

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, December 15, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR)

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); David Glasgow (DG); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of November 17, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
- **NOP news and update - JT**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP.
 - Crops (CS) - RG.
 - Livestock (LS) - KH.
 - Handling (HS) - JD.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of November 17, 2020** accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - PDS work agenda request: The PDS would like to work on a document addressing the public comment process, specifically how information is shared with the Board outside the public comment period. The NOSB is seeking a way to make the process fair and equitable. No formal request is necessary, as this is an internal NOSB process, but the PDS will write a brief statement describing the process and possible solutions.
 - CACS projects: The CACS is working on two projects as part of the human capital work agenda item: One seeking to improve the consistency among inspectors; and one on recruiting additional technical support that could provide technical expertise to the NOSB and ultimately improve work products for the program.
 - New member training. The training will be held virtually in February. NOP is working on content development and adapting the in-person schedule to a virtual platform. Several members volunteered to assist with the training and suggested some follow up activities such as a separate session for evaluating sunset reviews and a meeting two or three weeks after the training for follow-up questions.
 - New Subcommittee rosters/Chairs. The Subcommittee rosters, including the Subcommittee Chairs were modified after the Fall meeting, and the Subcommittees have begun work for the Spring meeting.

- Sunset reviews: Each Subcommittee has begun reviewing sunset substances and transferring substances from members who will be leaving in January to either remaining or new members.
- New member mentors. The NOSB Chair has not assigned mentors yet but will soon.
- Webcasting NOSB meetings. The NOSB is interested in webcasting its meetings going forward, to be more inclusive for those who can't travel to an in-person meeting.
- Research priorities for Spring 2021. The NOSB is working on a discussion document for the Spring meeting to glean public feedback, which will then be voted on at the Fall meeting.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Rulemaking update:
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). NOP is currently analyzing public comment. There are many different sections of rule and this will take some time. The NOP works on internal policy papers, which then inform the final rule.
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL). A second proposed rule is currently undergoing legal review.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) is still in litigation. The NOP cannot comment on ongoing litigation.
 - Process/difference between guidance, policy memos, and rulemaking. The NOP described the hierarchy for various USDA/AMS/NOP documents such as guidance and rules. For the NOP, the law - the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA) - is the highest level. The USDA organic regulations, included in the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR), are the next highest level. These are developed and modified via rulemaking and are legally enforceable. Guidance documents published in the NOP Handbook are not as enforceable as rulemaking. Guidance includes Instructions (directed primarily at certifiers) and Policy Memos (used to clarify specific issues). A member asked how NOP determines how to proceed with NOSB documents.
 - Inerts Working Group. The NOP is drafting an Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) to seek information from stakeholders. As the NOSB has already provided a recent review of inerts, a previous recommendation, and a resolution asking the NOP to update the regulations on inert ingredients, the NOP suggested that it might be clearer if the NOSB does not move ahead with additional work until NOP can complete its work.
 - In the next few months, the key priorities for NOP are SOE, OOL, and continuing National List rules, including inerts.
 - Transition period for greenhouses/NOC survey results? NOP thanks all those who contributed to the survey. At this time, the NOP believes that the 2010 recommendation on containers and greenhouses is not detailed enough for NOP to move ahead with rulemaking. We may consider possible steps forward with a new Administration and once current litigation on hydroponics is complete. Government transition update. We continue to work with the current Administration to advance goals. AMS/NOP has met with the Government transition team to relay program information.
 - Spring/Fall 2021 meetings: Invitation to potential speakers from the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) and the California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA). NOP is supportive of inviting these speakers and praised the partnership that the NOP has with CDFA.
 - Human Capital project for CACS. The CACS is working on two proposals: one to address mentorship and human capital in the inspector community, and one on possible support for the NOSB, and is seeking clarification on steps forward and process. NOP hopes to publish a call for proposals for cooperative agreements for projects focused on inspector apprenticeships. The group discussed the timeline to develop a proposal for the Spring meeting.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Status of Final Recs - Fall 2020. The final recommendations, the NOP response to recommendations, the voting tally, and the transcripts were sent to Public Affairs to be posted on the AMS website and should be posted soon.

- 2021 NOSB Meetings. The Spring meeting is tentatively scheduled for Crystal City, Virginia, but NOP is monitoring the situation and could shift to a virtual meeting. The Fall meeting has been scheduled for the week of October 18, 2021 in Sacramento, CA.
- New member training. NOP is working with the NOSB Officers and members to develop training for the new members.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP. The CACS is working on two proposals within the project on human capital: One to address mentorship in the inspector community, and one on possible support for the NOSB. The CACS emphasized that inspector training is robust, but there is a gap in mentorship between training and early career entry. The CACS is also working on a proposal to develop a pool of talent to assist the Board members with their workload.
 - Crops (CS) - RG. The CS is working on sunset reviews for the 2023 sunset cycle, and several petitions: Biochar, chitosan, hydronium, ammonia extract, kasugamycin, and paper pots.
 - Livestock (LS) - KH. Livestock met earlier today and began reviewing its sunset substances. The LS Chair noted that there are several substances that are undergoing the first sunset review and members shared tools and resources for conducting these reviews given the paucity of previous information. The Subcommittee also has one petition (chitosan as flocculant) and discussed removing the list of substances that were petitioned for aquaculture, because the LS is not working on them and they are archived in the NOSB work agenda spreadsheet.
 - Handling (HS) - JD. On its last call, the HS discussed the petition for phosphoric acid and requested a TR. The HS completed reviews for several sunset substances, reassigned the lead on the zein petition, and discussed deferring the reclassification review for L-malic acid.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT. The MS reviewed the petition for distilled tall oil and discussed the lingering inerts issue. The petitioner asserts that tall oil was incorrectly classified when it was reviewed 10 years ago, and the MS is re-evaluating all information. The MS also discussed the project on excluded methods and will develop a discussion document for the Spring meeting. The Materials Subcommittee is expecting research priorities from each of the other Subcommittees and will finalize a discussion document for the Spring meeting.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ. The PDS discussed a potential work agenda request regarding the public comment process. As noted above, the NOP does not need a formal request for the PDS to work on this. The member guide was revised by the PDS last year, the NOP made additional revisions, and will send it back for any final feedback. Additionally, the PDS talked about exit surveys for departing NOSB members and livestreaming of meetings.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

November 17, 2020

December 15, 2020

January 19, 2021

February 16, 2021

March 16, 2021

April 20, 2021 - public comment webinar

May 18, 2021

June 15, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021
October 19, 2021
November 16, 2021
December 21, 2021

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, November 17, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; PDS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG); Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Emily Oakley (EO), Materials Vice-Chair; Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of October 13, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Subcomm reorganization.
 - Outreach to new members
 - Final recommendations due November 27
 - Board process
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Outgoing NOSB members/Scientist seat vacancy
 - NOSB new member training
 - NOSB meeting debrief/Follow up on List-4 Inerts review
 - Rulemaking update
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Spring 2021 milestone dates
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SE for SB.
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - EO.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of September 15, 2020 were accepted as written.**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Subcommittees. The NOSB Chair has reorganized the Subcommittee rosters and the new Subcommittee Chairs will take their positions in December. In general the previous Chair will become the Vice Chair so they can mentor the newly seated Chairs.
 - New members. The NOSB Chair has initiated conversation with the five new NOSB members. They are excited to start their terms in January. Each will be on two subcommittees.
 - Final recommendations are due November 27.
 - Board processes. The PDS may review the public comment process, including late paper comments, as well as the oral comment schedule.

- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Outgoing NOSB members/Scientist seat vacancy. NOP reviewed the previous application submissions to determine if there were qualified applicants to fill the unexpected vacancy, but given that the scientist seat was not part of the call for nominations, the NOP will include the seat in the next call for nominations in spring 2021. There will be 4 positions that will be filled in January 2022.
 - Spring NOSB new member training. Dates have not been determined yet, but the training will likely be virtual. NOP and NOSB members discussed several approaches to holding a virtual training, such as reorganizing the order of topics and including more hands on activities.
 - NOSB meeting debrief/follow up on EPA List 4 Inerts. AMS is supportive of moving ahead with an Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) to identify the best approaches for solving the issue of having a reference to a list of substances that EPA no longer supports. The NOSB received thoughtful, in-depth comments, and is seeking a solution, The Executive Committee expressed support for the ANPR path to get practical input on the best path forward given the nature and status of the Safer Choice List referenced in the last NOSB recommendations.
 - Rulemaking update. As announced publicly at the meeting, the NOP is currently drafting a second proposed rule for Origin of Livestock (OOL). The Standards division is also currently reviewing comments from the Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) rule. NOP anticipates future rulemaking on List 4 inerts.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Spring 2021 milestone dates. See table below for proposal deadline and meeting dates.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG. PDS will be discussing the comment submission process and the oral comment schedule. The project on the consent calendar, which was discussed at the Fall 2020 meeting, is not something the PDS will continue to work on. The NOSB received very little feedback from commenters or the NOSB members
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS had a productive meeting about the project on human capital. The Subcommittee members proposed many great ideas, and were able to prioritize and narrow to two: consistency in certification and across inspections; and apprenticeships and mentorships. The NOSB received a lot of feedback about the latter during the Fall meeting.
 - Crops (CS) - JB. Crops met earlier today and had a robust discussion on the two chitosan petitions. The CS plans to post a discussion document for the Spring meeting, in coordination with Livestock, who also has a chitosan petition. The CS also discussed a new petition for hydronium and assigned discussion dates for all work projects for the Spring semester.
 - Livestock (LS) - SE. Livestock had a brief call earlier today and talked about final recommendations. Fenbendazole was the only proposal at the Fall meeting and it was not approved for addition to the NL for use in poultry. The LS scheduled discussion dates for its sunset reviews. The sunset review for chlorine materials is being reviewed across three Subcommittees and the leads for each are coordinating.
 - Handling (HS) - SE. The Handling Subcommittee met earlier today and debriefed from the Fall 2020 meeting. The proposal on Ion Exchange was not passed at the Fall meeting. The NOP will send a follow up memo indicating they are supportive of continued work and will respond to the NOSB's inquiry about working with the FDA on this project. There was some confusion at the meeting about the vote on the annotation for Wild Native Fish for Liquid Fish and the NOSB Chair suggested that moving forward it would be helpful to include more NOSB members on the Executive calls as they approach the NOSB meetings so members are more aware of proposals from Subcommittees they don't sit on.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - EO. Dave Mortensen chaired his last Materials call, before resigning his position due to his academic workload. The MS passed two recommendations at the Fall 2020 meeting: Research priorities and marine materials and will finalize them by the

November 27 deadline. The Subcommittee prepared for the sanitizer panel, which is being held November 12 via Zoom. The MS also discussed the petition for tall oil, which is an inert, noting that there is not a policy in place for inerts. NOP indicated support for the materials Subcommittee moving ahead with the review, even though tall oil was petitioned for addition to the list for Crops and Livestock.

- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

October 13, 2020 (Second Tuesday)

November 17, 2020

December 15, 2020

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, October 13, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; PDS Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG); Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT) - observer

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of September 15, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Fall meeting logistics/Sanitizer panel
 - Marine materials
 - Scheduling of Exec call/Subcomm calls
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - New NOSB members
 - Rulemaking update
 - Videos for Fall meeting
 - Comments
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting logistics
 - Spring 2021 milestone dates
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
 - Handling (HS) - AB.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of September 15, 2020 were accepted as written.**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - There are two practice meetings in Zoom for the comment webinars.
 - The group briefly discussed public comment. During its most recent call the Materials Subcommittee discussed the public commenter schedule and how to better manage the list to make it more efficient. The PDS may discuss this further.
 - The NOSB Chair reached out to the five new members and invited them to join the Fall meeting and Sanitizer panel as observers.
 - The Marine Materials proposal garnered lots of feedback from commenters, which was mixed.
 - Both the Crops and Livestock Subcommittees will be discussing the sunset review for List 4 Inerts, and the Board may discuss both before voting on either.

- Scheduling of Executive call and Subcommittee calls. Tuesdays may be a difficult time for many of the Subcommittee Chairs, so after the Fall meeting the NOSB Officers and NOP will consider new days/times.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - New NOSB members. The NOP announced the five new members a couple weeks ago. New member training dates are to be determined.
 - Rulemaking update. The NOP received about 1500 comments for the Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE), feedback was thoughtful and comprehensive. NOP is in the comment analysis phase and will be writing the rule once its complete. SOE continues to be priority.
 - NOP will give an update on Origin of Livestock (OOL) at the Fall NOSB meeting.
 - There are a couple of National List Rules in progress.
 - NOP is announcing three new courses for the Integrity Learning Center. Several other new courses are under review.
 - Videos for Fall meeting. The NOP staff will record videos discussing different updates, similar to the ones that were posted for the Spring meeting. The videos will be available in the Learning Center before the Fall meeting.
 - During the Fall meeting the NOP will give a brief update, then a guest speaker from Customs and Border Protection (CBP) will provide an update about its partnership with NOP. The Board will have the opportunity for Q & A after each.
 - The NOP, responding to a question from the NOSB, noted that 25% of the staff is remote by design and 75% are housed at the USDA building in DC and that likely won't change.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Reminded NOSB members of fall meeting logistics, including two comment webinars and three meeting days.
 - Spring 2021 milestone dates (pasted below). A member added that at some Universities have travel bans, likely through the spring.
 - The Subcommittee Chair or lead reviewer will read the citation for each sunset material into the record, so it is clear what material is being discussed.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. The MS met just before the Exec call, and discussed the comments on the marine macroalgae proposal, and excluded methods. The goal is to have a document on excluded methods for the Spring meeting. Members have reached out to a number of stakeholders and are working to move the document forward. The petition for tall oil will be delayed until after the Sanitizer panel to give it due consideration.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG. The PDS did not meet today. The Chair noted that there were very few comments on the consent calendar proposal.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS met today and discussed human capital document. The CACS received lots of comments with great ideas about how to move forward.
 - Crops (CS) - JB. The CS discussed two of the three chitosan proposals during its last call and is seeking some additional information on efficacy data for insecticides. At the Fall meeting, the NOSB may discuss both the LS and CS EPA List 4 inerts before voting on both. NOP recognizes that this is a complex topic and is working to find a solution to correct the National List, which points to a list that does not exist anymore. Additionally, the OFPA language must always be considered – and NOP must comply within the authority of the Act.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB. The LS discussed the fenbendazole proposal on its last call. They did not receive many public comments for the Fall meeting.
 - Handling (HS) - AB. The Handling Subcommittee prepped for the Fall meeting presentations and briefly discussed future work on Fish Oil during its last call.

- **Additional Items.**
 - The NOSB Chair asked that NOSB members be succinct and focus on a summary of comments and discussion when presenting their materials, rather than reading the entire proposal.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

October 13, 2020 (Second Tuesday)

November 17, 2020

December 15, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 1, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28 - 30, 2020
Sanitizer Panel	Nov 12, 2020

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, September 15, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; PDS Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG)

Absent: Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair; Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of August 18, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Distilled tall oil petition
 - Marine Materials petition
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Nominations update
 - OLPP Insider Notice
 - Cost share update
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Meeting materials (binders/thumb drives)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) - AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of August 18, 2020 approved as written.**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Distilled tall oil petition. The petition was referred to the Materials Subcommittee for review. Distilled tall oil is an inert and is on EPA List 3, exempt from an EPA tolerance, and on a Safer Choice List.
 - Marine materials petition. The proposal is posted and available for comment for the Fall meeting. Feedback thus far indicates that the organic community is divided on this topic, and the NOSB is expecting a number of comments.
 - The NOSB members will discuss how to conduct the Officer elections at the fall meeting, given that it will be virtual, and voting is typically conducted anonymously.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Nominations update. The nomination process is underway, and the NOP's hope is to be able to announce the five new members before the Fall meeting so they can attend the meeting.

- Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP). The Insider Notice was published Friday September 4, announcing the Final Decision on the OLPP Rule and Summary of Comments on the Economic Analysis Report. The economic analysis that the rule was based on was deemed flawed, and therefore USDA will not take any further action. Next steps are in the court system.
- Cost share update. The NOP had no update but is aware of the letter writing campaign to Farm Service Agency (FSA) and Congress.
- Fall 2020 NOSB meeting. NOP staff will record short videos for the NOP update, like they did for the Spring meeting. The NOP will also present an update at the meeting for NOP update, and guest speaker from Customs and Border Protection.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Meeting materials (binders) were sent last week.
 - Meeting logistics: Comment webinar practice sessions are scheduled, and comment registration (both written and oral) is underway.
 - A member mentioned that the format of Spring meeting worked well, but noted the limitations of meeting virtually, especially for the new members. Many feel that they do not know each other as well as if they had the chance to meet in person. Interpersonal exchanges and conversations are lost in a virtual setting.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB. HS met on September 1 and discussed the phosphoric acid petition + addendum., and updated questions for the sanitizer panel.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. MS met this week and discussed the sanitizer panel. The MS Chair also reached out to National Institute of Food and Ag (NIFA) who had inquired about the NOSB research priorities so they could incorporate them into the impending Request for Proposals (RFP). MS is also working on Excluded Methods, which is refreshed every 1-2 years. The lead has been exploring ways to gather feedback from stakeholders for guidance on key areas to work on. The Subcommittee will discuss this further on next call.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG. The PDS has one discussion document for the Fall meeting on using a consent calendar for voting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SE for SR. A member shared a personal experience with a virtual inspection. The Human Capital Management project that the CACS is working on may address some of the new processes that inspectors and certifiers are undertaking.
 - Crops (CS) - JB. There are three petitions for chitosan, two in Crops and one in Livestock, and the two leads are working together to review them. During the last meeting, Crops discussed the two petitions and sent additional questions back to the petitioner.
 - Livestock (LS) - SE for SB. The LS discussed the petition for chitosan, and will await answers to the questions that the Crops Subcommittee posed to the petitioner before moving forward. The lead is working with the lead in the Crops Subcommittee to review all three of the chitosan petitions. The LS has one proposal for the Fall meeting on fenbendazole.
- **Additional Items.** A member shared his experience with a virtual inspection in Colorado, noting that their GAP inspection occurred, but their organic inspection has not.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

September 15, 2020

October 13, 2020 (Second Tuesday)

November 17, 2020

December 15, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 1, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28 - 30, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, August 18, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; PDS Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Absent: Rick Greenwood (RG); Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair; Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY); Dave Glasgow (DG); Jared Clark (JC); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of July 21, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Fall meeting logistics - Voting, draft schedule, sanitizer panel
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Nominations update
 - Closing dates for SOE comment period
 - OOL update
 - Virtual meeting announcement
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall Proposals
 - Meeting materials (binders/thumb drives)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) - SR for SB.
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of July 21, 2020** were approved as written.
- **Chairs Report – SE**
 - Fall meeting logistics: The NOSB has a number of items to vote on at the Fall 2020 meeting, and will meet virtually for three days, for 4 hours each day. The NOSB would also like to schedule a panel on sanitizers after the public meeting, likely some time in November. All three panelists who were originally scheduled for the Spring meeting are available to participate in a virtual meeting.
 - The Chair thanked Board members for submitting their final documents early, allowing the NOP to get them posted with adequate time for public comment.
 - A member asked about the substances that had split votes and would like to ensure that all Board members are abreast of those issues ahead of time and are well informed before they have to vote. A member pointed out that the reference to the OFPA criteria in the text should indicate the reasoning for vote. MA offered to highlight the proposals and reviews that had split

votes in the meeting packet that is sent to NOSB members. Another member recommended resources from stakeholder groups that usually include a summary.

