

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, December 18, 2018 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Harriet Behar (HB)

Absent: Scott Rice (SR)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - Discuss review
- Oxalic Acid TR Sufficiency
- Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation - discuss document
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes.** The Chair made some modifications to the December 4 notes.
- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB).** The previous Board recommendation on fenbendazole is in final rulemaking. The NOSB recommendation, which was to remove the 90-day withholding time, was added to the current review, so commenters know that it is potentially being changed. The LS added questions about necessity.
- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB).** Moxidectin was reviewed at the same time as other parasiticides and the NOSB [proposed an annotation in April 2016](#). The proposed rule was issued in 2017 and it is currently in final rulemaking. Moxidectin was discussed in a 2006 rule. Initially the NOP did not accept the NOSB recommendation because it was considered an antibiotic, but after comment to the contrary, the NOP added it to the list in 2011 as a parasiticide not an antibiotic.
- **Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation.** The group discussed the draft document. The lead will incorporate the suggestions discussed by the group and will modify the draft for the next call.
- **Oxalic Acid TR sufficiency.** The TR was found sufficient and the LS will proceed with its review.
- **Other items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 4, 2018

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (AS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - Discuss review

December 18, 2018

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - Discuss review

Oxalic Acid (HB) - TR sufficiency
 Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation - discuss document
 January 15, 2019
 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - finalize discussion/review
 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review
 Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation.
 February 5, 2019
 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB/SR) - Discuss additional information from SR/ACAs
 Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss proposal
 February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal deadline
 March 5, 2019
 March 19, 2019
 April 2, 2019
 April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
 May 7, 2019
 May 21, 2019
 June 4, 2019
 June 18, 2019
 July 2, 2019
 July 16, 2019
 August 6, 2019
 August 20, 2019
 September 3, 2019
 September 17, 2019
 October 1, 2019
 October 15, 2019
 November 5, 2019
 November 19, 2019
 December 3, 2019
 December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting

Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18. TR found insufficient 9 18 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor 10 25 18. Revised TR send to LS 11 30 18. Response due 01 29 19. TR found sufficient 12 18 18	01 15 2019	Spring 2019
Aquaculture Substances				On hold until aquaculture rule is published. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets
TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov	01 15 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	12 18	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	12 18 01 15 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline. TR due early Nov	01 15 19	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	01 15 19	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture. TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019	02 05 19	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 02 05 19	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	12 18	Disc doc Spring 2019
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	TBD	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, December 4, 2018 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Scott Rice (SR)

Absent: Harriet Behar (HB); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- 2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (AS) - Discuss review
- 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - Discuss review
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB).** Discussion was deferred to December 18 to allow the lead to add information regarding the 2016 NOSB recommendation for an annotation.
- **2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB).** The lead summarized the use of vitamins for Livestock, noting that some could be produced using GMOs. The group reviewed the previous public comments from the last sunset review, noting that there was not much discussion of this. A member added that there is some language in the OMRI generic materials list about excluded methods and will send a link to the Livestock Subcommittee members. Members will also review NOP Guidance 5030 and will return to the discussion on future call.
- **2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS).** The lead summarized the uses of iodine. The review includes some questions about alternatives that were posed during the previous review.
- **2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (AS).** The lead summarized the many uses of magnesium sulfate, noting that it is commonly known as Epsom salt. The lead added questions to the review, which will be posted for public comment for the spring meeting.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (AS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - Discuss review

December 18, 2018

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - Discuss review

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation - discuss document

January 15, 2019

Oxalic Acid (HB) - TR sufficiency
 2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB) - Discuss review

February 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) - Discuss review
 2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB/SR) - Discuss additional information from SR/ACAs

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal deadline

March 5, 2019

March 19, 2019

April 2, 2019

April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar

May 7, 2019

May 21, 2019

June 4, 2019

June 18, 2019

July 2, 2019

July 16, 2019

August 6, 2019

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019

December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18. TR found insufficient 9 18 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor 10 25 18. Revised TR send to LS 11 30 18. Response due 01 29 19.	01 15 2019	Spring 2019
Aquaculture Substances				On hold until aquaculture rule is published. (See table below)	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation . TR due Early Nov	01 15	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation ; 04/2016 recommendation – annotation change	12 18	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 10/2015 sunset recommendation ; 04/2016 NOSB recommendation - annotation change	12 18	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov	01 15	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	01 15	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019	02 05	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 02 05 19	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	12 18	Disc doc Spring 2019
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	TBD	Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, November 20, 2018 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair;

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Assign discussion dates for 2021 sunset substances
- Oxalic acid
- Other items

Discussion

- **Assign discussion dates for 2021 sunset substances**
 - Trace mineral was reassigned to SR as ABR will be rotating off the Livestock Subcommittee
 - See table and call schedule below for discussion assignments
- **Oxalic acid.** The Program and LS members discussed the status of the forthcoming oxalic acid technical report, including a question from the report writers about the LS's preference for discussing the legal status of formulated oxalic acid products in various states.
- **Other items**
 - **Vaccines made with excluded methods.** The LS members discussed several options for how to move forward with this proposal. The Subcommittee will proceed with a discussion document for the Spring 2019 meeting to solicit feedback from stakeholders.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

November 6, 2018 - cancelled

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Fenbendazole (SB) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Iodine (AS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (AS) - Discuss review

2021 Sunsets: Vitamins (SB) - Discuss review

December 18, 2018

2021 Sunsets: (Parasiticide) Moxidectin (SB) - Discuss review

Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation - discuss document

January 15, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Atropine (DS)

2021 Sunsets: Xylazine (DS)

2021 Sunsets: Methionine (HB)

February 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (JB) -

2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (JB) -

2021 Sunsets: Trace minerals (SR) -

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal deadline
 March 5, 2019
 March 19, 2019
 April 2, 2019
 April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
 May 7, 2019
 May 21, 2019
 June 4, 2019
 June 18, 2019
 July 2, 2019
 July 16, 2019
 August 6, 2019
 August 20, 2019
 September 3, 2019
 September 17, 2019
 October 1, 2019
 October 15, 2019
 November 5, 2019
 November 19, 2019
 December 3, 2019
 December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18. TR found insufficient 9 18 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor 10 25 18.		Spring 2019
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation . TR due Early Nov	01 15	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05	“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18	“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05	“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline . TR due early Nov	01 15	“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	01 15	“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	SR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture . TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019	02 05	“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval. NOP approved addition to work agenda 11 06 18.	12 18	Disc doc Spring 2019
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2019		Fall 2019

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, October 2, 2018 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review public comments
- Review Subcommittee lead assignments for fall meeting presentations (All)
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Review public comments.**
 - The comment period opened September 12 and the LS hasn't received many comments yet.
 - Some commenters provided feedback about the listing of natamycin for Livestock, given that the Crops Subcommittee has classified it as non-synthetic.
- **Review Subcommittee lead assignments for fall meeting presentations (All)**
- **Other items.**
 - The NOSB has not received very many comments about SOEs, but the few they received indicated that they do not currently have EPA registration. A member asked if SOEs are used in other countries. A member noted that effectiveness was a concern, which is why manufacturers stopped making it, and why perhaps no one is using it.
 - Vaccines (HB). The Livestock Subcommittee presented a request to work on vaccines during the last ES call. The Exec team approved it and forwarded it to the NOP for approval.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

September 18, 2018.

Excluded methods discussion

Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss TR sufficiency

October 2, 2018

Review public comments

Review Subcommittee lead assignments for fall meeting presentations (All)

October 16, 2018 - cancelled for public comment webinar

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

December 18, 2018

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	Doc type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Petition discussion doc	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18.	Dec 5 Aug 21, 2018, Sep 18	Fall 2018
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5 Jul 17	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20 Jul 17	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19 Aug 21	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Glycerin	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6 Aug 21	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16 Jul 17	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19, Jul 17	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jun 5, Jun 19 Jul 17	Fall 2018
Vaccines made with excluded methods annotation	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. ES unanimously approved 09 21 18. Awaiting NOP approval.		

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	Aug	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline. TR due early Nov		“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture. TR requested 8/22/18. TR due mid Jan 2019		“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, September 18, 2018 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss TR sufficiency
- Excluded methods discussion
- Questions for fall meeting
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Oxalic Acid (HB).** The LS put forth a petition discussion document for the fall meeting to elicit public comment, and are hoping to get feedback from beekeepers. The lead summarized the TR and the LS found it insufficient at this time, as they have an additional question for the TR contractor. The lead added that sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs), which are currently undergoing sunset review the NOSB, are no longer registered by EPA for honeybee/crops use, and this could have implications for the discussion of oxalic acid. The members discussed the review of inerts, as well as the need to review the substance that is being petitioned and not a formulated product.
- **Excluded methods discussion.** The MS Chair summarized the Materials proposal on excluded methods for the benefit of the Livestock Subcommittee and members who may not be on the Materials Subcommittee. The group discussed the proposal and how it may affect vaccines for use in Livestock. The LS is seeking to add a work agenda item to annotate vaccines, and will seek feedback from the Executive team on the September 21 call.
- **Other items.** The LS Chair will send a written request to the Executive team about adding a vaccine annotation to the work agenda.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

August 21, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

Outdoor access for swine (HB) - review draft request.

Vaccines made from excluded methods (HB) - discuss request

September 4, 2018 - Cancelled

September 18, 2018.

Excluded methods discussion

Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss TR sufficiency

October 2, 2018

Review public comments

Review Subcommittee lead assignments for fall meeting presentations (All)
 October 16, 2018 - cancelled for public comment webinar
 November 6, 2018
 November 20, 2018
 December 4, 2018
 December 18, 2018

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18.	Dec 5 Aug 21, 2018, Sep 18	Petition discussion doc Fall 2018
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5 Jul 17	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20 Jul 17	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19 Aug 21	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Glycerin	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6 Aug 21	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16 Jul 17	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"

Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19, Jul 17	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jun 5, Jun 19 Jul 17	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA
Vaccines annotation	HB/AS?		LS sent request to ES 09 21 18. Approved by ES 09 21 18. Waiting for NOP approval.		

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	Aug	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		"
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline. TR due Early Nov		"
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		"
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture. TR requested 8/22/18		"
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, August 21, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-
dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DM)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July. TR sent to LS 08 21 18. TR sufficiency due 10 20 18.	Dec 5 Aug 21, 2018	Petition discussion doc Fall 2018
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5 Jul 17	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20 Jul 17	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19 Aug 21	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Glycerin	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6 Aug 21	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16 Jul 17	"

Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19, Jul 17	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jun 5, Jun 19 Jul 17	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- 2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB) - discuss proposal and vote
- Oxalic Acid (HB)
- Outdoor access for swine (HB) - review draft request.
- Vaccines made from excluded methods (HB) - discuss request
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB).** The lead summarized the draft sunset review, noting that she included discussion about the inconsistency between the allowances in the regulation versus the National List.

Motion to remove biologics, vaccines at §205.603

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB).** The lead summarized the use and previous comments for glycerin.

Motion to remove glycerin at §205.603

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Oxalic Acid petition discussion document (HB).** The lead discussed the draft document, noting that the process of posting a discussion document for a petition is new and will allow the NOSB to garner additional comment prior to posting a proposal and voting.

Motion to accept the discussion document on oxalic acid

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: SB

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Outdoor access for swine (HB).** The lead discussed the work agenda request. Some members were supportive of bringing this forward while others were not. The group discussed how to move forward - including bringing the request to the Executive team for additional input. The LS will seek feedback from the Exec team and if there is support, will bring it back to LS to discuss further.
- **Vaccines made from excluded methods (HB).** The group would like to work on a document to reconcile and clarify the listing for vaccines. Currently the National List and OFPA contradict each other. The LS will forward this to the Executive team for discussion on the call on September 21.
- **Other items.** The NOSB Chair has requested a TR for trace minerals, with year end funds, and not for magnesium sulfate, as proposed on the August 7 call. The TRs for atropine and xylazine should be available in November.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

August 7, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.

August 21, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

Outdoor access for swine (HB) - review draft request.

Vaccines made from excluded methods (HB) - discuss request

September 4, 2018 - Cancelled

September 18, 2018.

Excluded methods discussion

Oxalic Acid (HB) - discuss TR sufficiency

October 2, 2018

October 16, 2018

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018
December 4, 2018
December 18, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR due Early Nov		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	Aug	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		"
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline. TR due Early Nov		"
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		"
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR	Y	None. 2013 Aquaculture. TR requested 8/22/18		"
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, August 7, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Jesse Buie (JB)

Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Clarissa Mathews (CM)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July.	Dec 5	Petition discussion doc Fall 2018
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5 Jul 17	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20 Jul 17	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19 Aug 21	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Glycerin	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6 Aug 21	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16 Jul 17	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"

Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19, Jul 17	"
--------------------------	---------	----	---	-------------------------	----------------------------	---

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jun 5, Jun 19 Jul 17	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- 2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2021 TR Requests?
- Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.
- GMO Vaccines-HB
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB).** Deferred to next call.
- **2020 sunset review: Electrolytes (HB).** The lead summarized the uses of the material and the recent public comment.

Motion to remove electrolytes at §205.603

Motion by: HB

Seconded by: DS

Additional discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 TR Requests.** The LS discussed additional TR requests, and suggested magnesium sulfate.
- **Outdoor Access for Swine (HB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Vaccines made from excluded methods (HB).** The group briefly discussed the goal for this potential work agenda request. Vaccines are excluded in the regulation unless approved to be on the National List. Due to this discrepancy, it appears that certifiers are not implementing the rules consistently across operations. Members acknowledged that while they are not supportive of excluded methods, there is an animal welfare issue. The lead will recirculate a draft document, and the LS will discuss this further.
- **Other items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous LS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

July 17, 2018

2020 sunset review: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Aspirin (AS) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs) (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

Research priorities discussion (ALL)

Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.

August 7, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.

August 21, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

Outdoor access for swine (HB) - review draft request.

Vaccines made from excluded methods (HB) - discuss request

September 4, 2018

September 18, 2018

October 2, 2018

October 16, 2018

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

December 18, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	TBD
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018

Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	Aug	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		"
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline		"
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		"
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR	N	None. 2013 Aquaculture		"
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) call
Tuesday, July 17, 2018 3:00 pm ET

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Jesse Buie (JB)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Clarissa Mathews (CM)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July	Dec 5	Petition discussion doc Fall 2018
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets						
TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5 Jul 17	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20 Jul 17	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Glycerin	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6 Aug 21	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16 Jul 17	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"

Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19, Jul 17	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jun 5, Jun 19 Jul 17	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- 2020 sunset review: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Aspirin (AS) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs) (SB) - discuss proposal and vote
- Research priorities discussion (ALL)
- Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2020 sunset review: alcohols: ethanol (JB).** The lead summarized the review and modified some of the questions and format.

Motion to remove alcohols: ethanol at §205.603

Motion by: JB

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2020 sunset review: alcohols: isopropanol (JB).** The lead summarized the review and modified some of the questions and format.

Motion to remove alcohols: isopropanol at §205.603

Motion by: JB

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2020 sunset review: aspirin (AS).** The lead summarized the substance uses and comments from previous meeting. Commenters were supportive of renewal.

Motion to remove aspirin at §205.603

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2020 sunset review: phosphoric acid (DS).** The lead summarized the substance uses and made minor modifications to the review. The Subcommittee moved to a vote.

Motion to remove phosphoric acid at §205.603(a)

Motion by: DS

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2020 sunset review: lime, hydrated (ARB).** The lead summarized the uses and previous comments. The majority of commenters supported relisting.

Motion to remove lime, hydrated at §205.603

Motion by: ARB

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2020 sunset review: mineral oil (ARB).** The lead summarized the review, and the group discussed the use of this material, as well as alternatives.

Motion to remove mineral oil at §205.603

Motion by: ARB

Seconded by: SB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2020 sunset review: sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs) (SB).** The group discussed SOEs on the last call and recirculated the correct document for today's call in preparation for a vote.

Motion to remove sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs) at §205.603

Motion by: SB

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: One member supported removal because she feels SOEs are not affective and may be harmful to bees. The lead suggested the addition of a question or two regarding use.

Yes: 2 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Research priorities discussion (ALL).** No other topics were suggested beyond the original three.
- **Outdoor Access for Swine (HB).** The lead circulated a draft request to add this to the work agenda, but the group did not have time to review it before the call. Deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

July 3, 2018 - cancelled

July 17, 2018

2020 sunset review: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Aspirin (AS) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs) (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

Research priorities discussion (ALL)

Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.

August 7, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.

August 21, 2018

2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

September 4, 2018

September 18, 2018

October 2, 2018

October 16, 2018

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

December 18, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 18, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018

Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	Aug	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		"
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline		"
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		"
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR	N	None. 2013 Aquaculture		"
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting
Tuesday, June 5, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair;
A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Jesse Buie (JB)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July	Dec 5	Petition discussion doc Fall 2018
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5 Jul 17	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20 Jul 17	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Glycerin	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6 Aug 21	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16 Jul 17	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"

Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jun 5, Jun 19 Jul 17	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.
- Research priorities discussion (ALL)
- 2020 sunset review: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB)
- 2020 sunset review: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote
- 2020 sunset review: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Outdoor Access for Swine (HB).** Deferred to later call
- **Research priorities (RPs) discussion (ALL).** No update. The Chair would like to finalize the RPs on the July 17 call so they can get it to the Materials Subcommittee as soon as they can. The Chair also asked that members circulate any ideas to be considered prior to the next call.
- **2020 sunset review: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB).** The lead summarized public comment and the group discussed the draft proposal. The vote was deferred to a later call.
- **2020 sunset review: lime, hydrated (ARB).** Deferred to next call
- **2020 sunset review: mineral oil (ARB).** Deferred to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

June 5, 2018

Determine need for TRs for 2021 sunset substances

Discuss new work agenda item requests

Assign dates to discuss/vote on 2020 sunset reviews
 Research priorities discussion

June 19, 2018

July 3, 2018 - cancelled

July 17, 2018

2020 sunset review: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Aspirin (AS) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs) (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

Research priorities discussion (ALL)

Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.

August 7, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

2020 sunset review: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss proposal and vote

August 21, 2018

2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB) - discuss proposal and vote

September 4, 2018

September 18, 2018

October 2, 2018

October 16, 2018

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

December 18, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 18, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	Aug	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		"
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline		"
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		"
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR	N	None. 2013 Aquaculture		"
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting
Tuesday, June 5, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS); Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR requested 12 5 17. TR due mid-July	Dec 5	Petition discussion doc Fall 2018
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5 Jul 17	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20 Jul 17	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19 Aug 7	"
Glycerin	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6 Aug 21	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16 Jul 17	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19	"

Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6 Jun 19	“
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6 Jul 17	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	Jun 5, Jun 19	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Determine need for TRs for 2021 sunset substances
- Discuss new work agenda item requests
 - Outdoor Access for Swine-Harriet
 - Use of Antibiotics in Day Old Poultry-Ashley
-
- Assign dates to discuss/vote on 2020 sunset reviews
Research priorities discussion
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Determine need for TRs for 2021 sunset substances.** See table below.
 - **Methionine.** A member asked about the status of this NOSB recommendation from 2015. Where is this in rulemaking and does it reset the sunset date?
ABS note: the USDA published a final rule renewing the substance (AMS-NOP-14-05) <https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2017-03-21/pdf/2017-05480.pdf>
 - **Trace minerals.** The LS noted that there is a TR for 14 specific aquatic minerals, which they could use for the review of trace minerals, so they will not request an additional one.
 - **Vitamins.** A member suggested that a TR for amino acids might be useful. The group discussed this further and feels that the vitamins and amino acid issues are separate and would not be part of this review.
- **Discuss new work agenda item requests**
 - Outdoor access for swine (HB). HB will draft a document and circulate to the LS for review on the next call.
 - **Use of Antibiotics in day old poultry (AS).** Public comment from the last few years has indicated a need for the NOSB to work on this topic. Currently antibiotics are administered in-ovo and on day one, and the restriction begins on day 2 of life. The LS

would like to request the addition of this project to the work agenda during the June 8 Exec team call. A member suggested the addition of a sentence discussing the need for a systems approach as opposed to focusing on inputs. The will of the Subcommittee and the NOSB, as well as the community, is that this is an important topic that needs to be addressed.

- **Assign dates to discuss/vote on 2020 sunset reviews.** See table above.
- **Research priorities discussion (AS/HB).** Members made suggestions for potential additions to the Research Priorities list. ARB and HB will discuss an additional research priority and bring ideas to the next call.
- **Other items.** The July 3 call was canceled.
- **Oxalic Acid TR status.** TR is due in mid-July
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

May 15, 2018 - Cancelled

June 5, 2018

Determine need for TRs for 2021 sunset substances
Discuss new work agenda item requests
Assign dates to discuss/vote on 2020 sunset reviews
Research priorities discussion

June 19, 2018

Outdoor Access for Swine (HB). Review draft request.
Research priorities discussion (ALL)
2020 sunset review: Lime, hydrated (ARB)
2020 sunset review: Mineral oil (ARB)

July 3, 2018 - cancelled

July 17, 2018

2020 sunset review: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JB)
2020 sunset review: Aspirin (AS)
2020 sunset review: Phosphoric acid (DS)
2020 sunset review: Sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs) (SB)

August 7, 2018

2020 sunset review: Biologics, Vaccines (HB)
2020 sunset review: Electrolytes (HB)

August 21, 2018

2020 sunset review: Glycerin (SB)

September 4, 2018

September 18, 2018

October 2, 2018

October 16, 2018

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

December 18, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 18, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	Aug	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB	N	None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		“
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB	N	2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS	Y	2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline		“
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		“
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR	N	None. 2013 Aquaculture		“
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		“

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting
Tuesday, April 3, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DM)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	AS	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR sent to LS 11 07 17. Response/request for TR due 01 08 18. TR found sufficient 12 19 17.	Jul 19, 2016, Dec 19, Feb 20	Spr 2018
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR Requested 12 5 17	Dec 5	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19	"
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6	"

Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16	“
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	“
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	“
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017. Proposal for Spring 2018	Dec 5, Dec 19, Jan 16, Feb 20	Spr 2018
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	NA	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Review public comments
- Assign leads to 2021 sunsets
- Research priorities
- Other items - new work agenda requests
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Review public comments.** The LS Chair summarized the public comments that have been submitted to the LS.
- **Assign leads to 2021 sunsets.** See table below. Next steps: determine need for TRs
- **Research priorities.** HB and AS will be co-leads for the research priorities.
- **Other items.** New work agenda requests
 - Poultry task force to look at methionine. This has been on the work agenda since 2015, and was pending the completion of the final rule on OLPP, which the USDA recently withdrew. Since the rule was withdrawn, the LS would like to pursue the addition of this project and will discuss it on the June Executive call.
 - Antibiotics in day-old chicks. The Chair would like to request that this be added to the LS work agenda. The LS Chair will write a justification for further discussion.

- Outdoor access for swine. A member noted that there were other issues that were not addressed in OLPP such as outdoor access for swine. HB will write a request and circulate it to the rest of the LS for discussion.
- Enforcement of grazing rule. HB noted that this may be addressed in the inspector qualifications proposal.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

February 20, 2018

Glycolic Acid (AS) - Discuss draft proposal

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB) - Discuss next steps

Aspirin (AS) - TR sufficiency (due Feb 19)

March 6, 2018 - cancelled

March 20, 2018

April 3, 2018

April 17, 2018 - Call cancelled. NOSB comment webinar

May 1, 2018 - Cancelled

May 15, 2018 - Cancelled

June 5, 2018

Determine need for TRs for 2021 sunset substances

Discuss new work agenda item requests

Assign dates to discuss 2020 sunset reviews

Research priorities discussion

June 19, 2018

Research priorities discussion (ALL)

July 3, 2018

July 17, 2018

August 7, 2018

August 21, 2018

September 4, 2018

September 18, 2018

October 2, 2018

October 16, 2018

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

December 18, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018

NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)	DS		2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)	HB		2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)	JB		None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2	AS		2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		"
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)	AS		2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)	HB		2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)	JB		2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Xylazine	205.603(a)	DS		2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline		"
Methionine	205.603(d)	HB		2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		"
Trace minerals	205.603(d)	ABR		None 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Vitamins	205.603(d)	SB		2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 20, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Tom Chapman (TC) - observer

Absent: Dan Seitz (DS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DM)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	AS	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR sent to LS 11 07 17. Response/request for TR due 01 08 18. TR found sufficient 12 19 17.	Jul 19, 2016, Dec 19, Feb 20	Spr 2018
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR Requested 12 5 17	Dec 5	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18. TR found sufficient 02 20 18	Dec 19, Feb 20	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19	"

Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6	“
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16	“
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	“
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	“
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6	“

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Clarifying emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	Dec 5, Dec 19, Jan 16, Feb 20	Spr 2018
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017	NA	Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Approve notes from February 6, 2018
- Glycolic Acid (AS) - Discuss draft proposal
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB) - Discuss next steps
- Aspirin (AS) - TR sufficiency (due Feb 19)
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** February 6, 2018 were approved by the Subcommittee.
- **Work agenda.** The NOSB Chair relayed updates from the NOP regarding the NOSB work agenda. The proposal on “emergency use of parasiticides” will go forth for the Spring NOSB meeting.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The LS voted on the current iteration of the draft proposal, and will submit it to NOP for posting for the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting.

Motion to accept defining emergency treatment for parasiticides as amended on the call
 Motion by: HB

Seconded by: JB
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Glycolic Acid (AS).** The LS voted on the current iteration of the draft proposal, and will submit it to NOP for posting for the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting. The LS is seeking public comment.

