

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Wednesday January 9, 2013 2:00 pm EST**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Carmela Beck (CBe), John Foster (JFo), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Mac Stone (MS),

Absent: Harold Austin (HA), Barry Flamm (BF)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process					
Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested ?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS?	8/2006 TR No new TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process					
Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 Proposal. List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR		Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12.	Spr 2013
Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Quick, modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - will move to fall.	Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	HA/ZS	No 4/2011 TR		Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness.	Spr 2013?/Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013
Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 08 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12.	N/A
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . List at §205.601 Indole-3 -butyric acid (IBA) 2008 .	JFo	6/2011 TR No new TR rqstd		12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	Spr 2013

Inert Ingredients

Inerts update	JFe/ZS			Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
---------------	--------	--	--	--	----------

Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Fire blight (Tree fruit)	HA		On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012		Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee	Spr 2013
GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS			Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee	Spr 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for spring 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: Polyoxin D Zinc Salt; tetracycline petition (with ZS); streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with ZS)

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H)

CBo: Aquaculture CO2 (with ZS); Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid – Sunset 2015 material at 601(j)

JFe: Inerts (with ZS); aqueous potassium silicate – Sunset 2015; 3. Seed Purity –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); Plant Breeding –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo)

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate; indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) petition for reconsideration

NM: Vinasse; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas

ZS: Inerts (with JFe); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015; tetracycline petition (with HA); streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with HA)

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve December 18, 2012 subcommittee meeting notes
- Tetracycline petition (HA and ZS) – review checklist
- IBA recap and vote
- Check-Ins/Recap/TR response time?
 - Polyoxin D Zinc, petitioner response? (HA)
 - Vinasse (NM)
 - Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (NM)
 - Inerts (JFe, ZS)
 - Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H) (CBe)
 - Aquaculture: CO2 (CBo and ZS)
- Do leads for sunset materials believe an updated TR is needed to conduct review? (Take questions by email as follow up): (i) Aqueous potassium silicate – Sunset 2015 (JFe) – see attached questions in checklist format, (ii) Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015 (ZS), (iii) Sulfurous Acid – Sunset 2015 material (CBo)
- (If time allows) Aquaculture thoughts after policy briefing and what CS would like to see as follow up
- Next Meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The agenda was approved with no changes except ZS noted she is not ready to discuss Aquaculture - CO₂.
- December 18, 2012 subcommittee meeting notes were approved with no changes
- Tetracycline petition (HA and ZS). The intent of the proposal is to recap the history of the substance and the original review and to look at the more recent research available and fill in any gaps. The group discussed proposing an extended phase-out on the expiration date of 2017 and an annotation to require growers to use alternatives. The proposal and annotation are not written yet, as the members are still gathering info. SJK added that an annotation may not be necessary, as it could be part of the preamble or guidance, but ZS noted that the preference is to have it in the annotation at the outset, for the purpose of enforceability. ZS and HA plan to have an annotation written for the next meeting. The consensus is that tetracycline needs to be phased out but the Board is cognizant of consumers and growers, and would advocate for a longer phase out period. A member asked about alternatives, and how this situation was different than what was already in the regulation. ZS replied that they would like to specify amounts instead of only including vague language about “trying to use alternatives” with the intent of preparing growers for the elimination of antibiotics by 2017. A member cautioned the group about the difference between an accreditation problem versus the regulation at § 605.206, when the regulation is adequate. JFe asked if JFo would be willing to write some language summarizing this for inclusion in the checklist. Another member in support of not adding lengthy annotations noted that this notion is similar to the pasture rule, whereby there were unseen implications of becoming too prescriptive. JFe asked that the group continue the discussion via email if there is a need to discuss further. ZS asked that people help contribute to the annotation. Additional info is requested by Monday afternoon, Jan 14
- Members discussed aquaculture and the path forward for preparing their review. JFe will work on questions, and MS suggested talking with Max Mayeaux of the USDA to clarify some topics. The group is hoping to have a series of seminars to elucidate some of the points that were not addressed on the aquaculture call last week. JFe asked about TR requests for the aquaculture materials and if the group felt they could be ready in the next 30 days. SJK asked about sending Max Mayeaux an example of a TR and Supplemental TR so he can evaluate how the questions may need to be altered in the context of an aquaculture production system, so the Subcommittee

can determine if they are asking the right questions. ZS asked how aquatic plants are different from hydroponics, and suggested that this needs to be reevaluated for consistency.

- Aqueous potassium silicate: The chair asked if the group felt that they should go forward with a TR. A checklist was circulated for review with the agenda.
- Sulfurous acid: The lead person recommended a TR request for this material
- Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate: The lead person noted that they have adequate information for the review and would not recommend requesting a new TR. JFe asked if the checklist could be ready for the Jan 15 meeting.
- IBA. There is new information in the petition, but it was difficult to find, so JFo will re-circulate the checklist with the hope that the group can vote on this during the next meeting (Jan 15)
- Adjourned
- ABS note: The table above was altered to reflect the new target meeting date for the aquaculture petitions.

Future Call Schedule:

January 9, 2013 2:00 EST

Vote on IBA - postponed until next meeting
Determine Sunset TRs

January 15, 2013 2:00 EST

Vote on IBA
Discuss/vote Tetracycline proposal and checklist
Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

February 5, 2013 2:00 EST

February 19, 2013 2:00 EST

March 5, 2013 2:00 EST

March 19, 2013 2:00 EST

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Wednesday January 15, 2013 2:00 pm EST**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Carmela Beck (CBe), John Foster (JFo), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), Barry Flamm (BF)

Absent: Mac Stone (MS), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process					
Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested ?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS?	8/2006 TR No new TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process					
Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 Proposal. List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR		Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12.	Spr 2013
Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Quick, modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - will move to fall.	Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	HA/ZS	No 4/2011 TR	Straw poll 01 15 13	Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness.	Spr 2013?/Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013
Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 08 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12.	N/A
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . List at §205.601 Indole-3 -butyric acid (IBA) 2008 .	JFo	6/2011 TR No new TR rqstd		12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	Spr 2013

Inert Ingredients

Inerts update	JFe/ZS			Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
---------------	--------	--	--	--	----------

Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Fire blight (Tree fruit)	HA		On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012		Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee	Spr 2013
GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS			Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee	Spr 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Crops Subcommittee

Work Assignments, Draft Agenda (January 15, 2013/2:00pmEST meeting), Action Items

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Spring 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: Polyoxin D Zinc Salt; tetracycline petition (with ZS); streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with ZS)

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H)

CBo: Aquaculture CO2 (with ZS); Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid – Sunset 2015 material at 601(j)

JFe: Inerts (with ZS); Aqueous potassium silicate – Sunset 2015; 3. Seed Purity –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); Plant Breeding –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo)

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate; indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) petition for reconsideration

NM: Vinasse; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner)

ZS: Inerts (with JFe); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015; tetracycline petition (with HA); streptomycin

petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with HA)

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve January 9, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes
- Tetracycline petition (HA and ZS) – review checklist and vote
- IBA (JFo) – additional thoughts and vote
- Polyoxin D Zinc (HA) – update and next steps
- Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015 (ZS) – TR necessary?
- Next Meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The agenda was approved with no changes
- January 9, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes were approved with a note to the ABS that one of the links in the workplan table above was not working.
- HA summarized the Tetracycline petition and proposal and the group discussed various aspects. There were several changes made to the document since the last call, including the separation of the discussions of apples (expiring in 2017) and pears (remove expiration date). Since the organic pear industry is much more vulnerable than that of apples (if tetracycline is prohibited, virtually the entire organic pear industry will disappear from the market), the group felt this was the best way to discuss/review them. The default motion would be to include the 2017 expiration date for both apples and pears. Topics that were discussed include: annotations, which a member thought might be redundant (i.e. pest control and alternatives); the intention of the proposal and if it would be required to label pears as antibiotic free, which was not something that was considered when writing the proposal; and the historical context from past Board deliberations. ZS indicated that the current Board is in a better position to make an informed decision. The NOP asked about the way forward for a grower if all of the alternatives are exhausted, to which a member replied that this scenario would not occur because there are many variables that can be adjusted from year to year. The NOP asked for clarification about the motions that would be included in the proposal, and asked that the members consider how things would proceed for voting. The chair indicated that he would like to take a straw vote today and continue to work on the document before taking an official vote. A member asked for clarification of the motion, since it is complicated. For example, are there implications from removal of the expiration date?

Straw vote tetracycline for pears: Yes: HA, CBe, JFo, ZS No: CBo, BF, JFe, NM

Straw vote: tetracycline for apples: Yes: HA, CBe, JFo, ZS, No: CBo, BF, JFe, NM

ZS added that a different annotation might result in a different outcome, and requested that the others who cast a no vote weigh in with any suggestions. BF will send around some language from the last Board recommendation.

- The group did not have time to discuss the remainder of the agenda items, so MA added an additional call on Jan 29

Future Call Schedule:

January 9, 2013 2:00 EST

Vote on IBA - postponed until next meeting
Determine Sunset TRs

January 15, 2013 2:00 EST

Vote on IBA -postponed
Discuss/vote Tetracycline proposal and checklist -postponed
Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

January 29, 2013 2:00 EST – additional call

Vote on IBA
Final discussion/vote on Tetracycline proposal and checklist
Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

February 5, 2013 2:00 EST

February 19, 2013 2:00 EST

March 5, 2013 2:00 EST

March 19, 2013 2:00 EST

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes – Additional call
Tuesday January 29, 2013 2:00 pm EST**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Carmela Beck (CBe), John Foster (JFo), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), Mac Stone (MS), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process

Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 Proposal. (CAS # 146659-78-1) List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR	01 29 13	Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12. CS requested addtl info from TR contractor. TR revisions sent to CS 1/18/13	Spr 2013
Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited , modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - will move to fall.	Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	HA/ZS	No 4/2011 TR	Straw poll: 01 15 13 Vote recorded: 1 29 13	Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness.	Spr 2013?/Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013
Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 08 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12.	N/A

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process					
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . CAS# 133-32-4 List at \$205.601 Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2008 .	JFo	6/2011 TR No new TR rqstd	01 29 13	12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	Spr 2013

Inert Ingredients					
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Fire blight (Tree fruit)	HA		On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012		Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013
GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS			Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Crops Subcommittee

Work Assignments, Draft Agenda (January 29, 2013/2:00pmEST meeting), Action Items

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Spring 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: Polyoxin D Zinc Salt; tetracycline petition (with ZS); streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with ZS)

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H)

CBo: Aquaculture CO2 (with ZS); Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid – Sunset 2015 material at 601(j)

FT: No assignments yet.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS); aqueous potassium silicate – Sunset 2015; 3. Seed Purity –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); Plant Breeding –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo)

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate; indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) petition for reconsideration

NM: Vinasse; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner)

ZS: Inerts (with JFe); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015; tetracycline petition (with HA); streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with HA)

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve January 15, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes
- Polyoxin D Zinc (HA) – review new points on checklist and VOTE
- IBA (JFo) – review new points on checklist and VOTE
- Tetracycline petition (HA and ZS) – new thoughts, prepare for 2/1 meeting
- Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015 (ZS) – TR necessary? –postponed to next meeting. Not ready yet.
- Next Meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The agenda was approved as is, with the postponement of the discussion of sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate to the next meeting
- The January 15, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes were approved with no changes
- Polyoxin D Zinc (HA) –The group discussed new information that was added to the document since the last discussion and made some edits to the language. A member reminded the group to be mindful of the language when the classification vote is taken as the petitioner originally classified it as non-synthetic but revised it and re-classified it as synthetic. Group considered whether or not there is an impact on the beneficial aspects, and acknowledged that there is some CBI included that hinders their review. The members also discussed zinc concentrations.

Vote on Polyoxin D Zinc. Chair asked for any COIs-none reported

- Motion to classify Polyoxin D Zinc (CAS # 146659-78-1) as petitioned as synthetic:
- Motion by: HA
- Seconded by: CBo
- The members had no declarations of interest or additional discussion
- Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- Motion to list Polyoxin D Zinc (CAS # 146659-78-1) as petitioned on §205.601

- Motion by: HA
- Seconded by: CB
- No further discussion
- Yes: 3 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

The Chair indicated that the vote will remain open until February 5, 2013 if members would like to reread any of the documents that were presented. ABS note February 5: the vote was closed with no changes.

- IBA -JFo gave a brief summary of IBA and acknowledged that the addition of language from JFe was very helpful. It was also noted that 5 growers provided support for this material. The NOSB had rejected broader uses of IBA in the past and the petitioner narrowed the scope of the item and resubmitted the petition. Although the resubmitted petition didn't include any new technical info, it was rewritten in such a way to highlight some pertinent information that was not evident in the first petition.

Vote on IBA:

Motion to classify IBA (CAS# 133-32-4) as petitioned as synthetic:

Motion by: JFo

Seconded by: HA

There were no declarations of interest or any further discussion

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to list IBA as petitioned (CAS# 133-32-4) on §205.601 for the purpose of plant propagation via dipping.

Motion by: JFo

Seconded by: HA

No further discussion

Yes: 3 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- Tetracycline (Antibiotics). The group discussed potential questions for Brenda Book of the Washington State Department of Agriculture who will join the call on Friday to discuss antibiotics. Members were asked to send questions to HA by Wednesday afternoon (January 30) so he could compile them and forward them to Brenda prior to the call. A member noted that pears and apples are grown in different regions in CA which is not the case in WA State and that the information that has been presented so far seems to be WA centric.

Straw vote: tetracycline for pears **taken Jan 15 during call:** Yes: HA, CBe, JFo, ZS No: CBo, BF, JFe, NM

Straw vote: tetracycline for apples **taken Jan 15 during call:** Yes: HA, CBe, JFo, ZS, No: CBo, BF, JFe, NM

Vote on Tetracycline via email as of Jan 24 2013:

Motion #1:

Motion to remove the expiration date of October 21, 2014 and add the following annotation for tetracycline for apples only,

§205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production

(i) As plant disease control. (12) Tetracycline, for fire blight control in apples only until October 21, 2017. Orchard management systems must demonstrate and document annual increase in the extent or number of alternative practices for controlling fire blight.

Motion by: HA
Seconded by: ZS
Yes: 4 No: 4 Absent: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion #2:

Motion to remove the expiration date of October 21, 2014 and add the following annotation for pears:
§205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production.

(i) As plant disease control.

(12) Tetracycline, for fire blight control in pears only. Orchard management systems must demonstrate and document annual increase in the extent or number of alternative practices for controlling fire blight.

Motion by: Harold Austin
Seconded by: Zea Sonnabend
Yes: 4 No: 4 Absent: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

The group noted that a backup vote on the motion is not required and the voting order should be reversed, so the motion for Pears would be voted on first, so if it does not pass at the NOSB meeting, they then can choose to combine the motions. **The vote was left open so if members wanted to change their vote or propose a substitute motion they could.**

Future Call Schedule:

January 15, 2013 2:00 EST

Vote on IBA –delayed due to time constraint
Discuss/vote Tetracycline proposal and checklist – delayed for additional discussion and edits/will vote via email
Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

January 29, 2013 2:00 EST Extra call

Vote on IBA
Review vote for Tetracycline proposal and checklist
Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

February 5, 2013 2:00 EST

Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

February 19, 2013 2:00 EST

March 5, 2013 2:00 EST

March 19, 2013 2:00 EST

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013

Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday February 5, 2013 2:00 pm EST**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Carmela Beck (CBe), John Foster (JFo), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Francis Thicke (FT), Mac Stone (MS) – non voting member

Absent: Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR) substituting for SJK

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process

Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested ?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 Proposal. (CAS # 146659-78-1) List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR	01 29 13	Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12. CS requested addtl info from TR contractor. TR revisions sent to CS 1/18/13	Spr 2013
Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited , modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - will move to fall.	Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	HA/ZS	No 4/2011 TR	Straw poll: 01 15 13 Vote recorded : 1 29 13	Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013
Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 08 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12.	N/A
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . CAS# 133-32-4 List at §205.601 Indole-3 -butyric acid (IBA) 2008 .	JFo	6/2011 TR No new TR rqstd	01 29 13	12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	Spr 2013

Inert Ingredients					
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012	GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013
GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS		GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Agenda

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Spring 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with ZS)

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H)

CBo: Aquaculture CO2 (with ZS); Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid – Sunset 2015 material at 601(j)

FT: No assignments yet.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS); Aqueous potassium silicate – Sunset 2015; 3. Seed Purity –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); Plant Breeding –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo)

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate

NM: Vinasse; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner)

ZS: Inerts (with JFe); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015; tetracycline petition (with HA); streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with HA)

Approve agenda

Approve January 29, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate. Sunset 2015 (ZS). TR necessary?

Inerts update (ZS and JFe)

Tetracycline petition, debrief meeting with WSDA, questions, thoughts, next steps, etc.

Workplan Issues for Fall 2013

Next Meeting

Adjourn

Discussion

- Agenda was approved as is
- January 29, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes approved with clarifications to the voting for tetracycline to be completed by MA (Corrections made 02 06 13 by MA). The Jan. 24 vote was a straw vote, followed by an official email vote, with provision that the committee may decide to revoke.
- Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate - Sunset 2015 (ZS). The group discussed whether or not a new TR would be necessary. The members feel the old TR is not adequate to conduct the new review so they recommend requesting a new one. The NOP will also review the documents and see if a supplemental TR or a full TR is needed. ZS compiled 6 key questions for submission, and would like to revisit the annotation when the TR is received. A member noted that the previous NOSB recommendation for this substance is not posted on website. (MA will correct this)
- JFe will send a request to the National List Manager (LB) by Thursday Feb 7 for TRs for the three sunset materials, and seek input about whether or not a full TR is needed. The NOP noted that the old TRs may require updating.
- Inerts update (ZS and JFe) – The group discussed the presentation time for this item at the spring 2013 meeting, and suggested that it could be presented during the NOP update time on Tuesday. The update will include information about the grouping of materials; 16 groups, 9 individual materials, some of which will require TRs. The next steps include preparing a Federal Register notice to request information about any additional items that should be included. Workplan items for fall 2013: pending TR requests, the Crops Subcommittee will be able to complete some of the workplan items such as Vinasse.
- A member noted that the Classification Guidance might be coming out soon, which could mean that the CS may need to revisit some classifications, such as vinasse and soy protein isolate.
- Tetracycline petition, debrief meeting with WSDA, questions, thoughts, next steps, etc.
 - NM made a motion to move ahead with a 2-year extension for tetracycline (with an expiration date of 2016). He also suggested no annotation beyond that, but instead the inclusion of a rationale for stakeholders. A member asked if this was the same as a statement already included in the current checklist about “moving towards alternative methods”. NM felt that, as a grower, the language is too general and enforcement may be difficult, but that a 2-year extension would convey to the community that the NOSB intention is to phase out tetracycline. A member added that the language included in the narrative is more for the certifier than the growers. A member supported submission of the document as is, so they could decide how to proceed once the public has had a chance to comment. In response to a question about growers exhausting the alternatives, ZS noted that the possibilities are never exhausted because there are many variables that can be altered each season: timing, weather, materials, combinations, pruning schedules, etc.

The group discussed including the revised motion with two annotations, the second to include a vote for the “sense of the Board”. The NOP does not recommend an earlier expiration date as the rulemaking process will take the majority of that time, at which point it will be time to re-evaluate. JFe encouraged the group to keep the annotations in the vote, rather than deciding to add one later at the meeting, after the public comment period closes.

Vote on Tetracycline:

The Subcommittee was unanimous in its decision to vote again on tetracycline.

Motion # 1:

Motion to amend listing of tetracycline to remove the expiration date of 2014 and add the following annotation:
For use in control of fireblight in apples and pears until Oct 21, 2016

Motion by: NM

Seconded by: HA

Discussion: the Chair noted for the record that members are voting before we have the completed document.

Yes: 5 No: 3 Absent: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion # 2:

The subcommittee discussed wording for an additional resolution, to this effect: The National Organic Standards Board is committed to the phase out of this material. The board urges growers and certifiers between now and the 2016 expiration date, to encourage an annual increase in the extent and/or number of alternative practices that are trialed for controlling fire blight. In addition, the board strongly supports increased support for research into these alternative practices and materials.

- MA will add an extra Crops call for Monday Feb 11 at 2:00pm ET to finalize the tetracycline proposal.

Future Call Schedule:

January 29, 2013 2:00 ET Extra call

Vote on IBA

Review vote for Tetracycline proposal and checklist

Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

February 5, 2013 2:00 ET

Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

Inerts update (ZS and JFe)

Tetracycline petition, debrief meeting with WSDA, questions, thoughts, next steps, etc.

Workplan Issues for Fall 2013

February 11, 2013 2:00 ET – additional call

February 19, 2013 2:00 ET

March 5, 2013 2:00 ET

March 19, 2013 2:00 ET

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday February 11, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Carmela Beck (CBe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), Mac Stone (MS), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: John Foster (JFo)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK), Miles McEvoy

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process

Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested ?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Begin review fall 2013	Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 Proposal. (CAS # 146659-78-1) List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR	01 29 13	Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12. CS requested addtl info from TR contractor. TR revisions sent to CS 1/18/13	Spr 2013
Name	Contact	TR requested ?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited , modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - will move to fall.	Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	No 4/2011 TR	Straw poll: 01 15 13, vote recorded: 1 29 13 Revoted 02 05 13. Voted on resolution: 02 11 13	Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013
Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 08 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12.	N/A
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . CAS# 133-32-4 List at	JFo	6/2011 TR No new	01 29 13	12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition	Spr 2013

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

§205.601 Indole-3 -butyric acid (IBA) 2008.		TR rqstd		found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	
--	--	----------	--	---------------------------------------	--

Inert Ingredients

Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals

Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012	GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013
GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS		GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Agenda

- Approve agenda for call
- Approve February 5, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes

- Vote on tetracycline resolution

Discussion

- Agenda was approved with no changes
- February 5, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes were deferred to the next call so the Subcommittee members had time to review them
- **Vote on Tetracycline:**

Motion # 1: Voted on during the February 5, 2013 call

Motion # 2:

Resolution: The National Organic Standards Board is committed to the phase out of this material. The board urges growers and certifiers between now and the 2016 expiration date, to encourage an annual increase in the extent and/or number of alternative practices that are trialed for controlling fire blight. In addition, the board strongly advocates to the USDA a high priority for increased support for research into these alternative practices and materials.”

Motion by: NM

Seconded by: ZS

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Absent: 1 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

The group discussed some additional edits that were made to the most recent version of the document (2013 oxytet checklist draft 9 ZS), and had a vigorous debate about various aspects of the document including blocks of text in the checklist, scientific references about persistence, reference to specific people, and the minority and majority opinions. A member suggested simplifying the checklist by not marking both Yes and No for the same item. The group discussed this, and one member noted that the checklist and narrative were intentionally meant to be redundant. A member noted that although he agreed with the suggestion that the checklist be simplified, it seems like this is being suggested very late in the process and would have benefited from hearing about this sooner. Another member suggested submitting 2 separate checklists—one for the minority, and one for majority opinion. Which she then offered was not necessary, because sometimes there is not a clear answer and having both a yes and no answer reflects that. One of the members suggested adding footnotes to some of the yes/no line items for easy reference. The group decided 1) to eliminate redundancies between the checklist and the narrative, and 2) to maintain the majority/minority opinion in the document, based on their interpretation of the science. HA will make the changes discussed and send the document to the group before submitting it to the NOP.

Future Call Schedule:

February 5, 2013 2:00 EST

Discuss checklist for sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate

Inerts update (ZS and JFe)

Tetracycline petition, debrief meeting with WSDA, questions, thoughts, next steps, etc.

Workplan Issues for Fall 2013

February 11, 2013 2:00 EST – additional call

February 19, 2013 2:00 EST

March 5, 2013 2:00 EST

March 19, 2013 2:00 EST

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday February 19, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Carmela Beck (CBe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), Mac Stone (MS), Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: John Foster (JFo), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process

Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	Yes 3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2013
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	Yes 8/2006 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2013
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	Yes 9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2013

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Name	Contact	TR rqsted?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 (CAS # 146659-78-1) List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR	01 29 13	Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12. CS requested addtl info from TR contractor. TR revisions sent to CS 1/18/13	Proposal Spr 2013
Name	Contact	TR rqsted?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting

Vinasse List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited , modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - will move to fall.	Proposal Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	No 4/2011 TR	Straw poll: 01 15 13, vote recorded: 1 29 13 Revoted 02 05 13. Vote on resltion: 02 11 13	Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Proposal Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Sent to CS 02 28 13. Sufficiency due 04 29 13	Proposal Fall 2013
AQ guidance/standards for plants	ZS				TBD
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JF o	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CB e	2/2011 T R		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013
Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 08 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Due	N/A

				NLT 04 23 13	
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . CAS# 133-32-4 List at §205.601 Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2008 .	JFo	6/2011 TR No new TR rqstd	01 29 13	12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	Proposal Spr 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide		Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13.	

Inert Ingredients					
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012	GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013
GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS		GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Agenda

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Spring 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with ZS)

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H)

CBo: Aquaculture CO2 (with ZS); Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid – Sunset 2015 material at 601(j)

FT: No assignments yet.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS); Aqueous potassium silicate – Sunset 2015 –request for updated TR sent to Lisa; Plant Breeding –in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo)

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate

NM: Vinasse; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner)

ZS: Inerts (with JFe); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate – Sunset 2015; tetracycline petition (with HA); streptomycin petition –sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with HA)

- Approve agenda
- Approve February 5 and February 11, 2013 subcommittee meeting notes
- Status of TR requests
- Review schedule for posting of comments, public comment closing date, procedure for CS review and reporting back on public comments, reassessment of CS positions based on public comments, as needed
- Assign magnesium oxide petition. [Please think about volunteering for this.]
- Workplan Issues for Fall 2013
- Next Meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Agenda was approved as is.
- February 5, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes approved with no changes
- February 11, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes approved with no changes
- Status of TR requests – SJK indicated that the Vinasse TR is in development, and she would try to find out more information. The TRs for the three sunset items have been requested and the Subcommittee is awaiting their arrival. LB confirmed by phone to expect it during April 2013.
- Aquaculture items: fall 2013: ZS and Miles McEvoy were going to look at past NOSB recommendations (one on aquatic plants and one on terrestrial plants in green houses) to help inform the aquaculture review and the workplan moving forward. MA will put a placeholder on the workplan, AQ guidance/standards for aquatic plants (see table above).
- JFe asked for ZSs help with magnesium oxide and classification, and FT volunteered to review the material.
- A member asked about the status of the workplan, and whether or not the draft plan would be ready for discussion/acceptance by the next Executive Subcommittee call (March 8).
- JFe suggested adding residues in compost feedstock to the workplan as a potential item and the group discussed this. The idea would be to draft a document about contaminants. A member felt that this is covered under §205.203 and the Unavoidable Residual Environmental Contaminations (UREC) provisions, and because breakdown of residues in the compost process has not been studied, the NOSB would not be able to produce useful results. The members suggested asking the Deputy Administrator about the NOP guidance (policy memo?) that

was drafted and whether or not it is still in process. Members also discussed anaerobic digestion and vermi-compost, and manure as well, noting that heavy metal contamination falls under the manure standards for general contamination on §205.203. The consensus was that this item would not be a good use of time for the Subcommittee.

- A member noted that there was an information-sharing meeting on antibiotics at Organicology which several Board members participated in. A member asked about the sense of community with regard to the tetracycline opinion: It varies based on geographic location, but West Coast growers are generally supportive. MS asked about the potential for an overwhelming numbers of public commenters, and how the Board would accommodate this. Some members indicated that in the past the Board has chosen to stay late in order to hear all the comments. Another option would be to connect people so they could determine whether or not their comments echoed those of many others, and perhaps they could choose one representative who would speak for the many. JFe offered to help MA coordinate this effort.

Future Call Schedule:

February 19, 2013 2:00 EST

March 5, 2013 2:00 ET

March 19, 2013 2:00 ET

March 27, 2013 2:00 ET- addition call to discuss public comments

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday March 5, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), John Foster (JFo), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair)

Absent: Carmela Beck (CBe), Mac Stone (MS)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process

Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	Yes 3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	Yes 8/2006 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	Yes 9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process

Name	Contact	TR requested?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 (CAS # 146659-78-1) List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR	01 29 13	Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12. CS requested addtl info from TR contractor. TR revisions sent to CS 1/18/13	Proposal Spr 2013
Name	Contact	TR requested?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting

Vinasse List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited , modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - moved to fall 2013.	Proposal Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	No 4/2011 TR	Straw poll: 01 15 13, vote recorded: 1 29 13 Revoted 02 05 13. Vote on resltion: 02 11 13	Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Proposal Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Sent to CS 02 27 13. Sufficiency due 04 29 13	Proposal Fall 2013
AQ guidance/standards for plants	ZS				TBD
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JF o	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CB e	2/2011 T R		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013
Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from	N/A

				EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Petition suffic due 04 23 13	
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . CAS# 133-32-4 List at §205.601 Indole-3 -butyric acid (IBA) 2008 .	JFo	6/2011 TR No new TR rqstd	01 29 13	12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	Proposal Spr 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide		Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition sufficiency due ~ 04 15 13	Fall 2013

Inert Ingredients					
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert) -			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012	GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013
GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS		GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Agenda

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Spring 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with ZS)

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H)

CBo: Aquaculture CO2 (with ZS); Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid Sunset 2015 material at 601(j)

FT: No assignments yet.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS); Aqueous potassium silicate Sunset 2015 request for updated TR sent to Lisa; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo)

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate

NM: Vinasse; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner)

ZS: Inerts (with JFe); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate Sunset 2015; tetracycline petition (with HA); streptomycin petition sent back to petitioner by NOP with questions, waiting (with HA)

- Approve agenda
- Approve February 19, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes (sent out 2-25-13)
- Status of TR requests from NOP staff
- Workplan Issues for Fall 2013
- Discuss Compost, other possible workplan issues
- Discussion of public comments to-date
- Next Meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The agenda was approved with the addition of an item to discuss the NOSB meeting agenda
- February 19, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes approved with no changes
- Status of TR requests
 - Antibiotics (Streptomycin) - ZS will review petition for sufficiency and have it ready for discussion on the March 19 call.
 - Magnesium oxide. FT will review petition for sufficiency and have it ready for discussion on the April 2 call, or perhaps after the spring meeting.
 - Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert) – The Chair asked about including this in the inert review. EBR is checking into this to make sure all inerts that have been petitioned will be combined with IWG plan for review.
 - SJK will send JFo email from G. Lockwood regarding the Aquaculture petition for lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants)
- Workplan items

- Potential discussion doc re: allowance of green waste in organic systems productions and potential for contaminants such as pesticides, herbicides, heavy metals, antibiotics or animal drugs. The NOP 5016 Guidance on allowance of Green Waste says “non-organic crop residues or lawn clippings may contain pesticide residues. Provided ... that any residual pesticide levels do not contribute to the contamination of crops, soil or water, the compost is acceptable for use in organic production.” A member wanted clarification about how to identify “contamination”. The Subcommittee feels that considering green waste alone is not useful, if this topic is to be addressed it should include manure as well as compost. With that, and given that this is a complex project, the group discussed defining contamination as a long term workplan item, and crafting a white paper, which could then be used as the basis for research priorities or as the foundation for a discussion document. A member added that this is a very difficult topic due to lack of research, and the data that have been collected to date are sparse and were determined to be non-definitive. The NOP suggested that perhaps a petition as a prohibited natural for a certain types of manure could be a formal way to tackle this project on a smaller scale. The group discussed several ideas, such as starting with heavy metals as the first topic, and whether or not that would be an attainable goal. The consensus from the group is that they would like to put it on the workplan for spring 2014, and could always start working on it earlier. A member supported this and added that this is an issue in the community and feels that it is a topic that should be addressed. Other issues raised included problems associated with anaerobically digested liquid manure, and potential harm to soil microbes. The NOP noted that before it is added to the workplan, the Subcommittee needs to define the problem to be addressed and it must then be vetted by the Executive committee. A member reminded the group that this would be a long term project, and noted that it took OMRI 2 years to develop their standards on heavy metals in fertilizer and compost. Another member added that he supports inclusion of this on the workplan, but asked that the group keep in mind the needs of the farmers and growers, and supplying the growers with tools that they don’t have to second guess. An issue was raised regarding whether these are new problems or are a result of more sensitive detection levels. Likely, both are factors. The Chair will rewrite the workplan item based on today’s discussion, recirculate it, and present it to the Executive Subcommittee on Friday.
- ZS suggested two workplan items. 1) A review of the hydroponics and aquatic plants recommendations as a baseline before reviewing the aquaculture petitions. These two prior recommendations seem to be contradictory, and she feels this must be addressed before proceeding with the review for the rest of the aquaculture items. The group acknowledged the need for expediency so they can move ahead with the aquaculture petitions. As a follow up at the end of the call, the NOP determined that the April 2010 Hydroponics standards stated they were for terrestrial plants, so this particular past recommendation didn’t conflict with the current Boards review. 2) Guidance for using biodegradable mulch. JFe will present these two items to the Executive Subcommittee on the next call.
- Public comments. So far there haven’t been many comments, but it is still early in the process and the group feels that people will need time to submit thoughtful comments.

Future Call Schedule:

March 5, 2013 2:00 ET

March 19, 2013 2:00 ET

March 27, 2013 2:00 ET- additional call to discuss public comments

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday April 2, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), Mac Stone (MS), John Foster (JFo), Carmela Beck (CBe)

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Francis Thicke (FT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

Sunset 2015 - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production - Current status of review process					
Name	Contact	Technical Report (TR) requested?	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	Yes 3/2010 TR		Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	Yes 8/2006 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	Yes 9/2003 TR		Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 2 14 13	Proposal Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances – Current status of review process					
Name	Contact	TR requested?	Vote Date	Notes*	Meeting
Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Petition Polyoxin D Zinc Salt Addendum 1 (CAS # 146659-78-1) List at §205.601	HA/ZS	Yes 9/2012 TR	01 29 13	Petition sent to CS on 3/19. Request for TR 4/3/12. Draft TR sent to CS 07/13. Add'l questions sent from CS 8-15-12. TR deemed sufficient 11 20 12. CS requested addtl info from TR contractor. TR revisions sent to CS 1/18/13	Proposal Spr 2013

Name	Contact	TR requested?	Date of vote	Notes*	Meeting
Vinasse List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR		Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. Delayed TR - moved to fall 2013.	Proposal Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Tetracycline) Proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	No 4/2011 TR	Straw poll: 01 15 13, vote recorded: 1 29 13 Revoted 02 05 13. Vote on resoltn: 02 11 13	Sent to CS on 06 19 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. TR deemed sufficient	Proposal Spr 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TR		Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision, Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Sent to CS 02 27 13. Sufficiency due 04 29 13	Proposal Fall 2013
AQ guidance/standards for plants	ZS				TBD
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No		Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)		Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR		Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 for additional info	Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe			Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12	Fall 2013

Carbon monoxide (exhaust gas) List at §205.601	NM, JFe		N/A	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Petition suffic due ~04 23 13	N/A
Indole-3-butyric acid (IBA) 2012 . CAS# 133-32-4 List at §205.601 Indole-3 -butyric acid (IBA) 2008 .	JFo	6/2011 TR No new TR rqstd	01 29 13	12/2011 Final Recomm. Petition sent to CS on 11 02 12. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR rqst	Proposal Spr 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide		Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition sufficiency due ~ 04 15 13	Fall 2013

Inert Ingredients					
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	Spr 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert) - 1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)			On hold	Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On hold	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Name	Contact	Doc type	Vote Date	Notes	Meeting
Mushroom standards			On hold	Waiting to comment on rulemaking	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
GMO - seed purity	ZS	Disc doc 10/2012	GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013

GMO – plant breeding (Terminology for Excluded Methods)	ZS		GMO voted 02 06 13	Joint with GMO ad hoc Subcommittee. GMO is lead.	Spr 2013
---	----	--	--------------------	--	----------

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve March 27, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes
- CS public comments and board member presentations. Oxytetracycline, PDZS, and IBA

Discussion

- The agenda was approved as is
- March 27, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes were not sent to the Subcommittee yet for approval.
- The members summarized and discussed and public comments in relation to Oxytetracycline, PDZS, and IBA. As for the presentation, ZS and HA will present the majority opinion and JFe will present the minority opinion. Members intend on addressing some of the misconceptions that were presented in the comments regarding residues of tetracycline and language in OFPA. Members are discussing some additional issues regarding the expiration date with the NOP prior to the meeting, and suggested some supplemental language which would allow use as an emergency spray. A member asked if the NOSB has jurisdiction over this, and if they are interfering in what amounts to a certification decision. Members felt that this was sanctioned in Section 18 of the Emergency Spray Provision, and will double check with the Deputy Administrator. The two members who held the minority opinion discussed their views including not undermining the supporting science. Members discussed the opinion of the grower community that the Board is not composed of scientists, and the members noted that their hope is that the expert panel will be able to address some of the concerns.
- IBA- The vast majority of comments were against the inclusion of IBA on the list, which will be summarized and presented at the meeting
- PDZS- The vast majority of comments were against the inclusion of Polyoxin D zinc salt.
- The Inerts update is in progress, which will be presented by the NOP at the meeting.

Future Call Schedule:

March 27, 2013 2:00 ET- additional call to discuss public comments

April 2, 2013 2:00 ET

Spring 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	February 8, 2013
Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP	February 12, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	February 19, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	March 1, 2013

Discuss workplans on ES call	March 8, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	March 11, 2013
Public comment closes	March 19, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	March 25, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	March 29, 2013
Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR	April 8-11, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday May 7, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), Mac Stone (MS), John Foster (JFo), Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Carmela Beck (CBe)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

2015 Sunsets - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR	Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR	Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. TR sent to CS 04 29 13. Sufficiency due 06 28 13.		Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TAP	Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision. Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Waiting for response		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		Fall 2013

Petitioned Substances					
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. TR deemed suff 11 20 12		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info		Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe		Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12		Fall 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide TR	Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition Sufficiency response due 05 21 13		Fall 2013

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqtd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	NA	Update Fall 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	On hold	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	On hold	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Mushroom standards			Waiting to comment on rulemaking	On hold	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	JFe	DD? White paper?	Will be worked on in discrete components		TBD
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe/CBo	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Agenda

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Fall 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition (with ZS).

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H).

CBo: Aquaculture CO₂; Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR.

FT: Magnesium oxide.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS) – request for TR's for any groups?; Aqueous potassium silicate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); contamination issues in farm inputs.

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate.

NM: Vinasse, need to make TR sufficiency determination; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner).

ZS: Inerts (with JFe) – request for TR's for any groups?; streptomycin petition (with HA); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; aquaculture guidance/standards for plants.

- Approve agenda
- Approve notes of crops subcommittee meetings on March 27, 2013 and April 2, 2013
- Workplan Issues for Fall 2013
 - a. TR sufficiency determination for Vinasse
 - b. Streptomycin petition – schedule presentation and vote
 - c. aquaculture materials petition – schedule presentations and vote
 - d. magnesium oxide petition – schedule presentation and vote
 - e. aquaculture guidance/standards for plants schedule
 - f. Inerts – request for TRs for some groupings?
 - g. contaminants in farm inputs schedule

- Timing of NOP response to NOSB request to investigate possible use of emergency use (7 U.S.C. 6518(k)(6) and 7 C.F.R. 205.672) of tetracycline use for fire blight
- May 3 Federal Register on NOSB decisions on carrageenan infant formula annotation, cellulose annotation, and inerts annotation (FR notice attached)
- Thoughts on Spring 2013 NOSB meeting
- Next Meeting

Discussion

- The agenda was approved as is
- March 27 and April 2, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes approved with no changes.
- Workplan Issues for fall 2013.
 - Vinasse TR was sent to CS on April 29. The Chair would like to move forward with the petition sufficiency determination and as such, asked the members to review it. A member noted that it would be helpful to have an analysis of the final manufacturing step where supplemental additives are added to prevent further fermentation, but that the TR contractor is not able to answer those questions, so sending it back would not be productive. The group discussed the classification of Vinasse as synthetic, and if it is viewed as a fertilizer, then there is no need to move forward. The petition states that it was petitioned as a plant nutrient/soil amendment. A member had a specific question about this and will send via email.
 - Streptomycin petition - members will continue the review of this material. HA offered to assist ZS, who has already begun this review.
 - Aquaculture materials petition – The group scheduled the discussions for various materials (see below) and suggested that there may be a need to develop aquatic plants guidance in the future.
 - Magnesium oxide petition (FT). FT will have a document for the group to review for the next meeting and will discuss the need (or not) for TR
 - Hydroponics policy statement - The NOP intends on issuing guidance about this.
 - Inerts - FR notice is still with General Counsel (expected this summer), and the Working Group will be meeting next week, so the CS will wait and not request TRs on any groups at this time. The task force will be able to prepare and prioritize things in anticipation for the release of the FR.
 - Contaminants in farm inputs. JFo noted that the group should keep in mind past NOSB experiences and information, and the NOP response to these instances. Additionally, members noted the applicable guidance that already exists. The group discussed how to move forward including setting up a framework as a first step. This project is going to be large, and long term and the members felt it was necessary to create a workplan for the topic before determining any deadlines for project sub-goals.
- Timing of NOP response to NOSB request to investigate possible use of emergency use clause for tetracycline – The NOP response is high priority so SJK didn't feel it needed to be added to the workplan. The Chair will discuss this on the Executive call this Friday.
- May 3 Federal Register Notice about NOSB decisions on carrageenan, infant formula annotation, cellulose annotation, and inerts annotation – The NOSB will discuss this during the Executive Subcommittee call this Friday.

- Feedback about the spring 2013 meeting – The group discussed various aspects of the meeting, including the introduction of the emergency clause for tetracycline, without having voted on the main recommendation first. Many people were uncomfortable with the way the process was handled because several Board members and many members of the public were not aware of this document until it was projected on the screen. The group discussed the usefulness and purpose of the prep meeting, and the fact that some of the public feels the board is having “private” meetings. The meeting is intended to be preparatory in nature in an effort to make sure members are familiar with the entire slate of proposals that will be presented, and to familiarize the group with logistics and administrative details. No votes are taken nor final decisions made at this meeting.

Future Call Schedule:

May 7, 2013 2:00 ET

May 21, 2013 2:00 ET

Aquaculture-CO₂ (CBo, ZS)

Magnesium oxide (FT)

June 4, 2013 2:00 ET

Aquaculture-Chlorine (CBo)

June 18, 2013 2:00 ET

Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe)

Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe)

Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo)

Streptomycin (ZS/HA)

July 2, 2013 2:00 ET

Streptomycin (ZS/HA)

July 16, 2013 2:00 ET

AWG if needed

August 6, 2013 2:00 ET

August 20, 2013 2:00 ET

September 3, 2013 2:00 ET

September 17, 2013 2:00 ET

October 1, 2013 2:00 ET

October 15, 2013 2:00 ET

Fall 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	August 9, 2013
Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP	August 27, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	September 3, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	
Discuss workplans on ES call	
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	
Public comment closes	October 1, 2013

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~October 7, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	October 11, 2013
Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	October 21-24, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday May 21, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), John Foster (JFo), Francis Thicke (FT), Mac Stone (MS), Zea Sonnabend (ZS)

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Carmela Beck (CBe)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

2015 Sunsets - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR	Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR	Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. TR sent to CS 04 29 13. Sufficiency due 06 28 13.		Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TAP	Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision. Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Waiting for response		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		Fall 2013

Petitioned Substances					
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. TR deemed suff 11 20 12		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info		Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe		Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12		Fall 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide TR No new TR	Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition found sufficient 05 21 13. No TR requested		Fall 2013

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqtd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	NA	Update Fall 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	On hold	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	On hold	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	

Other Proposals					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Mushroom standards			Waiting to comment on rulemaking	On hold	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	JFe	DD? White paper?	Will be worked on in discrete components		TBD
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe/CBo	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013

* Yellow highlight indicates committee action needed

Agenda

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Fall 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition (with ZS).

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H).

CBo: Aquaculture CO2; Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR.

FT: Magnesium oxide.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS) – request for TR’s for any groups?; Aqueous potassium silicate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); contamination issues in farm inputs.

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate.

NM: Vinasse, need to make TR sufficiency determination; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner).

ZS: Inerts (with JFe) – request for TR’s for any groups; streptomycin petition (with HA); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; aquaculture guidance/standards for plants.

- Approve agenda
- Approve notes of Crops Subcommittee meeting on May 7, 2013
- Workplan Issues for Fall 2013
 - magnesium oxide petition – discussion and TR sufficiency (FT)
 - CO2: aquaculture (CBo)
 - contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan (JFe)
 - Inerts update (JFe)
- Report on ES discussion on NOP investigation of possible use of emergency use (7 U.S.C. 6518(k)(6) and 7 C.F.R. 205.672) of tetracycline use for fire blight
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The agenda was approved as is
- May 7, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes approved without changes.
- Workplan Issues for Fall 2013
 - Magnesium oxide petition – discussion and TR sufficiency (FT) – Magnesium Oxide is a synthetic substance petitioned to control viscosity for liquid suspension of humates. It's used as lime and is benign in soil, but is also non-essential. There are alternatives on the National List, and a member asked if the petition mentioned these and/or discussed the need for Magnesium Oxide over the others. The lead reviewer found the petition to be very thorough and the group considered the need for a TR. MgO is made from salt brine pumped from deep wells and the group thought that perhaps a TR could potentially give them more insight into any potential environmental concerns associated with the manufacturing process. They also discussed whether or not the NOSB could research those questions on their own. A member posed several questions: would the manufacturing process sway their determination, what subheading on §601 would this fit under, and where do we draw the line between essentiality and usefulness? Most members felt that the additional information about the manufacturing process would not alter their view. Subheading (j) soil amendments would be the only location under 601 that would be relevant. The consensus was that there are no detrimental effects but MgO is only essential if you apply it in liquid form, as opposed to other substances that can be applied dry. The petitioner indicated that it is preferable to apply as a liquid for worker health safety, and ease of application. The CS found the petition sufficient, and determined that they could complete the additional research on their own without requesting a TR.
 - CO₂: aquaculture (CBo) – The members discussed the review of this substance and the petition and the inherent difficulties since there are no previous standards or guidance. Instead they relied on a previous recommendation from the Handling Subcommittee. CO₂ is either mined or produced as a bi-product of a manufacturing process, and can be either a synthetic or non-synthetic process. The members discussed various topics such as the Canadian standards, and the worse-case scenario for CO₂ effects on the environment under typical use patterns. The NOP indicated that they did not have any background data, but thought that perhaps the AWG would, so JFe will compile a list of questions for the AWG. The petitioner was previously asked to provide additional information about several petitions, and he indicated that all the answers to the questions were already included in the petition. As a follow up to the response, the group asked for specific references in writing so they could locate the answers. The members would also like to have an aquatic plant expert available to answer questions in addition to the petitioner.
 - Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan (JFe) – The Chair sent a draft document to group, which included background information that they discussed on the last call. A member noted that if the intent was for this to be a proposal for spring 2014 the timeline seemed too quick. The Chair noted that it is intended to be a discussion document not a proposal, but the member still felt spring 2014 was too early a target date. Members discussed inviting Lindsay Fernandez-Salvador from OMRI to speak about the process OMRI uses for screening for contaminants. They also discussed whether or not the NOSB should take up this review if OMRI has a similar, comprehensive document. A member noted that there would potentially always be unfinished work.
 - Inerts update (JFe) - The Inerts Working Group has not met since last CS meeting, but there is ongoing work being conducted.

- The Chair relayed information from the last ES call for those who weren't on it, regarding the fireblight emergency spray. The NOP determined it was not viable, and JFe asked that the NOP look further at this issue.

Future Call Schedule:

May 21, 2013 2:00 ET
 Aquaculture-CO₂ (CBo, ZS)
 Magnesium oxide (FT)

June 4, 2013 2:00 ET
 Aquaculture-Chlorine (CBo)
 Magnesium oxide (FT)

June 18, 2013 2:00 ET
 Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe)
 Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe)
 Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo)
 Streptomycin (ZS/HA)

July 2, 2013 2:00 ET
 Streptomycin (ZS/HA)

July 16, 2013 2:00 ET
 AWG if needed

August 6, 2013 2:00 ET
 August 20, 2013 2:00 ET
 September 3, 2013 2:00 ET
 September 17, 2013 2:00 ET
 October 1, 2013 2:00 ET
 October 15, 2013 2:00 ET

Fall 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	August 9, 2013
Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP	August 27, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	September 3, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	
Discuss workplans on ES call	
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	
Public comment closes	October 1, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~October 7, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	October 11, 2013
Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	October 21-24, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday June 4, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), John Foster (JFo), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Carmela Beck (CBe), Mac Stone (MS)

Absent: Francis Thicke (FT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

2015 Sunsets - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR	Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR	Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. TR sent to CS 04 29 13. Sufficiency due 06 28 13.		Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TAP	Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision. Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Waiting for response		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		Fall 2013

Petitioned Substances					
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. TR deemed suff 11 20 12. Sent follow up questions to LB and are awaiting answers.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info		Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe		Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12		Fall 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide TR No new TR	Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition found sufficient 05 21 13. No TR requested		Fall 2013
Laminarin List at 205.601	TBD		Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13.		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqtd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	NA	Update Fall 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	On hold	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	On hold	

Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	
Other Proposals					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Mushroom standards			Waiting to comment on rulemaking	On hold	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	JFe	DD? White paper?	Will be worked on in discrete components		TBD
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe/CBo	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for fall 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition (with ZS).

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H).

CBo: Aquaculture CO₂; Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid for Spr 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR.

FT: Magnesium oxide.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS) – request for TR’s for any groups?; Aqueous potassium silicate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); contamination issues in farm inputs.

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate.

NM: Vinasse, need to make TR sufficiency determination; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner).

ZS: Inerts (with JFe) – request for TR’s for any groups?; streptomycin petition (with HA); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate for spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; aquaculture guidance/standards for plants.

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve notes of crops subcommittee meeting on May 21, 2013
- Workplan Issues for Fall 2013
 - a. magnesium oxide petition – discuss recommended proposal (FT)
 - b. CO₂: aquaculture – next steps (CBo)
 - c. chlorine: aquaculture – discuss checklist and related issues (CBo)
 - d. contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan - update (JFe)

- e. Inerts update (JFe)
- Assign petitioned material: Addition of laminarin to section 205.601 of the National List. Please think about volunteering to lead the CS on this. See email from Lisa Brines, dated June 4, 2013
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The agenda was approved as is
- The May 21, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes were approved with a minor change to the CO2 discussion (the addition of the phrase “and can be either a synthetic or non-synthetic process.”)
- Workplan Issues for Fall 2013
 - a. Magnesium oxide petition (FT). The Chair will let the NOP know that they will not request a new TR and will let FT know to proceed with the proposal and the annotation.

 - b. CO2: Aquaculture next steps (CBo) – The group discussed whether or not they could move forward before the aquaculture rule is out. MS indicated that the Subcommittees should move forward with their reviews, and have them ready for the fall meeting, unless the review is not complete. The goal is to not rush through it for fall just to get it done, but to do it thoughtfully and accurately. Petition sufficiency was determined earlier and there was no request for a new TR. ZS noted that the checklist used was out of date and information that she had provided was omitted from the review and therefore the draft proposal was unbalanced. Additionally, information about terrestrial plants should not have been included as it is not relevant.

 - c. Chlorine: aquaculture (CBo). The group discussed the petition and use of this material as a sanitizer, and discussed the need for more clarification. The Chair asked for a determination whether a TR is needed for chlorine. The Chair also asked that all petition sufficiency determinations for all aquaculture substances on the workplan be completed in the next 2 weeks. Poly-culture is built into organics and so if the standards for that and aquatic plant production were available, it would be easier to conduct this review. MS stated that CS members should not rush into completing the petition review for the fall meeting if they didn't feel they had enough background information nor information on practical applicability in the petition.

 - d. Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan - update (JFe) JFe wrote a more concise outline with timeframes because the original document had too large a scope, and will circulate it the group.

 - e. Inerts update (JFe) - The next Inerts Working Group call is June 13th and an update will be provided on the next CS call.

 - f. Assign petitioned material: Addition of laminarin to section 205.601 of the National List. Please think about volunteering to lead the CS on this.
- Meeting adjourned

Future Call Schedule:

June 4, 2013 2:00 ET

Aquaculture-Chlorine (CBo)

Magnesium oxide (FT)

June 18, 2013 2:00 ET

Laminarin Assignment

Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe)

Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe)

Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo)

Streptomycin (ZS/HA)

July 2, 2013 2:00 ET

Streptomycin (ZS/HA)

July 16, 2013 2:00 ET

AWG if needed

August 6, 2013 2:00 ET

August 20, 2013 2:00 ET

September 3, 2013 2:00 ET

September 17, 2013 2:00 ET

October 1, 2013 2:00 ET

October 15, 2013 2:00 ET

Fall 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	August 9, 2013
Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP	August 27, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	September 3, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	
Discuss workplans on ES call	
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	
Public comment closes	October 1, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~October 7, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	October 11, 2013
Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	October 21-24, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday June 18, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Harold Austin (HA), John Foster (JFo), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Francis Thicke (FT), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Carmela Beck (CBe), Mac Stone (MS)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

2015 Sunsets - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR	Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR	Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. TR sent to CS 04 29 13. Sufficiency due 06 28 13.		Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TAP	Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision. Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Revised petition sent to CS 02 28 13. Sufficiency due 04 29 13. Petition found sufficient...		Fall 2013

Petitioned Substances					
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. TR deemed suff 11 20 12. Sent follow up questions to petitioner and are awaiting answers.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13		Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe		Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13		Fall 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide TR No new TR	Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition found sufficient 05 21 13. No TR requested		Fall 2013
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS		Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13.		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqtd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	NA	Update Fall 2013
Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	On hold	

1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	On hold	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	
Other Proposals					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Mushroom standards			Waiting to comment on rulemaking	On hold	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	JFe	DD? White paper?	Will be worked on in discrete components		TBD
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe/CBo	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for fall 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition (with ZS).

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H).

CBo: Aquaculture CO2; Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid for spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR.

FT: Magnesium oxide.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS) – request for TR's for any groups?; Aqueous potassium silicate for spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); contamination issues in farm inputs.

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate.

NM: Vinasse, need to make TR sufficiency determination; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner).

ZS: Inerts (with JFe) – request for TR's for any groups? streptomycin petition (with HA); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; aquaculture guidance/standards for plants.

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve notes of Crops Subcommittee meeting on June 4, 2013
- Streptomycin – draft checklist/recommendation(HA/ZS)
- Aquaculture Materials – progress report (draft checklists)
 - Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe)
 - Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe)
 - Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo)
- Assign petitioned material: Addition of laminarin to section 205.601 of the National List. Please think about volunteering to lead the CS on this. See email from Lisa Brines, dated June 4, 2013
- Magnesium oxide petition – discuss recommended proposal (FT)
- Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan - update (JFe) Redrafted outline with timeframes.
- Inerts update (JFe/ZS)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The agenda was approved as is
- The June 4, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes were approved with a change to the text in points a and b as some of the information about CO₂ was included in the section about chlorine.
- Streptomycin – draft checklist/recommendation (HA/ZS). The members discussed the edits to the draft checklist and proposal including the addition of an introduction and a comparison between tetracycline and streptomycin. Members noted that because the two materials are similar, the proposals would be similar, in that it will have a majority and minority opinion. The group discussed the similarities and differences between the two substances, noting that the main differences include; modes of action, behavior in the soil, registration and time of usage. Streptomycin is used as curative (post infection), while tetracycline is used as preventative (pre-infection). Additionally, streptomycin can be used well into the growing season, and in human use, streptomycin is injected which provides a much higher dosage than when it is administered orally. A member noted one study from Austria that found residue on fruit but in this instance, the substance was applied close to harvest, and no farming practices were included in the study. The members also discussed various questions on the checklist such as environmental contamination which the 2011 TR notes is unlikely, breakdown of the product, which the EPA notes as harmful to algae. In general there are no field studies, only lab studies, and results are contradictory. As for geographic considerations, there are isolated pockets of strep resistance in Pacific North West in apples and pears and in the North East the temperature and precipitation regime is such that strep is primary treatment for fireblight. A member offered to update the group prior to the next call about some new research results. The chair suggested framing this proposal differently than the tetracycline one decided that compiling one document with a side by side comparison of the majority and minority opinions would make it easier for the reader. As an aside, members discussed some anecdotal data from CA growers regarding the use of Blossom Protect which they found was not effective, while results from the Pacific Northwest were mixed. Also, research trials with copper seem to have been successful but yeast treatments have not.

- Aquaculture Materials – progress report (draft checklists)
 - Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe). The petitioners are requesting approval of only three vitamins, including: B1 (Thiamine); B12 (Choline) & H (Biotin & B7) as these are the only ones required to be supplemented. The petition was found sufficient. CBo requested that the checklist be reworked with references other than solely from the petition.
 - Aquaculture-Micronutrients for Aquatic Plants (CBe/JFo). The lead reviewer discussed information gleaned from the petition, the 2010 TR, and follow up conversations with the AWG. All trace elements are used in extremely small quantities. The partial list of micronutrients included in the petition are identified as the most useful and necessary; however, the science is relatively new and the petitioner would like to allow for the use of additional micronutrients in the future as new species are discovered. Additionally all micronutrients are allowed in crops with the exception of those made from nitrates or chlorides, and the petitioner is requesting the same allowance (minus the reference made to nitrates/chlorides). Micronutrients are well-known, non-toxic materials although there is no information on how they are manufactured. For more information regarding alternatives, see discussion below, under Lignin Sulfonate. The petition was found sufficient.
 - Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe). JFo spoke at length with two members of the Aquaculture Working Group (AWG) during which they addressed specific questions that the Subcommittee had posed to the AWG in December. Lignin Sulfonate is an alternative to EDTA, which would not be allowed, but is financially preferable. Chelates are essential in soil systems to take up metals, and a member noted that it's probably more essential in aquatic systems. The amount used in an aquatic system would not persist in an active microbial environment. JFo will redo the checklist using the additional information and will also include some additional scientific info that the AWG sent. JFo also asked the AWG questions about micronutrients. Although only a sample list of micronutrients was provided in the petition the AWG representative noted that 99 % of them are represented. Members discussed several possibilities for adding them to the National List, including the appropriateness of 601(j)(6)(ii) if they included a chloride form. They also discussed creating a relatively closed list so other materials, such as nickel, couldn't be petitioned for use, having a truncated list and using the precedent in 601 to allay concerns and provide for the needs of producers. Members also discussed the manufacturing processes, which are variable; natural forms, which often contain accessory nutrients and require larger quantities and could introduce uncertainty into aquatic systems (which are tightly controlled), and the effectiveness of alternatives which provide chelation in a soil system but don't seem to have the same effect in aquatic systems.
- ZS volunteered to review the newly received petition for the addition of laminarin to section 205.601 of the National List.
- Magnesium oxide petition – discuss recommended proposal (FT) – FT is working on filling out the checklist for discussion on a future call. FT confirmed that there are manufacturing processes that do not use sulfuric acid, and is the case with the petitioner's product.
- Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan – update. JFe redrafted an outline with timeframes, and is working with ZS to further narrow the scope. They are considering two driving provisions in the regulation, and will determine by the next call if they will have a discussion document for the fall meeting.
- Inerts update (JFe/ZS)-The Inerts WG is working with the EPA group - Design on the Environment.
- Adjourn

Future Call Schedule:

- June 4, 2013 2:00 ET
 - Aquaculture-Chlorine (CBo)
 - Magnesium oxide (FT)
- June 18, 2013 2:00 ET
 - Laminarin Assignment
 - Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe)
 - Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe)
 - Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo)
 - Streptomycin (ZS/HA)
- July 2, 2013 2:00 ET
 - Streptomycin (ZS/HA)
 - Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe) review of cklis
 - Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo) review of cklis
- July 16, 2013 2:00 ET
 - AWG if needed
- August 6, 2013 2:00 ET
- August 20, 2013 2:00 ET
- September 3, 2013 2:00 ET
- September 17, 2013 2:00 ET
- October 1, 2013 2:00 ET
- October 15, 2013 2:00 ET

Fall 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	August 9, 2013
Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP	August 27, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	September 3, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	
Discuss workplans on ES call	
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	
Public comment closes	October 1, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~October 7, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	October 11, 2013
Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	October 21-24, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday July 2, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Harold Austin (HA), John Foster (JFo), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Francis Thicke (FT), Mac Stone (MS), Carmela Beck (CBe)

Absent: Colehour Bondera (CBo)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

2015 Sunsets - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production

Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR	Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 02 14 13		Fall 2013/Spr 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Fall 2013/Spr 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Fall 2013/Spr 2014

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR	Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. TR sent to CS 04 29 13. Sufficiency due 06 28 13-07 02 13 - readying questions for contractor.		Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TAP	Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision. Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Revised petition sent to CS 02 28 13. Sufficiency due 04 29 13. Petition found sufficient 07 02 13		Fall 2013

Petitioned Substances					
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. TR deemed suff 11 20 12. Sent follow up questions to petitioner and are awaiting answers.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe		Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13		Fall 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide TR No new TR	Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition found sufficient 05 21 13. No TR requested		Fall 2013
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS		Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13.		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqtd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	NA	Update Fall 2013

Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	On hold	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	On hold	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	
Other Proposals					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Mushroom standards			Waiting to comment on rulemaking	On hold	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	JFe	DD? White paper?	Will be worked on in discrete components		TBD
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe/CBo	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for fall 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition (with ZS).

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H).

CBo: Aquaculture CO2; Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid for spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR.

FT: Magnesium oxide.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS) – request for TR’s for any groups?; Aqueous potassium silicate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); contamination issues in farm inputs.

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate.

NM: Vinasse, need to make TR sufficiency determination; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner).

ZS: Inerts (with JFe) – request for TR’s for any groups?; streptomycin petition (with HA); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate for spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; aquaculture guidance/standards for plants; laminarin (petition)

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve notes of crops subcommittee meeting on June 18, 2013
- Streptomycin – sufficiency approval (confirm), draft checklist/recommendation (HA/ZS)
- Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate Review checklist, timing for action (JFo/CBe)
- Aquaculture-Micronutrients Review checklist, timing for action (CBe/JFo)
- Plan for finishing discussion on Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe), Chlorine (CBo), CO₂ (CBo)
- Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan - update (JFe) Redrafted outline with ZS.
- Laminarin – timing for determination of petition sufficiency and need for TR. (ZS)
- Magnesium oxide petition – Progress and date for vote (FT)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- MS announced that the fall meeting will be 3 days long, and asked that each of the Subcommittees think about any proposals that may be delayed in case we need to make more time for discussion. The options include the following: eliminate items as they drop off organically, delay aquaculture proposals wholesale until the spring 2014 meeting, or send proposals out for comment but delay voting until the spring 2014 meeting.
- The agenda was approved as is.
- The June 18, 2013 Subcommittee meeting notes were approved as is.
- Streptomycin (HA/ZS). JFe, ZS and HA spoke prior to the call about the streptomycin checklist and opened the discussion to the entire group. The Chair asked that the Subcommittee members add any feedback or comments about the version that was circulated so they can continue to edit and refine the document. Included in this version is language about the differences between tetracycline and strep, as well as a majority and minority opinion. Members also discussed some of the questions on the checklist that resulted in multiple answers (i.e. both yes and no). The petitioner is citing Confidential Business Information, which for now, doesn’t matter because they are petitioning it as a synthetic. The petition was deemed sufficient.
- Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe). Members discussed some additional questions and whether or not they wanted to send them back to the petitioner or just address them in the narrative in the proposal. The group reasserted their prior decision that the petition was sufficient. A member asked about using Lignin Sulfonate in an aquatic environment, and whether or not this was a concern. The general feeling is that this is not an issue as the amounts are minuscule. As for timing, this will likely be ready for the fall meeting even if the group decides to delay the aquaculture petitions until the spring.
- Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo). The AWG is petitioning all micronutrients, and the Subcommittee previously discussed whether or not they could limit or close the list. The group discussed the potential need for a new TR and whether or not there were specific questions that could or needed to be addressed or clarified. JFo, who had several lengthy conversations with members of the AWG, noted that according to the AWG, if the current annotation for soil micronutrients along with selenium is applied to aquaculture, then 99.9% of the micronutrients are accounted for. Further, the AWG asked that if the NOSB chooses to close the list that they please

close it as it is for soils. Members discussed the pros of this approach, which includes the benefit of it already existing in regulatory language. A member asked about residues in water, to which another member replied that the majority of these micronutrients are taken up by the plants and there isn't much left in water. The members also discussed the potential problems of not bounding the list. The Chair asked people to forward any follow up questions to the group.

- Aquaculture - Vitamins (CBe), Chlorine (CBo), CO₂ (CBo) - will discuss these items on the July 16 call.
- Contaminants in farm inputs - update (JFe). JFe redrafted the outline with ZS and will present it on a future call.
- Laminarin (ZS) – not discussed due to time constraints.
- Magnesium oxide petition (FT). The petition was found sufficient and the group discussed some of the information included in the checklist. Magnesium oxide is benign in soil but some manufacturing processes include the use of acids, which is a limiting factor, while other manufacturing processes release CO₂ into air. The Subcommittee did not request a TR for this, and instead asked the manufacturer for some additional information. FT asked for feedback from the members about the checklist as it was his first review.
- Vinasse – The members feel that the TR is not sufficient as it does not address some of the significant questions such as removal, and technical and functional effects. Vinasse is permitted in the Canadian and European standards but there are processes similar to the ones for Vinasse that are not allowed in CN, the EU or the US. Members discussed whether or not this information can be gleaned from the TR contractor. A member suggested that the group can ask the right questions to get the information they need and will work to compile a list of 5 or 6 more questions about chemical changes, and processes. Another member felt that while some of the questions could be addressed in a revised TR, such as residuals, some could not. ZS offered to work with NM to compose the list of questions.
- The meeting was adjourned.

Future Call Schedule:

July 2, 2013 2:00 ET

Streptomycin (ZS/HA)

Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe) review of cklist

Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo) review of cklist

Plan for finishing discussion on Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe), Chlorine (CBo), CO₂ (CBo)

Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan - update (JFe)

July 16, 2013 2:00 ET

Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) (CBe)

Magnesium oxide petition (TF)

August 6, 2013 2:00 ET

August 20, 2013 2:00 ET

September 3, 2013 2:00 ET

September 17, 2013 2:00 ET

October 1, 2013 2:00 ET

October 15, 2013 2:00 ET

Fall 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	August 9, 2013
Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP	August 27, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	September 3, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	
Discuss workplans on ES call	
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	
Public comment closes	October 1, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~October 7, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	October 11, 2013
Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	October 21-24, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday July 16, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Harold Austin (HA), John Foster (JFo), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Francis Thicke (FT), Mac Stone (MS), Carmela Beck (CBe), Colehour Bondera (CBo)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

2015 Sunsets - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR	Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 02 14 13		Summary-Fall 2013/Proposal-Spring 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Summary-Fall 2013/Proposal-Spring 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Summary-Fall 2013/Proposal-Spring 2014

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR	Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. TR sent to CS 04 29 13. Sufficiency due 06 28 13. Additional questions for contractor sent to LB 07 16 13.		Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TAP	Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision. Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Revised petition sent to CS 02 28 13. Sufficiency due 04 29 13. Petition found sufficient 07 02 13		Fall 2013

Petitioned Substances					
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. TR deemed suff 11 20 12. Sent follow up questions to petitioner and are awaiting answers.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe		Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13		Fall 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide TR No new TR	Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition found sufficient 05 21 13. No TR requested		Fall 2013
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS		Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13.		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqtd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	NA	Update Fall 2013

Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	On hold	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	On hold	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	
Other Proposals					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Mushroom standards			Waiting to comment on rulemaking	On hold	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	JFe	DD? White paper?	Will be worked on in discrete components		TBD
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe/CBo	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for fall 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition (with ZS).

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H).

CBo: Aquaculture CO2; Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid for spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR.

FT: Magnesium oxide.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS) – request for TR’s for any groups?; Aqueous potassium silicate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); contamination issues in farm inputs.

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate.

NM: Vinasse, need to make TR sufficiency determination; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner).

ZS: Inerts (with JFe) – request for TR’s for any groups?; streptomycin petition (with HA); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate for spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; laminarin (petition)

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve notes of Crops Subcommittee meeting on July 2, 2013
- Streptomycin - draft recommendation, schedule vote. (HA/ZS)
- Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate review, final with footnote containing answers to CS questions sent to AWG? TR update? (JFo/CBe)
- Aquaculture-Micronutrients review checklist final? TR update? (CBe/JFo)
- Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe) – petition sufficient, TR update?, checklist review, schedule vote. (see attached checklist and questions)
- Aquaculture - Chlorine (CBo) - petition & TR sufficient, checklist review, ready to vote?
- Aquaculture-CO2 (CBo) - petition sufficient, no request for TR update, checklist review, ready to vote?
- Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan – vote? (JFe) Redrafted outline with ZS. Approve updated TR questions for vinasse (NM)
- Laminarin –petition sufficiency and need for TR? (ZS)
- Magnesium oxide petition – Update. Vote? (FT)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Approve agenda – The laminarin discussion was postponed and replaced with research priorities
- The notes of Crops Subcommittee meeting on July 2, 2013 approved with no changes.
- Streptomycin – draft recommendation, schedule vote. (HA/ZS) - HA distributed a new draft document that combined 3 previously separate pieces and noted that the majority and minority opinions isn’t flushed out yet. The majority opinion supports an extension to 2017, and the minority is opposed to an extension and wants it to expire in 2014. The members discussed some specific language in the document that they would like to revise in an effort to present a balanced view. The group discussed including an executive summary which they felt would be helpful when presenting the document at the fall meeting. A member noted that the structure of the new document was much better and would like to include links and info for the public comment. ZS will make some comments on the draft document and forward them to the group.
- Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe) - The group discussed the need for a new TR and decided that the questions posed just prior to the call were already answered by the petitioner and were already included in the updated checklist that was circulated. A member asked that the phrasing of one of the questions be corrected as it was not quite accurate. The phrase “... may result in periodic and/or episodic discharges of lignin sulfonate” should read “chelated micronutrients”. JFe asked that ZS add that language to the document. The Chair asked that the group read the updated checklist and be prepared to vote.
- Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo) - The group discussed the need for a new TR and whether or not the 2010 TR is adequate. CBe felt that the TR was complete and the other members felt that information gleaned from public comments would be more helpful than a new TR. A member added that if they do not get enough public comment, they will be able to decide at the meeting how to move forward. One member noted his concern about using information about micronutrients in a terrestrial system and applying them to an aquatic system.

- Aquaculture-Vitamins (CBe). MA stated that the Livestock Subcommittee requested a TR for vitamins for aquatic animals and trace minerals. The subcommittee requested a copy of both from the NL manager to see if any useful information could be found in either report that would help inform their evaluation of the vitamins and micronutrients petitions.
- Aquaculture - Chlorine (CBo). CBo asked for more feedback about the draft document. A member had several questions and concerns, and asked that some of the language be changed to include more explanation. For example, there are two distinct uses indicated for chlorine but the information in the checklist does not make the distinction. Another member cautioned that the proposal should focus on the application for this specific use, rather than the “implications as used” as that is too far out of the scope of the petition. One member suggested asking for public comment from the perspective of an aquatic plant producer.
- Aquaculture-CO₂ (CBo). CBo asked for more feedback about the draft document. A member reiterated an earlier concern that the document is not well balanced. The document detailed policy issues and referenced other policies not relevant to the petition. The same member also noted that the references to CO₂ affecting the atmosphere are not accurate and need to be corrected. The group also discussed the inclusion of questions about the pros and cons of polyculture systems, so they can collect public comment. A member noted that although discussion of broader topics of organic and the Board’s responsibilities to the community are valuable, he feels that it shouldn’t delay the review of one material.
- Contaminants in farm inputs document (JFe). The outline was redrafted and circulated but the document is preliminary and written informally and members felt that it was not ready for the fall 2013 meeting.
- Approve updated TR questions for vinasse (NM) – The group has two main lingering questions regarding the definition of synthetic versus non synthetic, and whether or not there is a chemical change during production and what chemicals remain in the final product. The group isn’t sure the TR contractor will be able to answer these questions, but ZS and HA have compiled a list of questions that could help elucidate. JFe will send the questions to the National List Manager.
- Laminarin - postponed
- Magnesium oxide petition - (FT). JFe would like to talk with ZS more about this petition. During the review process, FT contacted the manufacturer for some additional information and although the processing component raised some questions he felt they were not concerning. The group does not feel they need to request a TR.
- Research priorities. MS urged the group to think about potential topics for the research priorities that have developed from the past year’s work, and send them to the Chair who will forward them to the Materials Subcommittee.
- The group chose to add an extra call at 2:00pm ET on July 30.
- Meeting adjourned

Future Call Schedule:

July 16, 2013 2:00 ET

Streptomycin (ZS/HA) –continued discussion of draft proposal
 Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe) continued discussion/vote?
 Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo) continued discussion/vote?

Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) (CBe) – postponed due to time
 Aquaculture - CO₂- discuss/vote?
 Aquaculture - Chlorine - discuss/vote?
 Magnesium oxide petition (FT) –vote?
 Laminarin - Petition sufficiency/TR request? (ZS) - postponed
 Vinasse - discuss additional questions for Contractor

July 30, 2013 2:00 ET

Streptomycin (ZS/HA) –continued discussion of draft proposal
 Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe) - vote?
 Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo) - vote?
 Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) (CBe) –discuss need for TR, checklist review, schedule vote
 Aquaculture - CO₂- discuss/vote?
 Aquaculture - Chlorine - discuss/vote?
 Magnesium oxide petition (FT) - vote?
 Laminarin - Petition sufficiency/TR request? (ZS)

August 6, 2013 2:00 ET

Strep info (ZS) – vote?

August 20, 2013 2:00 ET

September 3, 2013 2:00 ET

September 17, 2013 2:00 ET

October 1, 2013 2:00 ET

October 15, 2013 2:00 ET

Fall 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	August 9, 2013
Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP	August 27, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	September 3, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	September 11, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	September 13, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	September 23, 2013
Public comment closes	October 1, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~October 7, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	October 11, 2013
Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	October 22-24, 2013

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday July 30, 2013 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Jay Feldman (Chair) (JFe), Nick Maravell (NM) (Vice Chair), Harold Austin (HA), John Foster (JFo), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Francis Thicke (FT), Colehour Bondera (CBo)

Absent: Mac Stone (MS), Carmela Beck (CBe),

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)

Work plan

2015 Sunsets - § 205.601 Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sulfurous Acid at 601(j) Original petition 2008	CBo	3/2010 TR	Original recomm May 2009 Request for TR 02 14 13		Summary-Fall 2013/Proposal-Spring 2014
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate at 601(a) Original petition 2006	ZS	8/2006 TR No new TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Summary-Fall 2013/Proposal-Spring 2014
Aqueous potassium silicate at 601(e) and 601(i) Original petitions: 2004 , 2006	JFe?	9/2003 TR	Original recomm Nov 2007 Request for TR 02 14 13		Summary-Fall 2013/Proposal-Spring 2014

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR requested?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Vinasse - proposal. List at §205.601	NM	Yes. Expedited, modified TR	Petition sent to CS on 03 29 12. Sent request for feedback on feasibility for modified TR to LBrines. LB sent feedback 09 04 12. The CS reqst'd a quick modified TR 12 04 12. TR sent to CS 04 29 13. Sufficiency due 06 28 13. Additional questions for contractor sent to LB 07 16 13.		Fall 2013
Antibiotics (Streptomycin) proposal. Amend annotation, §205.601	ZS/HA	3/2011 TR 1/2006 TR 10/1995 TAP	Apr 2011 Final Recomm. NOP rcv'd petition but sent back to petitioner for revision. Rcvd revised petition 01 07 13 and sent back again for incompleteness. Revised petition sent to CS 02 28 13. Sufficiency due 04 29 13. Petition found sufficient 07 02 13		Fall 2013

Petitioned Substances					
Aquaculture-CO₂ , List at §205.609	CBo, ZS	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Will rqst modification from petitioner (for use pattern). Updated petition was deemed sufficient. TR deemed unnecessary.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Chlorine List at §205.609 and §205.611	CBo	No	Petition sent to CS on 5 30 12. Determine petition sufficiency. CS requested clarification from petitioner 11 20 12. TR deemed suff 11 20 12. Sent follow up questions to petitioner and are awaiting answers.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Micronutrients List at §205.609	CBe/JFo	2010 TR (Nickel)	Petition sent to CS on 06 08 12. Petition sufficiency response due 08 08 12? CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13		Fall 2013
Aquaculture-Lignin sulfonate (chelating agent for aquatic plants) List at §205.609	JFo/CBe	2/2011 TR	Petition sent to CS on 07 03 12. Petition Sufficiency Response due 09 04 12. CS sent request to NL Mgr 12 04 12 for additional info and TR. Questions clarified by petitioner. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13 and 07 02 13.		Fall 2013
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) List at §205.609	CBe		Petition sent to CS 08 10 12. Petition Sufficiency response due 10 10 12. Petition found sufficient 06 18 13		Fall 2013
Magnesium oxide List at 205.601	FT	2007 Magnesium (HYDR) oxide TR No new TR	Petition sent to CS on 02 14 13. Petition found sufficient 05 21 13. No TR requested		Fall 2013
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS		Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition sufficient 07 30 13		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqtd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - Review priority inerts, complete groupings, exact number to be determined	NA	Update Fall 2013

Polyglyceryl phthalate ester of coconut oil fatty acid (inert)			Sent to CS on 06 01 11; Needs petition sufficiency review. On hold.	On hold	
1,1-Difluoroethane (inert)		Yes	On 01 21 11 - Petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; Review TR for sufficiency. On hold	On hold	
Manganese sulfate monohydrate (inert)		Yes	On 02 03 11, petitioner notified NOP they would like to continue review; CS may want to re-evaluate request for TR since this is an inert	On hold	
Ethylene DDSA / EDDS (inert)	JFe	Yes	On hold	On hold	
Terpene Polymers (inert)	?	Maybe	On hold	On hold	
Other Proposals					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Mushroom standards			Waiting to comment on rulemaking	On hold	
Food safety			On hold	On hold	
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	JFe	DD? White paper?	Will be worked on in discrete components		TBD
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe/CBo	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Proposal	GMO is lead. Joint w/Crops.		Fall 2013

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Crops Subcommittee work assignments for Fall 2013 NOSB meeting:

HA: streptomycin petition (with ZS).

CBe: Aquaculture micronutrients/trace elements; Aquaculture Vitamins (B1, B12, and H).

CBo: Aquaculture CO2; Aquaculture chlorine; Sulfurous Acid for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR.

FT: Magnesium oxide.

JFe: Inerts (with ZS) – request for TR's for any groups?; Aqueous potassium silicate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; Plant Breeding in conjunction with Ad hoc GMO subcmte (with ZS, CBo); contamination issues in farm inputs.

JFo: Aquaculture lignin sulfonate.

NM: Vinasse, waiting on add'l TR question response; Carbon Monoxide/Exhaust Gas (sent back to petitioner).

ZS: Inerts (with JFe) – request for TR's for any groups; streptomycin petition (with HA); Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate for Spring 2014 (Sunset 2015), waiting on TR; laminarin (petition)

Agenda

- Approve agenda
- Approve notes of Crops Subcommittee meeting on July 16, 2013
- Streptomycin - Update/vote? (HA/ZS)
- Aquaculture - Discuss checklists for all the petitioned materials. Mini-report from Maine trip –to be followed by more in depth report (in writing). Voting schedule.
- Laminarin - petition sufficiency, synthetic/nonsynthetic, need for TR? (ZS)
- Magnesium oxide petition – Discussion. Vote? (FT)
- Research Priorities discussion (proposed CS research priorities (JFe): (i) Alternatives to chlorine; (ii) Bioplastic mulch. (iii) other proposals?
- Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan - vote? (JFe)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Agenda was approved as is
- Notes from the July 16 Crops Subcommittee approved with no changes
- Streptomycin - Update/vote? (HA/ZS) – JFe will work on consolidating several drafts and resend it to HA so he can ready it for a vote for next call.
- Aquaculture - JFe noted that the checklists for the aquaculture materials are nearly finished. JFe gave a mini-report about the Maine trip which will be followed by a more in depth written report. The overall consensus was that the aquaculture trip was very valuable and they gained a lot of insight that will be helpful with the materials review. As for the voting schedule, the CO₂ document needs to be revised and is not ready for voting in its current state. The group discussed the chlorine proposal and the idea of including questions for public comment. In light of that it too may not be ready for voting. JFe will discuss the schedule with the Board chair and report back on the next call. With regard to aquaculture in general a member suggested that the level of comfort people are experiencing centers around the policy and philosophy rather than the specific materials, and feels that the group needs to focus on the specific materials since they are known quantities. The members also discussed various aspects of aquaculture such as carrying capacity, monitoring, and standards which will be part of the Maine report. JFe asked that CBo distribute the documents on CO₂ and chlorine, and include a specific motion or annotation in writing so the members can vote on the next call.
- Laminarin - petition sufficiency, synthetic/nonsynthetic, need for TR? (ZS) – The lead reviewer felt the petition is straightforward and well explained, and the group deemed it sufficient. JFe will send a note to L. Brines indicating their determination. Laminarin is EPA approved and the group discussed the potential need for a TR. A member noted that the chemical reactions involved in the manufacturing process are very basic and based on that would deem this non-synthetic. He also noted that laminarin would be preferable to copper or sulfur. Another member supported this point of view but the Chair disagreed about the determination of non-synthetic and indicated that

he would support asking for a TR to determine this. In support of this he offered to distribute some scientific literature to the group. Another member suggested asking the manufacturer questions to help clarify this issue instead of requesting a TR. ZS offered to search the references to help clarify this issue and will discuss this further.

- Magnesium oxide petition – Discussion. Vote? (FT) – The group discussed the annotation and noted that the petition is for a very specific use so the annotation doesn't need to be complex. FT will edit the document and recirculate it in preparation for vote on the next call.
- Research Priorities discussion (proposed CS research priorities (JFe): (i) Alternatives to chlorine; (ii) Bioplastic mulch. (iii) other proposals? Vote on list/prioritize, amend -deferred to next call.
- Contaminants in farm inputs document/proposed plan - vote? (JFe) - The group briefly discussed the status of this document.
- JFe will contact the Subcommittee members regarding the expectations for completion of proposals (including motion and annotations (if applicable)) so they are ready for voting by the next call.
- The meeting was adjourned.

Future Call Schedule:

July 30, 2013 2:00 ET

Streptomycin (ZS/HA) –continued discussion of draft proposal
Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe) - vote?
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo) - vote?
Aquaculture- plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) (CBe) - discuss need for TR, checklist review, schedule vote
Aquaculture - CO₂- discuss/vote?
Aquaculture - Chlorine - discuss/vote?
Magnesium oxide petition (FT) - vote?
Laminarin - Petition sufficiency/TR request? (ZS)

August 6, 2013 2:00 ET

Strep info (ZS) – vote?
Aquaculture-Lignin Sulfonate (JFo/CBe) - vote?
Aquaculture-Micronutrients (CBe/JFo) - vote?
Aquaculture-plant production Vitamins (B1, B12, H) (CBe) - discuss need for TR, checklist review, schedule vote
Aquaculture-CO₂-discuss/vote?
Aquaculture-Chlorine - discuss/vote?
Prioritize and vote on Research Priorities list
Magnesium oxide petition (FT) - vote?

August 20, 2013 2:00 ET

September 3, 2013 2:00 ET

September 17, 2013 2:00 ET

October 1, 2013 2:00 ET

October 15, 2013 2:00 ET

Fall 2013 Milestones	Target date
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	August 9, 2013
Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP	August 27, 2013
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	September 3, 2013
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	September 11, 2013
Discuss workplans on ES call	September 13, 2013
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	September 23, 2013
Public comment closes	October 1, 2013
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~October 7, 2013
Workplans finalized on ES call	October 11, 2013
Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	October 22-24, 2013