# Vinasse Crops

1			-			
2	Identification of Petitioned Substance					
3						
4	Chemical Names:	16	ProLico®			
5	Vinasse (cane-, beet-)	17	Bio-Vinasse			
6		18				
7	Other Names:		CAS Numbers:			
8	Molasses vinasse		91082-90-5			
9	Stillage		No specific CAS for cane/beet vinasse			
10	Molasses stillage					
11	Distillery wastewater		Other Codes:			
12	Distillery slops		European Inventory of Existing Commercial			
13	Cane molasses solubles (CMS)		Chemical Substances (EINECS) No. 293-805-3			
14						
15	Trade Names:					
19						
20	Summary of Petitioned Use					
21	The petition before the National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) is to add vinasse (beet-, cane-) as an					
22	allowed synthetic substance in organic crop production (§ 205.601) for the purpose of augmenting soil					
		or production	(0 -otioo1) for the pulpose of dugiteriting bon			

nutrient levels. There are no regulations promulgated by the National Organic Program (NOP) regarding
the use of vinasse in organic livestock production or handling from which comparisons may be drawn.
Although vinasse (beet-, cane-) has a long-standing history of various agricultural applications outside of

26 the U.S., the use of vinasse as a fertilizer for organic crop production necessitates consideration of the

27 chemistry of its component chemicals and residues in terrestrial and aquatic environments.

28 29

# **Characterization of Petitioned Substance**

## 30 <u>Composition of the Substance:</u>

31 Vinasse is the principal byproduct generated during the distillation of ethyl alcohol, yeast, amino acids, 32 and/or organic acids from cane and beet molasses fermentation mixtures. As such, it contains every 33 substance added to the fermenter, plus yeast metabolites and yeast cell contents (Willington, 1982). The 34 primary organic and inorganic chemical components of vinasse are proteins, organic acids, amino acids, 35 unfermented carbohydrates, vitamins, and minerals (Hidalgo, 2009). In particular, high concentrations of 36 potassium, calcium, magnesium, sulfur, and nitrogen are typically found as components of vinasse, which 37 makes it particularly attractive as a soil amendment/fertilizer. Glycerol, lactic acid, ethanol, and acetic acid (all byproducts of the fermentation process) are the major organic compounds found in cane and beet 38 39 vinasse. The principal anions present are sulfate and chloride, with molasses stillage (i.e., distillation 40 residue) having a higher salt loading than other stillages (Willington, 1982). Information regarding the 41 characterization and elemental composition of cane and beet vinasse is summarized below in Table 1 42 (España-Gamboa, 2011). 43 Source or Origin of the Substance:

44 Vinasse is generally obtained through distillation of fermented cane and beet molasses, which is a

45 byproduct of cane and beet juice processing for the production of pure or refined sugar. In brief, the

- 46 process of vinasse production commences with the harvesting of sugar cane and sugar beets. The
- 47 sugarcane or sugar beet is subsequently processed, separating cellulosic components from the cane or beet
- 48 juice. Sulfur dioxide is sometimes added during the processing of beet juice prior to crystallization to
- 49 decolorize the cane juice. Multiple crystallization procedures are conducted on the syrup made from the
- 50 juice after clarification to produce sugar crystals, which are separated from the molasses by centrifugation
- and then harvested. The resulting byproduct, molasses, is then mixed with yeast or other microorganisms

- 52 and fermented. Depending on the yeast or microorganism used, fermentation converts the carbohydrates (i.e., sugars) contained within the molasses to ethyl alcohol, organic acids, and/or other desired organic
- 53 54
- compounds. In the case of ethanol production, small amounts of sulfuric acid may be added prior to
- 55 fermentation to reduce the populations and activity of undesired bacterial species by adjusting the pH to
- 56 between 4 and 5. Distillation of the resulting fermentation broth separates the desired organic compounds 57 (e.g., ethanol) from the mother liquor. Vinasse is the byproduct of the distillation procedure, with 9–20
- 58 liters of vinasse generated per liter of ethanol (Parnaudeau, 2008; España-Gamboa, 2011). Please see
- 59 Evaluation Question #2 for more information regarding the production methods of vinasse, including the
- 60 use of synthetic and non-synthetic materials in the industrial process.

#### 61 **Properties of the Substance:**

62 The petitioned substance (i.e., vinasse, stillage) is a liquid of low viscosity at 25 °C, having a very dark

63 brown color and weakly caramel, non-pungent odor (Tate & Lyle, 2005; DCM, 2010). It is also slightly

64 acidic, having a pH of approximately 4.5–4.8, which may vary depending on the natural source and/or

65 production method employed. Vinasse is an aqueous solution containing both organic (e.g., carbohydrates,

proteins, and vitamins) and inorganic (e.g., nitrogen, sulfur, and minerals) compounds; as such, it is denser 66

- 67 than water at room temperature (vinasse density = 1.25-1.33 g mL<sup>-1</sup>; water density = 1.0 g mL<sup>-1</sup>). Vinasse is
- 68 infinitely soluble in water (Tate & Lyle, 2005; DCM, 2010). Although there is no vapor pressure reported for

Table 1. Composition and yield of vinasse from cane and beet molasses

- 69 vinasse, volatilization of low molecular weight organic components such as lactic acid and acetic acid from
- 70 soils treated with vinasse is likely.

	Vinasse from Cane Molasses	Vinasse from Beet Molasses
BOD (g L-1)	39.5	27.5-44.9
COD (g L-1)	84.9–95	55.5-91.1
Nitrogen total (mg L-1)	153-1230	1800-4750
Phosphorus total (mg L <sup>-1</sup> )	1-190	160-163
Potassium (mg L <sup>-1</sup> )	4893-11000	10000-10030
Sulfate total (mg L <sup>-1</sup> )	1500-3480	3500-3720
pH	4.46-4.80	4.30-5.35
Copper	0.27–1.71 mg L <sup>-1</sup>	2.1–5.0 mg kg <sup>-1</sup>
Cadmium	0.04-1.36 mg L <sup>-1</sup>	<1 mg kg <sup>-1</sup>
Lead	0.02–0.48 mg L <sup>-1</sup>	<5 mg kg <sup>-1</sup>
Iron	12.8–157.5 mg L <sup>-1</sup>	203–226 mg kg <sup>-1</sup>
Phenols	34 mg L <sup>-1</sup>	450 mg kg <sup>-1</sup>
Vinasse Yield (L L <sub>ethanol</sub> -1)	12-20	9-15

#### 72

BOD = Biochemical Oxygen Demand; COD = Chemical Oxygen Demand; Source: España-Gamboa, 2011

#### 73 Specific Uses of the Substance:

74 The petitioned use of the substance is as a plant nutrient/soil amendment in organic crop production 75 (BioBizz Worldwide, 2011). All of the available literature included in this report for agricultural uses of

76 vinasse originated from outside of the U.S. Vinasse obtained from cane and sugar beets is commonly used

77 as a fertilizer in certain countries for conventional agriculture due to its nutrient content, particularly

78 calcium, potassium, and organic materials, and the vast quantity of vinasse generated during ethanol

79 production (España-Gamboa, 2011). Application to crops typically involves dilution of a commercially

80 available vinasse concentrate with water, and subsequent spraying of crops with the diluted aqueous

solutions. Depending on soil and plant nutrient requirements, vinasse may be applied as a 1-2% diluted 81

82 solution to land (80–160 liters per acre) through irrigation or foliar spray for direct absorption by the plant.

83 Vinasse may also be used as a compost ingredient. When applied in these ways, vinasse is expected to:

84 Enrich soils with macro-nutrients (e.g., nitrogen, phosphorus, sulfur),

<sup>71</sup> 

- Maintain soil organic carbon levels,
- Enhance micro flora and fauna development within soils,
- Improve the nutritional profile of crops for human and animal consumption,
- 89 Enhance the growth potential of crops.

The product information sheet for ProLico®, a vinasse-containing product manufactured in Belgium and used in Europe, states the following applications: "in soils or substrates for horticulture, tree nurseries, amenity planting, and landscaping." Suggested dosages are 1–2 g L<sup>-1</sup> and 3–5 g L<sup>-1</sup> of nutrient solution for continuous and periodic application, respectively (DCM, 2010). Exact dosages depend upon the crop, time of application (cultivation phase), the soil's nutritional reserve and intensity of sprinkling. Research and development of fertilizers made from vinasse is an active field; for example, the patent literature describes a method for the recovery of industrial water, decontamination and drying of vinasse using a micronizing

a method for the recovery of industrial water, decontamination and drying of vinasse using a microni
 procedure and formulation of the resulting material into an organic mineral fertilizer (Invitti, 2012).

- 98 Vinasse is also used as an additive or feed supplement for conventional ruminant and non-ruminant
- 99 livestock (Hidalgo, 2009). Recent studies have indicated significant decreases in the costs of animal feed
- 100 and more efficient production outcomes when using beet vinasse in livestock production (Hidalgo, 2011).
- 101 In addition, a positive correlation was observed between consumption of vinasse and animal behavior,
- 102 most likely due to the high content of organic acids and B complex vitamins contained within vinasse.
- 103 Researchers incorporating small amounts of vinasse into the diets of chickens being fattened for meat
- 104 production reported enhanced live weight conversions and increased weights for carcass and edible parts
- 105 (Hidalgo, 2011). Further, these studies indicate that the inclusion of vinasse in hen diets led to greater
- 106 viability.
- 107 Alternative applications of distillery vinasse are numerous and varied. Potential applications of vinasse
- 108 include the biotechnological production of single cell proteins and organic acids (Wilkie, 2000). Calcium
- 109 magnesium acetate is an organic acid salt generated through the fermentation of carbohydrates in vinasse,
- and may be used as an alternative di-icing agent for roadways (Wilkie, 2000). Recently developed
- 111 production methods for enzyme synthesis utilize the nutrient components of vinasse; for example, the
- 112 combination of vinasse and bagasse (the fibrous matter that remains following sugarcane processing) is a
- useful substrate for the microbiological production of cellulolytic and lignolytic enzymes (Aguiar, 2010). A
- 114 modified laboratory-scale upflow anaerobic sludge blanket (UASB) reactor was developed for the
- 115 production of methane from vinasse (España-Gamboa, 2012). Post treatment, the organic loading is
- significantly diminished, making the processed vinasse safe for agricultural use with diminished risk of
- 117 polluting soil, underground water, or nearby aquatic systems. It should be emphasized that this method 118 utilizes genetically modified microorganisms (GMMs) bearing recombinant DNA.
- 119 Vinasse disposal options must be utilized in the absence viable applications for the accumulated stillage.
- 120 The aerobic degradation of beet molasses fermentation wastewater (vinasse) has been carried out using
- 121 fungi of the genus *Penicillium* and *Aspergillus* (Jiménez, 2003). Significant decolorization of the waterwaters
- 122 was observed following microbial treatment, and chemical oxygen demand (COD) reductions were
- 122 was observed for all four microorganisms employed. Vinasse has also been processed through combustion and
- incineration to an ash, which may be used as fertilizer (Cortez, 1997; Willington, 1982). Early means of
- 125 vinasse treatment and disposal involved concentration of the stillage, neutralization with alkali, followed
- 126 by incorporation into road building material (Wilkie, 2000). Distilleries in countries lacking wastewater
- 127 effluent regulations or enforcement mechanisms frequently dispose of stillage in adjacent bodies of water.

# 128 Approved Legal Uses of the Substance:

- 129 Although some countries allow vinasse to be sprayed directly onto sugarcane crops as a fertilizer, the
- 130 Renewable Fuel Standard Program Regulatory Impact Analysis document states that this practice is not
- 131 currently allowed in the United States (U.S. EPA, 2010). However, restrictions on the use of vinasse as a
- 132 fertilizer were not found in the Code of Federal Regulations. Environmental legislation prohibits
- 133 inappropriate disposal of vinasse into rivers, lakes, the ocean, and soils due to the high nutrient loading
- and potential for polluting waterways (U.S. EPA, 2010). While vinasse is not specifically mentioned, 40
- 135 CFR 409 sets standard effluent limitations for beet sugar processing, crystalline sugar refining, and liquid

- 136 cane sugar refining (40 CFR 409.10-409.37), in addition to other effluent regulations. For example, from 40 137 CFR 409 Subpart A (Beet Sugar Processing): 138 The limitations establish the quality or quantity of pollutants or pollutant properties, controlled by this 139 section, which may be discharged by a point source subject to the provisions of this subpart after application 140 of the best practicable control technology currently available; provided however, that a discharge by a point 141 source may be made in accordance with the limitations set forth in either paragraph (a) of this section 142 exclusively, or paragraph (b) of this section exclusively 143 Certain characteristics and limitations of the effluent, such as Biochemical Oxygen Demand (BOD = 3.3 kg per 1000 kg of product, or 3.3 g L<sup>-1</sup> of product), pH (within the range of pH = 6-9), fecal coliform levels, 144 145 and temperature, are defined in subparagraphs (a) and (b). Specifically, these subparagraphs describe acceptable wastewater discharge resulting from barometric condensing operations and any other beet 146 147 sugar processing operation. 148 The U.S. Food and Drug Administration (U.S. FDA) makes no mention of cane or beet vinasse for use as a 149 livestock feed supplement; however, organic and inorganic chemical components of vinasse, such as acetic acid, lactic acid, and calcium and potassium salts, are listed as "Substances Generally Recognized as Safe" 150 151 (21 CFR 582). Caramel is prepared through the carefully controlled heat treatment of molasses, and is exempt from certification as a color additive under 21 CFR 73. Further, 21 CFR 501 states that distiller 152 153 solubles may be used in animal feeds listed as processed grain: 154 (b) Each collective name referred to in this paragraph may be used for the purpose of labeling where one or 155 more of the ingredients listed for that collective name are present. The animal feed ingredients listed under
- 156 each of the collective names are the products defined by the Association of American Feed Control Officials. The collective names are as follows: 157
- 158 (5) Processed grain byproducts include one or more of the following: Brans, brewers dried grains, distillers 159 grains, distillers solubles, flours, germ meals, gluten feeds, gluten meals, grits, groats, hominy feeds, malt sprouts, middlings, pearled, pollishings, shorts, and what mill run. 160
- 161 Collective names may be used if the animal feed is intended solely for the production of livestock and
- 162 poultry. Although cane and beet vinasse are not specifically referenced here, the composition of distillers
- 163 solubles is likely to be comparable.

#### Action of the Substance: 164

- Vinasse functions by enhancing the nutrient quality of soils and therefore crop production capacity. Some 165
- 166 reported advantages of using vinasse include increased pH and cation exchange capacity, improved soil
- 167 structure, increased water retention, and development of micro flora and fauna within the soil
- 168 environment. The results of studies conducted over 15 years indicate that there are no damaging impacts
- 169 on the soil at lower application doses (300 m<sup>3</sup> ha<sup>-1</sup>), while higher doses may impair sugarcane viability. 170 When applied to sandy or shallow soil, vinasse usage may lead to groundwater contamination (Zuurbier,
- 171 2008).
- 172 A number of scientific studies have analyzed the fertilizing efficiency of vinasse. For example, it was found
- 173 that sugar and cane yields increased with application of vinasse, with the optimal results obtained through
- application of vinasse at the moderate dosage level of 50,000 L ha<sup>-1</sup>. Further, the N (nitrogen),  $P_2O_5$ 174
- 175 (phosphorus) and K<sub>2</sub>O (potassium) sugarcane demands were supplied at this dosage level in proportions
- 176 of 55%, 72%, and 100%, respectively (Gómez, 2000). It was also observed that application of vinasse to
- 177 sandy loam soil enhanced the organic carbon, available nutrient levels, and the microbial soil population,
- 178 thereby resulting in higher sugarcane yields (Baskar, 2005). This report also suggested that application of
- 179 distillery effluent 40-60 days prior to planting may overcome any issues with the excessive BOD of vinasse.
- 180 The application of fresh beet vinasse had a detrimental impact on the soil's physical, chemical, biological
- 181 properties and wheat yield parameters, most likely because high quantities of sodium and fulvic acids 182 were introduced into the soil by vinasse. However, co-composting beet vinasse with cotton gin crushed
- 183 compost beneficially impacted soil properties and increased wheat yield (Tejada, 2006).

- Improper application of vinasse to agricultural land may lead to environmental impairment due to its
   potentially high organic loading, low pH and high salinity levels. As a result of the high levels of organic
- content, spreading of vinasse on soils may lead not only to anoxia but also alterations of mineral forms (i.e.,
- complexation and solubilization) and metal mobilization (Lahlah, 2009). Although vinasse is typically
- applied to soils, the residue is able to enter water bodies via runoff and leaching. Its dark coloring, organic
- 189 matter content, and low pH may potentially exert toxic effects on aquatic environments. As with other
- highly colored effluents, vinasse may exert negative impacts on the environment due to the inhibition of
- aquatic plant growth (Botelho, 2012). The effects of vinasse runoff on fish species were recently
- investigated, revealing high median lethal concentrations (LC<sub>50</sub>) of vinasse (low toxicity) following
   adjustment of the vinasse pH from acidic to neutral: 2.99% (*Ceriodaphnia dubia*), 5.62% (*Daphnia magna*), and
- 8.34% (Danio rerio). Significantly higher mortality rates (and correspondingly lower LC<sub>50</sub> values) were
- 195 observed for vinasse prior to pH adjustment, suggesting that certain environments (e.g., lakes and ponds)
- 196 may have a higher risk for aquatic toxicity from vinasse residue runoff (Botelho, 2012).

# 197 <u>Combinations of the Substance:</u>

198 Commercial vinasse concentrates are generally diluted with water and sprayed directly onto crops and

soil. Synthetic fertilizer ingredients (e.g., nitrogen, P<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, and K<sub>2</sub>O) may also be applied in combination with

200 vinasse, depending on soil nutrient requirements and the nutrient profile of the vinasse being used

- 201 (Gómez, 2000). Otherwise, no additional ingredients (e.g., inert ingredients, stabilizers, preservatives,
- 202 carriers, anti-caking agents, or other materials) are added to commercially available forms of vinasse.
- 203 **Status**204

# 205 <u>Historic Use:</u>

206 Historically, vinasse has found agricultural applications as an additive for feed supplement for the feeding

- of ruminant and non-ruminant animals in several tropical countries and Europe. In addition, vinasse has
- 208 been used as a fertilizer since the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Hidalgo, 2009). Please see the
- 209 "International" section below for details regarding the allowed use of vinasse in the organic production of
- 210 crops and livestock in other countries.

# 211 Organic Foods Production Act, USDA Final Rule:

212 The Petitioned Substance, vinasse for use in crop production, is not listed within the Organic Foods

213 Production Act of 1990 (OFPA) or the National Organic Program Final Rule, 7 CFR Part 205. However, as

found in 7 CFR 205.205, organic crop producers must implement a crop rotation including but not limited

- to sod, cover crops, green manure crops and catch crops that provide for soil organic matter maintenance
- and improvement as well as management of deficient or excess plant nutrients. More specifically, 7 CFR
- 217 205.203 states that the organic producer must take the following actions: (1) Select and implement tillage
- and cultivation practices that maintain or improve the physical, chemical, and biological condition of soil
- and minimize soil erosion; (2) manage crop nutrients and soil fertility through rotations, cover crops, and
- the application of animal materials; (3) manage plant and animal materials to maintain or improve soil
- 221 organic matter content in a manner that does not contribute to contamination of crops, soil, or water by
- 222 plant nutrients, pathogenic organisms, heavy metals, or residues of prohibited substances.

# 223 <u>International</u>

- 224225 European Economic Community Council
- 226 European Union regulations allow the use of vinasse as a fertilizer in organic crop production. Article 3(1)
- of Commission Regulation (EC) No 889/2008, allows the use of substances listed in Annex 1 as a fertilizer
- and soil conditioner in organic crop production when the nutritional needs of plants cannot be met by tille as and cultivation grantized area statices and the application of the statices of the statices area statices areas and the statices of the statices areas areas and the statices areas a
- tillage and cultivation practices, crop rotation, and the application of livestock manure and/or organic material as defined in Article 12(1)(a). (b) and (c) of Berulatian (EC) Na 824 (2007, Gravific II).
- material, as defined in Article 12(1)(a), (b), and (c) of Regulation (EC) No 834/2007. Specifically, Annex 1,
- regarding fertilizers and soil conditioners as referred to in Article 3(1), specifies the use of vinasse and the following related substances as fertilizers:
- 232 following related substances as fertilizers:
- Stillage and stillage extracts for use in organic crop production, excluding ammonium stillage

	Technical Evolution Depart	\/ippago	Grand	
	Technical Evaluation Report	Vinasse	Crops	
234 235 236 237 238	vegetable matter, w biogas production	ented mixtures of vegetable matter – products obtained fro hich have been submitted to composting or to anaerobic fe ained from sugar production or as a byproduct of sugar pro	rmentation for	
239 240 241 242	European regulations also specify the use of products related to vinasse in organic livestock production. Article 22 states that "non-organic feed materials of plant and animal origin may be used in organic productionif they are listed in Annex V." From Annex V, Feed materials referred to in Article 22(1), (2 and (3), the following substances related to vinasse may be used:			
243 244	-	roducts and by-products: Sugar Beet Pulp (Section 1.4) products, and by-products: Molasses (Section 1.7).		
245 246 247	be used in organic production	ed additives, certain products used in animal nutrition and on only if they are listed in Annex VI." Under section 3 of A ses are listed as substances allowed for silage production.		
248	Canadian General Standards E	Board		
249 250 251	fertilizer or soil amendment	regulations, Canadian standards allow the application of v without specific restrictions on use. Section 4.2 (soil amena rganic production systems and permitted substances lists (	dments and crop	

- catalogues the following substances as allowed in organic crop production: 252
- 253 • Stillage and stillage extract, except ammonium stillage is prohibited
- 254 Molasses, shall be organic molasses unless not commercially available
- 255 Sugar, organic sugar may be used as an ingredient in a crop production aid
- 256 Codex Alimentarius
- 257 Vinasse is also allowed under the Codex Alimentarius Commisson guidelines of organically produced

258 foods. Annex 2: Permitted substances for the production of organic foods, lists the following pertinent substances 259 in Table 1, substances for use in soil fertilization and conditioning:

- Stillage and stillage extract, except ammonium stillage is excluded 260
- 261 Byproducts of the sugar industry (e.g., vinasse); the need must be recognized by the certification • body or authority 262
- 263 In addition, Table 4 in Annex 2 lists processing aids that may be used for the preparation of products of agricultural origin referred to in section 3 of the Codex guidelines. Included in this list are sulfuric acid for 264 pH adjustment of extraction water in sugar production and sodium hydroxide for pH adjustment in sugar 265 266 production.
- 267 International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements
- 268 The IFOAM norms do not specifically allow the application of vinasse as an organic fertilizer or soil
- amendment. Products derived from sugar and sugar beet processing, including lime from sugar processing 269
- 270 and sugar beet lime, are permitted in appendix two of the IFOAM norms as calcium and magnesium soil
- 271 amendments. In addition, sulfuric acid is allowed as a processing aid for pH adjustment of water during
- 272 sugar processing, and sodium hydroxide is also listed as allowed for sugar processing.
- 273

## Evaluation Questions for Substances to be used in Organic Crop or Livestock Production

274

275 Evaluation Question #1: Indicate which category in OFPA that the substance falls under: (A) Does the 276 substance contain an active ingredient in any of the following categories: copper and sulfur

- 277 compounds, toxins derived from bacteria; pheromones, soaps, horticultural oils, fish emulsions, treated
- 278 seed, vitamins and minerals; livestock parasiticides and medicines and production aids including
- 279 netting, tree wraps and seals, insect traps, sticky barriers, row covers, and equipment cleansers? (B) Is
- 280 the substance a synthetic inert ingredient that is not classified by the EPA as inerts of toxicological

# concern (i.e., EPA List 4 inerts) (7 U.S.C. § 6517(c)(1)(B)(ii))? Is the synthetic substance an inert ingredient which is not on EPA List 4, but is exempt from a requirement of a tolerance, per 40 CFR part 180?

284 (A) Vinasse contains sulfur in the form of sulfate and sulfur-based organic compounds (e.g., amino acids).

In addition, small amounts of copper compounds, vitamins, and minerals are typically observed in cane, beet, and other forms of vinasse. Copper and lead, in addition to other heavy metals, may be introduced

- via uptake from soils by the sugarcane or sugar beet feedstock. The corrosion of piping, tanks, and heat
- exchangers may also contribute to levels of these metals in the effluent (Wilkie, 2000).
- (B) Since the petitioned substance is not requested for use in a pesticide, it is not, by definition, an inert.
- 290 The previous paragraph provides sufficient information to determine eligibility of the substance under
- 291 OFPA; however, the inert status of the substance is briefly described. The U.S. EPA has not classified the
- 292 petitioned substance (vinasse, stillage, etc.) as an inert in Lists 1–4; however, phenol is included in List 1,
- inert ingredients of toxicological concern, and has been observed as a minor organic component of some
- 294 vinasse samples (see Table 1). Phenolic compounds in stillage are derived from lignin (i.e., tannic and
- humic substances) naturally present in the feedstock or from industrial equipment contaminated with the
- chemicals due to unrelated processing operations (Wilkie, 2000).

# 297 <u>Evaluation Question #2:</u> Describe the most prevalent processes used to manufacture or formulate the

petitioned substance. Further, describe any chemical change that may occur during manufacture or
 formulation of the petitioned substance when this substance is extracted from naturally occurring plant,
 animal, or mineral sources (7 U.S.C. § 6502 (21)).

- 301 Vinasse is a byproduct in the production of ethanol from the residues remaining after crystallization of
- 302 sucrose from beet or cane juice. Bagasse, molasses, and filtercake are examples of other products resulting
- from this industrial process. Below are brief descriptions of sugarcane processing steps that ultimately lead
- 304 to the production of vinasse used for various agriculture purpose outlined in "uses of the substance."
- 305 Cane Juice Production
- 306 Vinasse production begins with the growing and harvesting of sugarcane. The sugarcane is then usually
- 307 milled across a tandem mill at a sugarcane factory to extract the cane juice. The crushed cane fibers exiting
- 308 the last mill are referred to as bagasse. Following extraction, the cane juice is filtered to remove large
- 309 particles and clarified to remove turbid and suspended particles using heat and lime (i.e., calcium oxide or 310 calcium hydroxide) and polyanionic synthetic polyacrylamide flocculants. Clarification results in the
- formation of an insoluble particulate mass, which is separated from the limed juice by gravity and
- discarded or recycled back into the juice to maximize sugar yields (U.S. EPA, 1997).
- 313 Sucrose Crystallization and Processing
- In order to facilitate the crystallization process, cane juice is concentrated to cane syrup. The clarified juice
- is initially passed through heat exchangers to preheat the juice and then proceeds to multiple-effect
- 316 evaporator stations. Heating continues through a series of typically five evaporators; as the temperature
- 317 decreases from an earlier evaporator to the next, the pressure inside each evaporator likewise is decreased
- to facilitate evaporation at lower temperatures. The final syrup is generally 65% solids and 35% water. In
- some factories (not common in the U.S.), the syrup can then be clarified using lime, phosphoric acid and
- 320 polymer flocculants analogous to those used in water treatment (e.g., synthetic flocculants based on
- 321 polyacrylamide), aerated, and filtered. Sucrose crystallization begins in vacuum pans, where the syrup is
- boiled until it reaches a supersaturated stage. At this stage, "seeding" or "shocking" the supersaturated
- solution initiates crystallization. Once the capacity of the vacuum pan is reached and the final mixture of
- 324 liquor and crystals (i.e., massecuite) is formed, the mixture is discharged to the crystallizer, which
- 325 maximizes sugar crystallization from the liquor. Centrifugation of the massecuite separates sugar crystals
- from the mother liquor (i.e., molasses). The crystals are washed with water and the wash water centrifuged
- from the crystals (U.S. EPA, 1997).
- 328 The mother liquor (i.e., molasses) and wash water from the first crystallization are returned to the vacuum
- pan, reboiled to form a second massecuite, which in turn yields a second batch of sucrose crystals. A third
- iteration of the entire process provides low grade sugar, typically mingled with syrup or used as a
- 331 "seeding" solution in vacuum pans, and a final molasses. The final batch of molasses, known as blackstrap

molasses, is a heavy, viscous material primarily used as a cattle feed supplement. Blackstrap molasses is
also used in the production of ethanol, yeast, and organic acids, leaving vinasse as the primary byproduct

(U.S. EPA, 1997). The raw sugar is then sent to a refinery where it is melted into a syrup and similar unit
 processes occur (e.g., clarification, evaporation, and crystallization) to produce refined sugar and a higher

- 336 quality, food grade molasses.
- 337 Sugarbeet processing

338 Sugarbeets are processed directly into refined sugar in one factory following a similar manner to sugarcane but with some differences. Long, thin strips of cut sugarbeet are conveyed to continuous diffusers, in which 339 sucrose is extracted through the application of hot water (50-80 °C). Sulfur dioxide, chlorine, ammonium 340 bisulfite or commercial FDA-approved, food-grade biocides are sometimes used as disinfectants. Raw 341 342 juice, the sugar-enriched water that flows from the outlet of the diffuser, contains 10–15% sugar and 343 undergoes clarification following the extraction procedure. Clarification begins with filtration of the raw 344 juice to remove any small particles that may inhibit crystallization. The mixture is then heated (80-85 °C) 345 and proceeds through the carbonation process. Milk of lime (a slurry of calcium hydroxide) is added to the 346 mixture in the first carbonation tank to adsorb impurities in the mixture. Carbon dioxide ( $CO_2$ ) gas is then bubbled through the mixture to precipitate the lime as insoluble calcium carbonate crystals that settle out 347 348 in the clarifier. At this point, the juice is again carbonated with  $CO_2$  to remove the remaining lime and impurities. The calcium carbonate crystals are filtered from the juice and a small amount of sulfur dioxide 349 350 (SO<sub>2</sub>) is added to acidify the solution and inhibit any reactions leading to darkening of the juice. Following 351 these initial processing steps, the juice is subjected to evaporation and crystallization procedures similar to 352 those described above for cane juice (U.S. EPA, 1997).

353 Molasses Fermentation

There are a number of industrial processes that utilize molasses as a fermentation medium, all producing vinasse as a byproduct.

356 Ethanol production, and specifically rum-making, involves the fermentation of musts made of raw

357 materials (i.e., cane juice, molasses) diluted with water followed by distillation of the fermented media. As

- 358 a byproduct of cane sugar manufacturing, molasses has been the primary source of fermentable sugars for
- the rum industry since the 16<sup>th</sup> century. Yeast strains of the genus *Saccharomyces, Schizosaccharomyces, Pichia*,
- 360 *Hansenula, Candida,* and *Toulopsis* are traditionally used to perform the alcoholic fermentation of diluted
- 361 molasses (Fahrasmane, 1998). Saccharomyces cerevisiae, for example, has provided ethanol yields of 53 g
- L-1 in a medium containing 250 g L-1 total reducing sugars (Roukas, 1996). Recently, methods utilizing the

363 bacterial strain Zymomonas mobilis have been developed for ethanol production, achieving yields of 55.8 g

L<sup>-1</sup> at a lower sugar concentration of 200 g L<sup>-1</sup> (Cazetta, 2007).

- 365 Molasses is generally less contaminated with bacterial flora than cane juice, as a large portion of the non-
- 366 sporulated bacteria is destroyed during sugar production. Notwithstanding, must components are
- 367 frequently subjected to bacteriostatic or sterilizing thermal (steam) treatments to control any bacterial flora
- that may otherwise excrete undesired organic compounds into the fermentation medium (Fahrasmane,
- 1998). The molasses-based fermentation medium may also be treated with small quantities (~0.3 mg/L) of
- antibiotics, such as penicillin (Borzani, 1957) and tetracycline (Aquarone, 1960). However, the extent of this
- 371 practice in current rum-making operations is uncertain. If added, it is possible that these antibiotics will not
- be fully degraded during the fermentation and ethanol distillation processes; a certain amount could
- remain in vinasse derived from antibiotic-treated fermentation mediums. Bacteriosides such as chlorine
   dioxide (Sumner 2011), ammonium bifluoride or quaternary ammonium compounds may also be used to
- control bacterial contamination (Murtagh, 1999). With the exception of chlorine dioxide, residues of these
- compounds may persist in vinasse. Finally, acidification of the media to a lower pH (i.e., pH = 4-5) using
- 377 sulfuric acid generally precedes the fermentation step as a protective measure (Fahrasmane, 1998).
- 378 Fermentation procedures utilizing molasses have also been developed for the synthesis of amino acids,
- organic acids, and flavoring agents. Lactic acid, an important feedstock in the chemical industry, can be
- produced through the bacterial or fungal fermentation of molasses. Optimized conditions using the
- 381 bacterial strains *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* and *Enterococcus faecalis* in combination with a molasses-based
- medium afforded lactic acid at concentrations of 90.0–95.7 g L<sup>-1</sup> (Wee, 2006). Lactic acid yields as high as

166 g L<sup>-1</sup> were reported for the fermentation of molasses using the *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* mutant Uc-3,
 generated via ultraviolet mutagenesis (Dumbrepatil, 2008). As a final example, three strains of the yeast

385 *Williopsis saturnus* were employed for the fermentative production of isoamyl acetate, a natural banana

flavor compound, using sugar beet molasses as the carbon source (Yilmaztekin, 2008).

1 navor compound, using sugar beet molasses as the carbon source (

# 387 Distillation

388 Distillations are commonly used to separate the chemical of interest (e.g., ethanol, lactic acid) from other

components of the fermentation mixture. Details for the distillation of heavy and light rum are given below as examples of distillation procedures that leave vinasse as a residue.

391 Batch distillations are generally used for the production of heavy rums, while light rums require

392 continuous distillation processes. In its simplest form, batch distillation involves the heating of the

fermented molasses solution such that alcohol and other volatile compounds are distilled out of the mother liquor. Once vaporized, these volatile components proceed through the vapor pipe, condense in a cooled

metal coil (i.e., condenser coil), and subsequently flow to the storage tank. The first fraction distilled may

contain more of the volatile, pungent chemicals and is typically discarded. Distillation is continued until

397 most of the alcohol has been distilled out of the fermented molasses material. Following the first

distillation, the residue (i.e., vinasse or stillage) is removed from the pot and the distillate is returned from

the storage tank to the pot to be redistilled following the above procedures. The term "vinasse" or

400 "stillage" refers to the combination of all pot residues recovered during the distillation process (Martagh,

401 1999).

## 402 Vinasse Processing

403 The generated vinasse may be used in its diluted form, concentrated, or further processed for various

404 agricultural applications (Parnaudeau, 2008). Please refer to Figure 1 below for a brief summary of the

405 conversion of molasses to diluted and concentrated vinasse. Processes for fractioning vinasse to obtain

separate organic and inorganic fractions have also been developed (Paananen, 2000). In this process,

407 sulfuric acid is added to free the potassium contained within vinasse in the form of its sulfate salt. This

408 procedure ultimately generates two fractions: (1) an organic fraction comprised of organic acids for use as a

409 livestock feed additive and (2) an inorganic fraction comprised primarily of potassium salts for use as a

410 fertilizer (Paananen, 2000). Methods for the combined distillation of ethanol and concentration of vinasse

411 have also appeared in the recent patent literature (Almeida, 2010).



#### 412

#### 413

Figure 1. Industrial fermentation process leading to vinasse generation (Parnaudeau, 2008)

### 414 <u>Evaluation Question #3:</u> Discuss whether the petitioned substance is formulated or manufactured by a 415 chemical process, or created by naturally occurring biological processes (7 U.S.C. § 6502 (21)).

416 Fermentation followed by distillation is the most common naturally occurring biological process used to

417 generate vinasse from cane and beet molasses. Yeast strains of the genus *Saccharomyces*,

418 *Schizosaccharomyces, Pichia, Hansenula, Candida,* and *Toulopsis* are traditionally used to perform the alcoholic

419 fermentation of diluted molasses (Fahrasmane, 1998). Recently, methods utilizing the bacterial strain

420 Zymomonas mobilis have been developed for the fermentative production of ethanol, achieving yields of

Vinasse

- 421 55.8 g L<sup>-1</sup> (Cazetta, 2007). Optimized conditions using the bacterial strains *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* and
- *Enterococcus faecalis* in combination with a molasses-based medium afforded lactic acid at concentrations of
   90.0–95.7 g L<sup>-1</sup> (Wee, 2006). Other yeast and bacterial strains, including genetically modified
- 90.0–95.7 g L<sup>-1</sup> (Wee, 2006). Other yeast and bacterial strains, including genetically modifi
   microorganisms, are commonly used depending on the organic compound of interest.
- 425 Sulfur dioxide, chlorine, ammonium bisulfite or commercial FDA-approved biocides are sometimes used
- 426 to disinfect cane juice. Milk of lime (a slurry of calcium hydroxide) is added to cane and beet juice during
- 427 the clarification step; however, this material is mostly removed by filtration during clarification. The pH of
- 428 the fermentation broth may be lowered (pH = 4-5) using sulfuric acid to minimize the risk of bacterial
- 429 contamination. In addition, antibiotics (e.g., penicillin) and bactericides (e.g., chlorine dioxide) are
- 430 potentially added to control bacteria present in the molasses feedstock. Due to the inclusion of synthetic
- 431 substances (i.e., sulfur dioxide and sulfuric acid) in the overall production of vinasse, the Organic Materials
- 432 Research Institute (OMRI) removed vinasse from the OMRI List of Approved Products as an organic
- 433 fertilizer (OMRI, 2013).

442

- 434 A synthetic substance is defined by the NOP as being "formulated or manufactured by a chemical process
- or by a process that chemically changes a substance extracted from naturally occurring plant, animal, or
- 436 mineral sources, except that such term shall not apply to substances created by naturally occurring
- biological processes." According to this definition and the classification of fermentation as a naturally
- 438 occurring biological process, vinasse would constitute a nonsynthetic (natural) substance. However, the
- 439 potential use of genetically engineered microorganisms and chemical substances not allowed on the
- 440 National List during the fermentation of molasses should be weighed in determining the status of vinasse
- as nonsynthetic (natural) or synthetic.

# References

- Aguiar MM, Ferreira LFR, Monteiro RTR. 2010. Use of vinasse and sugarcane bagasse for the production of
  enzymes by lignocellulolytic fungi. Brazilian Archives of Biology and Technology 53:1245–1254;
- 445 doi:10.1590/S1516-89132010000500030.
- Almeida JL De, Sampaio PH. 2010. Evaporator of Vinasse Concentration for Distilleries in General. Patent
  US 20100055239 A1. Retrieved February 18, 2013 from http://www.google.com/patents/US20100055239
- Aquarone E. 1960. Penicillin and tetracycline as contamination control agents in alcoholic fermentation of
   sugar cane molasses. Applied Microbiology 8: 263–268.
- 450 Baskar, M., Gopal, H., Sheik, M., Subash Chandra Bose, M., 2005. Effect of integrated use of distillery
- 451 effluent and fertilisers on soil properties and yield of sugarcane in sandy loam soil. The Madras
- 452 Agricultural Journal, 92(4-6) 349-354. Retrieved February 11, 2013 from
- 453 <u>https://sites.google.com/site/majmasu/archive/vol-92-4-6</u>
- 454 Beek EHVD. 1983. Method and Apparatus for Processing Vinasse. Patent EP0048061 A3. Retrieved January
- 455 9, 2013 from <u>www.google.com/patents/EP0048061A3?cl=en</u>
- BioBizz Worldwide. 2012. Petition: Vinasse for Organic Crop Production. Retrieved January 9, 2013 from
   <u>http://www.ams.usda.gov/AMSv1.0/getfile?dDocName=STELPRDC5097665</u>
- 458 Borzani W, Aquarone E. 1957. Molasses Fermentation, Continuous Fermentation, Alcoholic Fermentation
- 459 of Blackstrap Molasses. Penicillin as Contamination Control Agent. Journal of Agricultural and Food
- 460 Chemistry 5: 610–616.
- 461 Botelho RG, Tornisielo VL, Olinda RA de, Maranho LA, Machado-Neto L. 2012. Acute toxicity of sugarcane
- vinasse to aquatic organisms before and after pH adjustment. Toxicological & Environmental Chemistry
  94:2035–2045; doi:10.1080/02772248.2012.738516.
- 464 CAN (Canadian Organic Standards Board). 2011a. General Principles and Management Standards:
- 465 CAN/CGSB-1076 32.310-2006. Retrieved January 18, 2013 from http://www.tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca/ongc-
- 466 cgsb/programme-program/normes-standards/internet/bio-org/principes-principles-eng.html

- 467 CAN (Canadian Organic Standards Board). 2011b. Organic Production Systems Permitted Substances Lists:
   468 CAN/CGSB-32.311-2006. Retrieved January 18, 2013 from <u>http://www.tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca/ongc-</u>
   469 cgsb/programme-program/normes-standards/internet/bio-org/documents/032-0311-2008-eng.pdf
- 470 Cazetta ML, Celligoi MAPC, Buzato JB, Scarmino IS. 2007. Fermentation of molasses by Zymomonas
- 471 mobilis: Effects of temperature and sugar concentration on ethanol production. Bioresource Technology
   472 98:2824–2828; doi:10.1016/j.biortech.2006.08.026.
- 473 Codex Alimentarius Commission. 2012. Guidelines for the Production, Processing, Labelling, and
- 474 Marketing of Organically Produced Foods. Retrieved January 18, 2013 from
- 475 <u>http://www.codexalimentarius.org/standards/list-of-standards/en/?no\_cache=1</u>
- 476 Cortez LAB, Pérez B. 1997. Experiences on vinasse disposal: Part III: Combustion of vinasse-# 6 Fuel oil
- 477 emissions. Brazilian Journal of Chemical Engineering 14; doi:10.1590/S0104-66321997000100002. Retrieved
- 478 January 9, 2013 from http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?pid=S0104-66321997000100002&script=sci\_arttext
- 479 DCM. 2010. Product Information Sheet: ProLico<sup>®</sup> 2. Retrieved January 9, 2013 from
- 480 <u>http://www.pindstrup.dk/fileadmin/user\_upload/Pdf/hobby/Pindstrup\_flyd.\_oekologsik\_goedning.pd</u>
   481 f
- 482 Dumbrepatil A, Adsul M, Chaudhari S, Khire J, Gokhale D. 2008. Utilization of Molasses Sugar for Lactic
- Acid Production by Lactobacillus delbrueckii subsp. delbrueckii Mutant Uc-3 in Batch Fermentation. Appl.
   Environ. Microbiol. 74:333–335; doi:10.1128/AEM.01595-07.
- 485 España-Gamboa E, Mijangos-Cortes J, Barahona-Perez L, Dominguez-Maldonado J, Hernández-Zarate G,
- Alzate-Gaviria L. 2011. Vinasses: characterization and treatments. Waste Management & Research 29:
  1235–1250.
- 488 España-Gamboa EI, Mijangos-Cortés JO, Hernández-Zárate G, Maldonado JAD, Alzate-Gaviria LM. 2012.
- 489 Methane production by treating vinasses from hydrous ethanol using a modified UASB reactor.
- 490 Biotechnology for Biofuels 5:82–90; doi:10.1186/1754-6834-5-82.
- European Commission. 2007. Commission Regulation (EC) No. 834/2007. Retrieved January 18, 2013 from
   <u>http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2007:189:0001:0023:EN:PDF</u>
- European Commission. 2008. Commission Regulation (EC) No. 889/2008. Retrieved January 18, 2013 from
   <u>http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2008:250:0001:0084:EN:PDF</u>
- 495 Fahrasmane, Ganou-Parfait. 1998. Microbial flora of rum fermentation media. Journal of Applied
- 496 Microbiology 84:921–928; doi:10.1046/j.1365-2672.1998.00380.x.
- Gómez J, Rodríguez O. 2000. Effects of vinasse on sugarcane (Saccharum officinarum) productivity. Rev.
  Fac. Agron. (LUZ) 17: 318–326.
- 499 Hidalgo K. 2009. Vinasse in Feed: Good for Animal and Environment. Feed Tech 13: 18–20.
- 500 Hidalgo K, Rodríguez B, López M, Iben C, Albelo A, Cárdenas M. 2011. Distillery Vinasse as an Alternative
- 501 Additive in Poultry Feed. Retrieved February 8, 2013 from <u>http://en.engormix.com/MA-poultry-</u>
- 502 <u>industry/nutrition/articles/distillery-vinasse-alternative-additive-t1847/141-p0.htm</u>
- IFOAM (International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements). The IFOAM Norms. Retrieved
   January 18, 2013 from <a href="http://www.ifoam.org/about\_ifoam/standards/norms.html">http://www.ifoam.org/about\_ifoam/standards/norms.html</a>
- 505 Invitti JH, Sampaio LAS de A. 2012. Water, Decontaminant and Drying of Vinasse by Micronization and
- 506 Formulation of an Organic Mineral Fertilizer Made From Vinasse. Patent US20120210759 A1. Retrieved
- 507 January 9, 2013 from www.google.com/patents/US20120210759
- 508 Jiménez AM, Borja R, Martín A. 2003. Aerobic-anaerobic biodegradation of beet molasses alcoholic
- 509 fermentation wastewater. Process Biochemistry 38:1275–1284; doi:10.1016/S0032-9592(02)00325-4.
- 510 Lahlah J, Renault P, Cazevieille P, Buzet A, Hazemann J-L, Womes M, et al. 2009. Geochemical Resilience of
- a Ferralsol Subjected to Anoxia and Organic Matter Amendment. Soil Science Society of America Journal
- 512 73:1958; doi:10.2136/sssaj2008.0302.

- 513 Murtagh JE. 1999. Chapter 16: Feedstocks, Fermentation, and Distillation for Production of Heavy and
- 514 Light Rums. The Alcohol Textbook: A reference for the Beverage, Fuel and Industrial Alcohol Industries.
- 515 Retrieved February 14, 2013 from http://www.scocia.com/newsite/Rum.pdf.pdf
- 516 OMRI (Organic Materials Research Institute). 2013. Crop Products OMRI Products List. Retrieved
   517 February 14, 2013 from <u>http://www.omri.org/sites/default/files/opl\_pdf/crops\_category.pdf</u>
- Paananen H, Lindroos M, Nurmi J, Viljava T. 2000. Process for fractioning vinasse. U.S. Patent # 6022394.
- 519 Retrieved January 9, 2013 from <u>http://www.google.com/patents/US6022394</u>
- 520 Parnaudeau V, Condom N, Oliver R, Cazevieille P, Recous S. 2008. Vinasse organic matter quality and
- 521 mineralization potential, as influenced by raw material, fermentation and concentration processes.
- 522 Bioresource Technology 99:1553–1562; doi:10.1016/j.biortech.2007.04.012.
- 523 Roukas T. 1996. Ethanol production from non-sterilized beet molasses by free and immobilized
- Saccharomyces cerevisiae cells using fed-batch culture. Journal of Food Engineering 27: 87–96;
   doi:10.1016/0260-8774(94)00076-L.
- 526 Sumner EG, Okull D, Solomon EB. 2011. Stabilized chlorine dioxide to preserve carbohydrate feedstocks.
- 527 Patent # US20110236257 A1. Retrieved August 7, 2013 from
- 528 http://www.google.com/patents/US20110236257.
- Tate & Lyle, 2005, Material Safety Data Sheet Condensed Molasses Solubles (CMS) and Technical
   Datasheet: Vinasse MPCV 01.
- 531 Tejada M, Garcia C, Gonzalez JL, Hernandez MT. 2006. Organic Amendment Based on Fresh and
- 532 Composted Beet Vinasse. Soil Science Society of America Journal 70:900–908; doi:10.2136/sssaj2005.0271.
- U.S. EPA. 2010. Renewable Fuel Standard Program (RFS2) Regulatory Impact Analysis. Retrieved February
   8, 2013 from http://www.epa.gov/otag/renewablefuels/420r10006.pdf
- 535 U.S. EPA. 1997. Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards. Chapter 9: Food and Agricultural
- 536 Industries, AP 42, Fifth Edition, Volume I. Retrieved February 14, 2013 from
- 537 http://www.epa.gov/ttn/chief/ap42/ch09/index.html
- Wee Y, Kim J, Ryu H. 2006. Biotechnological Production of Lactic Acid and Its Recent Applications.
   Retrieved February 14, 2013 from <a href="http://www.aseanbiotechnology.info/abstract/21021670.pdf">http://www.aseanbiotechnology.info/abstract/21021670.pdf</a>
- 540 Wei Y, Xu Y. 2004. Eco-friendly management of sugar industry effluents in Guangxi, China. Sugar Tech
  541 6:285–290; doi:10.1007/BF02942510.
- 542 Wilkie AC, Riedesel KJ, Owens JM. 2000. Stillage characterization and anaerobic treatment of ethanol
- stillage from conventional and cellulosic feedstocks. Biomass and Bioenergy 19:63–102; doi:10.1016/S09619534(00)00017-9.
- 545 Willington IP, Marten GG. 1982. Options for handling stillage waste from sugar-based fuel ethanol 546 production. Resources and Conservation 8:111–129; doi:10.1016/0166-3097(82)90036-0.
- 547 Yilmaztekin M, Erten H, Cabaroglu T. 2008. Production of Isoamyl Acetate from Sugar Beet Molasses by
- 548 Williopsis saturnus var. saturnus. Journal of the Institute of Brewing 114:34–38; doi:10.1002/j.2050-549 0416.2008.tb00303.x.
- 550 Zuurbier PJP, Vooren JVD. 2008. Sugarcane Ethanol: Contributions to Climate Change Mitigation and the
- 551 *Environment*. Wageningen Academic Pub.