

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 5, 2016 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Tracy Favre (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Tom Chapman (TC)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Discussion / Vote	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Discuss Jan 19	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Discuss Jan 19	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Discuss Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Discuss Jan 5/Vote Jan 19	TBD
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested	Discuss Jan 19	TBD

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Discussion / Vote	Meeting
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/new NOSB mubr		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.		

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606

Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion scheduled: Reviewed	Summary Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting	Spr 2016

Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Spr 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Spr 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mibr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Discussion Document. Awaiting NOP clarification	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Pectin	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Yeast	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated January 2016	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine plants and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval.	
Research Priorities	ALL	RP's due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. Awaiting NOP approval.	

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the December 15 call
- Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mibr)
- Ancillary substances - pectin and yeast (ZS) - discuss proposals
- Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal
- Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal
- Sunset 2018 Agar-agar (LD) - questions for posting?
- Sunset 2018 Beta Carotene (JR) - questions for posting?
- Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from December 15** were approved with corrections to some unclear language under silicon dioxide.
- **Tocopherols Reclassification.** The lead suggested that based on a re-review of public comment and a subsequent discussion with another Subcommittee member, the HS consider adding tocopherols

to 205.605(a), maintain the listing at 205.605(b), and perhaps add an annotation about availability. The lead reached out to several stakeholders to seek more info and clarification, and the HS will discuss the proposal on a later call. One of the new NOSB members may take the lead on this review once their term starts. The group discussed the mention of rosemary extract in the listing, and feels this needs to be updated.

- **Ancillary substances.** . The lead developed a revised draft based on public input from the last meeting, with some suggestions from NOP. The revised draft includes a definition for ancillary substances and criteria for reviewing ancillary materials that are not mentioned in the original review of a generic substance. The HS will seek additional information before voting on the proposal. Additionally, the HS will forward the draft document to the new HS members whose term begins January 24. Discussion and vote was scheduled for February 2.
- **Hypochlorous Acid.** The group discussed the draft proposal and its format, and the lead reviewer will revise the document accordingly. The group discussed this material as an alternative to chlorine and a member noted that there is broad support in community for hypochlorous acid. The HS scheduled the vote for this material January 19.
- As a corollary to the above discussion, the NOP will modify a new review template and forward it to the NOSB for use with material reviews. This template is a modification of the current checklist but in narrative form. It continues to be based on the OFPA criteria and regulation. The Executive Committee will discuss this new format on January 8.
- **Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS).** Deferred to next call
- **Agar-agar - Sunset 2018 (LD).** The lead summarized the use of the material and noted that it is a marine-plant based material harvested from two different species. Agar agar was reviewed during the 2013 sunset review and was left on the list while waiting for the draft materials guidance. The HS will add questions for public comment regarding new developments and/or unique characteristics of agar agar. The members suggested adding language to indicate that the NOSB is also reviewing marine plants as a group and may hold a panel during the fall 2016 meeting.
- **Beta Carotene - Sunset 2018 (JR).** Beta Carotene was added to the National List in 2007, and annotated in 2009 to allow sources derived from algae. The group discussed various components of the draft proposal, including questions for public comment. The lead mentioned that Beta Carotene is a derivative of algae but the TR was not entirely clear about species. A member added that Beta Carotene is on 205.606, agricultural substances. The lead will modify the draft proposal based on this discussion and recirculate it to the group.
- **Other business** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

December 15, 2015

Sunset 2018 Calcium sulfate - mined - questions for posting?

Sunset 2018 - Tartaric acid - questions for posting?

Sunset 2018 - Animal Enzymes - questions for posting?

Sunset 2018 - Silicon dioxide - questions for posting?

January 5, 2016

Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mbr)

Ancillary substances - pectin and yeast (ZS) - discuss proposals

Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal

Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) – Deferred to next call

Sunset 2018 Agar-agar (LD) - questions for posting
 Sunset 2018 Beta Carotene (JR) - questions for posting
 January 19, 2016 - ZS will miss call due to hydroponic task force field trip. JR and EBR will also miss call.
 Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
 Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR if available
 Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal
 Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA) - Discuss proposal
 Oat Beta-Glucan (LD) - Discuss proposal
 Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mabr)
 Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal and vote
 February 2, 2016
 Ancillary substances – discuss and vote on proposal
 Packaging substances (ZS) - discussion doc
 Xanthan Gum Reclassification (ZS) - Discuss proposal/TR if available
 Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS) - Discuss TR if available
 Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC) - Discuss TR if available
 February 16, 2016
 March 1, 2016
 March 15, 2016
 April 5, 2016
 April 19, 2016
 May 3, 2016
 May 17, 2016
 June 7, 2016
 June 21, 2016
 July 5, 2016
 July 19, 2016
 August 2, 2016
 August 16, 2016
 September 6, 2016
 September 20, 2016
 October 4, 2016
 October 18, 2016
 November 1, 2016
 November 15, 2016
 December 6, 2016
 December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 4, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016

Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 19, 2016 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tom Chapman (TC); Jean Richardson (JR); Scott Rice (SR) - sitting in; A-dae Briones (AB) - sitting in; Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in
Absent: Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 2	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 2	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19	TBD
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested	Jan 19, Feb 16	TBD

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/new NOSB mubr		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.	Feb 2	

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606

Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion scheduled: Reviewed	Summary Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting	Spr 2016

Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Spr 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Spr 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mibr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Discussion Document. Awaiting NOP clarification	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Pectin	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Yeast	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated January 2016	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine plants and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RP's due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. Awaiting NOP approval.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the January 5 call
- Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA). Discuss (waiting for new TR)
- Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS). Discussion (waiting for new TR)
- Petitioned Material - Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal
- Petitioned Material - Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Brief discussion
- Petitioned Material - Oat Beta-Glucan (LD). Discuss proposal
- Petitioned Material - Hypochlorous Acid (AS). Discuss proposal (previously discussed, waiting on "New" template)
- Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from January 5** were approved with no changes.
- **Sunset 2018 cellulose (HA)**. Waiting for new TR. The members discussed the materials' uses and previous review history. There are numerous uses in organic food handling. The lead indicated that

during the previous sunset review there was no source of organic or nonsynthetic cellulose, so the HS is interested in information regarding new sources, or new uses, as well as alternatives. The group discussed the need to alter the annotation (limiting use to powdered form and casings – this would exclude the microcrystalline form), and will wait for the TR before proceeding.

- **Sunset 2018 - potassium hydroxide (AS).** Potassium hydroxide is used in peeling of peaches. A member added that it is used extensively and is also used for nectarines. The HS will request public comment on essentiality and may discuss this again after the TR arrives.
- **Petitioned Material - sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA).** The lead summarized the material and its uses. SDBS is an antimicrobial, and not considered to be GRAS (generally regarded as safe). The petitioner requests addition of this material to the National List as one of two active ingredients in a formulated product that they produce.. There are several health concerns associated with SDBS - mostly concerning the manufacturing and raw material, and the lead noted the incompatibility with some of the OFPA criteria. A member noted the comprehensive and balanced review the lead author compiled based on the petition and background info. Because the review was thorough the Subcommittee feels a TR is not necessary. However, a member raised the option of an annotation to limit the source of production, in which case they may request a TR for supporting scientific information. The group also discussed this material in light of FSMA (Food Safety Modernization Act). A member explained that the use of these types of materials, which are used on ready to eat foods before they are served, may increase. Another member asked if the petitioner included information about the difference between drum drying and spray drying. The HS will defer the vote in order to further research this material.
- **Petitioned Material - oat beta-glucan (LD).** Petitioned by manufacturer for addition to §205.606. The full manufacturing process was initially redacted as Confidential Business Information (CBI), but was later fully disclosed. Oat beta-glucan is used in processed food to increase the fiber content. It has no negative health impacts, and is found to have positive health effects. The lead author noted that it is made from conventional oats, and although organic oat beta-glucan was available at one time, demand was low and the domestic supply was constrained. The lead noted that commercial supply does not depend only on the U.S. market; another member noted that worldwide, the supply of small organic grain is limited. The lead will add language to the review about global sourcing. The members also discussed alternatives, which were included in the petition but found to be less palatable. The HS moved to a vote:

Motion to classify oat beta-glucan as petitioned as agricultural

Motion by: LD

Seconded by: AS

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion to add oat beta-glucan at §205.606

Motion by: LD

Seconded by: JR

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Petitioned Material - hypochlorous acid (AS).** The group discussed the proposal on a previous call and briefly discussed it again before proceeding to a vote. The lead reviewer noted that hypochlorous acid is also under review by Livestock and Crops. Members discussed adding an annotation that the substance must be produced onsite via electrolysis equipment, as this would

mitigate or eliminate any environmental and human health concerns.

Motion to classify hypochlorous acid as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: JR

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion to add hypochlorous acid at §205.605 with the following annotation: produced on-site using electrolysis equipment

Motion by: AS

Seconded by: LD

Additional discussion: Members further discuss the addition of an annotation.

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Petitioned Material - sodium lactate/potassium lactate (HA).** The discussion was deferred to next call. The lead noted that he will be speaking with the petitioner of electrolyzed water as their stakeholder rep and will inform the group about the meeting. He also noted that he discussed this communication with the NOP and the NOP urged the member to have the petitioner submit any comments or information to the public comment docket.
- **Other business** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

January 5, 2016

Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mabr)

Ancillary substances - pectin and yeast (ZS) - discuss proposals

Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal

Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) – Deferred to next call

Sunset 2018 Agar-agar (LD) - questions for posting

Sunset 2018 Beta Carotene (JR) - questions for posting

January 19, 2016 - ZS will miss call due to hydroponic task force field trip. JR and EBR will also miss call.

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available

Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR if available

Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal

Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA) - Discuss proposal

Oat Beta-Glucan (LD) - Discuss proposal

Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mabr)

Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal and vote

February 2, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available

Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Continue discussion if needed and if TR is available

Ancillary substances - discuss and vote on proposal

Packaging substances (ZS) - discussion doc

Xanthan Gum Reclassification (ZS) - Discuss proposal/TR if available
 Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS) - Discuss TR if available
 Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC) - Discuss TR if available
 Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas – Determine petition suff and need for TR

February 16, 2016

Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal and vote

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 2, 2016 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 16	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 16	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested	Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/SR		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.	Feb 16	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606

Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion scheduled: Reviewed	Summary Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16	Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development.	Feb 16	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting. Disc doc	Spr 2016
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mbr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Discussion Document.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Pectin	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Yeast	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16 TR request sent to NOP Feb 5	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RP's due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the January 19 call
- Welcome to new members & Introductions
- Sunset 2018 Materials Discussions:
 - Cellulose (HA) still waiting on TR to arrive.
 - Potassium hydroxide (AS)
 - Carrageenan (ZS)
 - Glucono-delta-lactone (TC) waiting on TR. Preliminary discussion
- Ancillary Substances (ZS). Discussion and vote
- Xanthan gum reclassification (ZS). TR status?, discussion
- Chlorine dioxide gas dry (JR/new member). Petition sufficiency, TR determination
- Tocopherols (TF). Assign to a new member. Discuss status.

- Electrolyzed Water (EW). Brief discussion on status, alignment with other Subcommittees, possible re-vote
- Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals discussion (NVM) (ZS)
- Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from January 19** were approved with one change to the target date for BPA packaging materials.
- **Welcome to new members & introductions**
- **Sunset 2018 Materials Discussions:**
 - **Cellulose (HA).** The HS has a document ready to post but will revisit it if the TR is returned before the due date.
 - **Potassium hydroxide (AS).** The Subcommittee members briefly discussed the substance and the TR, and find the TR sufficient. The HS Chair will notify the NOP.
 - **Carrageenan (ZS).** The lead circulated a booklet to the members regarding food additives, and commented that the booklet provides a very objective discussion. She summarized the background information about carrageenan. Carrageenan has unique gelling properties, and comes in two forms: degraded (polygeenan) and un-degraded. This substance is somewhat controversial and opponents who wish to have carrageenan removed from the National List assert that it has negative human health effects such as inflammation. The lead indicated that although some research supports this, the previous research did not distinguish between the two forms of carrageenan, and scientists disagree about the robustness of the research methodology. The group discussed previous public comments as well as the TR. The lead author noted that several citations were omitted from the recently requested supplemental TR, and therefore the HS has returned it for revision. Various other means by which to glean more information were discussed, including a panel on carrageenan, and the addition of questions to the review document seeking new information from the public and manufacturers.
- **Glucono-delta-lactone (TC).** Waiting for TR. Preliminary discussion deferred to next call.
- **Marine materials (marine algae and extracts).** The lead reviewer indicated that there are nine materials on the National List that fall into this category. The Subcommittee is seeking clarification on the substances, and will include specific questions in the TR request. The HS will also focus on the broader areas of conservation and sustainability. The lead asked that members send comment to her and the HS chair by Friday, February 3.
- **Ancillary Substances (ZS).** Discussion and vote deferred to next call.
- **Xanthan gum reclassification (ZS).** The HS will defer this project to the fall 2016 meeting since the TR is not available.
- **Chlorine dioxide gas dry (JR/new member).** Petition sufficiency, TR determination deferred to next call. JR and SR will circulate a draft document to the group before the next call
- **Tocopherols (TF).** Deferred to next call.
- **Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW).** The group had a very brief discussion about the status of the review, alignment with the other Subcommittees, and a possible re-vote. The HS will discuss this on the next call.
- **Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals discussion (NVM) (ZS).** Deferred to next call. NOP was asked to provide feedback regarding NVM and is hoping to receive that before the next call.
- **Other business.**
 - The HS added a call on February 23, 2016

- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

January 19, 2016 - ZS will miss call due to hydroponic task force field trip. JR and EBR will also miss call.

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR if available
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA) - Discuss proposal
Oat Beta-Glucan (LD) - Discuss proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mibr)
Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal and vote

February 2, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR
Ancillary substances - Discuss and vote on proposal
Xanthan Gum Reclassification (ZS) - Discuss proposal/TR if available
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS) - Discuss TR
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC) - Discuss TR if available
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas - Determine petition suff and need for TR

February 16, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA). Update, TR status
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS). Discuss proposal.
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS). Discuss proposal, TR status
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC). Discuss TR if available
Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW). Discuss. Revote?
Ancillary substances. Discuss and vote on proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification. Discuss and vote
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas. Determine petition suff and need for TR
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote

February 23, 2016

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016
 October 4, 2016
 October 18, 2016
 November 1, 2016
 November 15, 2016
 December 6, 2016
 December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016