

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 5, 2016 3:00pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Tracy Favre, (TF); Francis Thicke (FT); Jean Richardson (JR); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Vote	Meeting
Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)	205.603	AS	2015	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15	Jan 19	Proposal Spr 2016
Sodium Bisulfate Petition Addendum	205.603	AS	2015	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15.	Jan 19	Proposal Spr 2016
Acid-Activated Bentonite	205.603	AS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15 Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: sodium bisulfate and aluminum sulfate . TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995	Jan 19	Proposal Spr 2016

Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	FT	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16	Jan 5, Jan 19	TBD
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	No Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussion /Vote	Meeting
Annotation Changes Procaine Lidocaine	JR		Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15. Proposal	Jan 5/vote scheduled Jan 19	Spr 2016

Annotation Changes Parasitocides	JR		Proposal	Jan 5, Jan 19	Spr 2016
Research Priorities (RP)	All	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2016	Feb 16	Fall 2016

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from December 1, 2015
- Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss TR sufficiency
- Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR)
- Discuss annotation changes for parasitocides proposals (JR)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** December 1, 2015 were approved with several corrections. The work agenda (table above) was edited as follows: iodine and trace minerals were removed.
- **Hypochlorous acid (FT).** The petition was targeted towards crop and handling use, and not specifically livestock, but NOP suggested that the LS also review hypochlorous acid, since it is proposed to be included under chlorine materials and has uses in all categories. The lead summarized the petition and found the TR sufficient. The proposal and checklist/analyses will be presented on the next call. TF will coordinate with the lead reviewers for HS and CS.
- **Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR).** The LS grouped these materials for discussion and review. The lead circulated a draft document and received feedback from other members. Members discussed the text of the document at length The LS will vote on these materials separately during the next call.
- **Annotation changes for parasitocides proposals (JR).** The draft document was circulated prior to the call and Subcommittee members provided feedback. The lead acknowledged the complexity of the topic and the group discussed at length the specifics of the proposed changes. The lead reviewer will make some modifications based on the discussion and recirculate the document for further review.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 15, 2015 - cancelled

January 5, 2016,

- Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR)
- Discuss annotation changes for parasitocides proposals (JR)
- Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss TR sufficiency
- Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
- Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available
- Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

January 19, 2016

Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR). Discuss draft proposal.
 Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
 Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available
 Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
 Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal/checklist
 Lidocaine/Procaine vote (ALL)
 Discussion of organic poultry working group

February 2, 2016

February 16, 2016

RP discussion

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 04, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 19, 2016 3:00pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Tracy Favre, (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Harriet Behar (HB) - sitting in; A-dae Briones (AB) - sitting in; Scott Rice (SR) - sitting in; Dan Seitz (DS) - sitting in

Absent: Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)	205.603	AS	2015	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15	Feb 2	Proposal Spr 2016
Sodium Bisulfate Petition Addendum	205.603	AS	2015	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15.	Feb 2	Proposal Spr 2016
Acid-Activated Bentonite	205.603	AS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15 Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: sodium bisulfate and aluminum sulfate . TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995	Feb 2	Proposal Spr 2016

Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	FT	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16	Jan 5, Feb 2	Spr 2016
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	No Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Annotation Changes Procaine Lidocaine	JR		Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15. Proposal	Jan 5, Jan 19	Spr 2016

Annotation Changes Parasiticides	JR		Proposal	Jan 5, Jan 19	Spr 2016
Research Priorities (RP)	All	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2016	Feb 16	Fall 2016

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from January 5, 2016
- Lidocaine and Procaine Proposal (JR). Vote on proposal
- Parasiticides (JR). Vote on Annotation changes
- Hypochlorous Acid (FT). Discuss proposal
- Discussion of organic poultry working group
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** January 5, 2016 were approved with no changes.
- **Lidocaine/Procaine (JR).** The lead summarized the draft proposal and noted that there was broad support from the public for the proposed annotation changes. Several members provided additional comments and feedback. The lead will add the suggestions and recirculate the final document as voted. The group proceeded to a vote, and offered to leave the vote open for one member who was absent for the first part of the conference call.
(Underlined text to be added, and strike-through language to be removed).

Motion to amend the Lidocaine listing as follows: (4) Lidocaine—as a local anesthetic. Use requires a withdrawal period of ~~90 days~~ 8 days after administering to livestock intended for slaughter and ~~7 days~~ 6 days after administering to dairy animals

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Vote will remain open until Friday. **ABS note:** CW voted via email Jan 19, and the vote above was adjusted accordingly.

Motion to amend the Procaine listing as follows: (7) Procaine —as a local anesthetic. Use requires a withdrawal period of ~~90 days~~ 8 days after administering to livestock intended for slaughter and ~~7 days~~ 6 days after administering to dairy animals.

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Vote will remain open until Friday. **ABS note:** CW voted via email Jan 19, and the vote above

was adjusted accordingly.

- **Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR).** Three parasiticides underwent sunset review in 2015. Each material received a considerable amount of public comment. Simultaneous with the sunset review, the LS considered a discussion document about amending the parasiticides listing, for which the NOSB also received many comments. The lead author will circulate the final document incorporating minor edits to the group that will incorporate some minor comments from the other members.

For all five (5) motions to amend the annotations, the underlined language will be added, and the struck-out language deleted.

1. Motion to amend §205.238(b)(2) as follows: Dairy ~~stock~~ animals- cows, when used a minimum of 90 days after use of Ivermectin, or 2 days after use of Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin, prior to the production of milk or milk products that are to be sold, labeled, or represented as organic.

AND

Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18) as follows: Milk or milk products from a treated ~~animal cow~~ cannot be labeled as provided for in subpart D of this part for 90 days following treatment with Ivermectin, or 2 days following treatment with Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin, prior to the production of milk or milk products that are to be sold, labeled, or represented as organic.

Motion: JR

Second: FT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

2. Motion to add §205.238(b)(3) as follows: Dairy animals-goats/sheep when used a minimum of 90 days after use of Ivermectin, or 36 days after use of Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin.

AND

Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18) as follows: "...Milk or milk products from a treated ~~animal goat/sheep~~ cannot be labeled as provided for in subpart D of this part for 90 days following treatment with Ivermectin, or 36 days following treatment with Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin.

Motion: JR

Second: FT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

3. Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18)(i) as follows: Fenbendazole (CAS #43210-67-9) - ~~only for use by or on the lawful written order of a licensed veterinarian~~

Motion: JR

Second: FT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

4. Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18)(iii) as follows: Moxidectin (CAS #113507-06-5)—~~for control of internal parasites only~~

Motion: JR

Second: TF

Further discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

5. Motion to amend §205.238(b)(4) to add (3) Fiber bearing animals, when used a minimum of 90 days prior to production of fleece or wool that is to be sold, labeled or represented as organic.

AND

Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18) to add- Allowed for fiber bearing animals when used a minimum of 90 days prior to production of fleece or wool that is to be sold, labeled or represented as organic.

Motion: JR

Second: TF

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Hypochlorous acid (FT).** Discussion deferred to next call. The lead author will review this material in light of the conversations on the HS and CS.
- **Organic poultry working group.** As previously discussed the NOSB is considering the idea of forming a working group or task force to look at methionine issues. The members discussed the differences between the options: A Task Force would involve the issuance of a Federal Register notice and a call for nominees, and would be comprised of external (non NOSB and non-government) members. A working group would involve current NOSB members, and would be simpler to form. The majority of members were supportive of having a task force, which would allow external stakeholders to participate. The group discussed the need to clarify the objectives for this task force before determining a way forward. Several members emphasized the need to

refer to the NOSB resolution about methionine that was put forth last year as part of a recommendation. Additionally, a member suggested that this resolution be put into a broader context, and not just focus on methionine. The LS will discuss the next steps during the February 2 call.

- **Other items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 5, 2016,

Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR)
Discuss annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR)
Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss TR sufficiency
Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available
Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

January 19, 2016

Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR). Discuss draft proposal.
Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available
Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal/checklist
Lidocaine/Procaine vote (ALL)
Discussion of organic poultry working group

February 2, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available
Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal and vote
Organic poultry working group. Determine lead/liaison

February 16, 2016

RP discussion

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016
 November 1, 2016
 November 15, 2016
 December 6, 2016
 December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 04, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 2, 2016 3:00pm ET**

Attending: Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Tracy Favre, (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB); Dan Seitz (DS); Carmela Beck (CBe) - sitting in; Harold Austin (HA) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Materials						
Substance	Nat'l List §	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)	205.603	AS	2015	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15	Feb 19	Proposal fall 2016
Sodium Bisulfate Petition Addendum	205.603	AS	2015	Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15.	Feb 19	Proposal fall 2016
Acid-Activated Bentonite	205.603	AS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15 Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: sodium bisulfate and aluminum sulfate . TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995	Feb 19	Proposal fall 2016

Hypochlorous Acid	205.601, 205.603 and 205.605	FT	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16	Jan 5, Feb 2, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Aquaculture-CO ₂ , (for aquatic plants)	205.609	TF/CBo	N	Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2011 Crops TR 2006 TR 1995 TAP	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)	205.609	FT	2010 TR (Nickel) 6/2013 Minerals TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6	205.609	JR	2/2011 Crops TR 7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.	NA	Proposal TBD

Aquaculture - Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants	205.609	CW	4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR	Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals	205.611	JR	2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)	Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)	205.611	FT	No Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)	205.611	TF/CBo	2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	Yes 2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.	NA	Proposal TBD
Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)	205.611	CW/FT	2013 TR	Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled.	NA	Proposal TBD

Other projects					
Project	Contact	TR Reqst?	Notes	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Annotation Changes Procaine Lidocaine	JR		Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15. Proposal	Jan 5, Jan 19	Spr 2016

Annotation Changes Parasitocides	JR		Proposal	Jan 5, Jan 19	Spr 2016
Research Priorities (RP)	All	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2016	Feb 16	Fall 2016

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from January 19, 2016
- Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal and vote
- Organic poultry working group. Determine lead/liaison
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** from the January 19, 2016 call were approved with no changes
- **Introductions. The members made brief introductions for the benefit of the new members.**
- **Hypochlorous acid (FT).** The lead summarized the substance for the group, as was done during the two other Subcommittee calls today (Handling and Crops). Hypochlorous acid is a product of hydrolysis of a sodium chloride solution (also called “electrolyzed water”) and is considered to be a better and safer sanitizer than chlorine. The lead provided an overview and asked for feedback from the group. Members discussed an annotation regarding on-site production and pH levels. There was support for the inclusion of an annotation regarding on-site manufacture, but members felt an annotation regarding pH was unnecessary. The LS voted to classify this material and deferred the vote to add it to the National List so they could discuss further.

Motion to classify hypochlorous acid as petitioned as synthetic

- Motion by: FT
Seconded by: JR
Additional discussion: A new member asked a procedural question about voting
Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0
- Paracitocides (JR). The document, which was voted on previously, was reworded slightly to assist in rulemaking, but no substantive changes were made. The lead author presented the modifications and the members agreed that the proposal was not changed. Therefore the previous motions and votes carry and the document will be posted for public comment and brought forth to the NOSB for a vote at the April 2016 meeting.
- **Organic poultry working group.** The LS Chair asked that members review some of the previous conversations and the 2015 NOSB Methionine recommendation so they can come prepared to discuss the possibility of a working group on poultry.
- **Other items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous LS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

January 19, 2016

Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR). Discuss draft proposal.

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal/checklist

Lidocaine/Procaine vote (ALL)

Discussion of organic poultry working group

February 2, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal and vote

Organic poultry working group. Determine lead/liaison

February 16, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities discussion

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016