# EXHIBIT \# 

# Testimony of <br> Robert D. Wellington of Agri-Mark Dairy Cooperative Regarding Proposals 14 At Federal Order Hearing (Docket No. AO-14-A77, et al.; DA-07-02) April 9, 2007 in Indianapolis, Indiana 

My name is Robert D. Wellington. I testified during the first week of this hearing on proposals 1, 2, 10, and 11 and now wish to do so regarding Agri-Mark proposal \#14.

## PROPOSAL \#14

This proposal seeks to amend the Class III and Class I product price formulas by using a combination of the weekly NASS (National Agricultural Statistical Service) and CME (Chicago Mercantile Exchange) cheese price series to determine the cheese price to be used in the Class III and Class I product price formulas.

## CHE VS NAPS CHEESE PRICES

U.S. cheese manufacturers use the CME market prices as a basis to set the cheese prices they charge in the marketplace. In addition, California uses the CME price series to set its state mandated milk price for milk used to make cheese (Class Ab). However, USDA uses a different price series in its price determination.

USDA uses the NASS cheese price survey to determine the cheese prices that in turn, are used to determine Class III prices each month. While the NASS and CME are closely linked, that relationship usually involved a two week lag.

The two week lag between NASS and CME prices became a serious problem in 2004 when CME cheese prices changed so quickly from week to week that the monthly average between the two price series fluctuated dramatically. In fact the two prices varied by more than ten cents per pound in seven of the twelve months of 2004.

Figure 1 provides a graphic representation of the differences in CME versus NASS weighted average cheese prices shown in red and the differences in CME versus Proposal \#14 weighted average cheese prices on a monthly basis from 2003 through 2006. The intent of Proposal \#14 is to reduce those differences while still using the NASS price series as the primary indicator of cheese price changes. The data shown in Figure 1 is also given in Appendix Table 1.

## RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE NASS AND CME CHEESE PRICES SERIES

The following table shows the simple regression results estimating the relationship between the NASS and the CME for block and barrel cheese price series. The table shows the relationships based on having no lag as well as one week, two weeks and three week lags. The time period considered is from January 2000, when the Orders were amended to use NASS pricing, to February 2007. Specifically, there are 372 weeks going from January 22, 2000 through February 24, 2007. The initial weeks of January 2000 were not included in the direct regression analysis due the assumption of a three week lag as one of the scenarios.

As seen in Table 1, a two week lag in the CME relative to NASS prices shows the best relationship. In fact during the last seven years, the CME price series accounted for between $97 \%$ and $98 \%$ of the variation in the NASS price series.

# TABLE 1: NASS VERSUS CME WEEKLY CHEESE PRICE RELATIONSHIP REGRESSION ANALYSIS: R Squared Values 

BLOCK PRICES
BARREL PRICES
CURRENT NASS VS CME
88\%
91\%

1 WEEK LAG NASS VS CME
95\%
97\%

2 WEEK LAG NASS VS CME
98\%
97\%

3 WEEK LAG NASS VS CME
95\%
92\%

## HOW PROPOSAL \#14 WORKS

Figures 2 A and 2 B show the weekly time line for the monthly cheese price used in the Class III and Class I price calculations of Proposal \#14. Using the month of April as an example, Figure 2A shows the NASS cheese prices for the four weeks of April that are used to calculate the Class III price that month. While the April NASS prices are correlated with the CME price for the last two weeks of March and the first two weeks of April, there is no adjustment in the price formulas currently done to relate the two.

Underneath the current April Class III pricing time line in Figure 2A is an alternative time line showing the weeks to be used in Proposal \#14 that links the cheese price used to calculate the Class III price (referred to as "the Class III cheese price") with the CME market prices. The
proposal uses the actual CME weekly prices for the four weeks of April adjusted by the difference between the NASS cheese prices (for the last two weeks of March and the first two weeks of April) and the previous month's CME cheese prices (the four weeks of March in this example).

The Class III cheese price setting mechanism of Proposal \#14 uses all the weekly observations of all NASS and CME prices. Over a number of months, the CME current month price series and the previous month CME prices series cancel one another out, leaving only the NASS price series as the average price indicator overtime. This proposal allows the USDA to use up-todate CME prices needed by the industry while making the appropriate adjustments in those prices to assure that the NASS price is the primary determinant of cheese prices used overtime. If the CME is manipulated in such as a way as to diverge from true NASS prices, this proposal adjusts those CME prices to the actual NASS prices to correct the situation.

The time line chart in Figure 2B shows how the cheese prices for the Class I price determination can also be adjusted in order to use the more current CME price series, while also maintaining a relationship to NASS prices. This part of the proposal allows the use of actual CME prices for the second and third weeks of March to determine the Class I cheese price instead of the current first two weeks of NASS pricing. This part of the proposal does use a different set of weeks than currently used so it may not come back entirely to the NASS pricing on a historical basis. However it does relate back to the NASS price series.

## IMPACT ON FEDERAL ORDER PRICES

Appendix Tables 2 through 5 show the detailed monthly changes in the cheese prices used in the Class I and III formulas, the changes in the Class I and III prices, the changes in the Northeast Order producer price differentials and the Northeast uniform prices, and changes in the protein price.

Table 2 contains a summary of those appendix tables showing the average of the annual and 4year cumulative time periods (2003-2006). While the annual averages under Proposal \#14 can differ from year to year, the 4-year cumulative average for all prices were less than half a cent per pound of cheese or less than two cents per hundredweight of milk for all pricews.

Proposal \#14 is not intended to increase or decrease any prices used or determined by Federal Orders. The intent is to reduce the monthly differences between the prices that most cheese manufacturers sell their product for and the cheese prices used to determine their cost of milk. In this process, the proposal also reduces the number of weeks it takes to transmit marketplace cheese prices into changes in farm milk prices.

TABLE 2: SUMMARY OF DIFFERENCES BETWEEN CURRENT AND PROPOSAL \#14 PRICES

| YEAR | CHEESE PRICES |  | CLASS PRICES |  | NORTHEAST PRODUCER PRICES |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | ADVANCED | FINAL | CLASS I | CLASS III | PPD | UNIFORM PRICE | PROTEIN |
|  | (CLASS I) | (CLASS III) |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2003 | \$0.010 | \$0.000 | \$0.096 | (\$0.004) | \$0.048 | \$0.045 | (\$0.001) |
| 2004 | \$0.013 | \$0.009 | \$0.138 | \$0.086 | \$0.030 | \$0.114 | \$0.028 |
| 2005 | (\$0.037) | (\$0.009) | (\$0.319) | (\$0.085) | (\$0.077) | (\$0.164) | (\$0.029) |
| 2006 | (\$0.001) | \$0.003 | \$0.006 | \$0.034 | (\$0.019) | \$0.015 | \$0.011 |
| 4-YR AVERAGE | (\$0.004) | \$0.001 | (\$0.020) | \$0.008 | (\$0.004) | \$0.003 | \$0.002 |

Originally I had hoped that this proposal would also lessen the occurrence of negative producer price differences, which are mostly a by-product of the time lag between Class III and Class I price changes. This was indeed the case when the Class I cheese pricing changes (shown in Figure 2B) were considered independently of the Class III price changes. However when both changes were considered at the same time, as is being proposed, the lags are reduced for both the Class I and III prices BUT the lag relative to each price series is not reduced. This is why Appendix Table 4 does not show any reduction in the negative PPDs for 2004.

Thank you for this opportunity to present Proposal \#14.

APPENDIX TABLE 1: CURRENT AND PROPOSAL \#14 CHEESE PRICE COMPARISONS

|  | CME | NASS |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2003 | CURRENT | CURRENT | DIFFERENCE | PROPOSAL\#14 | VS CME |
| JANUARY | \$1.135 | \$1.137 | \$0.002 | \$1.138 | \$0.003 |
| FEBRUARY | \$1.081 | \$1.130 | \$0.049 | \$1.077 | (\$0.004) |
| MARCH | \$1.083 | \$1.078 | (\$0.005) | \$1.064 | (\$0.019) |
| APRIL | \$1.126 | \$1.100 | (\$0.026) | \$1.129 | \$0.003 |
| MAY | \$1.143 | \$1.139 | (\$0.004) | \$1.142 | (\$0.001) |
| JUNE | \$1.218 | \$1.146 | (\$0.072) | \$1.218 | \$0.000 |
| JULY | \$1.513 | \$1.350 | (\$0.163) | \$1.482 | (\$0.031) |
| AUGUST | \$1.601 | \$1.550 | (\$0.051) | \$1.617 | \$0.016 |
| SEPTEMBER | \$1.595 | \$1.594 | (\$0.001) | \$1.609 | \$0.014 |
| OCTOBER | \$1.572 | \$1.594 | \$0.022 | \$1.574 | \$0.002 |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.344 | \$1.494 | \$0.150 | \$1.331 | (\$0.013) |
| DECEMBER | \$1.306 | \$1.326 | \$0.020 | \$1.257 | (\$0.049) |
| AVERAGE | \$1.310 | \$1.303 | (\$0.007) | \$1.303 | (\$0.007) |
| 2004 |  |  |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$1.293 | \$1.302 | \$0.009 | \$1.293 | \$0.000 |
| FEBRUARY | \$1.420 | \$1.326 | (\$0.094) | \$1.424 | \$0.004 |
| MARCH | \$1.928 | \$1.568 | (\$0.360) | \$1.958 | \$0.030 |
| APRIL | \$2.169 | \$2.052 | (\$0.117) | \$2.260 | \$0.091 |
| MAY | \$1.927 | \$2.127 | \$0.200 | \$1.958 | \$0.031 |
| JUNE | \$1.677 | \$1.841 | \$0.164 | \$1.604 | (\$0.073) |
| JULY | \$1.450 | \$1.570 | \$0.120 | \$1.381 | (\$0.069) |
| AUGUST | \$1.575 | \$1.517 | (\$0.058) | \$1.548 | (\$0.027) |
| SEPTEMBER | \$1.553 | \$1.587 | \$0.034 | \$1.564 | \$0.011 |
| OCTOBER | \$1.518 | \$1.526 | \$0.008 | \$1.504 | (\$0.014) |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.763 | \$1.589 | (\$0.174) | \$1.756 | (\$0.007) |
| DECEMBER | \$1.516 | \$1.715 | \$0.199 | \$1.573 | \$0.057 |
| AVERAGE | \$1.649 | \$1.643 | (\$0.006) | \$1.652 | \$0.003 |
| 2005 |  |  |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$1.621 | \$1.606 | (\$0.015) | \$1.547 | (\$0.074) |
| FEBRUARY | \$1.483 | \$1.496 | \$0.013 | \$1.524 | \$0.041 |
| MARCH | \$1.512 | \$1.522 | \$0.010 | \$1.512 | \$0.000 |
| APRIL | \$1.540 | \$1.518 | (\$0.022) | \$1.521 | (\$0.019) |
| MAY | \$1.481 | \$1.468 | (\$0.013) | \$1.446 | (\$0.035) |
| JUNE | \$1.445 | \$1.499 | \$0.054 | \$1.499 | \$0.054 |
| JULY | \$1.473 | \$1.477 | \$0.004 | \$1.484 | \$0.011 |
| AUGUST | \$1.454 | \$1.461 | \$0.007 | \$1.443 | (\$0.011) |
| SEPTEMBER | \$1.578 \% | \$1.544 | (\$0.034) | \$1.559 | (\$0.019) |
| OCTOBER | \$1.446 | \$1.423 | (\$0.023) | \$1.435 | (\$0.011) |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.360 | \$1.377 | \$0.017 | \$1.352 | (\$0.008) |
| DECEMBER | \$1.352 | \$1.417 | \$0.065 | \$1.420 | \$0.068 |
| AVERAGE | \$1.479 | \$1.488 | \$0.009 | \$1.479 | (\$0.000) |
| 2006 |  |  |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$1.380 | \$1.335 | (\$0.045) | \$1.335 | (\$0.045) |
| FEBRUARY | \$1.195 | \$1.182 | (\$0.013) | \$1.178 | (\$0.017) |
| MARCH | \$1.149 | \$1.163 | \$0.014 | \$1.143 | (\$0.006) |
| APRIL | \$1.169 | \$1.161 | (\$0.008) | \$1.164 | (\$0.005) |
| MAY | \$1.222 | \$1.204 | (\$0.018) | \$1.202 | (\$0.020) |
| JUNE | \$1.187 | \$1.200 | \$0.013 | \$1.213 | \$0.026 |
| JULY | \$1.162 | \$1.167 | \$0.005 | \$1.162 | \$0.000 |
| AUGUST | \$1.305 | \$1.260 | (\$0.045) | \$1.261 | (\$0.044) |
| SEPTEMBER | \$1.294 | \$1.307 | \$0.013 | \$1.328 | \$0.034 |
| OCTOBER | \$1.287 | \$1.267 | (\$0.020) | \$1.272 | (\$0.015) |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.406 | \$1.401 | (\$0.005) | \$1.406 | \$0.000 |
| DECEMBER | \$1.322 | \$1.325 | \$0.003 | \$1.342 | \$0.020 |
| AVERAGE | \$1.257 | \$1.247 | (\$0.009) | \$1.251 | (\$0.006) |
| 4-YR AVERAE | \$1.424 | \$1.420 | (\$0.003) | \$1.421 | (\$0.003) |

## APPENDIX TABLE 2: CURRENT AND PROPOSAL \#14 FEDERAL ORDER CHEESE PRICES

ADVANCED CHEESE PRICE (FOR CLASS I)
$\underline{2003}$
JANUARY
FEBRUARY
MARCH
APRIL.
MAY
JUNE
JULY
AUGUST
SEPTEMBER
OCTOBER
NOVEMBER
DECEMBER
AVERAGE

2004
JANUARY
FEBRUARY
MARCH

APRIL MAY
JUNE JUL.Y AUGUST SEPTEMBER OCTOBER NOVEMBER DECEMBER AVERAGE

## 2005



MARCH APRIL MAY JUNE JULY AUGUST SEPTEMBER OCTOBER NOVEMBER DECEMBER AVERAGE

## 2006

| JANUARY | $\$ 1.398$ | $\$ 1.437$ | $\$ 0.039$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| FEBRUARY | $\$ 1.390$ | $\$ 1.371$ | $(\$ 0.018)$ |
| MARCH | $\$ 1.292$ | $\$ 1.152$ | $(\$ 0.140)$ |
| APRIL | $\$ 1.169$ | $\$ 1.146$ | $(\$ 0.023)$ |
| MAY | $\$ 1.170$ | $\$ 1.159$ | $(\$ 0.011)$ |
| JUNE | $\$ 1.160$ | $\$ 1.188$ | $\$ 0.028$ |
| JULY | $\$ 1.203$ | $\$ 1.206$ | $\$ 0.003$ |
| AUGUST | $\$ 1.186$ | $\$ 1.152$ | $(\$ 0.034)$ |
| SEPTEMBER | $\$ 1.163$ | $\$ 1.220$ | $\$ 0.057$ |
| OCTOBER | $\$ 1.306$ | $\$ 1.327$ | $\$ 0.021$ |
| NOVEMBER | $\$ 1.285$ | $\$ 1.219$ | $(\$ 0.066)$ |
| DECEMBER | $\$ 1.275$ | $\$ 1.402$ | $\$ 0.128$ |
| AVERAGE | $\$ 1.250$ | $\$ 1.248$ | $(\$ 0.001)$ |
|  |  |  | $\$ 1.411$ |
| 4-YR AVERAGE | $\$ 1.414$ |  | $(\$ 0.004)$ |


| CURRENT |
| :---: |
| $\$ 1.120$ |
| $\$ 1.136$ |
| $\$ 1.130$ |
| $\$ 1.070$ |
| $\$ 1.084$ |
| $\$ 1.142$ |
| $\$ 1.139$ |
| $\$ 1.269$ |
| $\$ 1.540$ |
| $\$ 1.594$ |
| $\$ 1.592$ |
| $\$ 1.533$ |
| $\$ 1.279$ |

$\$ 1.323$
$\$ 1.298$
$\$ 1.305$
$\$ 1.458$
$\$ 2.053$
$\$ 2.184$
$\$ 1.868$
$\$ 1.544$
$\$ 1.505$
$\$ 1.596$
$\$ 1.537$
$\$ 1.548$
$\$ 1.602$
$\$ 1.765$
$\$ 1.479$
$\$ 1.648$
$\$ 1.514$
$\$ 1.578$
$\$ 1.461$
$\$ 1.483$
$\$ 1.522$
$\$ 1.445$
$\$ 1.497$
$\$ 1.521$
$\$ 1.421$
$\$ 1.528$
$\$ 1.553$
$\$ 1.631$
$\$ 1.354$
$\$ 1.502$
$\$ 1.607$
$\$ 1.484$
$\$ 1.467$
$\$ 1.556$
$\$ 1.460$
$\$ 1.531$
$\$ 1.402$
$\$ 1.337$
$\$ 1.490$
$(\$ 0.212)$
$\$ 0.152$
(\$0.294)
(\$0.012)
$\$ 0.029$
$\$ 0.023$
(\$0.016)
$\$ 0.015$
$\$ 0.035$
(\$0.119)
(\$0.084)
(\$0.037)

MONTHLY CHEESE PRICE (FOR CLASS III)
$\$ 1.390$
$\$ 1.264$
$\$ 1.161$
$\$ 1.165$
$\$ 1.169$
$\$ 1.217$
$\$ 1.179$
$\$ 1.181$
$\$ 1.291$
$\$ 1.272$
$\$ 1.312$
$\$ 1.362$
$\$ 1.247$
$\$ 1.420$
PROPOSAL \#14DIFFERENCE

| CURRENT |
| :---: |
| $\$ 1.137$ |
| $\$ 1.130$ |
| $\$ 1.078$ |
| $\$ 1.100$ |
| $\$ 1.139$ |
| $\$ 1.146$ |
| $\$ 1.350$ |
| $\$ 1.550$ |
| $\$ 1.594$ |
| $\$ 1.594$ |
| $\$ 1.494$ |
| $\$ 1.326$ |
| $\$ 1.303$ |

$\$ 1.138$
$\$ 1.077$
$\$ 1.064$
$\$ 1.129$
$\$ 1.142$
$\$ 1.218$
$\$ 1.482$
$\$ 1.617$
$\$ 1.574$
$\$ 1.331$
$\$ 1$
$\$ 1.303$

| $\$ 1.293$ | $(\$ 0.009)$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| $\$ 1.424$ | $\$ 0.098$ |
| $\$ 1.958$ | $\$ 0.390$ |
| $\$ 2.260$ | $\$ 0.208$ |
| $\$ 1.958$ | $(\$ 0.169)$ |
| $\$ 1.604$ | $(\$ 0.237)$ |
| $\$ 1.381$ | $(\$ 0.189)$ |
| $\$ 1.548$ | $\$ 0.031$ |
| $\$ 1.564$ | $(\$ 0.023)$ |
| $\$ 1.504$ | $(\$ 0.022)$ |
| $\$ 1.756$ | $\$ 0.167$ |
| $\$ 1.573$ | $(\$ 0.142)$ |
| $\$ 1.652$ | $\$ 0.009$ |


| $\$ 1.517$ | $\$ 1.547$ | $\$ 0.030$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $\$ 1.571$ | $\$ 1.524$ | $(\$ 0.047)$ |
| $\$ 1.506$ | $\$ 1.512$ | $\$ 0.006$ |
| $\$ 1.559$ | $\$ 1.521$ | $(\$ 0.038)$ |
| $\$ 1.477$ | $\$ 1.446$ | $(\$ 0.030)$ |
| $\$ 1.485$ | $\$ 1.499$ | $\$ 0.015$ |
| $\$ 1.516$ | $\$ 1.484$ | $(\$ 0.032)$ |
| $\$ 1.432$ | $\$ 1.443$ | $\$ 0.011$ |
| $\$ 1.496$ | $\$ 1.559$ | $\$ 0.063$ |
| $\$ 1.500$ | $\$ 1.435$ | $(\$ 0.065)$ |
| $\$ 1.397$ | $\$ 1.352$ | $(\$ 0.045)$ |
| $\$ 1.396$ | $\$ 1.420$ | $\$ 0.024$ |
| $\$ 1.488$ | $\$ 1.479$ | $(\$ 0.009)$ |


| $\$ 1.335$ | $(\$ 0.055)$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| $\$ 1.178$ | $(\$ 0.086)$ |
| $\$ 1.143$ | $(\$ 0.018)$ |
| $\$ 1.164$ | $(\$ 0.001)$ |
| $\$ 1.202$ | $\$ 0.033$ |
| $\$ 1.213$ | $(\$ 0.004)$ |
| $\$ 1.162$ | $(\$ 0.017)$ |
| $\$ 1.261$ | $\$ 0.080$ |
| $\$ 1.328$ | $\$ 0.037$ |
| $\$ 1.272$ | $(\$ 0.000)$ |
| $\$ 1.406$ | $\$ 0.094$ |
| $\$ 1.342$ | $(\$ 0.020)$ |
| $\$ 1.251$ | $\$ 0.003$ |
| $\$ 1.421$ | $\$ 0.001$ |

NORTHEAST ORDER CLASS I PRICES

| 2003 | CURRENT | PROPOSAL \#14 | DIFFERENCE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| JANUARY. | \$13.81 | \$13.81 | \$0.000 |
| FEBRUARY | \$13.48 | \$13.48 | \$0.000 |
| MARCH | \$13.06 | \$13.06 | \$0.000 |
| APRIL | \$12.89 | \$12.89 | \$0.000 |
| MAY | \$12.96 | \$12.96 | \$0.000 |
| JUNE | \$12.99 | \$13.15 | \$0.164 |
| JULY | \$13.02 | \$13.23 | \$0.212 |
| AUGUST | \$14.22 | \$16.91 | \$2.692 |
| SEPTEMBER | \$16.96 | \$17.26 | \$0.299 |
| OCTOBER | \$17.52 | \$17.45 | (\$0.068) |
| NOVEMBER | \$17.62 | \$17.54 | (\$0.077) |
| DECEMBER | \$17.09 | \$15.02 | (\$2.075) |
| AVERAGE | \$14.63 | \$14.73 | \$0.096 |
| 2004 |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$15.10 | \$15.55 | \$0.454 |
| FEBRUARY | \$14.84 | \$14.64 | (\$0.193) |
| MARCH | \$15.19 | \$15.89 | \$0.704 |
| APRIL | \$16.89 | \$19.96 | \$3.078 |
| MAY | \$22.90 | \$23.81 | \$0.907 |
| JUNE | \$24.38 | \$22.01 | (\$2.374) |
| JULY | \$21.20 | \$20.77 | (\$0.425) |
| AUGUST | \$17.87 | \$16.73 | (\$1.139) |
| SEPTEMBER | \$17.19 | \$17.69 | \$0.502 |
| OCTOBER | \$18.03 | \$17.57 | (\$0.463) |
| NOVEMBER | \$17.54 | \$16.78 | (\$0.762) |
| DECEMBER | \$17.68 | \$19.04 | \$1.361 |
| AVERAGE | \$18.23 | \$18.37 | \$0.138 |
| 2005 |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$19.90 | \$17.85 | (\$2.046) |
| FEBRUARY | \$17.04 | \$18.51 | \$1.467 |
| MARCH | \$18.68 | \$15.93 | (\$2.750) |
| APRIL | \$17.38 | \$17.27 | (\$0.116) |
| MAY | \$18.05 | \$18.34 | \$0.290 |
| JUNE | \$16.87 | \$17.09 | \$0.212 |
| JULY | \$17.14 | \$16.98 | (\$0.154) |
| AUGUST | \$17.69 | \$18.01 | \$0.318 |
| SEPTEMBER | \$16.95 | \$17.09 | \$0.145 |
| OCTOBER | \$17.52 | \$17.85 | \$0.328 |
| NOVEMBER | \$17.81 | \$16.78 | (\$1.033) |
| DECEMBER | \$16.82 | \$16.33 | (\$0.492) |
| AVERAGE | \$17.65 | \$17.34 | (\$0.319) |
| 2006 |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$16.63 | \$17.01 | \$0.376 |
| FEBRUARY | \$16.63 | \$16.45 | (\$0.183) |
| MARCH | \$15.74 | \$14.65 | (\$1.090) |
| APRIL. | \$14.47 | \$14.26 | (\$0.212) |
| MAY | \$14.22 | \$14.12 | (\$0.106) |
| JUNE | \$14.00 | \$14.26 | \$0.261 |
| JULY | \$14.59 | \$14.59 | \$0.000 |
| AUGUST | \$14.22 | \$13.90 | (\$0.318) |
| SEPTEMBER | \$14.10 | \$14.64 | \$0.540 |
| OCTOBER | \$15.67 | \$15.87 | \$0.193 |
| NOVEMBER | \$15.65 | \$15.02 | (\$0.627) |
| DECEMBER | \$15.68 | \$16.92 | \$1.235 |
| AVERAGE | \$15.14 | \$15.14 | \$0.006 |
| 4-YR AVERAGE | \$16.414 | \$16.394 | (\$0.020) |

NORTHEAST ORDER CLASS III PRICES

| CURRENT | PROPOSAL\#14 | DIFFERENCE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \$9.78 | \$9.79 | \$0.010 |
| \$9.66 | \$9.12 | (\$0.540) |
| \$9.11 | \$8.96 | (\$0.145) |
| \$9.41 | \$9.69 | \$0.280 |
| \$9.71 | \$9.74 | \$0.029 |
| \$9.75 | \$10.44 | \$0.685 |
| \$11.78 | \$13.05 | \$1.274 |
| \$13.80 | \$14.44 | \$0.647 |
| \$14.30 | \$14.45 | \$0.145 |
| \$14.39 | \$14.20 | (\$0.193) |
| \$13.47 | \$11.90 | (\$1.573) |
| \$11.87 | \$11.21 | (\$0.666) |
| \$11.42 | \$11.42 | (\$0.004) |
| \$11.61 | \$11.52 | (\$0.087) |
| \$11.89 | \$12.83 | \$0.936 |
| \$14.49 | \$18.25 | \$3.764 |
| \$19.66 | \$21.67 | \$2.007 |
| \$20.58 | \$18.96 | (\$1.621) |
| \$17.68 | \$15.40 | (\$2.287) |
| \$14.85 | \$13.04 | (\$1.814) |
| \$14.04 | \$14.35 | \$0.309 |
| \$14.72 | \$14.49 | (\$0.222) |
| \$14.16 | \$13.96 | (\$0.203) |
| \$14.89 | \$16.51 | \$1.621 |
| \$16.14 | \$14.77 | (\$1.370) |
| \$15.39 | \$15.48 | \$0.086 |
| \$14.14 | \$14.44 | \$0.299 |
| \$14.70 | \$14.24 | (\$0.454) |
| \$14.08 | \$14.13 | \$0.058 |
| \$14.61 | \$14.25 | (\$0.367) |
| \$13.77 | \$13.48 | (\$0.289) |
| \$13.92 | \$14.07 | \$0.145 |
| \$14.35 | \$14.05 | (\$0.299) |
| \$13.60 | \$13.71 | \$0.106 |
| \$14.30 | \$14.90 | \$0.608 |
| \$14.35 | \$13.73 | (\$0.618) |
| \$13.35 | \$12.92 | (\$0.434) |
| \$13.37 | \$13.59 | \$0.222 |
| \$14.05 | \$13.96 | (\$0.085) |
| \$13.39 | \$12.86 | (\$0.531) |
| \$12.20 | \$11.37 | (\$0.830) |
| \$11.11 | \$10.93 | (\$0.174) |
| \$10.93 | \$10.92 | (\$0.010) |
| \$10.83 | \$11.15 | \$0.318 |
| \$11.29 | \$11.25 | (\$0.039) |
| \$10.92 | \$10.75 | (\$0.164) |
| \$11.06 | \$11.83 | \$0.772 |
| \$12.29 | \$12.65 | \$0.357 |
| \$12.32 | \$12.32 | (\$0.010) |
| \$12.84 | \$13.75 | \$0.907 |
| \$13.47 | \$13.28 | (\$0.193) |
| \$11.89 | \$11.92 | \$0.034 |
| \$13.187 | \$13.194 | \$0.008 |

APPENDIX TABLE 4: CURRENT AND PROPOSAL \#14 NORTHEAST ORDER PPD AND UNIFORM PRICES
PRODUCER PRICE DIFFERENTIAL

| 2003 | PRODUCER PRICE DIFFERENTIAL |  |  | NORTHEAST ORDER UNIFORM PRICE (Boston) |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | CURRENT | PROPOSAL | DIFFERENCE | CURRENT | PROPOSAL \#14 | DIFFERENCE |
| JANUARY | \$2.41 | \$2.40 | (\$0.007) | \$12.19 | \$12.19 | \$0.003 |
| FEBRUARY | \$2.13 | \$2.52 | \$0.392 | \$11.79 | \$11.64 | (\$0.152) |
| MARCH | \$2.36 | \$2.46 | \$0.101 | \$11.47 | \$11.42 | (\$0.043) |
| APRIL | \$2.04 | \$1.83 | (\$0.203) | \$11.45 | \$11.53 | \$0.080 |
| MAY | \$1.89 | \$1.87 | (\$0.017) | \$11.60 | \$11.61 | \$0.008 |
| JUNE | \$1.91 | \$1.49 | (\$0.423) | \$11.66 | \$11.93 | \$0.269 |
| JULY | \$0.68 | (\$0.10) | (\$0.777) | \$12.46 | \$12.96 | \$0.502 |
| AUGUST | (\$0.08) | \$0.67 | \$0.740 | \$13.72 | \$15.11 | \$1.392 |
| SEPTEMBER | \$0.71 | \$0.75 | \$0.040 | \$15.01 | \$15.19 | \$0.185 |
| OCTOBER | \$0.82 | \$0.92 | \$0.106 | \$15.21 | \$15.13 | (\$0.084) |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.48 | \$2.59 | \$1.112 | \$14.95 | \$14.48 | (\$0.464) |
| DECEMBER | \$2.52 | \$2.03 | (\$0.486) | \$14.39 | \$13.24 | (\$1.153) |
| AVERAGE 2004 | \$1.57 | \$1.62 | \$0.048 | \$12.99 | \$13.04 | \$0.045 |
| 2004 ( 20.045 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$1.97 | \$2.25 | \$0.282 | \$13.58 | \$13.77 | \$0.192 |
| FEBRUARY | \$2.06 | \$1,30 | (\$0.762) | \$13.95 | \$14.13 | \$0.185 |
| MARCH | \$1.07 | (\$1.33) | (\$2.402) | \$15.56 | \$16.93 | \$1.368 |
| APRIL | (\$2.38) | (\$2.50) | (\$0.124) | \$17.28 | \$19.16 | \$1.886 |
| MAY | (\$0.74) | \$1.02 | \$1.759 | \$19.84 | \$19.97 | \$0.129 |
| JUNE | \$2.02 | \$2.81 | \$0.791 | \$19.70 | \$18.20 | (\$1.501) |
| JULY | \$2.79 | \$3.89 | \$1.105 | \$17.64 | \$16.93 | (\$0.717) |
| AUGUST | \$1.53 | \$0.78 | (\$0.748) | \$15.57 | \$15.13 | (\$0.445) |
| SEPTEMBER OCTOBER | \$1.34 $\$ 1.91$ | \$1.76 | \$0.426 | \$16.06 | \$16.26 | \$0.206 |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.31 | (\$0.32) | (\$0.074) (\$1.635) | \$16.07 $\$ 16.20$ | \$15.79 | (\$0.283) |
| DECEMBER | \$0.29 | \$2.03 | \$1.738 | \$16.43 | \$16.18 | (\$0.017) |
| AVERAGE | \$1.10 | \$1.13 | \$0.030 | \$16.49 | \$16.60 | \$0.114 |
| 2005 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$2.17 | \$1.01 | (\$1.161) | \$16.31 | \$15.44 |  |
| FEBRUARY | \$0.81 | \$1.85 | \$1,036 | \$15.51 | \$16.09 | \$0.581 |
| MARCH | \$1.96 | \$0.68 | (\$1.276) | \$16.04 | \$14.82 | (\$1.219) |
| APRIL | \$0.91 | \$1.15 | \$0.238 | \$15.52 | \$15.39 | (\$0.130) |
| MAY | \$1.58 | \$1.94 | \$0.352 | \$15.35 | \$15.41 | \$0.057 |
| JUNE | \$1.31 | \$1.29 | (\$0.019) | \$15.23 | \$15.35 | \$0.121 |
| JULY | \$1.50 | \$1.67 | \$0.172 | \$15.85 | \$15.72 | (\$0.133) |
| AUGUST | \$2.24 | \$2.31 | \$0.062 | \$15.84 | \$16.00 | \$0.166 |
| SEPTEMBER | \$1.62 | \$1.22 | (\$0.397) | \$15.92 | \$16.13 | \$0.214 |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.53 $\$ 2.06$ | $\$ 2.18$ $\$ 1.89$ | \$0.650 | \$15.88 | \$15.91 | \$0.025 |
| DECEMBER | \$1.46 | \$1.05 | (\$0.412) | \$15.41 $\$ 14.83$ | \$14.81 $\$ 14.65$ | (\$0.598) (\$0 184) |
| AVERAGE | \$1.60 | \$1.52 | (\$0.077) | \$15.64 | \$15.48 | $\frac{(\$ 0.184)}{(\$ 0.164)}$ |
| 2006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| JANUARY | \$1.39 | \$1.98 | \$0.581 | \$14.78 |  |  |
| FEBRUARY | \$2.05 | \$2.61 | \$0.561 | \$14.25 | \$13.98 | (\$0.268) |
| MARCH | \$2.32 | \$1.96 | (\$0.355) | \$13.43 | \$12.90 | (\$0.531) |
| APRIL | \$1.71 | \$1.63 | (\$0.077) | \$12.64 | \$12.55 | (\$0.090) |
| MAY | \$1.78 | \$1.49 | (\$0.290) | \$12.61 | \$12.63 | \$0.025 |
| JUNE | \$1.37 | \$1.51 | \$0.142 | \$12.66 | \$12.77 | \$0.107 |
| JULY | \$1.86 | \$1.99 | \$0.127 | \$12.78 | \$12.74 | (\$0.040) |
| AUGUST | \$2.00 | \$1.25 | (\$0.747) | \$13.06 | \$13.09 | \$0.024 |
| SEPTEMBER | $\$ 1.14$ $\$ 1.72$ | \$1.14 | \$0.005 | \$13.43 | \$13.79 | \$0.361 |
| NOVEMBER | \$1.37 | $\$ 1.82$ $\$ 0.34$ | (\$0.100 | \$14.04 | \$14.14 | \$0.099 |
| DECEMBER | \$0.95 | \$1.71 | \$ $\$ 0.759$ | \$14.21 $\$ 14.42$ | \$14.09 $\$ 14.98$ | (\$0.124) |
| AVERAGE | \$1.64 | \$1.62 | (\$0.019) | \$13.53 | \$13.54 | $\frac{\$ 0.015}{}$ |
| 4-YR AVERAGE | \$1.476 | \$1.471 | (\$0.004) | \$14.662 | \$14.665 | \$0.003 |

PROTEIN PRICES PER POUND (CLASS III)

| 2003 | CURRENT |
| :--- | :---: |
| JANUARY | $\$ 1.816$ |
| FEBRUARY | $\$ 1.854$ |
| MARCH | $\$ 1.665$ |
| APRIL | $\$ 1.801$ |
| MAY | $\$ 1.928$ |
| JUNE | $\$ 1.943$ |
| JULY | $\$ 2.548$ |
| AUGUST | $\$ 3.144$ |
| SEPTEMBER | $\$ 3.318$ |
| OCTOBER | $\$ 3.282$ |
| NOVEMBER | $\$ 2.927$ |
| DECEMBER | $\$ 2.300$ |
| AVERAGE | $\$ 2.377$ |

2004

| JANUARY | $\$ 2.088$ | $\$ 2.058$ | $(\$ 0.030)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| FEBRUARY | $\$ 1.791$ | $\$ 2.107$ | $\$ 0.316$ |
| MARCH | $\$ 2.013$ | $\$ 3.270$ | $\$ 1.257$ |
| APRIL | $\$ 3.447$ | $\$ 4.117$ | $\$ 0.670$ |
| MAY | $\$ 3.764$ | $\$ 3.221$ | $(\$ 0.543)$ |
| JUNE | $\$ 3.109$ | $\$ 2.345$ | $(\$ 0.764)$ |
| JULY | $\$ 2.363$ | $\$ 1.755$ | $(\$ 0.607)$ |
| AUGUST | $\$ 2.466$ | $\$ 2.567$ | $\$ 0.101$ |
| SEPTEMBER | $\$ 2.543$ | $\$ 2.470$ | $(\$ 0.073)$ |
| OCTOBER | $\$ 2.381$ | $\$ 2.312$ | $(\$ 0.070)$ |
| NOVEMBER | $\$ 2.430$ | $\$ 2.969$ | $\$ 0.539$ |
| DECEMBER | $\$ 2.849$ | $\$ 2.392$ | $\$ 0.456)$ |
| AVERAGE | $\$ 2.604$ | $\$ 2.632$ | $\$ 0.028$ |

2005

| JANUARY | $\$ 2.530$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| FEBRUARY | $\$ 2.661$ |
| MARCH | $\$ 2.502$ |
| APRIL | $\$ 2.706$ |
| MAY | $\$ 2.597$ |
| JUNE | $\$ 2.574$ |
| JULY | $\$ 2.456$ |
| AUGUST | $\$ 2.162$ |
| SEPTEMBER | $\$ 2.301$ |
| OCTOBER | $\$ 2.378$ |
| NOVEMBER | $\$ 2.272$ |
| DECEMBER | $\$ 2.385$ |
| AVERAGE | $\$ 2.460$ |

## 2006

| JANUARY | $\$ 2.399$ | $\$ 2.224$ | $(\$ 0.176)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| FEBRUARY | $\$ 2.122$ | $\$ 1.846$ | $(\$ 0.276)$ |
| MARCH | $\$ 1.884$ | $\$ 1.825$ | $(\$ 0.059)$ |
| APRIL | $\$ 1.924$ | $\$ 1.919$ | $(\$ 0.004)$ |
| MAY | $\$ 1.912$ | $\$ 2.017$ | $\$ 0.105$ |
| JUNE | $\$ 2.079$ | $\$ 2.067$ | $(\$ 0.012)$ |
| JULY | $\$ 1.981$ | $\$ 1.925$ | $(\$ 0.056)$ |
| AUGUST | $\$ 1.905$ | $\$ 2.162$ | $\$ 0.257$ |
| SEPTEMBER | $\$ 2.135$ | $\$ 2.253$ | $\$ 0.119$ |
| OCTOBER | $\$ 2.078$ | $\$ 2.077$ | $(\$ 0.000)$ |
| NOVEMBER | $\$ 2.238$ | $\$ 2.540$ | $\$ 0.302$ |
| DECEMBER | $\$ 2.439$ | $\$ 2.373$ | $(\$ 0.066)$ |
| AVERAGE | $\$ 2.091$ | $\$ 2.102$ | $\$ 0.011$ |
| 4-YR AVERAGE | $\$ 2.383$ |  | $\$ 2.385$ |

FIGURE 1: DIFFERENCES BETWEEN MONTHLY AVERAGE CHEESE PRICES AT THE CME VS NASS AND VS PROPOSAL 14, 2003-2006


## FIGURE 2A:

## CLASS III CHEESE PRICING



CME CME CME WME


PROPOSED APRIL USES CME PRICING FOR APRIL PLUS (NASS PRICING LAGGED 2 WEEKS MINUS CME PRICES LAGGED FOUR WEEKS)

## FIGURE 2B:

CLASS I CHEESE PRICING
CURRENT APRIL USES NASS PRICING FOR FIRST TWO WEEKS OF MARCH



```
                                    CME W GME
```



PROPOSED APRIL USES CME PRICING FOR 2nd AND 3rd WEEKS OF MARCH PLUS (NASS PRICING FOR FIRST TWO WEEKS OF MARCH MINUS CME FOR LAST TWO WEEKS OF FEB.)

