

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, April 2, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Nate Lewis (NL); Esu Obu (EO)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review March 19, 2024 notes
- Meloxicam - Petition sufficiency and TR determination
- 2027 Sunset TR Determinations
 - Oxytocin (BC)
 - Poloxalene (KH)
 - Formic acid (KH)
 - EPA List 4 Inerts (BC/NL)
 - Excipients (BC/NL)
 - Strychnine (FQ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 19, 2024 notes** were approved with minor edits.
- **Meloxicam (KH/NPP) - Petition sufficiency and TR determination.** The LS members briefly discussed the petition for meloxicam, noting that it is FDA approved, and has no known side effects. The petition was found sufficient, and the group will revisit this conversation on the next call to determine the need for a Technical Report.
- **2027 Sunset TR Determinations**
 - **Oxytocin (BC).** The lead indicated that at the last sunset there was a recommendation to remove oxytocin, however the NOP did not implement that recommendation. At this time, the LS will not request a TR, and is looking forward to public comment for the Spring 2025 meeting.
 - **Poloxalene (KH).** The lead noted that poloxalene is used internally for bloat management, and is a substance managed by the FDA. At the last sunset review it was approved unanimously. The TAP is from 2001, and it seems to be thorough. The LS will mark this as a potential candidate for a new limited scope TR, based on the age of the last one, the lack of international information in the TAP, and to explore any manufacturing changes.
 - **Formic acid (KH).** Used in beekeeping. Seems non-controversial, and ubiquitous. No new TR.
 - **EPA List 4 Inerts (BC/NL).** There has never been a TR, because it involves hundreds of substances. List 4 inerts are currently under review by the Materials Subcommittee and the NOP has asked that the NOSB determine a path forward before the next sunset date. The LS will not request a TR.
 - **Excipients (BC/NL).** Similar to inerts, it's a group of substances - 8000 according to the 2015 TR. The LS will not request a new TR. The previous TR did indicate that some excipients are made with excluded methods. By default, excluded methods are not allowed except in vaccines, which must be approved for use.
 - **Strychnine (FQ).** The lead summarized strychnine, which is prohibited for use. It's non-synthetic and toxic, and there is no argument to allow it in organic. The LS will not request a TR.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous LS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

March 19, 2024

Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss

April 2, 2024

Meloxicam - Petition sufficiency and TR determination

April 16, 2024

Meloxicam (KH/NPP) - TR determination

2027 sunsets: TR determinations

Butorphanol (NPP)

Flunixin (NPP)

Magnesium hydroxide (NL)

Sucrose octanoate esters (FQ)

May 7, 2024

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

August 6, 2024

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency/TR determination due 4.21.24	3.19.24 4.16.24	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	-------	-------------------	----------------

Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023
---------------------	--------	--	-------------------	-----------

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Cont act	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “

Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24 3.19.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH	Maybe Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
----------------------------	------------	----	---	---	--------	-----

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, March 19, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review February 6, 2024 notes
- Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss
- 2026 Sunsets: Vitamins - discuss TR (BC)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 6, 2024 notes** were reviewed and accepted via email prior to the call.
- **Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss.** The NOSB received a petition for meloxicam, a non-steroidal pain reliever. The petition came from a group of veterinarians, not a manufacturer. KH and NPP volunteered to co-lead.
- **2026 Sunsets: Vitamins - discuss TR (BC).** The lead reviewed the TR and determined it was sufficient. He noted that fermentation is used to manufacture some vitamins. The group reviewed the questions they asked of stakeholders in the spring sunset review, which was completed before the TR was received. The lead noted that the conversation around fermentation extends beyond livestock, and in livestock, vitamins are critical to health and wellbeing.
- **2027 TRs.** Assigned leads, TR determinations are due to NOP by late May. The LS has three meetings to discuss and decide and scheduled those conversations for April 2 and April 16. See table below.
- **Additional Items.**
 - **Fermentation.** The LS discussed fermentation and noted that it is a broad topic and spans across several Subcommittees.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

February 6, 2024

2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024 - cancelled

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

Meloxicam petition - assign lead/discuss

April 2, 2024

Meloxicam - Petition sufficiency and TR determination

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Meloxicam	205.603	KH/NPP	Proposal	Petition sent to LS 2.21.24. Petition sufficiency due 4.21.24	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “

Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR was sent to LS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.23	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24 3.19.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
------------------------	--------------------------	------------------------------

NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Butorphanol	205.603(a)(5)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2002 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Flunixin	205.603(a)(12)	NPP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Magnesium hydroxide	205.603(a)(18)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2007 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Oxytocin	205.603(a)(22)	BC		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2005 2017/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.2.24	“ “
Poloxalene	205.603(a)(26)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2001 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Formic acid	205.603(b)(3)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.603(b)(10)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930	4.16.24	“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.603(e)(1)	BC/NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Excipients	205.603(f)	BC/NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Strychnine	205.604(a)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, February 6, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 23, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 23, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP), Moxidectin (KH).** The leads summarized the use of parasiticides. Both leads spoke with a couple of stakeholders/veterinarians to collect feedback about the use of these medicines and the current restrictions (annotations). The feedback they received is that in acute situations, moxidectin is a necessity for organic livestock; it should not be used as a routine practice. The annotation is robust. The LS supports re-listing as written and does not expect any controversy. A member mentioned that there is language in the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPS) rule regarding parasite control plans, which will be implemented at the beginning of 2025. The LS will add/modify the questions and submit the final reviews for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The group reviewed the research priorities and the results of the prioritization exercise. The LS will submit its top two priorities and three items that are ongoing priorities.
- **Additional Items.** The Chair proposed a potential work request for the Food Technologists for a literature search/analysis on parasites across species and regions and will submit the request to the NOSB Chair and NOP.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

January 23, 2024

- Research Priorities (All) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “

Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “
Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due Feb 16	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20

NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, January 23, 2024, 3:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 16, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 16, 2024 notes** were approved with minor revisions.
- **2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP).** The LS reviewed the questions to stakeholders in the draft review, made some modifications, and discussed how to add some of the topics to Research Priorities. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ).** The lead summarized atropine, which is a naturally occurring substance produced from plants in the nightshade family. It is used in humans as well as livestock, and it is used only on the recommendation of a licensed veterinarian. There are restrictions about post-use handling of animals, so risks are low. The lead summarized international acceptance, and human and environmental health, and the group discussed classification. To glean more information, members suggested questions to stakeholders, and the LS will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ).** The lead summarized the review and noted the ancillary substances. Hydrogen peroxide is Generally Regarded as Safe (GRAS), considered safe at low doses, and the breakdown products are benign. There were no questions to stakeholders. The lead will submit the review to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP).** The lead thanked the previous lead for prior work, and summarized the two substances that are used in conjunction with each other in veterinary surgical procedures for livestock. Xylazine is used as a sedative, and tolazoline counteracts it. These substances are critical to humane livestock husbandry, and are controlled by veterinarians. The lead will complete the documents and submit them to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The lead gave a brief update on research priorities. He asked members to look at the current list and identify top 2 or 3 priorities out of the 7. The LS will complete the list on the next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review

January 23, 2024

Research Priorities (All) - discuss
 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
 Research Priorities (All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	7.18.23 1.23.24 2.6.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “

Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23 1.23.24	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “

Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due Feb 16	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	---	-----

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Livestock Subcommittee (LS) Notes **Tuesday, January 16, 2024, 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Brian Caldwell (BC), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review December 19, 2023 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review
- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 19, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL).** The lead summarized the limited scope TR, and highlighted information regarding nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs). The TR was found sufficient, and the LS Chair will relay that information to the NOP. The lead also summarized the review for iodine, including its uses, manufacture, excipients, and human health and environmental issues. The LS finds iodine essential and is not proposing removal, however, they are interested in exploring an annotation to restrict the formulas to NPE-free versions. Members asked several questions about NPEs, and NOP pointed out previous work by the Crops Subcommittee on this topic: <https://www.ams.usda.gov/sites/default/files/media/CSDDNPEApr2016.pdf>. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC).** The lead summarized the review, noting the importance of vitamins in animal nutrition, and the fact that they are used in small amounts. The group discussed B vitamins specifically, and will include a question about the need/use. A member reminded the group about the terminology when talking about substances: For Crops and Livestock it's "necessity", and for Handling it is "essentiality". The Chair will submit the final review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH).** Deferred to later call.
- **2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP).** Deferred to later call.
- **Research Priorities (All).** Deferred to later call.
- **Additional Items.** MET lead will provide the members will several questions by the end of the week for discussion on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous LS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 3:00 PM ET | 12:00 PM PT, except where noted)

December 19, 2023

- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Oxalic acid dihydrate (KH) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Iodine (NL) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Vitamins (BC) - discuss review

January 23, 2024

- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: DL-Methionine (NPP) - discuss questions
- 2026 Sunset: Atropine (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Xylazine + Tolazoline (NPP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Fenbendazole (NPP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Moxidectin (KH) - finalize review

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Aquaculture Substances				On hold. (See NOSB Work agenda for additional information.)	TBD	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Research Priorities	BC/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	7.18.23 1.23.24	Fall 2023

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Atropine	205.603(a)(3)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Hydrogen peroxide	205.603(a)(15)	FQ	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “

Iodine	205.603(a)(16) and 205.603(b)(4)	NL	Y Limited Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec. TR sent to LS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.603(a)(19)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23	“ “
Fenbendazole	205.603(a)(23)(i)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) TR: 2020 (Fenbendazole) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Moxidectin	205.603(a)(23)(ii)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Parasiticides: Fenbendazole, Ivermectin, Moxidectin) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.21.23 2.6.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/ Peroxyacetic	205.603(a)(24)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Xylazine + Tolazoline	205.603(a)(30)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Xylazine/Tolazoline) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Oxalic acid dihydrate	205.603(b)(8)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2018 2019/Spring - Rec to Add 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog, and DL-Methionine—hydroxy analog calcium	205.603(d)(1)	NPP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Methionine) TR: 2019 (Trace Minerals) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
Trace minerals	205.603(d)(2)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 11.22.23	“ “

Vitamins	205.603(d)(3)	BC	Y - L'mtd scope on potential GMOs	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due Feb 16	3.21.23 4.4.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
--------------------------	---------------	----	-----------------------------------	--	---	-----

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting