

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday January 5, 2016 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in; Tracy Favre (TF) - sitting in

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

<b>2018 Sunsets (TR requests)</b>					
<b>Summary: Spr 2016    Review: Fall 2016</b>					
<b>Substance</b>	<b>Contact</b>	<b>TR request?</b>	<b>Notes</b>	<b>Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed</b>	<b>Meeting</b>
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.	Dec 15	Spr 2016
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015	Jan 19	Spr 2016
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. HS requested TR 07 10 15. Request for TR under review as of Nov 2015	Feb 2	Spr 2016
Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe	N	Petition for annotation change. Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.	Jan 5	Spr 2016

<b>Petitioned Substances</b>					
<b>Substance</b>	<b>Contact</b>	<b>TR request?</b>	<b>Notes</b>	<b>Scheduled for disc/ Vote</b>	<b>Meeting</b>
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015.	Jan 5	Spr 2016

<a href="#">Squid and Squid Byproducts</a> 205.601 <a href="#">Petition amendment #1</a>	CBe	Y	Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15. Petition amendment sent to CS 10 05 15. <b>TR in development (expected Dec 2015)</b>	<b>Feb 2 disc TR if available</b>	TBD
Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15. Waiting for LS	Waiting for LS to review	Proposal Spr 2016
<a href="#">Hypochlorous Acid</a> 205.605 and 205.601	HA	<a href="#">2015</a>	<a href="#">NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF)</a>  Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR suff discussion scheduled for 12 01 15 in HS	<b>Jan 19</b>	Spr 2016
<a href="#">Soy Wax</a>	FT	N	Petition sent to CS 10 14 15. Questions or request for TR due 12 15 15. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No TR requested	<b>Dec 1/Jan 19</b>	TBD
Calcium Chloride annotation change 205.602	CBe		Petition sent to CS 11 02 15. Petition suff/ <b>TR Request due 01 04 16</b>	<b>Jan 19</b>	TBD
1-methylcyclopropene (1-MCP). 205.601	ZS/HA		Petition sent to CS 11 30 15. Petition suff/ <b>TR Request due 02 01 16</b>	<b>Feb 2</b>	TBD
<b>Inert Ingredients</b>					
<b>Substance</b>	<b>Contact</b>	<b>TR rqstd?</b>	<b>Notes*</b>	<b>Vote</b>	<b>Meeting</b>
EPA List 4 Inerts annotation change	ZS	N/A	Update from IWG	NA	Spr 2016
<b>Other Topics</b>					
<b>Project</b>	<b>Contact</b>	<b>Doc type</b>	<b>Notes*</b>	<b>Disc/Vote</b>	<b>Meeting</b>
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/FT		Report?	<b>Mar 15</b>	TBD

Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) and other manure issues	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper. TR rqst sent to NOP 10 06 15. Petition withdrawn 10 14 15. CS moved project to "other topics"		TBD
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch	ZS	DD?		Feb 2	TBD
Prohibition of NPEs in Inerts annotation change	ZS	DD	DD leading toward annotation change. NOP already approved/		Spr 2016
Newspaper - annotation change	ZS		Will write justification to send to ES and NOP.		TBD
Research Priorities	All	NA	RP's due to MS Aug 2016		Fall 2016

\* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed    \***Highlight** indicates review completion

### Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of December 15
- Calcium Chloride (CBe): Discuss 2018 sunset questions
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe): Discuss petition
- Calcium Chloride annotation change (CBe): Petition sufficiency, need for TR?
- Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs (CBo/FT) - Discuss project
- Squid and Squid Byproducts (CBe) - Discuss TR if available
- Copper sulfate (ZS) - Discuss 2018 sunset questions
- Other items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes of December 15** approved with a change to the text regarding hypochlorous acid.
- **Calcium Chloride 208 sunset (CBe)**. The lead summarized the material, its uses, and previous reviews. The lead researched information from two Material Review Organizations (MROs) and noted that there are ~30 registered products containing calcium chloride. The draft review will be updated with some potential questions and will be finalized for posting for the April 2015 meeting.
- **Calcium Chloride annotation change (CBe)**. The group discussed the 2015 petition with respect to the 2005 petition, which was rejected by a previous Board because it failed to meet the OFPA criteria. Members discussed the difference(s) between the two petitions and whether or not there was any new information. The CS will revisit this on the next call.
- **Ash from Manure Burning (CBe)**: The lead summarized the changes made since the previous discussion, and the CS moved to a vote on this material.

Motion to annotate ash from manure burning (§205.602, nonsynthetic substances prohibited for use in organic crop production) with the following annotation: “except where the combustion reaction does not involve the use of synthetic additives and is controlled to separate and preserve nutrients.”

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

The motion failed, thus the Subcommittee supports retaining the existing prohibition of manure ash in organic crop production.

- **Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs (CBo/FT).** The CS discussed this project in light of the public comment from the last meeting, and the path forward. The lead feels there are emerging issues with regard to this and the CS should continue to work on this issue. A member noted that commenters mentioned contamination issues related to irrigation water, but pointed out that water is not restricted by the regulations as are other inputs, so although the NOSB could address this elsewhere, it is not germane to this document. The lead reviewer will co-lead this with one of the new NOSB members and will present this to the CS in March.
- **Squid and Squid Byproducts (CBe).** Deferred to Feb 2 call. Awaiting TR.
- **Copper sulfate - 2018 sunset (ZS).** The lead noted that this listing pertains to rice and control of tadpole shrimp and algae, and that it is used in a very specific and narrow range of conditions. She added that sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate was suggested as an alternative, but research found it was not successful. The CS will add a couple of questions for posting, hoping to glean comments from rice growers. The lead asked the NOP to add the link to the review of copper from last meeting.
- **Other items** - none.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous CS Notes](#)

#### **Future Call Schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 2:00 ET)**

December 15, 2015

Ozone gas (FT): Discuss 2018 sunset questions

Calcium Chloride (CBe): Discuss 2018 sunset questions

Ash from Manure Burning (CBe): Discuss petition

Hypochlorous Acid (HA): TR sufficiency

Calcium Chloride annotation change (CBe): Petition sufficiency, need for TR

1-methylcyclopropene (1-MCP): Assign lead

January 5, 2016

Calcium Chloride (CBe): Discuss 2018 sunset questions

Ash from Manure Burning (CBe): Discuss petition

Calcium Chloride annotation change (CBe): Petition sufficiency, need for TR?

Discuss Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs (CBo/FT)

Squid and Squid Byproducts (CBe): Discuss TR if available

Copper sulfate (ZS): Discuss 2018 sunset questions

January 19, 2016. (CBe & ZS may miss call due to conflict with hydroponics task force).

Squid and Squid Byproducts (CBe): Discuss TR if available

Calcium Chloride annotation change (CBe): Petition sufficiency, need for TR.

Soy Wax (FT): Discuss proposal

Paracetic Acid (HA): Discuss 2018 sunset questions & TR if available

Hypochlorous Acid - discuss proposal

February 2, 2016

EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity (ZS) - Discuss 2018 sunset questions & TR if available  
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch. Review public comment/memo/original  
Squid and Squid Byproducts (CBe)  
1-methylcyclopropene (1-MCP) (ZS/HA)

February 16, 2016

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

Contamination Issues in farm inputs

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 4, 2016
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016