

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, December 19, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer; Logan (LP) - observer

**Absent:** Jared Clark (JC)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO); Jo Mirenda (JM)

### **Agenda**

- Review December 5, 2023 notes
- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH) - discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **December 5, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (MET) (NPP).** The lead introduced the methionine review by noting that each time it is reviewed, it garners attention from the community, and each time has resulted in relisting. Methionine is a natural component of bird diets, mainly from insects. In birds being fed a vegetarian diet, it is often not adequate, so it is supplemented. The lead relayed feedback from stakeholders that the updated annotation, which limits MET to 2 lbs. over the lifetime of the bird, is workable and hasn't been a hinderance. The LS talked about several topics and ideas with regard to MET: A scenario in which there is a supply change disruption and feed is in short supply; A future proposal to remove the restriction based on the notion that even pastured birds may not getting enough methionine in their diet and need higher supplementation; A research priority on alternatives; The newly published Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards; and US standards European standards vs. (in which MET is not allowed).
- **2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic (NL).** The lead summarized the substance review. Peracetic acid is compound of hydrogen peroxide and acetic acid, and its breakdown products are benign. It's an alternative to chlorine, a highly effective sanitizer, not persistent in environment, and an important tool so producers have several options in rotation. The lead will finalize the draft and submit it to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH).** The lead summarized oxalic acid, which is used as a parasiticide for varroa mites in honeybee hives. It was added to the list recently, and it appears that the alternative (sucrose octanoate esters (SOE)) are still on the list. SOE was recommended for removal in 2018 but the NOP did not implement the recommendation. The lead will finalize the draft and the LS will submit for the Spring meeting.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (NL) - discuss review  
 2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review  
 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review  
 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review  
 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review  
 Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote

January 23, 2024

2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review  
 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review  
 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	7.18.23 1.16.24	Fall 2023

### 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “

<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. <b>TR suff due 2.13.24</b>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>11.21.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 1.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>12.19.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>12.19.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>12.19.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>11.22.23</b>	“ “

<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	---	-----

### Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, December 5, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

**Absent:** Nate Lewis (NL)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

### **Agenda**

- Review November 7, 2023 notes
- Review November 21, 2023 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **Review November 7, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Review November 21, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ).** Deferred to January 23, 2024.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ).** Deferred to January 23, 2024
- **2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP).** Deferred to January 23, 2024
- **Additional Items.**
  - Vitamin TR. The LS Chair and the NOP have been discussing the questions for the TR on vitamins. The TR contractor is seeking some clarification about the questions posed by the LS previously. The NOP will send feedback and an additional request by the Subcommittee.
  - A member suggested an idea for a work agenda project on feed additives that will help reduce methane, which could tie into the climate-smart initiative. This may be a candidate for a research priority rather than a work agenda item. Members shared thoughts and ideas, and discussed research about emissions from different livestock practices. A member added that there currently is a lot of research and data being generated about other greenhouse gasses, and will locate one study in particular and share it with the Subcommittee.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

November 21, 2023

2026 Sunset: Trace minerals (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - discuss review

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote

January 23, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

TBD

- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (ADB) - discuss review

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	7.18.23 1.16.24	Fall 2023

### 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Dec.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “

<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

**Milestones**

<b>Spring 2024 Milestones</b>	<b>Target dates (tentative)</b>	<b>Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)</b>
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, November 21, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Nate Lewis (NL)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

### **Agenda**

- Review November 7, 2023 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Trace minerals (BC) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (BC) - discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **November 7, 2023 notes** were deferred to next call as they are not currently available
- **2025 sunsets are due tomorrow.** Please send reviews to the LS Chair and he will compile them and send them to the NOP.
- **2026 sunsets.** Due to the LS by December 5 so all members have time to read and prepare for discussion.
- **2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH).** The lead briefly summarized the history of the substance on the National List, and parasiticides in general. She is still reviewing the information and hasn't yet composed any questions. Members discussed various aspects of "emergency use" of parasiticides, and specifically the fenbendazole annotation change. The annotation changed the withdrawal period from 90 days to 2 days in cattle. There was a lot of support for relisting moxidectin during the last review, but the lead would like to add more information to both parasiticide reviews regarding use and need from the veterinary community. The LS will revisit this at a future call.
- **2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (BC).** The lead summarized the substance, and noted that in the past there was strong support for relisting. There were no additional questions from members. The LS completed the review and will submit it to the NOP.
- **2026 Sunset: Trace minerals (BC).** The lead summarized the substance and emphasized that mineral deficiencies produce negative effects in animals. He also noted the issue of mineral deficiencies in soils. The TR is incredibly detailed and in-depth. A member added that most of these products are predominately sodium chloride, which is considered an ancillary substance, although trace minerals are given in micro-doses. and it is not viewed as a concern. The LS completed the review and will submit to the NOP.
- **Additional Items.**
  - **Swine.** The group discussed the issue of organic swine, which was added to the research priorities in Fall 2023. Members discussed the possibility of adding a work agenda project, and explored various aspects, such as market development, need for regulation updates, and consumer demand. The NOSB Chair noted that the CACS talked about working on a market development project, and this might fit well in that context. There were several lingering questions, and the LS may choose to update the Research Priority language.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

2026 Sunset: Trace minerals (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - discuss review

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote

January 23, 2024

2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	7.18.23 1.16.24	Fall 2023

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.5.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Dec.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “

<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, October 3, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Amy Bruch (ADB); Nate Lewis (NL); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

### **Agenda**

- Travel questions/concerns
- Fall meeting logistics, overview of run-of-show
- Discuss public comments
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **Travel questions/concerns.** The group discussed travel logistics for the NOSB meeting in Providence.
- **Fall meeting logistics, overview of run-of-show.** The group briefly reviewed the meeting agenda and noted that since the public comment period just closed, they have only had time to skim the comments.
- **Public comments.** The lead reviewer for vaccines indicated that there didn't seem to be much controversy and commenters were supportive of the Board's direction. He also remarked that while no one loves it, they recognize that it's necessary for animal welfare. A member mentioned that there is a contingent of stakeholders that continues to push for commercial availability for vaccines. A member asked whether mRNA vaccines would be considered GMO, and BC confirmed that they are GMO. The LS may mention this at the NOSB meeting for informational purposes.
- **Additional Items.**
  - The group discussed swine and the Chair reminded members that it was added to the research priorities and is not a work agenda item for the Livestock Subcommittee.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

September 19, 2023 cancelled

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

2026 Sunset: Atropine (ADB) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - discuss review

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (ADB) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Trace minerals (BC) - discuss review

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss review

January 2, 2024

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote

February 6, 2024

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 1.16.24	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> (Handling) <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> (Handling) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Dec.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “

<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine— hydroxy analog, and DL- Methionine— hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

### Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023



NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, August 15, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Amy Bruch (ADB); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review July 18, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunset Wrap-Up
- Looking Ahead:
  - Fall Meeting
  - 2026 Sunsets
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **July 18, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2025 Sunset Wrap-Up.** All sunset documents were submitted early, with thanks from the NOP! As NOP conducts its review, it may send some documents back for additional editing.
- **Looking Ahead:**
  - **Fall Meeting.** The LS briefly discussed the Fall meeting.
  - **2026 Sunsets.** The Chair noted that there are 13 sunsets for the 2026 review.
- **Additional Items.**
  - The LS may propose a work agenda item on an annotation for iodine. The LS is currently waiting for a TR, due in mid-December, and will move forward this year.
  - The lead reviewer for L-malic acid in handling, volunteered to write a proposed annotation to circulate to each of the Subcommittees as a suggested format. The Chair of Handling is maintaining a list of potential substances for consideration.
  - **Discussion dates for 2026 sunsets.** The LS Chair will schedule discussion dates for the 2026 sunsets and send that to members. (See table below for dates)
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities (All)

August 1, 2023 - cancelled

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

January 2, 16, 2024

February 6, 2024

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 1.16.24	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> (Handling) <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> (Handling) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Dec.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “

<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

## Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023

NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, July 18, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

**Absent:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review June 20, 2023 notes
- Research Priorities (BC/All)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **June 20, 2023 notes** were approved as written.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The lead introduced the document noting that there were 3 different entries that all focused in parasiticides, so he combined them into one entry. There were no objections by other members. The LS has 5 research priorities including one on alternatives to DL - Methionine. A member noted that AAFCO (Association of American Feed Control Officers) is critical to the conversation on DL-Methionine, as they regulate the safety of feed of livestock. He will add some language to the document regarding this. He also noted that there is scant information about insects and safety in feed, which is a barrier.

Members discussed ideas for two future research priorities: one addressing dairy and climate change, and one on organic pork. Members felt that both topics would benefit from input from economists on market/supply management. NPP will write the research priority on dairy for the Spring 2024 discussion document, so they aren't introducing a new topic to the Fall 2023 document.

On the topic of pork, the lead reached out to farmers (both small scale and larger scale) to ask about barriers to organic pork production, and both profit margins were a problem. There are also other limitations such as lack of slaughter-houses and a small market. The LS will add a research priority to get the discussion started on how to "characterize market and production barriers to the expansion of organic pork production".

The LS will complete the research priorities document via email and submit it to the Materials Subcommittee before the August 8 Materials call, on which they will vote.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

June 20, 2023.

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities (All)

August 1, 2023 cancelled

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “



Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 <a href="#">TR: 2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 <a href="#">TR: 2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “

**Milestones**

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, June 20, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Nate Lewis (NL)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review June 6, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (All)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **June 6, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH).** The lead summarized the use, manufacture, and alternatives of glycerine, noting that it was straight forward, and commenters were supportive of relisting. Commenters did mention wanting more information on the hydrolysis process.

Motion to remove glycerin from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH).** The lead summarized the public comment and Board discussion from the Spring 2023 NOSB meeting, and the LS moved to a vote. Most commenters were supportive of relisting. Although the use is very explicit, commenters mentioned other uses.

Motion to remove lime, hydrated from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC).** The lead summarized comments from the Spring 2023 meeting. Commenters suggested specifying allowed uses, which are already specified in the listing.

Motion to remove electrolytes from the National List

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC).** The lead noted that this is complex, and it appears twice in OFPA – once noting that vaccines are universally allowed, and once noting they are allowed as long as they go through the sunset process. In 2019 the NOSB passed a recommendation with a suggestion about how

to solve this, but NOP has not implemented that recommendation. The LS encourages the NOP to implement the 2019 recommendation, and has included language in the review stating that. The group discussed the listing, in which all vaccines are encompassed as a group, and noted that certifiers review them as a group. One commenter disagreed with the 2019 recommendation indicating that it could place an undue burden on farmers and veterinarians. The LS may ask the NOP for a response and update about this at the public meeting in the Fall.

Motion to remove biologics - vaccines from the National List

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Research Priorities (All).** Deferred to the next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities (All)

August 1, 2023 cancelled

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

#### **Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

#### **Petitioned Substances**

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	----------	-------	-------------------	----------------

Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD
------------------------	--	--	--	---	-----	-----

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “

Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine— hydroxy analog, and DL- Methionine— hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “

## Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, June 6, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Lewis (NL); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review May 16, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **May 16, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP).** The lead indicated there was no public comment and not much new to add from the Spring meeting. The LS moved to a vote on the two listings.

Motion to remove alcohols: ethanol from the National List

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

Motion to remove alcohols: isopropanol from the National List

Motion by: NPP

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH).** The lead summarized the use of aspirin in Livestock, which is used to treat inflammation, fevers, and as a pain reliever. Consistent with other substances used for pain relief, stakeholders are supportive of relisting. The LS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove aspirin from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: mineral oil (BC).** Mineral oil is used as an external parasiticide and as a lubricant, and the lead indicated its importance for livestock health. Commenters were strongly in favor of continued listing. A member asked about quantities used and if it is an issue. The lead included that info in the review. Another member mentioned use patterns and that it is helpful to include that information in the review. The lead will send the final draft to the Chair and the NOP by June 20. The LS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove mineral oil from the National List at 205.603(b)

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: phosphoric acid (ADB).** The lead summarized the use of phosphoric acid as a cleaner to remove deposits in dairy operations. There are no alternatives. Stakeholders noted that it does not need to be rinsed, but the regulations allow for that. The lead is waiting for additional information from the Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) and would like to clarify that at the upcoming meeting. The group discussed concentration and a member pointed out that there will be use instructions, and the FDA would approve levels when reviewing products. The lead will look at labels for more information. The LS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove phosphoric acid from the National List

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Additional Items.** The LS discussed the list of TR requests, and how TRs can provide information to Certifiers when reviewing brand-name products for GMOs. Nate Lewis will work with the Materials Subcommittee on the Excluded Methods list, and is looking to integrate the work on excluded methods into future TR requests.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

May 16, 2023

2026 Sunset: Xylazine (ADB) - Discuss need for TR

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023. Nate away!!

Research Priorities (All)

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.20.23	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> (Handling) <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> (Handling) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “

**Milestones**

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, May 16, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Lewis (NL); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review April 4, 2023 notes
- Debrief Spring 2023 Meeting
- Review May - October Timeline
- 2026 Sunset TR Determinations
  - Xylazine (ABD)
- Determine if May 30th call is necessary
- Work Agenda Items (if time)
- Research Priorities (if time)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **April 4, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Debrief Spring 2023 Meeting.** Members shared their perspectives about the Spring meeting, which were all positive.
- **Review May - October Timeline.** The group reviewed the upcoming schedule. See tables below for discussion dates for 2025 sunsets. The 2026 draft sunsets will be due to the LS Chair December 1.
- **2026 Sunset TR Determinations**
  - **Xylazine (ABD).** The lead indicated that the LS will likely approach FDA to glean some additional information about use, and not request a new TR.
  - The LS will request a total of 3 limited scope TRs for 2026 sunsets.
  - **Vitamins (BC).** A member relayed information from the Handling Subcommittee call regarding fermentation, as it relates to vitamins. The conversation revolved around the need to address GMOs in NL items, rather than addressing individual substances or listings. Members suggested asking a question in the Limited Scope TR although acknowledging that it might be difficult to gather information as the listing for vitamins is so big. The lead will narrow the focus of the questions. A member asked if vitamin manufacturers are required to disclose manufacturing processes. The LS Chair and lead reviewer for vitamins will re-review the previous TR and determine how to proceed.
- **May 30th call.** The LS will not schedule an additional call.
- **Work Agenda Items (if time).** The group discussed a potential work agenda item on swine, which was a suggestion from stakeholders at the last meeting. A member noted that California just passed swine regulations (Prop 12). Another member noted the most recent NASS data for swine: there are about 100 farms with swine, and about 20,000 animals total, and so perhaps there is a growth opportunity. Members discussed the barriers to raising organic swine, which include treatments for worms, required amino acids and lysine, and lack of slaughter facilities. The LS discussed writing a discussion document to allow the community to provide feedback. A member suggested reviewing the listing for casings as well. The LS will talk more on next call.

- **Other potential work agenda items for discussion.** The group briefly discussed goats and dry matter intake (DMI), noting that there isn't much information in the pasture rule about goat/sheep feed levels. Members also suggested turkeys may be a candidate for a future work agenda item.
- **Research Priorities (if time).** Deferred to June 20 call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

2026 Sunset: Xylazine (ADB) - Discuss need for TR

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023. Nate away!!

Research Priorities (All)

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

#### **Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

#### **Petitioned Substances**

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD



## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.20.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-</a> <a href="#">aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made</a> <a href="#">from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “

Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine— hydroxy analog, and DL- Methionine— hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “

## Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, April 4, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

**Absent:** Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Nate Lewis (NL); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review March 21, 2023 notes
- Discuss public comments
- Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets
- NOSB Meeting prep Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **March 21, 2023 notes** were accepted with modifications to the section on TR requests.
- **Discuss public comments.** No discussion. Comment period closes April 5.
- **Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets.** The LS discussed the potential TR request for xylazine, which they are revisiting from the last call. The group highlighted some discrepancies between the FDA regulations and the information in the 2019 TR and asked about reaching out to the FDA for clarification.
  - The HS is requesting a TR for magnesium sulfate and the LS would like to review it when it arrives just to see if there is any relevant information.
  - The Chair asked for volunteers to be reviewing partners.
  - The LS discussed the due date for the draft 2026 sunset documents, which will be in late November.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

March 21, 2023

2026 sunset TR needs

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

2026 Sunset: Xylazine (ADB) - Discuss need for TR

**May 30, 2023 - may have additional call**

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023. Nate away!!

Research Priorities (All)

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	1.3.23 1.17.23 6.20.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “

Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22 6.20.23	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	Maybe	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	---	-------------------	-----

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, March 21, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review March 7, 2023 notes
- New member introductions
- Determine 2026 sunset TR needs
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **March 7, 2023 notes** were accepted with minor changes.
- **New member introductions.** Members introduced themselves and welcomed two new NOSB members.
- **Determine 2026 sunset TR needs.** The group reviewed the list of 2026 sunsets and determined the need for TRs. The HS will request 3 limited scope TRs for the following: Hydrogen peroxide focused on Livestock uses; Vitamins, specifically to seek info about potential GMOs used in the production; and Iodine, with questions focused on nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). ADB will revisit the previous tolazoline review so they can sync its review with xylazine since they work in tandem. The HS will then determine if a new TR is necessary.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

2026 sunset TR needs

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

**May 30, 2023 - may have additional call**

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023. Nate away!!

Research Priorities (All)

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	1.3.23 1.17.23 6.20.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “

Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22 6.20.23	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	BC	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	ADB	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine + Tolazoline.</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB	Maybe	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	---	-------------------	-----

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, March 7, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review February 7, 2023 notes
- 2023 Spring Meeting (Agenda, etc.)
- 2026 Sunset Process and Timeline
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **February 7, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2023 Spring Meeting (Agenda, etc.).** The Chair shared the work timeline for the next several months including the 2025 sunsets. The LS scheduled dates for document submission, assigned review buddies, and scheduled dates for final discussions and votes. Similar to the process in Crops and Handling, members will submit all documents by May 19, 2023, and schedule discussion/vote dates (see table below), and submit final reviews for the Fall 2023 meeting no later than two weeks after the vote.
- **The May 2 call** was cancelled as it falls immediately after the conclusion of the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset Process and Timeline.** The group discussed the 2026 sunset substances to determine the need for TRs. Members volunteered to lead the review and conduct the assessment for TR needs (see table below). BC volunteered to lead more reviews than the other members. The LS is anticipating an additional member on Livestock, so each person will have about 2-3 sunsets. The NOSB Chair asked for other Chairs to take note of the overall workload across Subcommittees.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

February 7, 2023

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss

February 21, 2023 - cancelled

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

2026 sunset TR needs

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

Discuss public comments

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

May 30, 2023 - may have additional call

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023. Nate away!!

Research Priorities (All)

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	1.3.23 1.17.23 6.20.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23 6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023

Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 <b>2.7.23</b> 6.6.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 <b>12.6.22</b> 6.6.23	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-</a> <a href="#">aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made</a> <a href="#">from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 12.6.22 <b>2.7.23</b> 6.20.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 <b>12.6.22</b> 6.20.23	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 <b>2.7.23</b> 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003 (Handling)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 <b>1.3.23</b> 6.20.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 <b>1.3.23</b> 6.20.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 <b>2.7.23</b> 6.6.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	----------------	--------	----------------------	-------------------



<a href="#">Atropine</a>	205.603(a)(3)	ADB		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.603(a)(15)	BC		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Iodine</a>	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	ADB		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.603(a)(19)	BC		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fenbendazole</a>	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2020 (Fenbendazole)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Moxidectin</a>	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic</a>	205.603(a)(24)	KH		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Xylazine</a>	205.603(a)(30)	ADB		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Oxalic acid dihydrate</a>	205.603(b)(8)	KH		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Spring - Rec to Add</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium</a>	205.603(d)(1)	NPP		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Methionine)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Trace Minerals)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Trace minerals</a>	205.603(d)(2)	BC		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Vitamins</a>	205.603(d)(3)	BC		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, February 7, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review January 17, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC)
- 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC)
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP)
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP)
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **January 17, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (NPP).** The lead summarized the two alcohols noting they are powerful and benign sanitizers in wide use. He also noted they have minimal environmental issues. The lead will finalize the review and submit them to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH).** The lead summarized the uses, history, and manufacture of glycerin. The LS included a couple questions for stakeholder comment and the lead will submit the document for the Spring meeting.
- **2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC).** The lead summarized the use and potential issues with mineral oil, noting that it is benign, and it is also a highly purified petroleum distillate. The group discussed the two different listings - which essentially separate them into internal and external use. The lead suggested some questions for public comment and will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC).** The lead summarized the draft review and highlighted some areas for discussion, particularly excluded methods. Members support the idea that vaccines are essential for humane treatment of animals. The LS discussed the listing and the language in OFPA at § 205.102.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

January 17, 2023

- Research Priorities - finalize list and send to MS
- 2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss

February 7, 2023

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss  
 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP) - discuss  
 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss  
 2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss  
 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss

February 21, 2023

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	1.3.23 1.17.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 12.6.22 2.7.23	“ “

Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> (Handling) <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> (Handling) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 1.3.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.7.23	“ “

## Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, January 17, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kim Huseman (KH), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review January 3, 2023 notes
- Research Priorities - finalize list and send to MS
- 2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **January 3, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Research Priorities (KH).** The LS Chair presented the previous list of priorities, and the group had a lengthy discussion about which items to add, delete, or modify. The Subcommittee Chair will finalize the list and send it to the Materials Subcommittee by the end of the month.
- **2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC- discuss).** Deferred to next call.
- **2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP).** Deferred to next call.
- **2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP).** Deferred to next call.
- **2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH)** Deferred to next call.
- **2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

January 3, 2023

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss

January 17, 2023

Research Priorities - finalize list and send to MS

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss

February 7, 2023

2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP) - discuss

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss  
 2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss  
 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss

February 21, 2023

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	1.3.23 1.17.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 12.6.22 2.7.23	“ “

Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22	“ “
Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 2.7.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> (Handling) <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> (Handling) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 1.3.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.7.23	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes** **Tuesday, January 3, 2023, 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB); Kim Huseman (KH), Chair

**Absent:** Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review December 6, 2022 notes
- 2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss/TR sufficiency
- 2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss
- Research Priorities
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **December 6, 2022 notes** were accepted with minor modifications to the entry for biologics - vaccines.
- **2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH).** The lead summarized the substance and noted that it is only allowed for specific uses - as annotated. The group discussed questions for stakeholders about use and disposal. The lead will make edits and recirculate the document to members before submitting it to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB).** The LS received a limited scope TR focused on alternatives. The TR was found sufficient, and the LS will send an email to the NOP indicating that. The lead will add international uses before sending the review to the LS Chair and NOP
- **2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC).** Deferred to next call.
- **Research Priorities.** The LS Chair will circulate the previous priorities for discussion on the next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)**

December 6, 2022

- 2025 Sunset: Aspirin (KH) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Electrolytes (BC) - discuss

December 20, 2022 - cancelled

January 3, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (ADB) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Lime, hydrated (KH) - discuss

January 17, 2023

- Research Priorities - finalize list and send to MS
- 2025 Sunset: Mineral oil (BC) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol (NPP) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Isopropanol (NPP) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerin(e) (KH) - discuss
- 2025 Sunset: Biologics - Vaccines (BC)

February 7, 2023  
 February 21, 2023  
 March 7, 2023  
 March 21, 2023  
 April 4, 2023  
 April 18, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See <a href="#">NOSB Work agenda</a> for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	All	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	1.3.23 1.17.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.603(a)(1)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 1.17.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.603(a)(1)(ii)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 1.17.23	“ “
Aspirin	205.603(a)(2)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2017</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22	“ “
Biologics - Vaccines	205.603(a)(4)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2014 (Vaccines-aquaculture)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2011 (Vaccines Made from Excluded Methods)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 12.6.22 1.17.23	“ “
Electrolytes	205.603(a)(11)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 12.6.22	“ “

Glycerin(e)	205.603(a)(14)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 2010</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.17.22 1.17.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.603(a)(25)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> (Handling) <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> (Handling) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to LS 12.2.22. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23	“ “
Lime, hydrated	205.603(b)(6)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	4.5.22 1.3.23	“ “
Mineral oil	205.603(b)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR (Limited Scope) 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 1.17.23	“ “

## Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	