Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday January 6, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS), Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT), Harold Austin (HA), Carmela Beck (CBe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Jay Feldman (JFe), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
**Absent:** John Foster (JFo)
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate<br>205.601(h)<br>CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br><br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br><br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br><br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride<br>205.601(n)<br>CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br><br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br><br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 See Table Below**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols)<br>205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>Y | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | NA | Summary: Spr 2015<br>Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | NA | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15 | NA | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | NA | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. | NA | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec) | NA | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | Y | TR requested 08 15 14 for Alkylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015; Nonylphenols only | NA | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | NA | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | NA | " |

**Petitioned Substances**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | | TBD |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15 | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15<br><br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts update | ~~JFe~~/ZS | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo/~~JFe~~ | DD | | | Disc doc Spr 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from December 16, 2014
- Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - vote
- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Hydrated lime, Potassium chloride (ZS) - Discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of December 16, 2014 were approved with no changes.
- **New petitions** - Two new petitions were sent to the CS since last call (see table above): brown seaweed extract, and lignin sulfonate. CBe volunteered to lead the reviews and will determine petition sufficiency and the need for TRs.
- **Calcium Sulfate** (ZS) - Members discussed the proposal that was circulated prior to the call, and after some minor edits to the language proceeded to vote.

  **Vote:**
  Motion to classify Calcium Sulfate, produced by the flue gas desulfurization (FGD) process as petitioned as synthetic
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add Calcium Sulfate, produced by the flue gas desulfurization (SGD) process as petitioned to 205.601
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional discussion: none
  Yes: No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride** (FT) second meeting SC review. The CS discussed this material and the review that was circulated, and proceeded to vote. After additional discussion, the vote was deferred to the next call.

  **Vote:**
  Motion to remove Hydrogen chloride, CAS # 7647-01-0, from §205.601(n)
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: HA

Additional discussion: A member asked if there was a checklist completed for this review and urged the group to develop one. He feels that it would helpful and would incentivize the industry to move away from this material, which they have indicated they wish to do. The CS Chair reminded the group that checklists for the sunset materials are optional, and suggested that instead of completing a full checklist, the lead could extract the information and write it in narrative form in the summary, expanding the paragraph that was provided. The members chose to defer the vote until this is completed.

The CS Chair noted that she will not be available on the next CS call, and asked that the Vice Chair be prepared to lead the discussion and vote for this material. She also asked that the boiler plate language be added to the draft document indicating that the CS is voting to remove based on OFPA criteria. A member added that since there was a TR contracted, perhaps it makes sense to include an abbreviated checklist as well as a summary of the public comment. He also suggested that since the industry would like to move away from using this material, that info should be highlighted in the review. Members agreed that if there is no new info for a material then they do not need to complete a checklist.

- **2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate** (CBe). The lead noted that she will revise the ferric phosphate review to be consistent with other 2016 reviews. A member added that there was some additional info included in the last review about the concerns over EDTA, and urged that it be included here. This he feels, will create incentives to move away from this material. The lead will add the additional information and the group will defer the vote until the next meeting.

- The Chair asked that CS add an extra call on Jan 27.

- **3-decene-2-one** (CBe) - Petitioned as a sprout inhibitor for potatoes. Extends shelf life, and is beneficial for the export market. The petition mentioned several alternatives. The group discussed the checklist and the petition and the edits will be incorporated into the document before the group votes. The vote will be deferred to the Jan 27 call.

- **2017 Sunset - Ethanol** (FT) - The lead asked the group for input about questions to include in the review for ethanol. A member urged the group to include checklists at this stage in an effort to glean as much info as early as possible. The Chair noted that the checklists are optional, but perhaps they could pose a question that would direct people to the TR. The lead will complete the document and the group will discuss it on the January 27 call

- **2017 Sunset - Isopropanol** (FT) - deferred to the January 27 call so the lead can complete the review.

- **2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime** (ZS) - deferred to the January 27 call.

- **2017 Sunset (205.602 items) - Potassium chloride, Sodium fluoaluminate, strychnine** (ZS) - Members briefly discussed these materials. ZS will add a few questions for public input and recirculate for discussion on the January 27 call.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

Dec 16, 2014 2:00 ET

Allyl Isothiocyanate (HA) - Discuss checklist/vote - completed

2016 Sunset Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss and vote (?) deferred to Jan 6

2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (JFo/FT) - Discuss and vote - deferred to Jan 6
Exhaust Gas (FT) - Discuss checklist and vote - completed
Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - Discuss checklist
Discuss 2017 sunsets with no TRs

**Jan 6, 2015 2:00 ET**

Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - vote
2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
Laminarin (ZS) - Discuss TR if ready
3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist
2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, hydrated lime, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Jan 20, 2015 2:00 ET**

2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural), Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency
2017 Sunsets - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (if time allows) (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps, ammonium, (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
2017 Sunsets - Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids,
Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset, Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate (CBe) - discuss summary/questions if any (might get bumped to January 27 call

**Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET**

2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 2, 2:00 ET** (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET**

2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET** - Additional call

2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers Microcrystalline cheesewax (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any

2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) -Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**

**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET**

**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**

**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

| 2017 Sunsets (No TRs) | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006<br>Y | Both listings. Rqustd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | | " |
| Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | | " |
| Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e)<br>205.601(i)<br>205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j)<br>205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | | “ |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | | “ |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | | “ |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | | “ |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | | “ |
| Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | | “ |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | | “ |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | | “ |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | | “ |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | | “ |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | | “ |
| Boric acid | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted. | | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | | |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday January 20, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS), Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT), Harold Austin (HA), Carmela Beck (CBe), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Jay Feldman (JFe), John Foster (JFo), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in, Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate<br>205.601(h)<br>CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br><br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br><br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br><br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride<br>205.601(n)<br>CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br><br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br><br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols)<br>205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>Y | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | Will discuss 01 27 15 | Summary:<br>Spr 2015<br>Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15 | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec) | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | Y | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonlyphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | 01 20 2015. Will continue discussion 02 17 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqustd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 02 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | Will discuss 01 27 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | Will discuss 01 27 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 17 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | Will discuss 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 01 27 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | Will discuss 01 27 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | Scheduled for 01 27 15 | TBD |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15 | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15<br><br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts update | ~~JFe~~/ZS | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo/~~JFe~~ | DD | | Scheduled for 02 24 15 | Disc doc Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from January 6, 2015
- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural), Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
- 2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency
- 2017 Sunsets - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps (ammonium), (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers
- Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate (CBe) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of January 6, 2015 were approved as is
- **2017 Sunsets (HA)**
    - **Elemental sulfur:** The CS Chair noted that the questions that are included in the intro for the sunset reviews are being repeated for each material and asked that the redundancy be eliminated. Members will include unique and/or specific questions in the review. The group discussed targeted language regarding the compliance with requirements for personal protection, and will add a sentence into the narrative as opposed to a question. A member provided a checklist for this material.
    - **Oils (horticultural):** Two members collaborated on a checklist for this material, with additional questions for posting, including a question about the definition of the "narrow range". A member noted that there are horticultural oils that fall just outside the definition of "narrow range". The CS Chair indicated that the best way to address this would be via a regulatory change.
    - **Pheromones** – Synthetic insect hormones that are used to disrupt mating or for monitoring. Some inerts are listed in the TR. Members discussed the questions in the draft document, and the Chair noted that they should include some questions about new delivery systems that are

currently being developed. The lead will make some edits based on suggestions. The Chair also mentioned microencapsulated pheromones as they were discussed in the TR, however these are not being used in organic agriculture because they have list 3 inerts, and are not used in passive dispensers.

- **2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT)** - Used for delinting cotton seed. There are mechanical delinting methods as well.

  Motion to remove Hydrogen chloride, CAS # 7647-01-0, from §205.601(n)
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe)** - Members discussed the proposal that was circulated prior to the call and proceeded to vote.

  Motion to remove **Ferric Phosphate** (CAS # 10045–86–0) from 205.601(h)
  Motion by: CBe
  Seconded by: CBo
  Additional Discussion: A member feels that the inert ingredients used are actually active and urged the group to consider that when voting.
  Yes: 2 No: 3 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset - Lead salts (FT)** - Lead salts are prohibited in OFPA and were added to the National List by the NOP in 1997, and the CS feels that there is no new information to indicate that they should be removed.
- **2017 sunset - Soaps (ammonium) (FT)** - for animal repellants. Members discussed several aspects of this material, including the inclusion of questions for public comment regarding potential usage changes.
- **2017 sunset - Herbicidal soaps – (FT) -** Soap as algicide/demosser. **(FT)** - The lead will add some language pertaining to use. Little information is available in the old TAPs, so they will wait for the new TR.
- **2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA)** - Discuss TR sufficiency - deferred to next call.
- **2017 Sunsets - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (CBo)** - deferred to next call
- **Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo)** - JFe transferred this project to CBo as this is his last call. The CS Chair offered that the document was well written, coherent, and succinct. She asked for some modifications: Section 205.203 says contamination of soils, crops, and water, and therefore the proposal must look at contamination of soils and not just contamination of compost; and asked that the issue of loading rates be addressed.
- **2017 Sunsets - Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate (CBe)** - discuss summary/questions if any –deferred to next call
- The meeting was adjourned

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Jan 6, 2015 2:00 ET**

Calcium Sulfate (ZS) - vote
2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote

2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
Laminarin (ZS) - Discuss TR if ready
3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist
2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, hydrated lime, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Jan 20, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist - deferred to Jan 27
- 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural), Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
- 2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency
- 2017 Sunsets – (CBo): Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (if time allows) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps (ammonium), (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset, Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any

**Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 2, 2:00 ET** (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET** - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) -Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday January 27, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
**Absent:** Paula Daniels (PD)
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate<br>205.601(h)<br>CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br><br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br><br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br><br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride<br>205.601(n)<br>CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br><br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br><br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols)<br>205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>Y | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | Will discuss 02 02 15 | Summary: Spr 2015<br>Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15 | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | Y | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonlyphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | 01 20 2015. Will continue discussion 02 17 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqustd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 02 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 17 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | Will discuss 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | Will discuss 02 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | 01 27 15 | TBD |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15 | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15<br><br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts update | ~~JFe~~/ZS | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo/~~JFe~~ | DD | | Scheduled for 02 24 15 | Disc doc Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from January 20, 2015
- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset), Liquid fish products, Micronutrients, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of January 20, 2015 were approved with no changes
- **2017 Sunset: Lime Sulfur (HA)** - Lime sulfur is listed as an insecticide and fungicide. The CS received a new TR and the lead conveyed to the group that it was very thorough and well done. The CS found it sufficient. Members discussed future iterations of TRs and perhaps altering or adding some questions regarding efficacy of alternatives which will aid in their review..
- **2017 Sunsets: Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic (CBo)** - All are 205.602 materials; Non synthetics prohibited. The draft review docs were sent out prior to last meeting, and included checklists. The lead did not propose any additional questions.
- **2017 Sunsets (CBe)**
    - **Aquatic plant extracts -** The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2006 TR. There are no concerns with this material.
    - **Humic acids** - The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2006 TR. The CS Chair added that the TR for oxidized lignite addressed humic acids, and feels that it should be referenced in this review. The CS Chair offered that

some groups in the organic community feel that not all humic acid derivatives are synthetic, and as such she feels this material could be a candidate for an annotation change. NOP noted that classification issues can be clarified in the Materials Classification guidance (not yet finalized).
    - **Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)** - deferred to next call.
    - **Liquid fish products -** The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2006 TR. The CS Chair added that the annotation is problematic for use in review of blended fertilizers containing liquid fish. ZS will write a question for addition to the document.
    - **Micronutrients** - Found to be essential. Members discussed the annotation, which restricts use and requires testing for deficiency, and will add a question about the various ways to document deficiency.
    - **Magnesium sulfate** - The lead summarized past reviews and recommendations, and noted that there was a 1995 TAP and a 2011 TR. There was a unanimous vote in 1995 that Magnesium sulfate is synthetic and inconsistent with organic production, but based on public comments that there were no alternatives, the Board reconsidered its recommendation. The CS will include some additional questions for posting.
- **3-decene-2-one (CBe)** - Petitioned Material. This material is a registered pesticide. The lead incorporated comments from JFe into the document after the last call, and the group proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to classify 3-decene-2-one (CAS # 10519-33-2) as petitioned as synthetic
  Motion by: CBe
  Seconded by: CBo
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add 3-decene-2-one (CAS # 10519-33-2) as petitioned to 205.601
  Motion by: CBe
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS)** - deferred to next call
- The meeting was adjourned

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Jan 20, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2016 Sunset - Hydrogen Chloride (FT) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 2016 Sunset - Ferric Phosphate (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist - deferred to Jan 27
- 2017 Sunsets - Elemental sulfur, Oils (horticultural), Pheromones (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any (may try to discuss on Jan 6th)
- 2017 Sunset - Lime sulfur (HA) - Discuss TR sufficiency

- 2017 Sunsets – (CBo): Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), and Arsenic (if time allows) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Lead salts, Soaps (ammonium), (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in farm inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset, Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any

**Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset),(deferred to next call), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any - deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 2, 2015 2:00 ET** (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate - TR disc

**Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET** - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) -Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday February 2, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Paula Daniels (PD)
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>Y | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 02 02 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 02 02 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15 | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | Y | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonlyphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | 01 20 15. Will continue discussion 02 17 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqustd limited scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 17 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 17 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 17 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 02 02 15 and 02 24 15? | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 01 27 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | 02 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | Will discuss 02 17 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | 01 27 15 | Spr 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested | Disc scheduled for 02 24 15 | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15<br><br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts update | ~~JFe~~/ZS | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo/~~JFe~~ | DD | | Scheduled for 02 24 15 | Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from January 27, 2015
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of January 27, 2015 were approved with no changes.
- **2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT)** - The group discussed the additional questions about essentiality and availability that were initially proposed and chose not to include them as they were already posed in the introduction section.
- **2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) -** The group discussed the additional questions about essentiality and availability that were initially proposed and chose not to include them as they were already posed in the introduction section.
- **2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)** - Also called Calcium Hydroxide. Widely used as disease control. As per the Chair, a link to the 2002 TR for Calcium Hydroxide was added to the review for hydrated lime. No additional questions will be posed.
- **2017 Sunsets**
    - **Sodium fluoaluminate (ZS)** - The lead noted that the natural source of this material (a mine in Greenland) may have been closed so the nonsynthetic form is likely not available.
    - **Potassium chloride (ZS)** - The CS will add questions regarding usage and whether it will be added as an ingredient in in blended products or use by itself.

- **Strychnine (ZS)** - No new information and no issues. No additional questions will be asked

- **2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT)** - The CS discussed questions for posting. The lead will make some minor edits to the document and send the finalized version to ZS and MA.
- **2017 Sunsets - Lignin sulfonate (CBe)** (petition to remove and sunset review). A petition to remove from 205.601(l) was received in Nov 2014. It is used as a floating agent, but the petition indicates it is non-essential as it has been replaced with other methods. The petition was found sufficient and the CS is not requesting a new TR. During the sunset review the CS will ask questions and solicit comments about the petition to remove and whether or not it is essential as a flotation aid.
- **2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS)** - The Lead posed a couple of questions for the spring 2015 posting: One for growers and one for certifiers. A member asked about the possibility of consulting with the EPA on materials such as these and the chair noted that if the information is not in the TR then it is within the purview of the NOSB to seek additional info from other agencies or sources, via the NOP. The lead will add some additional questions and recirculate the document so people can review it by the proposal deadline.
- **2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo)** - deferred to next call
- **2017 Sunset - Potassium bicarbonate (HA). TR discussion** - deferred to next call
- The CS Chair noted that she read the **Nonlyphenol ethoxylates TR** (requested for the EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern) which needs sufficiency review. She asked about a reference to "environmental compartments" and was unsure what this is. EBR will consult with LB to determine what it means and will discuss it on the next call.
- The meeting was adjourned

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Jan 27, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunset - Lime Sulfur discuss summary/checklist (HA)
- 2017 Sunsets (CBo) Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate), Arsenic - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe): Aquatic plant extracts, Humic acids, Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset) - (deferred to next call), Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate - discuss summary/questions if any
- 3-decene-2-one (CBe) - Discuss cklist/vote
- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS)
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any - deferred to Feb 2
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 2, 2015 2:00 ET** (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions

- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion

**Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt (CBe) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any

**Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET** - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) (HA) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency of Nonlyphenol ethoxylates.
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- Discuss Checklists for copper
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday February 17, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) sitting in; Mac Stone (MS); Paula Daniels (PD)
**Absent:**
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>Y | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 02 02 15 | Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 02 02 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP Y Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | Y | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | 01 20 15. Will continue discussion 02 24 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | Will discuss 02 24 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 02 17 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 02 17 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | Will discuss 02 24 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 02 02 15. Will continue review 02 24 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 01 27 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | “ |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | 02 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP<br>Y | | Will discuss<br>02 24 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011<br>Y Lmtd | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not | Will discuss<br>02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd<br>Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | Will discuss<br>02 24 15 | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | 01 27 15 | Spr 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested | Disc scheduled for 02 24 15 | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15<br><br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |

| Substance | Con-tact | TR reqstd? | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts update | ~~JFe~~/ZS | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo/~~JFe~~ | ~~DD~~ Report | | Scheduled for 02 24 15 | Written report Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from February 2, 2015
- Hydroponics/Aquaponics task force.
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 2, 2015 were approved with no changes.
- **Hydroponics/Aquaponics task force.** The CS Chair informed the CS of the NOPs intention to create a Hydroponics/Aquaponics task force. The call for nominations will be published in the next few weeks and will be open for 60 days. In addition to the CS Chair, who will act as liaison to the Board, the chair invited another NOSB member to self-nominate if interested. The task force will report to CS and will present their findings at the spring 2016 NOSB.
- **2017 Sunsets (CBo)**
    - **Ammonium carbonate.** Used in traps, so no contact with organic food, soil, etc. The CS will not pose additional questions
    - **Newspaper or other recycled paper.** Used as mulch and compost feedstock. The CS will include some questions about inks.
    - **Plastic mulch and covers**. Herbicide, weed barrier. Members discussed the inclusion of questions and whether or not it would be useful given the recent memo from the NOP regarding the bio-based bio degradable mulch. The memo clarifies that currently there are no products that would qualify as bio-based, biodegradable based on the percentage of biobased

components versus petroleum based components. The CS Chair noted that plastic mulch is currently the only alternative.

- **2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate** (HA) - Limited scope TR was requested and received. The TR was found sufficient, as it answered the two questions that were posed by the HS. However, the lead feels that it did not provide comprehensive information on the many uses for disease control, so the HS will seek the additional information via public comments.
- **2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide** (ZS) - The 2006 notes indicate there was a TR, but the CS Chair was not able to locate this document, if it exists. NOP note: The NOP verified that there was no TR, only the 1995 TAP. The 2015 TR was found sufficient and the CS will add questions to the posting regarding the use of hydrogen peroxide to fight fireblight.
- **2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based** (FT) - The TR has not been received yet, so the CS will defer to next call.
- **2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers** (FT) - The TR has not been received yet, so the CS will defer to next call.
- **2017 Sunsets (PD)**
    - **Soaps, insecticidal**: Originally transferred from JFo to PD, but FT completed the review as well, so he and PD will confer and combine their review.
    - **Sodium silicate**: The CS discussed the environmental impacts and manufacturing process, and discussed the fate of used sodium silicate in evaporated ponds; this waste material is subject to other regulations.
    - **Sucrose octanoate esters:** Used for insect control of soft bodied insects, low toxicity, the TR was adequate, and no questions will be added.
    - **Vitamin D3:** The CS does not have additional questions or concerns about this material
- **EPA List 4 Inerts** (ZS): The NOP clarified language in the TR pertaining to "compartments" and the CS finds the TR sufficient. The lead noted that since the TR is narrow in scope they need to determine how to proceed.
- The meeting was adjourned

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Feb 2, 2015 2:00 ET** (moved from Feb 3 to Monday Feb 2)

- 2017 Sunset - Ethanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Isopropanol (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Hydrated lime (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Sodium fluoaluminate, Potassium chloride (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunset - Strychnine (ZS) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets - Calcium hypochlorite, Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite (FT) - discuss summary/questions
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate (petition to remove and sunset)
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion
- 2017 Sunsets – Micronutrients (Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt) (CBe) - discuss summary/questions

**Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any

- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion and suff determination
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD)
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency of Nonylphenol ethoxylates.

**Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET** - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday February 24, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) sitting in; Paula Daniels (PD)
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 02 02 15 | Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 02 02 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development | 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015 | 02 24 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)<br>Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 02 17 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 02 17 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | 02 24 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 02 24 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e)<br>205.601(i)<br>205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j)<br>205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 01 27 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 02 17 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | 02 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 17 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 02 24 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | TBD | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | 01 27 15 | Spr 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15<br><br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |

| Inert Ingredients | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts update | ~~JFe~~/ZS | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo/~~JFe~~ | ~~DD~~ Report | | NA | Written report Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from February 17, 2015
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT)
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets Inerts –2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 17, 2015 approved with no changes
- **2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based** (FT). Waiting for TR. Discussed questions previously.
- **2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers** (FT). Waiting for TR. Discussed questions previously.
- **2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT).** A previous TR provided answers to many of the questions the lead posed, but the CS had a couple of other questions to add to the posting. The CS Chair noted that public comment would be useful but suggested that a Limited Scope TR would be helpful in the future.
- **2017 Sunsets (CBo)**
    - **Sticky traps/barriers.** The CS will pose questions for the first posting in spring 2015.
    - **Microcrystalline cheesewax.** Petroleum product. Alternatives may be available. The CS will pose questions for the first posting, and discussed need for future limited scope TR for the next review.

    - **Boric Acid**. The Subcommittee will add questions for public comment. Group members asked that any declarative statements regarding the material (e.g. 'the substance is toxic') have citations. Many members felt that this type of language does not belong in the first posting for a material, but instead could be included in any attached checklist. Some members pointed out the references were limited and not scientifically rigorous.
- **2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe).** There was a 1995 TAP and the CS is waiting for a new TR. The CS will not add additional questions outside of the standards questions that the NOP included in the template.
- **2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA).** Listed at 205.605k (synthetic substance). Used to initiate pineapple flowering. No new TR was contracted; the most recent is from 2011. Questions will be related to use by smaller growers, and current practices. One member asked about environmental impacts of this substance.
- **Contaminants in Farm Inputs (**CBo). The draft document was sent immediately before the call so the group deferred the discussion until others had a chance to read it.
- **2017 Sunsets** - **Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate** (ZS). The CS Chair created her own review form as she felt the checklist format was not conducive to this review. The alternative form was composed with criteria directly taken from OFPA. The CS will add several questions for public comment. A member asked about contamination in water runoff, which she also noted is regulated under the EPA and Clean Water Act. The Chair noted that that is more of a concern for copper used in rice production. She also noted that copper accumulation varies greatly, but under current organic management practices it should not accumulate.
- **2017 Sunsets (ZS) Inerts** - The CS received a limited scope TR on nonylphenols, a subset of Inerts. At this time the group will provide a document that includes information about the collaboration between the NOSB/NOP and EPA, and what the intention is moving forward.
- **2017 Sunsets - Lignin sulfonate (CBe).** CBe will review additional information supplied to her by JR. A separate petition to remove lignin sulfonate as a floating agent was sent to the NOSB. Discussion on this will be delayed to a later meeting since it is not on the April agenda.
- The meeting was adjourned

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Feb 17, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunsets - Ammonium carbonate, Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Potassium bicarbonate (HA) - TR discussion and suff determination
- 2017 Sunsets - Hydrogen peroxide (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal, Sodium silicate, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3 (PD)
- 2017 Sunsets - EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern (ZS) - Discuss TR Sufficiency of Nonylphenol ethoxylates.

**Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET** - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT)
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available

- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove – deferred to next call

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**

- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Discuss any TRs that come in the interim.

**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**
**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday March 3, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) sitting in; Paula Daniels (PD)
**Absent:** Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT)
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 02 02 15 | Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 02 02 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development | 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP | 02 24 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP | 02 24 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)<br>Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 02 17 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 02 17 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | 02 24 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 02 24 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e)<br>205.601(i)<br>205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j)<br>205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 01 27 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 02 17 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | 02 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 17 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 02 24 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | TBD | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | 01 27 15 | Spr 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15.<br><br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |

| Inert Ingredients | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts update | ZS, PD | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | Report | | NA | Written report Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from February 24, 2015
- Lignin Sulfonate petition to remove. Discuss next steps.
- Work Agenda for fall 2015 - including next step on Contamination of Inputs?
- Research Priorities for Fall 2015 - timeline
- Set agenda for calls before spring meeting (Cancel 3/17 call?)
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 24, 2015 were not available for review
- **2017 Sunset TRs.** The Chair asked that members review the TRs for Herbicides, Soap-based and Soap-based algicide/demossers so the CS can determine sufficiency by Friday March 6 and get them posted by the spring meeting deadline. Several members noted that the two TRs were very well written and thorough.
- **Lignin Sulfonate.** Discussion deferred to May
- **Contamination of Inputs report** - Members discussed the feedback that NOP provided on the spring 2015 report, and made some edits to the draft document. ZS will send the revised document to the NOP for posting
- **Work agenda** - The group discussed the next steps for the Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs report. Potentially this could be a discussion document for the fall 2015 meeting.
- **Research Priorities**. The CS Chair reminded the members to continue to be proactive so they can narrow the list, which they will then send to the Materials Subcommittee. The CS will discuss this after the spring meeting.
- **Call agenda.** The CS will cancel two calls: March 17 due to a conflict with a webinar on fire blight, and May 5 which is immediately after the spring meeting.
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous CS Notes]

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Feb 24, 2015 2:00 ET** - Additional call

- 2017 Sunsets - Herbicides, soap-based (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Soap-based algicide/demossers (FT) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Soaps, insecticidal (PD/FT)
- 2017 Sunsets - Sticky traps/barriers, Microcrystalline cheesewax, Boric Acid (CBo) - discuss summary/questions if any
- 2017 Sunsets - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E (CBe) - Discuss TR Sufficiency if available
- 2017 Sunsets - Ethylene (HA) - discuss summary/questions if any
- Contaminants in Farm Inputs (CBo) - continue discussion
- 2017 Sunsets - Coppers (fixed), Copper sulfate (ZS) Discuss Checklists
- 2017 Sunsets (CBe) - Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove – deferred to next call

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**

- Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Discuss any TRs that come in the interim.
- Work Agenda for Fall 2015 - including next step on Contamination of Inputs
- Research Priorities for Fall 2015 - timeline
- Set agenda for calls before spring meeting

**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET** canceled due to conflict with E-organic webinar**.**

**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**

Public comments review

Discuss addition of calls (likely not needed)

**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

**May 5, 2015 - canceled**

**May 19, 2015 2:00 ET**

Lignin sulfonate

Research Priorities

**June 2, 2015**

**June 16, 2015**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

**August 4, 2015**

**August 18, 2015**

**September 1, 2015**

**September 15, 2015**

**October 6, 2015**

**October 20, 2015**

**November 3, 2015**

**November 17, 2015**

**December 1, 2015**

**December 15, 2015**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |

| | |
|---|---|
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday April 7, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Tom Chapman (TC); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Paula Daniels (PD); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in;
**Absent:**
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate<br>205.601(h)<br>CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br><br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br><br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br><br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride<br>205.601(n)<br>CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br><br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br><br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014<br>Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols)<br>205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 02 02 15 | Summar: Spr 2015<br>Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 02 02 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP | 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 02 17 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 02 17 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | 02 24 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Chlorine Materials: Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 02 24 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | “ |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | “ |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Chlorine Materials: Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | 02 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 02 24 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |

| **Petitioned Substances** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | TBD | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide)<br><br>List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)<br>List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. Petition withdrawn 03 11 15 | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate<br>List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one<br>CAS # 10519-33-2<br>List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | 01 27 15 | Spr 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate – Food Waste | | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. | | |
| Ash from Manure Burning | | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts update | ZS, PD | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | Report | | NA | Written report Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from February 24, 2015
- Approve notes from March 3, 2015
- Discuss additional calls for next semester
- Discuss public comments received so far
- Approach for presentations at spring meeting
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of February 24, and March 3, 2015 were approved with no changes.
- **Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E.** The **TR Sufficiency review** will be completed on the next call
- **Additional calls for next semester.** The CS will add 4 calls to the summer agenda and cancel any that are not needed. See below for proposed dates.
- On April 21 the CS will schedule materials for discussion for remainder of summer
- **Public comments.** Members will review the comments on the next call as many of them are not posted yet.

- **Approach for presentations at spring meeting.** The National List Manager will give a brief introduction to the substance, and the lead reviewer will summarize comments and discuss. The materials will be presented in the order in which they appear on the National List, except where there are multiple listings and it is more efficient to group them. The CS Chair asked that members let MA know if they will have presentations, or the proposal will be projected. The CS will finalize this list on the April 21 call.
- The CS will briefly discuss the **withdrawn petition for Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC)** at the meeting, so the public knows it was withdrawn.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Mar 3, 2015 2:00 ET**

- Lignin sulfonate. Discuss proposal for petition to remove
- Discuss any TRs that come in the interim.
- Work Agenda for Fall 2015 - including next step on Contamination of Inputs
- Research Priorities for Fall 2015 - timeline
- Set agenda for calls before spring meeting

**Mar 17, 2015 2:00 ET** canceled due to conflict with E-organic webinar**.**

**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**

Public comments review
Discuss addition of calls (likely not needed)

**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

TR Sufficiency on Vitamins
Schedule materials for discussions for remainder of summer
Prepare for presentations at the meeting

**May 5, 2015 - canceled**

**May 19, 2015 2:00 ET**

Lignin sulfonate
Research Priorities

**June 2, 2015**
**June 16, 2015**
**June 23, 2015 - additional call**
**June 30, 2015 - additional call**
**July 7, 2015**
**July 21, 2015**
**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|

| | |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday April 21, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Harold Austin (HA); Carmela Beck (CBe); Tom Chapman (TC); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in;
**Absent:** Paula Daniels (PD)
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2016 Sunsets**
**Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR requested | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ferric phosphate 205.601(h) CAS # 10045–86–0) | CBe | 2004 TAP<br>2010 TR<br>2012 TR Supp<br>No additional TR | Sunset Date: 09 12 16<br>2003 Petition to add to 205.601<br>2003 Petition supplement<br>2005 NOSB rec (passed)<br>2009 Petition to remove from 205.601(h)<br>2012 NOSB rec (failed) | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |
| Hydrogen chloride 205.601(n) CAS # 7647-01-0) | ~~JFo~~/FT | 2014 Lmtd Scope TR<br>2003 TAP | Sunset Date: 09 12 16. Used to de-lint cotton post harvest.<br>2002 Petition<br>NOSB rec<br>Request for Lmtd scope TR sent to the NOP 01 21 14. TR sent to CS 05 16 14. Sufficiency due 07 16 14. TR found sufficient 06 17 14. CS will include questions in the fall 2014 doc for posting. | 01 20 15 | Summary: Fall 2014 Review: Spr 2015 |

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Summary discussion | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 02 02 15 | Summar: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 02 02 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 01 27 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 17 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ~~JFe~~/ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 02 24 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Summary discussion** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 Y | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 02 17 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996 Y | | 01 20 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 02 17 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | ~~JFe/~~CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 02 02 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | ~~JFo/~~PD | 1994 | Low priority | 02 24 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | ~~JFe~~/CBo | | Low priority | 01 27 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Chlorine Materials: Chlorine dioxide 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 02 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 02 24 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | ~~JFe~~/FT | | | 01 20 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 02 02 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 01 27 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 01 20 15 | “ |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 01 20 15 | “ |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ~~JFo~~/ZS | | | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Chlorine Materials: Sodium hypochlorite 205.601(a) | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 02 02 15 | “ |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ~~JFe/~~ZS | | | 02 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 01 27 15 | “ |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | ~~JFo~~/PD | 2011 | | 02 17 15 | “ |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 02 24 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | ~~JFe~~/HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 02 24 15 | |

| **Petitioned Substances** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | Y Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015) | TBD | TBD |
| Exhaust gas (Carbon Monoxide) List at §205.601 | FT | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 06 06 12. Petition deemed insufficient 12 04 12. Petition revised and sent to CS 2 22 13. Revised Petition Sufficiency Review; Rcv'd info from EPA 03 07 13 addressing CS's questions. Questions sent back to petitioner; Petition sufficiency due ASAP. Petition found suff 01 21 14. TR request sent to NOP. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent to CS 10 0 6 14. Sufficiency due 12 05 14. TR found sufficient 12 02 14. | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) List at 205.601 | HA | 2014 TR | Petition sent to CS on 01 22 13. Petition suff due March 22, 2014. Petition found sufficient 03 04 14. TR request sent to NOP ~ 04 01 14. TR in development (expected September 2014). TR sent 10 06 14. TR found sufficient 11 18 14. Petition withdrawn 03 11 15 | 12 16 14 | Spr 2015 |
| Calcium Sulfate List at 205.601 | ZS | N | Petition sent to CS on 06 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 08 19 14. Petition found sufficient 09 02 14. No TR request. | 01 07 15 | Spr 2015 |
| 3-decene-2-one CAS # 10519-33-2 List at 205.601 | CBe | N | Petition sent to CS on 09 24 14. Questions or request for TR due 11 24 14. Petition found sufficient 12 02 14. No TR request | 01 27 15 | Spr 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate – Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | . | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. | | TBD |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR reqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts update | ZS, PD | N/A | Inerts - report on progress with Design for the Environment (DfE) | NA | Verbal Report Spr 2015 |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | Report | | NA | Written report Spr 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from April 7, 2015
- TR Sufficiency for Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E
- Seaweed extracts - Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15.
- New Petitions: assign lead person for petition sufficiency, TR request.
    - Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste (link sent April 8)
    - Ash from Manure Burning (link sent April 8)
    - Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients (link sent April 13)
- Review public comments
- Set call agendas for May 19, June 2 and beyond
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of April 7, 2015 were not available for review at the time of the call.
- **TR Sufficiency on Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E.** The TR was found sufficient. The Crops Chair will send confirmation to the National List Manager.
- **New Petitions:** The CS received the following petitions and assigned a lead reviewer to each.
    - **Anaerobic Digestate** - Food Waste. ZS volunteered to lead this review.
    - **Ash from Manure Burning** - CBe volunteered to lead this review.
    - **Sulfuric Acid** for solubilizing micronutrients - FT volunteered to lead this review.
- **Public comments**. The CS members discussed comments. The Chair asked that the lead on the Contamination of Farm Inputs document clarify at the April meeting that this is a preliminary report and it is not a project the Board is currently voting on, as there seemed to be some confusion. EPA List 4 Inerts and Copper products received substantial comments and the CS Chair felt that the group will need to spend more time at the meeting discussing these. The Chair also noted that she used a new format for the checklists that eliminated the checkboxes, which she feels makes it clearer. The group discussed Biobased bio-mulch and the potential of adding it to the work agenda for further work. The NOP requested some additional information from the technical review contractor and will pass that along to the CS to aid in their decision making. The CS requested that the Deputy Administrator address two topics at the April NOSB meeting: Chilean nitrate, and the ability to make annotation /classification changes.
- **Schedule**. The group scheduled materials for discussion for the next few meetings.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**Apr 7, 2015 2:00 ET**

Public comments review

Discuss addition of calls (likely not needed)

**Apr 21, 2015 2:00 ET**

TR Sufficiency on Vitamins

Schedule materials for discussions for remainder of summer

Prepare for presentations at the meeting

**May 5, 2015 - canceled**

**May 19, 2015 2:00 ET**

Lignin sulfonate (CBe)

Research Priorities (ALL)

2017 Sunsets - schedule assignments

Laminarin - TR sufficiency

Seaweed extracts - Petition sufficiency/TR request (CBe)

602 items (CBo) - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate)

**June 2, 2015**

2017 sunsets (HA)

2017 sunsets (FT) Arsenic, Lead salts

**June 16, 2015**

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

**July 7, 2015**

**July 21, 2015**

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Spring 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOSB Training | Feb 4-5, 2015 |
| NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | Feb 7, 2015 |
| NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP | Feb 25, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Mar 9, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Mar 13, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Apr 6, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg) | Apr 10, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Apr 13, 2015 |
| Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA | Week of April 27 - 30 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday May 19, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Carmela Beck (CBe); Colehour Bondera (CBo)
**Absent:** Harold Austin (HA); Paula Daniels (PD)
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP<br>Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP<br>2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 23 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 07 07 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 06 23 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | PD | 1994 | Low priority | 06 16 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 07 21 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 16 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | PD | 2011 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | PD | 2011 | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 02 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to degreening. Not contracted. | 07 21 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**Petitioned Substances**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15 | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts)<br>205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. No new TR request.<br>NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste<br>205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning<br>205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15.<br>Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. | | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts<br>205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. | | TBD |

## Inert Ingredients

| Substance | Con-tact | TR rqstd? | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |

## Other Projects

| Project | Con-tact | Doc type | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve notes from April 7, 2015

- Approve notes from April 21, 2015
- Assign 2017 Sunset materials to future call dates
- Assign call dates for sufficiency of new petitions
    - Anaerobic Digestate, Manure Ash, Sulfuric Acid, Squid
- Research Priorities Reminder
- NEW Petition for Squid (see Lisa Brines' email from 5/12/15), to be assigned
- Lignin sulfonate, petition to remove (CBe)
- Laminarin, TR sufficiency (ZS)
- Seaweed extracts (CBe)- Petition sufficiency/TR request
- 602 items (CBo) - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate)
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of April 7 and April 21, 2015 were approved with no changes
- **2017 Sunset materials. The members** scheduled the review discussions for future calls. See table above for scheduled dates.
- **Assign call dates for sufficiency of new petitions**
    - Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - Petition sufficiency June 2
    - Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency June 2
    - Sulfuric Acid (TF) - Petition sufficiency June 2
    - Squid and Squid Byproducts (CBe) - Petition sufficiency July 7
- **Research Priorities Reminder** - The Materials Subcommittee asked that the Research Priorities be forwarded to them in a timely manner, so they have enough time to prioritize them for final submission. The CS Chair asked that each member make note of items that may make good research topics as they are reviewing their materials. For example, public comment indicated the need for more research on coppers.
- **Lignin sulfonate, petition to remove (CBe) -** The lead summarized the public comment from the spring docket. There was overwhelming support for removal of this material, and/or an indication that lignin sulfonate was no longer in use. The CS will not request a new TR. The lead will write the proposal and have it ready for discussion and a vote on the next call.
- **Laminarin (ZS)** - The group discussed Laminarin and the information provided in the TR. Laminarin is mainly produced in France where there are strict controls on production. It is similar to the seaweed extract substance that is produced in Ireland. . Laminarin is used for disease control and is registered by EPA. The lead found the TR to be sufficient and will write a proposal for discussion, which will include a classification of non-synthetic. The CS plans to discuss and vote on June 16.
- **Seaweed extracts (CBe).**The lead indicated that seaweed extracts, which used as a fertilizer and "plant strengthener", are harvested in Ireland, and a member added that because they are harvested using an acid-base process, and according to the draft classification guidance, they are non-synthetic, It is . The CS will not request a TR, but instead will proceed to the proposal stage. The petition was found sufficient.
- **602 items (CBo) - Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate)** - discussion deferred to next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**May 5, 2015 - canceled**

**May 19, 2015 2:00 ET**

Lignin sulfonate (CBe)

Research Priorities (ALL)
2017 Sunsets - Assign discussion dates
Laminarin (ZS) - TR sufficiency
Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request

**June 2, 2015**

Misc sunset items (See table above for discussion dates)
Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - TR sufficiency
Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
Sulfuric Acid (TF) - TR sufficiency
Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) (CBo)

**June 16, 2015**

Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**
**June 30, 2015 - additional call**
**July 7, 2015**

Squid -TR sufficiency
Research priorities - Discuss topics

**July 21, 2015**
**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday June 2, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in
**Absent:** Carmela Beck (CBe); Paula Daniels (PD); Harold Austin (HA)
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP<br>2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary :<br>Spr 2015<br>Review: |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP<br>Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP<br>2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP<br>2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 23 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 16 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 07 07 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 06 23 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | PD | 1994 | Low priority | 06 16 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 07 21 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 16 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | PD | 2011 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 16 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | PD | 2011 | | 06 16 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 21 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

| **2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Contact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | | | Sunset date: 5/29/2018 | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| **Petitioned Substances** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15 | | TBD |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. | | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. | | TBD |

| Inert Ingredients | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR rqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |

| Other Projects | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of May 19
- Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - Petition sufficiency/TR request
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request
- Sulfuric Acid (FT) - Petition sufficiency/TR request
- Lignin sulfonate petition to remove (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
- Misc 2017 sunset items (CBo, FT, PD, ZS)
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of May 19 were deferred to next call.
- **Voting:** The Crops Subcommittee chose to proceed with discussions and voting, despite the lack of quorum on the call, and will leave any votes open so absent members can vote via email.
- **Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) -** Petition sufficiency/TR request. The petitioner indicates that Anaerobic Digestate is used to recycle food waste from restaurants and grocery stores and therefore should be placed into the same category as manure. The lead asked for feedback about the need for a TR to look at the sulfuric acid component, which is used to stabilize the pH. The CS will consider the need for a TR when it discusses the other materials that also use sulfuric acid. The petition was found sufficient.
- **Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request.** Deferred to next call
- **Sulfuric Acid (FT) - Petition sufficiency/TR request.** Deferred to next call
- **Lignin sulfonate petition to remove (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.** Deferred to next call
- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
    - **Ash from manure burning.** The lead summarized the material and the CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

      Motion to remove ash from burning manure from 205.602(a)
      Motion by: FT
      Seconded by: ZS

Additional Discussion:
Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate).** Members briefly discussed the material, and the CS Chair opened the vote which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

  Motion to remove tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) from 205.602(i)
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: ZS
  Additional Discussion:
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Boric acid.** The members discussed the language in the review and made some edits. The CS postponed the vote until the next call so the changes can be incorporated first.

- **Sticky traps/barriers.** The CS Chair suggested some minor edits and summarized the review. She feels that the previous TAP is not adequate as an exclusive source of information as it is based on outdated information; Traps now use specific lures, are targeted towards specific pests, and are better utilized. She added that while non-targeted species are still sometimes caught, the traps are overall very successful. The CS Chair asked the lead to include a narrative in the review as opposed to including a reference citing the optional checklist. The CS will defer voting until the modifications are made.

- **Microcrystalline cheesewax.** Based on information gleaned from public comment the group discussed the suitability and availability of alternatives, which they feel is not entirely clear. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

  Motion to remove Microcrystalline cheesewax from 205.601(o)
  Motion by: CBo
  Seconded by: FT
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 1 No: 2 Abstain: 2 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **2017 sunset items (FT)**

  - **Arsenic.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about arsenic. Arsenic does not meet the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

    Motion to remove Arsenic from 205.602(b)
    Motion by: FT
    Seconded by: ZS
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
    ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Lead salts.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about this material. Lead salts do not meet the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

  Motion to remove lead salts from 205.602(d)
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: ZS
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
  ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **2017 sunset items (ZS)**

  - **Potassium chloride.** The NOSB received few comments about Potassium chloride, a natural substance which is prohibited unless used in a manner that prevents chloride accumulation. While there are alternatives to potassium chloride, a vote to remove would make it available for use without restriction, and as such the CS supports continued listing on 205.602. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

    Motion to remove potassium chloride salts from 205.602(e)
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: FT
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0.
    ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

  - **Sodium fluoaluminate.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about Sodium fluoaluminate. This material does not satisfy the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

    Motion to remove Sodium fluoaluminate from 205.602(f)
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: FT
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
    ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

  - **Strychnine.** The NOSB didn't receive any comments about Strychnine. This material does not satisfy the OFPA criteria and as such the CS supports continued prohibition. The CS Chair opened the vote, which will remain open until the absent members have an opportunity to vote.

    Motion to remove strychnine from 205.602(h)
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: FT
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0
    ABS note: added votes from absent members on June 10

- **Other Items.** The CS will determine at a later date if the additional call on June 30 will not be necessary.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**May 19, 2015 2:00 ET**

Lignin sulfonate (CBe)
Research Priorities (ALL)
2017 Sunsets - Assign discussion dates
Laminarin (ZS) - TR sufficiency
Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Petition sufficiency/TR request

**June 2, 2015**

Misc 2017 sunset items (See table above for discussion dates)
Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - TR sufficiency
Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
Sulfuric Acid (FT) - TR sufficiency
Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) (CBo)

**June 16, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBo) Complete review and vote: Boric Acid, Sticky traps
2017 sunset items (PD) Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
Sulfuric Acid (FT) - TR sufficiency
Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**
**June 30, 2015 - additional call**
**July 7, 2015**

Squid -TR sufficiency
Research priorities - Discuss topics

**July 21, 2015**
**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |

| | |
|---|---|
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday June 16, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in, Jean Richardson - sitting in
**Absent:** Paula Daniels (PD)
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates. TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 23 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 07 07 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 06 23 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | PD | 1994 | Low priority | 06 23 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 07 21 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | PD | 2011 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | PD | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 21 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | | | Sunset date: 5/29/2018 | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| **Petitioned Substances** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15 | | TBD |
| Lignin sulfonate | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. | | TBD |

| Inert Ingredients | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR rqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |

| Other Projects | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of May 19
- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 2
- 2017 sunset items (CBo) Complete review and vote: Boric Acid, Sticky traps
- Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency
- Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- Sulfuric Acid (FT) - Petition sufficiency
- 2017 sunset items (CBe) Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate
- 2017 sunset items (FT) Complete review and vote: Isopropanol, Ethanol, Soap-based algicide/demossers, Herbicides, soap-based,
  Soaps, ammonium
- 2017 sunset items (PD) Complete review and vote: Soaps, insecticidal, Sucrose octanoate esters
- Other Items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of May 19 were approved with no changes.
- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 2 were approved with minor changes to the voting on microcrystalline cheesewax and a clerical error.
- **Sulfuric Acid (FT) -** The lead summarized the petition for the group and added that although the petition was lengthy it did not include information about essentiality. Sulfuric Acid is used for manufacture of micronutrients. Based on information in the TR he notes that this material is not compatible with organic principles and does not support a holistic approach. The petition was found sufficient, and no TR will be requested. The lead will prepare a proposal and the HS will discuss it on the July 21 call. Another member noted that Anaerobic Digestate, which was recently petitioned, is treated with sulfuric acid in large quantities. The HS discussed Anaerobic Digestate briefly and will discuss it

further on a later call. The NOP suggested that the HS may want to request a TR for Anaerobic Digestates.

- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
  - **Boric Acid.** The lead incorporated revisions to the document that the HS discussed on the last call and recirculated the draft document. The CS Chair noted that there were a couple of edits that were not made and asked that the lead complete the additions. The group discussed alternatives to boric acid. While there are some alternatives available, boric acid is considered the least toxic of these.

    Motion to remove Boric Acid from § 205.601(e)
    Motion by: CBe
    Seconded by: CBo
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  - **Sticky traps.** The revisions discussed on the last call were not incorporated in the latest version, so the CS Chair offered to send the lead the revised text to be incorporated. She noted that the information in the 1995 TAP is outdated and the proposal should reflect the change in the industry, as the traps have changed and improved.

- **Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) -** Petition sufficiency. Currently this material is prohibited. The lead noted that the key argument the petitioners make is that the production processes has changed, and is much more controlled, which leads to better preservation and less waste of nutrients. Members questioned whether the current process is substantially different; the CS Chair feels that it is not. The group will defer the discussion of this material while they research more. They will revisit the review once the 2017 sunset review is completed.

- **Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe)** - Discussion deferred to next call.

- **2017 sunset items (CBe)** - Discussions deferred to next call.
  - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E
  - Lignin sulfonate

- **2017 sunset items (FT)**
  - **Isopropanol.** Similar to ethanol. Allowed for use as an algicide, disinfectant and sanitizer. Public commenters were supportive of continued use of isopropanol as a safe and effective sanitizer

    Motion to remove Isopropanol from § 205.601(a)(1)
    Motion by: FT
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  - **Ethanol.** Allowed for use as an algicide, disinfectant and sanitizer including irrigation system cleaning. Commenters were supportive of relisting as it is considered to be safe and effective. Some comments indicated that natural sources should be used. The lad indicated that some of the natural sources have a larger ecological impact.

    Motion to remove Ethanol from § 205.601(a)(1)
    Motion by: FT
    Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Soap-based algicide/demossers.** Comments were general and mixed, and the CS didn't receive any responses to their question about alternatives. The group discussed how this material is used. A member noted that it was used to flush drip irrigation systems to clean algae buildup, but was unsure if the industry is currently using it. The CS will add language to the review indicating that they are seriously considering removal since there is no compelling evidence that it is in use. FT will revise the language and recirculate the document.

  Motion to remove Soap-based algicide/demossers from § 205.601(a)(7)
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: CBe
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Herbicides, soap-based. Commenters supported keeping this material on the list.** The TR indicated that soaps are toxic to aquatic plants and algae, and aquatic animals are sensitive to these substances. The group agreed that if soaps are used according to their allowed use in terrestrial systems they should not be a problem for aquatic organisms.

  Motion to remove Herbicides, soap-based from § 205.601(b)
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: The CS Chair asked that the lead add the reasons to the review about why commenters supported the continued listing.
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Soaps, ammonium.** Ammonium soaps are used as a deer repellent. The CS received no comments opposed to relisting, and one comment from an organization indicating that some of its members depended on the use of ammonium soaps in their organic operations.

  Motion to remove Soaps, ammonium from § 205.601(d)
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: CBe
  Additional Discussion: The CS Chair noted a clerical error in the document referring to ammonium salts, which the lead will correct.
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (PD)** - Deferred to next call
  - Soaps, insecticidal
  - Sucrose octanoate esters
- **Other Items** - Items that were deferred will be discussed and voted on during the June 23 call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**June 2, 2015**

Misc 2017 sunset items (See table above for discussion dates)

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
Anaerobic Digestate (ZS) - Petition sufficiency
Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - TR sufficiency
Sulfuric Acid (TF) - TR sufficiency
Ash from manure burning, Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) (CBo)

**June 16, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBo) - Complete review and vote: Sticky traps
2017 sunset items (PD) - Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency
Sulfuric Acid (TF) - Petition sufficiency
Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote - postponed

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
2017 sunset items (CBe) - Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate
2017 sunset items (PD) - Complete review and vote: Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
Laminarin (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote
Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
Discuss anaerobic digestates (ZS) - TR determination

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

2017 sunset items (CBo) - Complete review and vote: Sticky traps
EPA List 4 inerts

**July 7, 2015**

Squid - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics

**July 21, 2015**

**Sulfuric acid proposal discussion and vote**

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |

| | |
|---|---|
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday June 23, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Paula Daniels (PD), Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Jean Richardson - sitting in
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 07 07 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 06 30 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | PD | 1994 | Low priority | 07 07 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 30 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 07 21 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | PD | 2011 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | PD | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | PD | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 21 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | ZS | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | FT | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | HA | | Sunset date: 5/29/2018 | 07 07 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | ZS | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | 07 07 15 | |
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | CBe | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15 | Scheduled for June 30 | TBD |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | 06 23 15 | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plants extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | Scheduled for June 30 | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper? | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Aluminum sulfate | JR | Y | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15 | | Proposal Fall 2015 |

## Inert Ingredients

| Substance | Con-tact | TR rqstd? | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |

## Other Projects

| Project | Con-tact | Doc type | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 16
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
  - Sticky traps
- Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote
- Seaweed extracts petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal
- 2017 sunset items (CBe) - Discuss review and vote
  - Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E
  - Lignin sulfonate
- 2017 sunset items (PD)
  - Soaps, insecticidal
  - Sucrose octanoate ester
  - Vitamin D3
- Laminarin petition (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote
- Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS) - TR determination
- 2018 sunset materials - assign leads
- Other Items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 16 approved with no changes. MA will add Aluminum Sulfate to the work agenda above. The petition was submitted to both LS and CS, and each Subcommittee will conduct a review.
- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
    - **Sticky traps -** The document was modified after the last call and recirculated to the group. The HS proceeded to a vote:

      Motion to remove Sticky traps from §205.601(e)
      Motion by: FT
      Seconded by: CBe
      Additional Discussion: Comments about impact on non-target animals were addressed in the background section.
      Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

    - **Soap based algicide and demossers.** The CS Chair noted that essentiality was included in the revised proposal but is not an OFPA criteria for Crops. Instead she suggested including compatibility, necessity, or alternatives as the review criteria, and will make the change. This material was voted on during the last meeting and the members accepted the proposal with the current revisions.

    - **Aluminum sulfate.** FT volunteered to lead the review of this material and will work with JR who is reviewing the same material for Livestock. TR sufficiency is due July 15.

- **Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe).** Used as a floating agent. The lead and a member both indicated that based on comments there are no handlers using lignin sulfonate as it is listed on NL.

  Motion to remove Lignin Sulfonate from section **205.601(l)(1)** of the National List for use as a floating agent in postharvest handling
  Motion by: CBe
  Seconded by: CBo
  Additional Discussion: A member noted some clerical errors in the checklist, which the lead will correct. Another member added that he knows of no one in the industry using lignin sulfonate because disposal is an environmental concern. The group also discussed the checklist and the fact that they are outdated and need revision. The CS Chair reminded the group that she developed a pilot form that she used to review Copper and received favorable comments about it.
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Seaweed extracts petition (CBe).** Deferred to next call.
- **2017 sunset items (CBe)**
    - **Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E. The HS is i**nterested in information about usage. The TR contained little information about efficacy. Vitamins C and E are used as antioxidants in liquid formulated fertilizers.

      Motion to remove Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, from §205.601j8
      Motion by: CBe
      Seconded by: HA
      Additional Discussion: A member identified some language in the review that would need to be removed based on the vote.
      Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

    - **Lignin sulfonate.** The CS chair suggested adding a sentence to the sunset review about the other lignin sulfonate review in which they are proposing to remove it from §205.601(i). The HS

would like to make it clear that the proposal to remove is separate from the sunset review. The group edited some minor language.

Motion to remove lignin sulfonate from § 205.601(j)(4) as chelating agent and dust suppressant

Motion by: CBe
Seconded by: HA
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (PD)**
  - **Sucrose octanoate ester (SOE).** Used both in livestock and crops to control insects. There are solvents of low toxicity used in the manufacture of SOEs. The lead noted that there are alternatives, and the received very few public comments, and no opposition to this materials remaining on the list.

    Motion to remove Sucrose octanoate ester from §205.601(e)
    Motion by: PD
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Vitamin D3. As** supplements for humans vitamin D3 is deemed safe, but it is used as a rodenticide in Crops, which essentially causes rodents to have a heart attack. Public commenters called this out as an inhumane process. The CS Chair asked that information about compatibility be added, which she will do. A member expressed support for this material. Another member noted that it is used in a controlled environment in a trap, therefor not likely harmful to non-target species.

    Motion to remove vitamin D from §205.601(g)
    Motion by: PD
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Laminarin petition (ZS).** Deferred to next call
- **Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS).** The NOP suggested a white paper on this topic and feels it would be more effective and useful than a TR. The NOP will explore options for contracting this work.
- **Other Items - none**
- **2018 sunset materials. The CS assigned lead reviewers to the following:**
  - **Copper sulfate (ZS)**
  - **Ozone gas (FT)**
  - **Paracetic acid (HA)**
  - **EPA list 3 inters (ZS)**
  - **Calcium chloride (CBe)**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**
**June 16, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBo) - Complete review and vote: Sticky traps
2017 sunset items (PD) - Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
Ash from Manure Burning (CBe) - Petition sufficiency
Sulfuric Acid (TF) - Petition sufficiency
Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
Laminarin - Discuss proposal/vote - postponed

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
2017 sunset items (CBe) - Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate
2017 sunset items (PD) - Complete review and vote: Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
Laminarin petition (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote
Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
Discuss anaerobic digestate (ZS) - TR determination

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote
2017 sunset items (ZS). EPA List 4 inerts, Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime
2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials

**July 7, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBe).
- Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)
- Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2017 sunset items (PD) - Insecticidal soap, Sodium silicate
2018 sunset TR determinations
- EPA list 3 (ZS)
- Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
Squid (CBe) - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics
Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

**July 21, 2015**

2018 sunset TR determinations.
- Copper sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday June 30, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Jean Richardson - sitting in
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 07 07 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 06 30 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | FT | 1994 | Low priority | 07 21 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 30 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 07 21 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | FT | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | CBo | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 21 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | ZS | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | FT | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | HA | | Sunset date: 5/29/2018 | 07 07 15 | |
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | ZS | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | 07 07 15 | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | CBe | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL | 06 30 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | 06 23 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | 07 21 15 | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for White paper | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | 07 21 15 | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Aluminum sulfate | JR | Y | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15 | | Proposal Fall 2015 |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR rqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 23
- Reassign PD's materials: Sodium silicate, Soaps, insecticidal, Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
- Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
- Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunset items (ZS). Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime
- 2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials
- Other Items
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 23 approved with no changes.
- The CS Chair asked for volunteers to take over the review of four of the 2017 sunset materials. Two reviews have been completed and two have yet to be reviewed:
    - **Sodium silicate** - CBe. Scheduled for July 21
    - **Soaps, insecticidal** - FT. Scheduled for July 21
    - **Sucrose octanoate esters** - FT. Review was completed
    - **Vitamin D3** - CBo. Review was completed

- **Seaweed extracts petition (CBe) -** Brown seaweed extract is composed of naturally occurring components extracted from seaweed, including laminarin and fucoidan. Because this material is similar to laminarin, the limited scope TR for laminarin was used as part of this review. The group discussed both of these materials in conjunction with each other. The group will discuss this material further.

- **Laminarin petition (ZS).** At the request of the Crops Subcommittee the TR focused on extraction and conservation issues. Information from the TR suggests that the synthetic materials used to extract the seaweed do not cause a chemical change, do not remain in the final product nor do they have a technical or functional effect. Members discussed the proposal and proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to classify laminarin as petitioned as non-synthetic
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: A member commented about the extraction technique
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

  Since laminarin was classified as non-synthetic it does not need to be added to the National List.

- **2017 sunset items (ZS)**
  - **Hydrogen peroxide.** Used as a cleaning agent and for plant disease control. A new TR was requested and the lead summarized the information for the members. At full strength and in high concentrations hydrogen peroxide can be a strong oxidant and highly reactive, but when used as indicated it is not toxic and does not persist. The TR indicated that there are alternatives, but the data were not explicit about which alternatives could be used in what instances. (I.e. which alternatives would be used as cleaning agents vs. which ones for fire blight). The lead feels there is not enough research on the substitutes at this time. Commenters were supportive of keeping hydrogen peroxide on the list

    Motion to remove Hydrogen peroxide from §205.601(a) and §205.601(i)
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: CBe/HA
    Additional Discussion: A member noted that hydrogen peroxide is commonly used for fireblight control especially since antibiotics were removed from the list.
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

  - **Hydrated lime.** The lead noted that there were a number of related petitions including Ammonium hydroxide and Calcium hydroxide. Hydrated lime is commonly used to make Bordeaux mix. It is not allowed as a soil amendment. The material is synthetic but the lead indicated that it satisfies all OFPA criteria and no commenters provided evidence to the contrary.

    Motion to remove Hydrated Lime from 205.601
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: FT
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (FT)**
    - **Chlorine Materials** - The CS received no responses to a number of questions they posed for the first posting of chlorine materials. Commenters did respond to the question about necessity, relaying the need for chlorine materials and their support for continued listing. The CS Chair referenced the comments that were submitted to the Handling Subcommittee for the same materials, which she noted were more detailed than the comments submitted to the Crops Subcommittee.

Calcium hypochlorite is an EPA registered pesticide

Motion to remove **Calcium hypochlorite** from 205.601(a)
Motion by: FT
Seconded by: CBo
Additional Discussion: Members further discussed usage and alternatives
Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

Sodium hypochlorite is an EPA registered pesticide, similar to Calcium hypochlorite

Motion to remove **Sodium hypochlorite** 205.601(a)
Motion by: FT
Seconded by: CBo
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

The lead noted that chlorine dioxide is found to be a respiratory and eye irritant. The CS received no comments regarding this material

Motion to remove **Chlorine dioxide** from 205.601(a)
Motion by: FT
Seconded by: CBe
Additional Discussion: The CS Chair asked about the distinction between Chlorine dioxide and the other chlorine materials. NOP noted that chlorine dioxide is typically used as a gas, at lower rates and causes less formation of chlorine byproducts (trihalomethanes).
Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

- **Other Items - none**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**June 23, 2015 - additional call**

Lignin sulfonate petition (CBe) - Discuss proposal and vote.
2017 sunset items (CBe) - Complete review and vote: Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E, Lignin sulfonate
2017 sunset items (PD) - Complete review and vote: Sucrose octanoate esters, Vitamin D3
Laminarin petition (ZS) - Discuss proposal/vote

Seaweed extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
Discuss anaerobic digestate (ZS) - TR determination

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote
2017 sunset items (ZS). Discuss review, vote - Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime
2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials

**July 7, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBe).
- Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)
- Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2018 sunset TR determinations
- EPA list 3 (ZS)
- Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
Squid (CBe) - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics
Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

**July 21, 2015**

2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal
2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate
2018 sunset TR determinations.
- Copper sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote
2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)
Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
Squid (CBe) - TR determination

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |

| | |
|---|---|
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment webinars | Sep 22 & 29, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday July 7, 2015 2:00 pm ET draft**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA); Jean Richardson - sitting in
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | Low priority | 07 21 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | Low priority | 06 30 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | FT | 1994 | Low priority | 07 21 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | Low priority | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 30 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 07 21 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | FT | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | CBo | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 21 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | ZS | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | FT | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | HA | | Sunset date: 5/29/2018 | 07 21 15 | |
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | ZS | Y 2015 | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | CBe | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL | 06 30 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | 06 23 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | 07 21 15 | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper? | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Aluminum sulfate | JR | Y | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15 | | Proposal Fall 2015 |

**Inert Ingredients**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR rqstd? | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |

**Other Projects**

| Project | Con-tact | Doc type | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of June 30
- 2017 sunset items (CBe)
  - Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Micronutrients: [Soluble boron products], [Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt]
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
  - Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate
- 2018 sunset TR determinations
  - EPA list 3 (ZS)
  - Peracetic Acid (HA)
  - Copper Sulfate (ZS)
  - Ozone gas (FT)
  - Calcium Chloride (CBe)
- Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
- Squid (CBe) - TR determination
- Aluminum sulfate petition (FT). TR sufficiency
- Research priorities - Discuss topics
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of June 30 approved with no changes.
- **2017 sunset items (CBe)**
  - **Liquid fish products.** The lead summarized the material and its uses, noting that Liquid Fish products are critical to organic farming. The CS received positive feedback from commenters about keeping liquid fish products on the list Commenters also indicated that the annotation is sufficient and the common practice is to adjust the pH of the liquid fish product prior to being blended with other ingredients. The CS Chair suggested some minor changes to the text and the lead made some modifications.

    Motion to remove Liquid Fish products from 205.601(j) as a plant and soil amendment
    Motion by: CBe
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Magnesium sulfate.** The lead summarized the material and the group discussed it. The CS posed some questions about availability of non-synthetic magnesium sulfate. Commenters indicated that there were alternatives (such as Langbeinite) but they are not available in sufficient quantities. A member added that dolomite, which was put forth as an alternative, only works in low pH soils.

    Motion to remove Magnesium Sulfate from 205.601(j) as a plant and soil amendment
    Motion by: CBe
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Micronutrients:** Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt. Commenters were overwhelmingly in support of keeping micronutrients on the list. A couple commenters said that this fails OFPA criteria because micronutrients sometimes contain heavy metals. Contamination may also be a concern. In the first posting the CS indicated that they would propose an annotation. The CS Chair asked that this information be added to the review.

    Motion to remove Micronutrients from 205.601(j) as plant and soil amendment
    Motion by: CBe
    Seconded by: HA
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    Motion to change the annotation for Micronutrients as follows: 205.601 (j)(6) - As a plant or soil amendment. Micronutrients - not to be used as a defoliant, herbicide, or desiccant. Those made from nitrates or chlorides are not allowed. Deficiency must be documented.
    (i) Soluble boron products.
    (ii) Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt.
    Motion by: ZS
    Seconded by: FT

Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
  - **Newspaper or other recycled paper.** The lead summarized the review and the CS proceeded to a vote.

    Motion to remove newspaper or other recycled paper from 205.601(b) and 205.601(c)
    Motion by: HA
    Seconded by: CBe
    Additional Discussion: A member added that newspaper or other recycled paper is not used much in CA but it is used in other parts of the country. The Crops Chair asked that the review include specific language indicating that the CS will request a TR for future review.
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    The NOSB Chair suggested that the 5-page checklist be condensed to a couple of narrative paragraphs and be included in the proposal instead of being submitted separately.

  - **Plastic mulch and covers.** The lead summarized the material and past reviews. Members discussed the review document and the lead made some modifications based on the conversation.

    Motion to remove plastic mulch and covers from 205.601(j)
    Motion by: HA
    Seconded by: FT
    Additional Discussion: The NOSB Chair suggested that the CS vote as a Subcommittee on the use of checklists. The majority of the Subcommittee members suggested condensing the info from the checklist into a couple of narrative paragraphs to be included in the proposal. Since the checklist is optional, and is just a tool for the members to use to conduct their review.
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    Motion to not utilize checklists for sunset review and to instead add the pertinent part of the narrative text into the main body of the review.
    Motion by: HA
    Seconded by: CBe
    Discussion: A member expressed concern about not including the checklists. The remainder of the group indicated that by incorporating the text into the main document instead of appending it, it is easier for the public and future boards to locate the info.
    Yes: 4 No: 1 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  - **Ammonium carbonate.** Deferred to next call

- **2018 sunset TR determinations**
  - **EPA list 3 (ZS).** The CS will request a TR for this group of materials.
  - The remainder of the 2018 sunset material TR determinations will be postponed to the next call due to time constraints.
    - **Peracetic Acid (HA)**
    - **Copper Sulfate (ZS)**
    - **Ozone gas (FT)**
    - **Calcium Chloride (CBe)**
- **Anaerobic Digestate petition (ZS).** Deferred to next call

- **Squid petition (CBe).** TR determination. Deferred to next call
- **Aluminum sulfate petition (FT).** TR sufficiency. Deferred to next call
- **Research priorities** - Discuss topics. Deferred to next call
- **Other Items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**June 30, 2015 - additional call**

Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
Laminarin petition (ZS). Discuss proposal/vote
2017 sunset items (ZS). Discuss review, vote - Hydrogen peroxide, Hydrated lime
2017 sunset items (FT). Discuss review, vote - Chlorine Materials

**July 7, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBe).
- Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)
- Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2018 sunset TR determinations
- EPA list 3 (ZS)
- Peracetic Acid (HA)
- Copper Sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium Chloride (CBe)

Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
Squid petition (CBe) - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics
Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

**July 21, 2015**

2017 sunset materials (CBo) - Ammonium carbonate
2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal
2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate
2018 sunset TR determinations.
- Peracetic Acid (HA)
- Copper sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium chloride (CBe)

Anaerobic digestate petition (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
Squid petition (CBe) - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics
Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination
Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote
2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)
Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment webinars | Sep 22 & 29, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday July 21, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 28 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 08 04 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 21 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | | 06 30 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | FT | 1994 | | 07 28 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 30 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 07 28 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 07 28 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 28 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | FT | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | CBo | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 28 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | ZS | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | FT | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | HA | Y | Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15 | | |
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | ZS | Y 2015 | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | CBe | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL | 06 30 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | 06 23 15 | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | 07 28 15 | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper? | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Sunset date of 06 27 17 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15 | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Aluminum sulfate | JR | Y | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15 | | Proposal Fall 2015 |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR rqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of July 7
- 2018 sunset TR determinations
  - Peracetic Acid (HA)
  - Copper Sulfate (ZS)
  - Ozone gas (FT)
  - Calcium Chloride (CBe)
- Research priorities. Discuss topics
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
- Squid (CBe). TR determination
- Aluminum sulfate petition (FT). TR sufficiency
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
  - Ammonium carbonate
- 2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate, Aquatic plant extracts, Humic Acids
- 2017 sunset materials (HA) - Pheromones, Potassium Bicarbonate, ethylene
- Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed Adjourn
- Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT) - Discussion and vote

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of July 7 were approved with one change to the discussion of micronutrients and the reference to the annotation
- **2018 sunset TR determinations**
    - **Peracetic Acid (HA).** The lead summarized the material and recommended that the CS request a TR that includes all uses of this material (Crops and Livestock)

    - **Copper Sulfate (ZS).** Specifically for rice, and approved for control for algae and tadpole shrimp. Annotated for use only in a 24 month period. The lead feels no new info could be gleaned from a TR and the CS will not request one.

    - **Ozone gas (FT).** The lead summarized the material and the group discussed it. Ozone is a strong oxidizer, but its use is limited. The lead recommended not requesting a TR. The group will discuss this item in the future.

    - **Calcium Chloride (CBe).** Non synthetic substance on 205.602. The lead noted the history of the material including the most recent recommendation from 2006. The CS will not request a TR

- **Research priorities.** There were no additional topics nor further discussion on the research priorities
- **Seaweed Extracts (CBe).** Postponed to July 28 call
- **Squid (CBe). TR determination.** Petitioned for addition to 205.601. The lead summarized the document and the group discussed the need for a TR. The HS will request a TR to glean info on human health effects.
- **Aluminum sulfate petition (FT).** TR sufficiency. The lead feels the TR was lacking as it was geared towards conventional agriculture and not organic. However the CS did not see a need for further revision and will defer decision on TR to LS who is reviewing substance for application to manure in livestock facilities.
- **2017 sunset items (CBo)**
    - **Ammonium carbonate. T**he lead summarized the review and noted that the information from the checklist was incorporated into the narrative.

      Motion to remove Ammonium carbonate from 205.601(i)
      Motion by: HA
      Seconded by: CBe
      Additional Discussion:
      Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (CBe)**
    - **Sodium silicate.** The lead summarized the review including information from the petition, the TR, and public comment gleaned from the first posting. Public comment was limited and in the absence of industry support for relisting, the Subcommittee recommends allowing this material to be removed from the list.

      Motion to remove Sodium silicate from 205.601(j)
      Motion by: CBe
      Seconded by: CBo
      Additional Discussion: none
      Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Aquatic plant extracts.** The lead summarized the review including info from the petition, the TR, and public comment gleaned from the first posting. Public comment was limited and with the exception of one comment, the vast majority was supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove Aquatic plant extracts from 205.601(j)
Motion by: CBe
Seconded by: HA
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Humic Acids.** The lead summarized the review including info from the petition, the TR, and public comment gleaned from the first posting. The group discussed the various versions of humates, including the mined mineral and water extracted versions, and its uses on farms going through transition to build up soil quality. The Chair noted that some forms of humic acids are extracted with natural substances. There were no comments. The HS also discussed a potential annotation change.

  Motion to remove Humic Acids from 205.601(j)3
  Motion by: CBe
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: The group discussed the possibility of a annotation change during the next 5 years if they find it is needed.
  Yes: 2 No: 2 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (HA). Postponed to next call**
  - **Pheromones**
  - **Potassium Bicarbonate**
  - **Ethylene**
- **Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed - postponed to next call**
- **Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT). Discussion and vote - postponed to next call**
- **Other Items - none**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**July 7, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBe).
- Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)
- Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2018 sunset TR determinations
- EPA list 3 (ZS)
- Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
Squid (CBe) - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics
Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

**July 21, 2015**

2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate
2018 sunset TR determinations.
- Copper sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote
2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)
Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
The CS will submit a TR request with specific questions on newspaper to forward to the NOP.

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**

- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - discuss proposal.
- 2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

**August 4, 2015**
**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment webinars | Oct 13 & 20, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday July 28, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in; Jean Richardson - sitting in
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

**2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015**

| Substance | Con-tact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 28 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 08 04 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 21 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | | 06 30 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | FT | 1994 | | 07 28 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 30 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 08 04 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 28 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | FT | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | CBo | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 28 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | ZS | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | FT | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | HA | Y | Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15 | | |
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | ZS | Y 2015 | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | CBe | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL | 06 30 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | 06 23 15 | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | 08 04 15 | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper. | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15 | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Aluminum sulfate | JR | Y | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15 | | Proposal Fall 2015 |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR rqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | Report | | Fall 2015 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of July 21
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - discuss proposal
- Aluminum sulfate petition (FT). TR sufficiency
- 2017 sunset items (CBo)
    - Ammonium carbonate
- 2017 sunset materials (CBe). Sodium silicate, Aquatic plant extracts, Humic Acids
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Pheromones, Potassium Bicarbonate, ethylene
- Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
- Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT). Discussion and vote
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of July 21 were approved with no changes
- **Biobased BioMulch Memo.** The NOP sent a memo to the NOSB this week regarding Bio mulch asking that they add it to their workplans. CS will add it to the work agenda for spring 2016
- **Seaweed Extracts (CBe).** The lead summarized the material, the history of the reviews, and previous recommendations from the NOSB. Similar to laminarin, but unlike laminarin this is used as fertilizer rather than disease control. The group discussed modifications for this proposal and will bring it to a

vote at the next meeting.

- **2017 sunset materials (FT). Insecticidal soaps.** The lead summarized the material and public comment. This material is considered essential and the HS is recommending it remain on the list.

  Motion to remove Insecticidal soaps from 205.601
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (HA)**

  - **Pheromones.** Pheromones are used by organic (and many conventional) crop producers for insect management and are especially important for organic tree fruit production. The group discussed suggestions about annotations from the public comments. The consensus is that the language is redundant and was already captured in the listing. The lead made some modifications to the draft review based on the discussion and the CS proceeded to a vote.

    Motion to remove Pheromones from 205.601
    Motion by: HA
    Seconded by: CBe
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

  - **Potassium Bicarbonate.** Used as a plant disease control material. The lead summarized the material and its uses. He also reviewed the TR and the questions that were posed by the Subcommittee during the first posting. A member indicated that it is important to keep this material on the list as it is a good material to alternate with harsher products like copper. The lead added that during the growing season there are few to little materials that are effective for mildew.

    Motion to remove Potassium Bicarbonate from 205.601(i)(9)
    Motion by: HA
    Seconded by: CBe
    Additional Discussion: none
    Yes: No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

  - **Ethylene.** Used as a plant growth regulator for regulation of pineapple flowering. The Crops Subcommittee's inclination is to delist this material and it would like to make sure the public is aware of that. The lead will make some minor modifications and resend the doc.

Motion to remove Ethylene from 205.601(k)
Motion by: HA
Seconded by: CBo
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Anaerobic digestate (ZS**). CS will develop questions for a TR or white paper, but needs more time to do so.
- **Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT) -** Discussion and vote deferred.
- **2017 sunset materials (ZS).** Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate. The lead noted that she used an alternative form of the checklist for the first posting, and for this posting she included the key points from the checklist into the body of the review. Will vote on next call.
- **Other Items -** none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**July 7, 2015**

2017 sunset items (CBe).
- Liquid fish products, Magnesium sulfate, Soluble boron products, Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt] - Complete review and vote

2017 sunset items (CBo)
- Newspaper or other recycled paper, Plastic mulch and covers, Ammonium carbonate

2018 sunset TR determinations
- EPA list 3 (ZS)
- Peracetic Acid (HA)

Anaerobic digestate (ZS). Discuss possible white paper /how to proceed
Squid (CBe) - TR determination
Research priorities - Discuss topics
Aluminum sulfate petition (JR). TR determination

**July 21, 2015**

2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal
2017 sunset materials (CBe) - Sodium silicate
2018 sunset TR determinations.
- Copper sulfate (ZS)
- Ozone gas (FT)
- Calcium chloride (CBe)

Sulfuric acid proposal - Discussion and vote
2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS)
Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss proposal
The CS will submit a TR request with specific questions on newspaper to forward to the NOP.

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
- 2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

**August 4, 2015**
- Sulfuric Acid petition proposal (FT)
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal/vote

- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate.
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural; Lime sulfur; Elemental sulfur

**August 18, 2015**
**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment webinars | Oct 13 & 20, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday August 4, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in; Jean Richardson - sitting in
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 28 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 08 18 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 21 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | | 06 30 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | FT | 1994 | | 07 28 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 30 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 08 04 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 18 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 28 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | FT | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | CBo | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 28 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | ZS | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | FT | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | HA | Y | Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15 | | |
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | ZS | Y 2015 | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | CBe | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL | 06 30 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | 06 23 15 | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | 08 04 15 | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper. | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | 08 04 15 | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15 | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Aluminum sulfate | JR | Y | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15 | | Proposal Fall 2015 |
| Hypochlorous Acid | | | See Handling notes for info. Electrolyzed water. Was not allowed. Back under consideration. | | |

## Inert Ingredients

| Substance | Con-tact | TR rqstd? | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | | TBD |

## Other Projects

| Project | Con-tact | Doc type | Notes* | Vote | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | Report? | | Spr 2016 |
| Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) | ZS | | Pilot project for changing annotations w/o petition. CS will write a request to add this to the work agenda | | Disc doc TBD |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of July 28
- Procedural question on Lignin Sulfonate removal (ZS) (may need to re-visit)
- Seaweed extracts (CBe). Discuss revised proposal and vote
- Sulfuric acid (micronutrients) proposal (FT) - Discussion and vote
- Coppers, fixed and Copper Sulfate (ZS) - Discussion and vote
- 2017 sunset materials (HA).
    - Elemental Sulfur
    - Lime Sulfur
    - Horticultural Oil
- 2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS) (along with report from the inerts working group)
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of July 28 were approved with minor changes to the table entry for ash from burning manure.
- **Lignin Sulfonate (ZS).** A public commenter noted that there are two listings for lignin sulfonate and it was not clear if they were voted on separately. The CS will take two votes at the fall 2015 meeting: one for each listing. Additionally the sunset templates will be revised to separate the two, since the CS voted differently for each of the listings, which will make it clearer. The CS may revote on this item, and if so, will do so on the next call.
- **Seaweed Extracts (CBe). The lead r**ecirculated a new draft document with modifications that the CS members suggested on the last call. The NOP suggested some additional edits to the language

  Motion to classify Seaweed Extracts as petitioned as synthetic
  Motion by: CBe
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add Seaweed Extracts as petitioned at 205.601
  Motion by: CBe
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: Classified as synthetic and therefore the CS
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Sulfuric acid (used in micronutrients) proposal (FT) - Discussion and vote**

  Motion to classify Sulfuric acid as petitioned as synthetic
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  Motion to list Sulfuric acid as petitioned §205.601
  Motion by: FT
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Coppers, fixed and Copper Sulfate (ZS) -** Discussion and vote. The lead summarized the draft document. A member posed a question about how to move forward with an annotation change, which he felt would be complex. Another member added that copper is a very important tool in the industry and it will be important to get stakeholder feedback to develop an annotation. The HS will pose questions for public comment requesting suggested annotation language.

  Motion to remove Coppers, fixed from 205.601(i)
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: Recuse: 0

  Motion to remove Copper Sulfate from 205.601(i):
  Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: HA
Additional Discussion: none
Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset materials (HA)**
    - **Elemental Sulfur.** The lead summarized the material, its uses, previous NOSB votes, the TAP and recent public comment. It appears that Elemental sulfur is still necessary in organic crop production. No specific new information was provided via public comment to suggest otherwise.

      Motion to remove Elemental Sulfur from 205.601(e)5, 205.601 (i)10, 205.601 (j)2
      Motion by: HA
      Seconded by: CBe
      Additional Discussion: The group discussed some minor wording changes in the document. A member mentioned some early history about elemental sulfur, noting that in the past, it was not possible to determine the sources of mined sulfur.
      Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Lime Sulfur.** The lead summarized the material, its uses, previous NOSB votes, the TAP and recent public comment. Used as an insecticide and fungicide. Considered synthetic. There was an over whelming show of support for its continued listing.

      Motion to remove Lime Sulfur from 205.601(e)6, and 205.601(i)6
      Motion by: HA
      Seconded by: CBe
      Additional Discussion: A member suggested that defining "limited use" is appropriate and feels that the environmental impacts need to be considered. Another member noted that use of this material is self-regulating, as it is determined by season and temp.
      Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

    - **Horticultural Oil -** Deferred to next call

- **2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS) -** Deferred to next call
- The CS Chair reminded members of their action items
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**July 28, 2015 - additional call**
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal
- 2017 sunset materials (FT) - Soaps, Insecticidal

**August 4, 2015**
- Sulfuric Acid petition proposal (FT)
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate.
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural; Lime sulfur; Elemental sulfur

**August 18, 2015**

- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern

**August 25, 2015 - additional call**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment webinars | Oct 13 & 20, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**
**Crops Subcommittee (CS) Meeting Notes**
**Tuesday August 18, 2015 2:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Zea Sonnabend, Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke, Vice Chair (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Carmela Beck (CBe); Harold Austin (HA), Tom Chapman (TC) - sitting in; Jean Richardson - sitting in; Tracy Favre (TF)
**Absent:** none
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

**Work Agenda**

| **2017 Sunsets (TR requests)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Ethanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 1995 TAP 2014 TR | TR sent to CS 01 15 14. TR sufficiency due July 15, 2014. TR found sufficient 08 05 14. | 06 16 15 | Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015 |
| Isopropanol (Alcohols) 205.601(a) | FT | 2014 TR | Draft TR sent to CS and LS 09 24 14. CW is lead for LS<br>LS: 205.603(a). TR suff due 11 24 14. TR found sufficient 12 16 14 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Lime sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 TAP 2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14. TR sent to CS 12 04 14. TR suff due 02 04 15. TR found sufficient 01 27 15 | 08 04 15 | " |
| Hydrogen peroxide 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | ZS | 1995 TAP Y | TR requested 08 15 14. TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS on 01 13 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 06 30 15 | " |
| Vitamin B1, Vitamin C, Vitamin E 205.601(j) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14. Combined TR. Focus on uses and alternatives. TR in development. TR sent to CS 04 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 04 21 15 | 06 23 15 | " |
| Potassium bicarbonate 205.601(i) | HA | 1999 TAP 2015 Lmtd scope | TR requested 08 15 14. Focus on alternatives. Limited scope TR in development (expected mid-Dec). TR sent to CS 01 24 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 07 28 15 | " |
| EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern | ZS | 2015 | TR requested 08 15 14 for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). TR expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 01 30 15. Suff due 03 06 15. TR found suff 02 17 15 | 08 18 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b) | FT | 1996 TR<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| Soap-based algicide/demossers 205.601(a) | FT | 1994 TAP<br>2015 TR | TR requested 08 15 14 TR combined with Herbicides, soap-based 205.601(b). TR Expected Jan/Feb 2015. TR sent to CS 03 02 15. Suff due ASAP. TR found suff 03 06 15 | 06 16 15 | " |
| **2017 Sunsets (No TRs)**<br>**Summary: Spr 2015 Review: Fall 2015** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Scheduled for discussion/ Reviewed** | **Meeting** |
| Newspaper or other recycled paper 205.601(b) 205.601(c) | CBo | 2006 | Both listings. Rqstd Lmtd scope on inks and their impacts. Not contracted. | 07 07 15 | |
| Soaps, ammonium 205.601(d) | FT | 1996<br>Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Sticky traps/barriers 205.601(e) | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope. Not contracted. | 06 23 15 | |
| Ammonium carbonate 205.601(e) (used in traps) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 21 15 | |
| Ash from manure burning 205.602(a) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Hydrated lime 205.601(i) | ZS | 2002 | | 06 30 15 | |
| Soaps, insecticidal 205.601(e) | FT | 1994 | | 07 28 15 | |
| Tobacco dust (nicotine sulfate) 205.602(i) | CBo | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Aquatic plant extracts 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Arsenic 205.602(b) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Chlorine Materials: Calcium hypochlorite 205.601(a), Chlorine dioxide, Sodium hypochlorite | FT | 2011 | HS: 205.605(b)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 06 30 15 | " |
| Copper sulfate 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | LS: 205.603(b) | 08 04 15 | " |
| Coppers, fixed 205.601(i) | ZS | 2011 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Elemental sulfur 205.601(e) 205.601(i) 205.601(j) | HA | 1995 | | 08 04 15 | " |
| Humic acids 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 21 15 | " |
| Lead salts 205.602(d) | FT | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(j) 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Liquid fish products 205.601(j) | CBe | 2006 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Magnesium sulfate 205.601(j) | CBe | 2011 | HS: 205.605(a)<br>LS: 205.603(a) | 07 07 15 | " |
| Oils, horticultural 205.601(e) 205.601(i) | HA | 1995 | | 08 18 15 | " |
| Pheromones 205.601(f) | HA | 2012 | | 07 28 15 | " |
| Plastic mulch and covers (petroleum-based other than polyvinylchloride (PVC)) 205.601(b) | CBo | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Potassium chloride 205.602(e) | ZS | 1995 | HS: 205.605(a) | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium fluoaluminate 205.602(f) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | " |
| Sodium silicate 205.601(l) | CBe | 2011 | | 07 21 15 | " |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Soluble boron products 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 1995 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Strychnine 205.602(h) | ZS | | | 06 02 15 | |
| Sucrose octanoate esters 205.601(e) | FT | 2005 | LS: 205.603(b) | 06 23 15 | " |
| Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt 205.601(j) (Micronutrients) | CBe | 2010 | | 07 07 15 | " |
| Vitamin D3 205.601(g) | CBo | 2011 | | 06 23 15 | " |
| Boric acid 205.601(e) | CBo | 1995 TAP Y | | 06 16 15 | |
| Ethylene 205.601(k) | HA | 2011 Y Lmtd Scope | Medium priority. Limited scope on alternatives to de-greening. Not contracted. | 07 28 15 | |
| Microcrystalline cheesewax | CBo | Y Lmtd Scope | Limited scope on alternatives. Not contracted. | 06 02 15 | |

**2018 Sunsets (TR requests)**
**Summary: Spr 2016 Review: Fall 2016**

| Substance | Contact | TR request? | Notes | Scheduled for disc/ Reviewed | Meeting |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Copper sulfate 205.601(a) 205.601(e) | ZS | 2015 LS TR | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Ozone gas 205.601(a) | FT | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |
| Peracetic acid 205.601(a) 205.601(i) | HA | Y | Sunset date: 5/29/2018. The HS requested a TR 07 21 15 | | |
| EPA List 3 - Inerts of Unknown Toxicity 205.601(m) | ZS | Y 2015 | Sunset date: 11/3/2018 | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Calcium chloride 205.602(c) | CBe | | Sunset date: 11/3/2018. No new TR requested. | | |

| Petitioned Substances | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR request?** | **Notes** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Laminarin List at 205.601 | ZS | 2015 Lmtd Scope | Petition sent to CS on 06 03 13. Sufficiency response due 08 02 13. Petition found sufficient 07 30 13. Determine need for TR. Based on classification vote 12 17 13 the CS proposes to not add laminarin to the NL. Returned to CS after Apr 2014 meeting. CS requested Lmt'd scope TR 08 06 14. (Expected Feb 2015). TR sent to CS 05 11 15. Response due 07 10 15. TR found suff 05 19 15. Classified as non-synthetic and does not need to be added to the NL | 06 30 15 | Fall 2015 |
| Lignin sulfonate 205.601(i) | CBe | 1995 TAP 2011 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 18 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 18 15. Petition found sufficient 02 02. No new TR will be requested. | 06 23 15 | TBD |
| Seaweed extracts (Aquatic Plant extracts) 205.601 | CBe | 2006 TR | Petition sent to CS 12 16 14. Questions or request for TR due 02 16 15. Petition found sufficient. No new TR request. NOP Policy Memo 14-1: Aquatic Plant Extracts | 08 04 15 | TBD |
| Anaerobic Digestate - Food Waste 205.601(j) | ZS | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. Petition found sufficient 06 02 15. Reqst for TR or White paper. | | TBD |
| Ash from Manure Burning 205.602(a) | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 04 08 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 09 15. To be revisited after fall 2015 | | TBD |
| Sulfuric Acid for solubilizing micronutrients List at §205.601 | FT | | Petition sent to CS 04 13 15. Questions or request for TR due 06 12 15. Petition found suff 06 02 15. No TR request | 08 04 15 | TBD |
| Squid and Squid Byproducts 205.601 | CBe | | Petition sent to CS 05 12 15. Questions or request for TR due 07 14 15. HS requested TR 07 21 15 | | TBD |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Aluminum sulfate | JR | Y | The petitioner requests two related allowances on the NL: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). Sent to LS 03 12 14. TR request sent to NOP 06 18 14. TR expected Jan 2015. TRs (2) sent to LS 05 15 15. Suff due 07 15 15. TR found insufficient 07 21 15 | | Proposal Spr 2016 |
| Hypochlorous Acid | | | See Handling notes for info. Electrolyzed water. . | | |
| **Inert Ingredients** | | | | | |
| **Substance** | **Con-tact** | **TR rqstd?** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Inerts annotation change | ZS, PD | N/A | | 08 18 15 | TBD |
| **Other Projects** | | | | | |
| **Project** | **Con-tact** | **Doc type** | **Notes*** | **Vote** | **Meeting** |
| Contamination Issues in Farm Inputs | CBo | | Report | NA | Spr 2016 |
| Annotation for Micronutrients | ZS | Proposal | | 07 07 15 | |

* Yellow highlight indicates Subcommittee action needed *Highlight indicates review completion

**Agenda**

- Approve Crops Subcommittee notes of August 4
- Anaerobic Digestate TR request (ZS)
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Horticultural Oil
- Inert Ingredients (including annotation changes) (ZS)
- Potential doc on NPEs
- Adjourn

**Discussion**

- **Crops Subcommittee notes** of August 4 were approved with two changes: Hypochlorous Acid was added to the work agenda and the Annotation Changes (Sodium carbonate peroxyhydrate) was removed.

- **Anaerobic Digestate TR request (ZS).** The lead circulated some questions via email prior to the call and based on those conversations the CS will request a TR with specific questions.

- **2017 sunset materials (HA). Horticultural Oil.** Listed at 205.601(e) and 205.601(i) for crop production. The lead summarized its uses and the public comment. Horticultural oils are widely used. The group discussed the idea of using vegetable oil as a replacement, but it was found to be less than ideal because vegetable oil turns rancid. A member noted that both types of oil are manufactured in the same way and both use petroleum derived emulsifiers. The HS recommends relisting.

  Motion to remove Horticultural Oil from 205.601(e) and 205.601(i)
  Motion by: HA
  Seconded by: FT
  Additional Discussion: The members discussed the use and mode of action of this material in certain crops, and the fact that insects do not develop resistance to oils.
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2017 sunset EPA List 4 inerts (ZS).** The group discussed the draft document and its intention. The members were supportive of the document and feel it was well thought out and written, and will aid in moving them forward on this complex topic.

  Motion to remove EPA List 4 inerts from 205.601(m) based on compatibility with organic principles
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 1 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **EPA List 4 inerts annotation changes (ZS).** The group reviewed and edited the draft document. Members discussed the path forward given the complexity of this topic, and expressed the desire to post it for public comment and perhaps vote on it at the fall NOSB meeting. The group discussed the coordination between the Crops and Livestock Subcommittees as it is listed under both. Livestock will review the Crops document and may add their vote so the public is aware that the LS is in agreement. A member asked about the timing of implementation of this proposal. The lead reviewer pointed out that the proposal will set a new requirement for compliance of inerts and will require a substantial transition period so that the necessary review of substances and reformulation of products, if necessary, can take place. A member added that this will represent a sweeping change to the industry.

  Motion to adopt the annotation change for EPA List 4 inerts as follows:

  205.601(m) As synthetic inert ingredients as classified by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Substances permitted for use in minimal risk products exempt from pesticide registration under FIFRA section 25(b).
  (i) Substances included on the EPA's Safer Chemical Ingredient List.
  (ii) Inert ingredients that are exempt from the requirement of a tolerance under 40 CFR 180.1122 – for use only in passive pheromone dispensers.
  (iii) [Reserved] (for any other inerts individually petitioned and reviewed)]

  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **NPEs Discussion document.** The CS requested a TR for Nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs) as part of the List 4 Inerts sunset review. The lead developed a discussion document to potentially prohibit use of this class of inerts, and would like to begin this work now so the public has adequate notification. The lead outlined the challenges of the timeline and outreach to stakeholders, explaining that it could take 3 - 4 years.. The members discussed the extent to which NPEs are used. The group discussed involving Livestock in the review of NPEs although the LS is considering modifying specific materials such as iodine, where the CS is considering use as a class of inert ingredients. . Members are in support of a consolidated effort.

  Motion to approve the NPEs Discussion document for posting.
  Motion by: ZS
  Seconded by: HA
  Additional Discussion: none
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- The CS Chair asked the members please finalize their draft proposals so she can forward them to the NOP before the August 25 deadline.

- The CS will cancel the August 25 call as it is not needed.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Previous CS Notes**

**Future Call Schedule:**

**August 4, 2015**
- Sulfuric Acid petition proposal (FT)
- Seaweed Extracts (CBe) - Discuss proposal/vote
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). Coppers, fixed; Copper Sulfate.
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural; Lime sulfur; Elemental sulfur

**August 18, 2015**
- 2017 sunset materials (HA). Oils, horticultural
- 2017 sunset materials (ZS). EPA List 4 - Inerts of Minimal Concern

**August 25, 2015 - Additional call cancelled.**
**September 1, 2015**
**September 15, 2015**
**October 6, 2015**
**October 20, 2015**
**November 3, 2015**
**November 17, 2015**
**December 1, 2015**
**December 15, 2015**

| Fall 2015 Milestones | Target date |
|---|---|
| NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda | July 8, 2015 |

| | |
|---|---|
| Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials | July 15, 2015 |
| NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP | Aug 26, 2015 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | Sep 8, 2015 |
| Discuss work agendas on ES call | Sep 11, 2015 |
| Public comment webinars | Oct 13 & 20, 2015 |
| Public comment closes | Oct 5, 2015 |
| Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting) | Oct 8, 2015 |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | Oct 13, 2015 |
| Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT | Oct 26 - 29, 2015 |