Motion to classify glycolic acid as synthetic
Motion by: AS
Seconded by: HB
Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add glycolic acid as petitioned at 205.601
Motion by: AS
Seconded by: JB
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 3 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Aspirin (AS).** The lead found the TR sufficient, and will revise the sunset review accordingly before submitting it to the NOP for posting.
- **Other items.** The LS cancelled March 6 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

February 6, 2018

2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB). Deferred to next call.
2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB). Deferred to next call.
2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB). Deferred to next call.
2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB). Deferred to next call.
2020 sunset: Biologics, vaccines (HB)
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

February 20, 2018

Glycolic Acid (AS) - Discuss draft proposal
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB) - Discuss next steps
Aspirin (AS) - TR sufficiency (due Feb 19)

March 6, 2018 - cancelled

March 20, 2018

April 3, 2018

April 17, 2018

May 1, 2018

May 15, 2018

June 5, 2018

June 19, 2018

July 3, 2018

July 17, 2018

August 7, 2018
 August 21, 2018
 September 4, 2018
 September 18, 2018
 October 2, 2018
 October 16, 2018
 November 6, 2018
 November 20, 2018
 December 4, 2018
 December 18, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

2021 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR request ?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)			2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation		Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
(Parasiticide) Fenbendazole	205.603(a)			2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)			None. 2015 Crops TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Iodine	205.603(a)14, and 205.603(b)2			2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Ivermectin	205.603(a)			Nov 2016 NOSB Rec – Removal Included in proposed rule NOP 14-05 (83 FR 2498). 2015 TR		"
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)			2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
(Parasiticide) Moxidectin	205.603(a)			2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Peracetic acid	205.603(a)			2016 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Xylazine	205.603(a)			2002 TR Xylazine/Tolazoline 2017 NOSB Recommendation Xylazine/Tolazoline 2019 NOSB Recommendation - Tolazoline		"
Methionine	205.603(d)			2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation		"
Trace minerals	205.603(d)			None 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"
Vitamins	205.603(d)			2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation		"

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 6, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	AS	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR sent to LS 11 07 17. Response/request for TR due 01 08 18. TR found sufficient 12 19 17.	Jul 19, 2016, Dec 19, Feb 20	Spr 2018
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR Requested 12 5 17	Dec 5	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018						
Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18	Dec 19	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19	"

Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	"
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	Dec 5, Dec 19, Jan 16, Feb 20	TBD
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Approve notes from January 16, 2018
- 2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB)
- 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB)
- 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB)
- 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB)
- 2020 sunset: Biologics, vaccines (HB)
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** January 16 were approved with no changes
- **2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB)**. The LS will submit the review to the NOP for posting for the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting.

- **2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SOE) (SB).** The LS members modified some of the questions that will be included for public comment, and will submit the updated version to the NOP for posting for the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting.
- **2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB).** The LS will submit the review to the NOP for posting for the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting.
- **2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB).** The group will add some questions regarding the usage and application of mineral oil, and will submit the updated version to the NOP for posting for the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting.
- **2020 sunset: Biologics, vaccines (HB).** The lead will make some additional edits to the draft review based on the conversation, and will finalize the document for submission to NOP.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The LS will request on the upcoming Executive call that this document be brought forth to the Spring meeting as discussion document.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 2, 2018 - cancelled

January 16, 2018

2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB) – discuss
 2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

February 6, 2018

2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Biologics, vaccines (HB)
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

February 20, 2018

Glycolic Acid (AS) - Discuss draft proposal
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB) - Discuss next steps
 Aspirin (AS) - TR sufficiency (due Feb 19)

March 6, 2018

March 20, 2018

April 3, 2018

April 17, 2018

May 1, 2018

May 15, 2018

June 5, 2018

June 19, 2018

July 3, 2018

July 17, 2018

August 7, 2018
 August 21, 2018
 September 4, 2018
 September 18, 2018
 October 2, 2018
 October 16, 2018
 November 6, 2018
 November 20, 2018
 December 4, 2018
 December 18, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed	NA	Proposal TBD

				sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD

			Livestock 2006 Handling 2006			
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rww	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 16, 2018 3:00 pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar, (AS), Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Vice Chair; A-dae Romero-Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB); Dan Seitz (DS);

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB); Francis Thicke (FT)

Staff: Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Thymol Petition Addendum	205.603	HB		Petition sent to LS 02 01 17. Response/request for TR due 03 03 17. LS requested additional info from petitioner. Petition addendum sent to LS 05 26 17. Response due 07 25 17. LS sent additional questions to petitioner 08 15 17. Response sent to LS 10 06 17.	Mar 7, Apr 4, Aug 1, Oct 17	Spr 2018
Glycolic Acid, 2016	205.603	AS	Y	Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16. TR requested 07 19 16. TR sent to LS 11 07 17. Response/request for TR due 01 08 18. TR found sufficient 12 19 17.	Jul 19, 2016, Dec 19	Spr 2018
Oxalic Acid	205.603	HB	Y	Petition sent to LS 10 27 17. Response/request for TR due 12 26 17. Petition found suff 12 5 17. TR Requested 12 5 17	Dec 5	TBD
Aquaculture Substances (See table below)				On hold until aquaculture rule is published.	TBD	TBD

2020 Sunsets

TR Requests: July 2017, Summary: Spr 2018, Review: Fall 2018

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting

Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol	205.603	JB	N	1995 TAP ; 2014 TR Ethanol ; 2014 TR Isopropanol	Dec 5	Summary: Spr 2018 Review: Fall 2018
Aspirin	205.603	AS	Y	1995 TAP . TR requested 07 28 17. TR in contracting. TR sent to LS 12 20 17. Response due 02 19 18	Dec 19	"
Biologics, Vaccines	205.603	HB	N	2011 TR (Vaccines from Excluded Methods) ; 2014 TR (Aquaculture)	Dec 19	"
Electrolytes	205.603	HB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Dec 19	"
Glycerine	205.603	SB	N	2010 TAP (Livestock)	Feb 6	"
Phosphoric acid	205.603	DS	N	2003 TAP (Handling) . Low priority	Jan 16	"
Lime, hydrated	205.603	ARB	N	1995 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	"
Mineral oil	205.603	ARB	N	2002 TAP ; 2015 TR	Feb 6	"
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603	SB	N	2005 TR	Feb 6	"

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst ?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides	HB	N	Approved for addition to work agenda 07 15 16. Discussion doc. Postponed until Fall 2017	Dec 5, Dec 19, Jan 16, Feb 6, Feb 20	Proposal Spr 2018
Research Priorities (RP)	HB/AS/SB	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2017		Fall 2018
Organic poultry task force	ARB/AS/HB		Discuss formation of Task Force - on hold pending resolution of OLPP final rule.	NA	NA

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion/vote taken

Agenda

- Approve notes from December 19, 2017
- 2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss

- 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB) - discuss
- 2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss
- Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)
- Other items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** December 19 were approved with no changes
- **2020 sunset: Phosphoric acid (DS).** Phosphoric acid was recently reviewed and the Board voted unanimously to have it remain on the list. The lead will forward the current review to the Chair for submission to the NOP.
- **2020 sunset: Biologics, vaccines (HB).** The lead noted that vaccines are preventative and the NOSB supports continued listing. The group discussed adding a single listing for all GMO vaccines, rather than listing them individually. A member added that there are sometimes issues with implementation and certification, as some operations are referencing the National List and some are using the regulation. The LS would like to add this to the work agenda, acknowledging that currently they are not being encouraged to work on any projects outside of sunset or petitions. The group discussed framing the request in terms of enforcement, or perhaps submitting a petition. Members edited some of the questions in the draft review, and the lead will edit the draft document for further discussion on the next call.
- **Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB).** The lead posed some questions to the group regarding guidance. The Subcommittee expressed an interest in working on hierarchy and methods for use of parasiticides, before inputs are considered. The goal would be to put some tools in place, without necessarily mandating them. The LS Chair suggested a definition for “emergency” rather than a rule or guidance, as there was no public support for developing a hierarchy. Members are supportive of enhancing the definition. The NOP noted that there are already some requirements for use of parasiticides included, although they could be clarified or expanded upon.
- **2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB).** Deferred to next call.
- **2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB).** Deferred to next call.
- **2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB).** Deferred to next call.
- **2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Other items**
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 19, 2017

Glycolic Acid (AS) - TR suff due
 2020 sunset: Aspirin (AS) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Electrolytes (HB) - discuss
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

January 2, 2018 - cancelled

January 16, 2018

2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB) - discuss

2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Phosphoric acid (DS) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB) - discuss
 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB) – discuss
 2020 sunset: Biologics, Vaccines (HB) - discuss
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

February 6, 2018

2020 sunset: Glycerine (SB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Sucrose octanoate esters (SB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Lime, hydrated (ARB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Mineral oil (ARB). Deferred to next call.
 2020 sunset: Biologics, vaccines (HB).
 Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

February 20, 2018

Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides (HB)

March 6, 2018

March 20, 2018

April 3, 2018

April 17, 2018

May 1, 2018

May 15, 2018

June 5, 2018

June 19, 2018

July 3, 2018

July 17, 2018

August 7, 2018

August 21, 2018

September 4, 2018

September 18, 2018

October 2, 2018

October 16, 2018

November 6, 2018

November 20, 2018

December 4, 2018

December 18, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, Open public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Aquaculture petitions						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture- Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75- 0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture- Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	N Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found suff 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD