

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 17, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT); Tracy Favre, (TF); Dan Seitz (DS); Jesse Buie (JB); Jean Richardson (JR); Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC) - observer; Sue Baird (SB) - observer

Absent: A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	AB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early January 2017	May 17	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19	Fall 2017
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16	Oct 4	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting	
Research Priorities (RP)	All	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2017	
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	JR/DS		Approved to addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Spring 2017.	Aug 2 Sept 6 Dec 20	Spr 2017	
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold until OLPP final rule is published	NA	NA	
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA	

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	Summary: Spr 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Dec 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jan 17	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jan 17	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jan 17	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jan 17	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Dec 20	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Dec 20	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from December 20, 2016
- 2019 Sunset - discuss questions for meeting 1 posting
 - Glucose (HB) - Discuss review
 - Oxytocin (HB) - Discuss review
 - Tolazoline (DS) - Discuss review
 - Copper sulfate (JB) - Discuss review
 - Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** December 20 call were approved with no changes.
- **2019 Sunsets:**
 - Glucose (HB). The lead summarized the draft review, and noted the questions for public comment.

- Oxytocin (HB). The lead summarized the draft review, and noted the questions that will be included in the first posting. Members discussed the uses of this substance and suggested some modifications to the text.
- Tolazoline (DS). The lead provided some background on Tolazoline, which is used to reverse the effects of xylazine (a sedative and analgesic allowed for emergency use). The members suggested some questions and modifications to the review.
- Copper sulfate (JB). The lead summarized the substance and previous public comments. Members offered various viewpoints about use, and suggested some edits to the questions.
- **Other business.**
 - **Research priorities.** HB volunteered to co-lead the RPs.
 - **OLPP.** The Livestock Subcommittee will meet with the NOP next week via conference call to talk about potential work agenda items that the program would like to add, based on the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices rule.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 20, 2016

2019 sunset: Chlorhexidine (HB) - Discuss review
 Emergency treatment - finalize proposal and vote
 Lidocaine (DS) - Discuss review
 Procaine (DS) - Discuss review

January 3, 2017 - Cancelled

January 17, 2017

2019 Sunsets: discuss questions for meeting 1 posting
 Glucose (HB)
 Oxytocin (HB)
 Tolazoline (DS)
 Copper sulfate (JB)

January 31, 2017 - Cancelled

February 21, 2017 - May cancel

March 7, 2017

Research Priorities
 Work agenda items

March 21, 2017

April 4, 2017

April 18, 2017

May 2, 2017

May 16, 2017

June 6, 2017

June 20, 2017

July 18, 2017

August 1, 2017

August 15, 2017

September 5, 2017

September 19, 2017

October 3, 2017

October 17, 2017
 November 7, 2017
 November 21, 2017
 December 5, 2017
 December 19, 2017
 January 2, 2018
 January 16, 2018

Spring 2017 Milestones	2017 Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 8, 2017
NOP - Complete Spring 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2017
NOSB - Spring 2017 proposals due to NOP	Feb 17, 2017
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 1, 2017
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 10, 2017
Public comment closes	Mar 30, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2017
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 7, 2017
Public comment webinar	Apr 13, 2017
Spring 2017 NOSB meeting – Denver, CO	Apr 19-21, 2017 (W-F)

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency.	NA	Proposal TBD

(for aquatic plants)			2006 TR 1995 TAP	CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.		
Aquaculture- Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, March 7, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Jesse Buie (JB); Harriet Behar (HB); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Francis Thicke (FT); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	AB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017	May 17	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19	Fall 2017
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16	Oct 4	Fall 2017
Thymol	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17	Mar 7, Apr 4	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting	
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2017	
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	JR/DS		Approved to addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Spring 2017.	Aug 2, Sept 6, Dec 20	Spr 2017	
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold until OLPP final rule is published	NA	NA	

NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA
--------------------------------	-----	----	--	----	----

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	Summary: Spr 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Dec 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jan 17	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jan 17	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jan 17	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jan 17	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Dec 20	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Dec 20	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from January 17, 2017
- Research Priorities - Assign lead/discuss
- Work agenda items
- Thymol (footbath use only) - Assign lead
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the January 17 meeting.** The LS Chair suggested an update to the entry regarding the proposed LS/NOP meeting to discuss follow-up projects from the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practice rule. For now, the conversation is on hold due to the change in effective date of the rule.
- **Research Priorities.** HB, AS, and SB will co-lead the livestock research priorities. The group discussed possible topics for research priorities, including the efficacy and safety of materials

that are natural/non-synthetic but not necessarily approved by FDA, such as homeopathic remedies. The NOP will circulate last year's research priorities documents to use as an example for formatting.

