

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday January 6, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS), Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT), Harold Austin (HA), Carmela Beck (CBe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Jay Feldman (JFe), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in

Absent: John Foster (JFo)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)		Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.		Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 See Table Below					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP Y	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	NA	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	NA	“
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15	NA	“
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	“
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives.	NA	“
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	Fe/HA	1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec)	NA	“
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	Fe/ZS	Y	TR requested 08 15 14 for Alkylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015; Nonylphenols only	NA	“
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	“

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)		TBD

Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request		TBD
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15		TBD
Seaweed extracts	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15 NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/JFe	DD			Disc doc Spr 2015

Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition		Disc doc TBD
--	----	--	--	--	-----------------

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from December 16, 2014
- Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - vote
- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklst
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Hydrated lime, Potassium chloride (ZS) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of December 16, 2014 were approved with no changes.
- **New petitions** - Two new petitions were sent to the CS since last call (see table above): brown seaweed extract, and lignin sulfonate. CBe volunteered to lead the reviews and will determine petition sufficiency and the need for TRs.
- **Calcium Sulfate (ZS)** - Members discussed the proposal that was circulated prior to the call, and after some minor edits to the language proceeded to vote.

Vote:

Motion to classify Calcium Sulfate, produced by the flue gas desulfurization (FGD) process as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add Calcium Sulfate, produced by the flue gas desulfurization (SGD) process as petitioned to 205.601

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional discussion: none

Yes: No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT)** second meeting SC review. The CS discussed this material and the review that was circulated, and proceeded to vote. After additional discussion, the vote was deferred to the next call.

Vote:

Motion to remove Hydrogen chloride, CAS # 7647-01-0, from §205.601(n)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional discussion: A member asked if there was a checklist completed for this review and urged the group to develop one. He feels that it would be helpful and would incentivize the industry to move away from this material, which they have indicated they wish to do. The CS Chair reminded the group that checklists for the sunset materials are optional, and suggested that instead of completing a full checklist, the lead could extract the information and write it in narrative form in the summary, expanding the paragraph that was provided. The members chose to defer the vote until this is completed.

The CS Chair noted that she will not be available on the next CS call, and asked that the Vice Chair be prepared to lead the discussion and vote for this material. She also asked that the boiler plate language be added to the draft document indicating that the CS is voting to remove based on OFPA criteria. A member added that since there was a TR contracted, perhaps it makes sense to include an abbreviated checklist as well as a summary of the public comment. He also suggested that since the industry would like to move away from using this material, that info should be highlighted in the review. Members agreed that if there is no new info for a material then they do not need to complete a checklist.

- **2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe).** The lead noted that she will revise the ferric phosphate review to be consistent with other 2016 reviews. A member added that there was some additional info included in the last review about the concerns over EDTA, and urged that it be included here. This he feels, will create incentives to move away from this material. The lead will add the additional information and the group will defer the vote until the next meeting.
- The Chair asked that CS add an extra call on Jan 27.
- **3-decene-2-one (CBe)** - Petitioned as a sprout inhibitor for potatoes. Extends shelf life, and is beneficial for the export market. The petition mentioned several alternatives. The group discussed the checklist and the petition and the edits will be incorporated into the document before the group votes. The vote will be deferred to the Jan 27 call.
- **2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT)** - The lead asked the group for input about questions to include in the review for ethanol. A member urged the group to include checklists at this stage in an effort to glean as much info as early as possible. The Chair noted that the checklists are optional, but perhaps they could pose a question that would direct people to the TR. The lead will complete the document and the group will discuss it on the January 27 call
- **2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT)** - deferred to the January 27 call so the lead can complete the review.
- **2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)** - deferred to the January 27 call.
- **2017 Sunset (205.602 items) - Potassium chloride, Sodium fluoaluminate, strychnine (ZS)** - Members briefly discussed these materials. ZS will add a few questions for public input and recirculate for discussion on the January 27 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Dec 16, 2014 2:00 ET

Allyl Isothiocyanate (HA) - Discuss checklist/vote - completed

2016 Sunset Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss and vote (?) deferred to Jan 6

2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (JFo/FT) - Discuss and vote - deferred to Jan 6
Exhaust Gas (FT) - Discuss checklist and vote - completed
Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - Discuss checklist
Discuss 2017 sunsets with no TRs

Jan 6, 2015 2:00 ET

Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - vote
2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
Laminarin (ZS) - Discuss TR if ready
3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklst
2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, hydrated lime, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss
summary/questions if any

Jan 20, 2015 2:00 ET

2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklst 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural),
Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions
if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency
2017 Sunsets - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (if time
allows) (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps, ammonium, (FT) - discuss summary/questions
if any
Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
2017 Sunsets - Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids,
Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset, Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate (CBe) -
discuss summary/questions if any (might get bumped to January 27 call

Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET

2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss
summary/questions if any
2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss
summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 2, 2:00 ET (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and
covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET

2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper,
iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions
if any
2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) -
discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET - Additional call

2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers Microcrystalline cheesewax (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any

2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) -Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET****Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET****Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)					
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.		
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y			
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.		
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority		
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	FT /CBo		Low priority		

Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority		
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	J Fe/PD	1994	Low priority		
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	J Fe/CBo		Low priority		
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006			“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	J Fe/FT				“
Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)		“
Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)		“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)		“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011			“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995			“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006			“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	J Fe/FT				“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011			“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006			“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)		“

Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995			“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012			“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum- based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995			“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)		“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS				“
Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)		“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011			“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995			“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS				
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)		“

Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010			“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011			“
Boric acid	CBo	1995 TAP Y			
Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted.		
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday January 20, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS), Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT), Harold Austin (HA), Carmela Beck (CBe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Jay Feldman (JFe), John Foster (JFo), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in, Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Con- tact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0)	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0)	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Con- tact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP Y	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	Will discuss 01 27 15	Summary : Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives.	Will discuss 02 24 15	“
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	¶Fe/HA	1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec)	Will discuss 02 24 15	“
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	¶Fe/ZS	Y	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonlyphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015.	Will discuss 02 24 15	“
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demosers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	01 20 2015. Will continue discussion 02 17	“
Soap-based algicide/demosers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Will discuss 02 17 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 02 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	Will discuss 02 02 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	¶Fe/CBo		Low priority	Will discuss 01 27 15	

Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	Will discuss 01 27 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	1994	Low priority	Will discuss 02 17 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	Will discuss 01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	JFe/FT			Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	JFe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“

Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 01 27 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			Will discuss 01 27 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)		TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	Scheduled for 01 27 15	TBD
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15		TBD
Seaweed extracts	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15 NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/JFe	DD		Schedule d for 02 24 15	Disc doc Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from January 6, 2015
- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural), Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
- 2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency
- 2017 Sunsets - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps (ammonium), (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demosers
- Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate (CBe) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of January 6, 2015 were approved as is
- **2017 Sunsets (HA)**
 - **Elemental sulfur:** The CS Chair noted that the questions that are included in the intro for the sunset reviews are being repeated for each material and asked that the redundancy be eliminated. Members will include unique and/or specific questions in the review. The group discussed targeted language regarding the compliance with requirements for personal protection, and will add a sentence into the narrative as opposed to a question. A member provided a checklist for this material.
 - **Oils (horticultural):** Two members collaborated on a checklist for this material, with additional questions for posting, including a question about the definition of the “narrow range”. A member noted that there are horticultural oils that fall just outside the definition of “narrow range”. The CS Chair indicated that the best way to address this would be via a regulatory change.
 - **Pheromones** – Synthetic insect hormones that are used to disrupt mating or for monitoring. Some inerts are listed in the TR. Members discussed the questions in the draft document, and the Chair noted that they should include some questions about new delivery systems that are

currently being developed. The lead will make some edits based on suggestions. The Chair also mentioned microencapsulated pheromones as they were discussed in the TR, however these are not being used in organic agriculture because they have list 3 inerts, and are not used in passive dispensers.

- **2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT)** - Used for delinting cotton seed. There are mechanical delinting methods as well.

Motion to remove Hydrogen chloride, CAS # 7647-01-0, from §205.601(n)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe)** - Members discussed the proposal that was circulated prior to the call and proceeded to vote.

Motion to remove **Ferric Phosphate** (CAS # 10045-86-0) from 205.601(h)

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: A member feels that the inert ingredients used are actually active and urged the group to consider that when voting.

Yes: 2 No: 3 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset - Lead salts (FT)** - Lead salts are prohibited in OFPA and were added to the National List by the NOP in 1997, and the CS feels that there is no new information to indicate that they should be removed.
- **2017 sunset - Soaps (ammonium) (FT)** - for animal repellants. Members discussed several aspects of this material, including the inclusion of questions for public comment regarding potential usage changes.
- **2017 sunset - Herbicidal soaps – (FT)** - Soap as algicide/demosser. **(FT)** - The lead will add some language pertaining to use. Little information is available in the old TAPs, so they will wait for the new TR.
- **2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA)** - Discuss TR sufficiency - deferred to next call.
- **2017 Sunsets - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (CBo)** - deferred to next call
- **Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo)** - JFe transferred this project to CBo as this is his last call. The CS Chair offered that the document was well written, coherent, and succinct. She asked for some modifications: Section 205.203 says contamination of soils, crops, and water, and therefore the proposal must look at contamination of soils and not just contamination of compost; and asked that the issue of loading rates be addressed.
- **2017 Sunsets - Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate (CBe)** - discuss summary/questions if any –deferred to next call
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Jan 6, 2015 2:00 ET

Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - vote

2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote

2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
Laminarin (ZS) - Discuss TR if ready
3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist
2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, hydrated lime, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss
summary/questions if any

Jan 20, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist - deferred to Jan 27
- 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural), Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
- 2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency
- 2017 Sunsets – (CBo): Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (if time allows) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps (ammonium), (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset, Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any

Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 2, 2:00 ET (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) -Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday January 27, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in

Absent: Paula Daniels (PD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP Y	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	Will discuss 02 02 15	Summary: : Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	01 27 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives.	Will discuss 02 24 15	“
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	JFe/HA	1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15	Will discuss 02 24 15	“
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	JFe/ZS	Y	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonlyphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015.	Will discuss 02 24 15	“
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	01 20 2015. Will continue discussion 02 17 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Will discuss 02 17 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 02 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	Will discuss 02 02 15	

Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	Will discuss 02 02 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	1994	Low priority	Will discuss 02 17 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	JFe/FT			01 27 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	JFe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“

Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	Will discuss 02 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			Will discuss 02 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)		TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	01 27 15	TBD
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15		TBD
Seaweed extracts	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15 NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/JFe	DD		Scheduled for 02 24 15	Disc doc Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from January 20, 2015
- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Micronutrients, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklst/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminatate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of January 20, 2015 were approved with no changes
- **2017 Sunset: Lime Sulfur (HA)** - Lime sulfur is listed as an insecticide and fungicide. The CS received a new TR and the lead conveyed to the group that it was very thorough and well done. The CS found it sufficient. Members discussed future iterations of TRs and perhaps altering or adding some questions regarding efficacy of alternatives which will aid in their review..
- **2017 Sunsets: Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic (CBo)** - All are 205.602 materials; Non synthetics prohibited. The draft review docs were sent out prior to last meeting, and included checklists. The lead did not propose any additional questions.
- **2017 Sunsets (CBe)**
 - **Aquatic plant extracts** - The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2006 TR. There are no concerns with this material.
 - **Humic acids** - The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2006 TR. The CS Chair added that the TR for oxidized lignite addressed humic acids, and feels that it should be referenced in this review. The CS Chair offered that

some groups in the organic community feel that not all humic acid derivatives are synthetic, and as such she feels this material could be a candidate for an annotation change. NOP noted that classification issues can be clarified in the Materials Classification guidance (not yet finalized).

- **Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)** - deferred to next call.
- **Liquid fish products** - The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2006 TR. The CS Chair added that the annotation is problematic for use in review of blended fertilizers containing liquid fish. ZS will write a question for addition to the document.
- **Micronutrients** - Found to be essential. Members discussed the annotation, which restricts use and requires testing for deficiency, and will add a question about the various ways to document deficiency.
- **Magnesium sulfate** - The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2011 TR. There was a unanimous vote in 1995 that Magnesium sulfate is synthetic and inconsistent with organic production, but based on public comments that there were no alternatives, the Board reconsidered its recommendation. The CS will include some additional questions for posting.
- **3-decene-2-one (CBe)** - Petitioned Material. This material is a registered pesticide. The lead incorporated comments from JFe into the document after the last call, and the group proceeded to a vote.

Motion to classify 3-decene-2-one (CAS # 10519-33-2) as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add 3-decene-2-one (CAS # 10519-33-2) as petitioned to 205.601

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS)** - deferred to next call
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Jan 20, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklis - deferred to Jan 27
- 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural), Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
- 2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency

- 2017 Sunsets – (CBo): Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (if time allows) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps (ammonium), (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset, Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any

Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset),(deferred to next call), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any - deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 2, 2015 2:00 ET (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate - TR disc

Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demosers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) -Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday February 2, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Paula Daniels (PD)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP Y	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	02 02 15	Summary: : Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	02 02 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	01 27 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Will discuss 02 17 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives.	Will discuss 02 24 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	JFe/HA	1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15	Will discuss 02 17 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	JFe/ZS	Y	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonlyphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15.	Will discuss 02 24 15	"
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	01 20 15. Will continue discussion 02 17 15	"
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Will discuss 02 17 15	"

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 17 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	Will discuss 02 17 15	

Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	02 02 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	1994	Low priority	Will discuss 02 17 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	JFe/FT			01 27 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	02 02 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		02 02 15 and 02 24 15?	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	JFe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		02 02 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	01 27 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“

Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		Will discuss 02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)		TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	01 27 15	Spr 2015
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested	Disc scheduled for 02 24 15	TBD
Seaweed extracts	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15 NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/JFe	DD		Scheduled for 02 24 15	Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from January 27, 2015
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of January 27, 2015 were approved with no changes.
- **2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT)** - The group discussed the additional questions about essentiality and availability that were initially proposed and chose not to include them as they were already posed in the introduction section.
- **2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT)** - The group discussed the additional questions about essentiality and availability that were initially proposed and chose not to include them as they were already posed in the introduction section.
- **2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)** - Also called Calcium Hydroxide. Widely used as disease control. As per the Chair, a link to the 2002 TR for Calcium Hydroxide was added to the review for hydrated lime. No additional questions will be posed.
- **2017 Sunsets**
 - **Sodium fluoaluminate (ZS)** - The lead noted that the natural source of this material (a mine in Greenland) may have been closed so the nonsynthetic form is likely not available.
 - **Potassium chloride (ZS)** - The CS will add questions regarding usage and whether it will be added as an ingredient in in blended products or use by itself.

- **Strychnine (ZS)** - No new information and no issues. No additional questions will be asked
- **2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT)** - The CS discussed questions for posting. The lead will make some minor edits to the document and send the finalized version to ZS and MA.
- **2017 Sunsets - Lignin sulfonate (CBe)** (petition to remove and sunset review). A petition to remove from 205.601(l) was received in Nov 2014. It is used as a floating agent, but the petition indicates it is non-essential as it has been replaced with other methods. The petition was found sufficient and the CS is not requesting a new TR. During the sunset review the CS will ask questions and solicit comments about the petition to remove and whether or not it is essential as a flotation aid.
- **2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS)** - The Lead posed a couple of questions for the spring 2015 posting: One for growers and one for certifiers. A member asked about the possibility of consulting with the EPA on materials such as these and the chair noted that if the information is not in the TR then it is within the purview of the NOSB to seek additional info from other agencies or sources, via the NOP. The lead will add some additional questions and recirculate the document so people can review it by the proposal deadline.
- **2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Potassium bicarbonate (HA). TR discussion** - deferred to next call
- The CS Chair noted that she read the **Nonlyphenol ethoxylates TR** (requested for the EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern) which needs sufficiency review. She asked about a reference to “environmental compartments” and was unsure what this is. EBR will consult with LB to determine what it means and will discuss it on the next call.
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset) - (deferred to next call), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklst/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any - deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 2, 2015 2:00 ET (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions

- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion

Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency of Nonlyphenol ethoxylates.
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- Discuss Checklists for copper
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday February 17, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) sitting in; Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD)

Absent:

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP Y	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	02 02 15	Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	02 02 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	01 27 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives.	Will discuss 02 24 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	JFe/HA	1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	JFe/ZS	Y	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	01 20 15. Will continue discussion 02 24 15	"
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Will discuss 02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	02 17 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	02 17 15	

Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	02 02 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	1994	Low priority	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	JFe/FT			01 27 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	02 02 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		02 02 15. Will continue review 02 24 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	JFe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		02 02 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	01 27 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“

Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum- based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		02 17 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		01 27 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		01 27 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		Will discuss 02 24 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not	Will discuss 02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	Will discuss 02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)		TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	01 27 15	Spr 2015
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested	Disc scheduled for 02 24 15	TBD
Seaweed extracts	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15 NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD

Inert Ingredients

Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/JFe	DD Report		Scheduled for 02 24 15	Written report Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from February 2, 2015
- Hydroponics/Aquaponics task force.
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 2, 2015 were approved with no changes.
- **Hydroponics/Aquaponics task force.** The CS Chair informed the CS of the NOPs intention to create a Hydroponics/Aquaponics task force. The call for nominations will be published in the next few weeks and will be open for 60 days. In addition to the CS Chair, who will act as liaison to the Board, the chair invited another NOSB member to self-nominate if interested. The task force will report to CS and will present their findings at the spring 2016 NOSB.
- **2017 Sunsets (CBo)**
 - **Ammonium carbonate.** Used in traps, so no contact with organic food, soil, etc. The CS will not pose additional questions
 - **Newspaper or other recycled paper.** Used as mulch and compost feedstock. The CS will include some questions about inks.
 - **Plastic mulch and covers.** Herbicide, weed barrier. Members discussed the inclusion of questions and whether or not it would be useful given the recent memo from the NOP regarding the bio-based bio degradable mulch. The memo clarifies that currently there are no products that would qualify as bio-based, biodegradable based on the percentage of biobased

components versus petroleum based components. The CS Chair noted that plastic mulch is currently the only alternative.

- **2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA)** - Limited scope TR was requested and received. The TR was found sufficient, as it answered the two questions that were posed by the HS. However, the lead feels that it did not provide comprehensive information on the many uses for disease control, so the HS will seek the additional information via public comments.
- **2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS)** - The 2006 notes indicate there was a TR, but the CS Chair was not able to locate this document, if it exists. NOP note: The NOP verified that there was no TR, only the 1995 TAP. The 2015 TR was found sufficient and the CS will add questions to the posting regarding the use of hydrogen peroxide to fight fireblight.
- **2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT)** - The TR has not been received yet, so the CS will defer to next call.
- **2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demosers (FT)** - The TR has not been received yet, so the CS will defer to next call.
- **2017 Sunsets (PD)**
 - **Soaps, insecticidal:** Originally transferred from JFo to PD, but FT completed the review as well, so he and PD will confer and combine their review.
 - **Sodium silicate:** The CS discussed the environmental impacts and manufacturing process, and discussed the fate of used sodium silicate in evaporated ponds; this waste material is subject to other regulations.
 - **Sucrose octanoate esters:** Used for insect control of soft bodied insects, low toxicity, the TR was adequate, and no questions will be added.
 - **Vitamin D3:** The CS does not have additional questions or concerns about this material
- **EPA List 4 Inerts (ZS):** The NOP clarified language in the TR pertaining to “compartments” and the CS finds the TR sufficient. The lead noted that since the TR is narrow in scope they need to determine how to proceed.
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Feb 2, 2015 2:00 ET (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- 2017 Sunsets – Micronutrients (Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt) (CBe) - discuss summary/questions

Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion and suff determination
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD)
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency of Nonylphenol ethoxylates.

Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday February 24, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) sitting in; Paula Daniels (PD)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	02 02 15	Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	02 02 15	“
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	01 27 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	“
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development	02 24 15	“
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	JFe/HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	“
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	JFe/ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	“
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	“
2017 Sunsets (No TRs)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Con-tact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	02 17 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	02 24 15	

Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	02 17 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	J Fe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	02 02 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	J Fe/PD	1994	Low priority	02 24 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	J Fe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	J Fe/FT			01 27 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	02 02 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		02 24 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	J Fe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		02 02 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	01 27 15	“

Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum- based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		02 17 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		01 27 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		01 27 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		02 24 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)	TBD	TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	01 27 15	Spr 2015
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested		TBD
Seaweed extracts	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15 NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	JFe/ZS	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/JFe	DD Report		NA	Written report Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from February 17, 2015
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT)
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets Inerts –2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 17, 2015 approved with no changes
- **2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT)**. Waiting for TR. Discussed questions previously.
- **2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT)**. Waiting for TR. Discussed questions previously.
- **2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT)**. A previous TR provided answers to many of the questions the lead posed, but the CS had a couple of other questions to add to the posting. The CS Chair noted that public comment would be useful but suggested that a Limited Scope TR would be helpful in the future.
- **2017 Sunsets (CBo)**
 - **Sticky traps/barriers**. The CS will pose questions for the first posting in spring 2015.
 - **Microcrystalline cheesewax**. Petroleum product. Alternatives may be available. The CS will pose questions for the first posting, and discussed need for future limited scope TR for the next review.

- **Boric Acid.** The Subcommittee will add questions for public comment. Group members asked that any declarative statements regarding the material (e.g. 'the substance is toxic') have citations. Many members felt that this type of language does not belong in the first posting for a material, but instead could be included in any attached checklist. Some members pointed out the references were limited and not scientifically rigorous.
- **2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe).** There was a 1995 TAP and the CS is waiting for a new TR. The CS will not add additional questions outside of the standards questions that the NOP included in the template.
- **2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA).** Listed at 205.605k (synthetic substance). Used to initiate pineapple flowering. No new TR was contracted; the most recent is from 2011. Questions will be related to use by smaller growers, and current practices. One member asked about environmental impacts of this substance.
- **Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo).** The draft document was sent immediately before the call so the group deferred the discussion until others had a chance to read it.
- **2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS).** The CS Chair created her own review form as she felt the checklist format was not conducive to this review. The alternative form was composed with criteria directly taken from OFPA. The CS will add several questions for public comment. A member asked about contamination in water runoff, which she also noted is regulated under the EPA and Clean Water Act. The Chair noted that that is more of a concern for copper used in rice production. She also noted that copper accumulation varies greatly, but under current organic management practices it should not accumulate.
- **2017 Sunsets (ZS) Inerts** - The CS received a limited scope TR on nonylphenols, a subset of Inerts. At this time the group will provide a document that includes information about the collaboration between the NOSB/NOP and EPA, and what the intention is moving forward.
- **2017 Sunsets - Lignin sulfonate (CBe).** CBe will review additional information supplied to her by JR. A separate petition to remove lignin sulfonate as a floating agent was sent to the NOSB. Discussion on this will be delayed to a later meeting since it is not on the April agenda.
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion and suff determination
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD)
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency of Nonylphenol ethoxylates.

Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT)
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove – deferred to next call

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET

- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Discuss any TRs that come in the interim.

Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday March 3, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) sitting in; Paula Daniels (PD)

Absent: Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	02 02 15	Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	02 02 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	01 27 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development	02 24 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	JFe/HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	JFe/ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP	02 24 15	"
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP	02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	02 17 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	02 24 15	

Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	02 17 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	J Fe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	02 02 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	J Fe/PD	1994	Low priority	02 24 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	J Fe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	J Fe/FT			01 27 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	02 02 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		02 24 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	J Fe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		02 02 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	01 27 15	“

Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum- based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		02 17 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		01 27 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		01 27 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		02 24 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)	TBD	TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	01 27 15	Spr 2015
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.		TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts)	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	ZS, PD	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo	Report		NA	Written report Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from February 24, 2015
- Lignin Sulfonate petition to remove. Discuss next steps.
- Work Agenda for fall 2015 - including next step on Contamination of Inputs?
- Research Priorities for Fall 2015 - timeline
- Set agenda for calls before spring meeting (Cancel 3/17 call?)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 24, 2015 were not available for review
- **2017 Sunset TRs.** The Chair asked that members review the TRs for Herbicides, Soap-based and Soap-based algicide/demosers so the CS can determine sufficiency by Friday March 6 and get them posted by the spring meeting deadline. Several members noted that the two TRs were very well written and thorough.
- **Lignin Sulfonate.** Discussion deferred to May
- **Contamination of Inputs report** - Members discussed the feedback that NOP provided on the spring 2015 report, and made some edits to the draft document. ZS will send the revised document to the NOP for posting
- **Work agenda** - The group discussed the next steps for the Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs report. Potentially this could be a discussion document for the fall 2015 meeting.
- **Research Priorities.** The CS Chair reminded the members to continue to be proactive so they can narrow the list, which they will then send to the Materials Subcommittee. The CS will discuss this after the spring meeting.
- **Call agenda.** The CS will cancel two calls: March 17 due to a conflict with a webinar on fire blight, and May 5 which is immediately after the spring meeting.
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demosers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT)
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove – deferred to next call

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET

- Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Discuss any TRs that come in the interim.
- Work Agenda for Fall 2015 - including next step on Contamination of Inputs
- Research Priorities for Fall 2015 - timeline
- Set agenda for calls before spring meeting

Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET canceled due to conflict with E-organic webinar.

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

- Public comments review
- Discuss addition of calls (likely not needed)

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

May 5, 2015 - canceled

May 19, 2015 2:00 ET

- Lignin sulfonate
- Research Priorities

June 2, 2015

June 16, 2015

July 7, 2015

July 21, 2015

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015

NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday April 7, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Tom Chapman (TC); Colehour Bondera (CBO); Paula Daniels (PD); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in;

Absent:

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	02 02 15	Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	02 02 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	01 27 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP	02 24 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	JFe/HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	JFe/ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	02 24 15	"
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	02 24 15	"
2017 Sunsets (No TRs)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	02 17 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	

Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	02 17 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	02 02 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	1994	Low priority	02 24 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	JFe/FT			01 27 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(k)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Chlorine dioxide 205.601(l)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	02 02 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		02 24 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	JFe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		02 02 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“

Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	01 27 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum- based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		02 17 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(k)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		01 27 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	“
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		01 27 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		02 24 15	“

Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)	TBD	TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. Petition withdrawn 03 11 15	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	01 27 15	Spr 2015
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.		TBD

Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts)	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Anaerobic Digestate – Food Waste			Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15.		
Ash from Manure Burning			Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	ZS, PD	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo	Report		NA	Written report Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from February 24, 2015
- Approve notes from March 3, 2015
- Discuss additional calls for next semester
- Discuss public comments received so far
- Approach for presentations at spring meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 24, and March 3, 2015 were approved with no changes.
- **Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E.** The **TR Sufficiency review** will be completed on the next call
- **Additional calls for next semester.** The CS will add 4 calls to the summer agenda and cancel any that are not needed. See below for proposed dates.
- On April 21 the CS will schedule materials for discussion for remainder of summer
- **Public comments.** Members will review the comments on the next call as many of them are not posted yet.

- **Approach for presentations at spring meeting.** The National List Manager will give a brief introduction to the substance, and the lead reviewer will summarize comments and discuss. The materials will be presented in the order in which they appear on the National List, except where there are multiple listings and it is more efficient to group them. The CS Chair asked that members let MA know if they will have presentations, or the proposal will be projected. The CS will finalize this list on the April 21 call.
- The CS will briefly discuss the **withdrawn petition for Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)** at the meeting, so the public knows it was withdrawn.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET

- Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Discuss any TRs that come in the interim.
- Work Agenda for Fall 2015 - including next step on Contamination of Inputs
- Research Priorities for Fall 2015 - timeline
- Set agenda for calls before spring meeting

Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET canceled due to conflict with E-organic webinar.

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

- Public comments review
- Discuss addition of calls (likely not needed)

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

- TR Sufficiency on Vitamins
- Schedule materials for discussions for remainder of summer
- Prepare for presentations at the meeting

May 5, 2015 - canceled

May 19, 2015 2:00 ET

- Lignin sulfonate
- Research Priorities

June 2, 2015

June 16, 2015

June 23, 2015 - additional call

June 30, 2015 - additional call

July 7, 2015

July 21, 2015

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Spring 2015 Milestones

Target date

NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday April 21, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Tom Chapman (TC); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in;

Absent: Paula Daniels (PD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2016 Sunsets					
Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR requested	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045-86-0	CBe	2004 TAP 2010 TR 2012 TR Supp No additional TR	Sunset Date: 09 12 16 2003 Petition to add to 205.601 2003 Petition supplement 2005 NOSB rec (passed) 2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h) 2012 NOSB rec (failed)	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0	JFe/FT	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2003 TAP	Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest. 2002 Petition NOSB rec Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	02 02 15	Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	02 02 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	01 27 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	02 24 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	JFe/HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 17 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	JFe/ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"
Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	02 24 15	"
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	02 24 15	"
2017 Sunsets (No TRs)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006 Y	Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	02 17 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		01 20 15	

Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	02 17 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	02 02 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	1994	Low priority	02 24 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	JFe/CBo		Low priority	01 27 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	JFe/FT			01 27 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(k)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Chlorine dioxide 205.601(l)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	02 02 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		02 24 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	JFe/FT			01 20 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		02 02 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		01 27 15	“

Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	01 27 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		01 20 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		01 20 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum- based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		02 17 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(k)	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	02 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		01 27 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	JFe/ZS			02 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	JFe/PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	02 17 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		01 27 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	JFe/PD	2011		02 17 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		02 24 15	

Ethylene 205.601(k)	JFe/HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted.	02 24 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	02 24 15	

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	Y Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015)	TBD	TBD
Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601	FT	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14.	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601	HA	2014 TR	Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. Petition withdrawn 03 11 15	12 16 14	Spr 2015
Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601	ZS	N	Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request.	01 07 15	Spr 2015
3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601	CBe	N	Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request	01 27 15	Spr 2015
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.		TBD

Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Anaerobic Digestate – Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15.		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT	.	Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15.		TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts update	ZS, PD	N/A	Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE)	NA	Verbal Report Spr 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo	Report		NA	Written report Spr 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed

Agenda

- Approve notes from April 7, 2015
- TR Sufficiency for Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E
- Seaweed extracts - Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15.
- New Petitions: assign lead person for petition sufficiency, TR request.
 - Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste (link sent April 8)
 - Ash from Manure Burning (link sent April 8)
 - Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients (link sent April 13)
- Review public comments
- Set call agendas for May 19, June 2 and beyond
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of April 7, 2015 were not available for review at the time of the call.
- **TR Sufficiency on Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E.** The TR was found sufficient. The Crops Chair will send confirmation to the National List Manager.
- **New Petitions:** The CS received the following petitions and assigned a lead reviewer to each.
 - **Anaerobic Digestate** - Food Waste. ZS volunteered to lead this review.
 - **Ash from Manure Burning** - CBe volunteered to lead this review.
 - **Sulfuric Acid** for solubilizing micronutrients - FT volunteered to lead this review.
- **Public comments.** The CS members discussed comments. The Chair asked that the lead on the Contamination of Farm Inputs document clarify at the April meeting that this is a preliminary report and it is not a project the Board is currently voting on, as there seemed to be some confusion. EPA List 4 Inerts and Copper products received substantial comments and the CS Chair felt that the group will need to spend more time at the meeting discussing these. The Chair also noted that she used a new format for the checklists that eliminated the checkboxes, which she feels makes it clearer. The group discussed Biobased bio-mulch and the potential of adding it to the work agenda for further work. The NOP requested some additional information from the technical review contractor and will pass that along to the CS to aid in their decision making. The CS requested that the Deputy Administrator address two topics at the April NOSB meeting: Chilean nitrate, and the ability to make annotation /classification changes.
- **Schedule.** The group scheduled materials for discussion for the next few meetings.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET

Public comments review
Discuss addition of calls (likely not needed)

Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET

TR Sufficiency on Vitamins
Schedule materials for discussions for remainder of summer
Prepare for presentations at the meeting

May 5, 2015 - canceled

May 19, 2015 2:00 ET

Lignin sulfonate (CBe)
Research Priorities (ALL)
2017 Sunsets - schedule assignments
Laminarin - TR sufficiency
Seaweed extracts - Petition sufficiency/TR request (CBe)
602 items (CBo) - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate)

June 2, 2015

2017 sunsets (HA)
2017 sunsets (FT) Arsenic, Lead salts

June 16, 2015

June 23, 2015 - additional call

June 30, 2015 - additional call

July 7, 2015

July 21, 2015

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015
August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday May 19, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo)

Absent: Harold Austin (HA); Paula Daniels (PD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Con-tact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary : Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 23 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 16 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 23 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 02 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	07 07 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	06 23 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	PD	1994	Low priority	06 16 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 23 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	07 21 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		07 21 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 16 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 21 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“

Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	PD	2011		07 07 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 02 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	PD	2011		06 02 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 02 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted.	07 21 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD

Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.		TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15.		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15.		TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15.		TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo				Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from April 7, 2015

- Approve notes from April 21, 2015
- Assign 2017 Sunset materials to future call dates
- Assign call dates for sufficiency of new petitions
 - Anaerobic Digestate, Manure Ash, Sulfuric Acid, Squid
- Research Priorities Reminder
- NEW Petition for Squid (see Lisa Brines' email from 5/12/15), to be assigned
- Lignin sulfonate, petition to remove (CBe)
- Laminarin, TR sufficiency (ZS)
- Seaweed extracts (CBe)- Petition sufficiency/TR request
- 602 items (CBo) - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of April 7 and April 21, 2015 were approved with no changes
- **2017 Sunset materials. The members** scheduled the review discussions for future calls. See table above for scheduled dates.
- **Assign call dates for sufficiency of new petitions**
 - Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - Petition sufficiency June 2
 - Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency June 2
 - Sulfuric Acid (TF) - Petition sufficiency June 2
 - Squid and Squid Byproducts (CBe) - Petition sufficiency July 7
- **Research Priorities Reminder** - The Materials Subcommittee asked that the Research Priorities be forwarded to them in a timely manner, so they have enough time to prioritize them for final submission. The CS Chair asked that each member make note of items that may make good research topics as they are reviewing their materials. For example, public comment indicated the need for more research on coppers.
- **Lignin sulfonate, petition to remove (CBe)** - The lead summarized the public comment from the spring docket. There was overwhelming support for removal of this material, and/or an indication that lignin sulfonate was no longer in use. The CS will not request a new TR. The lead will write the proposal and have it ready for discussion and a vote on the next call.
- **Laminarin (ZS)** - The group discussed Laminarin and the information provided in the TR. Laminarin is mainly produced in France where there are strict controls on production. It is similar to the seaweed extract substance that is produced in Ireland. . Laminarin is used for disease control and is registered by EPA. The lead found the TR to be sufficient and will write a proposal for discussion, which will include a classification of non-synthetic. The CS plans to discuss and vote on June 16.
- **Seaweed extracts (CBe).**The lead indicated that seaweed extracts, which used as a fertilizer and “plant strengthener”, are harvested in Ireland, and a member added that because they are harvested using an acid-base process, and according to the draft classification guidance, they are non-synthetic, It is . The CS will not request a TR, but instead will proceed to the proposal stage. The petition was found sufficient.
- **602 items (CBo) - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate)** - discussion deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

May 5, 2015 - canceled

May 19, 2015 2:00 ET

Lignin sulfonate (CBe)

Research Priorities (ALL)
 2017 Sunsets - Assign discussion dates
 Laminarin (ZS) - TR sufficiency
 Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request

June 2, 2015

Misc sunset items (See table above for discussion dates)
 Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
 Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - TR sufficiency
 Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
 Sulfuric Acid (TF) - TR sufficiency
 Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) (CBo)

June 16, 2015

Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote

June 23, 2015 - additional call

June 30, 2015 - additional call

July 7, 2015

Squid -TR sufficiency
 Research priorities - Discuss topics

July 21, 2015

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday June 2, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in

Absent: Carmela Beck (CBe); Paula Daniels (PD); Harold Austin (HA)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Con- tact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary : Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 23 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 16 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 23 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 16 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	07 07 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	06 23 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	PD	1994	Low priority	06 16 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 23 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	07 21 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		07 21 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 16 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 21 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“

Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	PD	2011		07 07 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 16 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	PD	2011		06 16 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 21 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)		2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)			Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)			Sunset date: 5/29/2018		

EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)			Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Calcium chloride 205.602(c)			Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.		TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15.		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15.		TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15.		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo				Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of May 19
- Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - Petition sufficiency/TR request
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request
- Sulfuric Acid (FT) - Petition sufficiency/TR request
- Lignin sulfonate petition to remove (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
- Misc 2017 sunset items (CBo, FT, PD, ZS)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of May 19 were deferred to next call.
- **Voting:** The Crops Subcommittee chose to proceed with discussions and voting, despite the lack of quorum on the call, and will leave any votes open so absent members can vote via email.
- **Anaerobic Digestate (ZS)** - Petition sufficiency/TR request. The petitioner indicates that Anaerobic Digestate is used to recycle food waste from restaurants and grocery stores and therefore should be placed into the same category as manure. The lead asked for feedback about the need for a TR to look at the sulfuric acid component, which is used to stabilize the pH. The CS will consider the need for a TR when it discusses the other materials that also use sulfuric acid. The petition was found sufficient.
- **Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request.** Deferred to next call
- **Sulfuric Acid (FT) - Petition sufficiency/TR request.** Deferred to next call
- **Lignin sulfonate petition to remove (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.** Deferred to next call
- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
 - **Ash from manure burning.** The lead summarized the material and the CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove ash from burning manure from 205.602(a)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: ZS

Additional Discussion:

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate).** Members briefly discussed the material, and the CS Chair opened the vote which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) from 205.602(i)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: ZS

Additional Discussion:

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Boric acid.** The members discussed the language in the review and made some edits. The CS postponed the vote until the next call so the changes can be incorporated first.
- **Sticky traps/barriers.** The CS Chair suggested some minor edits and summarized the review. She feels that the previous TAP is not adequate as an exclusive source of information as it is based on outdated information; Traps now use specific lures, are targeted towards specific pests, and are better utilized. She added that while non-targeted species are still sometimes caught, the traps are overall very successful. The CS Chair asked the lead to include a narrative in the review as opposed to including a reference citing the optional checklist. The CS will defer voting until the modifications are made.
- **Microcrystalline cheesewax.** Based on information gleaned from public comment the group discussed the suitability and availability of alternatives, which they feel is not entirely clear. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove Microcrystalline cheesewax from 205.601(o)

Motion by: CBo

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 2 Abstain: 2 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **2017 sunset items (FT)**

- **Arsenic.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about arsenic. Arsenic does not meet the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove Arsenic from 205.602(b)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: ZS

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Lead salts.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about this material. Lead salts do not meet the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove lead salts from 205.602(d)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: ZS

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **2017 sunset items (ZS)**

- **Potassium chloride.** The NOSB received few comments about Potassium chloride, a natural substance which is prohibited unless used in a manner that prevents chloride accumulation. While there are alternatives to potassium chloride, a vote to remove would make it available for use without restriction, and as such the CS supports continued listing on 205.602. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove potassium chloride salts from 205.602(e)

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0.

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Sodium fluoaluminate.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about Sodium fluoaluminate. This material does not satisfy the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove Sodium fluoaluminate from 205.602(f)

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Strychnine.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about Strychnine. This material does not satisfy the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

Motion to remove strychnine from 205.602(h)

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Other Items.** The CS will determine at a later date if the additional call on June 30 will not be necessary.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

May 19, 2015 2:00 ET

- Lignin sulfonate (CBe)
- Research Priorities (ALL)
- 2017 Sunsets - Assign discussion dates
- Laminarin (ZS) - TR sufficiency
- Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request

June 2, 2015

- Misc 2017 sunset items (See table above for discussion dates)
- Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
- Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - TR sufficiency
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
- Sulfuric Acid (FT) - TR sufficiency
- Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) (CBo)

June 16, 2015

- 2017 sunset items (CBo) Complete review and vote: Boric Acid, Sticky traps
- 2017 sunset items (PD) Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
- Sulfuric Acid (FT) - TR sufficiency
- Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
- Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote

June 23, 2015 - additional call

June 30, 2015 - additional call

July 7, 2015

- Squid -TR sufficiency
- Research priorities - Discuss topics

July 21, 2015

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015

NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday June 16, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in, Jean Richardson - sitting in

Absent: Paula Daniels (PD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 23 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 23 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	07 07 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	06 23 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	PD	1994	Low priority	06 23 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 23 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	07 21 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		07 21 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 21 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“

Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	PD	2011		07 07 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	PD	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 21 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)		2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)			Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)			Sunset date: 5/29/2018		

EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)			Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Calcium chloride 205.602(c)			Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15		TBD
Lignin sulfonate	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.		TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts		TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15.		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request		TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15.		TBD

Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo				Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of May 19
- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 2
- 2017 sunset items (CBo) Complete review and vote: Boric Acid, Sticky traps
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency
- Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- Sulfuric Acid (FT) - Petition sufficiency
- 2017 sunset items (CBe) Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate
- 2017 sunset items (FT) Complete review and vote: Isopropanol, Ethanol, Soap-based algicide/demossers, Herbicides, soap-based, Soaps, ammonium
- 2017 sunset items (PD) Complete review and vote: Soaps, insecticidal, Sucrose octanoate esters
- Other Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of May 19 were approved with no changes.
- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 2 were approved with minor changes to the voting on microcrystalline cheesewax and a clerical error.
- **Sulfuric Acid (FT)** - The lead summarized the petition for the group and added that although the petition was lengthy it did not include information about essentiality. Sulfuric Acid is used for manufacture of micronutrients. Based on information in the TR he notes that this material is not compatible with organic principles and does not support a holistic approach. The petition was found sufficient, and no TR will be requested. The lead will prepare a proposal and the HS will discuss it on the July 21 call. Another member noted that Anaerobic Digestate, which was recently petitioned, is treated with sulfuric acid in large quantities. The HS discussed Anaerobic Digestate briefly and will discuss it

further on a later call. The NOP suggested that the HS may want to request a TR for Anaerobic Digestates.

- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**

- **Boric Acid.** The lead incorporated revisions to the document that the HS discussed on the last call and recirculated the draft document. The CS Chair noted that there were a couple of edits that were not made and asked that the lead complete the additions. The group discussed alternatives to boric acid. While there are some alternatives available, boric acid is considered the least toxic of these.

Motion to remove Boric Acid from § 205.601(e)

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Sticky traps.** The revisions discussed on the last call were not incorporated in the latest version, so the CS Chair offered to send the lead the revised text to be incorporated. She noted that the information in the 1995 TAP is outdated and the proposal should reflect the change in the industry, as the traps have changed and improved.

- **Ash from Manure Burning (CBe)** - Petition sufficiency. Currently this material is prohibited. The lead noted that the key argument the petitioners make is that the production processes has changed, and is much more controlled, which leads to better preservation and less waste of nutrients. Members questioned whether the current process is substantially different; the CS Chair feels that it is not. The group will defer the discussion of this material while they research more. They will revisit the review once the 2017 sunset review is completed.

- **Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe)** - Discussion deferred to next call.

- **2017 sunset items (CBe)** - Discussions deferred to next call.

- Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E
- Lignin sulfonate

- **2017 sunset items (FT)**

- **Isopropanol.** Similar to ethanol. Allowed for use as an algicide, disinfectant and sanitizer. Public commenters were supportive of continued use of isopropanol as a safe and effective sanitizer

Motion to remove Isopropanol from § 205.601(a)(1)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Ethanol.** Allowed for use as an algicide, disinfectant and sanitizer including irrigation system cleaning. Commenters were supportive of relisting as it is considered to be safe and effective. Some comments indicated that natural sources should be used. The lead indicated that some of the natural sources have a larger ecological impact.

Motion to remove Ethanol from § 205.601(a)(1)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Soap-based algicide/demossers.** Comments were general and mixed, and the CS didn't receive any responses to their question about alternatives. The group discussed how this material is used. A member noted that it was used to flush drip irrigation systems to clean algae buildup, but was unsure if the industry is currently using it. The CS will add language to the review indicating that they are seriously considering removal since there is no compelling evidence that it is in use. FT will revise the language and recirculate the document.

Motion to remove Soap-based algicide/demossers from § 205.601(a)(7)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Herbicides, soap-based. Commenters supported keeping this material on the list.** The TR indicated that soaps are toxic to aquatic plants and algae, and aquatic animals are sensitive to these substances. The group agreed that if soaps are used according to their allowed use in terrestrial systems they should not be a problem for aquatic organisms.

Motion to remove Herbicides, soap-based from § 205.601(b)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: The CS Chair asked that the lead add the reasons to the review about why commenters supported the continued listing.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Soaps, ammonium.** Ammonium soaps are used as a deer repellent. The CS received no comments opposed to relisting, and one comment from an organization indicating that some of its members depended on the use of ammonium soaps in their organic operations.

Motion to remove Soaps, ammonium from § 205.601(d)

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: The CS Chair noted a clerical error in the document referring to ammonium salts, which the lead will correct.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (PD)** - Deferred to next call
 - Soaps, insecticidal
 - Sucrose octanoate esters
- **Other Items** - Items that were deferred will be discussed and voted on during the June 23 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

June 2, 2015

Misc 2017 sunset items (See table above for discussion dates)

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
 Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - Petition sufficiency
 Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
 Sulfuric Acid (TF) - TR sufficiency
 Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) (CBo)

June 16, 2015

2017 sunset items (CBo) - Complete review and vote: Sticky traps
 2017 sunset items (PD) - Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
 Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency
 Sulfuric Acid (TF) - Petition sufficiency
 Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
 Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote - postponed

June 23, 2015 - additional call

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
 2017 sunset items (CBe) - Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate
 2017 sunset items (PD) - Complete review and vote: Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
 Laminarin (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote
 Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
 Discuss anaerobic digestates (ZS) - TR determination

June 30, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunset items (CBo) - Complete review and vote: Sticky traps
 EPA List 4 inerts

July 7, 2015

Squid - TR determination
 Research priorities - Discuss topics

July 21, 2015

Sulfuric acid proposal discussion and vote

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015

Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday June 23, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Paula Daniels (PD), Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Jean Richardson - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	07 07 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	PD	1994	Low priority	07 07 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	07 21 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		07 21 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 21 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“

Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	PD	2011		07 07 15	“
Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	PD	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	PD	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 21 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA		Sunset date: 5/29/2018	07 07 15	

EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS		Sunset date: 11/3/2018	07 07 15	
Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15	Scheduled for June 30	TBD
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	Scheduled for June 30	TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper?		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request		TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15.		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15		Proposal Fall 2015
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo				Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 16
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
 - Sticky traps
- Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- Seaweed extracts petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal
- 2017 sunset items (CBe) - Discuss review and vote
 - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E
 - Lignin sulfonate
- 2017 sunset items (PD)
 - Soaps, insecticidal
 - Sucrose octanoate ester
 - Vitamin D3
- Laminarin petition (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS) - TR determination
- 2018 sunset materials - assign leads
- Other Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 16 approved with no changes. MA will add Aluminum Sulfate to the work agenda above. The petition was submitted to both LS and CS, and each Subcommittee will conduct a review.
- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
 - **Sticky traps** - The document was modified after the last call and recirculated to the group. The HS proceeded to a vote:

Motion to remove Sticky traps from §205.601(e)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: Comments about impact on non-target animals were addressed in the background section.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Soap based algicide and demossers.** The CS Chair noted that essentiality was included in the revised proposal but is not an OFPA criteria for Crops. Instead she suggested including compatibility, necessity, or alternatives as the review criteria, and will make the change. This material was voted on during the last meeting and the members accepted the proposal with the current revisions.
 - **Aluminum sulfate.** FT volunteered to lead the review of this material and will work with JR who is reviewing the same material for Livestock. TR sufficiency is due July 15.
- **Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe).** Used as a floating agent. The lead and a member both indicated that based on comments there are no handlers using lignin sulfonate as it is listed on NL.

Motion to remove Lignin Sulfonate from section **205.601(l)(1)** of the National List for use as a floating agent in postharvest handling

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: A member noted some clerical errors in the checklist, which the lead will correct. Another member added that he knows of no one in the industry using lignin sulfonate because disposal is an environmental concern. The group also discussed the checklist and the fact that they are outdated and need revision. The CS Chair reminded the group that she developed a pilot form that she used to review Copper and received favorable comments about it.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Seaweed extracts petition (CBe).** Deferred to next call.
- **2017 sunset items (CBe)**
 - **Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E.** The HS is interested in information about usage. The TR contained little information about efficacy. Vitamins C and E are used as antioxidants in liquid formulated fertilizers.

Motion to remove Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, from §205.601j8

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: A member identified some language in the review that would need to be removed based on the vote.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Lignin sulfonate.** The CS chair suggested adding a sentence to the sunset review about the other lignin sulfonate review in which they are proposing to remove it from §205.601(i). The HS

would like to make it clear that the proposal to remove is separate from the sunset review. The group edited some minor language.

Motion to remove lignin sulfonate from § 205.601(j)(4) as chelating agent and dust suppressant

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (PD)**

- **Sucrose octanoate ester (SOE).** Used both in livestock and crops to control insects. There are solvents of low toxicity used in the manufacture of SOEs. The lead noted that there are alternatives, and she received very few public comments, and no opposition to this material remaining on the list.

Motion to remove Sucrose octanoate ester from §205.601(e)

Motion by: PD

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Vitamin D3.** As supplements for humans vitamin D3 is deemed safe, but it is used as a rodenticide in Crops, which essentially causes rodents to have a heart attack. Public commenters called this out as an inhumane process. The CS Chair asked that information about compatibility be added, which she will do. A member expressed support for this material. Another member noted that it is used in a controlled environment in a trap, therefore not likely harmful to non-target species.

Motion to remove vitamin D from §205.601(g)

Motion by: PD

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Laminarin petition (ZS).** Deferred to next call
- **Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS).** The NOP suggested a white paper on this topic and feels it would be more effective and useful than a TR. The NOP will explore options for contracting this work.
- **Other Items - none**
- **2018 sunset materials. The CS assigned lead reviewers to the following:**
 - **Copper sulfate (ZS)**
 - **Ozone gas (FT)**
 - **Paracetic acid (HA)**
 - **EPA list 3 inters (ZS)**
 - **Calcium chloride (CBe)**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

June 16, 2015

2017 sunset items (CBo) - Complete review and vote: Sticky traps

2017 sunset items (PD) - Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3

Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency

Sulfuric Acid (TF) - Petition sufficiency

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.

Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote - postponed

June 23, 2015 - additional call

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.

2017 sunset items (CBe) - Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate

2017 sunset items (PD) - Complete review and vote: Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3

Laminarin petition (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote

Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal

Discuss anaerobic digestate (ZS) - TR determination

June 30, 2015 - additional call

Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal

Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote

2017 sunset items (ZS). EPA List 4 inerts, Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime

2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials

July 7, 2015

2017 sunset items (CBe).

- o Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)

- o Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2017 sunset items (PD) - Insecticidal soap, Sodium silicate

2018 sunset TR determinations

- o EPA list 3 (ZS)
- o Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed

Squid (CBe) - TR determination

Research priorities - Discuss topics

Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

July 21, 2015

2018 sunset TR determinations.

- o Copper sulfate (ZS)
- o Ozone gas (FT)
- o Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday June 30, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Jean Richardson - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	07 07 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	FT	1994	Low priority	07 21 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfite) 205.602(i)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	07 21 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		07 21 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 21 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		07 21 15	“

Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	FT	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	CBo	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 21 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA		Sunset date: 5/29/2018	07 07 15	
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS		Sunset date: 11/3/2018	07 07 15	

Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
--------------------------------	-----	--	------------------------	--	--

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL	06 30 15	Fall 2015
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	Fall 2015
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	07 21 15	TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for White paper		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request	07 21 15	TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15.		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15		Proposal Fall 2015
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo				Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 23
- Reassign PD's materials: Sodium silicate, Soaps, insecticidal, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
- Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
- Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunset items (ZS). Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials
- Other Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 23 approved with no changes.
- The CS Chair asked for volunteers to take over the review of four of the 2017 sunset materials. Two reviews have been completed and two have yet to be reviewed:
 - **Sodium silicate** - CBe. Scheduled for July 21
 - **Soaps, insecticidal** - FT. Scheduled for July 21
 - **Sucrose octanoate esters** - FT. Review was completed
 - **Vitamin D3** - CBo. Review was completed

- **Seaweed extracts petition (CBe)** - Brown seaweed extract is composed of naturally occurring components extracted from seaweed, including laminarin and fucoidan. Because this material is similar to laminarin, the limited scope TR for laminarin was used as part of this review. The group discussed both of these materials in conjunction with each other. The group will discuss this material further.
- **Laminarin petition (ZS)**. At the request of the Crops Subcommittee the TR focused on extraction and conservation issues. Information from the TR suggests that the synthetic materials used to extract the seaweed do not cause a chemical change, do not remain in the final product nor do they have a technical or functional effect. Members discussed the proposal and proceeded to a vote.

Motion to classify laminarin as petitioned as non-synthetic

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: A member commented about the extraction technique

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

Since laminarin was classified as non-synthetic it does not need to be added to the National List.

- **2017 sunset items (ZS)**
 - **Hydrogen peroxide**. Used as a cleaning agent and for plant disease control. A new TR was requested and the lead summarized the information for the members. At full strength and in high concentrations hydrogen peroxide can be a strong oxidant and highly reactive, but when used as indicated it is not toxic and does not persist. The TR indicated that there are alternatives, but the data were not explicit about which alternatives could be used in what instances. (I.e. which alternatives would be used as cleaning agents vs. which ones for fire blight). The lead feels there is not enough research on the substitutes at this time. Commenters were supportive of keeping hydrogen peroxide on the list

Motion to remove Hydrogen peroxide from §205.601(a) and §205.601(i)

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: CBe/HA

Additional Discussion: A member noted that hydrogen peroxide is commonly used for fireblight control especially since antibiotics were removed from the list.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

- **Hydrated lime**. The lead noted that there were a number of related petitions including Ammonium hydroxide and Calcium hydroxide. Hydrated lime is commonly used to make Bordeaux mix. It is not allowed as a soil amendment. The material is synthetic but the lead indicated that it satisfies all OFPA criteria and no commenters provided evidence to the contrary.

Motion to remove Hydrated Lime from 205.601

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (FT)**

- **Chlorine Materials** - The CS received no responses to a number of questions they posed for the first posting of chlorine materials. Commenters did respond to the question about necessity, relaying the need for chlorine materials and their support for continued listing. The CS Chair referenced the comments that were submitted to the Handling Subcommittee for the same materials, which she noted were more detailed than the comments submitted to the Crops Subcommittee.

Calcium hypochlorite is an EPA registered pesticide

Motion to remove **Calcium hypochlorite** from 205.601(a)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: Members further discussed usage and alternatives

Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

Sodium hypochlorite is an EPA registered pesticide, similar to Calcium hypochlorite

Motion to remove **Sodium hypochlorite** 205.601(a)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

The lead noted that chlorine dioxide is found to be a respiratory and eye irritant. The CS received no comments regarding this material

Motion to remove **Chlorine dioxide** from 205.601(a)

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: The CS Chair asked about the distinction between Chlorine dioxide and the other chlorine materials. NOP noted that chlorine dioxide is typically used as a gas, at lower rates and causes less formation of chlorine byproducts (trihalomethanes).

Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

- **Other Items - none**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

June 23, 2015 - additional call

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.

2017 sunset items (CBe) - Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate

2017 sunset items (PD) - Complete review and vote: Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3

Laminarin petition (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote

Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
Discuss anaerobic digestate (ZS) - TR determination

June 30, 2015 - additional call

Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote
2017 sunset items (ZS). Discuss review, vote - Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime
2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials

July 7, 2015

2017 sunset items (CBe).

- o Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)

- o Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2018 sunset TR determinations

- o EPA list 3 (ZS)
- o Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
Squid (CBe) - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics
Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

July 21, 2015

2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal
2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate
2018 sunset TR determinations.

- o Copper sulfate (ZS)
- o Ozone gas (FT)
- o Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote
2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)
Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
Squid (CBe) - TR determination

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015

NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Sep 22 & 29, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday July 7, 2015 2:00 pm ET draft**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Jean Richardson - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 21 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995	Low priority	07 21 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002	Low priority	06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	FT	1994	Low priority	07 21 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfite) 205.602(i)	CBo		Low priority	06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	07 21 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		07 21 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 21 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		07 21 15	“

Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	FT	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	CBo	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 21 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA		Sunset date: 5/29/2018	07 21 15	
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y 2015	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
--------------------------------	-----	--	------------------------	--	--

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmtd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL	06 30 15	Fall 2015
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	Fall 2015
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	07 21 15	TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper?		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request		TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15.		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15		Proposal Fall 2015
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo				Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 30
- 2017 sunset items (CBe)
 - Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Micronutrients: [Soluble boron products], [Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt]
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
 - Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate
- 2018 sunset TR determinations
 - EPA list 3 (ZS)
 - Peracetic Acid (HA)
 - Copper Sulfate (ZS)
 - Ozone gas (FT)
 - Calcium Chloride (CBe)
- Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
- Squid (CBe) - TR determination
- Aluminum sulfate petition (FT). TR sufficiency
- Research priorities - Discuss topics
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 30 approved with no changes.
- **2017 sunset items (CBe)**
 - **Liquid fish products.** The lead summarized the material and its uses, noting that Liquid Fish products are critical to organic farming. The CS received positive feedback from commenters about keeping liquid fish products on the list. Commenters also indicated that the annotation is sufficient and the common practice is to adjust the pH of the liquid fish product prior to being blended with other ingredients. The CS Chair suggested some minor changes to the text and the lead made some modifications.

Motion to remove Liquid Fish products from 205.601(j) as a plant and soil amendment

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Magnesium sulfate.** The lead summarized the material and the group discussed it. The CS posed some questions about availability of non-synthetic magnesium sulfate. Commenters indicated that there were alternatives (such as Langbeinite) but they are not available in sufficient quantities. A member added that dolomite, which was put forth as an alternative, only works in low pH soils.

Motion to remove Magnesium Sulfate from 205.601(j) as a plant and soil amendment

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Micronutrients:** Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt. Commenters were overwhelmingly in support of keeping micronutrients on the list. A couple commenters said that this fails OFPA criteria because micronutrients sometimes contain heavy metals. Contamination may also be a concern. In the first posting the CS indicated that they would propose an annotation. The CS Chair asked that this information be added to the review.

Motion to remove Micronutrients from 205.601(j) as plant and soil amendment

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to change the annotation for Micronutrients as follows: 205.601 (j)(6) - As a plant or soil amendment. Micronutrients - not to be used as a defoliant, herbicide, or desiccant. Those made from nitrates or chlorides are not allowed. Deficiency must be documented.

(i) Soluble boron products.

(ii) Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt.

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**

- **Newspaper or other recycled paper.** The lead summarized the review and the CS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove newspaper or other recycled paper from 205.601(b) and 205.601(c)

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: A member added that newspaper or other recycled paper is not used much in CA but it is used in other parts of the country. The Crops Chair asked that the review include specific language indicating that the CS will request a TR for future review.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

The NOSB Chair suggested that the 5-page checklist be condensed to a couple of narrative paragraphs and be included in the proposal instead of being submitted separately.

- **Plastic mulch and covers.** The lead summarized the material and past reviews. Members discussed the review document and the lead made some modifications based on the conversation.

Motion to remove plastic mulch and covers from 205.601(j)

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: The NOSB Chair suggested that the CS vote as a Subcommittee on the use of checklists. The majority of the Subcommittee members suggested condensing the info from the checklist into a couple of narrative paragraphs to be included in the proposal. Since the checklist is optional, and is just a tool for the members to use to conduct their review.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to not utilize checklists for sunset review and to instead add the pertinent part of the narrative text into the main body of the review.

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: CBe

Discussion: A member expressed concern about not including the checklists. The remainder of the group indicated that by incorporating the text into the main document instead of appending it, it is easier for the public and future boards to locate the info.

Yes: 4 No: 1 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Ammonium carbonate.** Deferred to next call

- **2018 sunset TR determinations**

- **EPA list 3 (ZS).** The CS will request a TR for this group of materials.
- The remainder of the 2018 sunset material TR determinations will be postponed to the next call due to time constraints.
 - **Peracetic Acid (HA)**
 - **Copper Sulfate (ZS)**
 - **Ozone gas (FT)**
 - **Calcium Chloride (CBe)**

- **Anaerobic Digestate petition (ZS).** Deferred to next call

- **Squid petition (CBe)**. TR determination. Deferred to next call
- **Aluminum sulfate petition (FT)**. TR sufficiency. Deferred to next call
- **Research priorities** - Discuss topics. Deferred to next call
- **Other Items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous CS Notes

Future Call Schedule:

June 30, 2015 - additional call

- Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
- Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunset items (ZS). Discuss review, vote - Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials

July 7, 2015

- 2017 sunset items (CBe).
 - Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
 - Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate
- 2018 sunset TR determinations
 - EPA list 3 (ZS)
 - Peracetic Acid (HA)
 - Copper Sulfate (ZS)
 - Ozone gas (FT)
 - Calcium Chloride (CBe)
- Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
- Squid petition (CBe) - TR determination
- Research priorities - Discuss topics
- Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

July 21, 2015

- 2017 sunset materials (CBo) - Ammonium carbonate
- 2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal
- 2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate
- 2018 sunset TR determinations.
 - Peracetic Acid (HA)
 - Copper sulfate (ZS)
 - Ozone gas (FT)
 - Calcium chloride (CBe)
- Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
- Squid petition (CBe) - TR determination
- Research priorities - Discuss topics
- Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination
- Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote
- 2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)
- Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal

July 28, 2015 - additional call
August 4, 2015
August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Sep 22 & 29, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday July 21, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 28 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995		07 21 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo			06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002		06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	FT	1994		07 28 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo			06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	07 28 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		07 28 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 28 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		07 21 15	“

Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	FT	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	CBo	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 28 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15		
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y 2015	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
--------------------------------	-----	--	--	--	--

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL	06 30 15	Fall 2015
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	07 28 15	TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper?		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request		TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15		Proposal Fall 2015
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo				Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of July 7
- 2018 sunset TR determinations
 - Peracetic Acid (HA)
 - Copper Sulfate (ZS)
 - Ozone gas (FT)
 - Calcium Chloride (CBe)
- Research priorities. Discuss topics
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
- Squid (CBe). TR determination
- Aluminum sulfate petition (FT). TR sufficiency
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
 - Ammonium carbonate
- 2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate, Aquatic plant extracts, Humic Acids
- 2017 sunset materials (HA) - Pheromones, Potassium Bicarbonate, ethylene
- Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed Adjourn
- Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT) - Discussion and vote

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of July 7 were approved with one change to the discussion of micronutrients and the reference to the annotation
- **2018 sunset TR determinations**
 - **Peracetic Acid (HA).** The lead summarized the material and recommended that the CS request a TR that includes all uses of this material (Crops and Livestock)
 - **Copper Sulfate (ZS).** Specifically for rice, and approved for control for algae and tadpole shrimp. Annotated for use only in a 24 month period. The lead feels no new info could be gleaned from a TR and the CS will not request one.
 - **Ozone gas (FT).** The lead summarized the material and the group discussed it. Ozone is a strong oxidizer, but its use is limited. The lead recommended not requesting a TR. The group will discuss this item in the future.
 - **Calcium Chloride (CBe).** Non synthetic substance on 205.602. The lead noted the history of the material including the most recent recommendation from 2006. The CS will not request a TR
- **Research priorities.** There were no additional topics nor further discussion on the research priorities
- **Seaweed Extracts (CBe).** Postponed to July 28 call
- **Squid (CBe). TR determination.** Petitioned for addition to 205.601. The lead summarized the document and the group discussed the need for a TR. The HS will request a TR to glean info on human health effects.
- **Aluminum sulfate petition (FT).** TR sufficiency. The lead feels the TR was lacking as it was geared towards conventional agriculture and not organic. However the CS did not see a need for further revision and will defer decision on TR to LS who is reviewing substance for application to manure in livestock facilities.
- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
 - **Ammonium carbonate.** The lead summarized the review and noted that the information from the checklist was incorporated into the narrative.

Motion to remove Ammonium carbonate from 205.601(i)

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion:

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (CBe)**
 - **Sodium silicate.** The lead summarized the review including information from the petition, the TR, and public comment gleaned from the first posting. Public comment was limited and in the absence of industry support for relisting, the Subcommittee recommends allowing this material to be removed from the list.

Motion to remove Sodium silicate from 205.601(j)

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: CBo

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Aquatic plant extracts.** The lead summarized the review including info from the petition, the TR, and public comment gleaned from the first posting. Public comment was limited and with the exception of one comment, the vast majority was supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove Aquatic plant extracts from 205.601(j)

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Humic Acids.** The lead summarized the review including info from the petition, the TR, and public comment gleaned from the first posting. The group discussed the various versions of humates, including the mined mineral and water extracted versions, and its uses on farms going through transition to build up soil quality. The Chair noted that some forms of humic acids are extracted with natural substances. There were no comments. The HS also discussed a potential annotation change.

Motion to remove Humic Acids from 205.601(j)3

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: The group discussed the possibility of a annotation change during the next 5 years if they find it is needed.

Yes: 2 No: 2 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (HA). Postponed to next call**
 - **Pheromones**
 - **Potassium Bicarbonate**
 - **Ethylene**
- **Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed - postponed to next call**
- **Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT). Discussion and vote - postponed to next call**
- **Other Items - none**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

July 7, 2015

2017 sunset items (CBe).

- Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)

- Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2018 sunset TR determinations

- EPA list 3 (ZS)
- Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed

Squid (CBe) - TR determination

Research priorities - Discuss topics

Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

July 21, 2015

2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate

2018 sunset TR determinations.

- Copper sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote

2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)

Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal

The CS will submit a TR request with specific questions on newspaper to forward to the NOP.

July 28, 2015 - additional call

- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - discuss proposal.
- 2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday July 28, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in; Jean Richardson - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 28 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995		07 21 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo			06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002		06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	FT	1994		07 28 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo			06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	08 04 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		08 04 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 28 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		07 21 15	“

Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	FT	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	CBo	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 28 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15		
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y 2015	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
--------------------------------	-----	--	--	--	--

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL	06 30 15	Fall 2015
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	08 04 15	TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper.		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request		TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15		Proposal Fall 2015
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo		Report		Fall 2015
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of July 21
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - discuss proposal
- Aluminum sulfate petition (FT). TR sufficiency
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
 - Ammonium carbonate
- 2017 sunset materials (CBe). Sodium silicate, Aquatic plant extracts, Humic Acids
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Pheromones, Potassium Bicarbonate, ethylene
- Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
- Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT). Discussion and vote
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of July 21 were approved with no changes
- **Biobased BioMulch Memo**. The NOP sent a memo to the NOSB this week regarding Bio mulch asking that they add it to their workplans. CS will add it to the work agenda for spring 2016
- **Seaweed Extracts (CBe)**. The lead summarized the material, the history of the reviews, and previous recommendations from the NOSB. Similar to laminarin, but unlike laminarin this is used as fertilizer rather than disease control. The group discussed modifications for this proposal and will bring it to a

vote at the next meeting.

- **2017 sunset materials (FT). Insecticidal soaps.** The lead summarized the material and public comment. This material is considered essential and the HS is recommending it remain on the list.

Motion to remove Insecticidal soaps from 205.601

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (HA)**

- **Pheromones.** Pheromones are used by organic (and many conventional) crop producers for insect management and are especially important for organic tree fruit production. The group discussed suggestions about annotations from the public comments. The consensus is that the language is redundant and was already captured in the listing. The lead made some modifications to the draft review based on the discussion and the CS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove Pheromones from 205.601

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Potassium Bicarbonate.** Used as a plant disease control material. The lead summarized the material and its uses. He also reviewed the TR and the questions that were posed by the Subcommittee during the first posting. A member indicated that it is important to keep this material on the list as it is a good material to alternate with harsher products like copper. The lead added that during the growing season there are few to little materials that are effective for mildew.

Motion to remove Potassium Bicarbonate from 205.601(i)(9)

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Ethylene.** Used as a plant growth regulator for regulation of pineapple flowering. The Crops Subcommittee's inclination is to delist this material and it would like to make sure the public is aware of that. The lead will make some minor modifications and resend the doc.

Motion to remove Ethylene from 205.601(k)
Motion by: HA
Seconded by: CBo
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Anaerobic digestate (ZS)**. CS will develop questions for a TR or white paper, but needs more time to do so.
- **Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT)** - Discussion and vote deferred.
- **2017 sunset materials (ZS)**. Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate. The lead noted that she used an alternative form of the checklist for the first posting, and for this posting she included the key points from the checklist into the body of the review. Will vote on next call.
- **Other Items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

July 7, 2015

2017 sunset items (CBe).

- Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)

- Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2018 sunset TR determinations

- EPA list 3 (ZS)
- Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed

Squid (CBe) - TR determination

Research priorities - Discuss topics

Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

July 21, 2015

2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate

2018 sunset TR determinations.

- Copper sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote

2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)

Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal

The CS will submit a TR request with specific questions on newspaper to forward to the NOP.

July 28, 2015 - additional call

- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
- 2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

August 4, 2015

- Sulfuric Acid petition proposal (FT)
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal/vote

- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate.
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural; Lime sulfur; Elemental sulfur

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday August 4, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in; Jean Richardson - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Con- tact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	“
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	“
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	“
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 28 15	“
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 18 15	“

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995		07 21 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo			06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002		06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	FT	1994		07 28 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo			06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	08 04 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		08 04 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 18 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 28 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		07 21 15	“

Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	FT	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	CBo	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 28 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15		
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y 2015	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
--------------------------------	-----	--	--	--	--

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL	06 30 15	Fall 2015
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	08 04 15	TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper.		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request	08 04 15	TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15		Proposal Fall 2015
Hypochlorous Acid			See Handling notes for info. Electrolyzed water. Was not allowed. Back under consideration.		
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A			TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo		Report?		Spr 2016
Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate)	ZS		Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda		Disc doc TBD

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of July 28
- Procedural question on Lignin Sulfonate removal (ZS) (may need to re-visit)
- Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss revised proposal and vote
- Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT) - Discussion and vote
- Coppers, fixed and Copper Sulfate (ZS) - Discussion and vote
- 2017 sunset materials (HA).
 - Elemental Sulfur
 - Lime Sulfur
 - Horticultural Oil
- 2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS) (along with report from the inerts working group)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of July 28 were approved with minor changes to the table entry for ash from burning manure.
- **Lignin Sulfonate (ZS)**. A public commenter noted that there are two listings for lignin sulfonate and it was not clear if they were voted on separately. The CS will take two votes at the fall 2015 meeting: one for each listing. Additionally the sunset templates will be revised to separate the two, since the CS voted differently for each of the listings, which will make it clearer. The CS may revote on this item, and if so, will do so on the next call.
- **Seaweed Extracts (CBe)**. **The lead** recirculated a new draft document with modifications that the CS members suggested on the last call. The NOP suggested some additional edits to the language

Motion to classify Seaweed Extracts as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to add Seaweed Extracts as petitioned at 205.601

Motion by: CBe

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: Classified as synthetic and therefore the CS

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Sulfuric acid (used in micronutrients) proposal (FT) - Discussion and vote**

Motion to classify Sulfuric acid as petitioned as synthetic

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to list Sulfuric acid as petitioned §205.601

Motion by: FT

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Coppers, fixed and Copper Sulfate (ZS) - Discussion and vote.** The lead summarized the draft document. A member posed a question about how to move forward with an annotation change, which he felt would be complex. Another member added that copper is a very important tool in the industry and it will be important to get stakeholder feedback to develop an annotation. The HS will pose questions for public comment requesting suggested annotation language.

Motion to remove Coppers, fixed from 205.601(i)

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: Recuse: 0

Motion to remove Copper Sulfate from 205.601(j):

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (HA)**

- **Elemental Sulfur.** The lead summarized the material, its uses, previous NOSB votes, the TAP and recent public comment. It appears that Elemental sulfur is still necessary in organic crop production. No specific new information was provided via public comment to suggest otherwise.

Motion to remove Elemental Sulfur from 205.601(e)5, 205.601 (i)10, 205.601 (j)2

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: The group discussed some minor wording changes in the document. A member mentioned some early history about elemental sulfur, noting that in the past, it was not possible to determine the sources of mined sulfur.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Lime Sulfur.** The lead summarized the material, its uses, previous NOSB votes, the TAP and recent public comment. Used as an insecticide and fungicide. Considered synthetic. There was an over whelming show of support for its continued listing.

Motion to remove Lime Sulfur from 205.601(e)6, and 205.601(i)6

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: CBe

Additional Discussion: A member suggested that defining “limited use” is appropriate and feels that the environmental impacts need to be considered. Another member noted that use of this material is self-regulating, as it is determined by season and temp.

Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Horticultural Oil** - Deferred to next call

- **2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)** - Deferred to next call
- The CS Chair reminded members of their action items
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

July 28, 2015 - additional call

- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
- 2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

August 4, 2015

- Sulfuric Acid petition proposal (FT)
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate.
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural; Lime sulfur; Elemental sulfur

August 18, 2015

- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday August 18, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in; Jean Richardson - sitting in; Tracy Favre (TF)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 28 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 18 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995		07 21 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo			06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002		06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	FT	1994		07 28 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo			06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	08 04 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		08 04 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 18 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 28 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		07 21 15	“

Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	FT	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	CBo	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 28 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15		
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y 2015	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
--------------------------------	-----	--	--	--	--

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL	06 30 15	Fall 2015
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	TBD
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	08 04 15	TBD
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper.		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request	08 04 15	TBD
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15		Proposal Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid			See Handling notes for info. Electrolyzed water. .		
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR reqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Inerts annotation change	ZS, PD	N/A		08 18 15	TBD
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo		Report	NA	Spr 2016
Annotation for Micronutrients	ZS	Proposal		07 07 15	

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of August 4
- Anaerobic Digestate TR request (ZS)
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Horticultural Oil
- Inert Ingredients (including annotation changes) (ZS)
- Potential doc on NPEs
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of August 4 were approved with two changes: Hypochlorous Acid was added to the work agenda and the Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) was removed.
- **Anaerobic Digestate TR request (ZS)**. The lead circulated some questions via email prior to the call and based on those conversations the CS will request a TR with specific questions.

- **2017 sunset materials (HA). Horticultural Oil.** Listed at 205.601(e) and 205.601(i) for crop production. The lead summarized its uses and the public comment. Horticultural oils are widely used. The group discussed the idea of using vegetable oil as a replacement, but it was found to be less than ideal because vegetable oil turns rancid. A member noted that both types of oil are manufactured in the same way and both use petroleum derived emulsifiers. The HS recommends relisting.

Motion to remove Horticultural Oil from 205.601(e) and 205.601(i)

Motion by: HA

Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: The members discussed the use and mode of action of this material in certain crops, and the fact that insects do not develop resistance to oils.

Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS).** The group discussed the draft document and its intention. The members were supportive of the document and feel it was well thought out and written, and will aid in moving them forward on this complex topic.

Motion to remove EPA List 4 inerts from 205.601(m) based on compatibility with organic principles

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **EPA List 4 inerts annotation changes (ZS).** The group reviewed and edited the draft document. Members discussed the path forward given the complexity of this topic, and expressed the desire to post it for public comment and perhaps vote on it at the fall NOSB meeting. The group discussed the coordination between the Crops and Livestock Subcommittees as it is listed under both. Livestock will review the Crops document and may add their vote so the public is aware that the LS is in agreement. A member asked about the timing of implementation of this proposal. The lead reviewer pointed out that the proposal will set a new requirement for compliance of inerts and will require a substantial transition period so that the necessary review of substances and reformulation of products, if necessary, can take place. A member added that this will represent a sweeping change to the industry.

Motion to adopt the annotation change for EPA List 4 inerts as follows:

205.601(m) As synthetic inert ingredients as classified by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Substances permitted for use in minimal risk products exempt from pesticide registration under FIFRA section 25(b).

(i) Substances included on the EPA's Safer Chemical Ingredient List.

(ii) Inert ingredients that are exempt from the requirement of a tolerance under 40 CFR 180.1122 – for use only in passive pheromone dispensers.

(iii) [Reserved] (for any other inerts individually petitioned and reviewed)]

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **NPEs Discussion document.** The CS requested a TR for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs) as part of the List 4 Inerts sunset review. The lead developed a discussion document to potentially prohibit use of this class of inerts, and would like to begin this work now so the public has adequate notification. The lead outlined the challenges of the timeline and outreach to stakeholders, explaining that it could take 3 - 4 years.. The members discussed the extent to which NPEs are used. The group discussed involving Livestock in the review of NPEs although the LS is considering modifying specific materials such as iodine, where the CS is considering use as a class of inert ingredients. . Members are in support of a consolidated effort.

Motion to approve the NPEs Discussion document for posting.

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- The CS Chair asked the members please finalize their draft proposals so she can forward them to the NOP before the August 25 deadline.
- The CS will cancel the August 25 call as it is not needed.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

August 4, 2015

- Sulfuric Acid petition proposal (FT)
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate.
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural; Lime sulfur; Elemental sulfur

August 18, 2015

- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern

August 25, 2015 - Additional call cancelled.

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015

Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday October 6, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2017 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	1995 TAP 2014 TR	TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14.	06 16 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a)	FT	2014 TR	Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14	06 16 15	"
Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15	08 04 15	"
Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	ZS	1995 TAP Y	TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	06 30 15	"
Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j)	CBe	1995 TAP 2015	TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15	06 23 15	"
Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i)	HA	1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope	TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	07 28 15	"
EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern	ZS	2015	TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 18 15	"

Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b)	FT	1996 TR 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“
Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a)	FT	1994 TAP 2015 TR	TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15	06 16 15	“

2017 Sunsets (No TRs)

Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed	Meeting
Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c)	CBo	2006	Both listings. Rqstd Lmted scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted.	07 07 15	
Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d)	FT	1996 Y		06 16 15	
Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e)	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope. Not contracted.	06 23 15	
Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps)	CBo	1995		07 21 15	
Ash from manure burning 205.602(a)	CBo			06 02 15	
Hydrated lime 205.601(i)	ZS	2002		06 30 15	
Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e)	FT	1994		07 28 15	
Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i)	CBo			06 02 15	
Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Arsenic 205.602(b)	FT			06 02 15	“

Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	FT	2011	HS: 205.605(b) LS: 205.603(a)	06 30 15	“
Copper sulfate 205.601(i)	ZS	2011	LS: 205.603(b)	08 04 15	“
Coppers, fixed 205.601(i)	ZS	2011		08 04 15	“
Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j)	HA	1995		08 04 15	“
Humic acids 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 21 15	“
Lead salts 205.602(d)	FT			06 02 15	“
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		06 23 15	“
Liquid fish products 205.601(j)	CBe	2006		07 07 15	“
Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j)	CBe	2011	HS: 205.605(a) LS: 205.603(a)	07 07 15	“
Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i)	HA	1995		08 18 15	“
Pheromones 205.601(f)	HA	2012		07 28 15	“
Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b)	CBo	1995		07 07 15	“
Potassium chloride 205.602(e)	ZS	1995	HS: 205.605(a)	06 02 15	“
Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f)	ZS			06 02 15	“
Sodium silicate 205.601(l)	CBe	2011		07 21 15	“

Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	1995		07 07 15	“
Strychnine 205.602(h)	ZS			06 02 15	
Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e)	FT	2005	LS: 205.603(b)	06 23 15	“
Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients)	CBe	2010		07 07 15	“
Vitamin D3 205.601(g)	CBo	2011		06 23 15	“
Boric acid 205.601(e)	CBo	1995 TAP Y		06 16 15	
Ethylene 205.601(k)	HA	2011 Y Lmtd Scope	Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted.	07 28 15	
Microcrystalline cheesewax	CBo	Y Lmtd Scope	Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted.	06 02 15	

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)

Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016

Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15		
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y 2015	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		
--------------------------------	-----	--	--	--	--

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Laminarin List at 205.601	ZS	2015 Lmt'd Scope	Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL	06 30 15	Fall 2015
Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i)	CBe	1995 TAP 2011 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested.	06 23 15	Fall 2015
Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601	CBe	2006 TR	Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts	08 04 15	Fall 2015
Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper. TR sent to NOP 10 06 15		TBD
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015		TBD
Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601	FT		Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request	08 04 15	Fall 2015
Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15		TBD

Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15		Proposal Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid			See Handling notes for info. Electrolyzed water.		
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
EPA List 4 Inerts annotation change	ZS	N/A		08 18 15	Fall 2015
Other Projects					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo		Report?		Spr 2016

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of August 18
- Check in on presentations at the Fall board meeting
- Intentions of subcommittee members to remain on Crops next year
- Work Agenda for next semester
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of August 18 approved with no changes.
- **Presentations at the fall board meeting.** The members discussed the possibility of grouping some of the materials for voting at the meeting. The Chair asked that members be conscious of the large number of materials under review and to be brief in their presentations. She also urged them to incorporate all the public comment into their reviews. Additionally, for clarity, the summary should reflect the vote, especially if a vote is not unanimous.
- **Crops Subcommittee roster for 2016.** Several members expressed interest in remaining on the Crops Subcommittee after the fall meeting and through the next Board transition in January.
- **Work Agenda.** The CS will begin review on Ash from manure burning after the fall meeting. And will also discuss the possibility of reviewing 4 inert materials that were previously petitioned.

- **Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j)**. The CS will review the petition and have requested a TR on a slightly broader topic. The NOP noted that there's been a lot of interest in this topic and other forms of liquid manure in general.
- **Contamination in farm inputs**. The Chair asked that the current lead determine who will take on this project as he is rotating off the Board In January 2016.
- **Public comments**. The group discussed the comments, especially those for ethylene used for flower induction in pineapple production. The vote in Subcommittee was in favor of removal, and hence elicited many comments from pineapple growing operations, both small and large. Members found the comments very relevant and helpful, and noted that the final vote at the full board level will be informed by this input.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

September 15, 2015 - cancelled

October 6, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 9, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday November 17, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Tracy Favre (TF) sitting-in.

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		Spr 2016
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		Spr 2016
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15.		Spr 2016
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y 2015	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe		Petition for annotation change. Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.		Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015.	Dec 1	Spr 2016

Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 Petition amendment #1	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15. Petition amendment sent to CS 10 05 15. Waiting for TR.		TBD
Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15		Proposal Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid 205.605 and 205.601	HA	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR suff discussion scheduled for 12 01 15 in HS		Spr 2016
Soy Wax	FT		Petition sent to CS 10 14 15. Questions or request for TR due 12 15 15.		TBD
Calcium Chloride annotation change 205.602	CBe		Petition sent to CS 11 02 15. Petition suff/TR Request due 01 04 16		TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
EPA List 4 Inerts annotation change	ZS	N/A	Update from IWG		Spr 2016
Other Topics					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/FT		Report?		Spr 2016

Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) and other manure issues	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper. TR sent to NOP 10 06 15. Petition withdrawn 10 14 15	NA	NA
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch	ZS				TBD
Prohibition of NPEs in Inerts annotation change	ZS				Spr 2016
Research Priorities	All	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2016		Fall 2016

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of October 6
- Debrief from NOSB meeting in Vermont:
 - Discuss completion of 2015 recommendations
 - Discuss potential future work agenda items
 - Fracking water for irrigation
 - TR for newspaper
 - Aquatic plant extract environ issues
- Status of Petitioned items
 - Anaerobic Digestate: petition withdrawn on 10 19 15.
 - Ash from Manure Burning
 - Squid and Squid Byproducts. Petition amendment sent to CS 10 05 15
 - Aluminum sulfate. Awaiting action by LS.
 - Hypochlorous Acid. Assign lead. HS and LS are also both working on this.
 - Soy wax petition. Assign lead. FT
 - Calcium Chloride: Annotation change petition distributed on 11 2 15. Also a 2018 sunset. Assign lead.
- Other topics
 - Contamination of Inputs: Determine a new lead person and next steps in project.
 - Biodegradeable biobased mulch
 - Inerts
- 2018 Sunset materials

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of October 6 approved with no changes
- FT will remain Vice Chair of Crops. ZS asked that he substitute for her on the Dec 11 ES call.
- **Debrief from NOSB meeting in Vermont:**
 - The members discussed the completion of the 2015 recommendations. MA will send the coversheets to the Subcommittee Chairs by the end of week. Final recommendations are due November 30.

- The former NOSB Chair circulated a list of suggested work agenda items gleaned from public comment. The CS Chair asked that the members volunteer for any specific items they would like to work on, and she will then seek NOP approval to add them to the work agenda.
- **Potential future work agenda items**
 - **Fracking water for irrigation.** The NOP is seeking more information, comments, and feedback before requesting that the NOSB work on this.
 - **TR for newspaper.** The CS Chair feels this is a germane issue and asked the current lead (CBo) to work on transitioning this project to another member since he is rotating off the Board soon. Newspaper was renewed during the 2017 sunset review and the HS may develop an annotation change. ZS will send a request to the ES to discuss its addition to the work agenda.
 - **Aquatic plant extracts environmental issues** - The CS deferred this discussion until the next call.
- **2018 sunset materials**
 - EPA List 3 sunset. The October 2015 NOSB recommendation on the inerts annotation covered the use in pheromones. Due to the timing of implementation the NOSB will still need to complete the 2018 sunset review.
 - The CS will schedule the sunset materials for discussion during the Dec 1 call
- **Status of Petitioned items**
 - **Anaerobic Digestate:** Petition withdrawn on 10/19/15. Topic was moved to “other projects” and the CS will broaden the scope and review it in the context of manure issues. NOP is working on a memo to the NOSB regarding broader issues.
 - **Ash from Manure Burning.** Discussion of checklist scheduled for Dec 1. Once the checklist is complete the CS will determine if a TR is necessary.
 - **Squid and Squid Byproducts.** Petition amendment sent to CS 10/05/15. Waiting for TR. Scheduled discussion for January 2016
 - **Aluminum sulfate.** Awaiting action by LS. LS will discuss status on call today and let CS know the outcome.
 - **Hypochlorous Acid.** HA will lead the review. HS and LS are both working on this as well. The TR was sent to HS on Aug 13 and Handling will determine TR sufficiency on Dec 1.
 - **Soy wax petition.** FT will lead. Petition sufficiency/request for TR due by Dec 15. Scheduled for discussion on Dec 1
 - **Calcium Chloride:** Annotation change petition was distributed on 11/02/15. Calcium Chloride is also a 2018 sunset material. CBe will lead and will complete the petition sufficiency/TR determination on Dec 15.
- **Other topics**
 - **Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs:** FT will take the lead with the intention of including new NOSB members since it is long term project. Crops will discuss this on first call in January.
 - **Biodegradable biobased mulch** - NOP requested that the NOSB add this to their work agenda again. ZS volunteered to take the lead and will determine the path forward. The group briefly discussed the original TR and breakdown products.
 - **Inerts** - The CS Chair noted that there are several prongs to this topic. The Inerts Working Group (IWG) has a call scheduled for this Thursday, and the Chair described issues raised in public comments regarding the NOSB recommended annotation change. The IWG will address this further and will continue to work on various topics and report to the CS and NOSB. The group will likely provide an update at the spring 2016 NOSB meeting.
 - **NPE annotation change discussion document** should be ready for the spring 2016 meeting.
 - **Other Inerts.** The group briefly discussed the timeline for reviewing Inerts that have already been petitioned. There are several on the materials report, some of which are from pre-2011.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 ET)

October 6, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

Ash from Manure Burning - Discuss checklist

Soy wax - Petition suff and request for TR

December 15, 2015

Newspaper - Discuss potential annotation change

Calcium Chloride - Petition sufficiency/determine need for TR

January 5, 2016

Contamination in Farm inputs - discuss topic and path forward.

Squid and Squid Byproducts. Discuss TR if available.

January 19, 2016

February 2, 2016

February 16, 2016

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	?
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016

Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday December 1, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Tracy Favre (TF) sitting-in, Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in.

Absent: Colehour Bondera (CBo)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

2018 Sunsets (TR requests)					
Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed	Meeting
Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e)	ZS	2015 LS TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.	Jan 5	Spr 2016
Ozone gas 205.601(a)	FT		Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.	Dec 15	Spr 2016
Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 5/29/2018. HS requested TR 07 21 15. TR in development as of Nov 2015	Jan 19	Spr 2016
EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018. HS requested TR 07 10 15. Request for TR under review as of Nov 2015	Feb 2	Spr 2016
Calcium chloride 205.602(c)	CBe	N	Petition for annotation change. Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested.	Dec 15	Spr 2016

Petitioned Substances					
Substance	Contact	TR request?	Notes	Scheduled for disc/ Vote	Meeting
Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a)	CBe		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015.	Dec 15/Jan 1	Spr 2016

Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 Petition amendment #1	CBe		Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15. Petition amendment sent to CS 10 05 15. TR in development (expected Dec 2015)	Jan 5 disc TR if available	TBD
Aluminum sulfate	JR	Y	The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15. Waiting for LS to finish	Waiting for LS to review	Proposal Spr 2016
Hypochlorous Acid 205.605 and 205.601	HA	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15. TR suff discussion scheduled for 12 01 15 in HS	TR suff Dec 15	Spr 2016
Soy Wax	FT	N	Petition sent to CS 10 14 15. Questions or request for TR due 12 15 15. Petition found suff 12 01 15. No TR requested	Dec 1/Jan 19	TBD
Calcium Chloride annotation change 205.602	CBe		Petition sent to CS 11 02 15. Petition suff/TR Request due 01 04 16	Dec 15 pet suff/TR rqst	TBD
1-methylcyclopropene (1-MCP). 205.601	?		Petition sent to CS 11 30 15. Petition suff/TR Request due 02 01 16	Dec 15 - assign lead	TBD
Inert Ingredients					
Substance	Contact	TR rqstd?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
EPA List 4 Inerts annotation change	ZS	N/A	Update from IWG		Spr 2016
Other Topics					
Project	Contact	Doc type	Notes*	Disc/Vote	Meeting
Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs	CBo/FT		Report?	Jan 5	Spr 2016

Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) and other manure issues	ZS		Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper. TR sent to NOP 10 06 15. Petition withdrawn 10 14 15		TBD
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch	ZS				TBD
Prohibition of NPEs in Inerts annotation change	ZS				Spr 2016
Newspaper - annotation change					TBD
Research Priorities	All	NA	RPs due to MS Aug 2016		Fall 2016

* **Yellow highlight** indicates Subcommittee action needed ***Highlight** indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of November 17
- Assign discussion dates for Sunset 2018 materials discussions
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - discuss checklist
- Soy Wax (FT) - Determine petition sufficiency and need for TR
- Aquatic Plant Extracts - Discuss potential joint TR with the Handling Subcommittee
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Crops Subcommittee notes of November 17** approved with one correction to the initials of the lead reviewer for Hypochlorous acid.
- The CS scheduled the following Sunset 2018 materials discussions:
 - Copper sulfate - January 5
 - Ozone gas. December 15. The lead will prepare a short paragraph and a list of questions.
 - Peracetic acid - January 19
 - EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity. Feb 2. The CS originally requested a TR but since this was included into the recommendation for annotation change passed in October, it is not necessary.
 - Calcium chloride - December 15
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe). The lead presented the main points from the petition, and noted that it emphasizes that the reaction is controlled and there is no wasted nutrient value, however carbon and nitrogen are not accounted for. This was emphasized to distinguish it from previous practices. The group discussed the checklist and will continue the discussion on Dec 15.
- Soy Wax (FT) - The lead summarized the petition for the members. The petition was found to be sufficient and the CS will not request a TR. Soy wax is a synthetic, non-GMO material and could replace microcrystalline cheesewax, which is a petroleum product.
- Marine products. The Handling Subcommittee is considering this as a work agenda item. It would include several materials such as seaweed, kelp and aquatic plant extracts, with a focus on conservation

and environmental issues. JR will take the lead, submit the request to the NOP to add it to the work agenda, and once the TR is received will transfer it to another member. In the interim she will develop a set of questions that will serve as the basis for the TR request and could be posed to a panel, should the NOSB host a panel at a future meeting. The group will discuss this on the Dec 11 Executive call.

- The group discussed the submission of the final recommendations for 2017 sunset and the format and language that needs to be included in the document.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 ET)

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

January 5, 2016

January 19, 2016. (CBe & ZS will miss call due to conflict with hydroponics task force).

February 2, 2016

February 16, 2016

March 1, 2016

March 15, 2016

April 5, 2016

April 19, 2016

May 3, 2016

May 17, 2016

June 7, 2016

June 21, 2016

July 5, 2016

July 19, 2016

August 2, 2016

August 16, 2016

September 6, 2016

September 20, 2016

October 4, 2016

October 18, 2016

November 1, 2016

November 15, 2016

December 6, 2016

December 20, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones	Target date
New NOSB member orientation	?
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??

Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016