

**FORMAL RECOMMENDATION BY THE  
NATIONAL ORGANIC STANDARDS BOARD (NOSB)  
TO THE NATIONAL ORGANIC PROGRAM (NOP)**

**Date:** November 30, 2007

**Subject:** Agar-agar, Animal Enzymes, Calcium Sulfate and  
Carageenan for re-listing on § 205.605a

**Chair:** Andrea Caroe  
(sign)

**Recommendation**

The NOSB hereby recommends to the NOP the following:

Rulemaking Action: XXX

Guidance Statement: \_\_\_\_\_

Other: \_\_\_\_\_

**Statement of the Recommendation (including Recount of Vote):**

The Board Recommends the continuation of Agar-Agar, Animal Enzymes, Calcium Sulfate and Carageenan on the National List under section 205.605a Nonagricultural (nonorganic) substances allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as “organic” or “made with organic (specified ingredients or food group(s)).”

**Motion: Julie Weisman                      Second: Joe Smillie**

**Board Vote:** Yes – 15    No – 0    Abstain - 0    Absent - 0

**Rationale Supporting Recommendation (including consistency with OFPA and NOP):**

Demonstrated continued use in handling. Organic substitute unavailable at this time.

**Response by the NOP:**

# National Organic Standards Board

## Final Recommendation for Sunset Review of Materials on § 205.605a

November 30, 2007

**I. List: 205.605 Nonagricultural (nonorganic) substances allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as “organic” or “made with organic (specified ingredients or food groups.”**

(a) Nonsynthetics allowed

### II. Committee Summary:

The Federal register notice of the sunset of these materials had elicited no public comments by early October when this committee was due to give its recommendation on the continued use of these materials. One substance, agar-agar had been erroneously included in an earlier ANPR and numerous comments were elicited at that time supporting its continued use in handling.

Review of the original TAPs did not reveal unacceptable risks to the environment, human or animal health as a result of the use or manufacture of these materials. There is no new information contradicting the original TAP reviews which were the basis for the previous NOSB decisions to list these substances.

Even though materials appeared not to present a risk to the environment, the sunset process requires public comment to support the continuation of this regulation. For this reason the initial recommendation of the Handling Committee in early October for the re-listing of these materials failed.

In the eight weeks prior to the Board meeting, numerous comments have been received requesting that these materials be re-listed and there have been no comments received opposing their continued use in organic handling.

Motion for the Handling Committee to reconsider its earlier vote was made and seconded.

Deleted: ¶

### III. Board Recommendation(s):

The Board recommends the re-listing of the following substances in this use category as published in the final rule:

Agar-Agar  
Animal Enzymes

| Calcium Sulfate  
Carageenan

Moved: Julie Weisman

Second: Joe Smillie

| Yes: 15 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent:\_0