- **Work agenda items.** The group discussed several work agenda items, noting that many things are currently on hold during the administrative transition, such as apiculture and aquaculture. A member asked about providing feedback to the NOP regarding published draft guidance on treated lumber.
- **Thymol - petitioned for footbath use only.** HB volunteered to take the lead on thymol (as a footbath) and will discuss petition sufficiency and the need for a TR on the April 4 call. The NOP mentioned that an incomplete petition was received by NOP for oxalic acid (for control of varroa mites in honeybees), and that the NOSB could receive a petition once revisions were completed by the petitioner. FT will provide a brief description of a potential work agenda item.
- **Other Items.** The LS cancelled the March 21 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

February 21, 2017 - Cancelled

March 7, 2017

Research Priorities

Work agenda items

Thymol petition - assign lead

March 21, 2017 - cancelled

April 4, 2017

Thymol (HB) - Petition sufficiency

Work agenda items (All)

Public comment (All)

April 18, 2017

May 2, 2017

May 16, 2017

June 6, 2017

June 20, 2017

July 18, 2017

August 1, 2017

August 15, 2017

September 5, 2017

September 19, 2017

October 3, 2017

October 17, 2017

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017

December 5, 2017

December 19, 2017

January 2, 2018

January 16, 2018

Spring 2017 Milestones	2017 Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 8, 2017
NOP - Complete Spring 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2017
NOSB - Spring 2017 proposals due to NOP	Feb 17, 2017
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 1, 2017
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 10, 2017
Public comment closes	Mar 30, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2017
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 7, 2017
Public comment webinar	Apr 13, 2017
Spring 2017 NOSB meeting – Denver, CO	Apr 19-21, 2017 (W-F)

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD
--	---------	-------	---------	---	----	--------------

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 4, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Jesse Buie (JB); Harriet Behar (HB); Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR send to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19	Fall 2017
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16	Oct 4	Fall 2017
Thymol	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner.	Mar 7, Apr 4	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects						
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting	
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2017	
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	JR/DS	N	Approved to addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Spring 2017.	Aug 2, Sept 6, Dec 20	Spr 2017	

Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold until OLPP final rule is published	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets (TR requests) Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	Summary: Spr 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Dec 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Dec 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jan 17	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jan 17	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jan 17	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jan 17	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Dec 20	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Dec 20	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from March 7, 2017
- Thymol (HB) - Petition sufficiency
- Work agenda items (All)
- Public comment (All)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** March 7, 2017 approved with no changes.
- **Thymol (HB).** The lead summarized the material and the petition, which she felt was minimal and didn't include information regarding human health impacts, impacts of manufacturing

process, and ingredients in final product. The Subcommittee found the petition insufficient and will ask for additional information.

- **Work agenda items (All)**
 - TR sufficiency for sulfur was scheduled for May 16
 - The group discussed a topic that has been raised by organic dairy operations regarding the Pasteurized Milk Ordinance (PMO) and the presence/use of homeopathic and herbal remedies on their organic operations. The consensus among Subcommittee members was that the FDA has the authority over this area and that there is no clear path for the NOSB to address the topic. The LS will not plan to work on this topic.
 - A member asked about the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices rule (OLPP) and its current status. It is currently due to go into effect May 19.
- **Public comment (All).** The group briefly discussed public comments and the Chair asked if there were any questions or comments about the process for reading and summarizing comment.
- **Other Items.** The LS cancelled the May 2 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

March 7, 2017

Research Priorities

Work agenda items

Thymol petition - assign lead

March 21, 2017 - cancelled

April 4, 2017

Thymol (HB) - Petition sufficiency

Work agenda items (All)

Public comment (All)

April 18, 2017 - cancelled for NOSB meeting

May 2, 2017- cancelled

May 16, 2017

Sulfur (ARB) - TR sufficiency

June 6, 2017

June 20, 2017

July 18, 2017

August 1, 2017

August 15, 2017

September 5, 2017

September 19, 2017

October 3, 2017

October 17, 2017

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017

December 5, 2017

December 19, 2017

January 2, 2018

January 16, 2018

Spring 2017 Milestones	2017 Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 8, 2017
NOP - Complete Spring 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2017
NOSB - Spring 2017 proposals due to NOP	Feb 17, 2017
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 1, 2017
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 10, 2017
Public comment closes	Mar 30, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2017
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 7, 2017
Public comment webinar	Apr 13, 2017
Spring 2017 NOSB meeting – Denver, CO	Apr 19-21, 2017 (W-F)

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed	NA	Proposal TBD

				sufficient.		
Aquaculture- Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS	NA	Proposal TBD

				04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.		
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, May 16, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Jesse Buie (JB); Harriet Behar (HB); Francis Thicke (FT); Emily Oakley (EO) - observer

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR sent to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17. TR found sufficient 05 16 17.	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017, Jul 18	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19, 2016	Fall 2017
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16. TR in development.	Oct 4, 2016	Fall 2017
Thymol	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner.	Mar 7, Apr 4	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	JR/DS	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017.	May 16, Jun 20	Proposal Fall 2017

Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2017
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold until OLPP final rule is published	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	Review Fall 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jun 20	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from April 4, 2017
- Organic milk - Washington Post story update - NOP
- OLPP Update
- Sulfur (ARB) - TR sufficiency
- Research Priorities-(HB/SB/AS) - Set Deadline
- Assign discussion dates for 2019 sunset materials
 - Chlorine materials (AS) - Discuss proposal/vote
 - Chlorhexidine (HB) - Discuss proposal/vote

- Glucose (HB) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Oxytocin (HB) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Tolazoline (DS) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Copper Sulfate (JB) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Lidocaine (DS) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Procaine (DS) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Defining Emergency in Parasiticides - next steps
- Recap Meeting
- Other Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the April 4** were approved with no changes
- **Organic milk - Washington Post story update (BR).** There was a story in the Washington Post recently regarding Aurora Dairy, and the director of the Compliance and Enforcement Division (C & E) was asked to join the call to update the group. Since there is a current, ongoing, investigation, the NOP cannot provide specific information. The members discussed the nature of the complaint which includes both the dairy operation and the certifier. The NOSB members emphasized that while there is an issue, it is important to note that this is one dairy operation out of many operations. A member asked about the length of time it will take to complete the investigation. The NOP indicated that it is a priority, but cannot be sure how long it will take.
- **OLPP Update (AS).** The LS Chair updated the group about the delay of the effective date for the final rule, and reopening of comment period. The comment period was reopened on May 11 and NOP has received more than 7000 comments to date.
- **Sulfur (ARB) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the uses of the substance, as well as the TR information. Synthetically produced elemental sulfur is used as a pesticide for mites, fleas, ticks, etc. It is dusted on feathers/hair and also applied to livestock facilities. The TR was found sufficient.
- **Research Priorities (HB/SB/AS).** The group discussed research priorities and will discuss the topic on both the June 6 and July 18 calls. The lead will recirculate last year's document for review.
- **2019 sunset materials** discussion dates were assigned. See table above and list below.
 - Chlorine materials (AS). Discuss proposal/vote - June 6
 - Chlorhexidine (HB). Discuss proposal/vote - June 20
 - Glucose (HB). Discuss proposal/vote - June 20
 - Oxytocin (HB). Discuss proposal/vote June 20
 - Tolazoline (DS). Discuss proposal/vote - June 6
 - Copper Sulfate (JB). Discuss proposal/vote - June 20
 - Lidocaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote - June 6
 - Procaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote - June 6
- **Defining Emergency in Parasiticides - next steps (HB).** The NOSB received comments during the previous postings, and will review the document in light of the change in the status of OLPP. The intention is to work on a backup plan in case the OLPP Rule is not implemented. The lead will move forward with a proposal for discussion on a future call.
- **Other Items.**
 - The LS discussed the topic of re-transitioning dairy animals on a new farm if animals were previously certified organic on another farm. There is an inconsistency among certifiers when it comes to allowing this practice, and the LS discussed whether or not

this is a project they could work on to ensure consistency. The NOP will discuss this and report back to the LS on the next call.

- Antibiotic use in day-old chicks work agenda item. The NOSB continues to get feedback from stakeholders to work on this item, but it is not clear if it is feasible, based on language in OFPA.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

April 4, 2017

Thymol (HB) - Petition sufficiency
Work agenda items (All)
Public comment (All)

April 18, 2017 - cancelled for NOSB meeting

May 2, 2017- cancelled

May 16, 2017

Sulfur (ARB) - TR sufficiency

June 6, 2017

Chlorine materials (AS). Discuss proposal/vote
Tolazoline (DS). Discuss proposal/vote
Lidocaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote
Procaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote

June 20, 2017

Chlorhexidine (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
Glucose (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
Oxytocin (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
Copper Sulfate (JB). Discuss proposal/vote
Discuss Research Priorities.
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

July 18, 2017

Sulfur (AB). Discuss proposal and vote.
Research Priorities - discuss and vote.

August 1, 2017

August 15, 2017. Last call before proposal deadline

September 5, 2017

September 19, 2017

October 3, 2017

October 17, 2017

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017

December 5, 2017

December 19, 2017

January 2, 2018

January 16, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 5, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 17, 2017
NOP - Complete Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD
--	---------	-------	---------	---	----	--------------

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 6, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Francis Thicke (FT); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR sent to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17. TR found sufficient 05 16 17.	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017, Jul 18	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19, 2016	Fall 2017
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16. TR in development.	Oct 4, 2016	Fall 2017
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	JR/DS	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017.	May 16, Jun 20	Proposal Fall 2017
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jul 18	Fall 2017
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold until OLPP final rule is published	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	Review Fall 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jun 20	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from May 16, 2017
- Chlorine materials (AS). Discuss proposal/vote
- Tolazoline (DS). Discuss proposal/vote
- Lidocaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote
- Procaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote Other Items

- Other items:
 - Re-transitioning dairy animals - NOP update
 - LS request to add work agenda item on antibiotic use in day old poultry - NOP update
 - Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** April 16 were approved with no changes
- **Chlorine materials (Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite) (AS).** The lead summarized the uses of chlorine materials, and noted the previous suggestions that the NOSB undertake a review of sanitizers as a group. The Crops Subcommittee discussed this during its call earlier today, and feels that due to the wide array of uses it may be difficult to put forth a standard for all sanitizers, but perhaps could break them into smaller groups.

Motion to remove chlorine materials (Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite) from §205.603(a)

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: SB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Tolazoline (DS).** The lead summarized the public comments and the uses of tolazoline. The group discussed the “companion” substance, xylazine, which is used in conjunction with tolazoline. Xylazine is not being reviewed at the same time, and the group felt that it would not make sense to remove one without the other. The lead will add language to the review to ensure that when xylazine is reviewed, both materials will be considered.

Motion to remove tolazoline from §205.603(a)

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Lidocaine (DS).** Lidocaine is a local, short-term anesthetic, and was renewed unanimously in 2015. In 2016 the NOSB recommended an annotation to reduce the withholding times. Comments were supportive of the reduction in withholding times.

Motion to remove lidocaine from §205.603(b)

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: FT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Procaine (DS).** Procaine, like lidocaine, is a short-term, local anesthetic. It was reviewed in 2015 and the vote to remove it was split. The group discussed previous comments, the use of procaine (which is apparently rarely used, as it is formulated with penicillin), and its essentiality. A wide array of stakeholders suggested relisting during the 2015 review, based on animal welfare issues. The LS will add questions to the review regarding the uses and availability

without antibiotics.

Motion to remove procaine from §205.603(b)

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: SB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 3 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Other items:**

- Animal sourcing by new dairy operations that make whole herd transitions - update. The NOP noted that it intends to address a question raised by a member of the LS via certifier training, and it would not be necessary for the NOSB to work on it.
- Antibiotic use in day-old poultry. The LS would like to add a project to the work agenda to address issues with antibiotic use in day-old chicks. Both stakeholders and the NOSB are emphatic that it is an issue that needs to be addressed. Two members noted that antibiotics are used on some day-old birds in the industry, especially in broiler production. One of the key impediments is the language in OFPA.
- The group discussed the comment period for the OLPP rule, which closes Friday, June 9. NOP noted that there are currently 30K comments, the vast majority of which are in support of allowing the rule to become effective.
- Thymol - Deferred to next call.
- AS will work on the research priorities
- The LS will assign leads to the 2020 sunset materials (see below) on the next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

May 16, 2017

Sulfur (ARB) - TR sufficiency

June 6, 2017

Chlorine materials (AS). Discuss proposal/vote

Tolazoline (DS). Discuss proposal/vote

Lidocaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote

Procaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote

June 20, 2017

Chlorhexidine (HB). Discuss proposal/vote

Glucose (HB). Discuss proposal/vote

Oxytocin (HB). Discuss proposal/vote

Copper Sulfate (JB). Discuss proposal/vote

Assign leads to 2020 sunset materials

Discuss Research Priorities (All)

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)

July 18, 2017

Sulfur (AB). Discuss proposal and vote.

Research Priorities - discuss and vote.

August 1, 2017

August 15, 2017. Last call before proposal deadline
 September 5, 2017
 September 19, 2017
 October 3, 2017
 October 17, 2017
 November 7, 2017
 November 21, 2017
 December 5, 2017
 December 19, 2017
 January 2, 2018
 January 16, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 5, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 17, 2017
NOP - Complete Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603			1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol		Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603			1995 TAP		
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603			2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)		
Electrolytes	205.603			1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		

Glycerine	205.603			2010 TAP (Livestock)		
Phosphoric acid	205.603			2003 TAP (Handling)		
Lime, hydrated	205.603			1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Mineral oil	205.603			2002 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603			2005 TR		

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 20, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Francis Thicke (FT); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC) - observer

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR sent to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17. TR found sufficient 05 16 17.	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017, Jul 18	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19, 2016	Fall 2017
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16. TR in development.	Oct 4, 2016	Fall 2017
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4, Jul 18	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	JR/DS	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017.	May 16, Jun 20, Jul 18	Proposal Fall 2017
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jul 18	Fall 2017
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold until OLPP final rule is published	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	Review Fall 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jun 20	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from June 6, 2017
- Antibiotic use in day old chicks
- Chlorhexidine (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
- Glucose (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
- Oxytocin (HB). Discuss proposal/vote

- Copper Sulfate (JB). Discuss proposal/vote
- Assign leads to 2020 sunset materials
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
- New work agenda items - OLPP call outs?
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** June 6 approved with some minor revisions.
- **Antibiotic use in day old chicks.** The LS is interested in working on this topic, but will defer until after the OLPP rule is completed. Will discuss adding it to the work agenda later this year.
- **Chlorhexidine (HB).** The lead summarized the use of chlorhexidine and public comment from the first posting. The members found no reason to remove chlorhexidine from the National List.

Motion to remove Chlorhexidine from §205.603(a)

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Glucose (HB).** The lead summarized the public comment, noting that commenters were unanimously supportive of renewal. A member added some information regarding treatment of milk fever using calcium in combination with glucose.

Motion to remove glucose from §205.603(a)

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: SB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Oxytocin (HB).** The lead summarized the use of oxytocin, and the public comment. Stakeholders that supported removal included a number of dairy producers, who said they do not use it, as well as three veterinarians, who indicated that it is not needed. Several commenters had suggested there are alternative practices that can be implemented. The lead noted that the current annotation did not make it clear how long oxytocin could be used after parturition, or for what exact purposes. Members also discussed drafting a proposal to change the annotation.

Motion to remove Oxytocin from §205.603(a)

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Copper Sulfate (JB).** During the last call there were some questions that the lead has since addressed and modified in the draft document. The group discussed the frequency of use of copper sulfate and methods of application (individual animal treatment vs. foot bath for all animals). The group also discussed accumulation of copper in soil through application of manure/slurry from manure lagoons.

Motion to remove copper sulfate from §205.603(b)

Motion by: JB
Seconded by: HB
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2020 Sunset materials.** The LS assigned lead reviewers to the 2020 sunset materials to assess the need for TRs. See table below.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The lead summarized the use of the substance and noted previous discussions. There is wide support that this is an issue that needs to be clarified. The lead asked that the NOP review the draft language and provide feedback, given that it could involve a rule change. The members will continue the discussion on the July 18 call.
- **New work agenda items.** Deferred for lack of time.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

June 6, 2017

Chlorine materials (AS). Discuss proposal/vote
Tolazoline (DS). Discuss proposal/vote
Lidocaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote
Procaine (DS). Discuss proposal/vote

June 20, 2017

Chlorhexidine (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
Glucose (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
Oxytocin (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
Copper Sulfate (JB). Discuss proposal/vote
Assign leads to 2020 sunset materials
Discuss Research Priorities (All)
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

July 18, 2017

Sulfur (ARB). Discuss proposal and vote.
Research Priorities - discuss and vote.
TR determinations for 2020 sunsets
Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
Potential work agenda items

August 1, 2017

August 15, 2017. Last call before proposal deadline

September 5, 2017

September 19, 2017

October 3, 2017

October 17, 2017

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017

December 5, 2017

December 19, 2017

January 2, 2018

January 16, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~ Apr 27, 2017 , May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 17, 2017
NOP - Complete Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed, Oct 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB		1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol		Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS		1995 TAP		
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB		2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)		
Electrolytes	205.603	HB		1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Glycerine	205.603	SB		2010 TAP (Livestock)		
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS		2003 TAP (Handling)		
Lime, hydrated	205.603	AB		1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Mineral oil	205.603	AB		2002 TAP ; 2015 TR		

Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB		2005 TR		
--------------------------	---------	----	--	-------------------------	--	--

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, July 18, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC) - observer
Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR sent to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17. TR found sufficient 05 16 17.	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017, Jul 18, Aug 1	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19, 2016	Spr 2018
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16. TR in development. TR sent to LS 07 13 17. TR suff due 09 12 17	Oct 4, 2016, Aug 1	Spr 2018
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017.	May 16, Jun 20, Aug 1	Proposal Fall 2017
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jul 18	Fall 2017
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	Review Fall 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jun 20	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from June 20, 2017
- Sulfur (ARB). Discuss proposal and vote.
- Research Priorities - discuss and vote.
- TR determinations for 2020 sunsets

- Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
- Potential work agenda items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** June 20 approved with no changes.
- **Sulfur (ARB).** The lead summarized the petition, which is for elemental sulfur for use on livestock to control pests. A member noted that sulfur is primarily used on poultry, and the group discussed whether an annotation to limit use to poultry would be appropriate. The group also discussed manufacturing, alternatives, and human health concerns. International standards for use of sulfur are mixed: some standards allow it and some don't. The LS will postpone the vote to the next call so members can review the 2017 TR in further detail and research the international standards more closely.
- **Research Priorities.** The LS Chair circulated last year's priorities for review. Two previous topics, Methionine and prevention and maintenance of parasites, will remain. A member suggested two other topics: research on grasses and managing pasture for optimal grazing, and breed selection/development for organic livestock production. A member noted that pasture management is regionally dependent, and research may need to proceed at that level. HB will develop 2- 3 paragraphs on breed research and the LS will include it in the 2017 research priorities for submission to the Materials Subcommittee.
- **TR determinations for 2020 sunsets.** The LS determined the need for TRs for the 2020 sunset substances. See table below. The group discussed a possible TR for Biologics—Vaccines, but given the scope, will revisit this at a later date. Members suggested requesting TRs for vaccines based on a narrower scope - perhaps by species.
- **Thymol (HB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Potential work agenda items.** Deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

June 20, 2017

Chlorhexidine (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
 Glucose (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
 Oxytocin (HB). Discuss proposal/vote
 Copper Sulfate (JB). Discuss proposal/vote
 Assign leads to 2020 sunset materials
 Discuss Research Priorities (All)
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

July 18, 2017

Sulfur (ARB). Discuss proposal and vote
 Research Priorities. Discuss
 TR determinations for 2020 sunsets
 Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
 Potential work agenda items

August 1, 2017
 Sulfur (ARB). Discuss proposal and vote
 Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB/DS)
 Hypochlorous Acid (FT) - TR sufficiency
 August 14, 2017. Public web conference (NOSB)
 August 15, 2017. Last call before proposal deadline
 Hypochlorous Acid (FT). Discuss proposal and vote
 September 5, 2017
 September 19, 2017
 October 3, 2017
 October 17, 2017
 November 7, 2017
 November 21, 2017
 December 5, 2017
 December 19, 2017
 January 2, 2018
 January 16, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol		Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y low	1995 TAP		
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)		
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Glycerine	205.603	SB	Tentative	2010 TAP (Livestock)		
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	Y	2003 TAP (Handling)		
Lime, hydrated	205.603	AB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Mineral oil	205.603	AB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR		

Aquaculture petitions

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 1, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR sent to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17. TR found sufficient 05 16 17.	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017, Jul 18, Aug 1	Fall 2017
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17. LS will send additional questions to petitioner 08 01 17	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1, Sep 5	Fall 2017
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19, 2016	Spr 2018
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16. TR in development. TR sent to LS 07 13 17. TR suff due 09 12 17. TR found suff 08 01 17	Oct 4, 2016, Aug 1 Aug 15	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects

Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	May 16, Jun 20, Aug 1 Aug 15	Proposal Fall 2017
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jul 18	Fall 2017
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	Review Fall 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jun 20	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from July 18, 2017
- Sulfur (ARB) - Discuss proposal and vote
- Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB/DS)
- Hypochlorous acid (FT) - TR sufficiency
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the July 18, 2017** were approved with no changes
- **Sulfur (ARB).** The lead summarized the substance. Elemental sulfur is being petitioned for use as a parasticide in livestock production. .
- Members discussed reasons for use, human health impacts, and alternatives, and proceeded to a vote.

Motion to add sulfur, as petitioned, at §205.603

Motion by: ARB

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 2 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Thymol (HB).** The lead summarized the material and discussed the need for more information regarding the availability and comparability of nonsynthetic vs. synthetic forms of thymol. The LS will ask the petitioner for additional information.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The lead provided a recap of public comments thus far, and background on why the NOSB is reviewing this topic. She noted that the vast majority of commenters were supportive of this project. The group reviewed and made modifications to the proposed language to add to §205.238. The lead will revise the draft and recirculate it to the members before the next call.
- **Hypochlorous Acid (FT).** The lead indicated that the TR was comprehensive, but didn't include garlic on the list of natural alternatives, nor did it include efficacy information for those alternatives that were listed. The group discussed whether this substance is necessary for the petitioned use, provided the nonsynthetic alternatives. The TR was found sufficient and the lead will have a draft proposal ready for a vote during the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

July 18, 2017

Sulfur (ARB). Discuss proposal and vote

Research Priorities. Discuss

TR determinations for 2020 sunsets

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

Potential work agenda items

August 1, 2017

Sulfur (ARB). Discuss proposal and vote

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

Hypochlorous Acid (FT) - TR sufficiency

August 14, 2017. Public web conference (NOSB)

August 15, 2017. Last call before proposal deadline

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

Hypochlorous Acid (FT). Discuss proposal and vote

September 5, 2017

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency

September 19, 2017

October 3, 2017

October 17, 2017

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017

December 5, 2017

December 19, 2017

January 2, 2018

January 16, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol		Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting.		
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)		
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)		
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	Y - low priority	2003 TAP (Handling)		
Lime, hydrated	205.603	AB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Mineral oil	205.603	AB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR		

Aquaculture petitions

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 15, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Tom Chapman - observer

Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR sent to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17. TR found sufficient 05 16 17.	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017, Jul 18, Aug 1	Fall 2017
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17. LS sent additional questions to petitioner 08 15 17	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1, Sep 19	Spring 2018
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19, 2016	Spr 2018
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16. TR in development. TR sent to LS 07 13 17. TR suff due 09 12 17. TR found suff 08 01 17	Oct 4, 2016, Aug 1 Aug 15	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	May 16, Jun 20, Aug 1 Aug 15	Proposal Fall 2017
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jul 18	Fall 2017
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	Review Fall 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jun 20	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from August 1, 2017
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB) - discuss proposal and vote
- Hypochlorous Acid (FT). Discuss proposal and vote
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the August 1, 2017** were approved with no changes.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The group discussed additional text and background in the draft proposal, and made some modifications to the lettering hierarchy to improve readability. The lead noted that the previous discussion document was well received by stakeholders.

Motion to accept the proposal on defining emergency treatment for parasiticides

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: DS

Additional discussion: members discussed the correct citation

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Hypochlorous Acid (FT).** The lead summarize the substance, which is being petitioned as a topical treatment for pinkeye and wounds in livestock. The lead noted that there are alternative options/practices for treating pinkeye. Members are generally not supportive of adding a synthetic material to the list when there are non-synthetic alternatives.

Motion to add hypochlorous acid as petitioned at §205.603

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Other items.** The Subcommittee cancelled the September 5 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

August 1, 2017

Sulfur (ARB). Discuss proposal and vote

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency (response due 7/25)

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

Hypochlorous Acid (FT) - TR sufficiency

August 14, 2017. Public web conference (NOSB)

August 15, 2017. Last call before proposal deadline

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

Hypochlorous Acid (FT). Discuss proposal and vote

September 5, 2017 - Cancelled

September 19, 2017

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency

October 3, 2017
 October 17, 2017
 Discuss public comments
 November 7, 2017
 Potential cancellation (week after Fall meeting)
 November 21, 2017
 December 5, 2017
 December 19, 2017
 January 2, 2018
 January 16, 2018
 February 6, 2018
 February 20, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol		Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018

Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting.		
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)		
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)		
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority		
Lime, hydrated	205.603	AB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Mineral oil	205.603	AB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR		

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for	NA	Proposal TBD

			6/2013 Minerals TR	additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rww	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with	NA	Proposal TBD

				Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.		
--	--	--	--	---	--	--

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, October 17, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Francis Thicke (FT); Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS);
Absent: A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sulfur	205.603	ARB	Y	Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. TR expected early March 2017. TR sent to LS 03 20 17. Response due 05 19 17. TR found sufficient 05 16 17.	May 17 2016, May 16, 2017, Jul 18, Aug 1	Fall 2017
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17. LS sent additional questions to petitioner 08 15 17. Response sent to LS 10 06 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1, Oct 17	Spr 2018
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR in development	Jul 19, 2016	Spr 2018
Hypochlorous Acid	205.603	FT	Y	Petition sent to LS 08 05 16. Response/request for TR due 10 04 16. Petition found sufficient 10 0 416. LS requested Lmt'd scope TR 10 04 16. TR in development. TR sent to LS 07 13 17. TR suff due 09 12 17. TR found suff 08 01 17	Oct 4, 2016, Aug 1, Aug 15	Fall 2017
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	May 16, Jun 20, Aug 1 Aug 15	Proposal Fall 2017
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jul 18	Fall 2017
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

2019 Sunsets					
Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Calcium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	Review Fall 2017
Chlorine dioxide 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Sodium hypochlorite 205.603(a)	AS	N		Jun 6	"
Chlorhexidine 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Glucose 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Oxytocin 205.603(a)	HB	N		Jun 20	"
Tolazoline 205.603(a)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Copper sulfate 205.603(b)	JB	N		Jun 20	"
Lidocaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"
Procaine 205.603(b)	DS	N		Jun 6	"

