Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 5, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Tracy Favre (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Tom Chapman (TC)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussion / Vote**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Discuss Jan 19	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Discuss Jan 19	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Discuss Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Discuss Jan 5/Vote Jan 19	TBD
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested	Discuss Jan 19	TBD

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussion / Vote**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/new NOSB mmbr		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.		

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting	Spr 2016

Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Spr 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Spr 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Discussion Document. Awaiting NOP clarification	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Pectin	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Yeast	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated January 2016	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine plants and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval.	
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. Awaiting NOP approval.	

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the December 15 call
- Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mmbr)
- Ancillary substances - pectin and yeast (ZS) - discuss proposals
- Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal
- Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal
- Sunset 2018 Agar-agar (LD) - questions for posting?
- Sunset 2018 Beta Carotene (JR) - questions for posting?
- Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from December 15** were approved with corrections to some unclear language under silicon dioxide.
- **Tocopherols Reclassification.** The lead suggested that based on a re-review of public comment and a subsequent discussion with another Subcommittee member, the HS consider adding tocopherols

to 205.605(a), maintain the listing at 205.605(b), and perhaps add an annotation about availability. The lead reached out to several stakeholders to seek more info and clarification, and the HS will discuss the proposal on a later call. One of the new NOSB members may take the lead on this review once their term starts. The group discussed the mention of rosemary extract in the listing, and feels this needs to be updated.

- **Ancillary substances.** . The lead developed a revised draft based on public input from the last meeting, with some suggestions from NOP. The revised draft includes a definition for ancillary substances and criteria for reviewing ancillary materials that are not mentioned in the original review of a generic substance. The HS will seek additional information before voting on the proposal. Additionally, the HS will forward the draft document to the new HS members whose term begins January 24. Discussion and vote was scheduled for February 2.
- **Hypochlorous Acid.** The group discussed the draft proposal and its format, and the lead reviewer will revise the document accordingly. The group discussed this material as an alternative to chlorine and a member noted that there is broad support in community for hypochlorous acid. The HS scheduled the vote for this material January 19.
- As a corollary to the above discussion, the NOP will modify a new review template and forward it to the NOSB for use with material reviews. This template is a modification of the current checklist but in narrative form. It continues to be based on the OFPA criteria and regulation. The Executive Committee will discuss this new format on January 8.
- **Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)**. Deferred to next call
- **Agar-agar - Sunset 2018 (LD)**. The lead summarized the use of the material and noted that it is a marine-plant based material harvested from two different species. Agar agar was reviewed during the 2013 sunset review and was left on the list while waiting for the draft materials guidance. The HS will add questions for public comment regarding new developments and/or unique characteristics of agar agar. The members suggested adding language to indicate that the NOSB is also reviewing marine plants as a group and may hold a panel during the fall 2016 meeting.
- **Beta Carotene - Sunset 2018 (JR)**. Beta Carotene was added to the National List in 2007, and annotated in 2009 to allow sources derived from algae. The group discussed various components of the draft proposal, including questions for public comment. The lead mentioned that Beta Carotene is a derivative of algae but the TR was not entirely clear about species. A member added that Beta Carotene is on 205.606, agricultural substances. The lead will modify the draft proposal based on this discussion and recirculate it to the group.
- **Other business** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

December 15, 2015

Sunset 2018 Calcium sulfate - mined - questions for posting?
Sunset 2018 - Tartaric acid - questions for posting?
Sunset 2018 - Animal Enzymes - questions for posting?
Sunset 2018 - Silicon dioxide - questions for posting?

January 5, 2016

Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mmbr)
Ancillary substances - pectin and yeast (ZS) - discuss proposals
Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) – Deferred to next call

Sunset 2018 Agar-agar (LD) - questions for posting
Sunset 2018 Beta Carotene (JR) - questions for posting

January 19, 2016 - ZS will miss call due to hydroponic task force field trip. JR and EBR will also miss call.

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR if available
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA) - Discuss proposal
Oat Beta-Glucan (LD) - Discuss proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mmbr)
Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal and vote

February 2, 2016

Ancillary substances – discuss and vote on proposal
Packaging substances (ZS) - discussion doc
Xanthan Gum Reclassification (ZS) - Discuss proposal/TR if available
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC) - Discuss TR if available

February 16, 2016
March 1, 2016
March 15, 2016
April 5, 2016
April 19, 2016
May 3, 2016
May 17, 2016
June 7, 2016
June 21, 2016
July 5, 2016
July 19, 2016
August 2, 2016
August 16, 2016
September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 4, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016

Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 19, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tom Chapman (TC); Jean Richardson (JR); Scott Rice (SR) - sitting in; A-dae Briones (AB) - sitting in; Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in
Absent: Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 2	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 2	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19	TBD
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested	Jan 19, Feb 16	TBD

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/new NOSB mmbr		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.	Feb 2	

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Feb 2	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting	Spr 2016

Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Spr 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Spr 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Discussion Document. Awaiting NOP clarification	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Pectin	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Yeast	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated January 2016	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine plants and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. Awaiting NOP approval.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the January 5 call
- Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA). Discuss (waiting for new TR)
- Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS). Discussion (waiting for new TR)
- Petitioned Material - Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal
- Petitioned Material - Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Brief discussion
- Petitioned Material - Oat Beta-Glucan (LD). Discuss proposal
- Petitioned Material - Hypochlorous Acid (AS). Discuss proposal (previously discussed, waiting on "New" template)
- Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from January 5** were approved with no changes.
- **Sunset 2018 cellulose (HA).** Waiting for new TR. The members discussed the materials' uses and previous review history. There are numerous uses in organic food handling. The lead indicated that

during the previous sunset review there was no source of organic or nonsynthetic cellulose, so the HS is interested in information regarding new sources, or new uses, as well as alternatives. The group discussed the need to alter the annotation (limiting use to powdered form and casings – this would exclude the microcrystalline form), and will wait for the TR before proceeding.

- **Sunset 2018 - potassium hydroxide (AS).** Potassium hydroxide is used in peeling of peaches. A member added that it is used extensively and is also used for nectarines. The HS will request public comment on essentiality and may discuss this again after the TR arrives.
- **Petitioned Material - sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA)**. The lead summarized the material and its uses. SDBS is an antimicrobial, and not considered to be GRAS (generally regarded as safe). The petitioner requests addition of this material to the National List as one of two active ingredients in a formulated product that they produce.. There are several health concerns associated with SDBS - mostly concerning the manufacturing and raw material, and the lead noted the incompatibility with some of the OFPA criteria. A member noted the comprehensive and balanced review the lead author compiled based on the petition and background info. Because the review was thorough the Subcommittee feels a TR is not necessary. However, a member raised the option of an annotation to limit the source of production, in which case they may request a TR for supporting scientific information. The group also discussed this material in light of FSMA (Food Safety Modernization Act). A member explained that the use of these types of materials, which are used on ready to eat foods before they are served, may increase. Another member asked if the petitioner included information about the difference between drum drying and spray drying. The HS will defer the vote in order to further research this material.
- **Petitioned Material - oat beta-glucan (LD)**. Petitioned by manufacturer for addition to §205.606. The full manufacturing process was initially redacted as Confidential Business Information (CBI), but was later fully disclosed. Oat beta-glucan is used in processed food to increase the fiber content. It has no negative health impacts, and is found to have positive health effects. The lead author noted that it is made from conventional oats, and although organic oat beta-glucan was available at one time, demand was low and the domestic supply was constrained. The lead noted that commercial supply does not depend only on the U.S. market; another member noted that worldwide, the supply of small organic grain is limited. The lead will add language to the review about global sourcing. The members also discussed alternatives, which were included in the petition but found to be less palatable. The HS moved to a vote:

  Motion to classify oat beta-glucan as petitioned as agricultural
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add oat beta-glucan at §205.606
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Petitioned Material - hypochlorous acid (AS)**. The group discussed the proposal on a previous call and briefly discussed it again before proceeding to a vote. The lead reviewer noted that hypochlorous acid is also under review by Livestock and Crops. Members discussed adding an annotation that the substance must be produced onsite via electrolysis equipment, as this would

mitigate or eliminate any environmental and human health concerns.

Motion to classify hypochlorous acid as petitioned as synthetic
Motion by: AS
Seconded by: JR
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

Motion to add hypochlorous acid at §205.605 with the following annotation: produced on-site using electrolysis equipment
Motion by: AS
Seconded by: LD
Additional discussion: Members further discuss the addition of an annotation.
Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Petitioned Material - sodium lactate/potassium lactate (HA)**. The discussion was deferred to next call. The lead noted that he will be speaking with the petitioner of electrolyzed water as their stakeholder rep and will inform the group about the meeting. He also noted that he discussed this communication with the NOP and the NOP urged the member to have the petitioner submit any comments or information to the public comment docket.
- **Other business** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

January 5, 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mmbr)
Ancillary substances - pectin and yeast (ZS) - discuss proposals
Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) – Deferred to next call
Sunset 2018 Agar-agar (LD) - questions for posting
Sunset 2018 Beta Carotene (JR) - questions for posting

January 19, 2016 - ZS will miss call due to hydroponic task force field trip. JR and EBR will also miss call.
Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR if available
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA) - Discuss proposal
Oat Beta-Glucan (LD) - Discuss proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mmbr)
Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal and vote

February 2, 2016
Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Continue discussion if needed and if TR is available
Ancillary substances - discuss and vote on proposal
Packaging substances (ZS) - discussion doc

Xanthan Gum Reclassification (ZS) - Discuss proposal/TR if available
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC) - Discuss TR if available
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas – Determine petition suff and need for TR

February 16, 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal and vote
March 1, 2016
March 15, 2016
April 5, 2016
April 19, 2016
May 3, 2016
May 17, 2016
June 7, 2016
June 21, 2016
July 5, 2016
July 19, 2016
August 2, 2016
August 16, 2016
September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 2, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 16	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 16	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested	Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/SR		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.	Feb 16	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16	Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development.	Feb 16	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting. Disc doc	Spr 2016
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16.Discussion Document.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Pectin	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances - Yeast	ZS	Voted 08 18 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 meeting.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16 TR request sent to NOP Feb 5	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the January 19 call
- Welcome to new members & Introductions
- Sunset 2018 Materials Discussions:
  - Cellulose (HA) still waiting on TR to arrive.
  - Potassium hydroxide (AS)
  - Carrageenan (ZS)
  - Glucono-delta-lactone (TC) waiting on TR. Preliminary discussion
- Ancillary Substances (ZS). Discussion and vote
- Xanthan gum reclassification (ZS). TR status?, discussion
- Chlorine dioxide gas dry (JR/new member). Petition sufficiency, TR determination
- Tocopherols (TF). Assign to a new member. Discuss status.

- Electrolyzed Water (EW). Brief discussion on status, alignment with other Subcommittees, possible re-vote
- Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals discussion (NVM) (ZS)
- Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from January 19** were approved with one change to the target date for BPA packaging materials.
- **Welcome to new members & introductions**
- **Sunset 2018 Materials Discussions:**
    - **Cellulose (HA).** The HS has a document ready to post but will revisit it if the TR is returned before the due date.
    - **Potassium hydroxide (AS).** The Subcommittee members briefly discussed the substance and the TR, and find the TR sufficient. The HS Chair will notify the NOP.
    - **Carrageenan (ZS).** The lead circulated a booklet to the members regarding food additives, and commented that the booklet provides a very objective discussion. She summarized the background information about carrageenan. Carrageenan has unique gelling properties, and comes in two forms: degraded (polygeenan) and un-degraded. This substance is somewhat controversial and opponents who wish to have carrageenan removed from the National List assert that it has negative human health effects such as inflammation. The lead indicated that although some research supports this, the previous research did not distinguish between the two forms of carrageenan, and scientists disagree about the robustness of the research methodology. The group discussed previous public comments as well as the TR. The lead author noted that several citations were omitted from the recently requested supplemental TR, and therefore the HS has returned it for revision. Various other means by which to glean more information were discussed, including a panel on carrageenan, and the addition of questions to the review document seeking new information from the public and manufacturers.
- **Glucono-delta-lactone (TC).** Waiting for TR. Preliminary discussion deferred to next call.
- **Marine materials (marine algae and extracts).** The lead reviewer indicated that there are nine materials on the National List that fall into this category. The Subcommittee is seeking clarification on the substances, and will include specific questions in the TR request. The HS will also focus on the broader areas of conservation and sustainability. The lead asked that members send comment to her and the HS chair by Friday, February 3.
- **Ancillary Substances (ZS).** Discussion and vote deferred to next call.
- **Xanthan gum reclassification (ZS).** The HS will defer this project to the fall 2016 meeting since the TR is not available.
- **Chlorine dioxide gas dry (JR/new member).** Petition sufficiency, TR determination deferred to next call. JR and SR will circulate a draft document to the group before the next call
- **Tocopherols (TF).** Deferred to next call.
- **Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW).** The group had a very brief discussion about the status of the review, alignment with the other Subcommittees, and a possible re-vote. The HS will discuss this on the next call.
- **Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals discussion (NVM) (ZS).** Deferred to next call. NOP was asked to provide feedback regarding NVM and is hoping to receive that before the next call.
- **Other business.**
    - The HS added a call on February 23, 2016

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

January 19, 2016 - ZS will miss call due to hydroponic task force field trip. JR and EBR will also miss call.

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR if available
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA) - Discuss proposal
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA) - Discuss proposal
Oat Beta-Glucan (LD) - Discuss proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification (TF/new NOSB mmbr)
Hypochlorous Acid (AS) - Discuss proposal and vote

February 2, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR
Ancillary substances - Discuss and vote on proposal
Xanthan Gum Reclassification (ZS) - Discuss proposal/TR if available
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS) - Discuss TR
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC) - Discuss TR if available
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas - Determine petition suff and need for TR

February 16, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA). Update, TR status
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS). Discuss proposal.
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS). Discuss proposal, TR status
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC). Discuss TR if available
Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW). Discuss. Revote?
Ancillary substances. Discuss and vote on proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification. Discuss and vote
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas. Determine petition suff and need for TR
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote

February 23, 2016
March 1, 2016
March 15, 2016
April 5, 2016
April 19, 2016
May 3, 2016
May 17, 2016
June 7, 2016
June 21, 2016
July 5, 2016
July 19, 2016
August 2, 2016
August 16, 2016
September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 16, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); A-dae Briones (AB); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in
Absent: Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman (TC)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605, 205.601, and 205.603	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605 (b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested	Jan 19, Feb 23	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/SR		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.	Feb 23	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsed TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 16	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"

Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances procedures	ZS	Proposal	Spr 2016
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16.Discussion Document.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 2 call
- Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA). Update, TR status
- Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS). Discuss proposal.
- Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS). Discuss proposal, TR status
- Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (HA). Discuss TR if available
- Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW). Discuss. Revote?
- Ancillary substances. Discuss and vote on proposal
- Tocopherols Reclassification. Discuss and vote
- Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback

- Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas. Determine petition suff and need for TR
- Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
- Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss 1st draft, final will be ready on the 23rd
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** February 2 approved with minor changes to the table above for the ancillary substances proposal. The proposal will be renamed "ancillary substance procedures" and all ancillary substances (microorganisms, pectin, and yeast) will be included in the one proposal for spring 2016.
- **The HS Chair** reviewed the upcoming deadlines as noted in the table below.
- **Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA).** The TR was found sufficient. The lead summarized the materials' uses and discussed the questions that will be included in the first posting for cellulose.
- **Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS).** The lead gave a brief overview of potassium hydroxide, and the review. The HS Chair will forward the final document to the NOP today.
- **Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS).** The lead author discussed the revised TR and indicated that the questions the HS posed had been satisfactorily answered. Therefore it was found sufficient. Although carrageenan has important functions in food, a number of the organic food companies are moving towards removing it. The lead noted that although the science is not definitive, and scientists disagree about any potential health effects, consumer feedback has incentivized some companies to reformulate their products. Members discussed language in the document, and will put this version forth for public comment at the spring meeting.
- **Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (HA).** The lead summarized the uses of the material and the TR, which was found sufficient. The review document includes questions for which the Handling Subcommittee wishes to receive public comment.
- **Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW) (AS).** The group discussed the proposal that was voted on previously (January 19) and chose to make some modifications so it aligns with both the CS and LS proposals. The HS removed the annotation regarding on site production using electrolysis equipment and the group revoted. The classification motion was made during the January 19 call, and will remain.

  Motion to add **Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water** at §205.605
  Motion by: AS
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Ancillary substances.** The lead summarized feedback that led to modifications to the last draft version of the proposal and the HS proceeded to a vote:

  Motion to adopt the proposal for the definition, criteria for compliance, and procedure for the review of **ancillary substances**
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Tocopherols Reclassification.** Deferred to next call
- **Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS).** Deferred to next call
- **Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR).** The petition was found sufficient, although a member had a number of questions about the substance. The lead indicated the possibility of requesting a limited scope TR to seek additional info. The HS will discuss this on the next call.
- **Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA).** Deferred to next call
- **Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA).** Deferred to next call

The meeting was adjourned

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

February 2, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA) - Discuss TR if available
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS) - Discuss TR
Ancillary substances - Discuss and vote on proposal
Xanthan Gum Reclassification (ZS) - Discuss proposal/TR if available
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS) - Discuss TR
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC) - Discuss TR if available
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas - Determine petition suff and need for TR

February 16, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA). Update, TR status
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS). Discuss proposal.
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS). Discuss proposal, TR status
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC). Discuss TR if available
Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW). Discuss. Revote?
Ancillary substances. Discuss and vote on proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification. Discuss and vote
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas. Determine petition suff and need for TR
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote

February 23, 2016

Tocopherols Reclassification (TF). Discuss and vote
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR). Determine petition suff and need for TR
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote

March 1, 2016
March 15, 2016
April 5, 2016
April 19, 2016
May 3, 2016
May 17, 2016
June 7, 2016
June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016
July 19, 2016
August 2, 2016
August 16, 2016
September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Public comment webinar	Apr 18, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 23, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (AB); Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in
Absent: Jean Richardson (JR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605, 205.601, and 205.603	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested.	Jan 19, Feb 23	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/SR		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16.	Mar 15	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606			Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16.		TBD

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 16	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"

Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances procedures	ZS	Proposal	Spr 2016
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development.	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr	Will re-discuss in light of NOSB meeting.	Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Discussion Document.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16.	TBD
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 16 call
- Tocopherols Reclassification (TF). Discuss and vote

- Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
- Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR). Determine petition suff and need for TR
- Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
- Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** February 16 approved after a change to the name of the person who presented the Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) review.
- **A petition for oat protein concentrate** was sent to the HS on February 17 and added to the workplan above. The HS will assign a lead on the next call
- **Sunset 2018 glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC).** The lead addressed some questions that were posed during the last call. The TR was found sufficient on the February 16 call.
- **Tocopherols reclassification.** The lead summarized the material and public comment, noting the discussion about "natural tocopherols". The group discussed the idea of requesting a limited scope TR and chose to defer the discussion to next call. The lead will add some language to the proposal for consideration by the members, and the proposal will be moved from the spring 2016 meeting to the fall.
- **Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS).** The entire group discussed the draft discussion document and made some edits. The NOP discussed some issues encountered during rulemaking with the prior NVM recommendation, and will provide input to the HS at a future meeting. A member offered to send some language to the HS Chair. The HS moved to a vote on the discussion document and will add more discussion time on the March 15 call.

  Motion to approve the discussion document on Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) as amended
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA).** The HS discussed this material previously (January 19), and the lead summarized the material's uses and how to move forward. Members suggested some modifications and proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to classify Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) as synthetic
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  Motion to list Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) at 205.605
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: TC
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 1 No: 5 Abstain: 1 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA).** The lead summarized the material and its uses. Originally the proposal contained a separate checklist, which the lead then incorporated into the narrative of the proposal. After some minor changes, the document will be recirculated. The HS proceeded to a vote as the modifications will be minor.

  Motion to classify Sodium Lactate and Potassium Lactate as synthetic
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

  Motion to list Sodium Lactate and Potassium Lactate at 205.605(b) with the following annotation: for use as an antimicrobial agent and pH regulator only.
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: TC
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR).** Deferred to next call.
- **Other.** Several members of the Handling Subcommittee will be traveling on March 1, therefore the March 1, 2016 will be cancelled
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

February 16, 2016

Sunset 2018 Cellulose (HA). Update, TR status
Sunset 2018 Potassium hydroxide (AS). Discuss proposal.
Sunset 2018 Carrageenan (ZS). Discuss proposal, TR status
Sunset 2018 Glucono delta-lactone (TC). Discuss TR if available
Hypochlorous Acid/Electrolyzed Water (EW). Discuss. Revote?
Ancillary substances. Discuss and vote on proposal
Tocopherols Reclassification. Discuss and vote
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas. Determine petition suff and need for TR
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote

February 23, 2016

Tocopherols Reclassification (TF). Discuss and vote
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR). Determine petition suff and need for TR
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote

March 1, 2016 - cancelled

March 15, 2016

Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR). Determine petition suff and need for TR

Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Continue discussion and NOP feedback on the economic impact

April 5, 2016
April 19, 2016
May 3, 2016
May 17, 2016
June 7, 2016
June 21, 2016
July 5, 2016
July 19, 2016
August 2, 2016
August 16, 2016
September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Public comment webinar	Apr 18, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, March 15, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (AB); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Jean Richardson (JR); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR); Jessica Walden (JW); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605, 205.601, and 205.603	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested.	Jan 19, Feb 23	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/SR		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner	Mar 15	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606			Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16.	Apr 5	TBD

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 16	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"

Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances procedures	ZS	Proposal	Spr 2016
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development. Expected July 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr		Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Discussion Document.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16.	TBD
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	TC	Sunset date: 05 09 18. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015. TR sent to HS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by HS.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 23 call
- Discuss new member training in D. C.
- New template for petitioned materials proposals
- Assign a lead for oat protein concentrate
- Chlorine dioxide dry gas (SR). Petition sufficiency determination and TR need
- Open Public Comment period
- Nutrient vitamin and minerals (ZS). Continue discussion
- Phosphates (JR & HA). Discuss process to move forward
- Peracetic Acid. Discuss new TR. (2018 Crops sunset material).
- Hypochlorous acid/electrolyzed water proposal. Follow up about spring 2016 proposal
- New agenda items for our summer semester
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from February 23** were approved with no changes
- **Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS).** The group discussed the NVM proposal and the NOP provided some background about the status of the January 2012 proposed rule. This did not get finalized, but instead an Interim Final Rule that renewed the existing listing was published in order to meet the October 2012 sunset deadline. The proposed rule included a cost analysis that was very broad, from $500 million to $1.4 billion. The large range was due to lack of data, and because it involves materials used in a wide array of foods: Infant formula, baby food, pet food, breakfast cereal, and milk. Within each of these categories it was difficult to determine retail sales and how each would be affected. The proposed rule also noted that the estimate may be inflated, depending on outcome of pending petitions to the NOSB for a number of additional nutrients. However, the NOSB did not support addition of most of those substances, thus costs for implementing the final rule remained high. . The group discussed the role of the FDA in regard to regulating baby formula: FDA has specific regulations requiring essential nutrients, and a procedure for case by case review of all formulas to asses other ingredients. Manufactures are continually modifying formulas in order to better replicate breast milk, although FDA has not added additional nutrients as required to their regulations. Formula manufacturers think their products will be viewed as "nutrient inferior", and could exit the organic market if they are restricted to the FDA essential nutrients. A member indicated that this was understood by the NOSB at the time they rejected these additional ingredients, but thinks, the "made with organic" category could be an option. Another member is concerned about the loss of a whole organic product category of infant formula. If NOSB recommends a specific change to the listing for infant formula, additional petitioned nutrients for that use could be considered in that context. . The HS will review public comments and discuss further.
- **New member training recap.** The new NOSB members didn't have any additional questions or follow-up from the training at this time. The hands-on activities about how to conduct a review petitions and TRs proved to be most useful and the members supported expanding that portion of the training.
- **Petitioned Materials Proposals template.** The Chair noted that the updated review template, which was provided to the members earlier this month, will be used from this point forward when writing proposals for petitioned materials.

- **Oat Protein Concentrate.** LD will take the lead for the review of this material, which is similar to oat beta glucan. The HS will complete the petition sufficiency review on next call.
- **Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR).** Petition sufficiency and need for TR. The lead reviewer found the petition sufficient, but had a few additional questions about manufacture and use. The use of buffers in manufacture was not included in the petition, and the group would like more information regarding this. The lead also asked if there was more than one manufacturer of chlorine dry gas. The HS will request additional information from the petitioner before deciding about a need for a TR.
- **Public Comment period.** The comment period will open tomorrow and will close April 14
- **Phosphates (JR & HA). The co-leads found the limited scope Technical Review** sufficient. The leads will work on this further after the spring NOSB meeting. Initial observations indicate that individual materials are not problematic, but the members will also be researching cumulative impacts. The HS Chair will send a note to NOP the TR was found sufficient.
- **Peracetic Acid.** The Crops Subcommittee is reviewing peracetic acid for its 2018 sunset review, although Handling and Livestock also received TRs for this material. Both Handling and Livestock completed reviews for this material recently, therefore they will review the new TR for sufficiency and hold further review at this time.
- **Hypochlorous acid/electrolyzed water.** The Chair reminded the members that initially the hypochlorous acid proposal incorporated the new narrative form of the checklist, but to maintain consistency with the other proposals for the spring meeting, the previous checklist format was included.
- **New work agenda items.** Deferred to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

February 23, 2016

Tocopherols Reclassification (TF). Discuss and vote
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Discuss NOP feedback
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR). Determine petition suff and need for TR
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (HA). Discuss proposal and vote
Sodium Lactate/Potassium Lactate (HA). Discuss proposal and vote

March 1, 2016 - cancelled

March 15, 2016

Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR). Determine petition suff and need for TR
Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Continue discussion and NOP feedback on the economic impact

April 5, 2016

Oat Protein Concentrate. Petition sufficiency

April 18, 2016. Note: Call moved to Monday

Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Continue discussion

May 3, 2016 - cancelled
May 17, 2016
June 7, 2016
June 21, 2016
July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016
August 2, 2016
August 16, 2016
September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 16, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 14, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Public comment webinar	Apr 18, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 5, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (AB); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Jean Richardson (JR); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in; Harriet Behar - sitting in
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605, 205.601, and 205.603	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested.	Jan 19, Feb 23	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/SR		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner	Mar 15, Apr 5	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606		N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	Apr 5	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 16	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"

Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances procedures	ZS	Proposal	Spr 2016
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development. Expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr		Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Discussion Document.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016	TBD
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	TC	Sunset date: 05 09 18. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015. TR sent to HS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by HS. TR suff 04 18 16	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the March 15 call
- Oat Protein Concentrate (LD) - Petition sufficiency and TR
- Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR) - continue discussion
- Research priorities for Handling - initial discussion
- Public comment discussion
- TR sufficiency for peracetic acid (HA) - April 18
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** March 15 were approved with no changes
- **Oat Protein Concentrate (LD).** The lead noted that this substance is similar to oat beta glucan, which was recently petitioned. The petition was found sufficient and the HS does not see a need for a TR. The Chair will inform the NOP and the HS scheduled the discussion of the proposal for May 17.
- **Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR).** The petitioner requests the use of a process and not a material per se. The group discussed the possibility of having the petitioner resubmit the petition with a revised scope. The lead will provide some language and the HS will inform the NOP of its request to have the petitioner revise the petition to focus on the substances involved in the process.
- **Research priorities for Handling.** The NOSB Chair offered information gleaned from a recent call she participated in with the USDA Organic Policy Advisor and members of the OWG to discuss research priorities and funding. Two key issues were the length and specificity of the list of Research Priorities and the lack of a vehicle for system-based research needs. The OWG requested that the NOSB be more concise and focused when putting forth its research needs, as this will help when communicating funding needs to funding agencies and sources. Additionally, the OWG supports the idea of retaining previous recommendations on the list depending on whether or not they have been addressed and whether they are still necessary and relevant. Members discussed the path forward and will continue discussing this topic after the spring NOSB meeting.
- **Public comment discussion.** The group discussed the various comments received so far. There are a number of comments pertaining to carrageenan, most in support of retention of the material on the list. The group briefly discussed ancillary substances as well, although there are very few comments at this time.
- **TR sufficiency for peracetic acid (HA).** TR sufficiency discussion scheduled for April 18
- **Additional items.**
    - The Chair noted the future call schedule, and asked that the members let NOP know by if they will present their materials in a format other than the posted pdf proposal/discussion document at the meeting. If so, the NOP would like those presentations by Sunday, April 24.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

March 15, 2016

Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas (SR). Determine petition suff and need for TR

Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Continue discussion and NOP feedback on the economic impact

April 5, 2016

Oat Protein Concentrate. Petition sufficiency

April 18, 2016. Note: Call moved to Monday

Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Continue discussion

TR sufficiency for peracetic acid (TC)

May 3, 2016 - cancelled

May 17, 2016

Oat Protein Concentrate (LD) - discuss proposal

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 16, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 14, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment webinar	Apr 19, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 18, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tom Chapman (TC); Jean Richardson (JR); Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in; Harriet Behar - sitting in
Absent: Lisa de Lima (LD); A-dae Briones (AB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15. Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15 Referred back to HS at fall 2015 NOSB mtg.	Feb 23	Spr 2016
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD	N	Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15. Petition found sufficient 09 15 15. No TR will be requested.	Jan 19	Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605, 205.601, and 205.603	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR found suff 12 01 15.	Jan 5, Jan 19, Feb 16	Spr 2016
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested.	Jan 19, Feb 23	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Chlorine Dioxide Dry Gas	205.605	JR/SR		Petition sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Addendum from petitioner received 4 21 16 and posted to website.	Mar 15, Apr 5	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606		N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	Apr 5	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled: Reviewed**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Feb 16	"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"

Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jan 19, Feb 2, Feb 16	"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Dec 15	"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jan 5	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances procedures	ZS	Proposal	Spr 2016
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development. Expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/New NOSB mmbr		Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Discussion Document.	Spr 2016
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016	TBD
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	TC	Sunset date: 05 09 18. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015. TR sent to HS 03 04 16. Response due ~ May 3 (date flexible) as this is not currently under review by HS. TR suff 04 18 16. TR found suff 04 18 16	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the April 5 call
- Discuss public comments
- TR sufficiency for peracetic acid (TC)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from April 5** were approved with no changes
- **Discuss public comments**
    - **Carrageenan:** The lead summarized the written comments and the group discussed various aspects of the material. Two researchers, one on either side of the argument, will be on the public comment webinar tomorrow to provide oral comment. Members discussed the need to weigh the scientific evidence and consumer interests along with the review criteria.
    - **Hypochlorous acid:** Commenters have raised concerns about sources, although the Board focus is on electrolyzed water. The NOP supports the addition of "as petitioned" to the proposal to clarify.
    - **Sodium & Potassium Lactate:** A commenter raised an issue regarding calcium lactate and requested that the Board discuss this. This material was not included in the petition or the technical review so, while similar, it would need to be petitioned separately.

  TR sufficiency for peracetic acid (TC). The lead was not able to join the call, but sent his initial review via email, finding the TR sufficient. The NOP clarified some information regarding uses of peracetic acid. The TR identified the approved FDA sanitizing solutions, a number of which contain peracetic acid and other chemicals. Not all the FDA approved solutions are suitable for organic use in direct contact with product. This does not impact the NOSB review, as they are reviewing peracetic acid as a single substance, and there is no restriction on manufacture or source.
- **Additional items**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

April 5, 2016

Oat Protein Concentrate. Petition sufficiency

April 18, 2016. Note: Call moved to Monday

Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Continue discussion

TR sufficiency for peracetic acid (TC)

May 3, 2016 - cancelled

May 17, 2016

Oat Protein Concentrate (LD) - discuss proposal

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 29, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 16, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment closes	Apr 14, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 18, 2016
Public comment webinar	Apr 19, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, May 17, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tracy Favre (TF) - observer; Harriet Behar - observer
Absent: Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16	TBD	Fall 2016
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR		Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due?	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 18	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016

Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, and Aug 2	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 21	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jun 21	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/?	Review scheduled Jul 19	Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD

Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. Proposal?	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	TC	Sunset date: 05 09 18. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015. TR sent to HS 03 04 16. TR suff 04 18 16. TR found suff 04 18 16.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the April 18 call
- Recap NOSB April 2016 meeting (ALL)
- Schedule materials/assign call dates for discussion for summer (ALL)
- Oat Protein Concentrate (LD) - discuss proposal
- Discuss Sodium Chlorite (SR) (originally petitioned as chlorine dioxide dry gas). Assign lead, set a date for Petition sufficiency
- Sodium Dodecyl benzene Sulfonate next steps (HA)
- Discuss Xanthan gum TR sufficiency (due 6-21) (ZS)
- Ancillary Substances (ZS)
- Research Priorities (TC)
- Tocopherols status (TF?)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from April 18 approved with no changes.**
- **NOSB April 2016 meeting recap (ALL).** Members discussed the spring meeting including the process for reviewing ancillary substances going forth. See below for discussion.
    - **Ancillary Substances (ZS).** The review of ancillary substances will begin with the 2018 sunset materials. The members discussed best practices for including information in the proposals, and will likely include a statement about whether or not there are ancillaries, and if so, how they were addressed. For ancillary substances that are not allowed, the Subcommittee will initiate a separate proposal. This process will be referred to the Policy Development Subcommittee for addition to the PPM
    - **Sodium Dodecyl benzene Sulfonate (SDBS).** SDBS was referred back to Subcommittee at spring NOSB meeting. The group discussed at length the material and the path forward and will request a Technical Report.

- **Schedule materials/assign call dates for discussion for summer (ALL).** See work agenda tables for scheduled discussion dates.
- **Oat Protein Concentrate (LD).** The lead summarized the material and the petitioned use and the members discussed the proposal and voted. This substance is very similar to oat beta glucan, which the Subcommittee did not recommended for listing. The HS did not find claims of commercial unavailability compelling, and noted that organic oats are available in the EU.

  Motion to classify Oat Protein Concentrate as petitioned as agricultural
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: TC
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add Oat Protein Concentrate as petitioned at §205.606
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: SR
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Sodium Chlorite for generation of chlorine dioxide (SR).** Originally petitioned as chlorine dioxide dry gas. Petition sufficiency was scheduled for June 7, and the proposal discussion for August 16.
- **Sodium Dodecyl benzene Sulfonate next steps (HA).** As noted about, the HS will request a TR.
- **Discuss Xanthan gum TR sufficiency (due 6-21) (ZS).** Scheduled for June 7
- **Research Priorities (TC).** The HS will review previous topics to determine what is still relevant and what should go forward, as well as propose any new topics.
- **Tocopherols status (TF?).** Deferred
- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

April 18, 2016. Note: Call moved to Monday
  Nutrient Vitamin and Minerals (NVM) (ZS). Continue discussion
  TR sufficiency for peracetic acid (TC)
May 3, 2016 - cancelled
May 17, 2016
  Oat Protein Concentrate (LD) - discuss proposal
June 7, 2016
  Agar agar (LD) - discuss and vote
  Animal Enzymes (LD) - discuss and vote
  Silicon dioxide (LD) - discuss and vote
  Xanthan Gum (ZS) - reclassification
  Sodium Chlorite (SR) - petition sufficiency
  Cellulose (HA) - discuss and vote

Research Priorities (All)

June 21, 2016

Research Priorities (All)

Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote

Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote

Colors: Beta-carotene extract (JR) - discuss and vote

July 5, 2016

Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss

Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote

Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

Carrageenan (ZS) -- discuss and vote

August 16, 2016

Sodium Chlorite (SR) - Discuss proposal

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinars	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 7, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tracy Favre (TF) - observer; Harriet Behar - observer
Absent: Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16.	TBD	Fall 2016
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR		Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016

Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, and Aug 2	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 21	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jun 21	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD			Jun 21	"

Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS			Jun 21	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS			Jun 21	"
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS			Jun 21	"
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	?		Jun 21	"
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	?		Jun 21	"
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS			Jun 21	"
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	"
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Konjac flour	205.606	SR			Jun 21	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC			Jun 21	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/?	Review scheduled Jul 19	Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD

Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. Proposal?	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	TC	Sunset date: 05 09 18. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015. TR sent to HS 03 04 16. TR suff 04 18 16. TR found suff 04 18 16.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the May 17
- Agar agar (LD) - discuss and vote
- Animal Enzymes (LD) - discuss and vote
- Silicon dioxide (LD) - discuss and vote
- Xanthan Gum (ZS) - reclassification
- Sodium Chlorite (SR) - petition sufficiency
- Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft version
- Research Priorities (All)
- Discuss 2019 Sunset materials review
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from May 17** approved with no changes
- **Agar agar (LD).** The lead summarized the material and its uses. There was discussion about whether the manufacturing process involved synthetic processes, and the group agreed to wait until the Classification of materials final guidance is published. The group revised some minor language in the draft proposal and proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to remove agar agar from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Silicon dioxide (LD).** The lead summarized silicon dioxide for the group. It has a variety of uses including as an anticaking agent, a stabilizer in beer, and a defoaming agent. Public commenters also noted it is used to meter seed during the seed-pelleting process. The group also discussed

public comments that suggested the Subcommittee revisit the original NOSB recommendation, which did not limit the only organic (or non-synthetic) option to rice hulls. The HS will include language in the proposal asking for clarification about this. The lead indicated that it is a fairly benign material and there was no new information since the last review

Motion to remove silicon dioxide from 205.605(b)
Motion by: LD
Seconded by: TC
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Animal enzymes (LD).** The lead summarized the material and its uses, noting that it is straightforward. During the first posting for the sunset review, the Subcommittee included a list of ancillary substances and received no feedback other than for the material itself. The group further discussed ancillary substances. The NOP will provide some additional information about whether any of the ancillary substances in the table are on the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) or the National Toxicology Program (NTP) lists. The Subcommittee plans to include a request for ancillary substances to be reviewed according to the new assessment criteria when TRs are requested in the future.

Motion to remove animal enzymes from 205.605(a)
Motion by: LD
Seconded by: AS
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Xanthan Gum (ZS).** The HS received a TR that focused on manufacturing, which they found sufficient. At this time, and in light of the TR, the HS decided that xanthan gum does not warrant reclassification. The Subcommittee will consult with the NOP about how to close the loop so future Boards know that reclassification was considered but was deemed unnecessary.
- **Sodium Chlorite for the purpose of generating chlorine dioxide gas (SR).** The lead summarized the material and its uses, and discussed information supplied after the first review of the petition. The petition was found sufficient, and the proposal was scheduled for discussion and vote in August.
- **Cellulose (HA).** Deferred to next call.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The group discussed the draft compilation document sent by the Materials Subcommittee, which included the previous research priorities. Several members felt that some of the previous priorities are still pertinent but perhaps not attainable at this time, while others could be removed because they are being researched already. The Subcommittee will discuss this and any new priorities at the start of the next call.
- **2019 Sunset materials review.** The group assigned leads for all materials and will proceed with TR determinations by June 21.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)
May 17, 2016

Oat Protein Concentrate (LD) - discuss proposal

June 7, 2016

Agar agar (LD) - discuss and vote
Animal Enzymes (LD) - discuss and vote
Silicon dioxide (LD) - discuss and vote
Xanthan Gum (ZS) - reclassification
Sodium Chlorite (SR) - petition sufficiency
Cellulose (HA) - discuss and vote
Research Priorities (All)

June 21, 2016

Research Priorities (Research Priorities (All))
Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft
Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
2019 Sunset materials - TR determinations
2018 Sunset materials - Colors: Beta-carotene extract (JR) - discuss and vote

July 5, 2016

Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

Carrageenan (ZS) -- discuss and vote

August 16, 2016

Sodium Chlorite (SR) - Discuss proposal

September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016

Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 21, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR); Tracy Favre (TF) - observer
Absent: A-dae Briones (AB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16. TR in development.	TBD	Fall 2016
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR		Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016

Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, and Aug 2	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21, Jul 5	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"

Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	Low Priority		Jun 21	"
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	Low priority		Jun 21	"
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	"
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Konjac flour	205.606	SR	N		Jun 21	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC	N		Jun 21	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize. NOP determined that a verbal update at the fall 2016 meeting would suffice. HS will submit written update at fall meeting.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/?	Review scheduled Jul 19	Fall 2016

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. Proposal?	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	TC	Sunset date: 05 09 18. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015. TR sent to HS 03 04 16. TR suff 04 18 16. TR found suff 04 18 16.	TBD
Research Priorities	ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the June 7
- Carrageenan update
- Research priorities discussion (Due July 8th)
- Xanthan gum discussion
- 2019 Sunset materials - TR determinations
- 2018 Sunset materials
    - Colors: Beta-carotene extract (JR) - discuss and vote
    - Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft and ancillaries
    - Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
    - Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
- Discuss "Other Projects"
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from June 7** were approved with no changes
- **Update on TRs (JW).** There are two outstanding TRs that are due in mid-July: Marine materials and BPA (packaging substances). The TR for SDBS has not yet been initiated. It can be moved forward if there are no higher priorities.
- **Carrageenan.** Reference material presented during public comment at the spring 2016 meeting was requested by lead author, and should be available in early August. The group would like to be able to cite the paper, but since the researcher discussed the data at the spring meeting the Subcommittee has already incorporated it into their preliminary discussions.
- **Research priorities.** The group discussed the draft list of research priorities, and what projects to retain, remove, or add. Members agreed that carrageenan and perhaps BPA could be removed since they are both already being researched. The Subcommittee is waiting for a TR on BPA and

packaging materials that will help inform their decision to retain it or remove it from the priorities list. The group also chose to retain the project on consumer demand, which is more of a marketing/sociological project and not scientific research, as well as chlorine materials.

- **Xanthan gum.** During a prior discussion, the HS determined that a reclassification of xanthan gum was not necessary and therefore will not proceed with this project. The HS would like to provide a written update at the meeting, so there is a written account of the project for the public and future Boards, in the event that it is revisited.
- **Peracetic acid (TC).** The TR was found sufficient but since it will not be reviewed until 2018, it will be removed from the work agenda for now.
- **2019 Sunset materials.** The group discussed the 2019 sunset materials and determined the need for TRs' See table above.
- **Animal Enzymes (LD).** The NOP provided some additional information about whether any of the ancillary substances in the table that was included in the draft proposal are on the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) or the National Toxicology Program (NTP) lists. The lead will include the information regarding several ancillary substances (talc, asbestos, mineral oil) in the proposal.
- **2018 Sunset materials**
    - **Colors: Beta-carotene extract (JR).** The lead reviewed the material and comments from the public, and the Subcommittee proceeded to a vote.

      Motion to remove beta-carotene extract from §205.606
      Motion by: JR
      Seconded by: AS
      Additional discussion: A member asked if they received any feedback about source and quality, since there were two different sources mentioned? i.e. does seaweed provide a richer color than carrots?
      Yes: 2 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

    - **Cellulose (HA).** The lead summarized the material, including the information gleaned from the 2016 TR, and ancillary substances. The group discussed uses of cellulose as anticaking agent. The vote was deferred to the next meeting in the interest of time.
    - **Tartaric acid (AS).** Deferred to next call
    - **Potassium Hydroxide (AS).** Deferred to next call
- **Other Projects.** Deferred to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

June 7, 2016

Agar agar (LD) - discuss and vote
Animal Enzymes (LD) - discuss and vote
Silicon dioxide (LD) - discuss and vote
Xanthan Gum (ZS) - reclassification
Sodium Chlorite (SR) - petition sufficiency
Cellulose (HA) - discuss and vote

Research Priorities (All)

June 21, 2016

Research Priorities (Research Priorities (All))
Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft
Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
2019 Sunset materials - TR determinations
2018 Sunset materials - Colors: Beta-carotene extract (JR) - discuss and vote

July 5, 2016

Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft proposal
Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote

August 16, 2016

Sodium Chlorite (SR) - discuss proposal

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sept 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, July 5, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF) - observer
Absent: A-dae Briones (AB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16. TR in development.	TBD	Fall 2016
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR		Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016

Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, and Aug 2	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21, Jul 5	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"

Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	"
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Konjac flour	205.606	SR	N		Jun 21	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC	N		Jun 21	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize. NOP determined that a verbal update at the fall 2016 meeting would suffice. HS will submit written update at fall meeting.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/?	Review scheduled Jul 19	Fall 2016

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD
Phosphates annotation change	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. Discussion document	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is done.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the June 21
- Recap Research Priorities
- Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft proposal
- Animal Enzymes (LD) - Discuss Ancillary re-write (already voted on)
- Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
- Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
- Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss
- Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
- Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote
- Sodium Dodecylbenzene Sulfonate (HA) - update on TR request, assign a new lead who will be on the Board in the spring of 2017
- Review workload
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from June 21 approved with no changes.**
- **Research Priorities.** The group discussed the Handling research priorities including the following: updates to the topic of consumer demand, an as-yet-to-be-written priority for two chlorine materials, and celery powder alternatives. A member noted that there is an industry group currently working on alternatives to celery powder, and although the NOSB should keep it on the list of priorities, it could be a lower priority than others. The lead will incorporate the changes into the current Research Priorities document.
- **Cellulose (HA).** The members discussed cellulose and will add some questions to the proposal regarding need, use, and ancillary substances. The lead will incorporate information regarding the ancillary substances mineral oil and natomycin.

Motion to remove cellulose from §205.605(b) Cellulose - for use in regenerative casings, as an anti-caking agent (non-chlorine bleached) and filtering aid.
Motion by: HA
Seconded by: LD
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 1 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Animal Enzymes (LD).** The lead modified the previous document (discussed and voted on during the June 7 call) to include information regarding ancillary substances. The group accepted the modifications and will submit the document as final.

- **Tartaric acid (AS).** The lead noted that tartaric acid has many uses, such as a pH control, a preservative, a stabilizer, in baked goods, and in wine. The group discussed its use in wine, as it is used both in making wine and as a product of wine-making. The HS added questions to the proposal regarding essentiality.

  Motion to remove tartaric acid from §205.605(a)
  Motion by: AS
  Seconded by: ZS
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Potassium hydroxide (AS).** The lead summarized the material and its uses. The proposal addresses public comment received during the Spring 2016 NOSB meeting, including the suggestion of an annotation.

  Motion to remove potassium hydroxide from §205.605(b)
  Motion by: AS
  Seconded by: SR
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Carrageenan (ZS).** The lead circulated the Powerpoint presentation that was provided during the Spring 2016 NOSB meeting, and the group discussed the salient points. The group discussed necessity, environmental concerns, alternatives, consumer demand, and the scientific research. Members discussed the possibility of adding an annotation, and will explore this further on the August 2 call.

- **Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC).** Deferred to Aug 2
- **Calcium Sulfate - mined (TC).** Deferred to Aug 2
- **Sodium Dodecylbenzene Sulfonate (HA).** The TR is due in October, and because the current lead will rotate off the Board in January, asked for a volunteer to take over as lead reviewer.
- **Review workload.** Deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

June 21, 2016

- Research Priorities (All)
- Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft
- Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
- Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
- 2019 Sunset materials - TR determinations
- 2018 Sunset materials - Colors: Beta-carotene extract (JR) - discuss and vote

July 5, 2016

- Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft proposal
- Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
- Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
- Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss
- Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
- Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote

July 19, 2016

- Review workload

August 2, 2016

- Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
- Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote
- Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
- Phosphates annotation change - discuss

August 16, 2016

- Sodium Chlorite (SR) - discuss proposal

September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sept 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016

Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, July 19, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR)
Absent: A-dae Briones (AB); Tom Chapman (TC)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA/ LD	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16. TR in development.	TBD	Spr 2017
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR	N	Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016

Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, and Aug 2	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21, Jul 5	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"

Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	"
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Konjac flour	205.606	SR	N		Jun 21	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC	N		Jun 21	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize. NOP determined that a verbal update at the fall 2016 meeting would suffice. HS will submit written update at fall meeting.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/?	Review scheduled Aug 2	Fall 2016

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD
Phosphates - discussion doc. Potential future annotation change?	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. Discussion Document	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is available.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the July 5
- Review workload for remaining calls
- Discuss status of open public comment period
- Discuss NOP work agenda items
- Follow up re: Exec call and FOIA discussion
- Tocopherol discussion (TF/?) - discuss proposal
- SDBS (HA) -discuss TR and re-assigning this material.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from July 5 were approved with a change to the document type for the phosphates annotation change.**
- **Workload review for remaining calls.**
  - **SDBS** - TR is in development. LD volunteered to take over as lead reviewer when HA rotates off the NOSB in January.
  - **BPA** - TR is in development and was due at the beginning of July, but not yet received.
  - **Xanthan gum reclassification.** The HS will prepare a written paragraph, which will be posted with the other proposals.
  - **Phosphates -** Discussion is scheduled for August 2, but the HS will discuss the preliminary draft (see below for discussion)
  - **NVM (ZS) -** Discussion deferred to later call
  - **Magnesium chloride (JR) -** NOP has sent TR out for bids and it has not yet been contracted.
  - **Tocopherols (TF) -** TR in development
  - **Carrageenan (ZS) -** Discussion and vote scheduled for Aug 2 and possibly Aug 16.
  - **Marine materials (JR) -** TR is in development and was due at the beginning of July, but not yet received.

- **Open public comment period** - The Federal register notice is in clearance and should publish in the next 1-2 weeks.
- **NOP work agenda items (Operating Plan).** Once it is completed, the plan will be sent to the NOSB for feedback on additional priorities. The Subcommittees were invited to suggest 1-2 top priority items for 2017 or beyond.
- **Follow up re: Exec call and FOIA discussion.** The Chair briefly summarized the FOIA process and relayed the information to the Subcommittee members about FOIA requests regarding Board related deliberative documents.
- **Tocopherol discussion (TF/?) -** Discussion deferred
- **Phosphates - preliminary discussion.** The lead circulated a draft document and opened up a dialogue. HS members discussed the document and suggested some edits to the questions. The lead will incorporate the changes and recirculate the updated draft for the next HS call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

July 5, 2016

Cellulose (HA) - discuss draft proposal
Tartaric acid (AS) - discuss and vote
Potassium Hydroxide (AS) - discuss and vote
Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote

July 19, 2016

Review workload
Phosphates annotation change - preliminary discussion

August 2, 2016

Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote
Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
Phosphates annotation change - discussion
Tocopherols (TF) - discussion

August 16, 2016

Sodium Chlorite (SR) - discuss proposal
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts) discussion document - preliminary discussion

September 6, 2016
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	June/TBD
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sept 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sept 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sept 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 2, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR); Tom Chapman (TC); Harriet Behar (HB) - observing
Absent: A-dae Briones (AB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA/ LD	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16. TR in development.	TBD	Spr 2017
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR	N	Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016

Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, Aug 2, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21, Jul 5	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"

Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	"
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Konjac flour	205.606	SR	N		Jun 21	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC	N		Jun 21	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected Jul 2016	Disc Doc Fall 2016
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize. NOP determined that a verbal update at the fall 2016 meeting would suffice. HS will submit written update at fall meeting.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/?	Review scheduled Aug 16	Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD

Phosphates - discussion doc. Potential future annotation change?	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16.	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts)	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. Discussion Document	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is available.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the July 19
- Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
- Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote
- Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
- Phosphates annotation change - discussion
- Tocopherols (TF) - discussion
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from July 19** approved with one change to the entry for phosphates. The HS will present a discussion document at the Fall 2016 meeting, and will not propose an annotation change.
- **Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC).** GDL is used in tofu manufacture. The lead noted that the comments were fairly straight forward, although some commenters had concerns about the use of the GMO substrate in some production methods. The HS considers this substance to satisfy OFPA criteria and support retaining it on the National List.

  Motion to remove glucono delta-lactone (GDL) from the National List.
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 1 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Calcium Sulfate (TC).** The lead summarized the material and noted it is similar to gypsum. Calcium sulfate is used in tofu manufacture, as well as a host of other things. The lead summarized the public comment and indicated that there have been no changes in use to warrant removal. The HS proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to remove calcium sulfate from the National List.
  Motion by: TC

Seconded by: AS
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Carrageenan (ZS).** The lead summarized the draft proposal and an analysis of the scientific literature. The HS requested many articles that were cited by various public commenters, and the group discussed the accuracy of the science. Members discussed the pertinent OFPA criteria, the regulation, and alternatives. Several members will provide modified language to the proposal, and the lead will complete the draft document for voting on the next call.

- **Phosphates (JR).** The lead circulated a revised version of the draft document and the group discussed the suggested edits. There were no substantive changes since the last draft, and some questions were eliminated to make it more useful for public comment. The lead will make additional edits based on today's discussion and will recirculate the document. The HS will vote on the next call.

- **Tocopherols (TF).** Deferred to next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

July 19, 2016
Review workload
Phosphates annotation change - preliminary discussion
August 2, 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote
Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
Phosphates - discussion
Tocopherols (TF) - discussion
August 16, 2016
Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
Tocopherols (TF) - discussion
Phosphates - discussion and vote
Sodium chlorite (SR) - discuss proposal
September 6, 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts) discussion document - preliminary discussion
September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016 - cancelled
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 1, 2016
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sep 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sep 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 16, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB): Harriet Behar (HB) - observer; Tracy Favre (TF) - observer
Absent: Tom Chapman (TC)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA/ LD	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16. TR in development.	TBD	Spr 2017
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR	N	Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016

Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, Aug 2, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21, Jul 5	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"

Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	"
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Konjac flour	205.606	SR	N		Jun 21	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC	N		Jun 21	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected Aug 2016	Disc Doc Spring 2017
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize. NOP determined that a verbal update at the fall 2016 meeting would suffice. HS will submit written update at fall meeting.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF/?	Review scheduled Sep 6	Fall 2016

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD
Phosphates - discussion doc. Potential future annotation change?	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16. Vote: 08 16 16	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts). Discussion doc	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is available.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL		NA

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve notes from the August 2
- Tocopherols (TF) - discussion only
- Sodium Chlorite (SR) - discuss proposal and vote if ready
- Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
- Phosphates (HA) - discuss and vote on document
- BPA and Marine Materials - Discuss status and possible alternative time tables while TRs are still in development.
- Xanthan Gum - discuss written update for Fall 2016 meeting
- NOPs operating Plan - Discuss NOP's request for feedback and guidance
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** August 2 were approved with no changes.
- **Tocopherols (TF).** Currently tocopherols are listed at 205.605(b) as synthetic. The lead summarized the justification for re-classification of tocopherols, and the intention to add it to 205.605(a). The Subcommittee feels this is a worthy project, and although it is not urgent, the proposal is in development, and the HS will complete it for the Fall 2016 meeting.
- **Sodium Chlorite (SR).** The lead summarized the petition, and highlighted the difference between the current petition and the previous submission. Sodium chlorite is being petitioned for application as a gas into an enclosed storage area to prevent spoilage and pathogens. A member suggested the addition of citations to the proposal from the TR/petition. Another member added that there is acidified sodium chlorite on the list used for this purpose, but that sodium chlorite may be a better alternative to it. The lead author will add citations, add the votes, and resend to the document to the Subcommittee for review. The HS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to classify sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas as synthetic, non-agricultural
Motion by: SR
Seconded by: JR
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, as petitioned, at §205.605(b)
Motion by: SR
Seconded by: AS
Additional discussion: none
Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Phosphates (HA).** The lead modified the document as discussed during the last call and the group moved to a vote.

  Motion to send the discussion document on phosphates to the full Board for consideration.
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion:
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Carrageenan (ZS).** The Handling Subcommittee reviewed the draft document that contained suggestions and edits from members. The group modified some language in the current document. Members discussed an annotation regarding the use in gel caps, so if the NOSB votes to allow carageenan to remain on the National List, then a member may bring forth a petition to annotate. Alternatively, if the NOSB votes to remove it, it could be re-petitioned for specific uses only.

  Motion to remove Carrageenan from §205.605(a) based on OFPA criteria [§6518(m)(6)] - availability of alternatives.
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion: Members discussed the justification in the proposal for alternatives, and felt that although it is mentioned, it was not emphasized.
  Yes: 5 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **BPA and Marine Materials.** The TR for BPA is overdue, and it will likely not be available in time to complete a discussion document for the Fall 2016 meeting. The TR for marine materials was recently sent to the HS and the lead noted that from a cursory review it is adequate. The group will discuss this further on the next call.

- **Xanthan Gum.** Deferred to next call.
- **NOPs operating Plan.** Deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

August 2, 2016

- Glucono delta-lactone (GDL) (TC) - discuss and vote
- Calcium Sulfate (TC) - discuss and vote
- Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
- Phosphates - discussion
- Tocopherols (TF) - discussion

August 16, 2016

- Carrageenan (ZS) - discuss and vote
- Tocopherols (TF) - discussion
- Phosphates - discussion and vote
- Sodium chlorite (SR) - discuss proposal

September 6, 2016

- Tocopherols (TF) - discuss proposal and vote
- Marine materials (marine algae and extracts) discussion document - preliminary discussion, TR sufficiency
- Xanthan Gum - discuss written update for Fall 2016 meeting
- NOPs operating Plan - Discuss NOP's request for feedback and guidance

September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016 - cancelled (NOSB Meeting)
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 1, 2016
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sep 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sep 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, September 6, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Jean Richardson (JR); A-dae Briones (AB); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Harriet Behar (HB) - observer
Absent: Michelle Arsenault (MA)
Staff: Jessica Walden (JW); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Meeting
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA/ LD	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16. TR in development.	TBD	Spr 2017
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR	N	Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016
L-Methionine	205.605	TF		Petition sent to HS on 08 25 16. Response/request for TR due 10 24 16.	TBD	TBD

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Review Meeting

Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, Aug 2, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21, Jul 5	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed	Review Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	"

Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	"
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	"
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	"
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	"
Konjac flour	205.606	SR	N		Jun 21	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC	N		Jun 21	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sept	Disc Doc Spr 2017
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21 16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize. NOP determined that a verbal update at the fall 2016 meeting would suffice. HS will submit written update at fall meeting.	Fall 2016

Tocopherols Reclassification + addition to 205.605(a)	TF/?	Review scheduled 9/6/16. Voted 09 06 16.	Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 1-12-16. Proposal.	TBD
Phosphates - discussion doc. Potential future annotation change?	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16. Vote: 08 16 16	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts). Discussion doc	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16.	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after Classification guidance is published and TR is available.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL		NA

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve August 16 notes
- Tocopherols (TF) - discuss proposal and vote
- Marine materials (marine algae and extracts) discussion document - preliminary discussion, TR sufficiency
- Xanthan Gum - discuss written update for Fall 2016 meeting
- NOP's operating Plan - Discuss NOP's request for feedback and guidance
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from August 16** were approved with no changes.

- **Tocopherols (TF).** The group discussed the proposal and reasons for listing tocopherols at both §205.605(a) and §205.605(b) of the National List, including intent to encourage use of natural (vs. synthetic) tocopherols. Members discussed whether the same annotation from §205.605(b) was appropriate for section §205.605(a), and it was decided that it was not necessary at §205.605(a). Additionally, members discussed the current annotation at §205.605(b), and it was decided that TF would develop a separate proposal to revise the annotation at §205.605(b). The separate proposal that will consider changes to the annotation at §205.605(b) will be circulated to the HS by email, and votes are due back from members by September 12.

Motion to list tocopherols at §205.605(a).

Motion by: SR
Seconded by: JR
Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: The proposal that will consider changes to the annotation at §205.605(b) was circulated to the HS via email. Motion and votes are recorded below:

Motion to amend the annotation for Tocopherols listed at §205.605(b) of the National List to read as follows: Tocopherols – Derived from vegetable oil.
Motion by: TF
Seconded by: AS
Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Xanthan Gum (ZS).** The lead discussed the brief write up for the Fall 2016 meeting. She will send the final version to the Chair for submission to the NOP for posting to the website.

- **Carageenan (ZS).** Members briefly discussed the status of the carrageenan proposal for the Fall 2016 meeting. Final changes will be made to the document, per amendments suggested by other members, and it will be submitted to the NOP for posting to the website.

- **Marine materials (marine algae and extracts) (JR).** The lead discussed the technical report (TR) and recommended the TR be deemed sufficient. She proceeded to discuss the discussion document and intent to gather input from stakeholders. Questions to include in the document were discussed. A member asked how this work would be coordinated with the Crops Subcommittee (CS), as the CS also has this item on their work agenda and could build upon work by the Handling Subcommittee (HS). A member requested that any impact to livestock should be noted specifically, and the lead author agreed to update the document.

  Motion to accept the discussion document on marine materials (marine algae and extracts)
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: AS
  Yes: 9 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0
  (Note: TC joined call following first vote of the HS meeting)

- **L-Methionine Petition.** Members briefly discussed this new petition that would expand the use of L-methionine beyond those uses already recommended by NOSB. The Livestock Subcommittee made a recommendation for L-Methionine, for which they are awaiting action by NOP. A lead was designated for the petition review (TF).

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)
September 6, 2016

Tocopherols (TF) - discuss proposal and vote
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts) discussion document - preliminary discussion, TR sufficiency
Xanthan Gum - discuss written update for Fall 2016 meeting

September 20, 2016
October 4, 2016
October 18, 2016
November 1, 2016
November 15, 2016 - cancelled (NOSB Meeting)
December 6, 2016
December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 1, 2016
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sep 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sep 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, October 4, 2016 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Scott Rice, Vice Chair (SR); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); A-dae Briones (AB); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Jesse Buie (JB) - observer; Harriet Behar (HB) - observer
Absent: Jean Richardson (JR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Meeting**
Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS)	205.605(b)	HA/ LD	Y	Petition sent to HS on 11 02 15. Response/request for TR due 01 04 16. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No new TR will be requested. Referred back to HS at Apr 2016 NOSB meeting. TR request sent 05 18 16. TR in development - Expected late Oct 2016	TBD	Spr 2017
Sodium Chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas Petition, Addendum	205.605	JR/SR	N	Petition for chlorine dioxide dry gas sent to HS on 12 02 15. Response/request for TR due 02 02 16. HS sent request 03 17 16 for additional info from petitioner. Sodium chlorite addendum received 05 05 16. Suff due 07 05 16. Petition found sufficient 06 07 16	Jun 7, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Oat protein concentrate	205.606	EO	N	Petition sent to HS on 02 17 16. Response/request for TR due 05 11 16. Petition found sufficient 04 05 16. No new TR requested	May 17	Fall 2016
L-Methionine	205.605	TF	N	Petition sent to HS on 08 25 16. Response/request for TR due 10 24 16. Petition found suff 10 04 16. No new TR	Oct 4	Spr 2017

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Review Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 01 22 16. HS sent for revision. Rvsd TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jul 5, Aug 2, Aug 16	Fall 2016
Glucono delta-lactone (GDL)	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Aug 2	Fall 2016
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR Suff due 03 04 16. TR found suff 02 16 16	Jun 21, Jul 5	Fall 2016
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18. TR request sent 07 06 15. TR in development. TR sent to HS 01 22 16. TR suff due 03 04 16. TR found sufficient 02 02 16	Jul 5	Fall 2016
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018	Jun 7	Fall 2016
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18	Jun 21	Fall 2016

2019 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2017 Complete Review: Fall 2017						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Review Meeting**

Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	Fall 2017
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	N		Jun 21	“
Nitrogen	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	“
Sodium carbonate	205.605(a)	LD	N		Jun 21	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	“
Carbon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	N		Jun 21	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	“
Magnesium chloride	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	“
Potassium acid tartrate	205.605(b)	JR	Y		Jun 21	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	N		Jun 21	“
Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)	JR/HA	2016	Phosphates - TR Request rec'd 7/28/15; TR sent to HS on 2/10/2016; TR found sufficient on 3/15/2016	Jun 21	“
Casings	205.606	JR	N		Jun 21	“
Konjac flour	205.606	SR	N		Jun 21	“
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	TC	N		Jun 21	“

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS/LD	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program.	Disc Doc Spr 2017
Xanthan Gum Reclassification	ZS	TR in development. TR request send to NOP 10 26 15. TR expected May 2016. TR sent to HS 04 22 16. Response due 06 21	Fall 2016

		16. Review scheduled Jun 7. TR found sufficient 06 07 16. HS will not go forth with reclassification - Waiting for NOP re: how to finalize. NOP determined that a verbal update at the fall 2016 meeting would suffice. HS will submit written update at fall meeting.	
Tocopherols Reclassification	TF	Review scheduled 9/6/16. Voted 09 06 16.	Fall 2016
Tocopherols. Additional Listing @ 205.605(a)	TF	Voted 09 06 16.	Fall 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	ZS	Pending NOP Approval. Approved 01 12 16. Proposal. On hold.	TBD
Phosphates - discussion doc. Potential future annotation change?	HA/JR	Request to add to work agenda discussed on October 9 on ES call. TR request sent to NOP 07 28 15. Formal request for addition to agenda sent 11 24 15. Awaiting NOP approval. TR in development - estimated March 2016. TR sent to HS 02 11 16. TR suff due 04 12 16. TR found sufficient 03 15 16. Vote: 08 16 16	Fall 2016
Marine materials (marine algae and extracts). Discussion doc	JR	Pending NOP approval. NOP approved request 01 12 16. TR request sent to NOP 02 05 16. TR expected Jul 2016. TR sent to HS 08 10 16. TR suff due 10 11 16. TR found sufficient 09 06 16. Voted 09 06 16.	Fall 2016
Reclassification of Magnesium chloride	JR	HS requested addition of this. NOP approved 01 12 16, but delayed until after classification guidance is published and TR is available.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2016 - Celery Powder alternatives	Fall 2016
NOP operating plan suggestions	ALL		NA

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Agenda

- Approve September 6 notes
- L-Methionine - Petition sufficiency, TR request
- NOP operating plan priorities (from current list)
- Discuss prep for Spring 2017 meeting (Sunset 2019 Materials, Petitioned substances, and carried over items).
- Public comments to date
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** September 6 were approved with amendments to the work agenda table, and the addition of the discussion and vote for the tocopherols annotation change, which was conducted via email after the last call.

- **L-Methionine (TF)**. The Handling Subcommittee received a petition for L-Methionine, which was previously submitted in 2013, amended, and resubmitted. The lead noted that the petition was thorough and addressed all the NOSB questions from the previous submission. The petition was found sufficient. The HS will not seek a new TR.
- **NOP operating plan priorities (from current list).** The group discussed previous recommendations that are outstanding on the NOP operating plan for 2017. The NOSB was asked to prioritize the items for NOP. Members discussed several topics such as calculating percentage of organic ingredients, materials classification, infant formula substances (nutrient vitamins and minerals (NVM)/accessory nutrients) that the NOSB previously prohibited, apiculture, and aquaculture. The NOP will provide additional information about some of the items, and current status of these items. The list will be discussed on the next Executive call in preparation for the fall meeting.
- **Prep for Spring 2017 meeting (Sunset 2019 Materials, Petitioned substances, and carried over items).**
    - There is a short period of time between the Fall 2016 and Spring 2017 meeting. The HS Chair noted that the Subcommittee will have only four calls, and the new appointees will only have two calls before the proposal deadline. The 2019 sunset substances were reviewed for TR requests, and the current leads will remain until January, when several members will end their NOSB terms. Other projects may also need to be reassigned: BPA/packaging and NVM.
- **Public comments.** Members discussed comments received to date. Currently there are 500+ comments, and most address carrageenan and hydroponics.
- **Additional Items**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

September 6, 2016

Tocopherols (TF) - discuss proposal and vote

Marine materials (marine algae and extracts) discussion document - preliminary discussion, TR sufficiency

Xanthan Gum - discuss written update for Fall 2016 meeting

September 20, 2016 - cancelled

October 4, 2016

L-Methionine - Petition sufficiency, TR request

October 18, 2016

L-Methionine - discuss proposal?

Discuss public comment

November 1, 2016

Discuss public comment

SDBS - TR sufficiency, if available

BPA - TR sufficiency, if available

November 15, 2016 - cancelled (NOSB Meeting)

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Fall 2016 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 1, 2016
NOP - Complete fall 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Sep 8, 2016
NOSB - Fall 2016 proposals due to NOP	Sep 14, 2016
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 27, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2016
Webinar run through	Oct 25, 2016
Public comment closes	Oct 26, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Nov 2, 2016
Public comment webinar	Nov 3, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Nov 4, 2016
Fall 2016 NOSB meeting - St Louis, MO	Nov 16-18, 2016