

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, April 1, 2025 1:00 pm ET

Present: Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Kathryn Deschenes (KD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Andrea Hatziyannis (AH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: Amanda Felder (AF); Jo Mirenda (JM); Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review March 18, 2025 notes
- 2028 sunsets - TR determinations (All)
- Chitosan - petition sufficiency (AH)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 18, 2025 notes** were approved as written.
- **Chitosan - petition sufficiency (AH).** The lead noted that there was a 2020 TR that was a useful resource. The current petition asks for the addition of chitosan for use in winemaking, but unlike a previous chitosan petition, this version is manufactured from fermentation rather than sourced from crustaceans, which rendered it synthetic. The lead noted the petition was comprehensive and finds it sufficient. The HS would like to request a full TR to address the fermentation process. Members shared links to citations from the document for further background reading.
- **2028 sunsets - TR determinations.** The HS reviewed the 2028 sunset substances to determine the need for TRs. See table below for outcomes.
 - Agar-agar (DN). The lead indicated that he found the 2011 TR comprehensive and thorough, and didn't see the need for an updated one. The HS Vice Chair made a note in the previous review of agar agar that it may have been misclassified, and she suggested requesting a limited scope TR to look at the manufacturing process and decision tree.
 - Carrageenan (CD). The lead recommended a limited scope TR to focus on two areas – human health and classification. She indicated that there is new research on the health impacts of carrageenan and the 2011 TR noted that the extraction process renders carrageenan synthetic. The HS will forward specific questions to NOP with the request.
 - Cellulose (CD). The 2016 TR is sufficient, there was an annotation review in 2019, and no negative feedback from stakeholders at the last review, so the HS will not request a new TR.
 - Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, chlorine dioxide, hypochlorous acid - generated from electrolyzed water, sodium hypochlorite (LP). The previous TR for chlorine materials was from 2006, and although there was a 2015 TR for the Crops scope, the HS would like to request a limited scope TR.
- **Additional items.** Reminder to join the practice webinars if able, since the comment period has been truncated and there won't be a lot of time to review comments before the meeting.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous HS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025 (AF - not available)

2028 sunsets - TR determinations
Chitosan - petition sufficiency (AH)

April 15, 2025

2028 sunsets - TR determinations

May 6, 2025

May 20, 2025

June 3, 2025

June 17, 2025

July 1, 2025

July 15, 2025

August 5, 2025

August 19, 2025

September 2, 2025

September 16, 2025

October 7, 2025

October 21, 2025

November 4, 2025

November 18, 2025

December 2, 2025

December 16, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL -> LP	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	11.19.24 2.4.25	Spr 2025
Chitosan	205.605(b)	AH, CD, KS	TBD	Petition sent to HS 3.5.25. 2020 TR Crops 2020 Livestock petition . Petition suff. due 05.04.25. Petition found sufficient 4.1.25, CS requested a TR.	3.18.25 4.1.25	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification disc doc	AJ/NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. 2019 TR	12.17.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	Spr 2025

Research Priorities	DN, KS, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 9, 2025	1.7.25 1.21.25	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction proposal	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	1.7.25	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	KD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25.	1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. The TR was found sufficient 1.7.25.	1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "

				12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.		
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	AH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	11.19.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	AF	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25	1.21.25	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	AF	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	" "

Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024. TR sent to HS 12.6.24. TR suff due 2.4.25. TR found insufficient 12.17.24. HS	12.3.24 12.17.24 2.18.25	“ “

				sent additional questions to TR writer. Response sent to HS. TR found sufficient 2.18.25		
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24	“ “

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	March 28, 2025	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	March 28, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	April 28, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	April 29, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9

NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

2028 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2025), Summary (Spr 2026), Review (Fall 2026)

Previous Sunset Recommendations: [2021/Fall - Rec to Renew](#)

Previous Rule/Renewals: [04/14/2023, 88 FR 22893](#)

Substance	National List	Con tact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)(2)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 05/29/2028 2011 TR 1995 TAP	3.18.25 4.1.25	Summary: Spr 2026 Review: Fall 2026
Animal enzymes— (Rennet—animals derived; Catalase— bovine liver; Animal lipase; Pancreatin; Pepsin; and Trypsin).	205.605(a)(3)	KD		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR (enzymes, microorganisms, yeast) 2015 TR (enzymes) 2011 TR (enzymes) 2000 TAP	3.18.25	" "
Calcium sulfate - mined	205.605(a)(8)	AF		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2001 TAP 1996 TAP	3.18.25	" "
Carrageenan	205.605(a)(9)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 Lmt'd Scope TR 2011 TR 1995 TAP	3.18.25 4.1.25	" "
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)(14)	AH		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 TR 2002 TAP	3.18.25	" "
Tartaric acid - made from grape wine	205.605(a)(28)	AJ		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2011 TR	3.18.25	" "
Cellulose	205.605(b)(11)	CD	N	Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 TR 2001 TAP	3.18.25 4.1.25	" "

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)(12)(i)	LP	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25 4.1.25	" "
Chlorine Materials: Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)(12)(ii)	LP	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25 4.1.25	" "
Chlorine Materials: Hypochlorous acid - generated from electrolyzed water	205.605(b)(12)(iii)	LP	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2015 TR 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25 4.1.25	" "
Chlorine Materials: Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)(12)(iv)	LP	Y Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25 4.1.25	" "
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)(26)	AF		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 TR 2001 TAP	3.18.25	" "
Potassium lactate	205.605(b)(27)	AH		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2015 TR (lactic acid, sodium lactate, potassium lactate)	3.18.25	" "
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)(29)	KS		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2010 TR 1996 TAP 1995 TAP (colloidal silica)	3.18.25	" "
Sodium lactate	205.605(b)(33)	AH		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2015 TR (lactic acid, sodium lactate, potassium lactate)	3.18.25	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, March 18, 2025 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kathryn Deschenes (KD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Amanda Felder (AF); Andrea Hatziyannis (AH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review February 18, 2025 notes
- Chitosan petition - Assign lead and dates
- Food tech update
- Planning ahead for sunsets
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 18, 2025 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chitosan petition.** Chitosan was petitioned for use in winemaking. The HS Chair reviewed the process for assessing a new petition. Step 1 - determine sufficiency; Step 2 - determine need for TR; Step 3 - complete review by writing either a proposal or discussion document. Several members offered to mentor, co-lead, and/or support the new member who volunteered to lead this review. The HS scheduled petition sufficiency for April 1.
- **Food tech update.** The Food technologist provided an update on the mined substances project. She is focusing on substances on 205.605(a) and (b). Initially she identified 71 substances, and narrowed it down to 26. She then reviewed technical reports (TRs) for those 26 and compiled a table for Handling. Additionally, she is summarizing mining methods and impacts on the environment. The goal is to have an additional tool when reviewing sunsets that are mined, and having a way to compare substances.
- **Planning ahead for sunsets.** 2028 sunsets. Assigned leads for TR determinations (see table below).
- **Additional items.**
 - Reviewed work agenda tracker. Will map out discussion dates for TR reviews for the 2028 sunsets in the next couple of weeks.
 - The HS has discussed Sharepoint and other platforms, such as the Google Docs. The Board will continue to use an internal tracking sheet, outside of Sharepoint, for ease of use and access.
 - The HS Chair will assign discussion dates for the 2028 sunsets - either April 1 or 15.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

February 4, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN). Discuss review

Ethylene - Annotation change (NL). Discuss/vote

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL). Discuss/vote

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025 - cancelled

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025 (AF - not available)

2028 sunsets - TR determinations
Chitosan - petition sufficiency (AH)

April 15, 2025

2028 sunsets - TR determinations

May 6, 2025

May 20, 2025

June 3, 2025

June 17, 2025

July 1, 2025

July 15, 2025

August 5, 2025

August 19, 2025

September 2, 2025

September 16, 2025

October 7, 2025

October 21, 2025

November 4, 2025

November 18, 2025

December 2, 2025

December 16, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL -> LP	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	11.19.24 2.4.25	Spr 2025
Chitosan	205.605(b)	AH, CD, KS	TBD	Petition sent to HS 3.5.25. Petition suff. due 05.04.25. 2020 TR Crops 2020 Livestock petition	3.18.25 4.1.25	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification disc doc	AJ/NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. 2019 TR	12.17.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	Spr 2025

Research Priorities	DN, KS, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 9, 2025	1.7.25 1.21.25	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction proposal	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	1.7.25	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	KD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25.	1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. The TR was found sufficient 1.7.25.	1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "

				12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.		
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	AH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	11.19.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	AF	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25	1.21.25	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	AF	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	" "

Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024. TR sent to HS 12.6.24. TR suff due 2.4.25. TR found insufficient 12.17.24. HS	12.3.24 12.17.24 2.18.25	“ “

				sent additional questions to TR writer. Response sent to HS. TR found sufficient 2.18.25		
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24	“ “

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 24, 2025	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9

NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

2028 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2025), Summary (Spr 2026), Review (Fall 2026)

Previous Sunset Recommendations: [2021/Fall - Rec to Renew](#)

Previous Rule/Renewals: [04/14/2023, 88 FR 22893](#)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)(2)	DN		Sunset date: 05/29/2028 2011 TR 1995 TAP	3.18.25	Summary: Spr 2026 Review: Fall 2026
Animal enzymes— (Rennet—animals derived; Catalase— bovine liver; Animal lipase; Pancreatin; Pepsin; and Trypsin).	205.605(a)(3)	KD		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR (enzymes, microorganisms, yeast) 2015 TR (enzymes) 2011 TR (enzymes) 2000 TAP	3.18.25	“ “
Calcium sulfate - mined	205.605(a)(8)	AF		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2001 TAP 1996 TAP	3.18.25	“ “
Carrageenan	205.605(a)(9)	CD		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 Lmt'd Scope TR 2011 TR 1995 TAP	3.18.25	“ “
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)(14)	AH		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 TR 2002 TAP	3.18.25	“ “
Tartaric acid - made from grape wine	205.605(a)(28)	AJ		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2011 TR	3.18.25	“ “
Cellulose	205.605(b)(11)	CD		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 TR 2001 TAP	3.18.25	“ “

Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)(12)(i)	LP		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25	“ “
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)(12)(ii)	LP		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25	“ “
Hypochlorous acid - generated from electrolyzed water	205.605(b)(12)(iii)	LP		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2015 TR 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25	“ “
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)(12)(iv)	LP		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2006 TR (Chlorine/Bleach)	3.18.25	“ “
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)(26)	AF		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2016 TR 2001 TAP	3.18.25	“ “
Potassium lactate	205.605(b)(27)	AH		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2015 TR (lactic acid, sodium lactate, potassium lactate)	3.18.25	“ “
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)(29)	KS		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2010 TR 1996 TAP 1995 TAP (colloidal silica)	3.18.25	“ “
Sodium lactate	205.605(b)(33)	AH		Sunset date: 5/29/2028 2015 TR (lactic acid, sodium lactate, potassium lactate)	3.18.25	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, February 18, 2025 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kathryn Deschenes (KD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Amanda Felder (AF); Andrea Hatziyannis (AH); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Logan Petrey (LP); Nate Lewis (NL)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review February 4, 2025 notes
- Cornstarch TR sufficiency (CD)
- New work agenda items discussion
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 4, 2025 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Cornstarch TR sufficiency (CD).** The HS received a response to its questions from the TR writer. The answers didn't quite clarify the questions, however, the TR was found sufficient at this time, and the HS will include several questions for stakeholders in the Spring sunset review. The group discussed commercial availability, and the HS chair let members know that the CACS has submitted a work agenda request to address commercial availability.
- **New work agenda items discussion.** The HS always has a long list of sunsets to review, but since several of the proposals and other projects are coming to completion, the HS Chair invited members to suggest new work agenda items.
- **Additional items.**
 - Next round of sunsets (2028) will be sent in the spring, so HS can determine any TR needs
 - The Food Technologist will send the research on mined substances, for discussion on a future call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

February 4, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN). Discuss review

Ethylene - Annotation change (NL). Discuss/vote

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL). Discuss/vote

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

May 6, 2025

May 20, 2025

June 3, 2025

June 17, 2025

July 1, 2025

July 15, 2025
 August 5, 2025
 August 19, 2025
 September 2, 2025
 September 16, 2025
 October 7, 2025
 October 21, 2025
 November 4, 2025
 November 18, 2025
 December 2, 2025
 December 16, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL -> LP	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	11.19.24 2.4.25	Spr 2025

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification proposal	AJ/NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. 2019 TR	12.17.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	Spr 2025
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 9, 2025	1.7.25 1.21.25	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	1.7.25	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	KD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25.	1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. The TR was found sufficient 1.7.25.	1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "

Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	AH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	“ ”
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	11.19.24	“ ”
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	AF	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25	1.21.25	“ ”
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	AF	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	“ ”
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ ”
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ ”
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	9.17.24	“ ”
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ ”
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ ”

Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024. TR sent to HS 12.6.24. TR suff due 2.4.25. TR found insufficient 12.17.24. HS sent additional questions to TR writer. Response sent to HS. TR found sufficient 2.18.25	12.3.24 12.17.24 2.18.25	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “

Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24	“ ”
--------------------------------	------------	----	---	---	----------	-----

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 24, 2025	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, February 4, 2025 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Kathryn Deschenes (KD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Amanda Felder (AF); Andrea Hatziyannis (AH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Logan Petrey (LP); Nate Lewis (NL)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review January 21, 2025 notes
- Welcome new members!
- 2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review
- 2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review
- 2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN). Discuss review
- Ethylene - Annotation change (NL). Discuss/vote
- L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL). Discuss/vote (see attached)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 21, 2025 notes** were accepted as written. The HS noted that the January 7 notes contain an error and rather than revise them, they chose to clarify here. The mention of the Solvay and Trona manufacturing processes was discussed under the conversation for ammonium carbonate and ammonium bicarbonate, which is not correct. These manufacturing processes apply to sodium bicarbonate.
- **Welcome new members.** Members introduced themselves and welcomed three new members to the Handling Subcommittee.
- **2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate and ammonium bicarbonate (DN).** With the correction to the January 7 notes, mentioned above, the HS deemed the reviews for ammonium bicarbonate and ammonium carbonate finalized and will submit them for the Spring meeting.
- **2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN).** The lead summarized the sunset review, and the group discussed the questions for stakeholders. Members suggested modifications to the questions, and will finalize and submit the document for the Spring meeting.
- **Ethylene - Annotation change (NL).** The lead presented the review, and discussed various aspects, such as human and environmental health. NL will transition this project to LP for presentation at the Spring meeting, as NL will rotate off the Handling Subcommittee to help manage the number of HS members. The HS moved to a vote.

Ethylene is already on the National List and classified as synthetic:

Motion amend listing of ethylene at 205.605(b)(14) Ethylene—allowed for postharvest ripening of tropical fruit, and degreening of citrus, and postharvest sprouting inhibition of potatoes and onions.

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 9 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL).** The lead summarized the discussion document proposing to add L-malic acid to the synthetic list in addition to the current listing. The goal is to align the rule with the current practice.

Motion to accept the discussion document on the reclassification of L-malic acid.

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 9 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

January 21, 2025

Research Priorities (All)

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

February 4, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN). Discuss review

Ethylene - Annotation change (NL). Discuss/vote

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL). Discuss/vote

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

May 6, 2025

May 20, 2025

June 3, 2025

June 17, 2025

July 1, 2025

July 15, 2025

August 5, 2025

August 19, 2025

September 2, 2025

September 16, 2025

October 7, 2025

October 21, 2025

November 4, 2025

November 18, 2025

December 2, 2025

December 16, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL -> LP	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24		Spr 2025

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification proposal	AJ/NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. 2019 TR	12.17.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	Spr 2025
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 9, 2025	1.7.25 1.21.25	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	1.7.25	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25.	1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. The TR was found sufficient 1.7.25.	1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	11.19.24	" "

Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25	1.21.25	“ “
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	“ “
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “

Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024. TR sent to HS 12.6.24. TR suff due 2.4.25. TR found insufficient 12.17.24. HS sent additional questions to TR writer.	12.3.24 12.17.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24	“ “

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 24, 2025	16 -20

NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, January 21, 2025 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT); Logan Petrey (LP); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Amanda Felder (AF) – observer; Kathryn Deschenes - Observer

Absent: Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review January 7, 2025 notes
- Recognition of outgoing members: Jerry, Kim, Wood
- Research Priorities (All) - finalize
- 2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD). Discuss review and TR sufficiency
- 2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT). Discuss review and TR sufficiency
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 7, 2025 notes** were approved as written.
- **Recognition of outgoing members:** Farewell to Jerry, Kim, Wood! We'll miss you.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The group reviewed the Handling Research Priorities and suggested modifications. The lead made changes in real time, and will forward the document to the Materials Subcommittee for finalization and submission for the Spring 2025 meeting. The HS spoke specifically about PFAS, phthalates, plasticizers, and commercial availability.
- **2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD).** The lead summarized both the TR sufficiency and the review of ozone. The TR was found sufficient and there were no additional questions for stakeholders in the review.
- **2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT).** The lead summarized both the TR sufficiency and review of kaolin, noting that although it is a mined substance, it is mostly benign. He highlighted two questions to stakeholders regarding use and potential heavy metals.
- **Additional items.** The sunsets that were completed by members who rotate off January 23 will be passed along to new members for presentation at the Spring meeting.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

January 7, 2025

Research Priorities (All) - due to MS by 1.9.25

2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL)

Fish oil - CAS number correction (DN)

January 21, 2025

Research Priorities (All)

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

February 4, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN). Discuss review

Ethylene - Annotation change (NL). Discuss/vote

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL). Discuss/vote

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	2.4.25	Spr 2025

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification proposal	AJ/NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. 2019 TR	12.17.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	Spr 2025
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 9, 2025	1.7.25 1.21.25	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	1.7.25	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite)	1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review:

				TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25.		Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. The TR was found sufficient 1.7.25.	1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021 Tech correction:	12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 2.4.25	" "

Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	“ ”
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	11.19.24	“ ”
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. TR found sufficient 1.21.25	1.21.25	“ ”
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	“ ”
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ ”
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ ”
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	9.17.24	“ ”
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ ”
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ ”

Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024. TR sent to HS 12.6.24. TR suff due 2.4.25. TR found insufficient 12.17.24. HS sent additional questions to TR writer.	12.3.24 12.17.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ “

Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24	“ ”
--------------------------------	------------	----	---	---	----------	-----

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 24, 2025	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, January 7, 2025 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT); Logan Petrey (LP); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Amanda Felder (AF) - observer

Absent: Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review December 17, 2024 notes
- Research Priorities (All) - due to MS by 1.9.25
- 2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review and TR sufficiency
- 2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)
- 2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)
- L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL)
- Fish oil - CAS number correction (DN)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 17, 2024 notes** were approved as written
- **Research Priorities (LP/DN).** Members had a brief discussion about the past research priorities, and will continue the conversation on January 21.
- **2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN).** The lead summarized the review and the TR, and deemed the TR sufficient. He noted it was well written and comprehensive. The HS will forward the review to the NOP for the Spring 2025 meeting, and the HS Chair will let NOP know about the TR.
- **2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate (DN).** The lead summarized the review, and highlighted the minor differences between ammonium bicarbonate and ammonium carbonate. He noted the TR addresses both substances. A member offered to send additional background regarding the different manufacturing processes (Trona vs. Solvay) for calcium chloride, as it has relevance here. The HS will revisit this during the next call to finalize it for the Spring 2025 meeting.
- **L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL).** The lead summarized the history of this project and noted that it was sent back to Subcommittee from the Fall 2024 meeting for additional work, and to allow the community to provide feedback. She noted the two manufacturing processes or pathways to make L-malic acid, and added that the intent of this document is to add L-Malic to the National List as synthetic and add an annotation about commercial availability. Members suggested changes and the lead will make the edits and present the final version at the next meeting.
- **Fish oil - CAS number correction (AJ/DN).** Based on a comment from a stakeholder regarding the CAS numbers for fish oil, the Handling Subcommittee revisited the listing, and determined that they are incorrect, and will put forth a proposal to make a technical correction.

Motion to amend the listing for fish oil to correct the CAS numbers.

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)

2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL)

January 7, 2025

Research Priorities (All) - due to MS by 1.9.25

2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL)

Fish oil - CAS number correction (DN)

January 21, 2025

Research Priorities (All) - due to MS by 1.9.25

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN). Complete review

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN). Complete review

Ethylene - Annotation change (NL). Discuss/vote

L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL). Discuss/vote

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	11.19.24 1.21.25	Spr 2025

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	------------------	----------------

L-Malic acid reclassification proposal	AJ/NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. 2019 TR	12.17.24 1.7.25 1.21.25	Spr 2025
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 9, 2025	1.7.25 1.21.25	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	1.7.25	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25	1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25. The TR was found sufficient 1.7.25.	1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021 Tech correction:	12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24 1.7.25 1.21.25	" "

				TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.		
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25 1.21.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	11.19.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25	1.21.25	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	" "

Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024. TR sent to HS 12.6.24. TR suff due 2.4.25. TR found insufficient 12.17.24. HS	12.3.24 12.17.24	“ “

				sent additional questions to TR writer.		
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	“ ”
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24	“ ”

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 24, 2025	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8

Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post