

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, January 5, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Tracy Favre, (TF); Francis Thicke (FT); Jean Richardson (JR); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW)

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |  |                             |                   |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|--|-----------------------------|-------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes  | Scheduled for disc/<br>Vote | Meeting           |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15   | Jan 19                      | Proposal Spr 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15.  | Jan 19                      | Proposal Spr 2016 |
| Acid-Activated Bentonite   | 205.603      | AS      | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15<br><br>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter:<br><b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> .<br>TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995 | Jan 19                      | Proposal Spr 2016 |

|   |                     |        |   |  |               |              |
|---|---------------------|--------|---|--|---------------|--------------|
| <a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a>   | 205.605 and 205.601 | FT     | <a href="#">2015</a>                            | <a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a><br><br>Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16                                      | Jan 5, Jan 19 | TBD          |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants)  | 205.609             | TF/CBo | N   | Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.  | NA            | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)   | 205.609             | FT     | 2011 Crops TR<br>2006 TR<br>1995 TAP            | Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient. | NA            | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)   | 205.609             | FT     | 2010 TR (Nickel)<br>6/2013 Minerals TR          | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.                                     | NA            | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609             | JR     | 2/2011 Crops TR<br>7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.   | NA            | Proposal TBD |

|  |         |        |  |   |    |              |
|--|---------|--------|--|---|----|--------------|
| Aquaculture - Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR  | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)                                | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)           | 205.611 | FT     | No Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)        | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw   | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)           | 205.611 | CW/FT  | Yes 2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)     | 205.611 | CW/FT  | 2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal TBD |

| Other projects                              |         |           |   |                                |          |
|---|---------|-----------|---|--------------------------------|----------|
| Project                                     | Contact | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussion /Vote               | Meeting  |
| Annotation Changes<br>Procaine<br>Lidocaine | JR      |           | Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15.<br>Proposal | Jan 5/vote scheduled<br>Jan 19 | Spr 2016 |

|                                     |     |    |                        |                  |           |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|------------------------|------------------|-----------|
| Annotation Changes<br>Parasitocides | JR  |    | Proposal               | Jan 5, Jan<br>19 | Spr 2016  |
| Research Priorities<br>(RP)         | All | NA | RPs due to MS Aug 2016 | Feb 16           | Fall 2016 |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from December 1, 2015
- Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss TR sufficiency
- Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR)
- Discuss annotation changes for parasitocides proposals (JR)
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the** December 1, 2015 were approved with several corrections. The work agenda (table above) was edited as follows: iodine and trace minerals were removed.
- **Hypochlorous acid (FT).** The petition was targeted towards crop and handling use, and not specifically livestock, but NOP suggested that the LS also review hypochlorous acid, since it is proposed to be included under chlorine materials and has uses in all categories. The lead summarized the petition and found the TR sufficient. The proposal and checklist/analyses will be presented on the next call. TF will coordinate with the lead reviewers for HS and CS.
- **Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR).** The LS grouped these materials for discussion and review. The lead circulated a draft document and received feedback from other members. Members discussed the text of the document at length The LS will vote on these materials separately during the next call.
- **Annotation changes for parasitocides proposals (JR).** The draft document was circulated prior to the call and Subcommittee members provided feedback. The lead acknowledged the complexity of the topic and the group discussed at length the specifics of the proposed changes. The lead reviewer will make some modifications based on the discussion and recirculate the document for further review.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

December 15, 2015 - cancelled

January 5, 2016,

- Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR)
- Discuss annotation changes for parasitocides proposals (JR)
- Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss TR sufficiency
- Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
- Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available
- Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

January 19, 2016

Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR). Discuss draft proposal.  
 Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
 Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available  
 Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
 Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal/checklist  
 Lidocaine/Procaine vote (ALL)  
 Discussion of organic poultry working group

February 2, 2016

February 16, 2016

RP discussion

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

| Spring 2016 Milestones  | Target date       |
|---|-------------------|
| New NOSB member orientation                                       | Feb 04, 2016      |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda          | Feb 10, 2016      |
| NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP                           | Feb 26, 2016      |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | Mar 8, 2016       |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Mar 11, 2016      |
| Public comment webinars   | ??                |
| Public comment closes   | Apr 6, 2016       |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Apr 8, 2016       |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Apr 11, 2016      |
| Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC                         | Apr 25 - 27, 2016 |



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, January 19, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Tracy Favre, (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Calvin Walker, Vice Chair (CW); Harriet Behar (HB) - sitting in; A-dae Briones (AB) - sitting in; Scott Rice (SR) - sitting in; Dan Seitz (DS) - sitting in

**Absent:** Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |  |                  |                   |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|--|------------------|-------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes  | Discussed, Voted | Meeting           |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15   | Feb 2            | Proposal Spr 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15.  | Feb 2            | Proposal Spr 2016 |
| Acid-Activated Bentonite   | 205.603      | AS      | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15<br><br>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter:<br><b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> .<br>TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995 | Feb 2            | Proposal Spr 2016 |

|   |                     |        |   |  |              |              |
|---|---------------------|--------|---|--|--------------|--------------|
| <a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a>   | 205.605 and 205.601 | FT     | <a href="#">2015</a>                            | <a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a><br><br>Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16                                      | Jan 5, Feb 2 | Spr 2016     |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants)  | 205.609             | TF/CBo | N   | Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.  | NA           | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)   | 205.609             | FT     | 2011 Crops TR<br>2006 TR<br>1995 TAP            | Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient. | NA           | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)   | 205.609             | FT     | 2010 TR (Nickel)<br>6/2013 Minerals TR          | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.                                     | NA           | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609             | JR     | 2/2011 Crops TR<br>7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.   | NA           | Proposal TBD |

|  |         |        |  |   |    |              |
|--|---------|--------|--|---|----|--------------|
| Aquaculture - Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR  | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)                                | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)           | 205.611 | FT     | No Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)        | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw   | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)           | 205.611 | CW/FT  | Yes 2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)     | 205.611 | CW/FT  | 2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal TBD |

| Other projects                              |         |           |   |                  |          |
|---|---------|-----------|---|------------------|----------|
| Project                                     | Contact | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussed, Voted | Meeting  |
| Annotation Changes<br>Procaine<br>Lidocaine | JR      |           | Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15.<br>Proposal | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19 | Spr 2016 |

|                                     |     |    |                        |                  |           |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|------------------------|------------------|-----------|
| Annotation Changes<br>Parasiticides | JR  |    | Proposal               | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19 | Spr 2016  |
| Research Priorities<br>(RP)         | All | NA | RPs due to MS Aug 2016 | Feb 16           | Fall 2016 |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from January 5, 2016
- Lidocaine and Procaine Proposal (JR). Vote on proposal
- Parasiticides (JR). Vote on Annotation changes
- Hypochlorous Acid (FT). Discuss proposal
- Discussion of organic poultry working group
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the** January 5, 2016 were approved with no changes.
- **Lidocaine/Procaine (JR).** The lead summarized the draft proposal and noted that there was broad support from the public for the proposed annotation changes. Several members provided additional comments and feedback. The lead will add the suggestions and recirculate the final document as voted. The group proceeded to a vote, and offered to leave the vote open for one member who was absent for the first part of the conference call.  
(Underlined text to be added, and strike-through language to be removed).

**Motion to amend the Lidocaine listing as follows:** (4) Lidocaine—as a local anesthetic. Use requires a withdrawal period of ~~90 days~~ 8 days after administering to livestock intended for slaughter and ~~7 days~~ 6 days after administering to dairy animals

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Vote will remain open until Friday. **ABS note:** CW voted via email Jan 19, and the vote above was adjusted accordingly.

**Motion to amend the Procaine listing as follows:** (7) Procaine —as a local anesthetic. Use requires a withdrawal period of ~~90 days~~ 8 days after administering to livestock intended for slaughter and ~~7 days~~ 6 days after administering to dairy animals.

Motion by: JR

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Vote will remain open until Friday. **ABS note:** CW voted via email Jan 19, and the vote above

was adjusted accordingly.

- **Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR).** Three parasiticides underwent sunset review in 2015. Each material received a considerable amount of public comment. Simultaneous with the sunset review, the LS considered a discussion document about amending the parasiticides listing, for which the NOSB also received many comments. The lead author will circulate the final document incorporating minor edits to the group that will incorporate some minor comments from the other members.

For all five (5) motions to amend the annotations, the underlined language will be added, and the struck-out language deleted.

1. Motion to amend §205.238(b)(2) as follows: Dairy ~~stock animals-~~ cows, when used a minimum of 90 days after use of Ivermectin, or 2 days after use of Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin, prior to the production of milk or milk products that are to be sold, labeled, or represented as organic.

AND

Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18) as follows: Milk or milk products from a treated ~~animal cow~~ cannot be labeled as provided for in subpart D of this part for 90 days following treatment with Ivermectin, or 2 days following treatment with Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin, prior to the production of milk or milk products that are to be sold, labeled, or represented as organic.

Motion: JR

Second: FT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

2. Motion to add §205.238(b)(3) as follows: Dairy animals-goats/sheep when used a minimum of 90 days after use of Ivermectin, or 36 days after use of Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin.

AND

Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18) as follows: "...Milk or milk products from a treated ~~animal goat/sheep~~ cannot be labeled as provided for in subpart D of this part for 90 days following treatment with Ivermectin, or 36 days following treatment with Fenbenzadole or Moxidectin.

Motion: JR

Second: FT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

3. Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18)(i) as follows: Fenbendazole (CAS #43210-67-9) - ~~only for use by or on the lawful written order of a licensed veterinarian~~

Motion: JR

Second: FT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

4. Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18)(iii) as follows: Moxidectin (CAS #113507-06-5)—~~for control of internal parasites only~~

Motion: JR

Second: TF

Further discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

5. Motion to amend §205.238(b)(4) to add (3) Fiber bearing animals, when used a minimum of 90 days prior to production of fleece or wool that is to be sold, labeled or represented as organic.

AND

Motion to amend §205.603(a)(18) to add- Allowed for fiber bearing animals when used a minimum of 90 days prior to production of fleece or wool that is to be sold, labeled or represented as organic.

Motion: JR

Second: TF

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Hypochlorous acid (FT).** Discussion deferred to next call. The lead author will review this material in light of the conversations on the HS and CS.
- **Organic poultry working group.** As previously discussed the NOSB is considering the idea of forming a working group or task force to look at methionine issues. The members discussed the differences between the options: A Task Force would involve the issuance of a Federal Register notice and a call for nominees, and would be comprised of external (non NOSB and non-government) members. A working group would involve current NOSB members, and would be simpler to form. The majority of members were supportive of having a task force, which would allow external stakeholders to participate. The group discussed the need to clarify the objectives for this task force before determining a way forward. Several members emphasized the need to

refer to the NOSB resolution about methionine that was put forth last year as part of a recommendation. Additionally, a member suggested that this resolution be put into a broader context, and not just focus on methionine. The LS will discuss the next steps during the February 2 call.

- **Other items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

January 5, 2016,

Lidocaine/Procaine review draft proposals (JR)  
Discuss annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR)  
Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss TR sufficiency  
Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available  
Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

January 19, 2016

Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR). Discuss draft proposal.  
Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available  
Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal/checklist  
Lidocaine/Procaine vote (ALL)  
Discussion of organic poultry working group

February 2, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available  
Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal and vote  
Organic poultry working group. Determine lead/liaison

February 16, 2016

RP discussion

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016  
 November 1, 2016  
 November 15, 2016  
 December 6, 2016  
 December 20, 2016

| Spring 2016 Milestones  | Target date       |
|---|-------------------|
| New NOSB member orientation                                       | Feb 04, 2016      |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda          | Feb 10, 2016      |
| NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP                           | Feb 26, 2016      |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | Mar 8, 2016       |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Mar 11, 2016      |
| Public comment webinars   | ??                |
| Public comment closes   | Apr 6, 2016       |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Apr 8, 2016       |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Apr 11, 2016      |
| Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC                         | Apr 25 - 27, 2016 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, February 2, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Tracy Favre, (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB); Dan Seitz (DS); Carmela Beck (CBe) - sitting in; Harold Austin (HA) - sitting in

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |  |                  |                    |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|--|------------------|--------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes  | Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15   | Feb 19           | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15.  | Feb 19           | Proposal fall 2016 |
| Acid-Activated Bentonite   | 205.603      | AS      | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15<br><br>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter:<br><b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b> .<br>TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995 | Feb 19           | Proposal fall 2016 |

|   |                              |        |   |  |                      |              |
|---|------------------------------|--------|---|--|----------------------|--------------|
| <a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a>   | 205.601, 205.603 and 205.605 | FT     | <a href="#">2015</a>                            | <a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a><br><br>Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16                                      | Jan 5, Feb 2, Feb 16 | Spr 2016     |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants)  | 205.609                      | TF/CBo | N   | Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.  | NA                   | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)   | 205.609                      | FT     | 2011 Crops TR<br>2006 TR<br>1995 TAP            | Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient. | NA                   | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)   | 205.609                      | FT     | 2010 TR (Nickel)<br>6/2013 Minerals TR          | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.                                     | NA                   | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) (for aquatic plants) CAS #s 9009-75-0, 8062-15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609                      | JR     | 2/2011 Crops TR<br>7/2013 TR Aquatic Animals TR | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.   | NA                   | Proposal TBD |

|  |         |        |  |   |    |              |
|--|---------|--------|--|---|----|--------------|
| Aquaculture - Vitamins (B1, B12, H) for aquatic plants | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013 Aquatic Animals TR  | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Biologics: Vaccines for Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR (Vaccines made from GMOs)                                | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12. Petition found sufficient and TR requested on 05 21 13. (NOP note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Chlorine (for aquatic animals)           | 205.611 | FT     | No Crops 2011 Crops 2006 Crops 1995 Livestock 2006 Handling 2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 07 03 12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture – Tocopherols (for aquatic animals)        | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR 1995 TAP rvw   | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)           | 205.611 | CW/FT  | Yes 2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals)     | 205.611 | CW/FT  | 2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal TBD |

| Other projects                              |         |           |   |                  |          |
|---|---------|-----------|---|------------------|----------|
| Project                                     | Contact | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussed, Voted | Meeting  |
| Annotation Changes<br>Procaine<br>Lidocaine | JR      |           | Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15.<br>Proposal | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19 | Spr 2016 |

|                                     |     |    |                        |                  |           |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|------------------------|------------------|-----------|
| Annotation Changes<br>Parasitocides | JR  |    | Proposal               | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19 | Spr 2016  |
| Research Priorities<br>(RP)         | All | NA | RPs due to MS Aug 2016 | Feb 16           | Fall 2016 |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from January 19, 2016
- Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal and vote
- Organic poultry working group. Determine lead/liaison
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes** from the January 19, 2016 call were approved with no changes
- **Introductions. The members made brief introductions for the benefit of the new members.**
- **Hypochlorous acid (FT).** The lead summarized the substance for the group, as was done during the two other Subcommittee calls today (Handling and Crops). Hypochlorous acid is a product of hydrolysis of a sodium chloride solution (also called “electrolyzed water”) and is considered to be a better and safer sanitizer than chlorine. The lead provided an overview and asked for feedback from the group. Members discussed an annotation regarding on-site production and pH levels. There was support for the inclusion of an annotation regarding on-site manufacture, but members felt an annotation regarding pH was unnecessary. The LS voted to classify this material and deferred the vote to add it to the National List so they could discuss further.

Motion to classify hypochlorous acid as petitioned as synthetic

- Motion by: FT  
Seconded by: JR  
Additional discussion: A new member asked a procedural question about voting  
Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0
- Paracitocides (JR). The document, which was voted on previously, was reworded slightly to assist in rulemaking, but no substantive changes were made. The lead author presented the modifications and the members agreed that the proposal was not changed. Therefore the previous motions and votes carry and the document will be posted for public comment and brought forth to the NOSB for a vote at the April 2016 meeting.
- **Organic poultry working group.** The LS Chair asked that members review some of the previous conversations and the 2015 NOSB Methionine recommendation so they can come prepared to discuss the possibility of a working group on poultry.
- **Other items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

## Previous LS Notes

### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

January 19, 2016

Annotation changes for parasiticides proposals (JR). Discuss draft proposal.

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal/checklist

Lidocaine/Procaine vote (ALL)

Discussion of organic poultry working group

February 2, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal and vote

Organic poultry working group. Determine lead/liaison

February 16, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities discussion

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

| Spring 2016 Milestones  | Target date       |
|---|-------------------|
| New NOSB member orientation                                       | Feb 29, 2016      |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda          | Feb 10, 2016      |
| NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP                           | Feb 26, 2016      |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | Mar 8, 2016       |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Mar 11, 2016      |
| Public comment webinars   | ??                |
| Public comment closes   | Apr 6, 2016       |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Apr 8, 2016       |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Apr 11, 2016      |
| Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC                         | Apr 25 - 27, 2016 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, February 16, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Tracy Favre, (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB); Dan Seitz (DS)

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |  |                  |                    |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|--|------------------|--------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes  | Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15. <b>Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite</b> | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15. <b>Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite</b>   | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |

|  |                              |        |                                      |   |                      |                    |
|--|------------------------------|--------|--------------------------------------|---|----------------------|--------------------|
| Acid-Activated Bentonite                           | 205.603                      | AS     | Y Lmtd Scope                         | <p>Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. <b>TR in development 11 17 15</b></p> <p>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b>.<br/>TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</p> | TBD                  | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a>                  | 205.601, 205.603 and 205.605 | FT     | <a href="#">2015</a>                 | <p><a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a></p> <p>Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16</p>  | Jan 5, Feb 2, Feb 16 | Spr 2016           |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants) | 205.609                      | TF/CBo | N                                    | <p>Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>  | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)          | 205.609                      | FT     | 2011 Crops TR<br>2006 TR<br>1995 TAP | <p>Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.</p>   | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |

|   |         |        |   |   |    |                 |
|---|---------|--------|---|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture-<br>Micronutrients<br>(for aquatic<br>plants)   | 205.609 | FT     | 2010 TR<br>(Nickel)<br><br>6/2013<br>Minerals TR                                      | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12.<br>Petition sufficiency response due<br>08 08 12? CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info.<br>Questions clarified by petitioner.<br>Petition found sufficient 06 18 13<br>and 07 02 13. TR deemed<br>unnecessary. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Lignin sulfonate<br>(chelating agent<br>for aquatic<br>plants)<br>(for aquatic<br>plants) CAS #s<br>9009-75-0, 8062-<br>15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609 | JR     | 2/2011<br>Crops TR<br><br>7/2013 TR<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR                          | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency Response due<br>09 04 12. CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info<br>and TR. Questions clarified by<br>petitioner. Petition found<br>sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.                      | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Vitamins (B1,<br>B12, H) for<br>aquatic plants  | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR   | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency response due<br>10 10 12. Petition found<br>sufficient 06 18 13.  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Biologics:<br>Vaccines for<br>Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR<br>(Vaccines<br>made from<br>GMOs)  | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12.<br>Petition found sufficient and TR<br>requested on 05 21 13. (NOP<br>note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR<br>deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Chlorine<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | FT     | No<br>Crops 2011<br>Crops 2006<br>Crops 1995<br>Livestock<br>2006<br>Handling<br>2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 07 03<br>12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Tocopherols<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)  | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR<br>1995 TAP<br>rvw  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft<br>TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR<br>found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

|  |         |       |                |   |    |                 |
|--|---------|-------|----------------|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)       | 205.611 | CW/FT | Yes<br>2013 TR | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals) | 205.611 | CW/FT | 2013 TR        | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

| Other projects                              |                 |           |   |                     |           |
|---|-----------------|-----------|---|---------------------|-----------|
| Project                                     | Contact         | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussed,<br>Voted | Meeting   |
| Annotation Changes<br>Procaine<br>Lidocaine | JR              |           | Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15.<br>Proposal | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Annotation Changes<br>Parasitocides         | JR              |           | Proposal                                      | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Research Priorities<br>(RP)                 | All             | NA        | RPs due to MS Aug 2016                        | Feb 16,<br>Apr 5    | Fall 2016 |
| Organic Poultry task<br>force               | TF/AB/AS/<br>HB |           | Discuss formation of Task Force               | NA                  | NA        |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from February 2, 2016
- Hypochlorous Acid vote (FT)
- Organic Poultry Working Group Discussion
- Research Priorities Discussion
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes** from the February 2, 2016 were approved with no changes
- **Research Priorities Discussion.** The co-leads have circulated some background information and ideas and will discuss this further before bringing this to the April 5 Subcommittee call.
- **Hypochlorous Acid vote (FT).** The lead discussed hypochlorous acid briefly, since the LS has discussed this previously. In order to align the proposal with the other two Subcommittees who

are also reviewing this (Crops and Handling) the LS will not include an annotation. Additionally, the LS talked about including this as a subheading under chlorine materials. The LS previously voted on the classification of hypochlorous acid and moved to the vote on the motion to add.

Motion to add **Hypochlorous Acid** as petitioned at §205.603(a)(7) chlorine materials...(iv)

Hypochlorous acid

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: JB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Organic Poultry Working Group Discussion.** The group discussed the background information that was circulated to the members after the last LS call. There is strong support within the Subcommittee for the formation of a task force to provide the NOSB with guidance on the use of various materials in poultry production systems. A member noted that the animal welfare standards will help inform this topic, but feels there is a need to look at organic poultry systems holistically and with a long term vision. Members discussed various paths forward and the potential deliverables from such a task force. The lead will recirculate the justification document that was previously submitted to the NOP so the new members can participate in the decision for this project. Several members volunteered to discuss this offline to determine how to move forward, and will brief the group on the next call.
- **Other items.**
  - The LS Chair informed the members that she was contacted last week by stakeholders regarding kelp.
  - The Chair reminded the members that the public comment will open ~March 8
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

February 2, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Hypochlorous acid (FT) - discuss proposal and vote

Organic poultry working group. Determine lead/liaison

February 16, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available

Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities discussion

March 1, 2016 - cancelled

March 15, 2016

Organic Poultry Working Group Discussion

April 5, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016  
 May 17, 2016  
 June 7, 2016  
 June 21, 2016  
 July 5, 2016  
 July 19, 2016  
 August 2, 2016  
 August 16, 2016  
 September 6, 2016  
 September 20, 2016  
 October 4, 2016  
 October 18, 2016  
 November 1, 2016  
 November 15, 2016  
 December 6, 2016  
 December 20, 2016

| Spring 2016 Milestones  | Target date       |
|---|-------------------|
| New NOSB member orientation                                       | Feb 29, 2016      |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda          | Feb 10, 2016      |
| NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP                           | Feb 26, 2016      |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | Mar 8, 2016       |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Mar 11, 2016      |
| Public comment closes   | Apr 6, 2016       |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Apr 8, 2016       |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Apr 11, 2016      |
| Public comment webinar  | Apr 18, 2016      |
| Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC                         | Apr 25 - 27, 2016 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, March 15, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB); Tracy Favre, (TF); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Briones (AB); Francis Thicke (FT); Carmela Beck (CBe) - sitting in

**Absent:** Jean Richardson (JR)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |  |                  |                    |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|--|------------------|--------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes  | Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15. <b>Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite</b> TR rcvd 03 03 16. | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15. <b>Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite.</b> TR rcvd 03 03 16.  | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |

|  |                              |        |                                      |   |                      |                    |
|--|------------------------------|--------|--------------------------------------|---|----------------------|--------------------|
| Acid-Activated Bentonite                           | 205.603                      | AS     | 2016 Lmtd Scope                      | <p>Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15. TR sent to LS 03 03 16. Suff due 05 03 16. TR found suff 03 15 16</p> <p>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter:<br/> <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b>.<br/> TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</p> | TBD                  | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a>                  | 205.601, 205.603 and 205.605 | FT     | <a href="#">2015</a>                 | <p><a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a></p> <p>Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16</p>  | Jan 5, Feb 2, Feb 16 | Spr 2016           |
| Sulfur   | 205.603                      | AB     |                                      | <p>Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. <b>Response/request for TR due 05 09 16.</b></p>   | May 17               | TBD                |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants) | 205.609                      | TF/CBo | N                                    | <p>Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>  | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)          | 205.609                      | FT     | 2011 Crops TR<br>2006 TR<br>1995 TAP | <p>Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.</p>   | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |

|   |         |        |   |   |    |                 |
|---|---------|--------|---|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture-<br>Micronutrients<br>(for aquatic<br>plants)   | 205.609 | FT     | 2010 TR<br>(Nickel)<br><br>6/2013<br>Minerals TR                                      | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12.<br>Petition sufficiency response due<br>08 08 12? CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info.<br>Questions clarified by petitioner.<br>Petition found sufficient 06 18 13<br>and 07 02 13. TR deemed<br>unnecessary. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Lignin sulfonate<br>(chelating agent<br>for aquatic<br>plants)<br>(for aquatic<br>plants) CAS #s<br>9009-75-0, 8062-<br>15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609 | JR     | 2/2011<br>Crops TR<br><br>7/2013 TR<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR                          | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency Response due<br>09 04 12. CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info<br>and TR. Questions clarified by<br>petitioner. Petition found<br>sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.                      | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Vitamins (B1,<br>B12, H) for<br>aquatic plants  | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR   | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency response due<br>10 10 12. Petition found<br>sufficient 06 18 13.  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Biologics:<br>Vaccines for<br>Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR<br>(Vaccines<br>made from<br>GMOs)  | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12.<br>Petition found sufficient and TR<br>requested on 05 21 13. (NOP<br>note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR<br>deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Chlorine<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | FT     | No<br>Crops 2011<br>Crops 2006<br>Crops 1995<br>Livestock<br>2006<br>Handling<br>2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 07 03<br>12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Tocopherols<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)  | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR<br>1995 TAP<br>rvw  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft<br>TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR<br>found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

|  |         |       |                |   |    |                 |
|--|---------|-------|----------------|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)       | 205.611 | CW/FT | Yes<br>2013 TR | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals) | 205.611 | CW/FT | 2013 TR        | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

| Other projects                              |                 |           |  |                     |           |
|---|-----------------|-----------|--|---------------------|-----------|
| Project                                     | Contact         | TR Reqst? | Notes  | Discussed,<br>Voted | Meeting   |
| Annotation Changes<br>Procaine<br>Lidocaine | JR              |           | Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15.<br>Proposal  | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Annotation Changes<br>Parasitocides         | JR              |           | Proposal   | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Peracetic acid<br>205.601(a)<br>205.601(i)  | TF              | Y         | Sunset date: 05 09 18. TR sent to LS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by LS. |                     | TBD       |
| Research Priorities<br>(RP)                 | All             | NA        | RPs due to MS Aug 2016   | Feb 16,<br>Apr 5    | Fall 2016 |
| Organic Poultry task<br>force               | TF/AB/AS/<br>HB |           | Discuss formation of Task Force  | NA                  | NA        |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from February 16, 2016
- Organic poultry working group discussion/update
- Sulfur - assign lead to new petition
- Acid activated bentonite (AS). Discuss TR
- Peracetic acid (HA). Update
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the February 16, 2016** were approved with no changes
- **Organic poultry working group.** The three co-reviewers discussed the idea of a poultry working group and developed three main goals: 1) To provide NOP with tools for improvement of the organic poultry industry, 2) develop research priorities, and 3) review international practices and alternatives to methionine (MET). The 2015 NOSB recommendation included a resolution to phase out synthetic MET and the goal for the working group would be to support the LS in this endeavor.
- **Sulfur - assign lead to new petition.** The NOSB received a petition for sulfur, which is used as external pest control in livestock. A-dae Briones volunteered to be the lead reviewer for this substance. The group will discuss petition sufficiency on the May 17 call.
- **Acid activated bentonite (AS).** The lead found the TR sufficient and asked for feedback from the members. A member asked about information contained in the technical reports (in general) and if it is independently verified, and if it is evident what information came from the petitioner. TRs do include sources and references.
- **Peracetic acid (HA).** The Crops Subcommittee found the peracetic acid TR sufficient. Three Subcommittees received TRs for peracetic acid: HS, CS and LS although only the Crops Subcommittee is currently reviewing this substance for its 2018 sunset. HS reviewed peracetic acid in 2016 and LS in 2017. Both the HS and LS will assign a lead reviewer for their respective TRs and the three will consult and coordinate with each other.
- **Public comments.** The Chair was asked to share her process for reviewing public comments for the benefit of the new members.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

February 16, 2016

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
 Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR if available  
 Sodium Bi-sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal  
 Research Priorities discussion

March 1, 2016 - cancelled

March 15, 2016

Organic Poultry Working Group Discussion  
 Sulfur - assign lead to new petition  
 Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR

April 5, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)  
 Peracetic Acid - TR sufficiency (TF)

April 18, 2016

Public comment review  
 Sulfur petition sufficiency

May 3, 2016 - cancelled

May 17, 2016

Sulfur petition sufficiency  
 Acid Activated Bentonite (AS)  
 Aluminum Sulfate  
 Sodium Bisulfate

June 7, 2016  
 June 21, 2016  
 July 5, 2016  
 July 19, 2016  
 August 2, 2016  
 August 16, 2016  
 September 6, 2016  
 September 20, 2016  
 October 4, 2016  
 October 18, 2016  
 November 1, 2016  
 November 15, 2016  
 December 6, 2016  
 December 20, 2016

| Spring 2016 Milestones  | Target date       |
|---|-------------------|
| New NOSB member orientation                                       | Feb 29, 2016      |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda          | Feb 10, 2016      |
| NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP                           | Feb 26, 2016      |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | Mar 16, 2016      |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Mar 11, 2016      |
| Public comment closes   | Apr 14, 2016      |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Apr 8, 2016       |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Apr 11, 2016      |
| Public comment webinar  | Apr 18, 2016      |
| Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC                         | Apr 25 - 27, 2016 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, April 5, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tracy Favre, (TF); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Briones (AB); Jean Richardson (JR)

**Absent:** Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |  |                  |                    |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|--|------------------|--------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes  | Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15. <b>Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite</b> TR rcvd 03 03 16. | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15. <b>Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite.</b> TR rcvd 03 03 16.  | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |

|  |                              |        |                                      |   |                      |                    |
|--|------------------------------|--------|--------------------------------------|---|----------------------|--------------------|
| Acid-Activated Bentonite                           | 205.603                      | AS     | 2016 Lmtd Scope                      | <p>Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15. TR sent to LS 03 03 16. Suff due 05 03 16. TR found suff 03 15 16</p> <p>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter:<br/> <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b>.<br/> TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</p> | TBD                  | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a>                  | 205.601, 205.603 and 205.605 | FT     | <a href="#">2015</a>                 | <p><a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a></p> <p>Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16</p>  | Jan 5, Feb 2, Feb 16 | Spr 2016           |
| Sulfur   | 205.603                      | AB     |                                      | <p>Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. <b>Response/request for TR due 05 09 16.</b></p>   | May 17               | TBD                |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants) | 205.609                      | TF/CBo | N                                    | <p>Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>  | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)          | 205.609                      | FT     | 2011 Crops TR<br>2006 TR<br>1995 TAP | <p>Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.</p>   | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |

|   |         |        |   |   |    |                 |
|---|---------|--------|---|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture-<br>Micronutrients<br>(for aquatic<br>plants)   | 205.609 | FT     | 2010 TR<br>(Nickel)<br><br>6/2013<br>Minerals TR                                      | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12.<br>Petition sufficiency response due<br>08 08 12? CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info.<br>Questions clarified by petitioner.<br>Petition found sufficient 06 18 13<br>and 07 02 13. TR deemed<br>unnecessary. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Lignin sulfonate<br>(chelating agent<br>for aquatic<br>plants)<br>(for aquatic<br>plants) CAS #s<br>9009-75-0, 8062-<br>15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609 | JR     | 2/2011<br>Crops TR<br><br>7/2013 TR<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR                          | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency Response due<br>09 04 12. CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info<br>and TR. Questions clarified by<br>petitioner. Petition found<br>sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.                      | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Vitamins (B1,<br>B12, H) for<br>aquatic plants  | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR   | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency response due<br>10 10 12. Petition found<br>sufficient 06 18 13.  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Biologics:<br>Vaccines for<br>Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR<br>(Vaccines<br>made from<br>GMOs)  | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12.<br>Petition found sufficient and TR<br>requested on 05 21 13. (NOP<br>note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR<br>deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Chlorine<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | FT     | No<br>Crops 2011<br>Crops 2006<br>Crops 1995<br>Livestock<br>2006<br>Handling<br>2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 07 03<br>12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Tocopherols<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)  | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR<br>1995 TAP<br>rvw  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft<br>TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR<br>found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

|  |         |       |                |   |    |                 |
|--|---------|-------|----------------|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)       | 205.611 | CW/FT | Yes<br>2013 TR | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals) | 205.611 | CW/FT | 2013 TR        | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

| Other projects                              |                 |           |   |                     |           |
|---|-----------------|-----------|---|---------------------|-----------|
| Project                                     | Contact         | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussed,<br>Voted | Meeting   |
| Annotation Changes<br>Procaine<br>Lidocaine | JR              |           | Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15.<br>Proposal   | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Annotation Changes<br>Parasitocides         | JR              |           | Proposal  | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Peracetic acid<br>205.601(a)<br>205.601(i)  | TF              | Y         | Sunset date: 05 09 18. TR sent to LS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by LS. TR found sufficient 04 05 16 | 04 05 16            | TBD       |
| Research Priorities<br>(RP)                 | All             | NA        | RPs due to MS Aug 2016  | Feb 16,<br>Apr 5    | Fall 2016 |
| Organic Poultry task<br>force               | TF/AB/AS/<br>HB |           | Discuss formation of Task Force   | NA                  | NA        |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from March 15, 2016
- Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)
- Peracetic Acid - TR sufficiency (TF)
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the March 15, 2016** were approved with no changes.

- The Chair was notified that the animal welfare proposed rule will be published in the Federal Register this week, and the NOP will be accepting public comment.
- **Research Priorities (TF, JR).** The NOSB chair participated on a call recently with the Organic Policy Advisor and members of the OWG to discuss research priorities and funding. Two key issues were the length and specificity of the list of Research Priorities and the lack of a vehicle for system based research needs. The OWG requested that the NOSB be more concise and focused when putting forth its research needs, as this will help when communicating funding needs to funding agencies and sources. Additionally, the OWG supports the idea of retaining previous recommendations on the list depending on whether or not they have been addressed or whether they are still necessary and relevant. Members discussed the specific Livestock priorities that were submitted previously, and the leads asked for suggestions for future topics for discussion on the May 17 call.
- **Peracetic Acid (TF).** TRs for peracetic acid were sent to Crops, Handling and Livestock, although only Crops has a pending Sunset review due. The lead summarized the information from the Livestock TR, and indicated that it was comprehensive and thorough. The TR was found sufficient and the LS Chair will notify the NOP.
- **Public comment.** The group briefly discussed comments and will discuss them further on April 18.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

March 15, 2016

Organic Poultry Working Group Discussion  
Sulfur - assign lead to new petition  
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss TR

April 5, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)  
Peracetic Acid - TR sufficiency (TF)

April 18, 2016

Public comment review  
Sulfur petition sufficiency (AB)

May 3, 2016 - cancelled

May 17, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)  
Sulfur petition sufficiency (AB)  
Acid Activated Bentonite (AS)  
Aluminum Sulfate (AS)  
Sodium Bisulfate (AS)

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016  
 October 18, 2016  
 November 1, 2016  
 November 15, 2016  
 December 6, 2016  
 December 20, 2016

| Spring 2016 Milestones  | Target date       |
|---|-------------------|
| New NOSB member orientation                                       | Feb 29, 2016      |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda          | Feb 10, 2016      |
| NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP                           | Feb 26, 2016      |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | Mar 16, 2016      |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Mar 11, 2016      |
| Public comment closes   | Apr 14, 2016      |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Apr 8, 2016       |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Apr 18, 2016      |
| Public comment webinar  | Apr 19, 2016      |
| Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC                         | Apr 25 - 27, 2016 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, April 18, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tracy Favre, (TF); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Briones (AB); Jean Richardson (JR); Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Jesse Buie (JB)

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |   |                  |                    |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|---|------------------|--------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes   | Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite TR rcvd 03 03 16. | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite. TR rcvd 03 03 16.  | TBD              | Proposal fall 2016 |

|  |                              |        |                                      |   |                      |                    |
|--|------------------------------|--------|--------------------------------------|---|----------------------|--------------------|
| Acid-Activated Bentonite                           | 205.603                      | AS     | 2016 Lmtd Scope                      | <p>Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15. TR sent to LS 03 03 16. Suff due 05 03 16. TR found suff 03 15 16</p> <p>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter:<br/> <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b>.<br/> TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</p> | TBD                  | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a>                  | 205.601, 205.603 and 205.605 | FT     | <a href="#">2015</a>                 | <p><a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a></p> <p>Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 01 05 16</p>  | Jan 5, Feb 2, Feb 16 | Spr 2016           |
| Sulfur   | 205.603                      | AB     |                                      | <p>Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16.</p>   | May 17               | TBD                |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants) | 205.609                      | TF/CBo | N                                    | <p>Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>  | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)          | 205.609                      | FT     | 2011 Crops TR<br>2006 TR<br>1995 TAP | <p>Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.</p>   | NA                   | Proposal TBD       |

|   |         |        |   |   |    |                 |
|---|---------|--------|---|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture-<br>Micronutrients<br>(for aquatic<br>plants)   | 205.609 | FT     | 2010 TR<br>(Nickel)<br><br>6/2013<br>Minerals TR                                      | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12.<br>Petition sufficiency response due<br>08 08 12? CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info.<br>Questions clarified by petitioner.<br>Petition found sufficient 06 18 13<br>and 07 02 13. TR deemed<br>unnecessary. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Lignin sulfonate<br>(chelating agent<br>for aquatic<br>plants)<br>(for aquatic<br>plants) CAS #s<br>9009-75-0, 8062-<br>15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609 | JR     | 2/2011<br>Crops TR<br><br>7/2013 TR<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR                          | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency Response due<br>09 04 12. CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info<br>and TR. Questions clarified by<br>petitioner. Petition found<br>sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.                      | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Vitamins (B1,<br>B12, H) for<br>aquatic plants  | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR   | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency response due<br>10 10 12. Petition found<br>sufficient 06 18 13.  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Biologics:<br>Vaccines for<br>Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR<br>(Vaccines<br>made from<br>GMOs)  | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12.<br>Petition found sufficient and TR<br>requested on 05 21 13. (NOP<br>note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR<br>deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Chlorine<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | FT     | No<br>Crops 2011<br>Crops 2006<br>Crops 1995<br>Livestock<br>2006<br>Handling<br>2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 07 03<br>12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Tocopherols<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)  | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR<br>1995 TAP<br>rvw  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft<br>TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR<br>found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

|  |         |       |                |   |    |                 |
|--|---------|-------|----------------|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)       | 205.611 | CW/FT | Yes<br>2013 TR | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals) | 205.611 | CW/FT | 2013 TR        | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

| Other projects                              |                 |           |   |                     |           |
|---|-----------------|-----------|---|---------------------|-----------|
| Project                                     | Contact         | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussed,<br>Voted | Meeting   |
| Annotation Changes<br>Procaine<br>Lidocaine | JR              |           | Discussed at ES meeting 07 10 15.<br>Proposal   | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Annotation Changes<br>Parasitocides         | JR              |           | Proposal  | Jan 5,<br>Jan 19    | Spr 2016  |
| Peracetic acid<br>205.601(a)<br>205.601(i)  | TF              | Y         | Sunset date: 05 09 18. TR sent to LS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by LS. TR found sufficient 04 05 16 | 04 05 16            | TBD       |
| Research Priorities<br>(RP)                 | All             | NA        | RPs due to MS Aug 2016  | Feb 16,<br>Apr 5    | Fall 2016 |
| Organic Poultry task<br>force               | TF/AB/AS/<br>HB |           | Discuss formation of Task Force   | NA                  | NA        |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from March 15, 2016
- Public Comment Recap
- Sulfur Petition Sufficiency (AB)
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- Notes from the March 15, 2016 approved with no changes.

- **A member asked for clarification about the meeting procedures and the difference between proposals and discussion documents.**
- **Public comment.**
  - **Lidocaine & Procaine.** The majority of commenters are in support of the annotation for lidocaine and procaine. The lead is optimistic that the Board will be able to vote on these materials during the fall 2016 meeting.
  - **Parasiticides.** The majority of commenters are in support of the annotation for parasiticides. Commenters noted two difficulties: The definition of emergency use, and the removal of ivermectin. The lead summarized the path forward for ivermectin, which includes a two-stage process – education about alternatives, and then removal.  
**Hypochlorous acid:** Commenters have raised concerns about sources, although the Board is focused on electrolyzed water. The NOP supports the addition of “as petitioned” to the proposal to clarify. It was noted that this language is already in the proposal. A member suggested adding the phrase from “electrolyzed water” to the annotation, as the Crops Subcommittee did. All three Subcommittee proposals will be aligned.
- **Aquaculture.** Members briefly discussed the aquaculture rule and expressed hope that it will be released this year.
- **Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) proposed rule (aka Animal Welfare).** The NOSB Chair listened to the NOP webinar on OLPP last week, and urged people to disseminate the information about commenting during the open comment period. The NOP continues to reach out to stakeholders to discuss questions that have been raised. A member expressed support for the proposed rule and noted that it needs to be put into context of the rule, and not seen as a standalone document.
- **Sulfur Petition Sufficiency (AB).** The lead summarized the petition, and noted that it satisfies all of the required information for sufficiency. Sulfur is being petitioned for use for repellent of mites, fleas and ticks. Members discussed the potential of requesting a TR since the last TR was from 1995.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

## [Previous LS Notes](#)

### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

April 5, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)

Peracetic Acid - TR sufficiency (TF)

April 18, 2016

Public comment review

Sulfur petition sufficiency (AB)

May 3, 2016 - cancelled

May 17, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)

Sulfur petition sufficiency (AB)

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - Discuss proposal

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - Discuss proposal

Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - Discuss proposal

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016  
 July 19, 2016  
 August 2, 2016  
 August 16, 2016  
 September 6, 2016  
 September 20, 2016  
 October 4, 2016  
 October 18, 2016  
 November 1, 2016  
 November 15, 2016  
 December 6, 2016  
 December 20, 2016

| Spring 2016 Milestones  | Target date       |
|---|-------------------|
| New NOSB member orientation                                       | Feb 29, 2016      |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda          | Feb 10, 2016      |
| NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP                           | Feb 26, 2016      |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | Mar 16, 2016      |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Mar 11, 2016      |
| Public comment closes   | Apr 14, 2016      |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Apr 8, 2016       |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Apr 18, 2016      |
| Public comment webinar  | Apr 19, 2016      |
| Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC                         | Apr 25 - 27, 2016 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, May 17, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tracy Favre, (TF); Dan Seitz (DS); A-dae Briones (AB); Jean Richardson (JR); Jesse Buie (JB); Lisa de lima (LD) - observer, Harold Austin (HA) - observer

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |              |   |                             |                    |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|---|-----------------------------|--------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested | Notes   | Scheduled, Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate (PDF)   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite TR rcvd 03 03 16. | Jun 7                       | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015         | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite. TR rcvd 03 03 16.  | Jun 7                       | Proposal fall 2016 |

|  |         |        |   |   |        |                    |
|--|---------|--------|---|---|--------|--------------------|
| Acid-Activated Bentonite                           | 205.603 | AS     | 2016 Lmtd Scope                                 | <p>Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15. TR sent to LS 03 03 16. Suff due 05 03 16. TR found suff 03 15 16</p> <p>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter:<br/> <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b>.<br/> TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</p> | Jun 7  | Proposal fall 2016 |
| Sulfur   | 205.603 | AB     |   | <p>Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16.</p>   | May 17 | TBD                |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants) | 205.609 | TF/CBo | N   | <p>Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>  | NA     | Proposal TBD       |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)          | 205.609 | FT     | <p>2011 Crops TR<br/> 2006 TR<br/> 1995 TAP</p> | <p>Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.</p>   | NA     | Proposal TBD       |

|   |         |        |   |   |    |                 |
|---|---------|--------|---|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture-<br>Micronutrients<br>(for aquatic<br>plants)   | 205.609 | FT     | 2010 TR<br>(Nickel)<br><br>6/2013<br>Minerals TR                                      | Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12.<br>Petition sufficiency response due<br>08 08 12? CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info.<br>Questions clarified by petitioner.<br>Petition found sufficient 06 18 13<br>and 07 02 13. TR deemed<br>unnecessary. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Lignin sulfonate<br>(chelating agent<br>for aquatic<br>plants)<br>(for aquatic<br>plants) CAS #s<br>9009-75-0, 8062-<br>15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609 | JR     | 2/2011<br>Crops TR<br><br>7/2013 TR<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR                          | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency Response due<br>09 04 12. CS sent request to NL<br>Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info<br>and TR. Questions clarified by<br>petitioner. Petition found<br>sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.                      | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Vitamins (B1,<br>B12, H) for<br>aquatic plants  | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR   | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency response due<br>10 10 12. Petition found<br>sufficient 06 18 13.  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Biologics:<br>Vaccines for<br>Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR<br>(Vaccines<br>made from<br>GMOs)  | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12.<br>Petition found sufficient and TR<br>requested on 05 21 13. (NOP<br>note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR<br>deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Chlorine<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | FT     | No<br>Crops 2011<br>Crops 2006<br>Crops 1995<br>Livestock<br>2006<br>Handling<br>2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 07 03<br>12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Tocopherols<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)  | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR<br>1995 TAP<br>rvw  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft<br>TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR<br>found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

|  |         |       |                |   |    |                 |
|--|---------|-------|----------------|---|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture – Vitamins (for aquatic animals)       | 205.611 | CW/FT | Yes<br>2013 TR | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12. Response due ~07 30 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12. Requested joint TR with Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture - Trace Minerals (for aquatic animals) | 205.611 | CW/FT | 2013 TR        | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12. Response due ~08 08 12. Petition found sufficient 08 06 12? Requested joint TR with Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

| Other projects                             |                 |           |   |                     |           |
|--|-----------------|-----------|---|---------------------|-----------|
| Project                                    | Contact         | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussed,<br>Voted | Meeting   |
| Peracetic acid<br>205.601(a)<br>205.601(i) | TF              | Y         | Sunset date: 05 09 18. TR sent to LS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by LS. TR found sufficient 04 05 16 | 04 05 16            | TBD       |
| Research Priorities (RP)                   | All             | NA        | RPs due to MS Aug 2016  | Feb 16,<br>Apr 5    | Fall 2016 |
| Organic Poultry task force                 | TF/AB/AS/<br>HB |           | Discuss formation of Task Force   | NA                  | NA        |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve notes from April 18, 2016
- Spring 2016 meeting recap
- Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)
- Organic poultry working group
- Ivermectin petition - Removal
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the April 18, 2016** approved with no changes
- **Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP)** proposed rule. The group discussed recent developments with the proposed rule.
- **Spring 2016 meeting recap.** New members discussed their initial experiences, thoughts and challenges about the spring NOSB. They indicated the biggest challenges are the amount of information they receive, and the need to develop more historical and background knowledge. Overall the experience was a positive one.

- **Research priorities discussion (TF, JR).** The lead circulated a compilation of past research priorities from 2012 to present. The members discussed and ranked some of the previous proposals and suggested topics for future projects. Some of the topics were very broadly defined, and the group will work to refine some of these. The LS will discuss this in June, and have a document ready for the MS on or before the July 8 deadline. One member suggested a need for research on parasiticides, especially in poultry.
- **Organic poultry working group (AS).** Members discussed the need for a working group. The goal would be to review the current state of methionine use on a global level, including a review of alternative practices. The task force could also be tasked with recommending research priorities for methionine alternatives, animal welfare or behavior, management practices, and poultry breeding/genetics. This work would help to aid the LS in developing a targeted list of research priorities for the industry. AS will revise the document based on the discussion, add outcomes and expectations for the NOSB, and recirculate the updated version. The document will be finalized prior to May 31 for submission to the program.
- **Ivermectin petition.** The members discussed the process for a NOSB member to submit a petition for removal. Anyone can submit a petition, however NOSB does not have a specific procedure to recommend removals without a petition, although could request to do this as a work agenda item. Members will consider developing a petition as per the new NOP guidance.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

April 18, 2016

Public comment review

Sulfur petition sufficiency (AB)

May 3, 2016 - cancelled

May 17, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)

June 7, 2016

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Clarification of term "emergency treatment" in relation to use of parasiticides - discuss

June 21, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR) discuss/vote

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016  
December 6, 2016  
December 20, 2016

| <b>Fall 2016 Milestones</b>                                       | <b>Target dates (tentative)</b> |
|---|---------------------------------|
| NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda            | Sept 8, 2016                    |
| NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP                             | Sept 14, 2016                   |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | June/TBD                        |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Oct 14, 2016                    |
| Public comment closes   | Oct 26, 2016                    |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Nov 2, 2016                     |
| Public comment webinars   | Nov 3, 2016                     |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Nov 4, 2016                     |
| Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO                             | Nov 16-18, 2016                 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, June 7, 2016 3:00pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tracy Favre, (TF); A-dae Briones (AB); Jesse Buie (JB)

**Absent:** Dan Seitz (DS); Jean Richardson (JR)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials  |              |         |                 |   |                             |                    |
|---|--------------|---------|-----------------|---|-----------------------------|--------------------|
| Substance   | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested    | Notes   | Scheduled, Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate  | 205.603      | AS      | 2015            | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite TR rcvd 03 03 16. | Jun 7, Jun 21               | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015            | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite. TR rcvd 03 03 16.  | Jun 7, Jun 21               | Proposal fall 2016 |
| Acid-Activated Bentonite  | 205.603      | AS      | 2016 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15. TR sent to LS 03 03 16. Suff due 05 03   | Jun 7, Jun 21               | Proposal fall 2016 |

|  |         |        |   |   |        |                 |
|--|---------|--------|---|---|--------|-----------------|
|  |         |        |   | <p>16. TR found suff 03 15 16</p> <p>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b>.</p> <p>TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</p>  |        |                 |
| Sulfur   | 205.603 | AB     |   | <p>Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. Expected late summer 2016</p>   | May 17 | TBD             |
| <a href="#">Glycolic Acid, 2016</a>                | 205.603 |        |   | <p>Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16.</p>  |        | TBD             |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants) | 205.609 | TF/CBo | N   | <p>Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>  | NA     | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)          | 205.609 | FT     | <p>2011 Crops TR</p> <p>2006 TR</p> <p>1995 TAP</p> | <p>Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.</p> | NA     | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)    | 205.609 | FT     | <p>2010 TR (Nickel)</p> <p>6/2013 Minerals TR</p>   | <p>Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07</p>   | NA     | Proposal<br>TBD |

|   |         |        |   |   |    |                 |
|---|---------|--------|---|---|----|-----------------|
|   |         |        |   | 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.   |    |                 |
| Aquaculture-<br>Lignin sulfonate<br>(chelating agent<br>for aquatic<br>plants)<br>(for aquatic<br>plants) CAS #s<br>9009-75-0, 8062-<br>15-5, 8061-51-6 | 205.609 | JR     | 2/2011<br>Crops TR<br><br>7/2013 TR<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR                          | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency Response<br>due 09 04 12. CS sent request<br>to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for<br>additional info and TR.<br>Questions clarified by<br>petitioner. Petition found<br>sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Vitamins (B1,<br>B12, H) for<br>aquatic plants  | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR   | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency response<br>due 10 10 12. Petition found<br>sufficient 06 18 13.  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Biologics:<br>Vaccines for<br>Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR<br>(Vaccines<br>made from<br>GMOs)  | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12.<br>Petition found sufficient and TR<br>requested on 05 21 13. (NOP<br>note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR<br>deemed sufficient 02 03 14  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Chlorine<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | FT     | No<br>Crops 2011<br>Crops 2006<br>Crops 1995<br>Livestock<br>2006<br>Handling<br>2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 07 03<br>12. No TR requested  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Tocopherols<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)  | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR<br>1995 TAP<br>rww  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft<br>TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR<br>found sufficient 06 04 13   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Vitamins<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | CW/FT  | Yes<br>2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Response due ~07 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. Requested joint TR with<br>Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS<br>04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18<br>13.   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Trace Minerals<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | CW/FT  | 2013 TR   | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12.<br>Response due ~08 08 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12? Requested joint TR with   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
|  |  |  |  | Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS 06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|

| Other projects                             |              |           |   |                       |           |
|--|--------------|-----------|---|-----------------------|-----------|
| Project                                    | Contact      | TR Reqst? | Notes   | Discussed,<br>Voted   | Meeting   |
| Peracetic acid<br>205.601(a)<br>205.601(i) | TF           | Y         | Sunset date: 05 09 18. TR sent to LS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by LS. TR found sufficient 04 05 16 | 04 05 16              | TBD       |
| Research Priorities (RP)                   | All          | NA        | RPs due to MS Aug 2016  | Feb 16, Apr 5, Jun 21 | Fall 2016 |
| Organic Poultry task force                 | TF/AB/AS/ HB |           | Discuss formation of Task Force   | NA                    | NA        |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

| 2019 Sunsets (TR requests)<br>Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017 |         |             |       |                         |         |
|---|---------|-------------|-------|-------------------------|---------|
| Substance   | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled,<br>Discussed | Meeting |
| Calcium hypochlorite<br>205.603(a)                                | AS/FT   |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Chlorhexidine<br>205.603(a)                                       | HB      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Chlorine dioxide<br>205.603(a)                                    | AS      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Glucose<br>205.603(a)   | TF      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Oxytocin<br>205.603(a)  | TF      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Sodium hypochlorite   | AS      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Tolazoline<br>205.603(a)  | TF      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Copper sulfate<br>205.603(b)                                      | JB      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Lidocaine<br>205.603(b)   | JR      |             |       | Jun 21                  |         |

|                        |    |  |  |        |  |
|------------------------|----|--|--|--------|--|
| Procaine<br>205.603(b) | JR |  |  | Jun 21 |  |
|------------------------|----|--|--|--------|--|

### Agenda

- Approve notes from May 17, 2016
- Acid activated bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal
- Aluminum sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
- Sodium bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal
- Work agenda discussion
- New TRs/Assign leads on materials
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Notes from the** May 17, 2016 approved with no changes
- **Litter amendments: Acid activated bentonite, aluminum sulfate, sodium bisulfate (AS).** The lead summarized the uses for these materials and the group discussed the proposals for all three. Aluminum sulfate - also petitioned for use in crops. A member described the chemistry involved with the application of this material to soil, and the LS will include questions in the proposal about alternatives and management practices. The LS will revisit these materials and vote at a later date.
- **Work agenda (All).** Members discussed a potential work agenda item regarding clarification of the term “emergency treatment” in relation to the use of parasiticides. The Subcommittee supports the addition of this project and will seek approval from the Executive team on the June 10 call. The group also discussed working on the topic of antibiotic use in day-old chicks. Members and the NOP discussed the goal for this project and the language in OFPA about sourcing poultry. The LS is waiting for additional input from NOP about working on this topic considering the OFPA language.
- Members volunteered to lead the reviews for the 2019 sunset materials (see table above)
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)

May 17, 2016

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR)

June 7, 2016

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Clarification of term “emergency treatment” in relation to use of parasiticides - discuss

June 21, 2016

Assign lead to Glycolic acid - petitioned

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR) discuss/vote

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

2019 sunsets - TR determinations

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016  
 August 16, 2016  
 September 6, 2016  
 September 20, 2016  
 October 4, 2016  
 October 18, 2016  
 November 1, 2016  
 November 15, 2016  
 December 6, 2016  
 December 20, 2016

| Fall 2016 Milestones  | Target dates (tentative) |
|---|--------------------------|
| NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda            | Sept 8, 2016             |
| NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP                             | Sept 14, 2016            |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment            | June/TBD                 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Oct 14, 2016             |
| Public comment closes   | Oct 26, 2016             |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Nov 2, 2016              |
| Public comment webinar  | Nov 3, 2016              |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Nov 4, 2016              |
| Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO                             | Nov 16-18, 2016          |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Livestock/Aquaculture Subcommittee (LS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, June 21, 2016 3:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tracy Favre, (TF); A-dae Briones (AB); Dan Seitz (DS); Jean Richardson (JR)

**Absent:** Jesse Buie (JB)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Work Agenda**

| Petitioned Materials   |              |         |                 |   |                             |                    |
|--|--------------|---------|-----------------|---|-----------------------------|--------------------|
| Substance  | Nat'l List § | Contact | TR requested    | Notes   | Scheduled, Discussed, Voted | Meeting            |
| Aluminum Sulfate   | 205.603      | AS      | 2015            | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found suff 06 23 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite TR rcvd 03 03 16. | Jun 7, Jun 21               | Proposal fall 2016 |
| <a href="#">Sodium Bisulfate</a><br><a href="#">Petition</a><br><a href="#">Addendum</a> | 205.603      | AS      | 2015            | Petition sent to LS 05 27 14. Q's for petitioner/TR request due 07 28 14. TR request sent to NOP 08 06 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TR sent to LS 05 14 15. Suff due 07 14 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Pet addendum sent to LS 08 20 15. Waiting for TR for Acid-Activated Bentonite. TR rcvd 03 03 16.  | Jun 7, Jun 21               | Proposal fall 2016 |
| Acid-Activated Bentonite   | 205.603      | AS      | 2016 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to LS 04 03 15. Q's for petitioner. TR request due 06 02 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. Determine need for TR. Rqst for Lmtd scope TR sent to NOP 06 23 15. TR in development 11 17 15. TR sent  | Jun 7, Jun 21               | Proposal fall 2016 |

|  |         |        |   |   |         |                 |
|--|---------|--------|---|---|---------|-----------------|
|  |         |        |   | <p>to LS 03 03 16. Suff due 05 03 16. TR found suff 03 15 16</p> <p>Two related petitions pending for treatment of poultry litter: <b>sodium bisulfate</b> and <b>aluminum sulfate</b>.</p> <p>TAP for Kaolin Clay and Bentonite 1995</p>   |         |                 |
| Sulfur   | 205.603 | AB     |   | <p>Petition sent to HS 03 09 16. Response/request for TR due 05 09 16. Petition was found suff 04 18 16. TR request sent to NOP 04 18 16. Expected late summer 2016</p>   | May 17, | TBD             |
| <a href="#">Glycolic Acid, 2016</a>                | 205.603 | FT     |   | <p>Petition sent to LS 06 06 15. Response/request for TR due 08 08 16.</p>  | Jul 19  | TBD             |
| Aquaculture-CO <sub>2</sub> , (for aquatic plants) | 205.609 | TF/CBo | N   | <p>Petition sent to CS 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>  | NA      | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-Chlorine (for aquatic plants)          | 205.609 | FT     | <p>2011 Crops TR<br/>2006 TR<br/>1995 TAP</p>       | <p>Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. 2011 TR deemed suff for this review 11 20 12. Additional aquaculture TR deemed unnecessary. Sent follow up questions to petitioner. Response deemed sufficient.</p> | NA      | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-Micronutrients (for aquatic plants)    | 205.609 | FT     | <p>2010 TR (Nickel)<br/><br/>6/2013 Minerals TR</p> | <p>Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr. 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13. TR deemed unnecessary.</p>                                     | NA      | Proposal<br>TBD |

|   |         |        |   |  |    |                 |
|---|---------|--------|---|--|----|-----------------|
| Aquaculture-<br>Lignin sulfonate<br>(chelating agent<br>for aquatic<br>plants)<br>CAS #s 9009-75-<br>0, 8062-15-5,<br>8061-51-6 | 205.609 | JR     | 2/2011<br>Crops TR<br><br>7/2013 TR<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR                          | Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency Response<br>due 09 04 12. CS sent request<br>to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for<br>additional info and TR.<br>Questions clarified by<br>petitioner. Petition found<br>sufficient 6 18 13 and 07 02 13.                | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture-<br>Vitamins (B1,<br>B12, H) for<br>aquatic plants  | 205.609 | CW     | 4/2013<br>Aquatic<br>Animals TR   | Petition sent to CS 08 10 12.<br>Petition Sufficiency response<br>due 10 10 12. Petition found<br>sufficient 06 18 13.   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Biologics:<br>Vaccines for<br>Aquatic Animals  | 205.611 | JR     | 2011 TR<br>(Vaccines<br>made from<br>GMOs)  | Petition sent to LS 06 14 12.<br>Petition found sufficient and TR<br>requested on 05 21 13. (NOP<br>note: TR sent to LS 01 24 14. TR<br>deemed sufficient 02 03 14   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Chlorine<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | FT     | No<br>Crops 2011<br>Crops 2006<br>Crops 1995<br>Livestock<br>2006<br>Handling<br>2006 | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 07 03<br>12. No TR requested   | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Tocopherols<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)  | 205.611 | TF/CBo | 2013 TR<br>1995 TAP<br>rvw  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. TR requested 08 06 12. Draft<br>TR sent to LS on 04 16 13. TR<br>found sufficient 06 04 13  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture –<br>Vitamins<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | CW/FT  | Yes<br>2013 TR  | Petition sent to LS on 05 30 12.<br>Response due ~07 30 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12. Requested joint TR with<br>Minerals 08 06 12. TR sent to LS<br>04 29 13. TR found suff 06 18<br>13.  | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |
| Aquaculture -<br>Trace Minerals<br>(for aquatic<br>animals)   | 205.611 | CW/FT  | 2013 TR   | Petition sent to LS on 06 08 12.<br>Response due ~08 08 12.<br>Petition found sufficient 08 06<br>12? Requested joint TR with<br>Vitamins 08 06 12. TR sent to LS<br>06 25 13. Suff due 08 27 13. TR<br>found sufficient 07 16 13. Fall<br>2013 meeting cancelled. | NA | Proposal<br>TBD |

| Other projects                             |              |           |  |                       |           |
|--|--------------|-----------|--|-----------------------|-----------|
| Project                                    | Contact      | TR Reqst? | Notes  | Discussed,<br>Voted   | Meeting   |
| Peracetic acid<br>205.601(a)<br>205.601(i) | TF           | Y         | Sunset date: 05 09 18. TR sent to LS 03 04 16. Response due ~05 03 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by LS. TR found sufficient 04 05 16 | 04 05 16              | TBD       |
| Research Priorities (RP)                   | All          | NA        | RPs due to MS Aug 2016   | Feb 16, Apr 5, Jun 21 | Fall 2016 |
| Organic Poultry task force                 | TF/AB/AS/ HB |           | Discuss formation of Task Force  | NA                    | NA        |

\* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed \*Highlight indicates review completion

| 2019 Sunsets (TR requests)<br>Summary: Spr 2017 Review: Fall 2017 |         |             |       |                         |         |
|---|---------|-------------|-------|-------------------------|---------|
| Substance   | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled,<br>Discussed | Meeting |
| Calcium hypochlorite<br>205.603(a)                                | AS/FT   | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Chlorhexidine<br>205.603(a)                                       | HB      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Chlorine dioxide<br>205.603(a)                                    | AS      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Glucose<br>205.603(a)   | TF      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Oxytocin<br>205.603(a)  | TF      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Sodium hypochlorite   | AS      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Tolazoline<br>205.603(a)  | TF      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Copper sulfate<br>205.603(b)                                      | JB      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Lidocaine<br>205.603(b)   | JR      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |
| Procaine<br>205.603(b)  | JR      | N           |       | Jun 21                  |         |

#### Agenda

- Approve notes from June 7, 2016
- Assign lead to glycolic acid (petition)

- Research Priorities discussion (TF, JR) - discuss/vote
- Acid activated bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal/vote
- Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote  
Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2019 sunsets - TR determinations
- Adjourn

## Discussion

- **Notes from the June 7** were approved with a clarification to the section on litter amendments.
- **Glycolic acid - petitioned.** FT volunteered to lead this review and will provide the petition sufficiency on the July 19 call.
- **Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR).** The group discussed the list and the need to shorten it to increase its usefulness for the Organic Working Group and distribution to the research community. The group prioritized three topics and will forward the final list to the Materials Subcommittee. The three topics are whole farms system research, prevention and management of parasites, and general herd and flock health.
- **Acid activated bentonite (AS), aluminum sulfate (AS), sodium bisulfate (AS).** The group discussed the three proposals for litter amendments with particular regard to use for broilers, alternative practices, and the potential benefits of pH and bacteria control. The Subcommittee proceeded to votes.

Motion to classify acid activated bentonite as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: TF

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add acid activated bentonite as petitioned at §205.603

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: TF

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to classify aluminum sulfate as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add aluminum sulfate as petitioned) at §205.603

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: JR

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to classify sodium bisulfate as petitioned as synthetic:

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add sodium bisulfate as petitioned at §205.603

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: TF

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2019 sunsets - TR determinations.** The group discussed the need for TRs for the 2019 sunset materials and determined that none were needed.
- **Other projects.** The LS discussed topics under consideration for the work agenda related to poultry production practices. Further work may be postponed on these topics in light of current rulemaking activity.
- The LS will cancel the July 5 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous LS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 3:00 ET)**

June 7, 2016

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal

Clarification of term "emergency treatment" in relation to use of parasiticides - discuss

June 21, 2016

Assign lead to Glycolic acid - petitioned

Research Priorities Discussion (TF, JR) discuss/approve

Acid Activated Bentonite (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

Aluminum Sulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

Sodium Bisulfate (AS) - discuss proposal/vote

2019 sunsets - TR determinations

July 5, 2016 - cancelled

July 19, 2016

Glycolic acid (FT). Petition sufficiency

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

| Fall 2016 Milestones  | Target dates (tentative)   |
|---|----------------------------|
| NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment                            | June/TBD                   |
| NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda            | Sept 8, 2016               |
| NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP                             | Sept 14, 2016              |
| NOP - Post proposals  | On or before Sept 27, 2016 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call                                   | Oct 14, 2016               |
| Public comment closes   | Oct 26, 2016               |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                       | Nov 2, 2016                |
| Public comment webinar  | Nov 3, 2016                |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Nov 4, 2016                |
| Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO                             | Nov 16-18, 2016            |