Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 6, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA), Tracy Favre (TF), Jean Richardson (JR), Joe Dickson (JD), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Lisa de Lima (LD) - sitting in, Jay Feldman - sitting in,
Absent: John Foster, Vice Chair (JFo), Mac Stone (MS), Tom Chapman (TC)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015		Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.		Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. Awaiting possible revisions to petition. Due mid-September. No updated petition received.		TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. Awaiting possible revisions to petition. Due mid-September. No updated petition received.		TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.		Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009		Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14 Questions for posting	12 16 14	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests

Name	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	NA	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 Y	TR for ancillary substances will address this	NA	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	NA	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605(a) 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR Y	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"
(a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Calcium citrate (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"

Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	Y Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/MS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	NA	"
Colors	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"

Dairy Additives Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	Y	Dairy additives. TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	NA	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	NA	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	NA	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	NA	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the December 16 call
- Research Priorities
- Microorganisms (ZS) - Discuss
- WAF (HA) - Complete discussion of proposal and vote
- 2017 Sunsets - Sanitizers & Misc. Ingredients (JD)
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready
- Egg White Lysozyme (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin discuss summary/questions if any

- Casings (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Fish Oil (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** from the December 16 call were approved with no changes.
- **Research Priorities** - deferred to a later call since this is a fall 2015 project.
- **Microorganisms** (ZS) - The group discussed the draft document on microorganisms and ancillary substances, and considered public comment that was received for the last posting of this material. The members are in support of creating a complete chart of all the materials to clarify which materials are already on the National List and which are not. The following language will be included in the final version of this document "The subcommittee found no concerns regarding the continued listing of Microorganisms. The justification for this motion is that the whole NOSB needs to consider and vote on each material, rather than just a Subcommittee."

  Vote:
  Motion to remove microorganisms from §205.605
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Ancillary substances**-The group discussed the draft document that was circulated prior to the call. the lead will make some additional edits to the format and language and the group will discuss this again on Jan 27. A preference for use of organic substrate or media could be mentioned here.

- **Whole Algal Flour (WAF)** - WAF was referred back to the Subcommittee at the October 2014 meeting. A member noted that the petitioner is the manufacturer, and expressed concern over the fact that the NOSB is being asked to replace an organic material with a synthetic material. Another member noted that WAF doesn't seem to be compatible with organic principles and fails criteria number 2 for essentiality. It was noted that the group had previously classified this material as non- synthetic, but it is a highly processed substance, produced by fermentation using synthetic substrates and replaces organic food ingredients. The group consensus is that it does not satisfy criteria 2.

  Vote:
  Motion to classify WAF as petitioned as non synthetic
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: JR
  Discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add WAF as petitioned to 205.605
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: JR

Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets - Misc. ingredients** (JD)
  - Miscellaneous materials on 205.606. There are 8 materials listed on 205.606: celery powder, chia, dillweed oil, galangal (frozen), lemongrass (frozen), orange pulp (dried), peppers (chipotle chile) and Turkish bay leaves. The lead grouped the materials for review and although many of the additional questions are similar, some are specific and focused. A member noted that Chia is now widely available in organic form, and feels that this information should be included in the summary. JD offered to do some additional research regarding availability for the other materials and asked that others provide feedback as well.
  - Sanitizers - The lead reviewer noted that it was interesting and insightful to review these materials as a class instead of individually. The group discussed chlorine materials and deferred the reminder of the materials to a later call due to time constraints. Chlorine materials continue to be a complex topic. The lead noted that he included a discussion of the history of material review, including a discussion of the annotation which is problematic. The lead feels the sunset review should focus on renewal of the current annotation, acknowledging the fact that it needs to be revisited.
- **Triethyl Citrate** (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready - deferred to next call
- **Egg White Lysozyme** (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting - deferred to next call
- **2017 sunsets - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin** (ZS). Discuss summary/questions if any – deferred to Feb 2
- **Casings** (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any - deferred to next call
- **Fish Oil** (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any - deferred to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Dec 16, 2014 1:00 ET

- Activated charcoal (2016 Sunset) (HA) - Discuss and vote if ready
- Boiler Amines (2016 Sunsets) (JT/TF)- Discuss reviews for second posting
- WAF – Complete discussion of proposal and vote
- 2017 sunset items that will have no TR - Discuss
- LMalic Acid (2016 Sunset) (JD) - Discuss and vote
- SAPP (2016 Sunset) (JD) - Discuss and vote
- Paracetic Acid (2016 Sunset) (JFo) - Discuss and vote
- Ammonium Hydroxide (JR) - Vote on listing motion
- Microorganisms (ZS) - Discuss

Jan 6, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2016 sunset - (ZS) Microorganisms - Discuss/vote
- WAF - Complete discussion of proposal and vote
- Casings (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Fish Oil (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Egg White Lysozyme (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting

- PGME (JR) - Discuss TR if it is available
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready
- JD will discuss and transfer his 2017 Sunset Materials (Sanitizers and Misc Ingredients)
- Research Priorities

Jan 20, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 Sunset (JD) - continued: Phosphoric acid, Hydrogen Peroxide, Ozone and Sulfur Dioxide
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready
- Egg White Lysozyme (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting
- Casings (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Fish Oil (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- PGME (JR) status update
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Colors - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Filtering Aids: Attapulgite, Bentonite, Diatomaceous earth, Kaolin, Perlite, Glycerin
- 2017 Sunset (JR) – DryingAgents: Diglycerides, Magnesium stearate, Monoglycerides
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Flavors
- 2017 Sunset - (HA) Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic

Jan 27, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- Ancillary substances. Revisit the draft doc and possibly vote.
- Paracetic Acid (2016 Sunset) (TC/JR) - Discuss and vote
- Triethyl Citrate (JR)- vote
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates,
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins&Mins: Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate, Nutrient vitamins and minerals,
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols
- 2017 Sunsets (MS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any

Feb 2, 2015 1:00 ET - Moved from Feb 3

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (MS) - Minerals: Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates - discuss summary/questions if any

Feb 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Gases: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Enzymes - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate
- 2017 sunsets (TC) – Dairy: Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate, Dairy cultures

Feb 24, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015						
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010	FILTERING AGENT		
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995	FILTERING AGENT		
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF		VITAMINS & MINERALS		
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995	FILTERING AGENT		
Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005			
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995	FILTERING AGENT		
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996	FILTERING AGENT		
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), (a)Sodium bicarbonate, (a)Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N	Leavening agents		
(a) Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, (a) Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate,	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT~~/MS	Y Lmtd scope	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted		

Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates						
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, (a)Nitrogen, (a)Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y	Gases		
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995	VITAMINS & MINERALS		
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2008	SANITIZERS		
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2006	SANITIZERS		
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2006	SANITIZERS		
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	JD/AS		SANITIZERS		
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2006	SANITIZERS		
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS		SANITIZERS		
Ozone	205.605(b)	JD/AS		SANITIZERS		
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013	FILTERING AGENT		
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995	DRYING		
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	JD/TC	2011	PRESERVATIVES, THICKENERS		
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y			
Casings	205.606	JR				
Celery powder	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Dillweed oil	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums. Combined TR. NO TR contracted		
Galangal, frozen	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	JD/TC	None	MISC. INGREDIENTS		
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995	GUMS, THICKENING AGENTS		
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None	GUMS, THICKENING AGENTS		
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None	GUMS, THICKENING AGENTS		
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None	GUMS, THICKENING AGENTS		
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002	GUMS, THICKENING AGENTS		
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995	GUMS, THICKENING AGENTS		
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None	GUMS, THICKENING AGENTS		
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009	PRESERVATIVES, THICKENERS		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 20, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA), John Foster, Vice Chair (JFo), Tracy Favre (TF), Jean Richardson (JR), Joe Dickson (JD), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Mac Stone (MS), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in
Lisa de Lima (LD) - sitting in, Ashley Swaffar (AS) - sitting in
Absent: Jennifer Taylor (JT)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015		Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.		Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. Awaiting possible revisions to petition. Due mid-September. No updated petition received.	N/A	TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. Awaiting possible revisions to petition. Due mid-September. No updated petition received.	N/A	TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	Vote scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14 Questions for posting	12 16 14	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"

Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"
2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes**	**Summary discussion**	**Meeting**
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/MS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 01 27 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"

Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR Y	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums. Combined TR	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Dairy Additives Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	Y	Dairy additives. TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 Y	TR for ancillary substances will address this	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"

(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT/~~MS	Y Lmtd scope	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	Scheduled for 02 02 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Continued discussion scheduled for 02 02 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	Y Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 01 27 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes**	**Summary discussion**	**Meeting**
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005		Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	"
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		Scheduled for 01 27 15	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2008		01 20 15	"
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2006		01 20 15	"
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2006		01 20 15	"
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	JD/AS			01 20 15	"

Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	JD/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	JD/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		Scheduled for 01 27 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	JD/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	JD/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the January 6 call
- 2017 Sunset (JD) - continued: Phosphoric acid, Hydrogen Peroxide, Ozone and Sulfur Dioxide
- Egg White Lysozyme (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting
- Casings (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Fish Oil (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- PGME (JR) status update
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Filtering Aids:
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - DryingAgents: Diglycerides, Magnesium stearate, Monoglycerides
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Flavors
- 2017 Sunset - (HA) Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready
- Adjourn

Discussion

- The Chair extended thanks to the two outgoing members, John Foster and Joe Dickson, for their dedication and service to the NOSB and the Handling Subcommittee.
- **Notes** from the January 6 call approved with no changes.
- **Chlorine** materials (JD) (Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide and Sodium hypochlorite). The lead sent some additional information/language regarding chlorine materials clarifying the decision of the HS, which will be included in the first posting of this material. Since this has a complex history the HS feels that the additional information will be helpful. The NOP will provide some feedback.
- **2017 Sunset - Sanitizers (JD)**
    - **Phosphoric Acid**: Phosphoric acid seems to be the least objectionable sanitizer. Members discussed the standardized language to be included in the posting, and agreed to talk offline to determine how best to move forward.
    - **Hydrogen peroxide**: Used in place of chlorine, although there are instances when chlorine is preferable as Hydrogen peroxide is corrosive to metal.
    - **Ozone**: Ideal option as a sanitizer but because it is so short lived and must be generated on-site, it is not always practical.

- **Sulfur dioxide**: This material has been discussed thoroughly and the group feels that there haven't been any changes since the last petition in 2011.

- **2016 Sunset - Egg White Lysozyme (EWL)** (TF) - The review and checklist were sent to the members prior to last call, with additional information to address the concern by some commenters about sources of the egg white and the availability of organic egg whites for use in EWL production. One member noted that this is a minor ingredient that is highly purified, and feels it is unnecessary to require an organic source. Members proceeded to vote on this material.

  Vote:

  Motion to remove EWL from §205.605(a)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset Casings** (JR) - Natural casings, washed with water, no chemicals. The lead added several specific questions regarding availability and use.
- **2017 Sunset Fish Oil** (JR) - The members discussed the inclusion of six very difficult, broad questions related to this material. The consensus is that much of the feedback would come from manufacturers since the questions may not be answerable by members of the general public. The HS is waiting for a TR, with the hope that they can have more discussion and be able to revise questions before posting the review.
- PGME (JR) status update - deferred
- **2017 Sunset - Filtering Aids (JR):** All listed as processing aids.
  - **Attapulgite** - Used as a processing aid in the handling of plant and animal oils. In a previous recommendation this materials was found to satisfy all applicable evaluation criteria for consistency with organic handling practices. There was no public comment opposing its listing
  - **Bentonite** - Mined by open pit mining and thus, as with Attapulgite, adverse environmental impacts are possible although there are regulations in place to mitigate these. The HS will seek additional information regarding essentiality. A member noted that bentonite is also essential as a seed coating, and some certifiers treat this process as a handling operation. (The NOP noted that seed used as a crop input must meet crop standards, and bentonite is considered nonsynthetic and allowed in crop production)
  - **Kaolin** - Mined by open pit mining and thus, as with Attapulgite and bentonite, adverse environmental impacts are possible. The HS will seek additional information regarding essentiality.
  - **Diatomaceous earth** (DE) - Widely used throughout the industry as a food filtering aid only. Relisted in 2005 and 2010. All DE is removed during filtering of water, vegetable oils, sugars, syrups, honey, beer etc. As with bentonite, attapulgite and kaolin, human health can be impacted if excessive amounts are breathed into lungs. No additional information is sought by the Subcommittee. DE is also used as a nonsynthetic substance in post-harvest crop handling, such as grain storage.
  - **Perlite** - For use only as a filter aid in food processing. Perlite is amorphous volcanic glass. It is an excellent filtering aid and often substitutes for DE in filtering beer. No additional information is being sought by the Subcommittee.
  - **Glycerin** - produced by hydrolysis of fats and oils. The NOSB has been working on several aspects of Glycerin arising out of a 2013 petition to remove. The HS is seeking additional information regarding essentiality. Discussion deferred to next call

- **2017 Sunset (JR) – Drying Agents: Magnesium stearate** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - (HA) Leavening Agents:** Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic- deferred to next call
- **Triethyl Citrate (JR)** - Discuss checklist/vote if ready - deferred to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Jan 6, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2016 sunset - (ZS) Microorganisms - Discuss/vote
- WAF - Complete discussion of proposal and vote
- Casings (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Fish Oil (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Egg White Lysozyme (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting
- PGME (JR) - Discuss TR if it is available
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready
- JD will discuss and transfer his 2017 Sunset Materials (Sanitizers and Misc Ingredients)
- Research Priorities

Jan 20, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 Sunset (JD) – continued: Phosphoric acid, Hydrogen Peroxide, Ozone and Sulfur Dioxide
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready
- Egg White Lysozyme (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting
- Casings (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Fish Oil (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- PGME (JR) status update
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Filtering Aids: Attapulgite, Bentonite, Diatomaceous earth, Kaolin, Perlite, Glycerin
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Magnesium stearate
- 2017 Sunset - (HA) Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic

Jan 27, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunset (HA) - Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Diatomaceous earth - clarify use of language regarding cross-posting.
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Glycerin
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Magnesium stearate
- 2016 Sunset (TC/JR) - Paracetic Acid - Discuss and vote
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Colors - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Flavors
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Revisit the draft doc and possibly vote.
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Diglycerides, Monoglycerides
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates,

- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins&Mins: Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate, Nutrient vitamins and minerals,
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols
- 2017 Sunsets (MS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any

Feb 2, 2015 1:00 ET - Moved from Feb 3

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (MS) - Minerals: Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunset (TC) - Complete follow up on Chia (Misc Ingredients)

Feb 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials (Gums, Pectin, Cornstarch (native), Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Sweet potato starch, Gelatin, Kelp, Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Xanthan Gum)
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Gases: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene; Enzymes - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy: Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate, Dairy cultures

Feb 24, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - vote

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 27, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tracy Favre (TF); Jean Richardson (JR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS)
Absent: Mac Stone (MS)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. Suff due 03 31 15		Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.		Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb.	N/A	TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb.	N/A	TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14 Questions for posting	12 16 14	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"

Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"
2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes**	**Summary discussion**	**Meeting**
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	"

Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR Y	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	"
Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums. Combined TR	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Sufficiency due 03 06 15	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Sufficiency due 03 06 15	Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	Scheduled for 02 17 15	

Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 Y	TR for ancillary substances will address this	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT/~~JR	Y Lmtd scope	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	Scheduled for 02 02 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"

Fish oil	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Continued discussion scheduled for 02 02 15	“
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	Y Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 02 15	“

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	“
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005		01 27 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen,	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“

Oxygen						
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		Scheduled for 02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“

Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: scheduled for 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the January 20 call
- 2017 Sunset (HA) - Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Glycerin
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Magnesium stearate
- 2016 Sunset (TC/JR) - Peracetic Acid - Discuss and vote
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Colors - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Flavors
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Revisit the draft doc and possibly vote.
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Diglycerides, Monoglycerides
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates,
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Ferrous sulfate, Nutrient vitamins and minerals, Potassium chloride, Potassium
- Iodide; Calcium chloride, Ascorbic acid
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols
- 2017 Sunsets (MS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** from the January 20 call approved with no changes.
- TF will resend the Egg White Lysozyme (EWL) doc that had some minor edits from the last call.
- The HS received two TRs (for the dairy additives- Inulin-oligofructose enriched and Fructooligosaccharides). The HS Chair asked that the lead read through the TRs and provide a sufficiency review for the next call.
- Several materials have been reassigned to ZS and JR (yeast and minerals)
- **2017 Sunset (JR) -** Glycerin, document was circulated earlier in the month. HS will request public comment consisting of the standard questions regarding essentiality and use.
- **2017 Sunset (JR) -** Magnesium stearate. The document was circulated on Jan 22. A member noted that it is approved for use in "made with organic" products, and another member indicated that it is really only used in supplements. The group agreed that the more useful questions to ask would be: who is using it and why it is important? HS will add questions to the posting.
- **2017 Sunset (JR)** Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. The document was circulated to the members in January, and the HS is currently waiting for a limited scope TR. Used in drum drying of foods. A member noted that these materials are in use. The group discussed ancillary substances and the questions they will add to the posted document for public comment.
- **2017 Sunset (HA) - Leavening Agents:** Seven materials reviewed together in old TAPs. No new TRs were requested.
    - **Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate -** Widely used. No issues with relisting.
    - **Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate -** Used in small amount and are completely eliminated in the baking process. There are no alternatives. HS has no issues with relisting.
    - **Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic.** The 2012 review included a comment expressing concern over the fact that these materials are mined. The lead would like to include questions about any changes in source or manufacturing processes.
- **2016 Sunset (TC/JR) - Peracetic Acid**. Widely used. Comments from a wide segment of the community were all positive and didn't include any new info. Members discussed ancillary substances and the NOP noted that this is a registered pesticide. A member asked for clarification about the distinction between inerts and ancillary substances in handling: if a material is a registered pesticide, non-active ingredients are considered inert. NOP noted that the current annotation for handling references FDA limitations, which define the permitted stabilizer. Peracetic Acid is on the Crops sunset list too, and the inerts would be reviewed as per 205.601(m).. The chair referenced the April 11, 2013 NOP memo on ancillary substances. Members moved to a vote.

    Motion to remove Peracetic Acid (CAS # 79–21–0), from §205.605b
    Motion by: TC
    Seconded by: ZS
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset (JR) - Colors.** Waiting for TR, which is due in Feb. The draft document was circulated in January and although there were preliminary questions included, they may change based on the TR. There is no requirement that the colors are derived from agricultural crops that are grown

organically. Members discussed several questions about supply and essentiality. A member noted that the answers to those questions will vary based on the color, and asked if the HS would review the colors only as a group or individually. The lead will modify the questions so they reflect that the HS is asking about colors individually. Members also discussed the need to identify all CAS numbers, (which will be included in the table in the TR) and also removed reference to annatto, which was recently removed from the National List (effective Nov 14, 2014).

- **2017 Sunset (JR) - Flavors.** The HS did not request a new TR. The lead included historical information in the review, and provided a number of questions related to continuing need, availability of organic forms.
- **Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS).** Revisit the draft doc and possibly vote. Deferred to Feb 2
- **2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates -** Deferred to Feb 2
- **2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins & Mins (Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Nutrient vitamins and minerals); Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate,** - Deferred to Feb 2
- **2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols -** Deferred to Feb 2
- **2017 Sunsets (MS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any -** Deferred to Feb 2
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Jan 20, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 Sunset (JD) – continued: Phosphoric acid, Hydrogen Peroxide, Ozone and Sulfur Dioxide
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - Discuss checklist/vote if ready
- Egg White Lysozyme (2016 Sunset) (TF) - Discuss review for second posting
- Casings (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Fish Oil (JR) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Filtering Aids: Attapulgite, Bentonite, Diatomaceous earth, Kaolin, Perlite, Glycerin
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Magnesium stearate
- 2017 Sunset - (HA) Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic

Jan 27, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunset (HA) - Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Glycerin
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Magnesium stearate
- 2016 Sunset (TC/JR) - Peracetic Acid - Discuss and vote
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Colors - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Flavors
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Revisit the draft doc and possibly vote.
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Diglycerides, Monoglycerides
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates,

- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins & Mins (Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Nutrient vitamins and minerals); Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate, - Deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols
- 2017 Sunsets (MS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any

Feb 2, 2015 1:00 ET - Moved from Feb 3

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals: Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 Sunset (TC) - Complete follow up on Chia (Misc Ingredients)
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Revisit the draft doc and vote.
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates,
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins & Mins (Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Nutrient vitamins and minerals); Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate, - Deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any

Feb 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials (Gums, Pectin, Cornstarch (native), Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Sweet potato starch, Gelatin, Kelp, Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Xanthan Gum)
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Gases: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene; Enzymes - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy: Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate, Dairy cultures

Feb 24, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - vote

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

- PGME status update (JR)

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015

Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 2, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS)
Absent: Jean Richardson (JR); Mac Stone (MS)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. TR suff due 03 31 15		Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.		Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb.	N/A	TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb.	N/A	TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14 Questions for posting	12 16 14	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"

Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"
2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes**	**Summary discussion**	**Meeting**
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Scheduled for 02 17 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"

Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR Y	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Rescheduled for 02 17 15	"
Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums. Combined TR	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Sufficiency due 03 06 15	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Sufficiency due 03 06 15	Scheduled for 02 17 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	Scheduled for 02 17 15	

Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 Y	TR for ancillary substances will address this	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 02 15 Will continue discussion of nutrient vit and mins 02 24 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT/~~JR	Y Lmtd scope	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	Scheduled for 02 17 15	"

Fish oil	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Continued discussion scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	Y Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	Scheduled for 02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR rqst?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005		01 27 15	"
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	"
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	"
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"

Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	“

Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		Scheduled for 02 17 15	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Voted 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the January 27 call
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Vote.
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Vitamins & Mins (Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Nutrient vitamins and minerals); Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals: Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 Sunset (TC) - Complete follow up on Chia (Misc Ingredients)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** from the January 27 call approved with no changes.

- **Ancillary substances for Microorganisms** (ZS). Members discussed some minor updates made to the document since the last call and proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to approve the Ancillary Substances Permitted in Microorganisms proposal
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: TC
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0
  Motion carries

  Motion to amend the National List at 205.605(a) to state: Microorganisms - any food grade bacteria, fungi, and other microorganism; Organic sources for ancillary substances must be used when available.
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: TF
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0
  Motion carries

- **2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates.** Natural forms that come from seaweed. Alginates are synthetic, and while Alginic acid is not synthetic, the salts of Alginic acid are. The lead will not finalize the summaries until the TR is available. The HS will revisit these materials on Feb 17
- **2017 Sunsets (TF) - Vitamins & Minerals** (listed on 205.605)
  - Calcium chloride. Essential, still in use, no organic alternatives.
  - Potassium chloride. No additional questions.
  - Potassium iodide. No additional questions.
  - Ascorbic acid. TR was contracted for vitamin C. Ubiquitous and common.
  - Ferrous sulfate. 205.603(a). Iron enrichment. Will not ask additional questions beyond the standard ones.
- **2017 Sunsets (TF) - Nutrient vitamins and minerals category**, 205.605(b). No TR yet. Will defer to a later call.
- **2017 Sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols.** Listed at 205.605(b) with annotation. The NOSB recommended relisting in 2012, and a new limited scope TR was requested in 2013.
- **2017 sunsets (ZS) – Waxes, (Carnauba Wax, and wood rosin), Orange shellac - unbleached.** Technical correction is needed for wood rosin, as it is listed as "resin". The lead noted that Carnauba wax was never reviewed for agricultural/non-agricultural classification; it was only reviewed for Crops as synthetic or nonsynthetic. Since the NOSB voted to add it to Crops to be non-synthetic, and the NOP added it as a handling material, the lead reviewer feels this issue needs to be addressed. She added that there is organic carnauba wax, and will send a request to NOP to add the reclassification of carnauba wax to the workplan. She indicated that Alginates is a potential candidate for a correction as well. The HS Chair emphasized the need to make it clear in the documents that the HS intends on moving forward with the review as is, but intends on working on future proposals to reclassify these materials. ZS will add this language about a future proposal for an annotation change and forward it to the HS Chair, who will send to NOP.
- **2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals:** Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates - discuss summary/questions if any - deferred to next call

- **2017 Sunset (JR) - Diglycerides, Monoglycerides**. Discuss TR sufficiency. Deferred to next call.
- **2017 Sunset (TC) - Misc Ingredients** follow up. The HS discussed the list of Miscellaneous ingredients which includes the following: Celery powder, Chia (Salvia hispanica L.), Dillweed oil, Frozen Galangal, Frozen Lemongrass, Orange pulp (dried), Peppers (Chipotle chile), and Turkish bay leaves. The group discussed the materials in light of commercial availability and indicated that they are not inclined to delist Orange Pulp or Frozen Lemon Grass, but the remainder could be removed because organic alternatives exist and are readily available. The lead will add some questions to the posting for Celery powder, as commercial availability varies depending on its use, and also add questions about Frozen Galangal and why dried or fresh is not used in place of frozen. TC will make the changes and send to HA for review and then to MA.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Jan 27, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 Sunset (HA) - Leavening Agents: Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate, Calcium phosphate dibasic, Calcium phosphate monobasic, Calcium phosphate tribasic
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Glycerin
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Magnesium stearate
- 2016 Sunset (TC/JR) - Peracetic Acid - Discuss and vote
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Colors - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Flavors
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Revisit the draft doc and possibly vote.
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Diglycerides, Monoglycerides
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates,
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins & Mins (Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Nutrient vitamins and minerals); Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate, - Deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols
- 2017 Sunsets (MS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any-moved to Feb 17

Feb 2, 2015 1:00 ET - Moved from Feb 3

- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Vote.- completed
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals: Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 Sunset (TC) - Complete follow up on Chia (Misc Ingredients)
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Revisit the draft doc and vote.
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins & Mins (Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Nutrient vitamins and minerals); Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols

Feb 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials (Gums, Pectin, Cornstarch (native), Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Sweet potato starch, Gelatin, Kelp, Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Xanthan Gum) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Gases: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene; Enzymes - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate- discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy: Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate, Dairy cultures discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.

Feb 24, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- Nutrient vitamins and minerals (TF) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - vote
- PGME - TR sufficiency (JR)

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 17, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Mac Stone (MS)
Absent: Tracy Favre (TF)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. TR suff due 03 31 15. TR found suff 02 17 15		Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.		Proposal Spr 2015?
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15	N/A	TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15	N/A	TBD
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	JR		Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15.		TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14 Questions for posting	12 16 14	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"

Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"
2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes**	**Summary discussion**	**Meeting**
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"

Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR Y	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	"
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums. Combined TR. Not contracted.	02 17 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	

Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	Rescheduled for 02 24 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 Y	TR for ancillary substances will address this	02 17 15. Continued discussion scheduled 02 24 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	02 17 15. Continued discussion scheduled 02 24 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 02 15 Will continue discussion of nutrient vit and mins 02 24 15	"

Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT~~/JR	Y Lmtd scope	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	02 17 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	02 17 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	Continued discussion rescheduled for 02 24 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	Y Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	Scheduled for 02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"

Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005		01 27 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y	Not contracted	02 17 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“

Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		02 17 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		02 17 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		02 17 15	“

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Pckging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 2 call
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals: Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials (Gums, Pectin, Cornstarch (native), Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Sweet potato starch, Gelatin, Kelp, Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Xanthan Gum) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Gases: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene; Enzymes - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate- discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy: Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate, Dairy cultures discuss TR sufficiency, and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** from the February 2 call were approved with no changes
- **Flavors (JR):** The NOSB received a petition on Feb 3 for flavors requesting the addition of an annotation. The lead reviewed the petition and found it sufficient. She also noted that she re-reviewed the sunset listing for flavors, and believes that the HS does not need to alter the questions for posting. The group discussed the need for a TR and the NOP recommended they request one. Members also discussed the review with regard to ancillary substances.
- **PGME:** TR for PGME was determined to be sufficient and meets the criteria in OFPA. JR will complete a checklist and the group will discuss it on Feb 24
- **2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals**. Eleven materials. No TRs were requested, although the group feels that it could have been helpful. The group discussed each material and the lead will adjust some of the questions and recirculate the document to the group.
    - **Calcium carbonate:** Used to remove acidity in wine and as supplements and antacids. No questions will be added.
    - **Magnesium sulfate**: Members discussed this material which is also on the National List for crop use. According to the 2011 TR it is essential in tofu production. A member suggested adding questions to the posting to see if nonsynthetic forms are still available and it is currently being used.
    - **Calcium hydroxide**: Used as a component part of aluminum free baking powder as well as other uses. No additional questions will be asked.
    - **Magnesium carbonate**: synthetic, allowed in Made with Organic products, used as a drying agent, carrier, anticaking agent. . The HS feels this does not appear to be essential to

organic handling and therefore, based on public comment it receives at the spring 2015 meeting, may propose to remove it from the NL. The HS will add questions for posting.

- **Magnesium chloride**: The group discussed this material which has many uses, including as a firming agent for tofu. There appears to be some discrepancy over the classification. The HS will add some questions to the posting seeking information about essentiality and alternatives. The lead noted that the 1999 TAP was not posted on the website.
- **Potassium acid tartrate**: The lead noted various names for this material. It is not clear how potassium acid tartrate is manufactured. The NOP will clarify the correct nomenclature. The HS will ask some additional questions for the spring 2015 meeting.
- **Potassium carbonate**: Used in the Dutch alkali process in manufacture of cocoa and chocolate, can be used in soft drinks, confections, pH control, and as a leavening agent, and can also be used as a boiler additive. No TR was requested. The HS will add a question for posting.
- **Potassium citrate**: Listed in synthetic form. The 1995 TAP is very limited and does not address all OFPA criteria. Phosphates can replace citrates, and citrates cause less environmental damage than phosphates during manufacture. No additional information will be requested.
- **Potassium phosphate**: Listed on 205.605(b) with an annotation restricting its use in "organic" products, and only allowing it in "made with" organic. Used for pH control in milk and as an antimicrobial in yeast. The HS will add a question for posting.
- **Sodium hydroxide**: The 1995 TAP indicates that Sodium Hydroxide is toxic and caustic. It is used as a processing aid to adjust pH, and used in production of pretzels and cocoa. The HS will add a question to the posting about essentiality and impacts of removal.
- **Sodium phosphates**: Sodium phosphate allowed for dairy use only. The HS will add a question to the posting about essentiality and impacts of removal.

- **2017 Sunset (JR) - Diglycerides, Monoglycerides**. The TR was found sufficient and the HS chair will notify the NOP
- **2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials.** The lead reviewed the materials that are on 205.606 of the National List. Some of the materials are awaiting TRs, some will be posted as is without additional questions since the HS found no concerns with continued listing, and some will be posted with additional questions seeking information about essentiality.
  - **Gums, water extract only**: Guar and locust bean gums are now available in organic form and the HS is considering a separate proposal that an organic source must be used if commercially available. Will ask additional questions.
  - **Pectin**: Waiting for limited scope TR which is in development.
  - **Cornstarch (native):** The HS will add a question for public comment.
  - **Seaweed:** No additional questions
  - **Pacific kombu**: No additional questions
  - **Wakame seaweed**: No additional questions
  - **Sweet potato starch**: The HS will add one question about commercial availability of organic forms.
  - **Gelatin:** The lead noted that the petitions were for fish gelatin although all forms (meat) were added to the NL. The NOP noted that a TR was completed and did include meat (bovine, porcine) gelatin. The HS found no concerns and will not pose any extra questions for comment.
  - **Kelp:** The lead noted an inconsistency on the NL since Wakame and Kombu were added to the NL separately without the annotation that kelp has. The HS will ask questions pertaining to the relevance of the annotation and is considering proposing to remove the annotation at a future time.

- **Konjac flour**: The HS will pose questions regarding availability of organic and use.
- **Lecithin - de-oiled**: Very complex history with regard to the National List. Petition to remove was submitted in 2009. Commercial availability of organic unbleached lecithin was mentioned in last review, and the HS will pose questions to follow up to determine if there are organic forms available.
- **Xanthan Gum**: The HS will ask a question regarding ancillary substances

- **2017 sunsets (LD)**
  - **Gases**: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene. No additional questions except for Ethylene. Ethylene was approved in 1995 with the intention that it would eventually be removed from the list. A member noted that it was added to the list in two stages: First for bananas then for post-harvest handling, and its use for citrus greening was included in the latter. The HS is considering proposing to remove the use for greening of citrus.
  - **Enzymes** - A member suggested adding a table to the review that includes the functional classes of ancillary substances, as was done with microorganisms. ZS noted that she has spec sheets and will assist LD in compiling the chart while they are awaiting the limited scope TR.
- **2017 sunsets (AS)** - **Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate**. Deferred to next call.
- **2017 sunsets (TC) - Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate.** Deferred to next call.
- **2017 sunsets Dairy cultures (TC)** - Similar to enzymes. ZS noted that she has spec sheets and will assist TC in compiling the chart while they are awaiting the TR.
- **2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast** - discuss TR and summary/questions if any. Deferred to next call.
- **2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR)** - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions. Deferred to next call.
- **2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates.** Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review. Deferred to next call.
- **Tocopherols** (TF) - TR was found sufficient as noted in TFs email prior to the call. Discussion deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Feb 2, 2015 1:00 ET - Moved from Feb 3

- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Vote. Completed.
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Carnauba Wax, orange shellac, wood rosin discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals: Calcium carbonate, Magnesium sulfate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Drying Agents: Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 Sunset (TC) - Complete follow up on Chia (Misc Ingredients)
- Ancillary substances for Microorganisms (ZS). Revisit the draft doc and vote.

- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Vitamins & Mins (Calcium chloride, Potassium chloride, Potassium iodide, Nutrient vitamins and minerals); Ascorbic acid, Ferrous sulfate
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols

Feb 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials (Gums, Pectin, Cornstarch (native), Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Sweet potato starch, Gelatin, Kelp, Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Xanthan Gum) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Gases: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene; Enzymes - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate- discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate, Dairy cultures discuss TR sufficiency, and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.

Feb 24, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate - discuss TR sufficiency and summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate,
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy cultures - Discuss TR sufficiency, and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Nutrient vitamins and minerals - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols - Discuss TR Sufficiency
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - vote
- PGME – Review draft proposal (JR)

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

- Flavors petition. Discuss request for TR (due 04 06 15)
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015

Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 24, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS)
Absent: Mac Stone (MS)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. TR suff due 03 31 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15	N/A	TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15	N/A	TBD
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	JR		Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15.		TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14. The HS will not request a new TR. Questions for posting	12 16 14	"

Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"
Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests

Name	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFe~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 24 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"

Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	02 24 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 Y	TR for ancillary substances will address this	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP	02 02 15 & 02 24 15	"

Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT~~/JR	Y Lmtd scope	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	02 17 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	02 17 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"

Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005		01 27 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y	Not contracted	02 17 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		02 17 15	“

Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	"
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	"
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums.	02 17 15	"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	"
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	"
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	"
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		02 17 15	"
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	"
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	"
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		02 17 15	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Pckging substances used in organic food	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

handling - including BPA			

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 17 call
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate - discuss TR sufficiency and summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate,
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy cultures - Discuss TR sufficiency, and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Nutrient vitamins and minerals - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols - Discuss TR Sufficiency
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - vote
- PGME - Review draft proposal (JR)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the February 17** call were approved as written.
- **2017 sunsets (AS).** The HS found the TR for food acids sufficient. The lead had no additional questions to add to the summaries for Citric acid, Lactic acid, or Calcium citrate, but will add one additional question about alternatives for Sodium Citrate
- **2017 sunsets (TC)**
    - **Fructooligosaccharides (FOS):** The TR was found sufficient. FOS is fiber derived from inulin via different processes. The HS added questions about ancillary substances and demand.
    - **Inulin-oligofructose enriched**: The TR lacked info about organic alternatives but was otherwise found sufficient. The HS added a couple of questions to the summary.
    - **Whey protein concentrate:** Organic alternatives are not commercially available. Still awaiting a TR.
    - **Dairy cultures:** Waiting for TR. The HS feels that this material is addressed in the TR for microorganisms. The group added some questions to the summary and a member recommended including the chart, with some modifications, that was included in the microorganisms summary. ZS and TC will work together offline. The lead reviewer asked about enzymes since there is overlap with both dairy cultures and microorganisms. The same chart will be added to the enzymes summary.
- **2017 Sunsets (ZS)**
    - **Yeast.** Yeast was previously petitioned for removal and instead, the annotation was changed. The HS included several questions as well as the chart for the ancillary substances for the posting. The group discussed the difficulties associated with yeast because there are many forms, and acknowledged that in this instance they are reviewing yeast as a whole, and are not reviewing variations. The TR info has been available since 2010. The lead will make some minor edits and forward the finalized document to the NOP.
- **2017 Sunset (JR)**
    - **Fish Oil.** The TR for fish oil is still pending. The document will be submitted as is.

- **Colors. The lead indicated that the TR** was sufficient and the questions the HS already posed will be included in the posted version of the review. The group discussed the presentation of the 17 colors, and will group some of these by category for discussion at the spring meeting. Members also discussed the inclusion of a question about CAS numbers# and chose to strike this question as it has been asked before.

- **2017 Sunsets (TF)**
  - **Alginic acid, Alginates.** The TR was received Feb 2 and the lead reviewer found it sufficient. The HS will present the info they have found to date and will try to incorporate the data from the TR before the proposal deadline. The lead noted that based on the draft Materials Classification Guidance, both materials might be considered synthetic. A member felt that the guidance was not clear, so the HS will add questions for public comment.
- **Nutrient vitamins and minerals.** Members discussed the previous review of this material and noted the TR will help clarify some questions. A member noted that vitamins can contain ancillary substances and will add a question about this.
- **Tocopherols.** The TR was found sufficient on the last call. The lead noted that the TR discussed solvent extraction.
- **Triethyl Citrate (JR).** The HS discussed this material in November 2014. Triethyl Citrate is a processing aid used to stiffen egg whites, and the lead noted that because there are organic alternatives it fails the OFPA criteria of essentiality. The members proceeded to a vote:

  Motion to classify Triethyl Citrate as petitioned as synthetic
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: ZS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  Motion to list Triethyl Citrate as petitioned at 205.605 without annotation
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: ZS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  Motion fails.

- **PGME (JR).** Boiler additive petitioned for addition to 205.605(b). PGME does come in contact with food, as was petition. The petitioner requested a restrictive annotation for boiler use only. There are no human health concerns, and no natural alternatives per se, but the lead feels that it is not necessarily essential as there are other boiler water additives. The HS is seeking public comment on the proposal to not add PGME to the NL.

  Motion to classify Polyalkylene Glycol Monobutyl Ether (PGME) (CAS # 9038-95-3) as petitioned a synthetic
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: TF
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add PGME at 205.605(b) with the following annotation: with molecular weight greater than 1500, for use as a boiler additive in pelleted feed production

Motion by: JR
Seconded by: TF
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion fails

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Feb 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Minerals
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Diglycerides, Monoglycerides. Discuss TR sufficiency.
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - 205.606 materials (Gums, Pectin, Cornstarch (native), Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Sweet potato starch, Gelatin, Kelp, Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Xanthan Gum) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Gases: Nitrogen, Oxygen, Carbon dioxide, Ethylene; Enzymes - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate- discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate, Dairy cultures discuss TR sufficiency, and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.

Feb 24, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate - discuss TR sufficiency and summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate,
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy cultures - Discuss TR sufficiency, and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Nutrient vitamins and minerals - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols - Discuss TR Sufficiency
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - vote
- PGME – Review draft proposal (JR)

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

- Flavors petition. Discuss request for TR (due 04 06 15)
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes draft
Tuesday, March 3, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Tracy Favre (TF)
Absent: Mac Stone (MS)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. TR suff due 03 31 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	Y	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Flavors	205.605(a)	JR		Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015

Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14. The HS will not request a new TR. Questions for posting	12 16 14	"

Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"
Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests

Name	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFe~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 24 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"

Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	02 24 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 Y	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	02 02 15 & 02 24 15	"

Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT~~/JR	Y Lmtd scope	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	02 17 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	02 17 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	Y	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015	02 24 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"

Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005		01 27 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y	Not contracted	02 17 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		02 17 15	“

Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums.	02 17 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		02 17 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		02 17 15	“

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Pckging substances used in organic food	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

handling - including BPA			

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 24 call
- Flavors petition. Discuss request for TR
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals TR Sufficiency Determination
- Discuss any other TR's or petitions
- Discuss public comments and how to find them
- Petitioned materials discussion, 2016 Sunset materials discussion in preparation for April meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the February 24** call were not available for review.
- **Flavors petition**. The HS will request a new TR for this material.
- **Ancillary substances.** The lead will make some minor changes to the proposal and resend it to the NOP for posting.
- **Sodium Lactate/ Potassium Lactate.** The lead thought that the TR was very well done, and the HS found it sufficient. The NOP sent a request in June to add these materials to the workplan and allowed the petitioners, who petitioned these materials in 2000, the opportunity to add any additional information or make changes. The NOP informed the petitioner in 2004 that the substances were considered approved without appearing on the National List, but is now asking NOSB to review them to be consistent with current materials review policy. The petitioners did not submit any comments. The HS Chair is the lead reviewer and has begun a checklist.
- **2017 Sunset: Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals.** The TR was very comprehensive and the lead finds it sufficient. This determination was relayed by TF via email and the HS members agreed. A member asked that the TR be posted ASAP. **Other TR's or petitions:**
    - BPA - The lead indicated that she will not have a draft ready in March as originally expected and would like to schedule a discussion for May
- **Public comments** and how to find them. The DFO explained briefly how to access Regulations.gov and how to review public comments
- **Research Priorities** - The NOSB Chair requested time on the schedule to discuss the research priorities and another member suggested they also have an in-person conversation at the La Jolla meeting. A representative from National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) will be at the April 2015 meeting to talk about how the USDA is working with the NOSBs research priorities. A member asked if the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) would be a better avenue than NIFA when it comes to priorities that are focused on food handling and processing, as well as research.
- Petitioned materials discussion/2016 Sunset materials discussion – The Chair asked that in preparation for April meeting members look at their work calendars and identify any conflicts so the HS can arrange the discussion schedule accordingly.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Feb 24, 2015 1:00 ET - Additional call

- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Food Acids: Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate - discuss TR sufficiency and summary/questions if any
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate,
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Dairy cultures - Discuss TR sufficiency, and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (ZS) - Yeast - discuss TR and summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset Fish Oil (JR) - discuss TR if ready/follow up on questions
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Alginic acid, Alginates. Discuss TR sufficiency and revisit review.
- 2017 Sunsets (TF) - Nutrient vitamins and minerals - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - (TF) - Tocopherols - Discuss TR Sufficiency
- Triethyl Citrate (JR) - vote
- PGME – Review draft proposal (JR)

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

- Flavors petition. Discuss request for TR (due 04 06 15)
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals TR Sufficiency Determination (due ASAP)
- Discuss any other TR's or petitions
- Discuss public comments and how to find them
- Petitioned materials discussion, 2016 Sunset materials discussion in preparation for April meeting.

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals TR Sufficiency Determination (due ASAP)
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Review any public comments.

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET

- **Discuss public comment**

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

May 5, 2015 - cancel call - post NOSB meeting

May 19, 2015 1:00 ET

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc
Research priorities

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015

Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, March 17, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS)
Absent: Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Mac Stone (MS)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting.	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. TR suff due 03 31 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	JR	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**

Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14. The HS will not request a new TR. Questions for posting	12 16 14	"

Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"
Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests

Name	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFe~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 24 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"

Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	02 24 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	02 02 15 & 02 24 15	"

Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT~~/JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	02 17 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP.	02 17 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	02 24 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"

Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	JR	2005		01 27 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y	Not contracted	02 17 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“

Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		02 17 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums.	02 17 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		02 17 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		02 17 15	“

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**

Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Pckging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 24 call if available
- Approve notes from the March 3 call if available
- Discuss draft checklist for Sodium & Potassium Lactate
- Discuss TR sufficiency for Fish Oils
- Discuss spring meeting presentations and discussion
- Discuss Public Comment
- Discuss process for reviewing and presenting 2017 Sunset Materials at spring meeting
- Discuss addition of Subcommittee calls for next session
- Prepare sunset 2017 meeting 2 template
- Other business - Vacations, work days away, etc that will impact our schedule for the summer and fall
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the February 24 and March 3** call were not available for review yet.
- **Sodium & Potassium Lactate** - the group discussed the semi-completed draft checklists. The Chair reviewed the history of these materials, which are used for control of Listeria and to some degree, botulism. In 2004, the NOP originally determined that the substances were considered approved without appearing on the National List, but is now asking NOSB to review them to be consistent with current materials review policy. The HS is interested is gleaning public comment about alternatives and current use. A member offered to check with certifiers to see if this is essential or in use.
- **Fish Oils.** The lead found the TR sufficient and very well done and the other members agreed.
- **Ammonium hydroxide** was withdrawn by the petitioner after the Subcommittee completed their review and it was posted for comment. The members discussed the timing of this withdrawal and how best to handle such actions in the future. The PPM contains some language but the HS would like to request that either the Materials or Policy Development Subcommittee clarify this procedure and add it to their work agenda. In support of that the HS submits the following resolution:

  Motion of Resolution:

  The Handling Subcommittee requests that the Policy Development Subcommittee seek permission to add to their work agenda a process that would establish a clear and concise time frame for which a petitioner may be allowed to withdraw a petition. Included in this we would like to see a definitive timeline after which a petition could not be withdrawn. The Handling Subcommittee would like to suggest the following: **A petition may not be withdrawn from a Subcommittee once the Subcommittee has voted on the material proposal, with the intent of moving it out of the Subcommittee to the full board for deliberation.**

Motion: To send the request to amend the policy about petition withdrawals to the PDS
Motion by: ZS
Seconded: TF
Y: 5: N: 0 Absent: 3 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Spring meeting presentations and discussion.** The Chair asked that the members let MA know what and how they will present their materials' reviews at the April meeting.
- **Public Comment.** To date, the NOSB had received only 6 comments. Discussion deferred to next meeting
- **Process for reviewing and presenting 2017 Sunset Materials** at spring meeting. MA and EBR will talk with NOP to determine how best to present the 2017 sunset materials at the April meeting, given that there are 200 materials. A member suggested focusing on those materials that the NOSB is considering to remove, or change.
- **Other Business.**
    - **Addition of Subcommittee calls for next session.** The HS will add 5 calls to the current call schedule (see below for additional dates). The Chair asked that the members note if they have any conflicts with any of the dates.
    - **Sunset 2017 meeting 2 template** - MA will send the Word version of the Sunset materials, so the members can add the Subcommittee review to the document for the second posting in the fall
- The meeting was adjourned

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Mar 3, 2015 1:00 ET

- Flavors petition. Discuss request for TR (due 04 06 15)
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals TR Sufficiency Determination (due ASAP)
- Discuss any other TR's or petitions
- Discuss public comments and how to find them
- Petitioned materials discussion, 2016 Sunset materials discussion in preparation for April meeting.

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals TR Sufficiency Determination (due ASAP)
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Review any public comments.

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET. ZS May not be on call.
Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET
May 5, 2015 - canceled call
May 19, 2015
BPA - discuss draft discussion doc or perhaps
Research priorities
May 26, 2015 - additional call
June 2, 2015

June 16, 2015
June 23, 2015 - additional call
June 28, 2015 - additional call
July 7, 2015
July 21, 2015
July 30, 2015 - additional call
August 4, 2015
August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 7, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Carmela Beck (CBe) - sitting in
Absent: Mac Stone (MS)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting. Petition withdrawn 03 16 15	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. TR suff due 03 31 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	~~JR~~ TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**

Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14. The HS will not request a new TR. Questions for posting	12 16 14	"

Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"
Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests

Name	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Yeast (2006) (PDF) Petition Supplement (2010) (PDF) Petition Memorandum (2010) (PDF)	205.605(a)	~~JFe~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 24 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"

Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	02 24 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR sent 3 30 15, sufficiency due ASAP.	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	02 02 15 & 02 24 15	"

Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT~~/JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contract ed	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	02 17 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP.	02 17 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	02 24 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	"

Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	~~JR~~, TC	2005		01 27 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y	Not contracted	02 17 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“

Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		02 17 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums.	02 17 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		02 17 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		02 17 15	“

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**

Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Pckging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the February 24, March 3, and March 17 calls
- Discuss public comments
- Discuss best approach for presenting the 2017 Sunset Materials at the spring mtg
- Discuss which 2017 sunset materials will have discussion points that will need to be addressed at spring mtg
- Discuss templates for the fall meeting, and preparation for summer work agenda
- Discuss Research Priorities
- Other business
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes** from the February 24, March 3, and March 17 approved with no changes.
- **Public comments**. The group had a brief discussion about the comments received to date. Most of the comments have been submitted in the last few days so many are not yet posted. The members will review the comments and discuss them on the next call.
- **2017 sunset materials.**
    - The group discussed how best to present the materials at the spring meeting given the large number. The HS will present them in the order in which they are listed on National List, with some exceptions such as colors, which they will present as a grouping, etc.
    - 2017 sunset materials that will have lengthier discussion points. The HS Chair provided a spreadsheet of the materials so the members could identify which materials will need additional discussion.
- **Templates for the fall meeting, and preparation for summer work agenda.** In addition to the 2017 sunset materials there are several petitions in the work queue. The petition for Ammonium Hydroxide was withdrawn right before the meeting, although the HS will present a brief synopsis of their recommendation, the public comments, and will note the withdrawal. The HS will also discuss their intent to refer a work agenda item to amend the current petition withdrawal procedures to the PDS...
- **Research Priorities.** The HS Chair urged the members to reach out to stakeholders and to continue to actively work on the priorities for the fall submission. The NOSB Chair urged the HS members to take into consideration the position of organic handlers when thinking about which priorities should be put forth, and to ensure that they included enough specificity as to be useful to the research community.
- MA will **schedule the 2017 sunset materials discussions**. Members were asked to send in any vacation that may conflict with the conference calls.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous HS Notes]

Future Call Schedule

Mar 17, 2015 1:00 ET

- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals TR Sufficiency Determination (due ASAP)
- Sodium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Potassium Lactate - Determine TR Sufficiency (due 03 06 15)
- Review any public comments.

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET.

- Review public comments

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET
May 5, 2015 - canceled call
May 19, 2015

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc
Research priorities

May 26, 2015 - additional call
June 2, 2015
June 16, 2015
June 23, 2015 - additional call
June 30 2015 - additional call
July 7, 2015
July 21, 2015
July 28, 2015 - additional call
August 4, 2015
August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015

Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 21, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Lisa de Lima (LD); Tom Chapman, Vice Chair (TC); Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR)
Absent: Mac Stone (MS)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Whole algal flour Petition Addendum #1	205.606	HA	N	Petition sent to HS on 09 30 13. Petition suff (including TR Request, if applicable) due 11 29 13. Petition found insufficient. Sent addit'l Q's to petitioner. Pet. Addendum sent to HS 01 22 14. Sufficiency due 02 25 14. Petition found "complete" 02 18 14. No TR requested. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	01 06 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Ammonium hydroxide (boiler water additive)	Add to 205.605	JR	No 2001 TAP	2000 petition. 2001 Recommendation. 2001 Background Paper. 2012 Petition sent to HS 11 06 12. Petition Sufficiency Response Due Date: 01 27 13. Petition found sufficient 12 18 12. No TR requested. Original proposal revised for spring 2014 meeting. Petition withdrawn 03 16 15	Classification Motion 11 18 14 Listing motion 12 16 14	Proposal Spr 2015
Glycerin CAS #(56-81-5)	Remove from 205.605(b)	TF	1995 TR 2013 TR	Petition sent to HS on 01 09 13. Sufficiency response due 03 11 13. TR sent to HS on 06 11 13. Sufficiency due 08 12 13. TR found suff 07 02 13. Proposal for fall 2014 returned to HS.	12 02 14. Vote finalized 12 05 14	Proposal Spr 2015

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether PGME (CAS # 9038-95-3) As a boiler water additive	205.605	JR	2013 TR	Petition sent to MS/HS 01 28 13. TR Requested 2 19 2013. Draft TR sent to HS 06 11 13. TR sufficiency response due 08 12 13. TR found sufficient 07 02 13. Discussion doc returned to HS for further review. Supplemental TR rqstd 05 20 14. Waiting for petitioner response before proceeding with updated TR. No response so HS will request Limtd Scope TR 09 02 14. TR due Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 28 15. TR suff due 03 31 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Triethyl Citrate	205.605	JR	2014 TR	Petition sent to HS 03 04 14. Rqst for Q's or TR due 05 06 14. TR requested 04 16 14. TR in development (expected October 2014). TR sent to HS 11 06 14. Sufficiency due 01 06 15. TR found sufficient 11 20 14.	02 24 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	N/A	Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	~~JR~~ TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD

2016 Sunsets § 205.605(a) and 205.606						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**

Egg white lysozyme CAS # 9001–63–2	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR 2011 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Egg White Lysozyme on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	01 20 15	Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015
Microorganisms	205.605	ZS	2014 TR 2003 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Microorganisms on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR requested by NOP Aug 26 2013. TR sent to HS 01 23 14. TR suff due 03 25 14. TR found not sufficient. TR sent to HS 07 24 14. Suffic due 08 27 14. TR found sufficient 08 06 14	01 06 15	"
Activated charcoal CAS #s 7440–44–0; 64365–11–3	205.605(b)	HA	No new TR 2002 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Activated Charcoal on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009	12 16 14	"
Peracetic acid CAS # 79–21–0	205.605(b)	~~JFo~~/TC	No new TR 2000 TAP	Final Sunset Recommendation on Peracetic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Oct 2009	01 27 15	"
Cyclohexylamine CAS # 108 -91-8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Cyclohexylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Diethylaminoethanol CAS # 100–37–8	205.605(b)	~~JT~~/TF	2001 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on Dethylaminoethanol on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14	12 16 14	"
Octadecylamine CAS # 124-30-1	205.605(b)	TF	2001 TAP No new TR request	Final Sunset Recommendation on Octadecylamine on 205.605b (PDF) Nov. 2009	12 16 14	"
L-Malic acid CAS # 97 -67-6).	205.605(a)	~~JD~~/AS	2003 TAP No new TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on L-Malic Acid on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. TR determination: 01 17 14. The HS will not request a new TR. Questions for posting	12 16 14	"

Sodium acid pyrophosphate CAS # 7758–16–9 2009 Expanded use	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/LD	2001 TAP 2010 TR No New TR	Apr 2011 Subcomm recommendation April 2011 NOSB recommendation Final Sunset Recommendation on SAPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009.	12 16 14	"
Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP) CAS # 7722–88–5	205.605(b)	ZS	2014 Lmtd Scope TR 2002 TR	Final Sunset Recommendation on TSPP on 205.605b (PDF) Nov 2009. Requested a limtd scope TR 01 12 14. Lmtd Scope TR sent to HS 06 11 14. TR sufficiency due 08 12 14. TR found sufficient 08 05 14	12 02 14. Vote completed 12 05 14	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 TR Requests

Name	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 24 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	02 02 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	01 27 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	"

Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	02 24 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	02 24 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	01 27 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15	02 17 15 & 02 24 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	02 02 15 & 02 24 15	"

Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	~~JT/~~JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contract ed	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	02 17 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	02 17 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	02 24 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	02 24 15	"

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 No TRs
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Summary discussion	Meeting
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		01 20 15	"

Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			02 02 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	~~JR~~, TC	2005		01 27 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		01 20 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		01 20 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		01 27 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	~~JT~~/LD	Y	Not contracted	02 17 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		02 02 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2008		01 20 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS	2006		01 20 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/AS			01 20 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		01 20 15	“

Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		01 27 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	~~JD~~/TC	2011		01 20 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		02 17 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			01 20 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	~~JD~~/TC	None		01 06 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums.	02 17 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		02 17 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		02 17 15	“
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		02 17 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		02 17 15	“

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Spr 2015
Pckging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

* Highlight indicates committee action needed.

Agenda

- Approve notes from the April 7 call
- Discuss templates for sunset for next stage
- Presentations
- Ancillary Substances
- Discuss public comments
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the April 7** not yet available for review.
- **Discuss templates for sunset review**. Members will use the same template for each posting and simply add the pertinent information (the Subcommittee review and votes) for the second posting. MA will schedule the materials for discussion for the next call and the group can rearrange things as necessary.
- **Presentations.** The HS Chair summarized the number of materials and the amount of time needed for discussion. In order to facilitate the discussion, some of the materials will be grouped by use; for example flavors and colors. The Chair asked that the members prepare for their presentations by thinking about time, format of presentation, and inclusion of public comment summary. A member asked about including and presenting comments that were submitted during the first posting of the 2016 sunset materials.
- **Ancillary Substances.** The NOSB received comments from the certifier community and noted that many were in support of the idea of creating a list of ancillary substances, while also ensuring that it will be flexible. A member asked about altering/adding to the chart of ancillary substances based on public comment and if that would constitute a substantive change. The NOP will discuss this and determine what changes would require it be sent back to Subcommittee. The goal for this document is to make it part of a guidance document and not a rule change.
- **Public comments.** The group discussed the public comments and the Chair asked that members send him a summary of any materials that will require more discussion time. A member noted comments on the topic of fermentation. Both the NOP and the Subcommittee feel this is outside the scope of the sunset review. Members discussed several other materials including phosphate additives, noting that they may be a good candidate for the Research Priorities.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

Apr 7, 2015 1:00 ET.

Review public comments

Apr 21, 2015 1:00 ET

May 5, 2015 - canceled call

May 19, 2015

BPA - discuss draft discussion doc

Research priorities

2017 Sunsets (JR)

2017 Sunsets (TC)

May 26, 2015 - additional call

June 2, 2015

June 16, 2015

June 23, 2015 - additional call

June 30 2015 - additional call

July 7, 2015

July 21, 2015

July 28, 2015 - additional call

August 4, 2015

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, May 19, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Acting Chair; Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD)
Absent: Harold Austin, Chair (HA)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Con tact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Meeting
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	~~JFo~~/ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP	07 07 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

				– Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.		
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	05 26 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	06 30 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	~~JFo~~/AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06	08 04 15	"

				15. TR found suff 02 24 15		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	~~JFo~~/TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 07 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	05 19 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TF	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR	07 21 15	"

(b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals, (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide			NVM TR	Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15		
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	07 21 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 02 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 16 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15	"
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"

Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 21 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		05 19 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 30 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	“
Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		05 26 15	“
Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	AS	2006		05 26 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 16 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“

Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 02 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 16 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums.	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 07 15	“
Konjac flour	205.606	ZS	None		06 02 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 02 15	“

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**

Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the April 7 and April 21 calls
- Enzymes - TR Sufficiency
- WPC - TR Sufficiency
- 2017 Sunsets (JR)
- 2017 Sunsets (TC)
- Research priorities
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** April 7 and April 21 were approved with no changes
- **Enzymes - TR Sufficiency.** The contractor addressed the questions that the HS had and the group now finds the TR sufficient.
- **Whey protein concentrate** (**WPC) - TR Sufficiency.** The group discussed the lack of information about ancillary substance in relation to WPC, and decided that since there are organic alternatives to WPC, and they are considering removing this material from the list, it wasn't critical to the review. The members also discussed commercial availability, noting that this type of info is not generally included in a TR as it is outside the scope of the contract. The HS will seek this information from other sources to include in their review. The TR was deemed sufficient.
- **2017 Sunsets (JR) - Filter agents.** Public comment indicated wide support for all of the filtering agents. The lead reviewer noted that each material was evaluated against the OFPA criteria and was found to satisfy all of them, and will include a statement to that effect. The lead reviewer briefly summarized each of the materials and the HS proceeded to vote.

    - Motion to remove **Attapulgite from** 205.605(a)
    - Motion by: JR
    - Seconded by: TC
    - Additional Discussion: none
    - Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

    - Motion to remove **Bentonite** from 205.605(a)
    - Motion by: JR
    - Seconded by: LD
    - Additional Discussion: none
    - Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- Motion to remove **Diatomaceous Earth (DE)** from 205.605(a):
- Motion by: JR
- Seconded by: TF
- Additional Discussion: none
- Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- Motion to remove **Kaolin** from 205.605(a)
- Motion by: JR
- Seconded by: AS
- Additional Discussion: none
- Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- Motion to remove **Perlite** from 205.605(a)
- Motion by: JR
- Seconded by: AS
- Additional Discussion: none
- Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunsets (TC)**
  - **Inulin-oligofructose enriched (IOE).** The lead summarized the material for the group. IOE is derived from inulin obtained primarily from chicory, and used as a fiber in dairy and baked goods. Similar to Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) but with a different functionality: IOE is powdered, less sweet while FOS is a liquid, and sweeter. Both are non- digestible. . FOS has unique applications and works as a binder where IOE does not. The group discussed the need for both of these to be on the list. The NOSB received no answers to the questions they posed for the first posting of these materials, nor did they receive any comments about commercial availability of organic forms of inulin. A member expressed her desire to delay voting until they could seek more information, and the HS will seek more information.

  - **Whey protein concentrate (WPC) -** Byproduct of cheese manufacturing. The NOSB received several comments from certifiers and the petitioner during the public comment period. According to public comments, there are organic sources available and therefore the HS is in favor of removing it from the National List.

    Motion to remove Whey Protein Concentrate (WPC) from 205.606
    Motion by: TC
    Seconded by: JR
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Research priorities -** The Materials Subcommittee will collect research priorities from each of the NOSB Subcommittees for submission at the fall 2015 meeting. The liaison reminded the HS members that the MS is seeking focused and targeted research needs, which will help facilitate the

process for the USDA when seeking researchers. Each Subcommittee is asked to provide no more than 3 top priorities.

- The NOP inquired as to whether the HS will request a TR for the project on "Packaging substances used in organic food handling – including BPA". The lead feels that they may at a later date, but since the project is in the early stages of development, they will develop a discussion document and seek public comment first. The HS will keep this topic on the agenda for fall 2015.
- **Additional items**
    - **Reclassification language.** The NOP sent proposed language to the NOSB to use if they choose to reclassify some materials on the National List. The HS will review the language and discuss it on the next call.
- The Acting Chair reminded folks of next week's agenda
- The meeting was adjourned

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

May 5, 2015 - canceled call
May 19, 2015
    BPA - discuss draft discussion doc - postponed
    Research priorities
    2017 sunsets (JR)
    2017 sunsets (TC)
May 26, 2015 - additional call
    2017 sunsets (AS) - Sanitizers and cleaning agents (AS)
    2017 sunsets (TF) - Alginates, Alginic Acid
June 2, 2015
June 16, 2015
June 23, 2015 - additional call
June 30 2015 - additional call
July 7, 2015
    Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm
July 21, 2015
    Discussion: BPA discussion doc
July 28, 2015 - additional call
August 4, 2015
August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, May 26, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Acting Chair; Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS)
Absent: Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 **Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015**						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion/ vote scheduled:**	**Meeting**
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP	07 07 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

				– Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.		
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	06 30 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent	08 04 15	"

				to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 07 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	05 19 15	"

(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	NVM 07 21 15? Move to earlier date	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	07 21 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 02 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 16 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15? Move to earlier date	"
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015

Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 21 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		07 30 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 30 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 16 15	“

Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 02 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 16 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 07 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 02 15	“

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Meeting**
Agar-agar						
Animal enzymes						
Beta-carotene extract color						
Calcium sulfate-mined						
Carrageenan						
Cellulose						
Glucono delta-lactone						
Potassium hydroxide						
Silicon dioxide						
Tartaric acid						

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the May 19 call
- 2017 Sunsets (AS)
- 2017 Sunsets (TF)
- Discussion of 2018 sunset TR requests
- Prelim discussion of other sunset materials

- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** May 19 were approved with no changes.
- **2017 Sunsets (AS)**
    - **Acidified Sodium Chlorite (ASC).** Antimicrobial. Received comments from handlers about essentiality. None of the commenters indicated commercially available alternatives. The material was found to satisfy all OFPA criteria, and the lead supports relisting. The HS proceeded to a vote.

      Motion to remove Acidified Sodium Chlorite ASC from 205.605(b)
      Motion by: AS
      Seconded by: TC
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

    - **Chlorine materials (Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite).** The lead summarized her review including information gleaned from the TR. Her initial assessment supported relisting this material, but during further discussion a member offered the following: These materials have a controversial and long review history; There are some deleterious effects of chlorine on soil and human health and it does not necessarily meet all the OFPA criteria; Recent comments indicated that there are alternatives and that the NOSB may want to engage with the EPAs Safer Choice program to explore these. The same member suggested that this group of materials is a prime candidate for a Research Priority. A material review organization indicated in its review that there are ancillary substances, and the HS would like input from the NOP about whether ancillaries in sanitizers need to be identified and reviewed. The HS will defer vote to a later call.

- A member shared her **technique for re-reviewing the last set of public comments** for inclusion in the review for the second posting of the sunset materials. The same member requested that the citations be edited or a note needs to be added indicating the source, so the readers can find the reference.

    - **Phosphoric acid.** Used in operations, primarily dairy, to remove calcium buildup on equipment. Several commenters indicated it was essential to their operations. This material satisfies the OFPA criteria, and the lead supports relisting. The HS proceeded to a vote. members.

      Motion to remove Phosphoric Acid from 205.605(b)
      Motion by: AS
      Seconded by: ZS
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

    - **Hydrogen peroxide.** Widely used as a disinfectant and bleaching agent. This material satisfies the OFPA criteria, and the lead supports relisting. Members discussed the need to review ancillary substances, but a member noted that it is not necessary for sanitizers. Will ask the NOP to confirm this. The HS proceeded to a vote.

Motion to remove Hydrogen Peroxide from 205.605(b)
Motion by: AS
Seconded by: TF
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **Ozone.** Ozone is used as a disinfectant and in post-harvest treatment for produce to retard spoilage in cold storage or in wash water. The lead noted that it is effective and environmentally benign substance used to reduce and control microorganisms for food safety purposes. Several commenters noted essentiality. One consumer group opposed relisting because it's a powerful oxidizer and questioned its necessity. The HS proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to remove Ozone from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: AS
  Seconded by: ZS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunsets (TF)**
  - **Alginic acid. The lead summarized the material for the group. Alginic Acid is d**erived from wild harvested seaweed via a chemical process. Since this is the case, perhaps it should be listed at 605(b) instead of 605(a)? There are concerns about overharvesting. The public comments about essentiality were mixed; some felt that it was used as a texturizer and therefore not essential. Members discussed reclassification of this material and the HS will move forth with two separate motions, as was indicated by the NOP: one for a motion to reclassify and one for a motion to move its listing to a different section. The lead will edit the draft document, add language directly from the TR as suggested by another member, and resend it to the members for review and they will vote on the next call.

  - **Alginates.** Alginic acid is derived from alginates. Alginates are unique because they do not require heating, thereby making them ideal for applications where the food is sensitive to temperatures. Alginate materials are considered GRAS and have been used for over 50 years. Most commenters supported relisting because of its long history, and found them to be essential. A member requested that the citations be edited or a note needs to be added indicating the source, so the readers can find the reference. The HS proceeded to a vote.

    Motion to remove alginates 205.605(b)
    Motion by: TF
    Seconded by: AS
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **Discussion of 2018 sunset TR requests.** The HS Acting Chair asked that the members look at the 2018 materials in preparation to discuss any requests for TRs.

- **Additional items:**

    - A member discussed some materials that may be candidates for reclassification, such as Xanthan gum and Tocopherols.
    - Nutrient vitamins and minerals is going to be a complex topic and the lead would like to move the discussion to an earlier date so they have more time. She also noted that it may need an annotation.
    - The group discussed the possibility of requesting supplemental or limited scope TRs for Xanthan gum and Phosphates.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

May 19, 2015
    BPA - discuss draft discussion doc - postponed
    Research priorities
    2017 sunsets (JR)
    2017 sunsets (TC)
May 26, 2015 - additional call
    2017 sunsets (AS) - Sanitizers and cleaning agents (AS)
    2017 sunsets (TF) - Alginates, Alginic Acid
June 2, 2015
    2017 sunsets (AS) - Vote on Chlorine materials
    2017 sunsets (TF) - Vote on Alginic Acid
    2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote
June 16, 2015
    2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote
June 23, 2015 - additional call
    2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote
June 30 2015 - additional call
    2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
July 7, 2015
    2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote
    Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm
July 21, 2015
    2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
    2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
    Discussion: BPA discussion doc
July 28, 2015 - additional call
    2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote

2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015

October 6, 2015

October 20, 2015

November 3, 2015

November 17, 2015

December 1, 2015

December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 2, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Acting Chair; Tracy Favre (TF); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD)
Absent: Harold Austin, Chair (HA)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan (PDF)	205.606			Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response due 07 28 15.		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion/ vote scheduled:	Meeting
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995	07 07 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015

Memorandum (2010)				TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.		
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	06 30 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR	08 04 15	"

				Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 07 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	05 19 15	"

(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	NVM 07 21 15? Move to earlier date	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	07 21 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 16 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15? Move to earlier date	"
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015

Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 21 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		07 30 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 30 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 16 15	“

Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 16 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 16 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 07 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	“

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR		Sunset date: 05/29/18		
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS		Sunset date: 05/29/18		
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packgng substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the May 26 call
- 2018 Sunset requests:
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Vote on Chlorine materials.
- 2017 sunsets (TF) - Vote on Alginic Acid.
- 2017 sunsets (LD) Gases

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) Gums, Gelatin, Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Pectin (non-amidated forms only), Xanthan gum.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** May 26 were approved with a minor change to the language under "Other items".
- **2018 Sunset requests:** Members discussed the timeline for requesting TRs for 2018 sunset reviews. The deadline is ~ July 15. A member mentioned Carrageenan, and indicated that if the HS requests a TR it would be a limited scope one and the questions would be specific and targeted. ZS offered to take the lead as the technical expert and scientist representative. The HS will schedule the TR determinations for the end of June. A member also suggested that the HS should request a TR for Potassium Hydroxide.

- **2017 sunsets (AS) - Vote on Chlorine materials. A member contributed some** language regarding chlorine alternatives as a research priority and suggested that the HS add it to the chlorine review. Additionally, the NOP will send the link to the guidance on chlorine and the lead will add it to the review. Members discussed the various issues and alternatives surround these materials and proceed to a vote.

  Motion to remove Chlorine materials from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: AS
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (TF) - Vote on Alginic Acid.** As discussed on the last call, the lead provided an updated draft with TR reference numbers and the group discussed the latest version. The Handling Subcommittee proposes that Alginic Acid remain on the National List However, due to the determination that Alginic Acid would likely be classified as synthetic under the new draft Classification of Materials document the HS is also bringing forth a separate proposal to change the listing from 205.605(a) to 205.605(b).

  Motion to remove Alginic Acid from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: ZS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  Motion failed

  Motion to reclassify Alginic Acid from 205.605(a) to 205.605(b)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: LD
  Additional Discussion: Members suggested some clerical edits to the reclassification document, and the addition of language to the sunset document cross-referencing the reclassification proposal.
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  Motion passed

- **2017 sunsets (LD)**

- **Nitrogen -** The lead summarized the material for the group, and indicated there was no public comment opposed to its relisting. Additionally, Nitrogen satisfies all OFPA criteria.

  Motion to remove nitrogen from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  Motion failed

- **Oxygen.** The lead summarized the material for the group, and indicated they received no public comment. The material satisfies all OFPA criteria and the HS proposes that Oxygen remain on the list.

  Motion to remove oxygen from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  Motion failed

- **Carbon dioxide.** The lead summarized the material for the group, and indicated that all the public comment was supportive of relisting. Carbon dioxide satisfies all OFPA criteria.

  Motion to remove Carbon dioxide from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: AS/ZS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  Motion failed

- **Ethylene.** The Handling Subcommittee asked for public comment regarding annotation. Few comments were received. All public comment submitted was in favor of relisting without an annotation change. Ethylene satisfies all OFPA criteria

  Motion to remove ethylene from 205.605(b).
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional Discussion: The group discussed human health risks associated with the use of ethylene and a member noted that in the post-harvest ripening of tropical fruit and the de-greening of citrus it is used in a controlled atmosphere indoors and not in the field.
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  Motion failed

- **2017 sunsets (ZS)**
  - **Gums (Arabic gum, Guar, Locust Bean/Carob Bean).** The request for a TR to clarify the extraction process was a medium priority, and was not able to be funded. Members discussed availability of organic sources, noting that some are available organically, and some in limited supply. The group also discussed ancillary substances, of which there are

none. A member also mentioned the use of xanthan gum as an alternative because it is used it lesser quantities.

Motion to remove gums **(Arabic gum, Guar, Locust Bean/Carob Bean)** from 205.606
Motion by: ZS
Seconded by: AS
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
Motion failed

- **Gelatin.** The lead summarized the material, its uses, and the public comment received in spring 2015. There may be some organic bovine gelatin available, but not porcine or fish derived. She indicated that there are no ancillary substances and the HS supports continued listing.

  Motion to remove gelatin from 205.606(j)
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional Discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  Motion failed

- **Konjac flour. Deferred to next call due to time constraints**
- **Lecithin - de-oiled. Deferred to next call due to time constraints**
- **Pectin (non-amidated forms only). Deferred to next call due to time constraints**
- **Xanthan gum.** The lead indicated that the NOSB received many comments, the majority of which were in support of reclassification of xanthan gum from 205.605(b) to 205.605(a). Members discussed the draft classification guidance with regard to fermentation, and the NOP suggested moving forward with the review and not waiting for final guidance. The lead reviewer mentioned an article that was referenced during public comment at the last meeting, and suggested the group discuss this on the next call. The vote will be deferred until then.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

May 26, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (AS) - Sanitizers and cleaning agents (AS)
2017 sunsets (TF) - Alginates, Alginic Acid

June 2, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Vote on Chlorine materials
2017 sunsets (TF) - Vote on Alginic Acid
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote

June 16, 2015

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Pectin (non-amidated forms only), Xanthan gum.

2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

June 23, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2018 sunset TR requests: Agar-Agar, Animal enzymes, Beta carotene, Calcium sulfate, Glucono delta lactone

June 30 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2018 sunset TR requests: Carrageenan, Cellulose, Potassium hydroxide, Silicon dioxide, Tartaric acid.

July 7, 2015

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote
Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm

July 21, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
Discussion: BPA discussion doc

July 28, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015

Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 16, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Acting Chair; Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Harold Austin, Chair (HA); Zea Sonnabend (ZS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan (PDF)	205.606			Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response due 07 28 15.		TBD
Hypochlorous Acid (PDF)	205.605 and 205.601			Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response due 08 03 15.		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion/ vote scheduled:	Meeting
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995	07 07 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review:

(2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)				TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.		Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	06 23 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	06 30 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid,	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and	08 04 15	"

(b) Sodium citrate				one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 07 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to	05 19 15	"

				HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.		
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	NVM 07 21 15? Move to earlier date	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	07 21 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 23 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15	"

Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 21 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		07 30 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 30 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“

Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 07 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	“

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS		Sunset date: 05/29/18		
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD		Sunset date: 11/3/2018		
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR		Sunset date: 05/29/18		

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the June 2 call
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Pectin (non-amidated forms only), Xanthan gum.
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) Cornstarch (native), Sweet potato starch
- 2017 sunsets (JR) Casings, Fish oil, Diglycerides, Monoglycerides, Glycerin, Magnesium stearate,
- 2017 sunsets (TC) Celery powder, Chia (Salvia hispanica L.), Dillweed oil, Galangal, frozen, Lemongrass-frozen, Orange pulp, dried, Peppers (Chipotle chile), Turkish bay leaves
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** June 2 were approved with no changes.
- **2017 sunsets (ZS)**
    - **Konjac flour. The lead summarized the material, and its derivation and uses.** It is derived from the elephant yam and used in traditional Asian foods as a binding agent and thickener. Also used in weight loss supplements and in diabetic foods. Public comments indicate overall support. Members discussed availability in the US of organic Konjac and the lack of information regarding this. The HS will add questions to the posting for public comment regarding this. The HS will also add language to the proposal indicating it is considering removal of this material in the hopes that it will garner comment.

      Motion to remove Konjac flour from §205.606
      Motion by: ZS
      Seconded by: HA
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 4 No: 3 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Lecithin - de-oiled.** The lead summarized lecithin and noted that they have discussed it several times in the past. One manufacturer of de-oiled soy lecithin claims that the organic supply exists and will grow further. However other commenters said the supply is too limited. The lead offered that the market could likely not support the removal of lecithin because of lack of alternatives, particularly the lack of de-oiled sunflower lecithin. The group also discussed the difference between powdered and de-oiled lecithin; terms which are sometimes used interchangeably. Powdered forms are not necessarily also de-oiled. This was mentioned in public comment. Lecithin was found to satisfy the OFPA criteria

      Motion to remove Lecithin - de-oiled from §205.606
      Motion by: ZS
      Seconded by: JR
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Pectin (non-amidated forms only).** Gelling agent derived from citrus, apples or quince. The lead noted that pectin is a common ingredient, has positive health effects, and is essential. The HS received a limited scope TR for ancillary substances. The NOSB received only positive support and no support for removal. ZS will write ancillary substances proposal.

      Motion to remove Pectin (non-amidated forms only) from §205.606
      Motion by: ZS
      Seconded by: JR
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Xanthan gum.** The lead noted that Xanthan gum, which is non-synthetic and listed on 205.605(b), is made in a similar manner as gellan gum, which is listed on 205.605(a). She proposed that the NOSB reclassify the material. It was noted that public comment included a claim that xanthan gum had adverse health effects when used a as a thickener in food for

infants. Upon further research of the references, it was noted that the cause may have been contamination of the product, and therefore was not a valid concern. The members discussed the need for a limited scope TR, acknowledging that it would not arrive in time for the fall sunset review. The HS will request one, proceed with a vote on sunset and work on a reclassification proposal separately. Xanthan gum satisfies all OFPA criteria.

Motion to remove Xanthan gum from § 205.605(b)
Motion by: ZS
Seconded by: HA
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (ZS)**

  - **Cornstarch (native).** Starches are used in foods as thickeners, formulation aids, bulking agents and moisture adsorption agents. Cornstarch is made from special strains of corn that are high in amylose and amylopectin. The lead said that there is organic cornstarch on the market, but not suitable for all uses

  - **Sweet potato starch.** Used as a formulation aid for bean thread production.
    The HS voted on both of these materials together instead of each individually

    Motion to remove Cornstarch (native), and Sweet Potato Starch from §205.606
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion:
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (JR)**
  - **Casings** - Deferred to later call
  - **Fish oil -** Deferred to later call
  - **Glycerin -** Deferred to later call
  - **Glycerides (Mono and Di).** The lead summarized the materials and their uses. Used in drum drying of food in organics. They are not permitted in EU, JAPAN, and IFOAM, but are permitted in Canada. There are alternatives and alternative management techniques mentioned in the TR, such as freeze drying. A member emphasized that drum drying and freeze drying are completely different processes and result in different products, therefore are not interchangeable. The HS received no feedback on the questions they posed.

    Motion to remove Glycerides (Mono and Di) from § 205.605(b)
    Motion by: JR
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: A member asked if the alternatives mentioned in the TR are realistic options.
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Magnesium stearate.** Only used in made with organic products. Anticaking and flow agent, typically used to make medication/pills. The HS posed questions about health impacts and

alternatives, and received little to no comment. A couple of members searched product labels and found no supplements with Magnesium Stearate. One member noted that the possible reason for this is that there are several alternatives, including carob. It also may be used as a processing aid, and not required to be labeled. The HS did receive information from certifiers indicating they have clients who are using this material.

Motion to remove Magnesium stearate from §205.605(b)
Motion by: JR
Seconded by: TF
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (TC)** - deferred to next call.
  - Celery powder
  - Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)
  - Dillweed oil
  - Galangal, frozen
  - Lemongrass-frozen
  - Orange pulp, dried
  - Peppers (Chipotle chile)
  - Turkish bay leaves

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

May 26, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (AS) - Sanitizers and cleaning agents (AS)
2017 sunsets (TF) - Alginates, Alginic Acid

June 2, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Vote on Chlorine materials
2017 sunsets (TF) - Vote on Alginic Acid
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote

June 16, 2015

2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Pectin (non-amidated forms only), Xanthan gum.
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

June 23, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Celery powder, chia, etc.)
2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Casings, Fish Oil, Glycerin. Discuss reviews and vote (May defer to June 30 as JR may not be able to be on call)
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin)

June 30 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

July 7, 2015

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote
Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm

July 21, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
Discussion: BPA discussion doc

July 28, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 23, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan (PDF)	205.606			Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response due 07 28 15.		TBD
Hypochlorous Acid (PDF)	205.605 and 205.601			Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response due 08 03 15.		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion/ vote scheduled:	Meeting
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995	07 07 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review:

(2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)				TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.		Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 07 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 07 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 07 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	06 30 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts.	08 04 15	"

				Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15 Review	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15 Review	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 TR	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 07 15 Review	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15 Review	"

				05 19 15.		
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	NVM 07 21 15? Move to earlier date	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Potassium phosphate, Sodium hydroxide, Sodium phosphates	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	07 21 15	"
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15	"

Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 21 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		07 28 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		06 30 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“

Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 07 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 07 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	“

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	TBD	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	TBD	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the June 16 call
- 2018 TR requests
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Pectin (non-amidated forms only), Xanthan gum.
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) Cornstarch (native), Sweet potato starch
- 2017 sunsets (JR) Casings, Fish oil, Diglycerides, Monoglycerides, Glycerin, Magnesium stearate,
- 2017 sunsets (TC) Celery powder, Chia (Salvia hispanica L.), Dillweed oil, Galangal, frozen, Lemongrass-frozen, Orange pulp, dried, Peppers (Chipotle chile), Turkish bay leaves

- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** June 16 were approved with no changes
- **2018 TR requests. Members discussed the need for technical reports for each of the 2018 materials.**
    - **Agar Agar.** No TR request
    - **Animal Enzymes.** 2011 TR. No new TR request
    - **Colors - Beta carotene.** 2011 TR. No new TR request
    - **Calcium sulfate - mined.** Last TR was from 2001, but the lead feels it was done well and there's no need for a new one.
    - **Carrageenan.** The lead circulated potential questions for a limited scopeTR, which the HS will request. The lead noted that the current available research on human health is not conclusive, and they will ask for a comprehensive and objective review of the literature and research. The lead noted that conservation/environmental issues were well addressed in the TR.
    - **Cellulose.** The lead thought that the past TR was well done but there have been usage changes in the 14 years since it was completed. He suggested requesting a new one.
    - **Glucono delta-lactone (GDL).** TR was adequate but is 13 years old, so the HS will request a full TR.
    - **Potassium hydroxide (KOH).** Discussion deferred to next call. A member noted that the HS should consider a TR.
    - **Silicon Dioxide.** There was a comprehensive TR done in 2010. The lead added that since this material is annotated already, a new TR is not necessary and instead they will seek any additional information from public comment.
    - **Tartaric Acid.** Discussion deferred to next call.
- **2017 sunsets (TC)**
    - **Celery powder.** The lead summarized the material and its usage. Based on information from several stakeholders and industry members, they have been unable to source organic celery powder, and have tried alternatives. To date they have been unsuccessful. The lead therefore recommends that due to lack of alternatives celery powder remains on the list. The group also discussed the difficulty/ inadvisability of producing organic celery with a higher nitrate content for this use.. A member asked that this information be included in the review document.

      Motion to remove Celery powder from §205.606
      Motion by: TC
      Seconded by: AS
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 1 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Chia (Salvia hispanica L.).** The lead summarized the material and its usage. Chia is a seed used in a variety of products, and is readily available organically. Therefore the HS supports removal.

      Motion to remove Chia from §205.606
      Motion by: TC
      Seconded by: ZS

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Dillweed oil.** The lead summarized the material. It is used for such things as **dill pickles.** Although it did not appear on any international lists, the lead noted that it was likely allowed in the EU. It meets the definition of natural flavors and also has an annotation to that effect. The NOSB received no comments**.**

  Motion to remove dillweed from §205.606
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Galangal, frozen.** Widely used in Asian foods. Commenters indicated that there is sufficient organic supply available and no commenters opposed delisting. The HS will review additional public comment but feel that this material can be removed from the list.

  Motion to remove galangal from §205.606
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Lemongrass-frozen.** Commenters indicated that there is sufficient organic supply available and no commenters opposed delisting.

  Motion to remove lemongrass from §205.606
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Orange pulp, dried.** The lead noted that a more accurate term would be citrus fiber, because this material is composed of citrus rind and membranes. It is a mix of soluble and insoluble fiber and is used in the baking industry. Comment indicated a lack of demand and the existence of organic alternatives. No commenters indicated that this was necessary. The HS will defer the vote until the next call so the Chair can reach out to stakeholders to seek further information about necessity.

- **Peppers (Chipotle chile).** The lead summarized the materials and noted that the public commenters showed broad support for removing peppers from the list.

  Motion to remove Peppers (Chipotle chile) from §205.606
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: LD
  Additional Discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Turkish bay leaves.** Used as flavoring. The lead summarized public comment: one commenter noted that they are sourcing this material and the supply is fragile. The lead said that the market data indicates that the supply is robust. A member added that Turkish Bay is a common name for *Laurus nobilis* and is also grown in other regions such as CA. The HS supports removal based on availability of organic sources.

  Motion to remove Turkish bay leaves from §205.606
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: LD
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (JR)**
  - **Casings.** Certified organic intestines from certified animals are not available commercially. Industry strongly supports continued listing and no commenter asked for removal. The HS didn't receive any comments during the last comment period, and therefore it recommends that casings remain in the list.

    Motion to remove casings from §205.606
    Motion by: JR
    Seconded by: TF
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Fish oil.** Discussion and vote deferred to next call
  - **Glycerin.** The lead provided a brief summary and noted the previous work and recommendation on the petition for glycerin from the spring 2015 NOSB meeting. The HS proceeded to a vote on the sunset review of glycerin

    Motion to remove Glycerin from § 205.605(b)
    Motion by: JR
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: The group discussed the motion, in light of the recent recommendation to list glycerin at 205.606 and remove it from 205.605(b). The HS was concerned that if the rulemaking action to place it on 606 takes longer than the sunset recommendation and they choose to remove it from the list, there will be a gap. The NOP agreed that the rulemaking process will take longer and it will In fact create a gap. The HS Chair urged the members to not let glycerin sunset while waiting for the rule to publish. The group supports the delisting of glycerin and will add language to the review so the stakeholders know their intention.
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (HA).** Deferred to next call
  - Calcium phosphate dibasic
  - Calcium phosphate monobasic
  - Calcium phosphate tribasic

- **2017 sunsets (ZS)** - deferred to next call
    - Carnauba Wax
    - Orange Shellac
    - Wood rosin

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

June 16, 2015

2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Konjac flour, Lecithin - de-oiled, Pectin (non-amidated forms only), Xanthan gum.
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

June 23, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Celery powder, chia, etc.)
2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote - deferred to next call
2017 sunsets (JR) - Casings, Fish Oil, Glycerin. Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin) deferred

June 30 2015 - additional call

2018 Sunset TRs (AS) - Tartaric acid, Potassium hydroxide
Petitions (Oat Beta glucan, Hypochlorous Acid) - Assign leads
Discuss Research Priorities
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Fish Oil, Sodium Phosphate, Potassium Phosphate)
2017 Sunset (HA) - discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Colors)
2017 Sunset (TF) – Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals

July 7, 2015

2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin, Kelp Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote (Enzymes)
Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm

July 21, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
Discussion: BPA discussion doc

July 28, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 30, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Jennifer Taylor - sitting in
Absent: Tracy Favre (TF)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan	205.606	LD		Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response due 07 28 15.		TBD
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS		Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response due 08 03 15.		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion/ vote scheduled:	Meeting
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995	07 07 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review:

(2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)				TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.		Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 07 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 07 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 07 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	07 07 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts.	08 04 15	"

				Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15 Review	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15 Review	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 TR	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 07 15 Review	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15 Review	"

				05 19 15.		
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	NVM 07 21 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Sodium hydroxide,	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	07 21 15	"
Potassium phosphate, Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)		Y Lmtd scope Not contracted	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for minerals. NO TR contracted	06 30 15	
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17	08 04 15	"

				15		
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 21 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		07 28 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 07 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“

Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 07 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 07 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 07 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“

Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	"

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Discussion doc Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the June 23 call
- 2018 Sunset TRs (AS) - Tartaric acid, Potassium hydroxide
- Petitions (Oat Beta glucan, Hypochlorous Acid) - Assign leads
- Discuss Research Priorities

- 2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Fish Oil, Sodium Phosphate, Potassium Phosphate)
- 2017 Sunset (HA) - discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Colors)
- 2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** June 23 were approved with no changes
- **2018 Sunset TR determination (AS)**
    - **Tartaric acid.** There was a 2011 TR and the lead does not feel that a new TR is necessary.
    - **Potassium hydroxide.** The previous TAP is from 2001 and the lead suggested requesting a new one. The group discussed adding specific questions focused on alternative methods to peach peeling. The lead will compile specific questions and forward them to the HS Chair who will send them along with the TR request to the NOP.
- **Oat Beta glucan petition.** LD volunteered to take the lead for this material. NOP suggested the HS also review the 2009/2011 petition for barley betafiber.
- **Hypochlorous Acid petition.** AS volunteered to take the lead for this material. The NOP noted that this is the petition for electrolyzed water, which is the subject of NOP Policy Memo 14-3. A member offered to forward the memo to the rest of the group.
- **Research Priorities**
    - **Phosphates.** The CS chair suggested that the group discuss this material further because the NOSB recommendation on phosphates will have implications for the decision to make this a research priority or not. If phosphates are kept on the National List, the HS will add them to the research topics. JR will provide the information for the research priorities.
    - **Chlorine alternatives.** A member developed some questions related to the availability and efficacy of alternatives to chlorine.
    - The NOSB Chair noted that there has never been an NOP action on the NOSB proposal about calculating % water in organic products/formulations, and wondered if research would help. The NOP is currently working on a guidance doc on this topic.
    - The HS will send their list of research priorities to the Materials Subcommittee liaison (JT) by July 10 so the Materials Subcommittee can discuss and prioritize the list during its next call, July 14.
- **2017 Sunset (JR)**
    - **Fish Oil.** The lead distributed a draft document earlier this month and noted some links that need to be added. Fish oil is a complex material. Research indicates that some fish oil supplements contain contaminants and heavy metals, and harvesting of fish oil poses hazards to biodiversity and the environment. A member noted that many of these concerns are already addressed and are regulated in some countries. The TR indicated there are plant derived alternatives, but rates of use are much higher than for fish oil, causing problems in product formulation. The group also discussed international standards for sustainable fish oil, and the possibility of some kind of restriction on sources. The NOSB received no comment regarding contaminants. The HS proceeded to a vote.

      Motion to remove Fish Oil from 205.606

      Motion by: JR

      Seconded by: LD

      Additional Discussion: The NOP and other members suggested some edits to the document. Several members offered background info regarding the reasons behind their support or

opposition for delisting. Opinions were mixed. Members also discussed contaminants and the lack of public comment regarding this. The lead will reach out to stakeholders to ask a couple of questions regarding contaminants, and will circulate the modified document. The group felt they could proceed to a vote on the document regardless.
Yes: 2 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Potassium Phosphate (JR).** Used as a pH adjuster, primarily in dairy products. Prohibited in organic but allowed in "made with organic" products. Public commenters mentioned new information relating to negative human health impacts. The lead summarized the public comment that was received and noted that the material was reviewed against the following criteria: effects on human health, essentiality, and compatibility with a system of sustainable agriculture.

  Motion to remove Potassium Phosphate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: LD
  Additional Discussion: A member asked whether phosphates are listed on the ingredient panel or nutritional panel on products. Several members indicated that phosphates are listed as an ingredient, and of the products they researched, they found no potassium phosphate, only sodium phosphate. There was little comment in favor of potassium phosphate from industry, since it is only allowed in Made with Organic products, there may not be much interest. Phosphates will be included as a topic for the HS research priorities

  Yes: 3 No: 2 Abstain: 1 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Sodium Phosphate.** Only allowed in dairy products, and typically in processed cheese products as an emulsifier. Similar to potassium phosphate: there is mixed information about health effects. Some literature indicates that phosphates have a negative effect on calcium uptake/absorption, however, the effect is related to the total amount of phosphates in the diet. There was a lack of consensus around the subject of health effects in previous NOSB reviews.

  Motion to remove Sodium Phosphate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: A member noted that when Sodium Phosphate is used as an emulsifier in cheese it is listed on the label. The group questioned whether Sodium Phosphate was used exclusively as an ingredient or is also used as a processing aid. The group discussed its use further and will add questions to the review to clarify what products it is used in.
  Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (HA) -** deferred to next call due to time
  - **Calcium phosphate dibasic**
  - **Calcium phosphate monobasic**

    - **Calcium phosphate tribasic**
- **2017 Sunset (JR) -** deferred to next call due to time
    - **Colors**
- **2017 Sunset (TF) - Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals -** deferred to next call due to time
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

June 23, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Celery powder, chia, etc.)
2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote - deferred to next call
2017 sunsets (JR) - Casings, Fish Oil, Glycerin. Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin) deferred

June 30 2015 - additional call

2018 Sunset TRs (AS) - Tartaric acid, Potassium hydroxide
Petitions (Oat Beta glucan, Hypochlorous Acid) - Assign leads
Discuss Research Priorities
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Fish Oil, Sodium Phosphate, Potassium Phosphate)
2017 Sunset (HA) - discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Colors)
2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals

July 7, 2015

2017 Sunset (HA) - discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Colors)
2017 Sunset (TF) – Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin, Kelp Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote (Enzymes)
Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm

July 21, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
Discussion: BPA discussion doc
Petitions (Oat Beta glucan
Hypochlorous Acid) -

July 28, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 18, 2015

August 25, 2015 - additional call

September 1, 2015

September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Sep 22 & 29, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, July 7, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List §	Contact	TR rqst?	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	2015	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan	205.606	LD		Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response due 07 28 15.		TBD
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS		Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response due 08 03 15.		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015

Name	National List §	Contact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion/ vote scheduled:	Meeting
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995	07 07 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review:

(2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)				TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.		Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Wood rosin	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	07 07 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts.	08 04 15	"

				Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 21 15 Review	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 21 15 Review	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 TR	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 21 15Review	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15	"

				05 19 15.		
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	NVM 07 21 15? Move to earlier date	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Sodium hydroxide,	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	07 21 15	"
Potassium phosphate, Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)		N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	06 30 15	
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 04 15	"

Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 21 15	“
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		07 28 15	“
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	“
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 07 15	“
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	“
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	“
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	“
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“

Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 21 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 21 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	“

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Disc Doc Spr 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the June 30 call
- Finalize Research Priorities - Chlorine, Phosphates
- 2017 Sunset (HA) - Discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
- 2017 Sunset (JR) - Discuss, vote (Colors)
- 2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote (Enzymes)
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Wood rosin, Kelp, Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)

- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** June 30 were approved with no changes.
- **Additional meeting dates.** The HS Chair will assess the review status and determine the need for extra call(s). He will poll members for availability and work with the NOP to schedule.
- **Research Priorities**
    - **Chlorine.** The group briefly discussed chlorine materials and will forward this to the MS as a research priority.
    - **Phosphates (Sodium, Potassium) -** The HS members discussed phosphates and whether or not they would be a viable candidate for the research priorities since the outstanding questions revolve around health concerns. The group decided that rather than add it to the research priorities they will request a TR. Likely a limited scope TR.

- **2017 sunsets (HA)**
    - **Calcium phosphates** (monobasic, dibasic and tribasic). The lead summarized the materials for the group. The previous TAP included all 3 materials (monobasic, dibasic and tribasic). These materials are widely used as leavening agents. A member noted that these are used in some dairy products, and questioned why. Members felt that perhaps this could be the topic for a future annotation change. The HS posed several specific questions during the first posting and received no answers. The lead recommended continued listing until such time as they receive additional information. The HS voted on all three materials

      Motion to remove Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic and tribasic) from §205.605(b)
      Motion by: HA
      Seconded by: JR
      Additional Discussion: A member asked about the timeframe for working on an annotation change. This could be done at the fall meeting as a separate proposal, though it may be best to wait for the new TR and take it up in spring 2016.
      Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset (JR)**
    - **Colors.** The lead noted that there are four colors that are not available in organic form: pumpkin juice, black currant, beet juice extract and red cabbage extract. The remaining 13 colors are available commercially in organic form.

      Motion to remove the following thirteen colors from §205.606:
      Black/Purple carrot juice color
      Blueberry juice color
      Carrot juice color
      Cherry juice color
      Chokeberry - Aronia juice color
      Elderberry juice color
      Grape juice color
      Grape skin extract color
      Purple potato juice
      Red radish extract color

Saffron extract color
Turmeric extract color
Paprika color

Motion by: JR
Seconded by: LD
Additional Discussion: A member asked how to proceed if the HS receives additional info that causes them to alter the outcome for some of the materials. The NOP and NOSB Chair indicated that they could make a motion to separate the substances.
Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to remove pumpkin juice, black currant, beet juice extract and red cabbage extract from §205.606
Motion by: JR
Seconded by: LD
Additional Discussion: The HS will include clarifying language in the review about their intent to not remove these 4 colors.
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote**
  - **Enzymes.** The lead briefly summarized Enzymes: They are naturally occurring proteins that work as catalysts, and are used in a variety of foods. The lead recommended this material remain on the list.

    Motion to remove Enzymes from §205.605(b)
    Motion by: LD
    Seconded by: JR
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote**
  - **Carnauba Wax.** The lead summarized the material and its history for the group. It is used to coat fruit and vegetables, candies and as a base for chewing gum. It is often grown organically, almost exclusively in Brazil. During the creation of the National List, Carnauba was included in the review of "Fruit Waxes" under the Crops Committee because it was considered a post-harvest handling substance. It was never classified as either agricultural or non-agricultural at that time, and was eventually placed at section 205.605(a) for handling. There is organic Carnauba on the market but supply is limited. The HS posed a question during the first posting about reclassifying Carnauba but received no feedback in public comment. Members discussed morpholine, which is a substance mentioned in public comment that is used in non-organic formulations. The group also discussed the possibility of a proposal requiring labeling of fruits and vegetables that are coated with waxes. A member expressed concern about this, as it might create confusion, since non-certified businesses would not be required to participate. The HS will add language to the review recommending voluntary labeling. Another option the HS discussed was to make a change to the regulations instead of the National List. The group chose to postpone the vote until the next call so the lead can make some edits to the document

- **Wood rosin** - postponed to next call
- **Kelp** - postponed to next call
- **Seaweed** - postponed to next call
- **Pacific kombu** - postponed to next call
- **Wakame seaweed** - postponed to next call
- **Yeast** - postponed to next call

- **2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote**
  - **Orange Pulp** - postponed to next call
  - **FOS** - postponed to next call
  - **IOF** - postponed to next call
  - **Dairy Cultures** - postponed to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

June 30 2015 - additional call

2018 Sunset TRs (AS) - Tartaric acid, Potassium hydroxide
Petitions (Oat Beta glucan, Hypochlorous Acid) - Assign leads
Discuss Research Priorities
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Fish Oil, Sodium Phosphate, Potassium Phosphate)
2017 Sunset (HA) - discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Colors)
2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals

July 7, 2015

2017 Sunset (HA) - discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Colors)
2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin, Kelp Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote (Enzymes)
Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm

July 21, 2015

2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin, Kelp Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
Discussion: BPA discussion doc
Petitions (Oat Beta glucan, Hypochlorous Acid) -

July 28, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Sep 22 & 29, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, July 21, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	2015	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan	205.606	LD		Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS found petition insufficient 07 21 15 for CBI	NA	TBD
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion/ vote scheduled:**	**Meeting**

Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 28 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Wood rosin	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	07 07 15	"

(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	08 04 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15 Review	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15 Review	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 TR	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 28 15 Review	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30	05 19 15 TR	"

				15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	07 07 15	
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605(b)	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	07 21 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Sodium hydroxide,	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	07 28 15	"
Potassium phosphate, Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)		N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	06 30 15	
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	08 04 15	"

			Scope	TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15		
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			07 28 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		07 28 15	"
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	"
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 07 15	"
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 04 15	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	"
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	"
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	"

Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 04 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 21 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 21 15	“

Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	"
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	"

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Disc Doc Spr 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the July 7 call
- Discuss Petitions (Oat Betaglucan (LD), Hypochlorous Acid (AS))

- Discuss and Vote 2017 Sunsets (ZS): Orange Shellac, Carnauba Wax, Wood rosin,
- Prelim Discussion: Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals (ZS)
- Discuss and Vote 2017 Sunsets (TF): Kelp; Seaweed, Pacific kombu; Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** July 7 were approved with no changes.
- **Oat Beta Glucan. Petition sufficiency/Request for TR:** The lead provided a brief summary of the material, and noted that there was a related petition for barley beta fiber that was denied because of lack of market interest. The group discussed ancillary substances, which are used in the enzymes for processing. Members determined that there is not enough information about the manufacturing process to complete their review and determined that more information is needed due to redaction of confidential business information (CBI). A member reminded the group about the 2013 NOSB recommendation to change the petition process, which would prohibit CBI. The recommendation has not yet been implemented by the NOP.
- **Petition sufficiency/Request for TR: Hypochlorous Acid -** The lead summarized the petition and raised a question about the petitioners request for limited use. She recommended an expanded use and the need for a TR. The HS will request a TR for this substance.
- **2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote**
    - **Orange Shellac.** The lead will submit a request for a classification change for orange shellac, which is used as a coating for fruit and vegetables as well as a confectionary glaze. Public comment was primarily in favor of keeping this material, carnauba wax, and other coatings on the National List, and no new information was provided about any of the OFPA criteria.

      Motion to remove Orange Shellac from 205.606(r)
      Motion by: ZS
      Seconded by: HA
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

    - **Carnauba Wax.** The group discussion for Carnauba wax was included in the July 7 notes.

      Motion to remove Carnauba Wax from 205.605(a)
      Motion by: ZS
      Seconded by: HA
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

      Motion to classify Carnauba Wax as agriculture and move it to 205.606
      Motion by: ZS
      Seconded by: TF
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Wood rosin.** The Subcommittee recommends that a technical correction be made to the listing of this material, as it is listed as both wood rosin and wood resin. Wood Rosin is correct. No ancillary substances were suggested by commenters

  Motion to remove Wood rosin (sic resin) from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals (NVM) -** The lead summarized the review history of this material, which was complex. The material was renewed in 2012 with the existing annotation, which is not what the original 1995 Board recommendation said. The HS will propose 3 motions separate from the sunset proposal to restore the original intent of the NOSB, which was to allow NVM in food only where they are required by regulation or law, including infant formula. The lead will revise the proposal, which may be a discussion document for fall. NOSB may vote on this proposal at the spring 2016 meeting and the HS wishes to alert the public to this proposed change to garner public comment.

- **2017 sunsets (TF) -** The lead summarized the material and review for the group. The group discussed the need for a TR, and the need to clarify the separate listings for Wakame and Kombu, which are both related forms of edible seaweed.

  - **Kelp**

    Motion to remove Kelp from 205.606
    Motion by: TF
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  - **Seaweed Pacific kombu**

    Motion to remove Pacific kombu from 205.606
    Motion by: TF
    Seconded by: AS
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  - **Wakame seaweed**

    Motion to remove Wakame seaweed from 205.606
    Motion by: TF
    Seconded by: AS

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

July 7, 2015

2017 Sunset (HA) - discuss, vote (Calcium Phosphates: mono, di, tri, basic)
2017 Sunset (JR) - discuss, vote (Colors)
2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin, Kelp Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
2017 sunsets (LD) - Discuss reviews and vote (Enzymes)
Research Priorities - discuss list for transmission to Materials Subcomm

July 21, 2015

2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin, Kelp Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
Discussion: BPA discussion doc
Petitions (Oat Beta glucan, Hypochlorous Acid)

July 28, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 18, 2015
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, July 28, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	2015	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan	205.606	LD		Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI	NA	TBD
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015						
Name	**National List §**	**Contact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion/ vote scheduled:**	**Meeting**

Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 28 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Wood rosin	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	07 07 15	"

(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	08 18 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 chia	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 28 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30	05 19 15 TR	"

				15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	07 07 15	
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	07 21 15 & 08 04 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Sodium hydroxide,	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	07 28 15 & 08 04 15	"
Potassium phosphate, Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)		N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	06 30 15	
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	08 18 15	"

			Scope	TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15		
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			08 04 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		08 04 15	"
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	"
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 07 15 & 08 04 15	"
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 18 15	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	"
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	"
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	"
Hydrogen	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	"

peroxide						
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 18 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 21 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 21 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“

Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	"

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 02 02 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Disc Doc Spr 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the July 21 call
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
  - Orange Pulp
  - Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)
  - Inulin-oligofructose enriched (IOF)

    - Dairy Cultures
- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Yeast
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
    - Calcium hydroxide
    - Calcium carbonate
    - Magnesium sulfate
    - Potassium chloride
    - Magnesium carbonate
    - Magnesium chloride
    - Potassium acid tartrate
    - Sodium hydroxide
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the July 21** were approved with no changes.
- **2017 sunsets (TC)** - Discuss reviews and vote
    - **Orange Pulp, Dried** - The Handling Subcommittee is considering removal of orange pulp, as there doesn't seem to be much demand. If the NOSB receives public comment to the contrary the HS will consider that prior to voting at the meeting.

      Motion to remove Orange Pulp, Dried from 205.606
      Motion by: TC
      Seconded by: JR
      Additional Discussion: The motion to remove was supported by other members
      Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)**. The lead summarized FOS for the Subcommittee, which is used in baked products. FOS is primarily derived from chicory root, which is not available organically. It is used as a humectant, low calorie sweetener and fiber source. The Lead discussed FOS in relation to inulin, noting that FOS is a shorter-chain version of inulin. Commenters questioned whether FOS should be listed at 205.606 as it is highly processed, however a review of the manufacturing led to the conclusion it is categorized correctly.
      Motion to remove Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) from 205.606
      Motion by: TC
      Seconded by: LD
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 2 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Inulin-oligofructose enriched (IOE)**. The lead mentioned that IOE is a very specific product originally made by one company, and that it is used interchangeably with, and related to, FOS. It can be made from organic agave, which is commercially available. An alternative would be to use organic inulin, along with FOS. There seems to be adequate supply of organic inulin. The original petitioner is no longer using it.

      Motion to remove Inulin-oligofructose enriched from 205.606
      Motion by: TC
      Seconded by: JR
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Dairy Cultures.** Public comment was supportive of continued listing of dairy cultures. Members discussed ancillary substances and the redundant listing of dairy cultures and microorganisms. The group discussed the phrase "dairy cultures" and its use on labels. Commenters expressed concerns that if it is removed from the list it would disrupt labeling practices. The lead will make some modifications to the current draft.

  Motion to remove Dairy Cultures from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (ZS). Yeast.** The lead summarized the material and the public comments. The substance was amended in 2010 to require commercial availability, and the listing seems appropriate now, as not all forms of yeast are available organically. HS provided a chart on ancillary substances in the first posting, and commenters supplied one additional substance. All the ancillaries reviewed are acceptable, and the HS will consult further with NOP on options for ancillary proposals.
  Motion to remove yeast from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (JR)** - Discuss reviews and vote.
  - **Calcium hydroxide** - Deferred to next call
  - **Calcium carbonate** - The lead indicated there was no controversy over this materials and public commenters were supportive or relisting.

    Motion to remove calcium carbonate from 205.605()
    Motion by: JR
    Seconded by: TC
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Magnesium sulfate**. Commenters supported relisting of this material, which is widely used in tofu.

    Motion to remove Magnesium sulfate from 205.605()
    Motion by: JR
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Potassium chloride.** Deferred to next call
  - **Magnesium carbonate.** Primary use is as a flow agent, but it is also used as an anti-caking agent. The comments the HS received indicated that some processers are using this

material. It is non-essential but is only approved for the "made with" category. Commenters were in support of relisting

Motion to remove Magnesium carbonate from 205.605()
Motion by: JR
Seconded by: HA
Additional Discussion: The members discussed potential alternatives. Tricalcium phosphate is an alternative as an anti-caking agent in salt.
Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Magnesium chloride.** Derived from seawater. Used as processing aid and coagulant for tofu. Public comment suggested it should be reclassified as non-synthetic and listed on 605(a). The HS may reclassify but will request a TR first. They also may develop a proposal to annotate for use only as coagulant in tofu production. The group will allow magnesium chloride to remain on the list pending further review.
  Motion to remove Magnesium chloride from 205.605()
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Potassium acid tartrate**. By-product of wine making used in baked goods. Public comment indicates broad support for this material.
  Motion to remove Potassium acid tartrate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: TF
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Sodium hydroxide.** Used as a processing aid to adjust pH. Also used in production of pretzels and cocoa; olive processing, and as a cleaning agent. There was broad support for relisting
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: HA
  None
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- The meeting was adjourned

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

July 21, 2015

2017 sunsets (ZS) - Discuss reviews and vote (Carnauba Wax, Orange Shellac, Wood rosin, Kelp Seaweed, Pacific kombu, Wakame seaweed, Yeast)
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote (Orange Pulp, FOS, IOF, DairyCult)
2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote

2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 Sunset (TF) - Prelim discussion Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
Discussion: BPA discussion doc
Petitions (Oat Beta glucan, Hypochlorous Acid)

July 28, 2015 - additional call

2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote

August 4, 2015

2017 Sunset (ZS) - Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
2017 sunsets (JR) - Calcium hydroxide vote, Potassium chloride vote
2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors, Sulfuric Acid

August 18, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols, Ascorbic acid
2017 sunsets (TC) - Sulfuric Acid

August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015?
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 4, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Jean Richardson (JR); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Carmela Beck (CBe) - sitting in
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		TBD
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	2015	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		TBD
Oat Beta-Glucan	205.606	LD		Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI	NA	TBD
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion/ vote scheduled:**	**Meeting**

Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 28 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Wood rosin	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"
Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	07 07 15	"

(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	08 18 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 chia	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 28 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR found suff 02 17 15	06 16 15	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30	05 19 15 TR	"

				15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	07 07 15	
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	07 21 15 & 08 04 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Sodium hydroxide,	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	07 28 15 & 08 04 15	"
Potassium phosphate, Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)		N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	06 30 15	
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"
Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015.	08 18 15	"

			Scope	TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15		
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			08 04 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		08 18 15	"
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	"
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 07 15 & 08 04 15	"
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 18 15	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	"
Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	"
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	"
Hydrogen	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	"

peroxide						
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 18 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 21 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“
Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	“
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 21 15	“
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“

Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	"

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion scheduled:**	**Summary Meeting**
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Meeting**
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Waiting for feedback from NOP. Memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Disc Doc Spr 2016

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the July 28 call
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote. Chlorine Materials revision, Hypochlorous acid/Electrolyzed Water
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
    - o

- 2017 sunsets (ZS) - Yeast
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote
    - Calcium hydroxide
    - Potassium chloride
- 2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote. Potassium chloride, Calcium chloride, Potassium iodide, Ferrous sulfate
- 2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote. Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate, Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate
- 2017 Sunset (ZS) - Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals, Micronutrients – NVM will
- Adjourn

<u>Discussion</u>

- **Notes from the July 28** were approved with no changes.
- **2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote.**
    - Chlorine Materials revision. The members discussed the review document for chlorine materials and the petition for Hypochlorous acid.. The HS made some minor edits to the chlorine materials document, which was voted on during the June 2 call. The HS will discuss the Hypochlorous acid petition on a future call.

- **2017 sunsets (JR) - Discuss reviews and vote**
    - **Potassium carbonate.** The lead summarized the material and its uses and the HS proceeded to a vote.

      Motion to remove Potassium carbonate from 205.605(b)
      Motion by: JR
      Seconded by: TF
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Calcium hydroxide.** The lead summarized the material and its uses. It has multiples uses, and there are no adverse health effects, although the lead noted that Calcium hydroxide reduces the nutritional value in some food. There was no opposition to relisting.

      Motion to remove Calcium hydroxide from 205.605(b)
      Motion by: JR
      Seconded by: TF
      Additional Discussion: A member asked about including a citation to support the statement that Calcium hydroxide reduces nutritional value. Other members added that Calcium hydroxide is used for corn meal masa, and serves to increase nutrients [niacin]. The lead will amend the text to reflect the conversation.
      Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0
    -

- **2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote.**

    - **Potassium chloride.** The lead briefly summarized the material. Potassium chloride is a common, naturally occurring mineral used to provide potassium enrichment in foods, and as a salt replacer to reduce the sodium content in foods. There was little public comment and no objections to relisting this material

Motion to remove Potassium chloride from 205.605(a)
Motion by: TF
Seconded by: HA
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Calcium chloride.** Used in a wide variety of food processing applications, including as a meat tenderizer and flavor enhancer. Can be obtained by extraction of nonsynthetic brines, which would leave its molecular structure unchanged and thus should be classified nonsynthetic. However, Dow (the major supplier) and other producers use synthetic chemicals during the purification of the brine. The HS received little public comment, and there were no objections to relist.

  Motion to remove Calcium chloride from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Potassium iodide.** Commonly used in trace minerals supplements. Essential to health. There was very little public comment on this material.

  Motion to remove Potassium iodide from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Ferrous sulfate.** Used to treat or prevent anemia. Public comment was divided, with some supporting relisting, while others spoke to the fact that ferrous sulfate should only be used in products that by law require fortification.

  Motion to remove Ferrous sulfate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: A member noted that Ferrous sulfate is considered as one of the Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals, and if the NOSB were to remove this listing from the National List, it would still be allowed.
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote.**

  - **Sodium bicarbonate.** Used as leavening agent. Commenters were in support of relisting.

    Motion to remove Sodium bicarbonate from 205.605(a)
    Motion by: HA
    Seconded by: TF

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

- **Sodium carbonate.** Used as leavening agent, anti-caking agent, acidity regulator or stabilizer. Essential. Commenters were supportive of relisting

  Motion to remove Sodium carbonate from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Ammonium bicarbonate.** Used as leavening agent certain cookies and crackers. Used in baking products where yeast is not used. It is a leavening agent that is completely eliminated through the baking process. No organic alternatives.

  Motion to remove Ammonium bicarbonate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Ammonium carbonate.** Used as leavening agent. Since all of the carbonates were reviewed together as a group in the past, there were no comments pertaining specifically to this material. Commenters only remarked on bicarbonates. A member noted that since they are very similar, it is likely the commenters were addressing all 4 materials.

  Motion to remove Ammonium carbonate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset (ZS)**

  - **Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals.** The lead summarized the draft document for the sunset review and briefly discussed a separate annotation change proposal. There are many ancillary substances in this group of materials although they are generally regarded as safe (GRAS) by the FDA. The lead noted that they are used in a reasonable way, and there is no indication that they are harmful to the environment. They are used in very small quantities as part of the vitamin or mineral, which are added also in small amounts to food. Annotation change will be presented at next meeting.

    Motion to remove Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals from 205.605(b)
    Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Ancillary substances in Microorganisms.** The group discussed the proposal on ancillary substances in microorganisms, which the lead indicated was essentially the same document that was posted for the April 2015 meeting with slight modifications. The members discussed combining dairy cultures with the microorganisms proposal and voting on the combined document.

  Motion to approve the functional classes as listed for use with Microorganisms/Dairy cultures proposal
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: TC
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

July 28, 2015 - additional call
2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Discuss reviews and vote
August 4, 2015
2017 Sunset (ZS) - Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
2017 sunsets (JR) - Calcium hydroxide vote, Potassium chloride vote
2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors, Sulfuric Acid
August 18, 2015
2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote. Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate
2017 sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols, Ascorbic acid
2017 sunsets (TC) - Sulfuric Acid, Flavors
2017 sunsets (JR) – Potassium Citrate
August 25, 2015 - additional call
September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015?
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 18, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Jean Richardson (JR)
Absent:
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	2015	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		Fall 2015
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD		Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15		TBD
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion/ vote scheduled:**	**Meeting**
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 28 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Wood rosin	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"

Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	07 07 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	08 18 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 chia	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 28 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR	06 16 15	"

			scope	found suff 02 17 15		
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	07 21 15 & 08 04 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Sodium hydroxide	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	07 28 15 08 04 15 08 18 15	"
Potassium phosphate, Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)		N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	06 30 15	
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"

Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 18 15	"
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			08 04 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		08 25 15	"
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	"
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 07 15 & 08 04 15	"
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 18 15	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	"
Chlorine Materials: Calcium	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	"

hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite						
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 18 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 21 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“

Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	"
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 21 15	"
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	"
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	"

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Summary Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Disc Doc Spr 2016
Alginic Acid Reclassification		Pending NOP Approval. Voted ?	Fall 2015

Xanthan Gum Reclassification		Pending NOP Approval. Voted ?	Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax Reclassification		Pending NOP Approval. Voted ?	Fall 2015
Tocopherols Reclassification		Pending NOP Approval.	Fall 2015
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change		Pending NOP Approval	TBD
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms + dairy cultures		Pending NOP Approval	Fall 2015
Ancillary substances - Pectin		Pending NOP Approval. Voted 08 18 15	Fall 2015
Ancillary substances - Yeast		Pending NOP Approval. Voted 08 18 15	Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the August 4 call
- Ancillary Substances: Discuss and vote:
  - Micronutrients/Dairy Cultures
  - Pectin
  - Yeast - Discuss proposal
- 2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote. Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate
- 2017 sunsets (JR) - Potassium Citrate
- 2017 sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols, Ascorbic acid
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - Discuss Annotation proposal
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** August 4 call were approved with several changes. A member noted that Hypochlorous acid was petitioned for both Crops and Handling, although it was not sent to the Crops committee for addition to the work agenda. The Handling committee will coordinate with Crops on this review. A note was also added indicating that Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals will be reviewed on the August 18 call. The Crops chair will bring it to the August 18 Crops call for discussion as well.
- **Ancillary Substances proposals (ZS).** The group briefly discussed two proposals for ancillary substances

  - **Pectin.** Pectin is one of the materials due to sunset in 2017, and was also reviewed for ancillary substances. The HS is putting forth a separate proposal for ancillary substances.

    Motion to accept the ancillary substances for pectin
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: AS

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Yeast -** Yeast is one of the materials due to sunset in 2017, and was also reviewed for ancillary substances. The HS is putting forth a separate proposal for ancillary substances.

  Motion to accept the functional classes as ancillary substances for yeast
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote.**

  - **Citric acid.** Has multiple uses such as pH control and flavoring. The lead summarized the comments; the majority of which indicated that citric acid is essential and necessary for proper pH control. There was one commenter opposed to relisting because they consider citric acid to be synthetic. A member clarified that numerous previous Boards have determined citric acid to be non-synthetic. This material satisfies the OFPA Evaluation criteria and the Handling subcommittee supports the relisting.
  - **Lactic acid -** Widely used in almost every segment of the food industry. Carries out a wide range of functions. The overwhelming majority of public comments indicated it is necessary in the organic industry for proper pH control. This material satisfies the OFPA Evaluation criteria and the Handling subcommittee supports the relisting.
    The HS voted on these two materials as a group.

    Motion to remove citric acid and lactic acid from 205.605(a)
    Motion by: AS
    Seconded by: TF
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Calcium citrate.** Has a variety of uses: Water softener, supplement, pH adjuster, and sanitizer. The Subcommittee received very few specific comments about Calcium Citrate.

    Motion to remove calcium citrate from 205.605b)
    Motion by: AS
    Seconded by: TF
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Sodium citrate.** Used as an emulsifier in dairy products, and in cheese making where it allows the cheeses to melt without becoming greasy. The majority of commenters were supportive of relisting, while one was in opposition.
    Motion to remove sodium citrate from 205.605(b)
    Motion by: AS
    Seconded by: TF

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (JR)** - **Potassium Citrate.** Has several uses such as a flavor enhancer, and a nutrient supplement. It can replace some phosphates. Commenter were overwhelmingly in support of relisting, and there was no opposition.

  Motion to remove potassium citrate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: JR
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols.** Used as antioxidants in foods and animal feeds. Public comment was divided. Some commenters remarked that tocopherols are used as a preservative and therefore inconsistent with organic agriculture. The majority of commenters strongly supported relisting, stating essentiality in maintaining nutrients and freshness in their products.

  Motion to remove tocopherols from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: The group discussed the table that was included in the draft review doc. A member noted that tocopherols are a source of Vitamin E, made some editorial suggestions and added that tocopherols might be a candidate for reclassification to Section 205.605(a). The HS will pose some questions about the supply of non-synthetic sources.
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Ascorbic acid.** Used as a dietary supplement, is a vital nutrient for humans, and has a wide variety of processing uses as well. Fairly innocuous material. Public comment was divided. Most commenters supported relisting. Some commenters remarked that Ascorbic Acid is used as a preservative and therefore inconsistent with organic agriculture. The majority of commenters strongly supported relisting, stating essentiality in maintaining nutrients and freshness in their products.

  Motion to remove ascorbic acid from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: TF
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: A member suggested the addition of clarifying language about the fact that ascorbic acid is a source of vitamin C.
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors.** Derived from natural sources and different processes. Listed as a non-synthetic, agricultural product. Allowed in most international standards. The NOSB also received a petition for flavors, which is currently under review. The lead summarized the comments, indicating that only one was in opposition. Public commenters didn't identify any specific ancillary substances. The petition proposal will be discussed on the next HS call. A member asked that the HS defer the vote on the sunset review until the next call so the HS can review both of the documents at the

same time.

- **2017 sunsets (TC) - Sulfur dioxide.** No ancillary substances. Very little public comment was received during the first posting.

  Motion to remove sulfur dioxide from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals (NVM) -** The lead circulated a draft discussion document for an annotation change. The NOP has not yet reviewed this project for addition to the work agenda, but will do so before the next call. The group discussed the recent history of this material. The NOP suggested some changes for accuracy on the history, noting that after the Jan 2012 proposed rule , there was an interim final rule (Sept 27, 2012which specified that NVM be renewed with its original listing. The HS will vote on the next call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

August 4, 2015

2017 Sunset (ZS) - Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals
2017 sunsets (JR) - Calcium hydroxide vote, Potassium chloride vote
2017 sunsets (HA) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TF) - Discuss reviews and vote
2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors

August 18, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote. Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate
2017 sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols, Ascorbic acid
2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors, Sulfur dioxide
2017 sunsets (JR) - Potassium Citrate

August 25, 2015 - additional call

Sodium and Potassium Lactate - petitioned (HA) Discuss proposals
2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors.
Flavors - petitioned (TC) - Discuss proposal
Discuss BPA Discussion Doc (ZA)
Hypochlorous Acid petition (AS) (tentative)

September 1, 2015
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015?
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Handling Subcommittee (HS) Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 25, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Present: Tom Chapman (TC) Chair; Harold Austin, Vice Chair (HA); Tracy Favre (TF); Ashley Swaffar (AS); Lisa de Lima (LD); Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Jean Richardson (JR)
Absent: none
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR rqst?**	**Notes***	**Vote**	**Meeting**
Sodium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Potassium Lactate	205.605	HA	2015	Request to add to workplan sent to HS 06 24 14. TR (combined with lactic acid) due Feb. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 03 17 15		Fall 2015
Flavors, 2015	205.605(a)	TC	2015	Petition sent to HS 02 03 15. Response due 04 06 15. Petition found sufficient 02 17 15. TR requested 03 03 15		Fall 2015
Oat Beta-Glucan Pet addendum1: Source/mfg Process Pet addendum 2: process flow diagram	205.606	LD		Petition sent to HS 05 28 15. Response/request for TR due 07 28 15. No new TR. HS rejected petition 07 21 15 for CBI. Petitioner response sent to HS 08 06 15		TBD
Hypochlorous Acid	205.605 and 205.601	AS	2015	NOP Policy Memo 14-3: Electrolyzed Water (PDF) Petition sent to HS 06 03 15. Response/request for TR due 08 03 15. TR request sent to NOP 07 21 15. TR sent to HS 08 13 15. TR suff due 10 13 15		TBD

2017 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606 Summary: Spr 2015 Complete Review: Fall 2015						
Name	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TAP/TR**	**Notes**	**Discussion/ vote scheduled:**	**Meeting**
Yeast (2006) Petition Supplement (2010) Petition Memorandum (2010)	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	NOP 5014 – Certification of Organic Yeast (PDF) TAP – Yeast, Autolysate, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Bakers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 TAP – Yeast, Brewers, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Nutritional, 1995 TAP – Yeast, Smoked, 1995 TAP – Yeast Derivatives, Livestock Use, 2002 NOSB Formal Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2010) NOSB Committee Rec (2007) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 22 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 28 15	Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015
Carnauba Wax	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TAP for Fruit Waxes, 1996 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 24 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Orange Shellac	205.606	ZS	2014 TR	TAP, 2002 (PDF) 2014 TR sent to HS 01 27 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
Wood rosin	205.605(a)	ZS	2014 TR	TR sent to HS on 01 24 14. Sufficiency due July 2014. TR found sufficient 06 03 14.	07 21 15	"
(b) Alginates (a) Alginic acid	205.605	TF	1995 TR 2015 TR	Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. Both TRs sent to HS 02 06 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found sufficient 02 24 15	Alginates 05 26 15 Alginic Acid 06 02 15	"

Colors	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. All colors (17 total). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 20 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	07 07 15	"
(b) Calcium citrate (a) Citric acid, (a) Lactic acid, (b) Sodium citrate	205.605	AS	1995 2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. Food Acids + salts. 2 TRs: One for citric acid and its salts, and one for lactic acid and its salts. Look at ancillary substances. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 18 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	08 18 15	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	"
Fructooligosaccharides	205.606	TC	2015 TR	Dairy additives. Combined TR Requested 08 15 14. (Fructooligosaccharides, Inulin-oligofructose enriched, TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 24 15	05 19 15 TR 07 28 15	
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	TC	2015 TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. Whey protein concentrate). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 04 24 15. TR found suff 05 19 15.	05 19 15 chia	
Dairy Cultures	205.605(a)	TC	1995 2015 Ancill Subs TR	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. Will address Dairy Cultures	07 28 15	"
Diglycerides, Monoglycerides	205.605(b)	JR	1995 2015 Lmtd	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. Combined. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 01 27 15. Suff due 03 06 15, TR	06 16 15	"

			scope	found suff 02 17 15		
Enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 30 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found insufficient 04 22 15. Sent Q's to contractor. Rvs'd TR sent to HS 05 12 15. TR found sufficient 05 19 15.	05 19 15 TR 07 07 15	"
(b) Ferrous sulfate (b) Nutrient vitamins and minerals (a) Potassium chloride (a) Potassium iodide	205.605	TF	2015 NVM TR	TR Requested 08 15 14. One TR for vitamins. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015, TR sent to HS 02 25 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 03 15	07 21 15 & 08 04 15	"
Calcium carbonate, Calcium hydroxide, Magnesium carbonate, Magnesium chloride, Magnesium sulfate, Potassium acid tartrate, Potassium carbonate, Potassium citrate, Sodium hydroxide	205.605(a), 205.605(b)	JR	N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	07 28 15 08 04 15 08 18 15	"
Potassium phosphate, Sodium phosphates	205.605(b)		N	Limited Scope TR Requested by HS 08 15 14. NO TR contracted	06 30 15	
Pectin (non-amidated forms only)	205.606	ZS	Y Lmtd scope	Lmtd scope TR requested for ancillary substances approved by NOP 09 16 14. TR Expected Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 27 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 22 15	06 16 15	"

Fish oil	205.606	JR	2015	TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 03 11 15. TR found suff 03 17 15	06 30 15	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	TF	2015 Lmtd Scope	Lmtd scope TR Requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to HS 02 09 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15	08 18 15	"
Attapulgite	205.605(a)	JR	2010		05 19 15	Fall 2015
Bentonite	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TF			08 04 15	"
Diatomaceous earth	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Flavors	205.605(a)	TC	2005		08 25 15	"
Kaolin	205.605(a)	JR	1995		05 19 15	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	JR	1996		05 19 15	"
Ammon bicarbonate, Ammon carbonate, Calcium phosphate (monobasic, dibasic, tribasic), Sodium bicarbonate, Sodium carbonate	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	HA	N		07 07 15 & 08 04 15	"
Carbon dioxide, Ethylene, Nitrogen, Oxygen	205.605(b) 205.605(a)	LD	Y	Not contracted	06 02 15	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	TF	1995		08 18 15	"
Acidified sodium chlorite	205.605(b)	AS	2008		05 26 15	"
Chlorine Materials: Calcium	205.605(b)	AS	2006		06 02 15	"

hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite						
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Ozone	205.605(b)	AS			05 26 15	“
Glycerin	205.605(b)	JR	2013		06 23 15	“
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	JR	1995		06 16 15	“
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	TC	2011		08 18 15	“
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	ZS	Y		06 16 15	“
Casings	205.606	JR			06 23 15	“
Celery powder	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Dillweed oil	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Galangal, frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Lemongrass-frozen	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	TC	None		07 21 15	“
Peppers (Chipotle chile)	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	TC	None		06 23 15	“
Gums: Arabic gum, Carob bean gum, Guar gum, Locust bean gum	205.606	ZS	1995 Y Lmtd Scope	Gums	06 02 15	“
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	ZS	1995		06 16 15	“
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ZS	None		07 21 15	“
Sweet potato starch	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	“

Gelatin	205.606	ZS	2002		06 02 15	"
Kelp	205.606	ZS	1995		07 21 15	"
Konjac flour (starches)	205.606	ZS	None		06 16 15	"
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606	ZS	2009		06 16 15	"

2018 Sunsets §205.605(a), §205.605(b) and 205.606
Summary: Spr 2016 Complete Review: Fall 2016

Name	National List §	Con tact	TAP/TR	Notes	Discussion scheduled:	Summary Meeting
Agar-agar	205.605(a)	TF	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		Spr 2016
Animal enzymes	205.605(a)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Calcium sulfate-mined	205.605(a)	TC	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Carrageenan	205.605(a)	ZS	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Glucono delta-lactone	205.605(a)	TC	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Tartaric acid	205.605(a)	AS	N	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Cellulose	205.605(b)	HA	Y	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Potassium hydroxide	205.605(b)	AS	Y	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"
Silicon dioxide	205.605(b)	LD	No new TR	Sunset date: 11/3/2018		"
Colors: Beta-carotene extract	205.606	JR	No new TR	Sunset date: 05/29/18		"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Meeting
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms	ZS	Vote: 08 04 15	Proposal Fall 2015
Packging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	ZS	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14	Disc Doc Spr 2016
Alginic Acid Reclassification			Fall 2015

Xanthan Gum Reclassification		Pending NOP Approval.	Spr 2016
Carnauba Wax Reclassification		Pending NOP Approval.	Fall 2015
Tocopherols Reclassification		Pending NOP Approval.	Spr 2016
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change		Pending NOP Approval	Spr 2016
Ancillary substances for Microorganisms + dairy cultures		Pending NOP Approval	Fall 2015
Ancillary substances - Pectin		Pending NOP Approval. Voted 08 18 15	Fall 2015
Ancillary substances - Yeast		Pending NOP Approval. Voted 08 18 15	Fall 2015

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion

Agenda

- Approve notes from the August 18 call
- 2017 sunsets (TC) - Colors, Flavors. Discuss and vote
- Sodium and Potassium Lactate - petitioned (HA) Discuss proposals
- Flavors - petitioned (TC) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Discuss BPA Discussion Doc (ZA)
- Hypochlorous Acid petition (AS) (tentative)
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from the** August 18 were approved with no changes.
- The group discussed the requested work agenda items for annotation changes and reclassification of substances. Most were approved for the fall 2015 NOSB meeting, and several are scheduled for the spring 2016 meeting.
- **2017 sunsets (TC) - Colors.** Members discussed the proposal for colors, which they voted on during the July 7 call. The HS was considering separating the colors based on which ones they are considering for removal. Instead they chose to keep the proposal as is, and allow for the possibility for a motion to separate at the fall meeting if they choose to vote differently on one or more colors.
- **2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors.** Flavors are derived from natural sources and are widely used in processed products, typically in very small amounts. The manufacture of flavors adds to the complexity of listing, due in part to the fact that flavors cross over the categories of non-synthetic and agricultural. All but one commenter were supportive of continued listing. The HS discussed the 205.600 criteria, and the fact that no one criterion is determinate, but that they are used in total to evaluate processing aids and adjuvants.

  Motion to remove flavors from 205.605(a)
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: JR

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Flavors - petitioned (TC) -** The NOSB received a petition for colors and is reviewing this as a separate proposal from the sunset review. During the 2010 sunset review, the NOSB chose to relist flavors as a category and added a recommendation that for the next sunset review the Board consider "appropriately dividing flavors into rational subparts, or classes, composed of flavors which shared similar sources and processes." The current petition requests the addition of a commercial availability clause. The HS discussed the complex nature of this listing and made some minor edits to the draft proposal.

  Motion to revise the Flavors annotation to read: Flavors - Non-synthetic flavors may be used when organic flavors are not commercially available. All flavors must be derived from organic or nonsynthetic sources only, and must not be produced using synthetic solvents and carrier systems or any artificial preservative.

  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: JR
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- S**odium and Potassium Lactate - petitioned (HA).** The lead summarized the history and uses of these two materials, which were originally petitioned in 2004. The NOP informed the petitioner at that time that the substances were considered approved without having to appear on the National List, but has recently asked the NOSB to review them to be consistent with current materials review policy. The petitioners were given an opportunity to update the petitions and submit comments but did not. The HS is asking for input from the public about how and to what extent these materials are being used.

  Motion to classify Sodium and Potassium Lactate as synthetic
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  Motion to list Sodium and Potassium Lactate at section 205.605 for use as an antimicrobial agent only
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional Discussion: A member asked if these materials are interchangeable and if so, are both listings needed. Informal communication indicates that these materials may not be used to the extent that they were when it was originally petitioned. They may however have other uses in slaughterhouses. Some members felt that if they are not widely used then perhaps they do not warrant listing.
  Yes: 4 No: 1 Abstain: 2 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Discuss BPA Discussion Document (ZS).** The lead summarized the background on this project for the benefit of new members.. She informed the members that although there is strong opposition

from some segments of the industry, many companies are voluntarily moving away from BPA already. She noted that many other countries have already banned BPA and it would be helpful to understand the justification for why they did so. The NOSB discussed submitting a request for a TR, which will provide objective information and allow them to proceed with a proposal. The lead added specific questions to the TR request to supplement the documentation and literature that currently exists. If the TR is received in a timely manner, the HS intends on presenting a discussion document in spring 2016 and a proposal in fall 2016.

- The NOSB Chair requested from the NOP a list of previous NOSB actions and the current status of said actions. The Board members often get inquiries about adding work agenda items and feel that this information would be helpful when responding to those inquiries.

- The HS Chair asked for feedback regarding standardized language for the proposals so they are aligned and more consistent.

- The group briefly discussed some of the materials for the spring 2016 agenda, including petitioned materials and reclassification proposals.

- The HS will cancel the September 1, 2015 call

- **Hypochlorous Acid petition (AS)**. The HS will review this for the spring 2016 meeting.

- **Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals (NVM) -** Discussion document for the spring 2016 meeting.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule

August 18, 2015

2017 sunsets (AS) - Discuss reviews and vote. Citric acid, Lactic acid, Calcium citrate, Sodium citrate
2017 sunsets (TF) - Tocopherols, Ascorbic acid
2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors, Sulfur dioxide
2017 sunsets (JR) - Potassium Citrate

August 25, 2015 - additional call

Sodium and Potassium Lactate - petitioned (HA) Discuss proposals
2017 sunsets (TC) - Flavors.
Flavors - petitioned (TC) - Discuss proposal
Discuss BPA Discussion Doc (ZA)
Hypochlorous Acid petition (AS) (tentative)

September 1, 2015 - cancelled
September 15, 2015
October 6, 2015
October 20, 2015
November 3, 2015
November 17, 2015
December 1, 2015
December 15, 2015

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015?
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015