603	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	“
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20	“
Strychnine	205.604	NPP	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	“

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 29 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, January 21, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), Vice Chair; Swaffar (AS); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer, Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review January 7 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** January 7 were accepted as is.
- **2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB).** The lead summarized the review and noted its uses. The LS added questions for public comment and will submit the review to the NOP for posting.
- **2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR).** The lead summarized the listing and uses of butorphanol. It is used as a pain med pre-surgery, and commonly used as an antiesthetic.
- **Additional items.** The current sunset reviews will be reassigned to new members on a future call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss

February 4, 2020

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020
 July 21, 2020
 August 4, 2020
 August 18, 2020
 September 1, 2020
 September 15, 2020
 October 6, 2020
 October 20, 2020
 November 3, 2020
 November 17, 2020
 December 1, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020		11.5.19	Fall 2020

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.2020	"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	2.18.20	"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20 2.4.20	"
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020

Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, January 7, 2019 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Sue Baird (SB), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer, Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Vice Chair

Staff: Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review December 17 notes
 - 2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss
 - 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** December 17 were accepted as written
- **2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB).** The lead summarized the uses of magnesium hydroxide and members suggested minor modifications. The LS will submit the document for posting for the Spring meeting.
- **2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR).** The Livestock Subcommittee had a lengthy discussion about the EPA List 4 inerts listing, which is inactive, and has been for about 8 years. The lead noted that the Executive Committee also discussed this issue on the December call, and NOP is supportive of the NOSB work to rectify the discrepancy. Members discussed the which could include the SCIL list. The group also discussed a memorandum of understanding (MOU). The lead added some questions for public comment and reviewed them with the members. The LS will forward this to NOP for posting for the Spring meeting.
- **2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB).** The lead summarized the draft review including uses and potential GMOs. The LS will add some questions targeted at certifiers about how excipients are reviewed, and if there are any specific excipients that are of more concern than others. The LS will forward this to NOP for inclusion at the Spring meeting.
- **Other items.** The LS submitted questions for the Fenbendazole TR to NOP, who will send to the contractor.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 17, 2019

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets Magnesium hydroxide: (JB) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss

2022 Sunsets: Excipients (SB) - discuss

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Butorphanol (SR) - discuss
 2022 Sunsets: Flunixin (SB) - discuss
 2022 Sunsets: EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (SR) - discuss
 Research Priorities discussion document - discuss
 Fenbendazole disc doc - discuss/vote

February 4, 2020

February 18, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Poloxalene (DS) - discuss

March 3, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 7, 2020

April 21, 2020

May 5, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 2, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 7, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 4, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 6, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 3, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 1, 2020

December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Fenbendazole	205.603(a) (23)	AS/SB	Disc doc	Petition sent to LS 7.9.2019 Sufficiency due 9.6.2019. Petition found sufficient 7.16.19. Limited scope TR requested on 12.17.19. 2015 TR 2016 NOSB Recommendation	11.5.19 11.19.19 12.17.19 1.21.20	Spr 2020
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See table below)	TBD	TBD
Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes		Discussed, Voted	Target meeting

Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs for discussion document due to MS Jan 2020	11.5.19 1.21.20	Fall 2020
--------------------------	----------	----	---	--------------------	-----------

*Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

2022 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Butorphanol	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2002 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Flunixin	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603	JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2007 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.2020	"
Poloxalene	205.603	DS	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2001 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	2.18.20	"
Formic acid	205.603	HB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 2011 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Excipients	205.603	SB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR 2015 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
EPA List 4—Inerts of Minimal Concern.	205.603	SR	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (FR Notice 82 FR 14420) TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19 1.7.20 1.21.20	"
Strychnine	205.604	AS/JB	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020

NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting – Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD