

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, December 19, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Kyla Smith, NOSB Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Livestock Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Handling Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ), Materials Chair; Logan Petrey (LP), Crops Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kim Huseman (KH) - observer

Absent: Jared Clark (JC)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Erin Healy (EH); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- **Review November 21, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (KS)**
 - Update on in-person public comment at Spring meeting
 - Proposal deadline (February 15, 2024)
 - Food technologists process (more later in agenda)
 - TR timelines for 2026 sunset reviews
 - Reminder January 2 calls moved to Jan 23
- **NOP news and updates (EH)**
 - Market Development Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - SOE rollout update
 - OLPS public webinar
 - Climate Smart Ag - Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC) module update
 - Food Technologist work requests - TR template
- **Food Technologist update (EH for JC)**
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Upcoming deadlines (see tables below).
 - Work agenda spreadsheet - posted on website
<https://www.ams.usda.gov/sites/default/files/media/NOSBWorkAgenda.pdf>
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) (AJ)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (FQ)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (NL)
 - Livestock (LS) (BC)
 - Crops (CS) (LP)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **November 21, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report (KS)**
 - Update on in-person public comment at Spring meeting. The Federal Register Notice is in clearance, and includes language about the Board possibly hearing in-person comments at the meeting in Milwaukee.

- Spring meeting agenda: The NOSB is discussing options for agenda items for the Spring meeting including a presentation by the Transition to Organic Partnership Program (TOPP), a compost panel, and a speaker to discuss diversity, equity and inclusion in agriculture.
- The submission deadline to get documents in for the Spring 2024 meeting is February 15, 2024.
- Food technologists process. The NOP/NOSB added a standing agenda item on the Executive call for an update on current projects and workload. The NOSB Chair reminded members that if they have ideas for projects, they should filter them up through Subcommittee Chairs, which will get sent to the NOSB Chair, and then on to NOP. There is a list of the current projects in the queue on the tracking sheet the Subcommittee Chairs maintain.
- TR timelines for 2026 sunset reviews. The Chair highlighted the timeline for TR sufficiency reviews (the Subcommittee has 60 days to review), but asked that if Subcommittee members can get them done sooner, it would be helpful for the Spring meeting. She also noted that some of the TRs will not be back in time for the Spring meeting, and it would be helpful to note that in the sunset review, so stakeholders know it is forthcoming.
- Reminder: The January 2 Subcommittee calls were moved to January 23.
- The NOSB Chair meets with the NOP Standards Division Director monthly to keep the program abreast of topics the Board is discussing, and to keep the lines of communication open.
- **NOP news and updates (EH)**
 - SOE Update: NOP's top priority is Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) implementation. The NOP has been answering many emails, doing lots of outreach, webinars, phone calls, and hosting "coffee with certifiers" calls. The NOP has received many thoughtful, detailed questions. The NOP Trade Division launched the technology ahead of time to allow time for testing before the implementation date.
 - The Transition to Organic Partnership Program (TOPP) had its one-year anniversary recently. All TOPP events are listed on the Organic Transition Initiative (OTI) website. <https://www.organictransition.org/>
 - NOSB nominations. In January 2025 there will be 5 positions to be filled: One producer, two handlers, one retailer, and one environmental/resource conservation rep. The application period will be announced in approximately March or April 2024, and be open for 60 days. The NOP asked Board members to reach out to stakeholders to let them know.
 - Residue testing. The CACS is working on a proposal on residue testing, and asked about the timeline and best options for a proposal with regard to the SOE rollout. The NOP confirmed that a proposal for the April meeting would work.
 - Market Development Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food). The Rule was designated "not significant" by Office of Management and Budget (OMB), which means it will have a shorter, quicker clearance process.
 - Climate-Smart Ag microlearning is now available in the Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC). It links the organic regulations to climate smart outcomes and NRCS activities. The goal was to integrate these aspects with that of the NOSB Recommendation on organic and climate-smart ag. The NOP asked the NOSB to spread the word about the availability of this module, and noted that this has been shared on social media.
 - Food Technologist work requests - TR template. The NOP will respond to this work request as soon as possible. The group discussed the role and processes for the Food Techs. The NOSB (via the Board Chair) will send requests to the NOP, and the National List Manager will manage the work queue, so there is consistency. Prior to sending anything back to the board, the Assistant Director, who supervises the Food Techs, will review it to ensure accuracy and quality. The Board asked about the possibility of having the Food Techs work on smaller projects to test the process. Members asked questions about capacity, turnaround time, and cadence.

- **Food Technologist update (EH for JC).**
 - Currently working on two projects: The TR template update review and the International Standards for the sunset reviews. Upcoming projects may include inerts, Research Priority literature review, and perhaps populating the 2027 sunset templates.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Upcoming deadlines (see tables below). MA will draft the Spring 2024 meeting agenda for discussion on the January 9 admin call with the NOSB leadership team.
 - The NOP is working on the NOSB Charter renewal, as the Charter expires in July 2024.
 - The NOP is working on the call for nominations for 2025. The notice will get posted in the Spring of 2024.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) (AJ). The HS is working through a long list of sunset reviews, and a proposal for a rye pollen extracts petition for the Spring meeting. The Subcommittee is also reviewing limited scope TRs related to fermentation products and GMOs.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (FQ). The MS is working on induced mutagenesis for the Spring 2024 meeting, and also discussed the possibility of hosting a panel on inerts at the Fall 2024 meeting, or if feasible, hosting a virtual panel outside of the NOSB meeting, which the Board has done before. Members also discussed the status on the petition for tall oil, which was put on hold until the inerts work is complete.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (NL). The PDS is working on PPM updates for a proposal for the Spring 2024 meeting. The updates are relatively minor and include technical corrections, and additional language about board participation. The PDS also talked about informal interviews for outgoing Board members, and a potential speaker for the spring meeting on the topic of racism, which grew out of conversation about USDA's equity commission report.
 - Livestock (LS) (BC). The LS has a light agenda for 2024 and is working on sunsets. The Subcommittee had a robust discussion about topics such as methionine.
 - Crops (CS) (LP). The CS is working through sunset reviews, compost, and two petitions. The CS is going to add an extra call to work on the compost proposal and to talk about a panel on compost.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS will have 3 proposals for the Spring 2024 meeting, and have a two-step process in Subcommittee so they have more discussion time for each document. On its last call, the CACS heard from Lindsay Haines of the NRCS who talked about the Organic Transition Initiative (OTI) and Transition to Organic Partnership Program (TOPP). Lindsay described the successes and challenges, including finding and communicating with organic producers. They are interested in assistance with outreach from the NOP and NOSB. March 1 is the deadline for OTI grants and Lindsay asked that the Board elevate that information within their communities. The NOP also suggested sharing and forwarding posts on social media.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

October 16, 2023 - Monday

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

January 16, 2024

February 20, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 16, 2024

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, November 21, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Kyla Smith, NOSB Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Livestock Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Handling Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ), Materials Chair; Wood Turner (WT) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP), Crops Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- **Review October 16, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (KS)**
 - New Subcommittee chairs
 - Fall meeting debrief
 - Annotations
 - Spring 2024 in person comments
 - Housekeeping reminders
 - Coversheets for Final 2025 sunsets due November 22
 - 2026 sunset first draft due dates
 - Subcommittee meetings for January 2, 2024
 - Support-staff workflow
- **NOP news and updates (EH)**
 - The Market Development Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - SOE rollout update
 - OLPS public webinar
 - Consumer education
 - Research priorities
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Upcoming deadlines
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (AJ)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (FQ)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (NL)
 - Livestock (LS) (BC)
 - Crops (CS) (ADB for LP)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **October 16, 2023 notes** were accepted as revised, based on feedback from a Board member.
- **Chairs Report (KS)**
 - New Subcommittee chairs. The NOSB Chair thanked all members for stepping into new roles, and offered support and help
 - Fall meeting debrief. KS highlighted the time to interact with other members and guest speakers.

- **Annotations.** The NOSB discussed the process and structure of this work agenda item, so it remains a useful tool for future Boards. For example, the NOSB Vice Chair could lead this project across all Subcommittees. A member added that it might be helpful to add to the current list of candidates for annotation changes to highlight the substances that were reviewed in the interim period before they added the work agenda item.
- **Spring 2024 in-person comments.** The NOSB discussed the pros and cons of in-person comments on multiple occasions, and has explored various opportunities and configurations. Members did not decide about how to proceed for the Spring 2024 meeting. The meeting notice is in clearance and the NOP will pull it back and revise the language to include time at the Spring meeting for comments.
- **Housekeeping reminders**
 - Coversheets for Final recommendations (2025 sunsets and proposals) are due November 22.
 - 2026 sunset first draft due dates. Set by Subcommittees. Staggered, so people who are in multiple Subcomms have time. First drafts: Crops (Nov 28), Handling (Dec 1), and Livestock (Dec 5).
 - Subcommittee meetings for January 2, 2024. The NOSB proposed shifting all the Subcommittee meetings from January 2 to January 23 (Fourth Tuesday). MA will modify the calendar invitations.
 - Support staff workflow. The NOSB Chair will track requests from the Subcommittees. Subcommittee members will draft the request and send to the Subcommittee Chair, then to admin team, then to NOP. There is an internal NOP process that will take time, so please factor in turnaround time.
- **NOP news and updates (EH)**
 - The Market Development Proposed Rule (mushrooms, pet food). In clearance. NOP is addressing minor comments from the Office of General Council (OGC).
 - Consumer education. There were numerous comments at the Fall meeting about marketing Organic. NOP is drafting a toolkit of graphics for retailers to use in stores, and is currently seeking stakeholder/retailer feedback. The graphics are in clearance and NOP is hoping to introduce them early next year.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) rollout update. NOP continues to conduct lots of outreach events. A member asked about international ports that handle bulk imports.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) public webinar. Last week NOP hosted a webinar and there were 183 participants. NOP is also creating a class for the Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC), which should be out later this year.
 - Research priorities. The group discussed research priorities and the feedback loop between the NOSB and researchers. Currently there is not much overlap between what the Board puts forth as priorities, and what academia works on, and they are exploring ways to improve that.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Upcoming deadlines for 2024 (see below)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has several projects on its work agenda and is looking to invite various guest speakers to Subcommittee calls. Projects under development include organic transition initiatives/crop insurance, which they may couple with the climate change work. The CACS is also discussing the addition of a work agenda item on market development, and the Executive team approved the idea. The CACS will forward the written request to the program.
 - Handling (HS) (AJ). The Handling Subcommittee is working on many sunset reviews and has a couple of petitions and other projects underway.

- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (FQ). The MS has two major projects in progress: Final edits to the TR templates with the new questions on excluded methods; and Inerts. The MS plans on asking the Food Technologists for assistance with Inerts.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (NL). The PDS discussed several topics during the last call: in-person comments, exit interviews, refining agenda item requests, and how ideas are developed into proposals. The PDS also reassigned roles of Subcommittee members, given the change in leadership at the Fall 2023 meeting. The process for requesting work agenda requests is documented in the PPM, and the PDS discussed cross referencing it in the Member Guide. The NOP highlighted the summary handouts from the NOSB training.
 - Livestock (LS) (BC). The LS has begun its reviews of the 2026 sunsets and scheduled discussions for its upcoming calls. The group also discussed organic swine, and lack of such products, and possible barriers, which is currently included as a research priority.
 - Crops (CS) (ADB for LP). The CS is interested in hosting a panel at its Spring 2024 meeting. The task at hand is to create a list of potential panelists in collaboration with the NOP, and to send out invitations around February 2024. Crops is also working on a new petition for pear ester as well as many 2026 sunsets.
- **Additional Items.** None.
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

September 18, 2023

October 16, 2023 - Monday

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

January 16, 2024

February 20, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 16, 2024

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1

Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Monday, October 16, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Allison Johnson (AJ) - PDS Chair; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ) – observer; Nate Lewis (NL) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- **Review September 18, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Format for oral comments at Spring & Fall 2024 meetings.
 - Spring 2024 meeting options: Panel?
 - Additional topics to discuss at Fall 2023 NOSB meeting (Work agenda/additional business)?
 - Response to BBMF request
 - November 7 Subcommittee calls - on schedule
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) status
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Open docket process
 - Fall 2023 Meeting logistics update
 - Michelle's leave (Nov 7 and 14)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (AJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). Compost work agenda request update?
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **September 18, 2023 notes** were
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Format for oral comments at Spring & Fall 2024 meetings. The Board is considering holding a panel on compost at the spring meeting, and also discussed whether to host public comments at the in-person meeting in addition to virtually. The group discussed the equity and value of online comments while acknowledging some stakeholder sentiments about the benefits of in-person comments, which brings with it an emotional or visceral quality for those in the room. Members provided opinions and feedback about the options. Hearing testimony the week before the in-person meeting allows the Board members more time to digest comments and

more time at the meeting to deliberate and discuss proposals. Some are concerned about access and equality for those who are not able to travel to a meeting. The farmer community seemed to support virtual comments as the meetings tend to fall during planting and harvest seasons. The time commitment to attend an in-person meeting may be a hinderance. Not hearing comments in person opens up time at the meetings for panels and guest speakers. Overall, members supported virtual oral comments, but also allowing for flexibility so future Boards can decide the best options.

- **Spring 2024 meeting options: Panel?** The Vice Chair explained the usefulness of hosting a panel on compost, and questioned whether they had time to hear a panel and host public comment at the Spring meeting. Both the Compost and Inerts projects have short timelines, and in the interest of getting the project on compost started as soon as possible, the Board feels a panel would be helpful for education and outreach to the industry and consumers. Since two NOSB members have expertise on compost, the timing seems ideal. A member added that compost is a foundational material and ubiquitous in organic, and touches so many parts of the rule that it seems to lend itself well to a panel discussion. NOP supported the idea of providing the board with outside expertise. As to process: the NOSB would suggest 3-5 panelists, NOP would review the list to make sure there is a breadth of expertise and diversity, and then extend invitations.
- Additional topics to discuss at Fall 2023 NOSB meeting (work agenda/additional business)? The Crops Subcommittee Chair would like to discuss the upcoming agenda items during the Crops session rather than at the end of the meeting. The NOSB Chair will give a brief update on Inerts during the NOSB update, and will defer to the Chair of the Materials Subcommittee to discuss it (inerts) and compost at the end of the meeting under “other business”.
- Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) update. Both Crops and CACS discussed the BBMF request. CACS looked at expanding this topic to weed management. Crops debated and decided that the timing of this project is not ideal. Although they chose to not work on it, they invite future Boards to address it if they are interested and the community supports the need for the work.
- November 7 Subcommittee calls - on schedule. Not cancelled.
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - The availability of the NOP updates (in the form of video recordings) for NOSB meeting were announced in an Organic Insider notice today. The NOP encouraged folks to watch the videos for an overview of what the NOP has been working on.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) status. The rule is a high priority and is making good progress through the approval process.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) rule. The NOP is conducting outreach on implementation of SOE, which goes into effect in March 2024.
 - The Market Development Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food) was submitted into legal clearance. OLPS is the priority until published.
 - The NOP expressed appreciation for the Board’s work and is looking forward to seeing everyone next week in Providence.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Open docket process. The NOP described the process to use the open docket.
 - Fall 2023 Meeting logistics update. There were no questions about travel or meeting times.
 - Michelle’s leave (Nov 7 and 14). NOP staff will substitute on the Subcommittee calls to take notes in Michelle’s absence.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has several large projects on its work agenda.

- Handling (HS) (KS). The HS has a few petitions and projects, as well as 29 sunset reviews for the next semester.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). In addition to Research Priorities Inerts. A subgroup of Materials members are collaborating on a proposal on inerts. They are working on information collection to determine options on the best path forward. The members may gather in person in Providence to talk more. The MS will also continue work on TR templates updates.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (AJ). The PDS will work on PPM updates for the Spring 2024 meeting.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). The workload in Livestock is light. There are currently no petitions, only sunsets. The LS received some written comments on topics that were not on the agenda, and mineral oil and vaccines garnered interest from the community.
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). Crops talked about public comments on last call, and when they return from the Fall meeting they will have a full roster of projects including sunsets, compost, and a new petition on pear esters. The CS thanked the NOP for combining the two requests on compost (one from the NOSB and one from the petitioner). The work-load across the entire board is quite full.
- **Additional Items.** None
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

September 18, 2023

October 16, 2023 - Monday

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, September 19, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Nate Lewis (NL) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Allison Johnson (AJ) - PDS Chair; Carolyn Dimitri (CD) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); Fred David (FD); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- **Review August 15, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Discuss format for oral comments - Spring 2024 meeting.
 - Alternate meeting scenarios in case of shutdown
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - NOSB technical support liaison introduction.
 - Government Fiscal Year end - September 30
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) status
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall 2023 Meeting agenda
 - Oral and written comment update
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) (ADB)
 - Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) work agenda request (sent September 8).
 - Compost work agenda request
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - RMA Speaker at Fall NOSB meeting
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - NVM 2026 sunset/2012 Interim Rule
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (AJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **August 15, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Format for oral comments at Spring 2024 meeting. The Chair informally polled members about the format of the meeting, and will let the NOP know prior to the next Executive Committee call, so it can be included in the FR notice for the Spring Meeting.
 - Alternate meeting scenarios in case of "lapse in appropriations". The Board and NOP have discussed possible alternate options in case the meeting has to be postponed.

- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - NOSB technical support liaison introduction. Heather Kumar and Esu Obu are the two new NOP technical support staff hired to assist the NOSB with research and writing. The NOP will send protocols for subject lines and priority ranking criteria for work requests, and asks that all work requests be sent to the NOSB inbox. Based on the NOSB recommendation, some of the tasks will include literature reviews, background research, editing, summarizing technical reports, etc. The NOSB Chair suggested How will the Board coordinate between Subcommittees. NOP asked that members also include Subcomm Chairs when requesting.
 - Government Fiscal Year end - September 30. The Deputy Administrator shared the process for communicating to the Board and the public in the event that the USDA does not receive its appropriation from Congress on October 1. The NOP will communicate to stakeholders via an Organic Insider notice letting them know the possible if-then scenarios.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) status. The rule is in clearance, and NOP continues to respond to comments from the Office of Management and Budget (OMB). A member noted that there have been proposed amendments introduced in Congress.
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food). The NOP received comments from the Office of General Counsel (OGC) on this rule, however, is prioritizing OLPS.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - The group viewed the Fall 2023 Meeting agenda, and didn't have any comments or questions.
 - Oral and written comments update. The comment period closes September 30.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). The CS has been brainstorming ideas for additional work agenda items, and will continue discussions on future calls.
 - Crops is discussing the Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) work agenda request (sent by NOP September 8).
 - Compost work agenda request (MJ). Crops has been discussing a work agenda on this topic, as the regulations are out-of-date with the industry standards. Crops is seeking to do several things with this work agenda item: add a definition for compost feedstocks, and make updates at §§ 205.2 205.203 and 205.601, which all intersect and are connected to compost. The Subcommittee is aware that the NOP received a petition for rulemaking on compost, and will likely ask the Board to work on this. If so, Crops will combine the two into one project, and provide a recommendation as soon as possible. The current Board is well positioned with expertise and experience, as the co-leads are both certified composters. They also have extensive experience at the state-level. The Executive Team approved of the work agenda request and will forward to the NOP.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - The CACS is anticipating working on "carry over" items from Fall meeting. Items that were discussion documents that they may develop into proposals. The CACS also talked about adding projects on weed management and use of plastic in systems
 - The CACS will hear from an invited speaker from the Risk Management Agency (RMA) at Fall NOSB meeting, and will compile a list of questions to pass along ahead of time.
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - The HS has begun work on its 2026 sunsets since they have many.
 - On the September 5 Handling call the HS discussed nutrient vitamins and minerals (NVM), which is due to sunset in 2026, and would like to ask the NOP to comment at the Fall 2023 NOSB meeting on status of 2012 interim rule re: nutrient vitamins and minerals <https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2012/09/27/2012-23748/national-organic-program-nop-sunset-review-2012-for-nutrient-vitamins-and-minerals>

- There was enthusiasm in subcommittee on proceeding with work on the reclassification of L-Malic Acid.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT).
 - The Materials Subcommittee is working on incorporating the Inerts work agenda item into its workflow. A subgroup of MS members will be working closely to support that work.
 - TR templates/excluded methods. The MS incorporated suggestions from the public comment into the templates, and they continue to talk about the materials classification flowchart and how far back in the process they should they look when assessing substances for excluded methods.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (AJ). The PDS has no formal documents for the Fall meeting, but will provide a verbal update about future administrative updates, such as member participation.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). The Livestock Subcommittee’s work agenda has been relatively quiet, so they cancelled today’s call. The LS Chair noted that a large grain-seed provider filed bankruptcy recently, and they anticipate it will create significant price volatility in the Livestock market.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

August 15, 2023

September 18, 2023

October 16, 2023 - moved to Monday to accommodate the oral comment webinars

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, August 15, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Nate Lewis (NL) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Allison Johnson (AJ) - PDS Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ) - observer; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer; Carolyn Dimitri (CD) - observer; Brian Caldwell (BC) - observer.

Absent: NOP leadership team

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- **July 18, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Highlight Fall meeting docs status
 - Spring 2024 meeting - discuss format (MJ)
 - Inerts work agenda request sent June 23, 2023 - Assign Subcommittee
 - Officer Elections
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall 2023 timeline - update below
 - 2026 sunset templates - will send by August
 - Spring/Fall 2024 meetings - update
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (AJ)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **July 18, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall meeting docs status. All proposals were submitted early or on time, with thanks from the NOP.
 - Spring 2024 meeting - discuss format (MJ). The group discussed oral public comments and whether or not they want to continue hearing comments only virtually, or return to a hybrid model. Members were invited to provide feedback, and agreed to revisit this prior to the publication date of the Spring meeting notice. The NOSB considered community feedback, equity, and access and will talk more at the public meeting.
 - Inerts work agenda request. The NOP sent a work agenda item to the NOSB in late June 2023 asking for a recommendation on inerts by Fall 2024, so NOP has time to implement it before the next sunset date. Several members drafted language about how best to move forward and the

group discussed options. They also discussed whether to create an ad-hoc subcommittee or add it to the Materials Subcommittee work agenda. The group chose to house it in the Materials Subcommittee and will add a second call each month. The Materials Subcommittee will post a pre-discussion document with some basic questions for stakeholders in the public docket that is currently open (AMS-NOP-23-0026), and will alert stakeholders to its availability. They would like to use feedback to help frame the conversation. The NOP will review the proposed questions and provide feedback this week so they can move forward with a draft for posting next week. A member suggested adding time at the fall meeting to talk about it, perhaps during other business or when they discuss the work agenda.

- Officer elections. Elections for Chair, Vice Chair, and Secretary occur at the Fall NOSB meeting. A member heard feedback from the community that the Fall 2022 elections were not transparent. The NOP highlighted the section in the Policy and Procedure Manual (PPM) where the election mechanics are laid out, and the group discussed the internal process and factors that are considered amongst Board members. Such things as whether a member wants a leadership role, whether they have time, how long they've been on the Board, succession planning, etc. These conversations happen all year prior to an election, and NOP is not involved in the process. The NOSB Chair invited feedback from members about ways to make it more transparent: Perhaps candidate statements at the meeting, discussing why they do or do not want the role.
- NOP/NOSB collaboration and interaction. The NOSB is interested in improving communication with the NOP, so as they move forward with projects, they can check in to make sure goals are aligned and projects remain within scope. The Chair would like to include time during the Executive calls for Subcommittees to discuss specific questions, as needed. Additionally, they asked that the technical representative in each Subcommittee be invited to join the conversations and intervene when needed. Historically, NOP has only provided guidance when asked, so it is not viewed as "undue influence". Members discussed the need or desire to work on projects that might not necessarily result in rulemaking, acknowledging that the goal might be to express the Board's or stakeholders' position on a specific topic. A member added that they could use the discussion section in a proposal to expound, so the goal is clear.
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH).** No update.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall 2023 timeline. The ACS provided a brief update highlighting the upcoming deadlines, and thanked the Board for submitting their Fall documents early and on time. As the NOP reviews the documents, it might return some for edits or comments, so please keep an eye on your email.
 - 2026 sunset templates. NOP sent the templates to the Subcommittee Chairs.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). The LS finished its 2025 sunset reviews for the fall meeting, and has prepped for discussions on the 2026 sunsets. On the last call they also discussed a potential annotation for iodine.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has three discussion documents and one proposal for the Fall 2023 meeting. The Chair is seeking suggestions for more work agenda items.
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). Crops will begin work on the 2026 sunset reviews now that they have the templates. On the last call the CS discussed potential work agenda items on compost, and also discussed the use of plastic in organic agriculture and possible work on annotations.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The HS met earlier today and reviewed future work schedules. The HS has a long list of sunset reviews for 2026 (~29 listings).
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The MS completed its research priorities proposal on the last call. The HS added a research priority addressing equity and access at Historically Black

Colleges and Universities. The Subcommittee is also finalizing the updated TR template, and will begin discussions about Inerts.

- Policy Development (PDS) (AJ). The PDS is not presenting anything at the Fall meeting, but will give a verbal update about its work plan.
- **Additional Items.** A member asked about inviting speakers to the Fall meeting, including someone from Rural Management agency (RMA) to talk about Crop Insurance, or perhaps someone from the equity commission to discuss the interim report.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

- July 18, 2023
- August 15, 2023
- September 18, 2023
- October 17, 2023
- November 21, 2023
- December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, July 18, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Nate Lewis (NL) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ) - PDS Chair

Staff: Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); Fred David (FD)

Agenda

- **May 16, 2023 notes** were approved via email
- **Chairs Report (MJ for NPP)**
 - Work agenda project - annotation changes
 - Fall meeting docket/oral comments
 - 2026 TR requests status
 - Fall 2025 sunset templates
 - Inerts work agenda request sent June 23, 2023 - Assign Subcommittee
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) status
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts work agenda request sent June 23, 2023
 - Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) work agenda request
 - Workflow for the NOSB technical support liaisons
 - Update on Spring 2023 NOSB recommendations
 - National List Rules
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall 2023 timeline - update below
 - 2026 sunset templates - will send by August
 - Spring 2024 meeting update
 - Cloud Vault
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD/NL for AJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (NPP for KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). Liquid fish annotation proposal.
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **May 16, 2023 notes** were approved via email
- **Chairs Report (MJ for NPP)**
 - Work agenda project - annotation changes. The work agenda request was approved by NOP May 19. The Handling Subcommittee Chair described several options on how to move forward,

and noted that the NOSB will consider each case to make sure it will provide value and clarity, and not make it make it harder for farmers and certifiers.

- Fall meeting docket/oral comments. The NOP suggested the NOSB consider including a formal process in the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM) for determining whether to hold in-person public comments in addition to virtual comment webinars. Additionally, the decision needs to be made well in advance in order to be included in the Federal Register Notice announcement.
- 2026 TR requests status. The NOP confirmed that the list of TR requests is complete and has been forwarded to OMRI (the TR contractor). The NOSB Vice Chair asked for feedback about process improvements, so when a member requests a limited scope TR they come prepared with questions. The NOSB asked the National List Manager to facilitate that process. The NOSB also asked if there is a way to get an idea of when to expect TRs so they can schedule discussions accordingly.
- Fall 2025 sunset templates. The templates were distributed via several avenues, and subsequently updated. Members can find them in the new Cloud Vault account or email.
- NOP sent the NOSB a work agenda request on Inerts on June 23, 2023, and it needs to be assigned to a Subcommittee.
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) status. The rule is moving through the clearance process, and once the USDA completes its review, it will go to the Office of Management and Budget (OMB). Its status in the [OMB system](#) will change when it's under review.
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed rule on mushrooms, pet food). The rule is currently under review at the Office of General Council (OGC).
 - Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) work agenda request. Based on additional research and vetting conducted by NOP, and several NOSB members, it was determined that there would be no commercially available products that would meet the criteria in the recommendation. Previous NOSB work focused on the percentage of biobased content, and based on new research, the proposed percentages are likely not attainable. Given this new information, NOP would like to return the topic back to the Board as a work agenda item for a revised recommendation. The better question might be about biodegradability and compostability. The NOP is drafting a work agenda request to the NOSB asking them to revisit the topic. Several members asked clarifying questions about the project.
 - Workflow for the NOSB technical support liaisons. Candidate selection for two new technical support staff persons will be underway soon. The NOP asked that the NOSB think through communication channels and workflow. The NOSB inbox will be used to direct questions and requests from the NOSB to the tech support staff, and NOP asked that Board members coordinate amongst each other to provide clarity to the support staff on priorities and deadlines. Fred David, Assistant Division Director in Standards will be their supervisor. Members asked about the roles/positions, when they are expected to start, and if they would be attending the Fall 2023 NOSB meeting.
 - Update on Spring 2023 NOSB recommendations. NOP sent the NOSB its response to the Spring 2023 recommendations on July 7. The NOP highlighted the climate smart recommendation, and the climate cross walk, which was shared with several agencies and the Climate Team. The objective is to weave this information (that organic agricultural practices are already climate smart) into various projects and opportunities, as well as a training module in the Learning Center.
 - National List Rules. The NOP is waiting for feedback from the EPA about the nitrogen rule.
 - Other work agenda items in the queue? The NOP mentioned other work agenda projects to highlight the need for the NOSB to stay within the scope that was requested and approved. This will aid the NOP in implementing recommendations. For example, in the CACS, there are 3

overarching projects: Human Capital; Climate Change/Equity; and Enforcement/Fraud Prevention. Under these headings, the CACS has requested to work on sub-topics, but they must be scoped appropriately as something that NOP has the authority to implement.

- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**

- Fall 2023 timeline - see table below
- 2026 sunset templates. The templates are drafted and once they are proofread, will be sent to the Subcommittees by early August.
- Spring 2024 meeting update (Milwaukee, WI, Apr 29 - May 1, 2024)
- Fall 2024 meeting (Portland, OR, October 22 - 24, 2024)
- Cloud Vault. NOP asked that Board members verify they have access, and can start using it immediately.

- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**

Policy Development (PDS) (JD/NL). The leadership of the PDS changed last week. Allison Johnson will Chair the PDS in place of Jerry D'Amore, who stepped down as Chair, as he is on 4 Subcommittees; and Nate Lewis will replace Mindee Jeffery as Vice Chair. Both Jerry and Mindee will remain on the Subcommittee. The PDS is focused on PPM updates that include language about Board participation, technical corrections, and administrative updates. The Subcommittee will also begin discussions about how the equity commission work impacts Board membership, structure of oral public comments, and exit interviews.

- Livestock (LS) (NPP for KH). Livestock has completed all its Fall 2023 sunset documents and has a few to submit. LS will cancel its August 1 call.
- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has several proposals and discussion documents in progress, including two climate-focused documents: Climate Induced Farming Risk and Crop Insurance; and What/Why Organic. The What/Why organic is meant to highlight previous work and accomplishments, and highlight OTI (Organic Transition Initiative). NOP asked that the CACS clearly state what they are asking the NOP to do with this document and how they think this would be implemented, as fulfillment rate of recommendations is important.
- Crops (CS) (ADB). The Crops work agenda is extensive, and the CS has scheduled an extra call in August to complete its work for the Fall meeting. On the last call the group talked about newspaper, which led to a conversation about compost, and the issue of synthetic feedstocks. Crops will talk more about this at a later date. The CS Chair asked about the status of a previous NOSB recommendation (Fall 2020) on an annotation for liquid fish. NOP indicated that they would not move forward with this recommendation, as it may present an undue burden on certifiers or Material Review Organizations, who are currently at capacity prepping for the full implementation of Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). The CS Chair asked about follow-up with regard to status of recommendations – there are two ways the NOP communicates this information: Via the response to recommendations and the NOSB Recommendations Library, which the NOP strives to update twice a year, and more if needed.
- Handling (HS) (KS). The HS has one more meeting prior to the proposal deadline, on which they will complete the sunset review on 6 gums, and two discussion documents for two petitions under review. The HS will defer the review for rye pollen extracts to the Spring 2024 meeting, as they are awaiting a technical report.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The TR template update (to include questions about excluded methods) will be finalized soon. Subcommittees' research priorities are almost complete, and the MS will collect and collate them, and vote on the proposal next month. The Subcommittee talked about a work agenda item or research priority about 1890 institutions and access to state-matching funds.

- **Additional Items.** None.

- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

June 20, 2023 - cancelled

July 18, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 18, 2023

October 17, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, May 16, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair;

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - PDS Chair

Staff: Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH)

Agenda

- **Approve April 17, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (MJ for NPP)**
 - Chairs acknowledgement of Board members
 - Debrief from Spring 2023 NOSB Meeting
 - In-person/Virtual meetings/Listening session?
 - Organic seed requirements/recommendations/OILC
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR)
 - National List Rules
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall 2023 timeline - update below
 - Fall 2023 sunset templates
 - 2026 sunset templates - will send by August
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Approve April 17, 2023 notes** were approved as written.
- **Chairs Report (MJ for NPP)**
 - Acknowledgement of Board members. The Vice Chair praised members for an excellent job at Spring meeting
 - Debrief from Spring 2023 NOSB Meeting. Members shared reflections and feedback from stakeholders about the benefits of having extra time for dialogue about sunsets, and about the in-person meeting agenda. Although the meeting was less packed than usual, it allowed for more and better in-depth discussions. New members participated extensively, given that they were appointed not long ago.
 - In-person/Virtual meetings/Listening session?

The notice for the Fall 2023 is in clearance and it included a virtual component for oral comments. Since the goal is to open the docket as soon as possible after an NOSB meeting, the Board will have to decide well in advance to hold oral comments both virtually and in-person. would be easier to make the decision long in advance so it can be included in the notice.

- Members discussed several options for engagement with the community such as smaller, informal listening sessions. Since NOSB members represent their constituents, attending events to talk to them is encouraged. For fairness and consistency, the group discussed the idea of using centralized/shared information with their stakeholder groups.
- Organic seed requirements/recommendations/Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC). The NOSB asked for an update about previous recommendations on seed guidance and the OILC training module. The NOP created several training modules on this topic, as it did not lend itself well to rulemaking. The NOP also noted that if there is interest, there are options to add content, and if there are specific issues, then the Program may be able to address them individually. A member noted the difficulties in the global supply chain vs the domestic supply chain, given that commercial availability is part of the regulations. She also noted that the Organic Seed Alliance doesn't collect International data.
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). Currently NOP is focused on outreach, which is critical for implementation. The NOP hosted a webinar earlier today for about 200 people from CIAO (Comisión Interamericana de Agricultura Orgánica) - International stakeholders from South America.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). The rule is in clearance, and NOP will let the NOSB know when it is sent to the Office and Management and Budget (OMB). The Secretary announced at the Organic Policy conference last week in DC that he hopes for a late summer/early fall publication date. OLPS is a top priority along with SOE and Origin of Livestock (OOL) Rule.
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food). In development, but OOL, OLPS, and SOE are top priorities.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). The NOP presented an executive summary during the April NOSB meeting.
 - Human Capital Initiative is in progress.
 - Container Production. NOP heard from public commenters and is considering options if they move forward.
 - Solicitation for NOSB Tech support. The announcement will be sent to Human Resources soon. NOP is seeking to hire two people in the DC region, who can translate science-speak into plain language, and has familiarity with organic and food technology.
 - A member asked about a recent article regarding terminology such as eco and bio. The NOP has recently trademarked the organic seal, and in addition to labels regarding organic, those are the only two over which NOP has authority.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Updated timeline below - for fall (see below)
 - Fall Sunset templates. NOP will send out draft templates for the Fall soon.
 - 2026 sunset templates. NOP will send by the templates by August.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (MJ for WT). The MS reviewed next steps for research priorities on its last call, and asked that the other Subcommittees send the research priorities to them as soon as they are ready. The lead on the TR template updates welcomed feedback from other NOSB members and noted that the document will not be sent to the Fall meeting as a

proposal. The MS also discussed the TBD list in the excluded methods work, and the status of the seed guidance.

- Policy Development (PDS) (MJ for JD). The PDS discussed several topics on its last call including a few pending updates to PPM. The PDS wants to add guidance from the diversity, equity and inclusion commission. The Subcommittee also discussed in-person vs virtual attendance for NOSB members and is seeking to establish and strengthen policies about board participation.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). The LS met today for first time since the Spring NOSB meeting, and have the agenda and timeline for the remainder of the year completed. All TR requests for 2026 sunsets are done, although they are still discussing a TR for vitamins. The Subcommittee also explored possible additional work agenda items, including one on swine, which was suggested by public commenters. The LS views this as exploratory, and doesn't yet have a goal in mind, but may produce a discussion document to illuminate the bottle necks in organic swine production.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) (ADB). The CACS has four discussion documents and one proposal slated for the Fall NOSB meeting: Crop insurance, What/Why Organic, Residue testing, and Organic Transition support. The proposal is on Standardized Location information. The CACS also completed a year-long schedule (as have all the Subcommittees) to aid with work-load distribution and personal scheduling.
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). The Crops agenda is mapped out through February 2024. Going forward the CS Chair will collect and send sunset reviews to the NOP as they are completed to streamline the process and be more efficient. Today, the CS completed votes for three 2025 sunsets, and discussed liquid fish products. The Chair asked about the 2020 NOSB recommendation to annotate liquid fish, and how the NOSB may proceed. The NOP mentioned at the Spring 2023 meeting that it has not moved ahead with rulemaking and likely won't. Crops also discussed sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (SCP) which a member noted is listed as a biopesticide by EPA although it is a synthetic. Another member pointed out the annotation - for use as an algicide - and so this seems like it is not an issue. The CS wondered if NOP could connect them with someone at EPA to verify the definition. NOP suggested that it might be beneficial to approach an advocacy group that has a relationship with EPA already, who could locate the appropriate office/person to ask.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The first round of 2025 sunsets is due this week and the HS has all discussions scheduled. The 2026 TR determinations are complete with the exception of a couple until they know if NOP has capacity for a couple more. The HS has outstanding TRs for 3 petitions, which are in development. The HS Chair proposed a work agenda request to standardize the process across Subcommittees for addressing annotation changes. The HS Chair will send an email to the Executive Committee for approval on the next Exec call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

April 17, 2023 (Monday)

May 16, 2023

June 20, 2023

July 18, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 18, 2023

October 17, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Monday, April 17, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - PDS Chair; Nate Lewis (NL) - observer

Absent: none

Staff: Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve March 21, 2023 notes were accepted as written**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Spring 2023 NOSB meeting logistics, oral comment webinars
 - Questions to NOP for Q & A at meeting.
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - Address designation change of NOSB seats to SGEs at the NOSB meeting?
 - New member training
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR)
 - National List Rules
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting questions?
 - Room change – will send updated agenda
 - Dinner
 - Reception?
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (ADB)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Approve March 21, 2023 notes were accepted as written**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Spring 2023 NOSB meeting logistics, oral comment webinars
 - Potential questions/topics for NOP for Q & A at meeting. Import status; Equivalency with partners and enforcement issues; Grain; SOE training/course availability; Incorporation of guidance from Equity Commission; NOSB technical support update.
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**

- Address designation change of NOSB seats to Special Government Employees (SGEs) at the NOSB meeting? NOP mentioned that the NOSB has adopted Conflict of Interest (COI) rules that are essentially the same as the Federal Guidelines, so the two new SGE members are not viewed differently than the representative members. A member added that commenters may mention it and if so they may talk about it.
- New member training. Several sessions are scheduled during the NOSB meeting week, and for May 8 in DC, as several members will already be in DC.
- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). Implementation continues. NOP views the rule positively and while there may be gaps, overall NOP feels like it will be tremendously beneficial and will improve the industry. A member emphasized how randomness is valuable for enforcement. He described it as a panopticon - the potential you are always being observed.
- Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). Under legal review.
- The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food). Under development and will move along once OLPS is farther along.
- Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). The NOP will provide an update at the NOSB meeting and will summarize comments. In brief, 70% of the issues can be solved easily, while 30% will take additional thought and work. The NOP will likely send a work agenda to the NOSB this summer, with a request that it provides a timely, clear recommendation about where to go next before the next sunset date.
- National List Rules. The Nitrogen Rule is with EPA (for consultation). NOP will provide an update at the NOSB meeting.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting questions? None
 - Room change – NOP will send an updated agenda.
 - The NOP noted the NOSB dinner, and a reception hosted by several local organizations.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) (KS). Scheduled work agenda items for summer and beyond. Waiting on several TRs.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). Materials has three documents for the April meeting.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD). PDS met last week and discussed public comments. The Subcommittee will be working on updates to the PPM for the Fall meeting, but will not have any documents for the Spring meeting.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). Livestock Subcommittee has completed TR determinations for the 2026 sunsets. After the Spring meeting, the LS will complete the 2025 sunset reviews in preparation for the Fall meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) (ADB). Jon Veley, Trade Systems Director, joined the last CACS call. The CACS is working on several documents on climate change, and enforcement, and have one work agenda request on residue testing. The CACS Chair submitted a request to the Executive Committee who approved the request, and the NOP indicated its full support.
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). The CS Chair is coordinating with the Chairs of the HS and LS to schedule sunset discussions since there is overlap of Subcommittee members. The Chairs are also interested in coordinating and scheduling TR due dates, so they can plan their workflow better. The NOSB Chair will mention the process changes during the Chair's update at the NOSB meeting so they are being transparent. A member suggested that the NOSB prioritize the TR sufficiency step, even though they have 60 days to complete it.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

March 21, 2023

April 17, 2023 (Monday)

May 16, 2023

June 20, 2023

July 18, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 18, 2023

October 17, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023 (actual date)	10
New NOSB member training	Apr 6 + Apr 25-27, 2023	3
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	11
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	0
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	4 weeks post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, March 21, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - PDS Chair; Nate Lewis (NL) - observer

Absent: Jennifer Tucker (JT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve February 21, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Welcome new NOSB members
 - Spring 2023 NOSB meeting logistics: oral comments, meeting start times, time blocks
- **NOP news and updates (JT/EH)**
 - New member training
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR)
 - National List Rules
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline reminder
 - Travel prep
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) (ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Approve February 21, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - The Executive Team welcomed the two new NOSB members
 - Spring 2023 NOSB meeting logistics: oral comments, meeting start times, time blocks. The NOSB Chair has been receiving comments from stakeholders regarding the oral comments being held virtually only and not also at the in-person meeting. The NOSB views it as more equitable, and allows the Board members more time to process and analyze comments before voting. Members discussed the benefits of both structures. The Chair offered to answer questions that members may receive.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**

- New member training. NOP is rearranging the training a bit given the new members were appointed a little later than normal. Training will be delivered in separate sessions including an NOP led session Thursday afternoon after the NOSB meeting in Atlanta.
- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). Since the rule was published earlier this year, NOP has held one public webinar to collect feedback as it develops an FAQ library. The NOP is also working on a side-by-side comparison of the old rule and new rule, which may answer many of the initial questions. The NOP encourages stakeholders to read the rule and get certified.
- Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). The final rule is a top priority and NOP is working diligently to complete it.
- The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food). Deferred until OLPS is finished.
- Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). NOP is holding internal discussions about next steps.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline reminder. See timeline below. Public comment closes April 5, the comment webinars are being held via Zoom on April 18 & 20, and the in-person meeting begins April 25, 2023
 - Travel. Please complete flight arrangements by April 4, 2023.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Crops (CS) (ADB).** The Crops Subcommittee has been working on scheduling for the rest of the year, and have all critical deadlines scheduled. The new process of scheduling the work for the entire year will be more efficient and will allow people to control their own work schedule as needed. On the last call the CS welcomed one new member and determined TR needs for the 2026 sunsets.
 - **Handling (HS) (KS).** The HS has scheduled work for the upcoming year, including prepping for the Spring NOSB meeting, and the reviews of the 2025 sunsets. The HS has twenty-nine sunsets for 2026 and three petitions in progress. On the last call the HS welcomed a new member to the Subcommittee.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT).** The MS has three documents for the Spring 2023 meeting: Research priorities; TR templates update; and the TBD list of excluded methods. The Subcommittee rescheduled the date of the April meeting.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) (JD).** The PDS met last week to discuss its work agenda items for the Fall meeting, which may include an update to the PPM, and feedback on the update to the Member Guide. The PDS will not present any documents for the Spring meeting. The group also discussed exit interviews for outgoing members; A project that has received much positive feedback. The PDS continues to discuss where to store the information and how to use the data to support the ultimate goals of continuous improvement. Lastly, the PDS briefly discussed the new Special Government Employee (SGE) designation for members, but will not initiate any work on such.
 - **Livestock (LS) (KH).** The LS welcomed two new Subcommittee members today, prepped for the Spring 2023 meeting, and began discussions about the 2026 TR determinations. The LS will complete the conversation about Sunsets on the next meeting.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB).** The CACS has three topics for the Spring meeting: a proposal on Organic IS Climate Smart; A discussion document on Crop Insurance; and a discussion document on Geolocation Standardization. There are two other projects on the work agenda: One on Organic Transition, and one focusing on marketing and outreach called “What/Why Organic?”. The Chair proposed a potential work agenda item on SOE follow-up, but given the timing of the implementation, the CACS may not move ahead with this for the Fall meeting. During its last call the CACS discussed testing and soybean imports, and has extended an invitation to the NOP Trade Systems Director to join the April 11 CACS call.

- **Additional Items.** Sunset process changes. The MS Chair offered positive feedback and support about the process changes to the sunset reviews and to the entire NOSB work-flow. Rather than work semester to semester, the NOSB is now scheduling work for the entire year, in the interest of efficiency.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

February 21, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 17, 2023 (Monday)

May 16, 2023

June 20, 2023

July 18, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 18, 2023

October 17, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023 (actual date)	10
New NOSB member training	Mar 28 - 29, 2023	3
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	11
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	0
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	4 weeks post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, February 21, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - PDS Chair

Absent: Kyla Smith, HS Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve January 17, 2023 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Accomplishments
 - Plans for member support
 - Spring 2023 NOSB meeting logistics: oral comments, meeting start times, time blocks
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR)
 - National List Rules
 - Nomination's update
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline reminder (See below). Next steps to prep for meeting
 - Travel reservations
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Work agenda request on SOE
 - Crops (CS) (ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (AJ for KS). Annotations
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **January 17, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Accomplishments. The chair applauded the members for launching a new process for sunset reviews, and although the transition had some bumps, they were able to complete the documents in a timely manner for the Spring meeting. The Vice Chair provided a summary of the Handling Subcommittee discussion about a workflow strategy for the post- Spring NOSB meeting. The goal is to schedule all discussions and reviews far in advance to provide ample time for consideration.

- Plans for member support. The Chair thanked members for the trust and support they show towards each other. The group discussed ideas for a memorial gift for a member, and several members offered to lead the various efforts.
- Spring 2023 NOSB meeting logistics: oral comments, meeting start times, time blocks. The NOSB has chosen to hold the public comments for the Spring meeting virtually the week before the meeting, and not at the NOSB meeting.
- The meeting start time will either be 9 or 10 ET, which would still be a little early for the West Coast attendees given that we are live-casting it.
- Time blocks. The Spring agenda is fairly light and there should be a lot of time in the schedule for good discussion. The NOSB will have 2 items on which to vote.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). The NOP held a webinar this afternoon to summarize the rule, and reached the limit of 1000 people. The slides and recordings will eventually be posted in the Organic Integrity Learning Center. The NOP emphasized the importance of reading the rule, and to urge everyone in the supply chain get certified ASAP. The implementation date is March 2024. Members asked several questions about SOE in relation to acreage reporting, imports, export prices, and supply chain issues, specifically with regard to organic soybeans.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). The final rule is in development and there is a lot of interest from the community.
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food). The rule is in early development.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). The public comments indicate that the industry has about 70% consensus around the issue, and there is a clear path forward. NOP will provide an update at the Spring 2023 meeting and will likely send the NOSB a work agenda request.
 - National List Rules. The Nitrogen Rule is in development, and the community indicated that they see this as a higher priority than the Marketing Rule.
 - Nomination's update. The two new members should be announced soon. The group discussed the structure of the NOSB and the challenges for small farmers, as well as others. Members discussed potential solutions, and the Chair challenged members to think about recruitment practices.
 - The NOP response to the Fall 2022 meeting recommendations is in clearance and will be sent to the NOSB soon.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline reminder (See below). The NOP mentioned some next steps to prep for Spring meeting.
 - Travel reservations. The NOSB will be able to make flight arrangements soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has three documents for the Spring meeting: The Organic IS climate smart proposal, and two discussion documents, one on Crop insurance and one on acreage reporting. There are two other documents on the CACS work agenda for the Fall 2023 meeting. The CACS is also discussing a potential work agenda request regarding SOE.
 - Crops (CS) (ADB). The Crops Subcommittee held a meeting today and talked about planning for the upcoming year. They talked about sunset review process and scheduled discussion dates.
 - Handling (HS) (AJ). The HS didn't hold a call today. The Subcommittee has several items on their work agenda, including a potential project on annotations, and for the Spring meeting will discuss one project proposal on resins, and about 19 sunset reviews.

- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The Materials Chair commended the members for their work on the Research Priorities, Excluded Methods TBD list, and the TR template update. All three documents will come to the Spring meeting as discussion documents.
- Policy Development (PDS) (JD). The PDS did not meet this month as they are not working on any documents for the Spring meeting. They intend on convening over the Spring and summer to work on updates to the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM).
- Livestock (LS) (KH). The Livestock Subcommittee completed their sunset documents and have a fairly light agenda. A couple of the sunsets may solicit robust feedback. The LS also updated some of its Research Priorities and hope to solicit community feedback at the Spring meeting.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

- January 17, 2023
- February 21, 2023
- March 21, 2023
- April 17, 2023 (Monday)
- May 16, 2023
- June 20, 2023
- July 18, 2023
- August 15, 2023
- September 18, 2023
- October 17, 2023
- November 21, 2023
- December 19, 2023

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023 (actual date)	10
New NOSB member training	Mar 28 - 29, 2023	3
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	11
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1

Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	0
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	4 weeks post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, January 17, 2023 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - PDS Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC) - Livestock Vice Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve December 20, 2022 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Panels at NOSB meetings
 - Oral comment at meeting
 - NOSB membership update
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). Comments closed December 31, 2022
 - National List Rules
 - Nomination's update
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline reminder (See below)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG/ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (KS). Annotations
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **December 20, 2022 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Panels at NOSB meetings. The group discussed hosting panels, which they haven't done in a few years. There are several considerations, such as topics, logistics (virtual or in-person), panelist invitations, travel expenses, administrative staff support time, and other factors. The Chair will follow up with the NOP about ideas as they move forward.
 - Oral comment at meeting. The NOSB Chair asked for feedback about the format of the NOSB meeting regarding both the hybrid format and oral comment. Members discussed the merits of hearing oral comments both before and during the meeting, versus hearing them the week before the meeting.

- NOSB membership update. The Chair announced that one of the NOSB members resigned her seat due to work-load on her farm. She was applauded for making the difficult but gracious decision.
- Members discussed non-participation by members, and the NOSB process for addressing this as noted in the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM). The Executive team members offered feedback, and may add some additional guidance to the PPM about expectations and workload.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). Office of Management and Budget finalized its review of SOE, and it will be on public display at the Federal Register one day before it publishes.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) Final Rule. Rulemaking is in progress.
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food). Proposed rule is in development.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). The NOP received 386 comments during the comment period, which closed December 31, 2022. NOP is analyzing comments.
 - National List Rules. The rule addressing ammonia (stripped and concentrated) and nitrogen fertilizers is in development, and NOP will consult with the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) as it proceeds.
 - The Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) training is next week in New Orleans. The NOP will attend, and will be delivering multiple training sessions.
 - Updates on court cases. The USDA Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) and/or Department of Justice (DOJ) posts information about cases, depending on who initiates the action and what type of enforcement action it is.
 - Nomination's update. The nomination package is in clearance. With the recent resignation of an NOSB member, the Secretary will choose two new NOSB members instead of one.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline reminder (See below). The Board members discussed using the time immediately after an NOSB meeting to complete documents for the next meeting. A member added that to balance the workload, it would be helpful to view the work agenda on a year-long basis, rather than semester to semester.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). The Subcommittee is short members at the moment. The LS spent today's call discussing research priorities and will complete sunset reviews on the next call.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has several large projects and is making good progress. Will have 4 or 5 documents for the Spring 2023 meeting. The Chair noted that the CACS doesn't typically have research priorities given the nature of the list.
 - Crops (CS) (RG/ADB). Rick Greenwood, who is completing his term on the NOSB, thanked the new Crops Chair as they transition. Crops completed several sunsets, but will add an additional call to complete the remainder of the documents before the deadline.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). Handling has completed most if not all of its sunset reviews, and has a couple of other projects and a petition to work on. Currently there are three pending TRs.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The MS Chair thanked everyone for their work on the Research Priorities, and noted a possible role for "other" Subcommittees like CACS. Currently the bulk of research priorities are from Crops, Livestock, and Handling. Subcommittees are asked to provide their lists to the MS by January 20, so the MS can finalize the document for the spring meeting. The MS is working on two other projects; the TBD list for Excluded Methods, and a revision of the TR templates.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD). The PDS didn't meet this month, but has a couple of projects on its work agenda to update the PPM and talk about exit interviews.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

December 20, 2022

January 17, 2023

February 21, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 17, 2023 (Monday)

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 23, 2023	
New NOSB member training	Mar 28 - 29, 2023	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	