Agenda

- Approve notes from August 15, 2017
- Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency
- Discuss public comments (ALL)
- Whole-herd conversions of dairy herds to organic (FT)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the August 15, 2017** were approved via email on September 19.
- **Thymol (HB).** The lead summarized the petition, which requests thymol for use in footbaths, and is an alternative to copper. The LS requested additional information and feels that since much of the information is proprietary they cannot make an informed decision at this time. The group discussed possible paths forward, including asking additional questions, or requesting a TR. The LS will discuss with NOP how best to proceed.
- **Meeting logistics (All).** The LS Chair reminded the group about their assignments for presentations at the fall meeting. HB will have PowerPoint on oxytocin, and emergency use of parasiticides
- **Discuss public comments.** The members briefly discussed public comments.
- **Whole-herd conversions of dairy herds to organic (FT).** A member of the LS raised a concern about the interpretation of 205.236 and whether nonorganic animals that have been previously certified could be included with nonorganic animals for conversion to organic (by new dairies). NOP indicated that they plan to address this topic via certifier training and suggested other avenues that operations could pursue to seek resolution from NOP.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

October 3, 2017 - cancelled

October 17, 2017

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency

Discuss public comments

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017

December 5, 2017

December 19, 2017

January 2, 2018

January 16, 2018

February 6, 2018

February 20, 2018

March 6, 2018

March 20, 2018

April 3, 2018

April 17, 2018

May 1, 2018

May 15, 2018
 June 5, 2018
 June 19, 2018
 July 3, 2018
 July 17, 2018
 August 7, 2018
 August 21, 2018
 September 4, 2018
 September 18, 2018
 October 2, 2018
 October 16, 2018
 November 6, 2018
 November 20, 2018
 December 4, 2018
 December 18, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018

Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol		Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting.		
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)		
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)		
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority		
Lime, hydrated	205.603	AB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Mineral oil	205.603	AB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR		
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR		

Aquaculture petitions

Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting

Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, November 7, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Francis Thicke (FT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17. LS sent additional questions to petitioner 08 15 17. Response sent to LS 10 06 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1, Oct 17	Spr 2018
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FT/AS	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR sent to LS 11 07 17. Response/request for TR due 01 08 18.	Jul 19, 2016, Dec 19	Spr 2018
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17	Dec 5	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting.	Dec 19	"

Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods); 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19	“
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP; 2015 TR	Dec 19	“
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Dec 5	“
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16	“
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP; 2015 TR	Jan 16	“
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP; 2015 TR	Jan 16	“
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Dec 5	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017. Referred back to LS at Fall 2017 meeting		Proposal Spr 2018
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jul 18	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL	NA		NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Approve notes from October 17, 2017
- Recap of Fall 2017 meeting
- Assign lead to oxalic acid
- Assign dates for sunset items.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** October 17, 2017 were approved with no changes
- Recap of Fall 2017 meeting.

- **Copper Sulfate.** At the Fall 2017 meeting commenters made a suggestion for an annotation change for copper sulfate, to prevent contamination from the disposal of copper sulfate in footbaths. The LS Chair asked for feedback and will discuss it at a future call.
- **Oxytocin.** The group discussed preparation of the coversheets for the final recommendations. The NOP will email the coversheet templates for completion by November 24.
- **Oxalic acid.** HB volunteered to review oxalic acid.
- **Assign dates for sunset items.** See table above for review dates.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

October 17, 2017

Thymol (HB) - petition sufficiency

Discuss public comments

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017- cancelled

December 5, 2017

Oxalic Acid (HB) - TR sufficiency due

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

2020 sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss

2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss

2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss

December 19, 2017

Glycolic Acid (AS) - TR suff due

2020 sunset: Aspirin (AS) - discuss

2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss

2020 sunset: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss

January 2, 2018 - cancelled

January 16, 2018

2020 sunset: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss

2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss

2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss

February 6, 2018

February 20, 2018

March 6, 2018

March 20, 2018

April 3, 2018

April 17, 2018

May 1, 2018

May 15, 2018

June 5, 2018

June 19, 2018

July 3, 2018

July 17, 2018

August 7, 2018
 August 21, 2018
 September 4, 2018
 September 18, 2018
 October 2, 2018
 October 16, 2018
 November 6, 2018
 November 20, 2018
 December 4, 2018
 December 18, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed	NA	Proposal TBD

				sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

			Livestock 2006 Handling 2006			
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rww	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, December 5, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB); Tom Chapman (TC) - observer;
Absent: A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Francis Thicke (FT)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17. LS sent additional questions to petitioner 08 15 17. Response sent to LS 10 06 17. LS deemed insufficient on 12 08 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1, Oct 17	Spr 2018
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	FF/AS	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR sent to LS 11 07 17. Response/request for TR due 01 08 18.	Jul 19, 2016, Dec 19	Spr 2018
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR Requested 12 5 17	Dec 5	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018

Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting.	Dec 19	“
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19	“
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19	“
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Jan 16	“
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16	“
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Jan 16	“
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Jan 16	“
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Jan 16	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqt ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	Dec 5, Dec 19, Jan 16, Feb 6, Feb 20	Proposal Spr 2018
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Approve notes from November 7, 2017
- Removal of AQ from LS name.
- Oxalic Acid (HB) - Petition sufficiency due
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
- 2020 sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the November 7, 2017** were approved with a correction to eliminate the word “vote” from the sunset reviews. The Subcommittees do not vote on the posting of the initial sunset documents.
- **Livestock Subcommittee name.** The NOP suggested removing aquaculture from Livestock’s name, as the USDA/AMS is not currently working on an aquaculture rule. The group chose to leave it in the subcommittee’s name at this time.
- **Oxalic Acid (HB).** The petition was found sufficient and the LS will request a TR. The group discussed the need to add this material to the National List, which is used in apiculture (beekeeping), given that there are no USDA organic apiculture standards. The National List currently includes two other materials for use in apiculture. A member argued that the Board should not commit time and resources for the petition in the absence of standards. Members discussed that some certifiers in the U.S. do certify bees and products of apiculture, and some members noted that this material could support producers that are certified and support the development of the market for products of organic apiculture. The LS Chair reiterated that the NOSB would like to see specific apiculture standards developed under the USDA organic regulations (based on a previous NOSB recommendation), and the LS agreed to review the petition. A TR will be requested to support the development of a proposal. A member suggested adding a work agenda item to develop a discussion document to look at the economic impact to U.S. producers of not having apiculture standards, as most organic honey sold in the U.S. is imported.
- **2020 sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB).** The lead summarized the substances, noting that the reviews are fairly straightforward. During the 2015 review, the NOSB asked specific questions regarding denaturing agents and uses. The LS will add a couple of questions for the Spring meeting posting.
- **2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB).** Deferred to January 16, 2018
- **2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB).** Deferred to January 16, 2018 call
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The lead summarized the public comment suggestions from the last meeting, and the LS discussed how to move forward. Members will review the previous docs and discuss on future calls.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

November 7, 2017

November 21, 2017- cancelled

December 5, 2017

Oxalic Acid (HB) - TR sufficiency due

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

2020 sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss

2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss/vote

2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss

December 19, 2017

Glycolic Acid (AS) - TR suff due

2020 sunset: Aspirin (AS) - discuss

2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss

2020 sunset: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

January 2, 2018 - cancelled
 January 16, 2018
 2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
 February 6, 2018
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
 February 20, 2018
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
 March 6, 2018
 March 20, 2018
 April 3, 2018
 April 17, 2018
 May 1, 2018
 May 15, 2018
 June 5, 2018
 June 19, 2018
 July 3, 2018
 July 17, 2018
 August 7, 2018
 August 21, 2018
 September 4, 2018
 September 18, 2018
 October 2, 2018
 October 16, 2018
 November 6, 2018
 November 20, 2018
 December 4, 2018
 December 18, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018

Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, December 19, 2017 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS); Tom Chapman (TC) - observer

Absent: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Francis Thicke (FT)

Staff: Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17. LS sent additional questions to petitioner 08 15 17. Response sent to LS 10 06 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1, Oct 17	Spr 2018
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	AS	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR sent to LS 11 07 17. Response/request for TR due 01 08 18.	Jul 19, 2016, Dec 19	Spr 2018
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR Requested 12 5 17	Dec 5	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018

Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting.	Dec 19	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19	"
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Jan 16	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Jan 16	"
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Jan 16	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Jan 16	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	Dec 5, Dec 19, Jan 16, Feb 6, Feb 20	Proposal Spr 2018
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Approve notes from December 5, 2017
- Glycolic Acid (AS) - TR suff due
- 2020 sunset: Aspirin (AS) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss review
- 2020 sunset: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss review
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** December 5, 2017 were approved after several revisions from the LS Chair, including a change to the thymol item to indicate the LS deemed the petition insufficient on 12/8/17.
- **Glycolic Acid - TR sufficiency (AS).** The lead summarized the TR and did not note any concerns. A member asked if the substance would be used in rotation with other teat dip substances. Members briefly discussed alternatives and agreed to take more time for members to review the TR before making a TR sufficiency determination via email.
- **2020 sunset: Aspirin (AS).** The lead summarized the substance's uses, manufacturing process, and alternatives.
- **2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB).** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of vaccines. Vaccines are mentioned in several sections of the organic regulations, and the lead discussed previous work completed on the topic related to excluded methods and section 205.105. The group discussed questions they may want to include to solicit public input for the sunset review. The LS agreed to discuss further on a future call.
- **2020 sunset: Electrolytes (HB).** The lead summarized the sunset proposal and uses of the substance. The lead noted that the substance cannot be used in the absence of illness. Members noted that electrolytes are essential for organic production.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The lead discussed comments received at the last meeting and the common request to define the term "emergency". Members also discussed comments received about the hierarchy included in the previous version. Some comments questioned which measures were mandated under the previously drafted language. Members discussed the option of shortening the proposal to define the term "emergency" in relation to parasiticides use. The Program noted that recommendations for rulemaking and guidance would need to be accompanied by sufficient justification. The lead will move forward with developing several options.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 5, 2017

- Oxalic Acid (HB) - TR sufficiency due
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
- 2020 sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss/vote
- 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss

December 19, 2017

- Glycolic Acid (AS) - TR suff due
- 2020 sunset: Aspirin (AS) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

January 2, 2018 - cancelled

January 16, 2018

- 2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB) – discuss

2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
 February 6, 2018
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
 February 20, 2018
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
 March 6, 2018
 March 20, 2018
 April 3, 2018
 April 17, 2018
 May 1, 2018
 May 15, 2018
 June 5, 2018
 June 19, 2018
 July 3, 2018
 July 17, 2018
 August 7, 2018
 August 21, 2018
 September 4, 2018
 September 18, 2018
 October 2, 2018
 October 16, 2018
 November 6, 2018
 November 20, 2018
 December 4, 2018
 December 18, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD