

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, December 19, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Jared Clark (JC)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review December 5, 2023 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 5, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC).** The lead summarized the review for horticultural oils, noting that oils work by smothering pests, and the timing of application is key. He also noted that there is an array of other non-petroleum-based alternatives, such as fish oil. A member clarified that this listing is for narrow range oils, which contain a restriction (petroleum derivatives, predominately of paraffinic and naphthenic fractions with 50 percent boiling point (10 mm Hg) between 415 °F and 440 °F). The Food Technologists will complete the International Use section of all sunset reviews, including this one. The lead will make some modifications to the draft review before it is submitted to the NOP.
- **2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC).** The lead author summarized the draft review and highlighted a reference in the last sunset review to a 2018 TR, which may be a typo or mistake, as there doesn't seem to be a 2018 TR. The CS has requested a new limited scope TR which is due at the end of January 2024. Ferric phosphate is used as a molluscicide, and contains a chelator (EDTA). The CS will discuss this review again, after the TR is received and before it is submitted for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The group discussed the previous list of Research Priorities (RPs) and discussed how to improve them for this year. A member suggested prioritizing and highlighting the top priorities while still retaining the others, as the entire list remains important. The Materials Subcommittee will discuss this approach on its next call. Members shared ideas for ways to get researchers to consider the topics because it seems that there is not much overlap with the list the Board puts forth and the topics that the research community works on. A member countered that idea by saying that sometimes there is overlap in research that may not be apparent.
- **Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All).** The lead summarized the outline for the compost work, highlighting the memo from the NOP, OFPA citations, guidance documents, and the Organic Regulations. Compost is regulated as waste and as a soil amendment, which complicates the issue, and the Federal Government leaves it to State and local governments to regulate. The leads are seeking feedback about how best to move forward and how to keep it within the scope of NOSB and NOP. They are looking for feedback on several topics such as time/temperature preharvest intervals, contaminants, current regulations, etc. The leads asked other members to write down questions as they work on ideas for a compost panel. The CS scheduled an additional meeting dedicating to the topic of compost, so they can have a discussion document and a panel ready for the Spring 2024 meeting.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous CS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

December 5, 2023

- 2026 Sunset: Soaps, ammonium (ADB) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium bicarbonate (JD) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

- 2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 9, 2024 - Additional call (12:00 ET/9:00 PT)

- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

January 23, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due.

- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Con tact	TR Reques t?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024

Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “
--	------------	----	---	---	---------------------	-----

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, December 5, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Nate Lewis (NL)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review November 21, 2023 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Soaps, ammonium (ADB) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium bicarbonate (JD) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **November 21, 2023 notes** were accepted with some minor edits.
- **2026 Sunset: Potassium bicarbonate (JD).** The lead summarized the use and history of potassium bicarbonate, noting it is fairly straight forward. He found scant information on ancillary substances, or health and environmental issues in the previous TRs. The 2015 TR was limited in scope and only answered two questions - about essentiality and availability. Members discussed the uses and alternatives, and supported the review, noting it was comprehensive and thoughtful. The NOP provided a definition of ancillary substances to clarify the lack of inclusion. The lead will finalize the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Soaps, ammonium (ADB).** The lead summarized the specific use for ammonium soaps, which are limited. The group discussed whether it is being used much or at all. The lead will add a question about use, and the CS will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB).** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of hydrogen chloride, which is primarily used in cotton delinting. She highlighted human and environmental health concerns. The CS requested an updated TR, which was found sufficient. The CS will send a note to the NOP indicating such. The group had a robust discussion about the organic cotton industry, and will add some discussion to the document and revisit it at a future call.
- **Research Priorities (All).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The Food Technologists are working on a project to update the international acceptance info, and will send the final write-ups to the NOSB Chair who will distribute them. A member asked if it's feasible to add a date-stamp to the reviews, so they know it's updated.
 - Compost panel. The CS will discuss ideas for panelists during the December 19 call for a compost panel at the Spring meeting.
 - NOP updated the schedule below based on recent changes
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

November 21, 2023

Pear ester (FQ) - Petition Sufficiency

2026 Sunset: Sodium fluoaluminate (mined) (MJ) - discuss review

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Soaps, ammonium (ADB) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium bicarbonate (JD) - discuss review

Research Priorities (All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review

Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review

Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal

Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote

January 23, 2024

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due.

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23	Spr 2024
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, November 7, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Kyla Smith (KS) - Observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO); Nate Lewis (NL)

Staff: Jared Clark (JC); Johanna Miranda (JM)

Agenda

- Review October 3, 2023 notes
- Fall 2023 meeting debrief
- Welcome new members + new SC Chair
- Review schedule + assign pear ester petition
- Cover sheets for all fall sunsets/proposals - attached (due by 11.22). Please save as your sunset(s) and delete the rest.
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **October 3, 2023 notes** were approved with suggested edits.
- **Fall 2023 meeting debrief:** A member liked the intensity of discussion in the Fall meeting and hopes that continues in the Spring meeting where they can make changes to documents before votes in the Fall.
- **Welcome new members + new SC Chair**
- **Review schedule + assign pear ester petition:** Members scheduled and assigned proposals, discussions, and sunsets between now and the February due date for documents. FQ is the lead for the pear ester petition. The Subcommittee discussed timing of TRs and discussion documents.
- **Cover sheets for all fall sunsets/proposals - attached (due by 11.22).** Please save as your sunset and delete the rest.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

October 3, 2023

Review public comments

BBMF (LP) - discuss

November 7, 2023

Pear Ester petition - Assign lead

November 21, 2023

Pear Ester - Petition Sufficiency

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Soaps, ammonium (ADB) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium bicarbonate (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - discuss review

Research Priorities (All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (WT) - discuss review

January 2, 2024

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Sodium fluoaluminatate (mined) (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due.

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	LP/FQ/ NL	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23	Spr 2024
Compost	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.16.24	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, October 3, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer; Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review September 19, 2023 notes
- Review public comments
- BBMF work agenda request (All)
- Organic Inputs Discussion
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **September 19, 2023 notes** were accepted with the provided modifications.
- **NOSB Tech Support reps.** The Subcommittee members welcomed the newest NOSB technical representative.
- **Review public comments (All).** The group had a brief conversation about public comments. The comment period just closed, so most people have not had a chance to read comments yet.
- **BBMF work agenda request (All).** The Chair noted that the NOSB received a number of comments about BBMF (Docket # AMS-NOP-23-0026). The group discussed various aspects of the material, the previous NOSB work and recommendation, and the NOP memo/work agenda request in an effort to determine how to move forward.
A member shared information about advertisements for BBMF, which indicate that it is available and biobased, although the percentage of biobased content is not clear. This doesn't seem to coincide with the information the NOSB received previously, and there appears to be an information gap. The group discussed a number of questions. The CS considered either not accepting the work agenda request, or accepting it and deferring the work to a later date.
A member added that since the community is not asking for this to be revisited, perhaps deferring it would be the best approach. The Crops Subcommittee chose to decline the work agenda request at this time, and may revisit it at a later date. Several members offered to write a response to the NOP which they will relay to the NOP. The NOSB will also address the decision at the NOSB meeting for the community.
- **Organic Inputs.** The group continued the conversation from the last call about a potential project on organic inputs, and how to advocate for organic through outreach and education, to explain the benefits. The group talked about marketing and the difficulties of not having marketing dollars, how to clearly articulate the benefits of organic, and how they would definite success with such an undertaking.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

September 19, 2023

Annotations (All)

Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB)

October 3, 2023

Review public comments

BBMF (LP) - discuss

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Soaps, ammonium (ADB) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium bicarbonate (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - discuss review

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (WT) - discuss review

January 2, 2024

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium fluoaluminatate (mined) (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due.

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	8.1.23	Fall 2023
-------------------	-----	----------	--	--------	-----------

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	LP/FQ/NL	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “

Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23 8.1.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105. TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	8.1.23	“ “

Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also request ed in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023

NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, September 19, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review September 5, 2023 notes
- Compost work agenda request
- BBMF work agenda request
- Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **September 5, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
Compost work agenda request. The Crops Subcommittee has been investigating the need to update organic systems with regard to compost because they are out-of-date, and will submit a request to the Executive Team and NOP today. The lead summarized the request, noting that compost appears in OFPA, the Organic Regulations, the National List, and NOP guidance documents. The CS discussed section 205.2 which houses definitions and the national list. A member cautioned the group about creating barriers or making it more difficult to be or remain certified organic. The Crops Subcommittee members were supportive of moving ahead with the request, and the lead will present the request to the Executive Committee later today. The Subcommittee is also aware that the NOP has received a petition for compost, and may send the NOSB a work agenda request.
- **BBMF work agenda request.** The group discussed the [work agenda request from the NOP](#) (sent September 8). A previous Board worked on this topic extensively, and produced a recommendation that NOP indicates it cannot implement. The recommendation proposed to change the biobased content requirement in the current BBMF listing from 100% to 80%, which the NOSB acknowledged as aspirational. Currently there are no BBMF products that meet the requirement.

Members candidly shared their thoughts about the request, the potential work, and the goals and outcomes. The lead updated the members about the review she has conducted thus far, which includes a review of the 2012 petition, Board conversations, and public comments. That review is not complete, and she requested time to finish. To date, she has found that BBMF is allowed in the Organic Standards for Canada and the EU and at one point there were products allowed. There is some discrepancy over the term "biobased" content, which doesn't seem to be in the original petition, but seems to be the part that contributed to the lack of available products. The NOSB Chair added that one of the questions in the NOP memo is about the word biobased and whether it is necessary, as it does not impact biodegradability. A member mentioned that several growers in NY dropped their certification years ago, because they wanted to be able to use this product, which was labeled as compostable. Although at that time there seemed to be a misunderstanding about the components of the product.

The petitioner is also the same entity who has petitioned compost. MJ suggested that it might be beneficial to address compost first, before tackling the BBMF document again, noting that compostability requirements are clearer, and that is not so for biodegradability. Members agreed that it

makes sense to address these two separate-but-related, work agenda items sequentially. The CACS will hold its work on plastics in weed management until the CS has determined if/how they will move forward on BBMF.

- **Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB).** The lead explained the broad idea behind this topic. Members sometimes (often?) hear criticism about organic and the use and quantity of pesticides and members discussed outreach or education about the distinction of persistent pesticides, and bio-pesticides. A member chatted: “The difference is that these are natural products that break down into products that are better for the environment. The reason for the higher application rates is the fact that these products are less persistent. So, the good thing about organic pesticides - the reason they are better for the environment - is the same reason why there is the need to have higher application rates. They are super photodegradable because benign compounds break down easily”. A member offered an example: Pyrethrins are unstable when they are exposed to sunlight/heat., while the synthetic counterparts, pyrethroids, are more stable and persistent in the environment.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

Annotations (All)

Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB)

October 3, 2023

Review public comments

BBMF (LP) - discuss

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Soaps, ammonium (ADB) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium bicarbonate (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - discuss review

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (WT) - discuss review

January 2, 2024

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium fluoaluminatate (mined) (MJ/ FQ) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due.

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	8.1.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	LP/	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023	9.19.23 10.3.23	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023

Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23 8.1.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “

Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	8.1.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	--------------------	----------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “

Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, September 5, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review August 15, 2023 notes
- Review Potential Work Agenda Items: Compost (MJ); Plastic (JD)
- Annotations (All)
- Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 15, 2023 notes** were accepted with minor changes.
- **Review Potential Work Agenda Items:**
 - **Compost (MJ).** The group discussed ideas for a possible project on compost. For now, the CS is using this as a fact-finding project to determine how best to move forward, and to collect information from the compost industry. The group is interested in perhaps hosting a panel at a future call to help understand the issues. The lead feels like the industry has made great strides and the technology has changed a lot since the rule was written, and there is a need to update the regulations to come up to speed. Members acknowledged that it's a daunting issue, and may be difficult, or unsolvable, but they would like to get the conversation started to determine best practices, and if there is a productive path forward for the industry. The CS will discuss possible areas of opportunity at the September Executive call. MJ will kick off the project and feels comfortable transitioning it to a member at the end of their term (January 2025).
 - **Plastic (JD).** The lead discussed background for a possible project on plastic. The key questions are what and why would the Board take on a project on plastic? While the entire group acknowledged that plastic is an issue that needs to be addressed, they also understand the limitations of what the NOSB and NOP can do. The use/mention of plastic is embedded in OFPA and is woven throughout the law and regulations, and changing that would require congressional legislation. Members discussed writing a letter to the Secretary expressing the Board's viewpoint on plastic, and how that relates to climate smart agriculture. A member expressed reservations that the organic community could move the needle given that the problem is so large and widespread, and agreed that a letter to the Secretary may be the only path. Another member offered that there is a benefit in articulating the problem, even if they don't have a solution. A member clarified that Crops is talking about plastic at large (e.g., packaging) and not biodegradable biobased mulch film (BBMF), as plastic used in packaging is double what is used for cultivation. A member suggested including in the initial document a list of what plastic is currently used in production and why it is being used.
- **Annotations (All).** Deferred to next call.
- **Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

Annotations (All)

Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB)

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	8.1.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23 8.1.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “

Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	8.1.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, August 15, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review August 1, 2023 notes
- Discuss the schedule and 2026 Sunset materials (templates) (ADB/MA)
- Review Potential Work Agenda Items (ADB/MJ)
- Question on the origin of plastic annotation (JD/JC)
- Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 1, 2023 notes** were accepted with minor edits.
- **Discuss the schedule and 2026 Sunset materials (templates) (ADB/MA).** The CS reviewed the upcoming call schedules for the 2026 sunset reviews, and also scheduled the discussion for carbon dioxide.
- **Review Potential Work Agenda Items (ADB/MJ).** The CS is not expecting any NOP work agenda requests, but potentially HS may request to work on compost.
 - **Compost:** The lead author reviewed background information about compost in OFPA and the regulations, as well as the past work done by the NOSB, NOP, and the Compost Task Force. The group discussed ideas and goals for the document, and what they consider three areas of opportunity: Terms defined; Section 205.203 (practice standard), and section 205.601 (National List). The lead noted that the data used initially for the standards are outdated and the technology has changed. The ultimate goal (one of them) is to support small-scale farmers who are making compost.
The CS would like to invite guest speakers to talk more about how to implement and enforce stronger rules on composting. The CS Chair will introduce this topic on the next Executive Committee call to discuss this more, and seek approval to have this added as a work agenda item. Two members (NL and FQ) expressed interest in leading this project once MJ rotates off the Board. The CS will discuss this again on the next call.
- **Question on the origin of plastic annotation (JD/JC).** JD proposed plastic as a future work agenda item, and proposed that the mulches might be an area that Crops could work on. The group will talk more about this on the next call. A member also mentioned the impending request from NOP to work on the Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) document. The group did not talk specifically about the origin of the annotation on plastic mulch and covers: "petroleum-based other than polyvinyl chloride (PVC)". The lead reviewer for plastic mulch and covers suggested adding a question to the sunset review regarding hand weeding. Members agreed to the wording of the question and NOP will revise the sunset review accordingly. The group discussed labor issues, and the possible reasons for the use of plastic mulch, and wondered if it differed regionally.
- **Discussion on organic inputs (WT/ADB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

August 1, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Plastic Mulch and Covers (LP) - discuss
- Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	8.1.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Research Priorities	BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023
---------------------	----	--	-------------------	-----------

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23 8.1.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “

Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternati ves	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	8.1.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also request ed in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “

Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “
--------------------	------------	----	---	--	---------	-----

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, August 1, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL) - observer; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review July 18, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (LP) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities - finalize draft
- Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Plastic Mulch and Covers (LP) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 18, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.

- **2025 Sunset: sulfurous acid (JD).** The lead summarized the review of sulfurous acid, including uses as an acidifying agent to neutralize excessive alkalinity in soil and or water. Previous commenters have raised concerns based on the idea that it might be masking a deficiency. A member asked if there was information in the TR regarding possible carcinogens/adverse health effects, and the lead indicated there was no indication that was an issue.

Motion to remove sulfurous acid from the National List

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **2025 Sunset: microcrystalline cheesewax (JD).** The lead summarized the uses of microcrystalline cheesewax, which is used in mushroom production, and used widely among smaller growers. During the last round of comments, stakeholders unanimously supported relisting. The lead will add a summary of public comments from the spring meeting, and submit the document for the Fall 2023 meeting.

Motion to remove microcrystalline cheesewax from the National List

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: alcohols: ethanol, isopropanol (LP).** The lead discussed both listings, including uses and manufacture, noting that ethanol can be manufactured with fermentation. EPA regulates all non-food

applications of alcohols. There were not many comments from the Spring meeting, but those that were received were supportive. In particular, farmers emphasized the importance of having these sanitizers available quickly, especially in rural areas. The CS moved to vote on each listing separately.

Motion to remove alcohols: isopropanol from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to remove alcohols: ethanol, from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Research Priorities (RPs) (BC/All).** The Crops liaison previewed the list of research priorities for Crops, highlighting modifications and additions made to the Spring 2023 version of the document. The group discussed the research priority on the demand for organic nursery stock, and whether it is necessary. A member indicated there are two different aspects when talking about nursery stock, (i.e., annuals vs perennials) and the CS may revisit this topic at a later date. The lead will make modifications based on the conversation today, and send it to the CS Chair to forward to the MS Subcommittee. The MS will vote on the August 8 call.
- **Potassium sorbate proposal - petitioned (ADB).** The lead presented follow-up information provided by the petitioner about testing. Potassium sorbate is an approved synthetic inert, and is being petitioned for use as a foliar application on the plant and not on the soil. There are many approved alternatives, and there is limited information regarding human health and environmental concerns. The petitioner indicated that it could reduce the use of copper and sulfur, although there wasn't any comparison data or efficacy studies. The lead will add question and finalize the document for the Fall 2023 meeting.

Motion to classify as synthetic

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to add potassium sorbate to the National List at 205.601 (e) as an insecticide

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: LP

Yes: 1 No: 5 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to add potassium sorbate to the National List at 205.601 (i) as a disease control/fungicide

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 2 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: liquid fish products (ADB).** The lead reached out to NOP regarding a previous NOSB recommendations on an annotation for liquid fish, and NOP indicated it will not move forward with that recommendation based on several factors such as cost to the industry. The Crops Subcommittee voted on the sunset review as it currently appears on the National List.

Motion to remove liquid fish products from the National List

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss additional info.** The lead summarized plastic mulch and covers again, highlighting that plastic mulch is mentioned in OFPA, as well as on the National List at § 205.206 as crop pest, weed, and disease management practice. The annotation restricts the use of PVC. The CS voted previously (June 20) on the sunset listing, which caused some unease amongst the Board members, so the CS chose to have a follow-up conversation. After discussing the citation in OFPA and the National List entry the CS chose to vote on the substance again.

Motion to remove plastic mulch and covers from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 3 Abstain: 4 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - TR sufficiency

August 1, 2023

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic Mulch and Covers (LP) - discuss

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 TBD	Spr 2024
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	8.1.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23 8.1.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “

Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	8.1.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024

Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
--	------------	-----------	---	---	-------------------	-----

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes Tuesday, July 18, 2023 2:00 pm ET

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review June 20, 2023 notes
- Carbon Dioxide proposal - Petitioned (LP) - TR sufficiency
- 2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 20, 2023 notes** were accepted with minor corrections.
- **Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP).** The lead found the TR sufficient: It was thorough, had a comprehensive citation list, a robust section on international uses, and it addressed the specific petitioned use. The lead will work on the proposal and the CS will present it at the Spring 2024 meeting. The CS Chair suggested re-reviewing public comments from the Spring 2023 meeting, as there was comment about this specific use. The CS will inform the NOP that the TR was found sufficient so it can be posted to the AMS website.
- **2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT).** The lead summarized the review for newspaper, noting the relationship to other listings, such as paper pots and compost. There is some discussion in the document about the problem of compost contamination. There was no widespread opposition from stakeholders for the continued listing of newspaper, though there has been discussion of tightening up the annotation. Members expressed support for the questions to stakeholders included in the review, and the CS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove newspaper or other recycled paper at 205.601(b)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to remove newspaper or other recycled paper at 205.601(c)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT).** The lead summarized the review for potassium chloride, including uses, manufacture, and international use. At the last review potassium chloride was unanimously relisted. The NOSB requested a new TR in 2023, and the lead incorporated the information

into this review. Members discussed the annotation, and the fact that potassium chloride is a prohibited natural. The group also discussed alternatives such as potassium sulfate, and revised the questions to include a question to certifiers about monitoring chloride levels. The CS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove potassium chloride from the National List at 205.602(e)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Potassium Sorbate Proposal - petitioned (ADB)** - deferred to next call for time
- **Research Priorities Proposal (BC)**. The liaison/lead summarized public comments from the Spring meeting and in response, how he reorganized some of the topics. There are 12 items on the list, which have been categorized into three “buckets”: inputs/contaminants/systems. The lead will make some revisions, highlight the changes, and the group will revisit the final list on the August 1 call before sending it to the Materials Subcommittee.
- **Additional Items**. The Chair asked that members please submit all completed reviews/proposals as they are finished, and not wait until the deadline in August.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - TR sufficiency

August 1, 2023

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic Mulch and Covers (LP) - discuss additional info

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 TBD	Spr 2024
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	8.1.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “

Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105. TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	8.1.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024

Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
--	------------	-----------	---	---	-------------------	-----

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes
Tuesday, June 20, 2023 2:00 pm ET

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review June 6, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 6, 2023 notes** were accepted with minor changes to the section on liquid fish products.
- **2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP).** The lead summarized ethylene gas uses and manufacture. In Crops (this listing) it is used for pineapple flowering only, although it also has uses in handling. Members discussed the listing of this material to support year-round production of a crops which seems to be for economic reasons. The lead will collect additional information about production areas and the CS will discuss it at the Fall 2023 meeting.

Motion to remove ethylene gas from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 1 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP).** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of plastic mulch, noting that they are supposed to be removed at the end of each season. Commenters and the NOSB acknowledged the need for these materials, while also finding the issue of plastic problematic. The Board is interested in determining how much plastic is actually used in organic production, and is unsure how to find that data. Members discussed alternatives and solutions, and feel that biodegradable biobased plastic mulch, which is on the National List although no products exist currently, may not be the solution. The CS moved to a vote, which was mixed.

Motion to remove plastic mulch and covers from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 4 No: 2 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.** The CS will request a limited scope TR for ferric phosphate with specific questions about EDTA chelation and possible alternatives.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes
Tuesday, July 18, 2023 2:00 pm ET

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review June 20, 2023 notes
- Carbon Dioxide proposal - Petitioned (LP) - TR sufficiency
- 2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 20, 2023 notes** were accepted with minor corrections.
- **Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP).** The lead found the TR sufficient: It was thorough, had a comprehensive citation list, a robust section on international uses, and it addressed the specific petitioned use. The lead will work on the proposal and the CS will present it at the Spring 2024 meeting. The CS Chair suggested re-reviewing public comments from the Spring 2023 meeting, as there was comment about this specific use. The CS will inform the NOP that the TR was found sufficient so it can be posted to the AMS website.
- **2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT).** The lead summarized the review for newspaper, noting the relationship to other listings, such as paper pots and compost. There is some discussion in the document about the problem of compost contamination. There was no widespread opposition from stakeholders for the continued listing of newspaper, though there has been discussion of tightening up the annotation. Members expressed support for the questions to stakeholders included in the review, and the CS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove newspaper or other recycled paper at 205.601(b)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to remove newspaper or other recycled paper at 205.601(c)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT).** The lead summarized the review for potassium chloride, including uses, manufacture, and international use. At the last review potassium chloride was unanimously relisted. The NOSB requested a new TR in 2023, and the lead incorporated the information

into this review. Members discussed the annotation, and the fact that potassium chloride is a prohibited natural. The group also discussed alternatives such as potassium sulfate, and revised the questions to include a question to certifiers about monitoring chloride levels. The CS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove potassium chloride from the National List at 205.602(e)

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Potassium Sorbate Proposal - petitioned (ADB)** - deferred to next call for time
- **Research Priorities Proposal (BC)**. The liaison/lead summarized public comments from the Spring meeting and in response, how he reorganized some of the topics. There are 12 items on the list, which have been categorized into three “buckets”: inputs/contaminants/systems. The lead will make some revisions, highlight the changes, and the group will revisit the final list on the August 1 call before sending it to the Materials Subcommittee.
- **Additional Items**. The Chair asked that members please submit all completed reviews/proposals as they are finished, and not wait until the deadline in August.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - TR sufficiency

August 1, 2023

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic Mulch and Covers (LP) - discuss additional info

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 TBD	Spr 2024
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	8.1.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “

Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	8.1.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	8.1.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024

Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
--	------------	-----------	---	---	-------------------	-----

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

May 16, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (MJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

- Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote
- Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - discuss/vote
- Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June	7.18.23	Fall 2023

Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	7.18.23	Fall 2023
-------------------	-----	----------	--	---------	-----------

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “

Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 8.1.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105. TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	7.18.23	“ “

Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also request ed in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	7.18.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Limited Scope TR	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023

NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes
Tuesday, June 6, 2023 2:00 pm ET

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Logan Petrey (LP); Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review May 16, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 16, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB).** The NOP noted at the NOSB Spring meeting, as well as the last Executive call, that it will not move forward with the previous recommendation on marine materials, and the Crops Subcommittee has lingering questions on the related proposal to annotate liquid fish to restrict the source material. The CS and NOP worked collaboratively to develop the marine materials proposal, but there was uncertainty about the USDA's authority and whether NOP could implement a rule. Currently there is no restriction on the source material. Members are frustrated about this and would like to see the annotation adopted. In support of that, they will continue the discussion on the Executive Committee call on June 20, and delay the vote on the sunset review until the next CS call. The group also discussed the timing of pH adjustments, as well as additional data from OMRI about the different acids used for stabilization. The CS may add questions for stakeholders to the sunset review for the Fall 2023 meeting. The group also discussed the broader topic of marine materials and will discuss this further.
- **2025 Sunset: Aqueous potassium silicate (APS) (BC).** There was not much discussion at the Spring meeting. The lead summarized previous research, and noted that the TRs indicated low levels of environmental or human health impacts, and that the substance is benign. The lead also pointed out that the Limited scope TR is no longer pending, and was received and incorporated into the review. The CS moved to votes on the two listings.

Motion to remove aqueous potassium silicate from the National List at 205.601(e)(2)

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to remove aqueous potassium silicate from the National List at 205.601(i)1

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC).** The lead summarized the uses of lime sulfur noting that it is used extensively, has been in use for a long time, and is fairly benign. Lime sulfur can be hazardous to those operators who are mixing it. Several members provided feedback about use by and necessity to apple and pear growers. Members discussed alternatives to lime sulfur, and the CS moved to a vote on both listings. The CS also discussed a request for an annotation change, and will include that information in the review. The CS Chair will consult with the HS Chair who is spearheading the work agenda project on annotations, to determine how to move forward.

Motion to remove lime sulfur from the National List at 205.601(e)(6)

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to remove lime sulfur from the National List at 205.601(i)(6)

Motion by: BC

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP).** Deferred to next call.
- **2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** The Chair asked that members send final sunset reviews from the May 16 call to her and the NOP.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

May 16, 2023

2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JD) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - discuss/vote
 2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023
 August 15, 2023
 September 5, 2023
 September 19, 2023
 October 3, 2023
 November 7, 2023
 November 21, 2023
 December 5, 2023
 December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23.	7.18.23	Fall 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	7.18.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	-------------	--------------------	--------	----------------------	-------------------

Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “

Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23 6.20.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Low to med need L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Limited Scope TR	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, May 16, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Logan Petrey (LP);

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review April 4, 2023 notes
- Debrief from Spring 2023 NOSB meeting
- Review 2023 schedule
- 2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (FQ/MJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (FQ/MJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 4, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **Debrief from Spring 2023 NOSB meeting.** Members shared thoughts about the Spring meeting. All feedback was positive.
- **Review 2023 schedule.** The lead shared the Subcommittee schedule for discussions and due dates with members.
- **2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (FQ/MJ).** The lead summarized the review and the CS moved to a voted.

Motion to remove hydrated lime from the National List

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: ADB

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (SCP) (FQ/MJ).** The lead discussed the review and comments from the Spring 2023 meeting. There was a discussion about functionality of SCP versus copper. A member noted that the EPA lists this substance as a biopesticide although it is a synthetic. Another member pointed out the annotation for use as an algicide, and so this seems like it is not an issue. The CS may include a question to community about use as fungicide.

Motion to remove sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (SCP) from the NL

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB).** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of liquid fish products, which deliver nitrogen to crops. Liquid fish products are used in fruit and vegetable production. There are alternatives but this provides nearly instant energy. A member noted that because this product is liquid it has important utility for application on some crops. The NOSB voted in 2020 to annotate the listing for wild native fish for liquid fish products, and NOP has not yet implemented the recommendation. At the Spring 2023 a commenter from a fertilizer company

expressed concerns about fortification with phosphorus. The Board will review additional information from a materials review organization about essentiality of phosphorus, and the CS Chair will reach out to stakeholder groups to gather more information. A member noted that he finds this listing problematic, but supports growers needs. The CS deferred the vote to the next call.

- **2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB).** The lead summarized the review and the public comments from the Spring 2023 meeting. A member noted that sulfur is used widely, but it does have some environmental concerns, and would like to see the industry move away from extensive use. A couple of organizations/associations suggested annotations to address environmental concerns. A member added that it is important to use uniform definitions throughout the document, such as insecticides and acaricides. The NOSB Vice Chair suggested that this might be a candidate for a future annotation correction. The NOP suggested that this could be a technical correction as part of the inerts rulemaking. The CS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove elemental sulfur from the NL at 205.601(e)

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Motion to remove elemental sulfur from the NL at 205.601(i)

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Motion to remove elemental sulfur from the NL at 205.601(j)

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: MJ

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets

May 2, 2023 - cancelled

May 16, 2023

2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JD) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23.	7.18.23	Fall 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	7.18.23	Fall 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	7.18.23	Fall 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew	5.16.23	“ “

				Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105		
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	5.16.23 6.6.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	6.6.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	6.20.23	“ “

Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	6.20.23	“ “
--------------------	------------	----	---	--	---------	-----

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Low to med need L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “

Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Limited Scope TR	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, April 4, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ);

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review March 21, 2023 notes
- Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets
- Additional work agenda item requests?
- Discuss public comments, Spring meeting prep
- Additional Items.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 21, 2023 notes** were accepted with a minor change to the roll call.
- **Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets.** The CS reviewed the schedule and filled in dates to discuss the remainder of the 2026 sunsets. The 2025 sunset final reviews will be due to the Chair May 12. The group discussed the process changes, in which they are looking at work flows for the entire year rather than semester to semester. This allows people to manage their own personal schedules to get work done.
- The CS will work on questions for limited scope TR for hydrogen chloride
- **Additional work agenda item requests?**
 - The Chair suggested that members keep note of any additional items such as annotation changes for sunset substances, and bring those to a future discussion about work agenda requests. For example, perhaps the Subcommittee can revisit the research priorities and work on some of the topics internally.
- **Discuss public comments, Spring meeting prep.** The CS briefly discussed public comments.
- **Additional Items.** NOP will send the 2026 sunset templates to the Subcommittees by August.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

March 21, 2023.

Discuss TR requests for 2026 sunsets

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets

May 2, 2023 - cancelled

May 16, 2023

2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JD) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23.	2.9.23 7.18.23	Fall 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Discussion Doc	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	9.20.22 12.20.22 2.9.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	1.17.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 5.17.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.9.23 6.6.23	“ “

Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	3.15.22 12.06.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	3.15.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	3.15.22 1.17.23 3.7.23 6.6.23	“ “

Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.20.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Low to med need L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Limited Scope TR	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5

Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, March 21, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review March 7, 2023 notes
- New member introductions
- Discuss TR requests for 2026 sunsets (All)
- Schedule 2026 sunsets
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 7, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **New member introductions.** The Crops Subcommittee welcomed a new NOSB member, and members introduced themselves.
- **Discuss Technical Report (TR) requests for 2026 sunsets.** The group discussed the 2026 sunsets to determine the need for new TRs (See table below). To determine needs, members take into consideration the age of the most recent TR, any use or manufacturing changes in the substance, and whether they can glean the information from public comment. The CS will request two limited scope TRs: one on ferric phosphate, with specific questions regarding EDTA chelation and sulfur alternatives now available; and one on hydrogen chloride.
- **Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets.** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

March 7, 2023

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23

March 21, 2023.

Discuss TR requests for 2026 sunsets

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

Schedule discussion dates for 2026 sunsets

May 2, 2023 - cancelled

May 16, 2023

2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JD) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23.	2.9.23 7.18.23	Fall 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Discussion Doc	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	9.20.22 12.20.22 2.9.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	1.17.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 5.17.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.9.23 6.6.23	“ “

Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	3.15.22 12.06.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	3.15.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	3.15.22 1.17.23 3.7.23 6.6.23	“ “

Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.20.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “

Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Low to med need L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Limited Scope TR	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ/ FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5

Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, March 7, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Nate Powell-Palm

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review February 21, 2023 notes
- Chair's Update (ADB)
- 2026 Sunsets - Assign leads to determine TR needs
- Ethylene gas (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 21, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Chair's Update (ADB).**
 - The CS anticipates having a new member soon.
 - The Chair discussed the workflow for the time between the Spring and Fall meetings given the workload. All 2025 sunset reviews for the Fall meeting will be due to the CS Chair May 12, 2023. The discussion/vote dates were scheduled (see table below) and all final drafts will be submitted to the Chair/NOP two weeks after that date.
- **2026 Sunsets - Assign leads to Identify TR needs (All).** The Chair will assign the 2026 sunsets. MJ volunteered to lead more sunsets than others since she isn't leading as many as others.
- **Ethylene gas (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23.** The lead summarized the information in the TR, and it was declared sufficient. He indicated that the TR was easy to read and spoke to the specific questions the Subcommittee asked. Ethylene is used as a growth regulator in pineapple flowering in very small quantities, and is uniquely beneficial. The group also discussed ethylene and its relationship to petroleum products and plastic. The Chair will send an email to the NOP declaring sufficiency.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The response to the additional questions from the CS on potassium chloride were received and NOP will send them to the CS soon.
 - The group discussed the next steps for the carbon dioxide proposal. The CS requested a full TR on February 9, in response to public comment from the Fall 2022 meeting.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

February 21, 2023

March 7, 2023

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23

March 21, 2023.

Discuss TR requests for 2026 sunsets

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

April 18, 2023

May 2, 2023 - cancelled

May 16, 2023

2025 Sunset: Hydrated lime (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Liquid fish products (ADB) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Elemental sulfur (ADB) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lime sulfur (BC) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Plastic mulch and covers (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene gas (LP) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfurous acid (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (JD) - discuss/vote

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities Proposal (BC) - discuss/vote

Potassium Sorbate Proposal - Petitioned (ADB) - discuss/vote

Carbon Dioxide Proposal - Petitioned (LP/ADB) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23.	2.9.23 7.18.23	Fall 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Discussion Doc	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found	9.20.22 12.20.22 2.9.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023

			sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.		
--	--	--	---	--	--

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	1.17.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 5.17.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “

Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.9.23 6.6.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	3.15.22 12.06.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105. TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	3.15.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 6.20.23	“ “

Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also request ed in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23.	3.15.22 1.17.23 3.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.20.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer. TR addendum sent to CS 3.7.23.	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	MJ		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “

Pheromones	205.601(f)	MJ		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	MJ		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	WT		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks

NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, February 21, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review February 9, 2023 notes
- Review & Schedule Semester #2 Work Agenda Topics (attached workflow)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 9, 2023 notes** were accepted with the addition of some language under the potassium sorbate discussion
- **Review & Schedule Work Agenda Topics.**
 - The CS Chair proposed a schedule for the Subcommittee work agenda items and the group discussed the process and added discussion dates (see table below).
 - JD volunteered to present the two alcohol sunset reviews at the Spring meeting.
 - Members discussed the highlights and challenges of the new process for reviewing sunsets. The CS talked about the need to define the timeline for proposals and sunsets that are waiting for TRs, submitting documents to the Subcommittee, and ultimately to the NOP. The process would apply to all Subcommittees.
 - The CS set May 12, 2023 as the day that all draft Fall 2023 sunset reviews will be due to the other Subcomm members, so members can prep prior to the scheduled discussions (see table below for dates).
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

February 9, 2023, 3:00 pm ET - additional call

Plastic mulch and covers (LP/ADB)

Hydrated lime (MJ)

Sulfurous acid (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.21.23

Carbon Dioxide petition (LP/ADB) - discuss TR request

Potassium Sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote

February 21, 2023

March 7, 2023

Ethylene gas (LP) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

May 5, 2023

May 16, 2023

Hydrated lime (MJ)

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ)

Liquid fish products (ADB)

Elemental sulfur (ADB)

June 6, 2023

Aqueous Potassium Silicate (BC)

Lime sulfur (BC)

Plastic mulch and covers (LP)

Ethylene gas (LP)

June 20, 2023

Newspaper or other recycled paper, w/o glossy or colored inks (WT)

Potassium chloride (WT)

Microcrystalline Cheesewax (JD)

Sulfurous acid (JD)

Alcohols: Ethanol (JD)

Alcohols: Isopropanol (JD)

July 18, 2023

Research Priorities - Proposal (BC)

Potassium Sorbate - Petitioned (ADB)

Carbon Dioxide - Petitioned (LP/ADB)

August 1, 2023

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23.	2.9.23 7.18.23	Fall 2023

Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Discussion Doc	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	9.20.22 12.20.22 2.9.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023
-------------------	-----	----------------	--	--	----------

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	1.17.23 7.18.23	Spr 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23 6.20.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 5.17.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “

Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.9.23 6.6.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	3.15.22 12.06.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.6.23	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.9.23 5.16.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 5.16.23	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 . TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	3.15.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 2.9.23 6.20.23	“ “

Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also request ed in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 3.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.20.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer.	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 6.20.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Thursday, February 9, 2023 3:00 pm ET - additional call**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Javier Zamora (JZ); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review February 7, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
 - Plastic mulch and covers (LP/ADB)
 - Hydrated lime (MJ)
 - Sulfurous acid (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.21.23
- Carbon Dioxide petition (LP/ADB) - discuss TR request
- Potassium Sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 7, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2025 Sunsets: Discuss review**
 - **Plastic mulch and covers (LP/ADB).** The co-lead provided a summary of the plastic mulch review and the CS discussed environmental issues surrounding plastics in general. Members also discussed the requirement in the Organic Regulations that plastics are removed at the end of the growing season. [https://www.ecfr.gov/current/title-7/subtitle-B/chapter-I/subchapter-M/part-205#p-205.206\(c\)\(6\)](https://www.ecfr.gov/current/title-7/subtitle-B/chapter-I/subchapter-M/part-205#p-205.206(c)(6)). The co-lead will edit the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
 - **Hydrated lime (MJ).** The lead summarized the review and alerted the members to the alternative terms used for hydrated lime, such as calcium hydroxide, which is listed at 205.605 for handling and also at 205.603 for livestock. The lead will add a question for public comment regarding use, and will finalize the document for submission for the Spring meeting.
 - **Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (SCP) (MJ).** SCP is used as an alternative to copper, but it's not clear if it is actually being used. A member noted that he thought it is being used but might not be as effective. The lead will add a question for public comment about use and will submit the document for the Spring meeting.
 - **Sulfurous acid (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.21.23.** The lead summarized the limited scope TR and received concurrence from members that it is sufficient. A member also noted that the TR was well written and comprehensive.
- **Carbon dioxide petition (LP/ADB) - discuss limited scope TR request.** The co-lead recapped the history of the carbon dioxide petition, which was petitioned for addition to two sections on the National List: 205.601(a) and (j). The NOSB voted at the Fall 2022 meeting to add it to 205.601(a) and is now reviewing the request for listing at 205.601(j). After some discussion the CS determined the need for a full scope TR. The co-lead will send an email to the NOP with the request.
- **Potassium sorbate petition (ADB).** The lead summarized the potassium sorbate petition. She noted that it is approved for use as an inactive ingredient, and the petitioner is seeking approval as an active ingredient for plant disease and insect control/suppression at §205.601(e) and §205.601(i). The group discussed the existence of alternatives, its classification as a synthetic, and the previous three petitions. The Board voted each of those previous times to not add potassium sorbate to the NL, citing lack of

compatibility with organic systems. The lead added that the TR was comprehensive and well written although it seemed to focus more on non-petitioned uses of potassium sorbate. The CS will post a discussion document for the Spring meeting to collect stakeholder feedback, before bringing a full proposal to the board for a vote.

Motion to accept the discussion document on potassium sorbate

Motion by: ADB

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Additional Items.** The lead for potassium chloride noted that both the crops and handling reviews are now complete and will finalize and submit them to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

February 7, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ)

Hydrated lime (MJ)

Plastic mulch and covers (LP)

Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT)

Potassium chloride (WT) - verify that this is complete

Carbon Dioxide petition (LP) - discuss proposal/vote

Potassium Sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote

February 9, 2023, 3:00 pm ET - additional call

Plastic mulch and covers (LP/ADB)

Hydrated lime (MJ)

Sulfurous acid (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.21.23

Carbon Dioxide petition (LP/ADB) - discuss TR request

Potassium Sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote

February 21, 2023

Ethylene gas (LP) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23.	2.9.23	Fall 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Discussion Doc	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	9.20.22 12.20.22 2.9.23	Spr 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	1.17.23	Spr 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	RG/ LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	RG/ LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 5.17.22 2.7.23 2.9.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.9.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	3.15.22 12.06.22 12.20.22	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.9.23	“ “

Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105. TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23. TR found sufficient 2.9.23	3.15.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 2.9.23	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.21.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23. The CS will seek some additional info from the TR writer.	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks

New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, February 7, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch, Chair (ADB); Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review January 17, 2023 notes
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
 - Potassium chloride (WT) - verify completion
 - Sulfurous acid (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.21.23
 - Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ)
 - Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT)
 - Plastic mulch and covers (LP)
 - Hydrated lime (MJ)
 - Ethylene gas (LP) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23
- Carbon dioxide petition (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- Potassium sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 17, 2023 notes** were accepted with no changes.
- **2025 Sunsets: Discuss review**
 - **Potassium chloride (WT).** A member indicated that upon second look there was some data potentially missing from the TR and would like to seek some additional information. WT will send an email to the NOP who will reach out to the TR writer. The lead will also add a note to the draft review and resend it to the CS Chair to forward to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
 - **Sulfurous acid (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.21.23.** The group discussed sulfurous acid briefly and will discuss TR sufficiency on the Feb 9 call.
 - **Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (SCP) (MJ).** The lead summarized the draft review, including the uses, of SCP. In previous sunset reviews the NOSB noted that SCP is used as an alternative to copper sulfate in rice production. The lead will add questions for public comment and submit the review for the Spring meeting.
 - **Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT).** The lead summarized the newspaper review and the CS discussed it briefly. He noted chemicals used in production, and potential environmental issues. The lead will complete the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
 - **Plastic mulch and covers (LP)** - deferred to next call
 - **Hydrated lime (MJ)** - deferred to next call
 - **Ethylene gas (LP) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23** - deferred to next call
- **Carbon dioxide petition (LP)** - deferred to next call
- **Potassium sorbate petition (ADB)** - deferred to next call
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 17, 2023

Research Priorities - discuss list/send to MS

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Alcohols: Ethanol (RG)

Alcohols: Isopropanol (RG)

Plastic mulch and covers (LP)

Ethylene gas (LP)

February 7, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ)

Hydrated lime (MJ)

Plastic mulch and covers (LP)

Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT)

Potassium chloride (WT) - verify that this is complete

Carbon Dioxide petition (LP) - discuss proposal/vote

Potassium Sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote

February 9, 2023, 3:00 pm ET - additional call

Plastic mulch and covers (LP/ADB)

Hydrated lime (MJ)

Sulfurous acid (JD) - TR sufficiency due 3.21.23

Carbon Dioxide petition (LP/ADB) - discuss TR request

Potassium Sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote

February 21, 2023

Ethylene gas (LP) - TR sufficiency due 3.26.23

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting.	2.9.23	Fall 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Discussion Doc	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due	9.20.22 12.20.22 2.9.23	Spr 2023

			09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.		
--	--	--	--	--	--

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	1.17.23	Spr 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	RG/LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	RG/LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 5.17.22 2.7.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23	“ “

Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.9.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22	3.15.22 12.06.22 12.20.22	“ “
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 (Livestock) TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.9.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternatives	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105. TR sent to CS 1.20.23. Sufficiency due 3.21.23	3.15.22 12.6.22 2.7.23 2.9.23	“ “

Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also requested in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan. TR sent to CS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.9.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23, and they will seek some additional info from the TR writer.	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, January 17, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Rick Greenwood (RG), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Amy Bruch (ADB); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- December 20, 2022 notes
- Research Priorities - discuss list/send to MS
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
 - Alcohols: Ethanol (RG)
 - Alcohols: Isopropanol (RG)
 - Potassium chloride (WT) - TR sufficiency
 - Ethylene gas (LP)
 - Plastic mulch and covers (LP)
 - Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 20, 2022 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Research Priorities (all).** The lead summarized the current list of research priorities, as well as suggestions for additional items gleaned from public comments. Members discussed what to add, remove or alter. ADB and BC will complete the document and forward it to the Materials Subcommittee prior to the next MS meeting.
- **2025 Sunsets: Discuss review**
 - **Alcohols: Ethanol, Isopropanol (RG/LP).** The lead summarized the two alcohols noting there is little to no environmental or human health impacts associated with use. During the last sunset the NOSB voted unanimously to retain both substances on the National List.
 - **Potassium chloride (WT).** The lead found the TR sufficient, noting that it was contracted for both handling and crops, although he noted that it seems to focus on Crops. Once the NOP clarifies that it covers both scopes, the CS and HS will send a note to the NOP that it is sufficient. The lead will modify the draft review to incorporate information from the TR and will submit the review to NOP for the Spring meeting. Members further discussed the use of this material.
 - **Ethylene gas (LP). TR pending.** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of ethylene gas, and will finalize the review based on feedback from members. The CS will forward the review to the NOP for the Spring 2023 meeting.
 - **Plastic mulch and covers (LP).** Deferred to next call.
 - **Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** MJ will cover sunset reviews for JZ and LG.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

December 20, 2022

Potassium Sorbate (ADB) - TR Sufficiency

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Aqueous potassium silicate (BC)

Lime sulfur (BC)

January 3, 2023 - canceled

January 17, 2023

Research Priorities - discuss list/send to MS

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Alcohols: Ethanol (RG)

Alcohols: Isopropanol (RG)

Plastic mulch and covers (LP)

Ethylene gas (LP)

February 7, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate (MJ)

Hydrated lime (MJ)

Plastic mulch and covers (LP)

Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks (WT)

Potassium chloride (WT) - verify that this is complete

Carbon Dioxide petition (LP) - discuss proposal/vote

Potassium Sorbate petition (ADB) - discuss proposal/vote

February 21, 2023

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting.	2.7.23	Spr 2023
Potassium Sorbate	ADB	Proposal	Petition sent to CS 11.22.21. Petition suff/TR request due 01.21.22. Petition found sufficient. TR requested 4.5.22. TR sent to CS 7.28.22. Sufficiency due 09.26.22. TR was not found sufficient. The CS sent additional questions to the contractor 9.20.22. Response sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. The TR was found sufficient 12.20.22.	9.20.22 12.20.22 2.7.23	Spr 2023

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	RG/BC	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	1.17.23	Spr 2023

2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Alcohols: Ethanol	205.601(a)(1)(i)	RG/ LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Alcohols: Isopropanol	205.601(a)(1)(ii)	RG/ LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate	205.601(a)(8)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 5.17.22 2.7.23	“ “
Newspaper or other recycled paper, without glossy or colored inks	205.601(b)(2)(i) and 205.601(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2017 TR: 2006 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23	“ “
Plastic mulch and covers	205.601(b)(2)(ii)	LP	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2016 Supplement (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TR: 2012 (Biodegradable Mulch Film Made from Bioplastics) TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 2.7.23	“ “
Aqueous potassium silicate	205.601(e)(2) and 205.601(i)(1)	BC	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TAP: 2003 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.06.22 12.20.22	“ “

				TR sent to CS 11.25.22. TR found sufficient 12.06.22		
Elemental sulfur	205.601(e)(5), 205.601(i)(10) and 205.601(j)(2)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Lime sulfur	205.601(e)(6) and 205.601(i)(6)	BC	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Hydrated lime	205.601(i)(4)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2015 TAP: 2002 (Calcium Hydroxide) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 4.5.22 2.7.23	“ “
Liquid fish - products	205.601(j)(8)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2019 (Fish-based fertilizers) TR: 2006 (Fish products) 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Sulfurous acid	205.601(j)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope on alternati ves	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2014 TR: 2010 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Ethylene gas	205.601(k)	LP	Y - Also request ed in HS	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2011 Supplemental TR: 2007 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 TR due late Jan	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Microcrystalline cheesewax	205.601(o)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: 2018 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.602(e)	WT	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TAP: 1995 2018/Fall - Rec to Renew	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23	“ “

				Sunset renewal: 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105 Draft TR sent to CS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23		
--	--	--	--	---	--	--

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	