

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, January 13, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair, PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB) - NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Materials/GMO ad hoc Chair; Zea Sonnabend (ZS); Harold Austin (HA), Handling Chair; Harriet Behar (HB) - observer; Francis Thicke (FT) Crops Chair; Scott Rice (SR), Dan Seitz (DS)

Absent: Ashley Swaffar (AS), NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of December 9, 2016**
- **Chairs Report** - TC
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
- **NOP news and update** - PL
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Handling (HS) - HA.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - LD.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - TC.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - CBe.
 - Crops (CS) - ZS.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of December 9, 2016** were approved with no changes
- **Chairs Report** - TC
 - **New member mentors.** The Chair has spoken with each of the new members and has paired up mentors and mentees. The list will be finalized soon.
 - **New member training** is scheduled for early February.
 - **Fall 2017 meeting.** The Chair asked about the possibility of having a 3 ½ day meeting in the fall to accommodate the new sunset review schedule. While the NOP recognizes the increased workload associated with the new sunset review schedule, the NOP suggested adding an extra comment webinar as an alternative to extending the meeting. This will allow the Board to have adequate time to discuss and vote at the in-person meeting, while maintaining the same number of hours dedicated to public comment. Members were supportive of this approach.
 - **Administration transition.** The NOSB Chair reminded members that there may be changes under the new administration, and initially the rulemaking process may slow down.
 - **TR contractors.** The Handling Subcommittee had concerns about the quality of recent TRs, and submitted a critique of the TR on BPA asking that the NOP consider finding a different contractor. NOP will provide an update at a future date regarding this.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
 - Final recommendations from the fall meeting should be posted early next week.
 - The NOP thanked outgoing members for their dedication and service to the USDA.

- New member orientation will be held in D.C. February 8. The Subcommittee calls that were scheduled for February 7 were moved to Jan 31 so as to not conflict with travel to the training.
- To date there have been 4 comments submitted and ~9 oral commenters signed up for the spring meeting.
- The deadline for proposal submission is February 17
- **NOP news and update** - MM/PL
 - **Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP).** The Office of Management and Budget (OMB) has completed its final review and the document is in its final stages. The NOP noted that it was a monumental effort, and in addition to receiving ~7000 comments, it also was reviewed by multiple agencies and offices.
 - **Hydroponics.** NOP staff will meet with several members of the Crops Subcommittee next week to discuss the format of the document on hydroponics/aquaponics.
 - **The CACS proposal on the NOP 2027 - Inspector evaluations** will be announced and discussed during the certifier training at the end of January.
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Handling (HS) - LD. Handling has met twice since the last Exec meeting. The Subcommittee is working on several reviews and proposals including the Sunset 2019 substances, several petitioned materials, and the proposal on additional ancillary substances in cellulose. The TR for BPA was deemed not sufficient and as noted above, the Handling Subcommittee has requested that it be redone by a new contractor. For the BPA proposal to be ready for the fall 2017 NOSB meeting, the TR would have to be received by no later than July. The project on marine materials is still under discussion.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The excluded methods document will not be ready for the Spring 2017 meeting. The seed purity discussion document is in development and may include information on excluded methods. The MS is seeking approval to convene a task force about seed purity, which will be delayed until the new leadership is in place.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. PDS is reviewing the 2013 COI guidance from NOP and asked that the NOP clarify the language about compensation. The section about barring "government compensation" is unclear, and the PDS would like to clarify that this pertains to Special Government Employees (SGEs), of which there are none on the NOSB. NOP will discuss this and let the PDS know how to move forward. The Subcommittee has also discussed the sunset reorganization, and grouping like materials. Once one entire cycle of sunset reviews has been completed, the PDS will revisit this idea. The PDS is also considering the disclosure of commenter affiliations. While this disclosure is already part of the comment instructions, the NOSB chair reserves the option to ask for further information at the meeting. The PDS will not submit any proposals for the Spring meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS is working on two documents for the spring meeting: A discussion document on the conversion of native ecosystems, and a proposal on inspector evaluations (NOP 2027). NOP will be discussing this document at the ACA training in a couple of weeks.
 - Crops (CS) - FT. The Crops Subcommittee rejected a petition for ammonium nonanoate. The substance was previously submitted and the Subcommittee determined that there was no new information that would warrant another review. The CS received two new TRs: one for newspaper, and one for biobased mulch. Four members of the Crops Subcommittee are working on the topic of Hydroponics. The container/greenhouse document will not be ready for spring, but the CS will continue to work on it for the fall meeting.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS is reviewing several 2019 sunset materials. The discussion document on the definition of emergency treatment is completed and will be discussed at the spring meeting.

- **Additional Items.**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- December 9, 2016
- January 13, 2017
- February 10, 2017
- March 10, 2017
- April 14, 2017 (Last call before Spring meeting)
- May 12, 2017
- June 9, 2017
- July 14, 2017
- August 11, 2017
- September 8, 2017
- October 13, 2017
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)**
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018

Spring 2017 Milestones	2017 Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 8, 2017
NOP - Complete Spring 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2017
NOSB - Spring 2017 proposals due to NOP	Feb 17, 2017
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 1, 2017
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 10, 2017
Public comment closes	Mar 30, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2017
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 7, 2017
Public comment webinar	Apr 13, 2017
Spring 2017 NOSB meeting – Denver, CO	Apr 19-21, 2017 (W-F)

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, February 10, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair

Absent: Jessica Walden (JW); Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of January 13, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - New member training
 - Potential field trip - Denver
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Annual ethics training - March 10 during ES call
 - OWG update - TBD
 - Upcoming proposal deadline.
- **NOP news and update - PL**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - TC.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - TC.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - FT.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS.
 - Handling (HS) - LD.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of January 13, 2016** were approved with some minor edits and corrections to the Handling and Crops' sections.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - New member training was held February 8 in Washington D.C. The new members are enthusiastic and prepared to get started. Based on feedback from several of the participants, that the training was too short, the NOP suggested moving some of the presentations such as the OFPA and Regulations to a separate webinar that will allow for more hands on activities at the in-person training. The NOP will explore using a pre-recorded self-paced webinar that the members can then access on their own.
 - Potential field trip - Denver. The NOSB discussed the possibility of taking a field trip as part of the Spring NOSB meeting to visit a container or hydroponic based operation. A member suggested adding a soil based operation, although the Board has visited soil based operations at past meetings. Members were supportive of the idea. The NOP suggested alternative options in

case logistics do not work out, such as a field trip at a later date for the Crops Subcommittee, or moving the field trip to coincide with the Fall meeting in Jacksonville.

- The Exec team discussed convening a technical panel of soil scientists at the Spring meeting to help inform decision making on the hydroponics/container documents. The NOSB and NOP will collaborate on a list of potential panelists. The NOSB Chair will contact other NOSB members for suggestions and will provide that list to the NOP.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Annual ethics training - March 10 during ES call. The ethics training will be one hour long.
 - OWG update. The Organic Working Group update will be scheduled at a later date.
 - Upcoming proposal deadline - February 17. The majority of proposals have already been submitted and are scheduled to be posted on the NOSB webpage by March 1.
- **NOP news and update - MM/PL**
 - The NOP noted that work has slowed while the new administration is getting established. The hearing for the new Secretary of Agriculture will either be in the next two weeks, or sometime in March. Routine activities are continuing and the NOP has been able to focus on such things as audits. Currently there are no new initiatives being put forth until the new administration announces its priorities. The NOSB Chair is working with the NOP to draft a letter to the incoming Secretary, to inform him about the NOSB.
 - The PDS had a question regarding some language in the Conflict of Interest memo about compensation, and the NOP suggested the Subcommittee consult with the ethics officer during the ethics training next month.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - TC. No update at this time. The MS will not be bringing forth any documents for the spring meeting
 - Policy Development (PDS) - TC. The PDS has not met since the last ES call, so there is no new business at this time.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS has two documents for the Spring 2017 NOSB meeting. The CACS Chair mentioned that the discussion document on Inspector Evaluations was discussed at the recent Accredited Certifiers Association, Inc. (ACA) training.
 - Crops (CS) - FT. The Crops Subcommittee is moving forward with a discussion document instead of a proposal on hydroponics. The discussion document will contain questions regarding container growing, in preparation for the container document for the fall meeting. There are two other proposals the Crops Subcommittee continues to work on: one on anaerobic digestate, which was petitioned, and one on an annotation change for newspaper. Additionally, the CS will present a proposal on strengthening and clarify the requirements for use of organic seed (NOP 5029)
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS has several sunset reviews and a couple of proposals for the Spring meeting. The LS and NOP will meet at a later date to discuss the addition of work agenda items, based on the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) rule, which is currently delayed for 60 days, while the new administration is getting set up. Two potential work agenda items are 1) space requirements for turkeys, and 2) outdoor access for swine. The potential work agenda items are listed in the OLPP document which is posted on Regulations.gov.
 - Handling (HS) - LD. The HS has completed its 2019 sunset reviews and has voted on a number of proposals and petitions. The Subcommittee will vote on the BPA proposal during its next call.
- **Additional Items.** The NOSB Chair will be traveling for the next two weeks. Please refer any pressing questions to the Vice Chair.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- January 13, 2017
- February 10, 2017
- March 10, 2017
- April 14, 2017 (Last call before Spring meeting)
- May 12, 2017
- June 9, 2017
- July 14, 2017
- August 11, 2017
- September 8, 2017
- October 13, 2017
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018

Spring 2017 Milestones	2017 Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 8, 2017
NOP - Complete Spring 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2017
NOSB - Spring 2017 proposals due to NOP	Feb 17, 2017
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 1, 2017
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 10, 2017
Public comment closes	Mar 30, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2017
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 7, 2017
Public comment webinar	Apr 13, 2017
Spring 2017 NOSB meeting – Denver, CO	Apr 19-21, 2017 (W-F)

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, April 14, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM)

Absent: none

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of February 10, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Research Priorities process
 - Work agendas for projections at Spring 2017 meeting
 - Pre-meeting admin meeting
 - Voting at spring meeting
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Publication of post-NOSB meeting summary/Response to recommendations
 - Meeting logistics. Dropbox docs soon.
 - Fall 2017 meeting set up (FR Notice, webinars)
- **NOP news and update – MM**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - FT.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS.
 - Handling (HS) - LD.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of February 10, 2017** were approved with some clarifying language to the Crops section.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - The NOSB does not have a field trip scheduled nor will there be a panel during the Denver meeting. Both of these options were discussed earlier, and the NOSB Chair wanted to update the group on the status.
 - Research priorities process. In the absence of an Organic Policy Advisor at USDA, PL will now shepherd the NOSB Research priorities through the process of distribution to funding agencies. The Fall 2016 Research priorities have been circulated to the agricultural Research Service (ARS) and the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA).
 - Work agendas for projection at Spring 2017 meeting: The group discussed several items from the Subcommittee work agendas, such as allowable seed thresholds, and the NOP 2027 guidance document. The issue regarding irrigation water is not currently on the CACS work

agenda but will be discussed below. With regard to the Inspector evaluation document, the NOP recently revised the NOP 2027 guidance, which has implications for the CACS proposal that will be discussed at the Spring meeting, so the CACS will likely return the document to Subcommittee, and will expand the scope to look at inspector qualifications. The NOSB Chair described the process of work agenda development for the new NOSB members.

- Pre-meeting admin meeting. During the pre-meeting, the group will review the agenda and workflow, so new members feel comfortable with the process.
- Voting at the Spring meeting. The members discussed the possibility of deferring votes from the Spring to the Fall meeting, based on feedback from stakeholders about the shortened comment period. The Board reserves the right to defer votes as needed.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Publication of post-NOSB meeting summary/Response to recommendations. These two documents have not been approved for posting yet, but may post soon. The Board members received a copy of the meeting summary, as they will vote to accept them as official record for the previous meeting.
 - Meeting logistics. MA updated the group about various meeting logistics and document availability.
 - Fall 2017 meeting set up (FR Notice, webinars) is currently in progress.
- **NOP news and update - MM**
 - Remarks at the beginning of the Denver meeting will be brief since we do not yet have a Secretary, and as such do not have a comprehensive list of policy initiatives. A member asked about addressing the OLPP rule, but the USDA is in ex parte communication at this time and cannot talk about it. The rule is currently under review with an effective date of May 19. The same applies to the 2017 Sunset rule, for which the department received three comments. The current directive from the new administration requires government agencies to remove two regulations for every new rule. So, while significant rulemaking is on hold, AMS continues to move forward on other initiatives. MM encouraged members to ask questions during the update in Denver.
 - The comment period for the proposed rule on Sunset 2017 materials closes April 19. The comment period for draft guidance on calculating the percent of organic ingredients closed April 7, and NOP is currently reviewing comments.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. No new updates. There are currently no updates to the PPM in progress, and there are no proposals going to the Spring meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. NOP updated the NOP 2027 guidance, which affects the proposal that the CACS is bringing to the Spring meeting. The CACS will refer the proposal back to Subcommittee so they can revise it. The CACS received a large number of comments on the conversion of native ecosystems to organic agriculture. The CACS is also discussing issues surrounding irrigation water and fracking, and trying to determine the best way to respond, given the purview of the NOSB. The CACS has received a number of public comment about this issue, although it is not currently a work agenda item.
 - Crops (CS) - FT. The Crops Subcommittee has several proposals for the Denver meeting: The marine materials proposals (both in Crops and Handing) may be deferred to fall, based on public comment; and the Organic seed guidance document may also be deferred, based on stakeholder input that two weeks was not enough time to review it and provide comments. Crops has several other petitions under review, including fatty alcohols, anaerobic digestate, polyoxin D zinc salt, and allyl isothiocyanate, among others.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. Livestock has four petitioned materials for the Fall 2017 meeting, and is discussing other work agenda items.

- Handling (HS) - LD. The HS will discuss several proposals at the Spring NOSB meeting and determine if they are ready to vote or if anything will be brought back to Subcommittee for additional work. The Subcommittee has received a couple of new petitions. The HS Chair had some corrections for the work agenda that will be presented at the Denver meeting.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS is not presenting anything at the Spring meeting. The group will continue to work on excluded methods, and seed purity from GMO contamination. The MS would like to move forward with the project on contaminated inputs now that the compost ruling is completed, and will discuss a path forward at the Spring meeting and during future Subcommittee calls.
- **Additional Items.** The group discussed some feedback from the April 13 comment webinar regarding time for questions from the Board. The Fall meeting is going to be very busy and in an effort to give the Board more time for discussion and voting, the comment time at the in-person meeting will be shortened, and a second webinar will be added to make up the time. Several members noted that the community may not welcome that approach.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- March 10, 2017 - replaced with annual ethics training
- April 14, 2017 (Last call before Spring meeting)
- May 12, 2017
- June 9, 2017
- July 14, 2017
- August 11, 2017
- September 8, 2017
- October 13, 2017
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018

Spring 2017 Milestones	2017 Target date
New NOSB member orientation	Feb 8, 2017
NOP - Complete Spring 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2017
NOSB - Spring 2017 proposals due to NOP	Feb 17, 2017
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 1, 2017
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 10, 2017
Public comment closes	Mar 30, 2017

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2017
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 7, 2017
Public comment webinar	Apr 13, 2017
Spring 2017 NOSB meeting – Denver, CO	Apr 19-21, 2017 (W-F)

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Apr 27, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 17, 2017
NOP - Complete Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, May 12, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM) - observer

Absent: Ashley Swaffar (AS) NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM), Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jessica Walden (JW); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of April 14, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Denver meeting feedback
 - Hydroponics
 - Letter to Secretary
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Posting of NOSB materials on web (FR notice - open docket and Fall meeting, nominations, meeting summary, transcripts)
 - Submission of Spring recommendations - ~May 22
- **NOP news and update - MM**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - FT.
 - Livestock (LS) - (FT?)
 - Handling (HS) - LD.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of April 14, 2017** were approved with no changes
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Denver meeting feedback. The overall feedback was very positive. In general members felt that both the Board members and the stakeholders were engaged, cooperative, civil, and respectful. One member noted surprise that the commenters didn't build on each other's comments. The group discussed comment management for the Fall meeting, given the large agenda. The Chair noted the desire to have more time for questions between commenters. In the past the NOSB has heard from approximately 140 commenters, and will be able to accommodate roughly the same number, but shift 3 hours of comment time to a webinar from the face to face meeting. Members indicated the usefulness of the community to hear the dialogue during the Q & A period. As for the physical aspects of the meeting, members mentioned having natural light and more breaks to stretch.

- Hydroponics. The NOSB Chair had requests from multiple NOSB members to visit hydroponic and container operations as a group, and to have discussions to gather information in preparation for the fall. A member suggested that if it is difficult to all gather in one place, perhaps they can “divide and conquer” based on geographic location. The NOP noted the challenges with budget, and perhaps with the optics of gathering the entire Board in one location, although it would be to gather information only, which is allowed under FACA. The Crops Subcommittee is working on a vehicle by which to assess the direction of the project, to aid in scoping the tasks ahead. A member asked a question about the formation of the hydroponics task force, and NOP suggested inviting Miles McEvoy and Bridget McElroy to a future Crops call to inform the new members how the Task Force members were chosen.
- Letter to Secretary. The Board is working on a general letter letting the new Secretary know who the Board is and what they do, as well as inform him about organic agriculture in general. The goal is to set a positive tone to develop a collaborative environment.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Posting of NOSB materials on web (FR notice - open docket and Fall meeting, nominations, meeting summary, transcripts) are all delayed pending approval.
 - Submission of Spring recommendations. MA has asked that the Spring NOSB recommendations be submitted by ~May 22. Once approved, they will be posted on the AMS/NOP/NOSB website.
- **NOP news and update - MM**
 - There are two active investigations that the NOP is working on: one regarding Aurora Dairy and one regarding grain imports from Turkey. Since both are currently being investigated, the NOP cannot discuss details, as that would infringe on an operation’s ability to appeal. Betsy Rakola, Compliance & Enforcement (C&E) division director, will be on the Livestock call next week to discuss the recent complaint and subsequent news article about Aurora Dairy. The NOP is reviewing the certification and compliance aspects. The group discussed in broad terms the various aspects of the certification process and traceability in the supply chain.
 - AMS re-opened the comment period for the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practice (OLPP) rule, and delayed the effective date to November 2017.
 - FOIA requests. NOP has two full time staff and 5 contractors working on FOIA requests, which is challenging given that we are not fully staffed. The NOP is working as quickly as possible to get things posted in the FOIA reading room.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS is working on two documents: one on inspector qualifications, and one on incentives to convert high value conservation land to organic. During the last comment period, the CACS received useful feedback and ideas for tools to use while developing the latter proposal. The Subcommittee will invite more feedback about how to move this topic forward within the regulation. The CACS is seeking access to the Inspector evaluation work that NOP did with IOIA as it may contain useful information. The CACS Chair will send a formal request, and may invite NOP staff to a future Subcommittee call to discuss it. The Subcommittee is also discussing a project on exempt operations.
 - Crops (CS) - FT. Crops is working on the meeting 2 sunset reviews for the fall, and is waiting for several TRs on petitioned materials. Several members are working on inerts and are looking to reconnect with partners who were part of the inerts working group - NOP, USDA, and EPA. The CS Chair welcomed feedback from other NOSB members
 - Livestock (LS) - (FT). The Livestock Subcommittee has not met since the Spring meeting so there are no new updates. As mentioned above, the C&E division director will join the next LS call to talk about the Aurora Dairy article. MA will send the meeting notice to the entire NOSB if others want to listen.

- Handling (HS) - LD. The last call was spent assigning discussion dates for the 16 sunset materials. The HS is also working on several petitioned materials including sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The Chair noted that the MS had a very productive call this week. The group is working on the research priorities proposal, the seed purity prevention strategies discussion document, and a proposal to further refine the excluded methods project. The MS is also developing a request for the addition of a work agenda item to review sanitizers as a group, as opposed to individual substances. This work agenda item was proposed by several stakeholders and Board members. The Subcommittee also discussed the possibility of moving the “Contamination in farm inputs” project from the Crops Subcommittee to Materials for continued work.
- Policy Development (PDS) - (TC). The PDS has not met since the last call. The NOP recently met with the PDS Chair to discuss the public comment process to determine how it can be “enhanced”, streamlined, improved. The NOSB Chair welcomed feedback from members on the process, and will continue the conversation on the next ES call. The PDS Chair sent a written request to the NOP requesting that the NOSB continue moving forward with the reorganized sunset reviews, since the final NOSB recommendation from the Fall 2016 meeting has not yet been finalized.
- **Additional Items.** Jessica Walden, Materials Specialist and technical liaison for the NOSB, is leaving at the end of the month. Devon Pattillo will be the Technical Rep for all Subcommittees with the exception of Materials Subcommittee, which Lisa Brines is responsible for.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

April 14, 2017 (Last call before Spring meeting)

May 12, 2017

June 9, 2017

July 14, 2017

August 11, 2017

September 8, 2017

October 13, 2017 (Last call before Fall meeting)

November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)

December 8, 2017

January 12, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Apr 27, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 17, 2017
NOP - Complete Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, June 9, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS) NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM) - observer

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB)

Staff: Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of May 12, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - **Nominations**
 - **Fall meeting timeline**
- **NOP news and update - MM**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - FT.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS.
 - Handling (HS) - LD.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of May 12, 2017** approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - The NOSB sent a letter to the Secretary at the end of May, introducing themselves, and the NOP has forwarded it to the Secretary's office.
 - Research priorities. The NOSB Chair reminded the Subcommittee Chairs to send the research priorities to the Materials Subcommittee by August.
 - The deadline to submit requests for technical reports (TRs) is July 18, and the Chair suggested that requests be sent to the NOP as they are determined, so the contracting process can begin sooner.
 - The FR notice announcing the fall meeting was published May 30 and the docket is now open for comments.
 - The CACS has requested an addition to the work agenda that was approved: A review of exempt operations. They are also moving forward with the re-scoped proposal on inspector qualifications.
 - The substances for the 2020 sunset review have been added to work agendas for Crops, Handling and Livestock. The NOSB sought approval from NOP since the recommendation on the sunset reorganization has not gone through rulemaking yet.
 - A public teleconference hosted by the NOSB and NOP on hydroponics is in development.

- The deadline to submit proposals to the NOP for the Fall 2017 meeting is August 29.
- The Chair asked that the NOP discuss the recent story in the Washington Post about algal oil.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Nominations - FR notice published June 6, and is open for 60 days. The submission deadline is August 7.
 - Fall meeting timeline (see below)
- **NOP news and update - MM**
 - In response to the recent news article regarding fraudulent grain shipments from Turkey, the NOP is providing a number of trainings on organic integrity in supply chain. Including a certifier training last week, and a virtual training for certified handlers next week. To date the NOP has taken some adverse actions, and the investigation is ongoing.
 - This year the NOP will conduct audits for a majority of its certifiers.
 - The comment period for the delayed rule on Organic Livestock and Poultry Practice closes today. The NOP has received approximately 45,000 comments so far.
 - The NOP is in the process of drafting the FR notice and working through the Department clearance process for a possible NOSB hydroponics teleconference. A member asked if the fall meeting would be affected/shortened by the teleconference. Since it was already advertised via the Federal Register, it will not be shortened.
 - The NOP is currently monitoring the situation on algal oil.
 - The group discussed import certificates and monitoring the integrity of the organic seal. A member asked about the EU anti-fraud initiative (<http://www.organic-integrity.org/>). The next meeting is in Ukraine in September.
 - The NOP noted that currently no new significant rulemaking is proceeding at this time.
 - A member asked for some background on the recent news article regarding DHA in milk. The NOSB Chair summarized the previous NOSB recommendation and NOP activities surrounding this. DHA was not added to the National List after it was recommended by the NOSB for addition in 2010.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - HB. The Chair noted that the Crops Subcomm has added a couple of calls to discuss hydroponics.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS is working to finish the 2018 sunset reviews as well as several petitions, for which there are several TRs in development. The Subcommittee will submit a request during the next ES call to add antibiotic use in day-old chicks to its work agenda.
 - Handling (HS) - LD. Handling is nearly finished with the 2019 sunset reviews, and is working on several petitions and other projects. The HS recently received the TR for sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS), and requested one for sodium chlorite. The Subcommittee is going to develop a proposal to reclassify potassium acid tartrate. This project has been on the work agenda, and now that they have a full TR and a classification decision tree, they feel the proposal can move forward.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The Materials Subcommittee is working on a number of projects for the Fall 2017 meeting: The seed purity discussion document, excluded methods, which may be either a discussion document or proposal, and sanitizers. Two NOSB members who are not on the Materials subcommittee but who have expertise in this area will be involved in this project, and will be invited to calls to assist.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. There were no new updates from the PDS. The PDS, along with Handling, will continue to discuss the review procedure for ancillary substances. The NOSB Chair will schedule a call to discuss this further with the two Subcommittee Chairs and the NOP.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS added a work agenda item to review exempt operations, and continues to work on a proposal on inspector qualifications. As

mentioned on the previous ES call, the CACS Chair had requested a report that was prepared for the NOP by the International Organic Inspectors Association (IOIA) in 2011. The NOP has provided that report to the CACS. The Subcommittee is also seeking additional information regarding international (EU) certifiers.

- **Additional Items** - none.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- May 12, 2017
- June 9, 2017
- July 14, 2017
- August 11, 2017
- September 8, 2017
- October 13, 2017 (Last call before Fall meeting)
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~ Apr 27, 2017 , May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 18, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	July 25, 2017 (tentative)
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, July 14, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; NOSB Secretary; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS) NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Sue Baird (SB); Dave Mortensen (DM) - observer; Asa Bradman (AB) - observer

Absent: Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Lisa Brines (LB)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of June 9, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - [2017 sunset final rule](#)
 - Agenda for hydroponics teleconference
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Nominations status
 - Fall meeting timeline
- **NOP news and update - MM**
 - Update on July 13 Senate Agriculture Committee hearing
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) - AS.
 - Handling (HS) - SR.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - FT.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of June 9, 2017** were approved with no changes
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - The 2020 sunset TR requests are due to NOP July 19.
 - Research Priorities are due to the Materials Subcommittee soon, so they can finalize the proposal for posting for the Fall meeting.
 - Hydroponics teleconference - August 14. The Chair summarized the purpose of the meeting, which is to host a dialogue between the entire Board as the Crops Subcommittee prepares a proposal on hydroponics. The Board will not be voting on the proposal during the call.
 - [2017 sunset final rule](#) results. The NOSB recommended removal of 11 items, and the NOP removed 8. Three were renewed based on public comments received during the proposed rule comment period: Turkish bay leaves, inulin-oligofructose (IOF), and whey protein concentrate. The group discussed the availability of these materials in organic form, in particular, whey protein concentrate. The NOSB Chair asked for clarification about the NOP decision making process based on the different outcome between this and the April 2015 outcome for egg white lysozyme.

- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Nominations. The call for nominations closes August 7.
 - Oral commenters. To date, a total of 11 people have signed up to comment at the fall 2017 meeting: 2 for the webinar and 9 for the face-to-face meeting.
 - Fall meeting timeline dates. See below
 - A member asked about the NOSB appointment process. The Board members are appointed by the Secretary and are evaluated using many factors, such as expertise prescribed by the OFPA, knowledge of organic policy, as well as geographic distribution and diversity.
- **NOP news and update - MM**
 - Senate Agriculture Committee hearing update. The July 13 hearing was focused on Specialty Crops, Organic Agriculture, and the 2018 Farm Bill. There seemed to be some uncertainty about regulations with regard to hydroponics and container production, as well as fraudulent imports. Several constituents have lobbied Congress for reforms to the NOSB, indicating among other things, that the public does not have access to the Board. The members discussed the many ways in which the public has access to the NOSB, including the continuously open public comment docket, technical panels, and written and oral comments at the in-person meetings. A member asked about the term “production agriculture” which was used during the hearing.
 - Pasture Rule. The NOP is currently reviewing and evaluating information about the pasture rule, and developing training materials for certifiers. Future trainings will include dairy producers and other interested parties.
 - In response to fraudulent grain imports from Turkey, the NOP has improved and strengthened regulations and is conducting more grain audits. This has also been expanded to include import regulations and residue testing on corn, soy, edible dry beans, wheat, flax, etc.
 - There are several enforcement actions underway, which will be posted on the AMS/NOP website once they are finalized.
 - The NOP noted that there were some useful suggestions mentioned at the Senate Agriculture hearing on ways in which technology can be used for tracking imports.
 - The NOP asked the NOSB to consider ways in which the Board could review issues such as the pasture rule and import certificates, possibly for discussion at the Fall 2017 meeting. A member noted that the Board is already reviewing uncertified handlers and brokers, which ties into the import issue. As for the pasture rule, the NOSB could evaluate such things as regional applications of livestock standards, and areas where the rule can be improved. A member noted that the CACS is currently working on a document on de-incentivizing the conversion of native ecosystems to organic agriculture.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS recently received a TR on hypochlorous acid, and will begin its review. A potential project on antibiotic use in day old checks is delayed until the outcome for the OLPP rule is known.
 - Handling (HS) - SR. Handling has several petitions under review for the Fall meeting, is almost done reviewing the 2019 sunset materials, and has nearly completed its determination for technical reports for the 2020 sunsets. There are several other projects on the HS work agenda some of which will be ready for the Fall 2017 meeting.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS is working on three (3) projects for the Fall 2017 meeting: Research priorities, non-GMO organic seed integrity, and excluded methods terminology. The MS is also working on a draft document on sanitizers for potential inclusion on the work agenda, and will be working on contamination of farm inputs, which was recently moved from the Crops Subcommittee.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. The PDS met earlier this week to discuss adding a section to the PPM regarding the 2016 NOSB recommendation on procedures for reviewing ancillary

substances. The Subcommittees found that there isn't enough specificity in the guidance to move forward, so the PDS will not modify the PPM until the NOP provides additional guidance and clarification. Until that time, the Subcommittees will track ancillaries that are identified in its reviews, and will maintain a list for future work.

- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS is working on three projects: Eliminating the incentives to convert native ecosystems to organic production, inspector qualifications, and exempt handlers and brokers. The NOP provided some useful feedback to the CACS about these projects and the group will move forward with its reviews.
- Crops (CS) - FT. The 2019 sunset reviews are nearly complete, and the 2020 sunset TR requests underway. Crops is working on its research priorities, several petitions, and has added a couple extra meetings to talk about hydroponics.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The group continued discussion about the Senate Agriculture hearing.
 - A member asked for clarification about the request from the NOP to work on "hot" topics of interest, such as the application of the pasture rule or imports. The member felt that these projects amounted to monitoring and enforcement, which is not the role of the NOSB. The NOP clarified that the NOSB is a vehicle to provide information to the USDA, and could reach out to stakeholder communities to collect feedback. The NOSB members requested more open dialogue with the NOP, for example with regard to the grain imports.
 - Work agenda additions. The Livestock Subcommittee will begin discussion on pasture issues and may loop in other Subcommittees if there seems to be overlap.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- June 9, 2017
- July 14, 2017
- August 11, 2017
- September 8, 2017
- October 13, 2017 (Last call before Fall meeting)
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, August 11, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; NOSB Secretary; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB);

Absent: Ashley Swaffar (AS) NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM); Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of July 14, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - NOSB Fall meeting panel - Imports.
 - Hydroponics web conference - August 14
 - Work agenda item: Imports
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Draft Fall meeting agenda (attached)
 - Aug 14 web conference log-in info
 - Deadlines (see below)
 - Nominations update
 - Travel for Fall meeting
- **NOP news and update - MM**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) - LD.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - FT.
 - Livestock (LS) - FT.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of July 14, 2017** were accepted as amended.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Hydroponics web conference - August 14. The NOSB Chair explained the logistics of the call. The NOSB will be discussing the proposal, and the Board will not be taking public comments on the call.
 - NOSB Fall meeting panel on imports. On the previous call, the Executive team discussed adding a work agenda item on imports. The NOP sent a memo to the Board yesterday asking them to provide the NOP with a recommendation on improving oversight of imports. Also, in support of this, the NOP will convene a panel at the Fall 2017 NOSB to discuss imports. The group discussed potential panelists (or categories of panelists). A member asked if anyone was familiar with the European system. The NOP Deputy Administrator will be speaking at the anti-fraud initiative

study tour and workshop in Odesa, Ukraine, and will be visiting and reviewing their systems. The NOP is seeking ways in which to use the existing regulations and statutory authority to address issues.

- A member asked about the Sunset 2017 substances that the NOSB recommended for removal and the NOP did not remove. It was noted that the NOP's decision was based on comments received from stakeholders during rulemaking. The member asked specifically about whey protein concentrate (and more specifically hydroxylate), and its listing on 205.606, which is supposed to be for items that are not available in organic form. Under current regulations, if a processor can demonstrate they cannot find it in organic form, they are allowed to use the non-organic form. The Chair noted there are several triggers that would prompt a new review and recommendation by the NOSB: a petition from public, a petition by the NOSB, or the next sunset review. The Handling Subcommittee will discuss this on a future call.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Draft Fall meeting agenda - in progress.
 - Aug 14 web conference log-in info: specifics will be sent in an email prior to the call
 - Deadlines (see below)
 - Nominations update – USDA received a total of 12 applicants for the position of environmentalist/resource conservation representative
 - Travel for Fall meeting. The NOP may not be able to book any travel until the beginning of October, once the fiscal year begins.
- **NOP news and update - MM**
 - The NOP is focusing on the import issue and is supporting this in many ways:
 - The NOP sent a memo to the NOSB yesterday, seeking advice and a recommendation.
 - The Program will publish a new import instruction in the next couple of weeks to clarify how certifiers should review and approve Organic System Plans (OSPs) for operations that import organic products.
 - The NOP is hosting a certifier call next week to talk about the Interim Instruction
 - Investigations are ongoing
 - A Notice of Proposed Revocation is now available on the enforcement webpage. The operation has appealed the action, and the appeals process can be lengthy. NOP has provided guidance to certifiers to ensure sufficient oversight and organic integrity in the interim.
 - The NOP participated in the InterAmerican Commission on Agriculture in Portland a couple of weeks ago. It focused on training with Latin American countries and strengthening systems in Latin America. The NOP noted that Mexico's new organic certification system is strong and that they are developing a tracking system for exports/imports.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) - LD. The HS had a productive call last week. The HS received the TR for BPA, as well as for SDBS, and both were found sufficient. The HS Chair noted that the TR for BPA was an improvement over the first version. The HS has two more sunset materials to complete for the Fall 2017 meeting. Several petitions are in various stages of completion - some are waiting for TRs or additional information from petitioners.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS Chair praised the lead for completing the Research Priorities early and efficiently. The GMO organic seed integrity project will be delayed to the Spring 2018 meeting. The MS will also continue to work on excluded methods and is not yet sure if it will be a discussion document or proposal.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. No update at this time. No outstanding work agenda items.

- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS has two projects in development: conversion of native ecosystems, and excluded operations. New work agenda items as a result of the memo from the NOP about imports will likely be completed by the CACS.
- Crops (CS) - FT. Completing documents for fall, including a couple of petitions and one sunset review. A couple projects will be deferred to the spring meeting. The hydroponics web conference is being held on Monday, and the Crops Subcommittee members are preparing for the discussion. Marine materials may go forward to the fall meeting, but the CS will discuss this further with the Handling Subcommittee to coordinate.
- Livestock (LS) - FT. Two outstanding items will be voted on next week: defining emergency treatments for use of synthetic parasiticides, and a petition for hypochlorous acid.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- July 14, 2017
- August 11, 2017
- September 8, 2017
- October 13, 2017 (Last call before Fall meeting)
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, September 8, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; NOSB Secretary; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Ashley Swaffar (AS) NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair

Absent: none

Staff: Miles McEvoy (MM); Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of August 11, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Fall meeting agenda
 - Fall meeting panel - Imports
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting: Materials, travel, comments
 - Deadlines
 - Nominations update
- **NOP news and update - MM/PL**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
 - Crops (CS) - FT
 - Livestock (LS) - AS
 - Handling (HS) - LD
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of August 11, 2017** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Fall meeting agenda
 - Fall meeting panel - Imports
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting: Materials, travel, comments. The meeting materials (proposals and tentative agenda) are in clearance and should be posted by mid-September. Travel reservations can be made beginning October 1. Currently there are 9 people signed up for the webinar and ~50 for the in-person meeting.
 - Deadlines (see below).
 - Nominations update. There were 12 applicants for the one position that will be vacant beginning January 2018.
 - Panel on imports. The NOP will discuss this more in depth in the section below.
- **NOP news and update - MM/PL**

- The NOP plans to convene a panel on imports at the October NOSB meeting. The panelists will likely include representatives from the government sector such as the USDA, Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS), and Department of Homeland Security (customs and border protection). A second panel with certifiers, both domestic and international, and industry representatives, may be held at the April 2018 meeting. The group discussed the composition and goals of the panel and the NOSB Chair suggested that one of the panelists at the fall meeting be a certifier, who could bridge the two separate panels and provide an important perspective. A member asked that the panel time include a discussion of the problems and solutions, and not just a review of the current processes and technical aspects of inspections. Additionally, members discussed that it would be useful to discuss how the process dovetails with the certifier community. The NOSB Chair suggested time to discuss import integrity, which is more pertinent to the Board.
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. Materials has three proposals for the fall meeting, including a previous discussion document that the public said they didn't have time to comment on. The MS will meet again in October to talk about comments and look at other projects.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. No new update. The PDS will cancel the September 12 call and reconvene in October.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS has two documents for the Fall 2017 meeting: Eliminating the incentive to convert native ecosystems to organic crop production, and excluded operations in the supply chain (uncertified handlers).
 - Crops (CS) - FT. The Crops Subcommittee has several documents for the fall meeting, including a proposal on hydroponics that includes a minority view. There is also a separate discussion document on containers that the CS is putting forth to solicit public feedback.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS is bringing forward 3 proposals: two petitioned substances and one proposal, in addition to the sunset materials. The LS cancelled its early September meeting and will meet again later this month. The LS Chair noted that the Subcommittee has voted to remove oxytocin from the National List, and will watch for comments from stakeholders.
 - Handling (HS) - LD. The Handling Subcommittee completed its sunset reviews and a proposal on the reclassification of potassium acid tartrate. The HS also will post a previous discussion document on Marine materials. The HS will meet again in October.
- **Additional Items** - none
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- August 11, 2017
- September 8, 2017
- October 13, 2017 (Last call before Fall meeting)
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017

NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, October 13, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; NOSB Secretary; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Ashley Swaffar (AS) NOSB Vice Chair, Livestock Chair

Absent: Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair

Staff: Jenny Tucker (JT); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of September 8, 2017 (attached)**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Tentative Fall 2017 meeting agenda (attached)
 - Work agendas for projection at Fall NOSB meeting (attached)
 - Work agenda request from Materials Subcomm (attached)
 - Voting procedure for hydroponics
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting: Materials, travel, comments
 - Spring 2018 milestone chart (below)
 - Fall deadlines (below)
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
 - Import panel
 - New leadership?
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
 - Crops (CS) - FT
 - Livestock (LS) - AS
 - Handling (HS) - LD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of September 8, 2017** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Tentative Fall 2017 meeting agenda. The Chair reviewed the agenda with the group.
 - Work agendas. The draft work agenda that will be projected at the meeting was provided for review. The Subcommittee Chairs were encouraged to read the list prior to the meeting to make sure it is comprehensive.
 - Work agenda request from Materials Subcommittee. The purpose and goals for the request to review sanitizers was discussed during the last MS call. The MS Chair noted that stakeholders have been asking for years for a comprehensive review of sanitizers. The executive team was supportive of this request, which was forwarded to the NOP for approval.

- Voting procedure for hydroponics. The group discussed the process for debate and voting and will review the process again during the admin meeting so the entire Board knows. There are four motions in the hydroponics proposal and there will also be discussion of the minority view.
- Expert opinions, and facilitation of outside consultation. Currently the NOSB is not using technical panels, and inquired about the possibility of convening technical panels between meetings. Members were supportive of the idea, and the NOSB will seek input from the NOP.
- There is a rally scheduled for Tuesday, October 31, during the NOSB meeting by the “Keep soil in organics” group. It will be held offsite during lunch.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting: Materials, travel, comments. The ABS noted that to date there are 2,272 written comments, 161 people signed up to provide oral comments, and 29 more on the waitlists.
 - Spring 2018 milestone chart (see below)
 - Fall deadlines (see below)
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
 - Import panel. There are four government staff members on the imports panel that will be held at the Fall 2017 meeting. The NOP would also like to convene a panel comprised of certifiers at the Spring meeting. The Fall panelists include experts from Animal and Plant Health Inspection Services (APHIS), Customs and Border Protection (CBP), and AMS Specialty Crops. The CACS was asked to provide questions for the panelists, and the NOSB Chair asked for any additional questions by end of day. The panel will include presentations and questions from the NOSB.
 - New AMS/NOP leadership. There is no update on the AMS Administrator position or the NOP Deputy Administrator (DA) position at this time. An NOP Acting Deputy Administrator will be chosen soon and will fill the role while the search for a permanent NOP Deputy Administrator is conducted.
 - The NOP had a recent offsite retreat to talk about the operating plan. Imports and enforcement are high priorities for this administration.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. The PDS will look at the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM) to see if there are any revisions to be addressed for Spring 2018. In addition to some typographical corrections, the PDS will also review the policy about convening technical panels.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. On its last call, the CACS discussed the two proposals that they will bring to the fall meeting. The group also discussed the possibility of working on the topic of fracking, noting that they are seeking to focus on areas where the USDA has authority. Members agreed that this is a critical issue and needs to be addressed. A member asked about convening a panel to support this work. The CACS will continue work on inspector qualifications, which is on the work agenda for Spring 2018.
 - Crops (CS) - FT. No new updates. The Chair took questions from the group regarding the voting process on the hydroponics proposal.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS voted in Subcommittee to remove a couple of substances from the national list: oxytocin and procaine. The LS directed the members’ attention to these proposals and the corresponding comments.
 - Handling (HS) - LD. The Handling Subcommittee has requested a TR for tamarind seed extract. The TR may not be received in time to have a proposal ready for the Spring 2018 meeting. The HS is also reviewing two petitions for peppers for the Spring meeting, for which the HS is seeking additional information from the petitioner.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS has submitted a request to work on sanitizers and is awaiting a response from the NOP. The group discussed public comment on excluded methods, and also reviewed the Spring work agenda.
 -

- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

September 8, 2017

October 13, 2017 (Last call before Fall meeting)

November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)

December 8, 2017

January 12, 2018

Fall 2017 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 30, 2017
NOSB Request for TRs for 2020 sunset materials	July 19, 2017
NOP - Draft Fall 2017 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 11, 2017
NOSB public teleconference	Aug 14, 2017
NOSB - Fall 2017 proposals due to NOP	Aug 29, 2017
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 12, 2017
Public comment closes	Oct 11, 2017
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 13, 2017
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 16, 2017
Two Public comment webinars	Oct 24, and if needed 26, 2017
Fall 2017 NOSB meeting - Jacksonville, FL	Oct 31- Nov 2, 2017

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, "Open" public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018

Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, November 17, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; NOSB Vice Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Steve Ela (SE) - Observer

Absent: Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair

Staff: Jenny Tucker (JT); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Paul Lewis (PL)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of October 13, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Review of Fall 2017 meeting
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting: Final recommendations
 - Spring 2018 milestone chart
- **NOP news and update - JT**
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - EO
 - Crops (CS) - EO
 - Livestock (LS) - AS
 - Handling (HS) - LD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of October 13, 2017** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - The Chair asked for input from members about Subcommittee assignments and would like to have the new rosters finalized by the end of December. He noted that the CACS could use some more members to work on imports.
 - Fall meeting debrief. Overall, members thought the meeting was well run and executed. A member appreciated the NOSB group dynamic, especially with regard to the conversation around hydroponics. The NOSB Chair also mentioned the professionalism and respectfulness among members, which makes for a welcoming and productive work environment. The group discussed the comment process and the amount of time for questions, and felt that it worked well, even though the meeting ran a little behind. There were 145 oral commenters at the meeting (including both webinars and the in-person meeting). The NOSB Chair asked about setting the conference room to make it easier from picture taking so as not to be distracting to the NOSB or NOP staff.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**

- Fall meeting: Final recommendations due November 24. Most of the final recommendations and cover sheets have been submitted, and the NOP will post them on the website as soon as they are completed.
- Spring 2018 milestone chart (see below). The oral comment registration will open coincident with the posting of the NOSB proposals and the meeting agenda. Written comments will be accepted from the time of the posting of the Federal Register Notice.
- **NOP news and update - JT.**
 - The Associate Deputy thanked the NOSB members for their time and focus during the meeting. She felt that the conversation was excellent and had a lot of impact on the AMS program staff that attended. She noted that it was useful to hear the broad nature of the conversations.
 - The NOP briefed the Acting Deputy Administrator about the meeting, including the discussion around imports, which continues to be an important topic and a top priority for AMS.
 - The Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) rule effective date was delayed from November 2017 to May 14, 2018. As noted in the Federal Register, there will be a comment period during which stakeholders will be invited to submit comments. A member noted that stakeholders are interested in providing feedback about the economic impact, which was cited as one of the reasons the effective date was delayed.
 - Sanitizers. The Materials Subcommittee requested the addition of a work agenda item to review sanitizers as a group. The request included the development of a framework by which to review any future sanitizers that are petitioned for the National List (NL). This would standardize the review process for sanitizers which are found in several sections of the NL, The program would like to explore what the final product would look like before approving this agenda item. Paul Lewis was invited to the December MS call.
 - Jenny Tucker will participate on the CACS calls to provide support as the CACS works on the import topic.
 - Hydroponics next steps. The NOP suggested that the Crops Subcomm focus on petitions and sunset reviews.
 - The NOP will meet with NIFA to share the NOSB's 2017 research priorities that were recommended at the Fall 2017 meeting. The NOP noted that the Spring 2018 meeting will be in Tucson near a land grant university that may be doing interesting research.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) – EO
 - CACS has scheduled several additional calls to work on imports, since they typically only meet once a month. In addition to imports, the CACS is also working on two other proposals: Inspector Qualifications, and Eliminating the Incentive to Convert Native Ecosystems into Organic Crop Production.
 - With regard to the imports work, the Board will be looking at the industry and certifier perspectives.
 - A member suggested that tools or regulations may already exist, and perhaps the Board could think about how to use them without necessarily recommending a rulemaking action.
 - Crops (CS) - EO. The Crops Subcommittee work agenda is manageable. The CS has received a couple of new petitions, as well as a couple of re-petitions. There are also a couple of non-petitioned materials as well. The Crops Subcommittee asked about moving forward on the Container discussion document. The NOP encouraged them to focus on items that must be completed, including petitions and sunset materials.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS is working on emergency use for parasiticides, sunset reviews and petitions.

- Handling (HS) - LD. The work agenda was displayed at the Fall 2017 meeting, and there are no changes. The TR for tamarind seed gum probably won't be back in time to have a proposal for the spring 2018 meeting. The HS Chair noted that the NOP participated on the last HS call to discuss whey protein concentrate and why the NOP did not accept the NOSB recommendation to remove it from the National List. One takeaway was that the rationale for removal needs to be robust, and the Board needs to make sure to discuss it in depth at the in-person so it is on the public record.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS is working on several projects: a template for reviewing excluded methods, strengthening the seed guidance, which was referred back to Subcommittee at the Fall 2017 meeting, and seed genetic integrity. Additionally, the Subcommittee will add information to its initial request to work on sanitizers, and intends on continuing work on inerts and contaminated inputs. Most of these projects will not be ready for the Spring 2018 meeting. A member added that the intention for inerts document is to clarify the rule with regard to the EPA List 3 and List 4 inerts, which are no longer updated by the EPA.
- Policy Development (PDS) - DS. The PDS has not met and had nothing to report at this time.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

- October 13, 2017 (Last call before Fall meeting)
- November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)
- December 8, 2017
- January 12, 2018
- February 9, 2018
- March 9, 2018
- April 13, 2018
- May 11, 2018
- June 8, 2018
- July 13, 2018
- August 10, 2018
- September 14, 2018
- October 12, 2018
- November 9, 2018
- December 14, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, "Open" public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018

Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes
Friday, December 8, 2017, 1:00 pm ET**

Attending: Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; NOSB Vice Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Francis Thicke (FT), Crops Chair; Steve Ela (SE) - Observer; Emily Oakley (EO)

Absent: None

Staff: Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Paul Lewis (PL)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of November 17, 2017**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - Subcommittee assignments
 - Oral comment registration
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
 - Final recommendations
- **NOP news and update - JT.**
 - Guidance re: work agendas, and imports, as was discussed on the CACS call.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - FT
 - Livestock (LS) - AS
 - Handling (HS) - LD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
 - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of November 17, 2017** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
 - The NOSB Chair is moving forward with Subcommittee chair assignments
 - Public comments for next meeting: working to ensure slots will be available for petitioners
 - Both the Chair and Vice Chair met with the NOP acting deputy administrator. Each discussed priorities and NOSB work agendas.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
 - Final recommendations. Most of the recommendations have been submitted and NOP is working on finalizing them.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - The FR notice announcing the Spring NOSB meeting is in clearance
 - Ruihong Guo, acting Deputy Administrator for NOP, is out of country this week
 - Deputy Administrator position was advertised and is now closed
 - Import and enforcement work continues and the NOP is coordinating with Customs and Border Protection.
 - The NOP is continuing work to address several items from the OIG audit

- The NOSB Chair requested a recap from the NOP regarding work agendas, priorities, and regulation development, as was discussed on the last CACS call. The NOP discussed the current regulatory environment and the ongoing transition at USDA and in AMS. The NOP described the overarching policy goals of the USDA and executive branch and conveyed that quantification of benefits is particularly important for rulemaking. The NOP indicated that imports and prevention of fraud is a priority, as it will prevent quantitative harm to certified organic producers/handlers. The Chair discussed how the NOSB's priorities, and topics that are of importance to the organic community, may not always align with the USDA's. The NOP highlighted different kinds of projects that do not involve rulemaking, such as outreach products or training. A member noted that rulemaking is preferable to guidance because of its enforceability.
- Certifier training in January 2018. A member suggested review of specific case studies for certifier training. The NOP noted that it is easier to develop guidance applicable to a wide range of stakeholders using general examples.
- Oral commenter web registration. The registration period will open when the proposals post, rather than when the meeting is announced in the Federal Register. This will allow petitioners enough time to register.
- A member asked about a task force on non-GMO organic seed integrity. The NOP indicated that the development of a task force would require resources that the NOP does not have at the moment, and suggested instead the MS focus on sanitizers. PL will sit in on MS calls to provide more information. The MS has submitted a request to add this to the work agenda, but will articulate the request to make sure the goals and outcomes are robust.
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
 - Crops (CS) - FT. Crops is working on sunset reviews for the first posting at the Spring meeting, as well as several petitions, including a re-petition for ammonium citrate and ammonium glycinate. The NOSB previously voted to not add these materials to the National List (NL). The petitioner argued that the NL entry for chelates, and possibly the OMRI listings, are incorrect, and would like the Board to revisit its previous decision. The Crops Subcommittee has requested a TR for chelates to assist in this review. The CS wants to move forward on a discussion document for containers, which they would like to bring forth for the Spring 2018 meeting. A member asked about working on a proposal for an alternative label. The NOP indicated that this is not an area of interest to the USDA at this time, and recommended the NOSB focus on projects that NOP could move forward. A member contended that this issue is unresolved, creating uncertainty in the organic community, and suggested the development of guidelines about hydroponic practices. This could include a clear definition of systems and how they must comply with the regulations.
 - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS is working through its 2020 sunset items, as well as several petitions. The LS has requested a TR for the petitioned material oxalic acid, and continues work on defining emergency use in parasiticides.
 - Handling (HS) - LD. The Subcommittee is working through 2020 sunset items, and several petitioned materials. The HS sent some additional questions to the TR contractor for silver dihydrogen citrate, and will delay the sufficiency determination.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) – HB. The MS has not met since the Fall meeting, but will be meeting next week. Two topics they plan to address are sanitizers and genetic integrity of seed. The MS will also continue to work on excluded methods to provide more detail, as was suggested in the previous round of public comments at the Fall 2017 meeting. The NOP cautioned the MS that other agencies within USDA are tasked with regulating (and classifying) these technologies, namely APHIS, and that there is ongoing work at USDA in this area. The NOP noted that while excluded methods are prohibited by organic regulations, the NOP is not

- responsible within USDA for defining what is or is not genetic engineering. The MS Chair mentioned the need for further work on contamination of inputs and green waste compost.
- Policy Development (PDS) - DS. No new updates. The PDS will be discussing some minor edits to the PPM.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) – SR. The CACS had a useful discussion on the last call regarding imports, and has added some additional calls to accommodate the work load. The Subcommittee is also continuing work on inspector qualifications.
 - **Additional items.**
 - The Chair summarized the current status of the work on imports for the benefit of those that were not on the CACS call. NOP staff joined the last CACS call to provide more guidance on the four possible topics that were presented at the Fall 2017 meeting. JT flushed out those four broad topics to provide focused areas where the CACS could provide guidance, and the CACS will discuss them more on the next Subcommittee call.
 - The Chair thanked everyone for attending the last Executive call of 2017.
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT

November 17, 2017 (3rd Friday, as Nov 10 is Veterans Day)

December 8, 2017

January 12, 2018

February 9, 2018

March 9, 2018

April 13, 2018

May 11, 2018

June 8, 2018

July 13, 2018

August 10, 2018

September 14, 2018

October 12, 2018

November 9, 2018

December 14, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, "Open" public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018