

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, January 14, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker, Chair (CW), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Nick Maravell (NM), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Francis Thicke (FT), Jay Feldman (sitting in), Colehour Bondera (CB, sitting in)

Absent: Melissa Bailey (MB)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML)

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT	Subcommittee reps to MS WF-LS JFe-CS ZS-HS JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc	08 27 13	Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
Confidential Business Information (CBI)	TF	Fall 2013 Meeting cancelled Will discuss any potential revisions on Jan call	07 23 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Update petition and TR process -Misc topics	ZS/LB	Fall 2013 Meeting cancelled. No revisions to proposal as of 12 10 13	08 13 13	Proposal Spr 2014
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe	Written report. Working on revisions.		Spr 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc		Spr 2014

Potential Future Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
--------------	---------	--------	------	---------

Tracing GMOs in Input/Ingredient Chain		Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	JFe, CBo	Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Transgene flow	JFe	Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD

Agenda:

- Approve Materials/GMO notes from December 10, 2013
- Spring Milestones inclusive of February's confab
- Seed Purity Update (ZS)
- CBI - discuss comments/potential revisions - Calvin
- AC21 Comment Period Extension - Mark
- Future Work Plan Briefs Reminder - Calvin
 - Tracing GMOs in the input ingredient chain
 - Farmer's Choice
 - Transgene Flow
- Request for Sunset 2016 TRs - Zea
- Reassign Subcommittee reps to MS for Research Priorities if time
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes from the December 10, 2013 call were approved with the following amendment:
 - JT asked about the possibility of the MS providing a report/summary of their prior work to the NOSB Chair and to the program (e.g., during Executive call time) to inform other Subcommittees about issues they are working on."
- Spring Milestones inclusive of February's confab
 - LB had no new information to report in MB's absence
- Seed Purity Update (ZS)
 - Mark Lipson and Jay Feldman provided comments and ZS is still reviewing them. She asked that the NOP provide input before next call (with time to make adjustments if needed). LB will check in with the head of the Standards division to see if the NOP has additional input.
 - There was discussion about the tone of the first paragraph and how the issue was described. ZS explained that the paragraph was intentionally worded to describe the issue neutrally and to avoid the use of inflammatory language.
 - The group also discussed the comment about intermediary steps that the NOP could accomplish, since some of the larger issues are outside of NOP's mandate or are part of the wider debate about GMOs and responsibilities of patent holders. The group discussed rewording two specific sections: one to indicate that the NOSB needs more information on mechanisms about how compensation would work; and the section about describing how GMO drift causes a burden on organic farmers and impedes their ability to comply with the NOP standard.

- ZS will revise the document and circulate it prior to next call. The next draft should be ready by the end of January. The Chair asked about scheduling an additional call on February 25th to finalize this document, and asked that the NOP provide written feedback to next call on February 11th.
- CBI - discuss comments/potential revisions - Calvin
 - FT agreed to lead the discussion at the spring NOSB Meeting. CW suggested making modifications based on public comment received and asked that the members send any suggestion to FT. The group will discuss this topic on next call. The Chair noted that this document does not need to be revised, or voted on again.
- AC21 Comment Period Extension – ML
 - The deadline for public comment was extended to March 3
- Future Work Plan Briefs Reminder - CW
 - JT will draft a document on Farmer's Choice
 - ZS intends to work on the discussion document for Terminology for Excluded Methods
 - FT mentioned Monsanto case that was rejected from Supreme Court
 - Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling proposals for potentially fall 2014

Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:

December 10, 2013 1:00 ET

January 14, 2014 1:00 ET

Seed Purity Update (ZS)

CBI - discuss comments/potential revisions

February 11, 2014 1:00 ET

Review edits to the Seed Purity document

CBI - discuss comments/potential revisions

February 25, 2014 1:00 ET – extra call tentatively scheduled to finalize seed purity document.

March 11, 2014 1:00 ET

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014

Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 11, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	~Apr 28- May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 11, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker, Chair (CW), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Nick Maravell (NM), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Francis Thicke (FT), Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in, Mac Stone (MS) - sitting in, Colehour Bondera - (CB) - sitting in

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Melissa Bailey (MB), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML)

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT	Subcommittee reps to MS WF-LS JFe-CS ZS-HS JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc	08 27 13	Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
Confidential Business Information (CBI)	TF	Fall 2013 Meeting cancelled Will discuss comments and any potential revisions on Feb 25 call	07 23 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Update petition and TR process -Misc topics	ZS/LB	Fall 2013 Meeting cancelled. No revisions to proposal	08 13 13	Proposal Spr 2014
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe	Written report. Will be finalized Feb 25.		Spr 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc		Spr 2014

Potential Future Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
--------------	---------	--------	------	---------

Tracing GMOs in Input/Ingredient Chain		Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	JFe, CBo	Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Transgene flow	JFe	Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD

Agenda:

- Approve January 14, 2014 notes
- Material Process Training Recap (Tentative)
- Discuss 2014 Publication: “Protecting Organic Seed Integrity” by the Organic Seed Growers and Trade Association.
- Seed Purity Update
- Research Priorities across USDA Departments
- CBI - Discuss comments/Potential revisions
- Future workplan reminder: Farmer’s Choice
- Research funding possibility (\$20M) - Seeking an Organic or Sustainable & Organic Category
- Next meeting agenda
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes from the January 14, 2014 call were approved with no changes.
- **Materials Process Training Recap** - The NOP updated the group about the Petition and TR Process proposal and whether or not the current MS proposal needed to be revised to address petitions for removal of materials. The NOP feels that it does not need to be revised at this stage but intends to address this issue before publication.
- **2014 Publication: “Protecting Organic Seed Integrity”** by the Organic Seed Growers and Trade Association - The group discussed this publication and a member indicated that she would like to work on future guidance about protecting organic from GMO contamination.
- **Seed Purity document** - Several members and NOP staff circulated edited drafts and comments prior to the call and the group discussed various revisions and changes; both copy editing and content. ZS will complete the editing and the group will finalize the document on the Feb 25 call.
- **Research Priorities.** The members discussed, and decided, on an earlier call to not alter the Research Priorities document. The MS will submit this document for the fall 2014 meeting.
- **CBI** - Discuss comments/potential revisions. CW will send the summary of fall 2013 comments to FT for review, and the group will discuss them Feb 25 to determine whether or not this proposal will be revised. The Chair noted that based on his assessment of the comments, they will not make changes.
- **Future workplan reminder.** The MS Chair reminded the potential lead reviewer to complete the position paper on Farmer’s Choice in order to submit it to the NOP for consideration for inclusion on the workplan.
- **Research Funding Possibility (\$20M)** - The Chair noted that this is a great opportunity and would like to see the NOSB play a role in seeking an organic or sustainable & organic category
- The next meeting agenda was revised based on today’s call

- The meeting was adjourned

Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:

January 14, 2014 1:00 ET

Seed Purity Update (ZS)

CBI - discuss comments/potential revisions

February 11, 2014 1:00 ET

Review edits to the Seed Purity document - will complete edits and finalize on next call.

CBI - discuss comments/potential revisions - postponed to next call

February 25, 2014 1:00 ET – extra call tentatively scheduled to finalize seed purity document.

CBI - discuss summarized fall 2013 comments

Review/finalize Seed Purity document

March 11, 2014 1:00 ET

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 11, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	~Apr 28- May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, February 25, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker, Chair (CW), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Nick Maravell (NM), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Francis Thicke (FT), Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in, Mac Stone (MS) - sitting in, Colehour Bondera (CB) - sitting in, Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in

Absent: Jennifer Taylor (JT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Melissa Bailey (MB), Mark Lipson (ML), OSEC

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT	Subcommittee reps to MS WF-LS JFe-CS ZS-HS No revisions to fall 2013 proposal	08 27 13	Spr 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
Confidential Business Information (CBI)	TF	Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. No revision to fall 2013 proposal	07 23 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Update petition and TR process -Misc topics	ZS/LB	Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. No revisions to fall 2013 proposal	08 13 13	Proposal Spr 2014
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity	ZS/JFe	Written report	02 25 14	Spr 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	NA	Fall 2014

Potential Future Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Tracing GMOs in Input/Ingredient Chain		Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	JFe, CBo	Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Transgene flow	JFe	Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD

Agenda

- Roll Call
- Approve February 11, 2014 notes
- Seed Purity
- CBI - Discuss comments/Potential Revisions and Vote
- Petition and TR Process proposal Update
- Review next meeting Dates: March 11 and April 8
- Other business

Discussion:

- Notes from the February 11, 2014 call were approved with no changes
- Seed Purity Report. The members briefly discussed some minor edits. The lead reviewer asked that in the future if members have comments to please circulate them with plenty of lead time so they can review them for discussion. The NOP noted that they did not have any objections to the edits, so ZS will incorporate some of them and send the document to the Chair for transmission to the NOP.

VOTE on Seed Purity:

Motion to accept the report on Seed Purity

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: CW

Discussion: No additional discussion

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- CBI - Discuss comments/Potential Revisions and Vote. The lead reviewer noted that after reviewing both the spring and fall 2013 proposals he did not see a need for revisions. A member agreed with this assessment, and feels that it's important to acknowledge the past public comment at the spring 2014 meeting. Many commenters expressed their support for eliminating CBI, which the Board agrees with. The Board feels that it is not possible to make determinations on materials without some disclosure of information. They are seeking information about manufacturing processes only, such as extraction or distillation, not detailed

information about recipes. The group will submit the same proposal that was submitted for fall 2013 without revisions.

- The Chair noted that members were encouraged to visit the USDA website and were pleased to see that organic was fairly prominent on the page.
- Petition and TR Process proposal update. The document is complete and will be put forth for the spring 2014 as is.
- The Chair noted the next meeting dates were March 11 and April 8, and a member suggested adding a discussion of workplan items since the deadline to submit workplan ideas to the NOP is immediately after the March 11 call.
- Other business:
 - The Subcommittee will discuss the fall 2013 Research Priorities proposal at the spring 2014 meeting. MA will add this item to the draft agenda. The group will revisit the Research Priorities liaison assignments (see above table) after the spring meeting.
 - NM will not be on the Mar 11 call. ZS will not be on the Apr 8 call
- The meeting was adjourned.

Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:

February 11, 2014 1:00 ET

Review edits to the Seed Purity document - will complete edits and finalize on next call.

CBI - discuss comments/potential revisions - postponed to next call

February 25, 2014 1:00 ET – extra call tentatively scheduled to finalize seed purity document.

CBI - discuss summarized fall 2013 comments

Review/finalize Seed Purity document

March 11, 2014 1:00 ET.

Prevention Strategy Guidance

Other workplan items

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET.

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014
NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 11, 2014

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	~Apr 28- May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, March 11, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker, Chair (CW), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Wendy Fulwider (WF), Francis Thicke (FT), Jay Feldman (JFe) - sitting in, Mac Stone (MS) - sitting in
Absent: Nick Maravell (NM), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Melissa Bailey (MB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML), OSEC

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT	Subcommittee reps to MS WF-LS JFe-CS ZS-HS No revisions to fall 2013 proposal	08 27 13	Spr 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
Confidential Business Information (CBI)	TF	Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. No revision to fall 2013 proposal	07 23 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Update petition and TR process -Misc topics	ZS/LB	Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. No revisions to fall 2013 proposal	08 13 13	Proposal Spr 2014
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report	02 25 14	Spr 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	NA	Fall 2014

Potential Future Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Tracing GMOs in Input/Ingredient Chain		Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	ZS, JFe, CBo	Discussion doc? ZS Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD
Transgene flow	JFe	Discussion doc? Will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP		TBD

Agenda

- Roll Call
- Approve February 25, 2014 notes
- Update on Posting Proposals
- Due Date Reminder
- Seed Purity document
- Discussion of tentative work plan due to NOP by March 12, 2014
 - a. Prevention strategy Guidance for Excluded methods in crops and handling
 - b. Seed Purity: The next step
 - c. Transgene Flow: The next step
 - d. Farmer Choice: The next step
 - e. Other: To be determined
- Petition: Aluminum sulfate (LB)
- Other business
 - o Public comment compilations
- Next Meeting Dates
 - o April 8, 2014 at 1:00 ET
 - o May 13, 2014 at 1:00 ET

Discussion:

- **Notes from the February 25, 2014 call** were approved with minor changes to the section on CBI.
- **Seed Purity document** - the group will determine how to proceed with this document based on the comments they receive for the spring meeting.
- **Tentative work plan items due to NOP by March 12, 2014**
 - a. **Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling** - The NOP indicated that it is supportive of the concept for this work but wants to write a memo to send to the Board to place it on the workplan, so it is forwarded as an official request from the program to the Board. A member asked that the NOP make this a priority since the Board will be very busy with Sunset reviews for the next few NOSB Meetings. They noted that there is a need for expediency during this short window of opportunity. The group discussed the process for getting this particular item on the workplan, and the NOP indicated that due to its nature, it's important that the scope is well defined. The MS Chair and/or principal reviewer will discuss this further on the ES call. Members discussed adding specific language to the briefing paper, including

reiterating that organic means non-GMO as well as background information and history about the new process that is now in effect. ML suggested adding references to past guidance and/or situations where the rule has proved to be inadequate, such as GMO avoidance. ZS will recirculate the document and the group will discuss it on the ES call on Friday.

- c. **Transgene Flow: The next step** - deferred for time
- d. **Farmer Choice: The next step** - deferred for time
- e. **Other: To be determined** - deferred for time
- **Petition: Aluminum sulfate (LB)** - The NOP received a petition for Aluminum Sulfate for both Crops and Livestock use, and The National List manager is seeking advice from the Materials Subcommittee about which Subcommittee should conduct the review. The petitioned uses are as follows: (1) treatment of poultry litter (205.603) and (2) application of treated poultry litter to the field (205.601). The members discussed whether or not the review should be conducted by one Subcommittee or both and chose to have both conducts reviews sequentially. The MS Chair indicated that it should go to Livestock first, with clear instructions that it is being petitioned for two uses. When Livestock has completed the review it will then go to Crops, and then both proposals could be presented and voted on at the same NOSB meeting. NOP will send the petition to Livestock for inclusion on their workplan.
- **Next Meeting Dates**
 - o April 8, 2014
 - o May 13, 2014
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

February 25, 2014 1:00 ET – extra call tentatively scheduled to finalize seed purity document.

CBI - discuss summarized fall 2013 comments

Review/finalize Seed Purity document

March 11, 2014 1:00 ET

Prevention Strategy Guidance

Other workplan items

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET. ZS absent

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014

NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 11, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	Apr 29 May 1, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, April 11, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair (Wendy Fulwider, Vice Chair, (WF), Francis Thicke (FT), Nick Maravell (NM), Zea Sonnabend (ZS)

Absent: Jennifer Taylor (JT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Melissa Bailey (MB), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML), OSEC

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT	Subcommittee reps to MS WF-LS JFe-CS ZS-HS No revisions to fall 2013 proposal	08 27 13	Spr 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
Confidential Business Information (CBI)	TF	Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. No revision to fall 2013 proposal	07 23 13	Proposal Spr 2014
Update petition and TR process -Misc topics	ZS/LB	Fall 2013 meeting cancelled. No revisions to fall 2013 proposal	08 13 13	Proposal Spr 2014
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report	02 25 14	Spr 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	NA	Fall 2014

Potential Future Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Tracing GMOs in Input/Ingredient Chain		Discussion doc? Will write briefing paper to submit to the NOP		TBD
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	CW, ZS	Discussion doc? ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this is placed on the workplan. Waiting for response from NOP		Fall 2014
Transgene flow	JFe	Discussion doc? Will write briefing paper to submit to the NOP		TBD

Agenda

- Roll Call
- Approve March 11, 2014 notes
- Update on posting proposals
- Public comments
- NOSB Material Report, Sunset 2016-17
- NOSB/NOP 2013 Research Priority Assessment by USDA Organic Working Group
- Organic Website Search Engine - Continue Site visit Update
- Spring Meeting Presentations
- MS Work Plan Topic Justification, NOP Approval Update
- Other business
- Next Meeting Dates
 - May 13, 2014 at 1:00 ET
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- **Notes from the March 11, 2014 call** were approved with no changes.
- **Public comments.** The comments are currently being bundled and will be sent to the Board members in the next couple of days for review
- **NOSB Material Report, Sunset 2016-17.** The latest Materials report was circulated last week. Currently there are two outstanding Sunset 2016 TRs in development: CS and HS. The NOP noted that the 2017 Sunset requests are due in July.
- **NOSB/NOP 2013 Research Priority Assessment by USDA Organic Working Group.** ML circulated an informal report to the group ahead of the call and the group briefly discussed the comments. The report will be presented at the Board meeting in San Antonio. NOP staff participated in discussions with the Organic Working Group to help clarify some of the research priorities and noted that the working group members carefully considered each point before providing feedback. During the discussions the NOP was able to add some clarifying language and had some suggestions for the Subcommittee when writing future research priorities that could help the scientific panels that are convened to conduct these types of reviews. The

panelists are recruited from various fields and are comprised of both governmental and non-governmental people. The MS members discussed how to proceed with the next Research Priorities list. One member urged the group to start discussing the fall 2014 list in their respective Subcommittees so they can start working on the fall 2014 proposal.

- **Organic Website Search Engine.** The Chair is very supportive of this website and encouraged people to visit. The website will be updated now that the farm bill has been signed.
- **Spring Meeting Presentations.** ZS will present three of the four spring proposals/reports and the MS Chair volunteered to summarize the public comments for each.
- **MS Work Plan Topic Justification, NOP Approval Update.** The NOP is working on a workplan request in response to the MS about the following briefing paper it submitted: Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling. The NOP plans to send this to the Subcommittee prior to the spring meeting. The table above was changed to reflect this update.
- **Other business.** The Chair let the members know about a USDA funding program he works with extensively that funds organic and sustainable agriculture research at historically black land grant Universities.
- **Next Meeting Dates.** May 13, 2014 at 1:00 ET. See below for updated list.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

March 11, 2014 1:00 ET

Prevention Strategy Guidance

Other workplan items

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET. Moved to April 11, 2014.

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

June 10, 2014 1:00 ET

July 8, 2014 1:00 ET

August 12, 2014 1:00 ET

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY)

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2014 Milestones	Target date
Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances	Jan 15, 2014
NOSB Training meeting	Feb 4 - 5, 2014
NOP – Complete tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2014
Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 10, 2014
Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP	Mar 12, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Mar 14, 2014

NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB	Mar 28, 2014
Public comment closes	Apr 8, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call	Apr 18, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 14, 2014
Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX	Apr 29 - May 2, 2014

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, May 13, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Francis Thicke (FT), Nick Maravell (NM), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Jay Feldman, (JFe) - sitting in

Absent: Jennifer Taylor (JT), Wendy Fulwider, (WF)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	ZS	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS JFe/FT - CS ZS - HS		Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		Fall 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	NA	Fall 2014

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	CW, FT	Discussion doc? ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this be placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14		Fall 2014

Agenda

- Roll Call
- Approve April 11, 2014 notes
- NOSB Material Report
- Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update
- Work Plan
- MS Work Plan Topic Justification, NOP Approval Update
- Research Priorities
- Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant breeding)
- Seed Purity Report
- Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling
- Second Call Discussion
- Other business
- Next Meeting Dates (see below)
- New Fall Timetable (see below)
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- **Notes from the April 11, 2014 call** approved with no changes.
- **NOSB Materials Report** - The National List Manager distributed a new Materials Report to the NOSB just prior to the Subcommittee meeting and noted that the technical reports for the 2016 Sunset Materials should be back soon. The group discussed the TR for yeast and its applicability to microorganisms.
- **Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update** - There was no update regarding this topic. However, the NOP is conducting a Google + webinar tomorrow on Growing Organic.
- **Work Plan** – The new 2014 workplans are posted and MA will paste the tables into the Subcommittee notes for reference.
- **MS Work Plan Topic Justification, NOP Approval Update** - No update
- **Research Priorities** - A member asked that the group schedule discussion time for the Research Priorities, noting that the Board received several suggestions from the community for research topics. The MS assigned liaisons to the other subcommittees for the Research Priorities (see table above). The MS Chair will ask WF if she would liaise with CACS even though they do not typically have research topics. A member added that it's important to recognize that lead time is very important because the timeline from conception to implementation is long. The members also discussed the format for the topics, in an effort to supply the Organic Working Group with as much specificity and detail as possible.
- **Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant breeding)** – Discussion time for this topics was added to the calendar below
- **Seed Purity Report** – The group would like to ask MB or ML on next call how to interface with Economic Research Service (ERS)
- **Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling.** The NOP sent a memo to the Board on April 28, 2014 approving the addition of this item to the workplan.
- **Second Call Discussion** – The group added a call to the schedule for August 26, 2014 1:00 ET
- **Other business** - none
- **Next Meeting Dates (see below)**
- **New Fall Timetable (see below)**

- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET. Moved to April 11, 2014.

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

June 10, 2014 1:00 ET

How to interface with Economic Research Service (ERS) (ML)

July 8, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

August 12, 2014 1:00 ET

August 26, 2014 1:00 ET - additional call

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY)

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 8, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, June 10, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Francis Thicke (FT), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Wendy Fulwider, (WF), Jay Feldman, (JFe)

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML), OSEC

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	ZS	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS JFe/FT - CS ZS - HS		Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		Fall 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	NA	Fall 2014

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	CW, FT	Discussion doc? ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this be placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14		Fall 2014

Agenda

- Roll Call
- Approve May 13, 2014 notes
- Petition & CBI Recommendations - NOP Implementation (LB)
- Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update (ML)
- Approaches to interfacing with the Economic Research Service (ML)
- Work plan Assignments/Assistance
- Work Plan Review July 8, 2014 1:00 ET (ZS)
 - Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment
 - Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods
- Research Priorities Update from the Livestock Subcommittee
- Fall Milestones (MA)
- Next Meeting Dates (CW)
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- **Notes from the May 13, 2014** call were approved with no changes.
- **Petition & CBI Recommendations (LB)** - The NOP provided an update about plans for implementation of their recommendation to update the Petition and TR process. The goal is to publish the Federal Register (FR) notice before the next NOSB fall meeting. The hope is that any petitions received in the interim are in compliance with the new guidelines and do not contain Confidential Business Information (CBI). LB will flag any petitions that are submitted between now and the effective date of the new FR notice that contain CBI. Members asked if the NOP will hold petitions that comply with the new guidelines until the new guidelines are published and the NOP indicated that the preference is that petitioners delay submission of those petitions until the guidelines are published. A member asked a question about a streamlined process to change annotations.
- **Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update (ML)** - ML (OSEC) updated the group about activities pertaining to Organic at the USDA, including the Farm Bill implementation, the agriculture survey and census. The group discussed the comprehensiveness of the survey, which is 12 pages long, and its utility to crop insurance and risk management. Members also discussed public comment regarding the GMO contamination in seed purity document, and the AC21 implementation team. A member inquired about how the NOSB can help further the process along. The program suggested forwarding the Seed Purity report to other entities inside the USDA, highlighting this issue. ZS will send the report to The NOP Deputy Administrator and ML to forward to the appropriate people.
- **Work Plan Review**
 - **Research Priorities Update** - ZS asked the MS to develop and submit Research Priorities for the fall 2014 meeting. JFe volunteered to be the liaison to each of the other Subcommittee leads to keep this moving forward. ZS also reminded the group to review the Research Priorities Framework and how priorities are brought to the forefront for consideration. Specifically, the suggestions from stakeholders. ML noted that the Research Priorities Framework has garnered lots of attention, and suggested that it might be more useful to keep it a short list of important priorities and not just a compendium of topics.

- o The MS Chair indicated the Livestock Subcommittee will review the Framework and prioritize their projects, taking into account any public comments they received, to see if there is overlap.
- **Organic at USDA Update**
 - o Secretary Vilsack announced a research grant opportunity for citrus greening disease. A member of the organic community was seated on USDA research advisory Board on Citrus Greening, which is charged with distributing research grants.
 - o ZS and the NOP participated in an E-Organic seed webinar last week. ZS noted that they had nearly 300 participants from all around the world.
 - o CW mentioned that each state has at least one land grant university who has money for research needs and noted that they are very receptive to inquiries for grants.
- **Fall Milestones** - see table below as a reminder.
- **Next Meeting Dates** - see list below.
- **Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling** - The discussion for this topic was scheduled for July 8 (see below). ZS suggested that the lead reviewer(s) review two documents: [the NOP memo](#) issued April 28, 2014 as well as her briefing paper sent to Board members March 11, 2014.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

June 10, 2014 1:00 ET

How to interface with Economic Research Service (ERS) (ML)

July 8, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment

Discuss draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling

August 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

August 26, 2014 1:00 ET - additional call

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY)

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 8, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014

NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, July 8, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Jennifer Taylor (JT), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Nick Maravell (NM), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in

Absent: Jay Feldman (JFe), Francis Thicke (FT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML), OSEC

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JFe	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS JFe/FT - CS ZS - HS		Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		Fall 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	NA	Fall 2014

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT, CW	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this be placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition		Fall 2014

Agenda

- Roll Call
- Approve June 10, 2014 notes
- New Petition: 3-decen-2-one, potato sprout inhibitor (Lisa, 5 minutes)
- Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update
- Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment (JFe) - Deferred to August 12
- Discuss draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods
- Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling (FT) - Deferred to August 12
- Research Priorities Update from the Livestock Subcommittee
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- **Notes from the June 10, 2014 approved with no changes**
- **New Petition: 3-decen-2-one, potato sprout inhibitor (LB).** Petitioner requested addition to §205.601 for post-harvest use on potatoes. The NOP discussed the appropriate section of the list (§205.601 vs §205.605) in light of the post-harvest handling draft guidance that was issued April 25. NOP will leave the final determination for placement to the NOSB. The group discussed specifics of the petition such as the timing of the application of the material, which has bearing on which Subcommittee would complete the review. As a petition for §205.601, the petition will be reviewed by the Crops Subcommittee not Handling. The petition was incomplete as received and will be distributed to the CS once it meets the petition guidelines.
- **Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update (ML).** The Farm bill implementation is moving forward. Certification and Cost Share program is progressing and the states are in the process of applying for Cost Share grants. ML noted that OSEC is currently searching for his successor upon his departure, and it will be an internal hire.
- **Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment** - Deferred to August 12
- **Discuss draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods** - The lead circulated an outline prior to the call and the group discussed it. The public comment the Board received for spring 2015 was diverse. A couple of the commenters referenced the Senate report that accompanied OFPA (1990), and was quoted in the first proposed rule. (62 Fed. Reg. 65850, 65875). The NOP will locate this document and send it to the Subcommittee members. The goal of this document is to clarify which techniques are considered excluded. A member added that many of the techniques discussed in the draft document have already crept into the seed supply. The Chair asked about lengthening the current comment period from 30 days to 6 months. The entire group feels that it is a very complex topic and 30 days is inadequate.. MA will check on the status of the NOSB recommendation regarding an open, ongoing public docket. ML encouraged the NOP to seek a resolution to this.
- **Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling** - deferred to August 12
- **Research Priorities update from the Livestock Subcommittee** – The LS is working on Research Priorities' ranking, and will forward the list to the Materials Subcommittee by end of week.

- **Organic Bug or Organic Hug.** CW spoke with community members, specifically Marty Mesh of the Florida Organic Growers, about working with Universities to provide training opportunities to farmers in the southern states.
- **Fall Milestones Update** - See table below.
- **Next Meeting Dates** - August 12 and 26
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

June 10, 2014 1:00 ET

How to interface with Economic Research Service (ERS) (ML)

July 8, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment - Deferred to August 12

Discuss draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling - Deferred to August 12

August 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling

August 26, 2014 1:00 ET - additional call

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY)

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 8, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 12, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Jennifer Taylor (JT), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Jay Feldman (JFe), Francis Thicke (FT), Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML), OSEC. Betsy Rakola (BR), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JFe	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS JFe/FT - CS ZS - HS		Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		Fall 2014
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	NA	Fall 2014

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT, CW	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this be placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition		Fall 2014

Agenda

- Roll Call
- Approve July 8, 2014 notes
- NOP National List update?
- Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update
- Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment
- Discuss draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods
- Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- **Notes from the July 8, 2014** were approved with no changes.
- **NOP National List update (LB).** The Sunset 2017 TR request list is being finalized and the NOP will send it to the entire Board once it is finalized.
- **Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update (ML).**
 - Betsy Rakola, NOP Accreditation Manager has been named successor to Mark Lipson as the Organic Policy Advisor and Chair of the Organic Working Group. They are currently collaborating to define her roles, including that on the Materials Subcommittee.
 - The MS Chair asked about the potential for tax incentives for organizations to bring forth organic alternatives. ML offered to put out some queries to seek information or potential networks. ML also suggested looking into SBIR ([Small Business Innovation Research](#)) grants in NIFA, who provides seed funding for new ideas. ML will send links to MA.
- **Discuss Research Priorities suggestions (JFe)** - The group discussed the draft document that was circulated prior to the call, and discussed the Research Priorities Framework document as well. The Framework explains the criteria and process for adding Research Priorities to the list and, as NOP noted, provides the NOSB with a venue to solicit information that would help in the decision making process for items where a lack of data/information has been identified as a problem. A member asked about adding a topic regarding no-till practices. The Crops Chair indicated that this topic will be discussed on the next Crops call and they will provide feedback to the Materials Subcommittee. Another member remarked that the NRCS representative who participated on one of the Crops calls discussed this topic in relation to the soils assessment document that the CACS is working on. Another topic proposed for possible addition to the research priorities list was biological controls. The members discussed the phrase “biological controls” and felt that it was not specific enough, so may use the phrase bio-pesticides, or classical biological controls instead.
- **Draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods.** The members discussed the draft document and incorporated various edits and comments. The lead noted the inclusion of the public comment that was received at the last meeting. The MS asked about having a 6-month comment period instead of the typical 30-day period which they feel is inadequate for such a complex topic. The NOP will seek options for comment collection and let the group know. The MS Chair requested NOP input prior to the posting of the document for the fall 2014 meeting. ZS will circulate another draft by the weekend so members will have a week to review.

The following items were deferred to the next call due to lack of time:

- Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling (FT) - deferred to next call.
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

June 10, 2014 1:00 ET

How to interface with Economic Research Service (ERS) (ML)

July 8, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment - Deferred to August 12

Discuss draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling - Deferred to August 12

August 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling

August 26, 2014 1:00 ET - additional call

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY)

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 8, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 27 - Oct 31

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, August 26, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Vice Chair, Jay Feldman (JFe), Nick Maravell (NM), Tracy Favre (TF) sitting in, Jennifer Taylor (JT), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: none

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML), OSEC, Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JFe	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS JFe/FT - CS ZS - HS	08 26 14	Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		TBD
Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	08 26 14	Fall 2014

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT, CW	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this be placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition		Spr 2015

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve August 12, 2014 notes
- TR Request Update, Biopesticide and Organic Support Program
- Prevention Guidance for GMOs (FT)
- Organic and sustainable agriculture update
- Discuss research priorities suggestions from public comment
- Discuss 2nd draft of terminology for excluded methods
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall Milestones Update
- Review Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- **Notes from the** August 12, 2014 approved with no changes.
- **NOP Update** (LB). The TR requests are at the contracting office and being processed. LB will provide an update if there are any changes based on available budget, but NOP expects to be able to fund the current requests. LB noted that she forwarded an email regarding the IR4 program to the members for informational purposes. The goal of the [IR4 Biopesticide and Organic Support Program](#) is to further the development and registration of biopesticides for use in pest management systems for specialty crops or for minor uses on major crops.
- **Organic and sustainable agriculture update** (ML). ML updated the group about his successor, Betsy Rakola, who will continue to work with the Materials Subcommittee. The Organic Working Group (OWG) met since the last MS call and ML updated the members. The Organic Agriculture Research and Extension Initiative (OREI) proposals will be finalized soon, and ML noted that there is overlap between the NOSB Research Priorities and the OREI proposals.
- **Research Priorities** (JFe). A draft document was circulated prior to the call, and the group reviewed it and suggested various changes. Based on feedback from the Organic Working Group (OWG) the research items need to be narrowly focused and specific, so a few of the items were removed from the list as they were not viable candidates for research. Additionally, the current list contained items that were put forth previously, and while the group agreed that the items needed to remain on the list and kept at the forefront, they chose to include them in an appendix instead. A member reminded the group about the pace of research and funding sources and the need for patience with the research community. ML noted two approaches for the Research Priorities going forth: 1. Building an ongoing cumulative inventory or 2. Identifying a short list of top priorities. The group will have a more in depth conversation about these options for the next set of priorities. Members also asked about receiving a progress report on the past priorities. One member suggested the addition of a Research Priority on methods to reduce and/or eliminate impact of contamination on organic farming systems and in organic food. Another member noted that there is research on these topics.

Vote on Research Priorities:

Motion to accept the 2014 Research Priorities document with modifications and removals as discussed

Motion by: JFe

Seconded by: ZS

Discussion: no additional discussion

Y: 7 N: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0 Abstentions: 0

Motion carries

ABS Note 08 27 14: The MS recirculated the proposal with an addition and revoted on the amended proposal:

Motion to add the research priority, "Risk Reduction from Off-Target Exposure to Non-Permitted Materials," to the final 2014 research priorities document.

Motion by: JT

Seconded by: JFe

Discussion: A member objected to the fact that this was added at the last minute and the Subcommittee did not have time to discuss it in depth before it was added to the Research Priorities list

Y: 5 N: 1 Absent: 1 Abstentions: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion carries

- **Discuss 2nd draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods.** The group discussed the substantive edits that were circulated via email, and made changes accordingly. Members noted that they expect a rigorous discussion about this topic at the fall meeting.

Vote on Excluded Methods Terminology discussion document

Motion to approve the discussion document on Excluded Methods Terminology as amended on the call.

Motion by: ZS

Seconded: CW

Additional Discussion: Members confirmed that the NOP was supportive of this topic and document prior to its submission for the fall 2014 meeting.

Y: 6 N: 0 Absent: 1 Abstention: 0 Recusals: 0

Motion carries

- **Prevention Guidance for GMOs (FT).** The group discussed the document, noting that they did not receive many comments. Members discussed whether or not they should submit it for the fall 2014 meeting or continue to work on it and submit it for the spring 2015 meeting. One member reminded the group that submitting two discussion documents to consecutive meetings is a useful way to gather public comment and has been done in the past. The NOP recently forwarded a document ([NOP 5025: Guidance on Commingling and Contamination Prevention in Organic Production and Handling](#)) to the group indicating that while it does not address GMOs specifically, there is some overlap with prevention strategies, and the group might find it useful. Members opted to hold the discussion document for the spring 2015 meeting so they can edit and add to it.
- **Organic Bug or Organic Hug.** CW noted that he has been working with Southern University's policy center.
- **Fall Milestones Update:** see below

- Next Meeting Dates: see below
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

August 12, 2014 1:00 ET

Discuss Research Priorities suggestions from public comment

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling

August 26, 2014 1:00 ET - additional call

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY)

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 8, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 28- Oct 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, September 9, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Vice Chair, Wendy Fulwider (WF), Francis Thicke (FT), Jennifer Taylor (JT)

Absent: Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Nick Maravell (NM)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JFe	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS JFe/FT - CS ZS - HS	08 26 14	Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		TBD
Excluded Methods Terminology (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	08 26 14	Fall 2014

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT, CW	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this be placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition		Spr 2015

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve August 26, 2014 notes
- Antimicrobial petition for handling (LB)
- Organic and sustainable agriculture update (BR)
- Reference for mitigation measures for residues in compost (JFe)
- Clarification on mastitis & pneumonia priority ranking of LS.
- Approach(es): Review of approach for compiling public comments
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (CW)
- Fall Milestones update (MA)
- Spring 2015 workplan
- Review Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- **Approval of notes from August 26, 2014** - deferred to next call.
- **Antimicrobial petition for handling - Ancillary Substances vs. Inerts** (LB). The NOP received a petition for a new antimicrobial active ingredient to be added to the National List (NL). The petition asks that the Board review the inert ingredients as ancillary substances. Some of the inert ingredients are on the former EPA list 4 Inerts. The NOP is seeking advice from the Materials and Handling Subcommittees about how to proceed. The group will wait until the two members who have extensive knowledge in this area (JFe and ZS) can provide comments. The NOP will continue to have internal discussions about this, and will provide a summary to the Subcommittee. Members also noted that it would be helpful to wait until the post-harvest handling guidance is published.
- **Organic and sustainable agriculture update** (ML) - no updates
- **Reference for mitigation measures for residues in compost**. The NOP suggested that the MS might want to add a citation for the reference to OMRI regarding this topic, but the proposal went forth as is in order to meet the posting deadline.
- **Clarification on mastitis & pneumonia priority ranking**. The NOP suggested that the MS clarify the ranking on Livestock's list of Research Priorities in the Research Priorities Proposal, but the proposal went forth as is in order to meet the posting deadline.
- **Public comments**. The link to Regulations.gov, where people can view the public comment, was sent to the NOSB members. Members will review the comments and plan to discuss and summarize on the next call.
- **Organic Bug or Organic Hug** (CW). CW noted that he is participating on a project through his University with organic ranchers and has added organic topics to the list of topics for proposals. The group seeks to help limited- resources farmers through organic policy research.
- **Fall milestones update** - see table below
- **Spring 2015 workplan**. MA will send the lists to the group for review and comments.
- **Review Next Meeting Dates**. MA will send alternate dates for the Nov 11 which falls on Veterans Day.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

August 26, 2014 1:00 ET - additional call

Discuss first draft of Terminology for Excluded Methods

Discuss Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Antimicrobial petition for handling – Ancillary Substances vs. Inerts (LB)

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY)

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 8, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 28- Oct 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, October 14, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Francis Thicke (FT), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Jay Feldman (JFe), Nick Maravell (NM), Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS)

Absent: Wendy Fulwider (WF)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Betsy Rakola (BR), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR)

Work Plan

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JFe	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS JFe/FT - CS ZS - HS	08 26 14	Fall 2014
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		TBD
Excluded Methods Terminology (formerly Plant Breeding)	ZS	Discussion Doc	08 26 14	Fall 2014

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT, CW	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this be placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition		Spr 2015

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve August 26, 2014 notes
- Approve September 9, 2014 notes
- Antimicrobial petition for handling - Ancillary Substances vs. Inerts
- Sodium hydroxide petition (LB)
- Organic and sustainable agriculture update (BR)\NOSB - Meeting - Louisville Kentucky – Prep
- Discussion Document: Excluded Methods Terminology
- Proposal: Fall 2014 Research Priorities
- Oral commenters
- Discuss public comments and how to summarize them
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (CW)
- Fall Milestones update (MA)
- Spring 2015 workplan
- Review Next Meeting Dates - sub for Nov 11
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes of August 26, 2014 approved with no changes
- Notes of September 9, 2014 approved with no changes
- Antimicrobial petition for handling - Ancillary Substances vs. Inerts (). The petitioner requested that the Board review the inert ingredients in this product as ancillary substances of the active ingredient. Some of the inert ingredients are on the former EPA list 4 Inerts. The NOP discussed this and determined that the active ingredient is eligible for review but the inerts do not meet the intent of the NOSB's policy for review of ancillary substances, in which case the petitioner would need to petition the inerts separately. A member noted that the EPA's Design for the Environment (DfE) is looking at antimicrobials and indicated that the inerts should be considered under the inert policy and not the ancillary substances policy. Other members and the NOP were supportive of this approach of not reviewing inerts in formulated products as ancillary substances. NOP will notify the petitioner of the eligibility.
- Sodium hydroxide petition. NOP received a petition for sodium hydroxide for used on shell eggs. The NOP determined that the petition was ineligible because the wrong National List (NL) section was identified and sodium hydroxide is already on NL at 205.605.
- Organic and sustainable agriculture update (BR) - Betsy Rakola, the Organic Policy Advisor, updated the group about various activities such as the ORIE grants which were announced recently. BR will forward the information about the grants to the MS. Representatives from the Rodale Institute are conducting a multi-day climate change walk to raise awareness about the role of organic agriculture in mitigating climate change, and will visit with various departments at the USDA. The USDA Food and Agriculture Proceedings on Organic Research meeting is in DC and will host National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) grantees. BR will circulate the meeting minutes. BR also noted that they are finalizing the work plan for next year and it includes more outreach focusing on resources for farmers who are transitioning to organic.
- Discussion Document: Excluded Methods Terminology. The lead is preparing a summary of the public comments to be presented at the fall 2014 meeting. The Board received comments from 9 organizations and 3 individuals for the Research Priorities, some of which raised additional issues or topics. CW will summarize comments.

- Public comment summaries. ZS and JFe will present PowerPoints at the fall meeting.
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (CW). The Chair applauded Rodale Institute for bringing a positive message about Organic Agriculture. A member noted a recent research paper out of England, confirming the nutritional benefits of Organic Food. ZS will circulate the paper.
- Fall Milestones update (MA). See table below
- Spring 2015 workplan. The MS members reviewed the workplan going forward.
- Next meeting dates. The November meeting will be rescheduled for November 25 instead of the 11th due to Veterans Day.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Antimicrobial petition for handling – Ancillary Substances vs. Inerts (LB)

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY) - cancelled

November 25, 2014 1:00 ET

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Fall 2014 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2017 substances	Jul 15, 2014
NOP - Complete tentative agenda	Aug 8, 2014
NOSB - Fall 2014 proposals due to NOP	Aug 27, 2014
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2014
NOSB Subcommittees - submit tentative workplans to NOP	Sept 11, 2014
Discuss workplans on ES call	Sept 12, 2014
Public comment closes	Oct 7, 2014
Workplans finalized on ES call (last call before fall mtg)	Oct 17, 2014
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2014
Fall 2014 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY	Oct 28- Oct 30

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, November 25, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Jay Feldman (JFe), Harold Austin (HA), Colehour Bondera (CBo), Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM), Wendy Fulwider (WF)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JFe/JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	08 26 14	Fall 2015
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	N/A
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS/JFe	Written report: Next steps		TBD?
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	08 26 14	Spr 2015

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this is placed on the workplan. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition		Spr 2015

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve October 14, 2014 notes
- Organic and sustainable agriculture update (BR)
- Work agenda for 2015 - transition projects from past members
- Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling - Discuss having an expert panel at Spring 2015 meeting
- Research Priorities
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (CW)
- Fall Milestones update (MA)
- Review Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes of October 14, 2014 notes approved with no changes
- **Organic and sustainable agriculture update (BR)** - The Chair noted that updates are provided to the MS via the Organic Policy Advisor who participates in the Organic Working Group (OWG) meetings weekly. Currently the OWG is seeking to update the training and outreach materials (organic literacy 101 and 201, etc). The group received comments from the public about the materials indicating that they would like to see information about farming practices, which are not currently included. The OWG will be expanding the information to include this topic, and hope to have it ready early next year. They are also incorporating updates from the farm bill including organic funding opportunities. Additionally, the OWG will be working on a project to compile information and materials about organic research funding sources. CW offered to send BR some information about the 1890 land grant institutions and current grants that they are administering.
- **Work agenda for 2015**
 - The Seed Purity project will be removed from the table above, as a piece of it will be incorporated into the Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling project.
 - Excluded Methods Terminology - The MS will repost the same discussion document for the spring 2015 NOSB meeting in an effort to collect more input from the public.
 - Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling - FT will be the lead on this project. ZS noted that she would like to include a piece on non-organic feed, and will assist FT with this. The members discussed having an expert panel at the spring 2015 meeting to discuss the seed component part of this topic. MA will discuss this with the NOSB Chair and the Deputy Administrator and report back to the Subcommittee. The NOP noted that past panels have included 3 or 4 panelists. The group discussed several possible panelists and will refine the list. The NOP asked that the MS expand the bios for each of the people they are considering in an effort to seat a panel representative of the community.
- **Research Priorities (RP)** - during and after the new-appointees-transition period, the RP liaisons will be appointed to network with the other Subcommittees. Jennifer Taylor volunteered to be the coordinator for this project. In addition to coordinating with the other Subcommittees, the lead will be responsible for making sure the RPs are clear and detailed enough for the OWG so they are ready to be forwarded to the research community. Members discussed the importance

of including a report or summary of past research priorities in the document each year, to keep the community up to date.

- **Organic Bug or Organic Hug** (CW) - CW conveyed condolences to JT for a recent death in her family.
- **Spring Milestones update** (MA) - see below
- Review **Next Meeting Dates** - December 9 is next call and there are only 4 more calls scheduled before the spring 2015 meeting.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

September 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Antimicrobial petition for handling – Ancillary Substances vs. Inerts (LB)

October 14, 2014 1:00 ET

November 11 (VETERANS DAY) - moved to November 25

November 25, 2014 1:00 ET

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - May 1

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes
Tuesday, December 9, 2014 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS), Harold Austin (HA), Francis Thicke (FT), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Colehour Bondera (CBo)

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Jay Feldman (JFe), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

Work agenda

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JFe/JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS CW - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS	08 26 14	Fall 2015
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling doc		TBD?
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	08 26 14	Spr 2015
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this is placed on the work agenda. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition		Spr 2015

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve November 25, 2014 notes
- Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update
- Expert panel 1 pager update & finalize the panel list
- Brief Update on the Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document
- Brief Update on Research Priorities
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Spring Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes of November 25, 2014 were approved with no changes
- **Organic and Sustainable Agriculture Update** - No update at this time
- **Expert panel on Seed Purity** - The MS discussed the idea of having a panel at the spring 2015 NOSB meeting to discuss seed purity as it relates to prevention strategies for excluded methods. Specifically, how seed purity can prevent GMO contamination. Members have put forth several names for potential panelists. ZS will merge the lists, including a short bio for each person, and will send it to the NOP for review and response. The goal is to seat 3-4 panelists.
- **Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document** - deferred to next call
- **Research Priorities** - The lead reminded the group about the research priorities work agenda item, and urged people to keep it in mind as they conduct other Board work. She also asked that the NOP provide a briefing about the impact of past research priorities. MA will ask BR to discuss any outcomes on the next call.
- **Organic Bug or Organic Hug** - CW noted that once he rotates off the Board he is interested in developing a group to work with public interest groups helping to resolve issues in the organic community, or between organic and conventional agriculture. He is especially interested in beginning with his local, rural community.
- **Spring Fall Milestones Update** - See table below. The NOP noted that there are only two more MS meetings before the proposal deadline.
- **Next Meeting Dates** - See list below
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule:

November 25, 2014 1:00 ET

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

January 13, 2015 1:00 ET

February 10, 2015 1:00 ET

March 10, 2015 1:00 ET

April 14, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
------------------------	-------------

NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30