- **NOP news and update - JT**

- Nominations update. Nominations are currently under review, and the NOP hopes to announce the five new members at the Fall NOSB meeting.
- The comment period for the Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) rule closes October 5. The NOP is presenting outreach in the form of six Insiders summarizing the rule.
- Origin of Livestock (OOL) update. The NOP is engaging in conversations with the community about the rule. The rule was originally published 5 years ago, and given that the program is still in ex-parte communication, the NOP is documenting who it is speaking with and any questions that arise. The USDA is currently considering next steps.
- Virtual meeting announcement. The Fall NOSB meeting was announced in the Organic Insider last week, and the Federal Register notice should publish September 1. The agenda and proposals will be available on September 1 as well as the links to submit public comments. A member asked about posting the materials before the FR notice published.
- The NOSB will be reviewing EPA List 4 Inerts as part of its sunset review this Fall, and the NOP is discussing options on how to proceed should the Board recommend removal. List 4 is no longer maintained by the EPA, and the EPA's process for reviewing "inert" or "other ingredients" has changed since the organic regulations were first published. Stakeholders and the NOSB have expressed the need to update this section of the National List.

- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**

- Fall Proposals are under review and should be ready to post by September 1.
- Meeting materials (binders/thumb drives). The NOP will send meeting materials to members in hard copy for those who want them.
- The NOP is exploring several dates in November for the Sanitizer panel.

- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**

- Livestock (LS) - SR for SB. The LS has completed all its sunset reviews, and a proposal on fenbendazole for the Fall meeting. A petition for chitosan was recently added to the LS work agenda.
- Handling (HS) - SE for AB. The HS completed all of its documents for the Fall meeting. There are several substances that could garner some attention: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (IOE); orange shellac, which had a split vote; whey protein concentrate (WPC) sunset review; and a petition discussion document on WPC. The NOSB previously voted to remove WPC and during the subsequent comment period the NOP received a comment that it was needed, so it was not removed. The Subcommittee also completed a recommendation on ion exchange filtration that concluded that recharge materials should be listed, but resins themselves shouldn't. The HS also worked on the fish oil annotation proposal which will be discussed at the Spring 2021 NOSB meeting.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. The Materials Subcommittee met last week and voted on the Research Priorities proposal. The Fall document is nearly identical to the document that was posted last Spring, with a minor change to a Livestock priority on fenbendazole. The remainder of the call was spent discussing the Marine Materials proposal. The proposal contains an executive summary, which the group felt would be useful given the length of the document. The MS has discussed excluded methods during its last few calls and will move ahead with a discussion document for the Spring 2021 meeting, with questions for the public. The MS also reviewed a new petition for chitosan and chose to send it to the Livestock Subcommittee for review. The MS Chair also noted that the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) reached out to the NOSB about incorporating the Research Priorities into their upcoming RFP.
- Policy Development (PDS) - SE for RG. The PDS met last week and voted on a discussion document on the use of a consent calendar for voting.

- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS had a productive discussion on its last call about the NOP memo on human capital. The CACS will post a brief document calling for comments and ideas from stakeholders at the Fall 2020 meeting. The NOP indicated that it has received lots of positive feedback, and is looking forward to feedback from the Fall meeting. The CACS may develop a discussion document at the Spring 2021 meeting.
- Crops (CS) - JB. The Crops Subcommittee discussed the ammonia extract petition on its last call and requested a TR. The CS will present a discussion document at the Fall meeting. The petition for sodium carbonate lignin is under review, as well as two petitions for chitosan.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The Farm Service Agency (FSA) is holding a webinar this week on the Cost Share program, and they are taking comments.
 - A member acknowledged two new learning resources added to the integrity learning center.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

August 18, 2020
 September 15, 2020
 October 13, 2020 (Second Tuesday)
 November 17, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 1, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28 - 30, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, July 21, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair

Absent: Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY); Dave Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of June 16, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Fall NOSB meeting - Format and agenda
 - Sanitizer panel - Possible dates if virtual
 - Reminder to submit Fall docs
 - Cost Share Program
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - SOE webinar recap
 - OOL update
 - Coffee with the Deputy recap
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Rescheduled October Exec call - October 13
 - Fall Proposals
 - Outstanding TRs
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of June 16, 2020** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Fall NOSB meeting - Format and agenda. The Chair queried the Board and a majority of members are not comfortable travelling to an in-person meeting in the Fall, and therefore the Board recommends a virtual meeting. The Chair is considering logistics given that the NOSB has a full agenda and many items to vote on. The dates for the virtual meeting have been updated from October 27 -29, to October 28-30. See table below.
 - Sanitizer panel. The NOSB would like to move forward with the Sanitizer panel at the Fall meeting, virtually, and is discussing the possibility of holding it sometime in November to allow adequate discussion time.

- Fall proposals and discussion documents are due to the NOP August 13. The NOSB Chair reminded the Subcommittee Chairs to send them as they are voted on.
- Cost Share Program. Board members are hearing from the organic community that the delays in the Cost Share disbursements is difficult and disruptive.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - The Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) webinar recording is posted on the AMS website, along with the draft rule. The rule is not yet published in Regulations.gov.
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) update. The NOP is committed to getting a rule published that will help the community, and it continues to be a priority for USDA. The USDA is evaluating next steps to produce a robust, defensible final rule. The timeline for publication is not known at this time but the NOP may be able to provide an update at the Fall NOSB meeting.
 - Coffee with the Deputy recap. The NOP hosted an informal virtual conversation with the certifier community to discuss and encourage certifiers to share information and best practices for critical thinking and consistency. Approximately 150 certifiers and inspectors attended. The feedback from NOSB members and the community was positive.
 - Fall meeting: The NOP supports the Board's decision to meet virtually. The FR Notice, which has not been published yet, will be updated to reflect this. The group discussed logistical concerns like voting, and whether or not to use video. Most members agreed that having video on during presentations is helpful and welcomed.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - October Executive team call was rescheduled to October 13
 - Fall Proposals. NOP has received ~11 so far. The deadline to submit documents for the Fall meeting is August 13.
 - Outstanding TRs (From Materials Subcomm update)
 - The Chitosan TR was recently sent to the Crops Subcommittee for sufficiency review.
 - TRs under development and due to NOP in the next few months:
 - Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) for Handling (due back in September)
 - Biochar TR for Crops (due back in Nov)
 - TR requests recently sent out for bids:
 - Ammonia extract (Crops)
 - Kasugamicyn (Crops)
 - Activated charcoal (Livestock sunset)
 - Kaolin Pectin (Livestock sunset)
 - Mineral oil (Livestock sunset)
 - TR request call-orders in development by NOP:
 - Zein (Handling)
 - Propylene glycol (Livestock sunset)
 - Magnesium oxide (Crops sunset)
 - Ozone (Crops sunset)
 - Calcium chloride (Crops sunset)
 - The response to the Handling Subcommittees additional questions on Ion Exchange will be sent to the HS soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - JB. The Crops Subcommittee completed several sunset reviews on the last call including Vitamin D₃, lignin sulfonate, liquid fish products, and EPA List 4 inerts. The motion to remove EPA List 4 inerts passed in Crops. The NOP emphasized the need to include options if the NOSB votes to remove List 4 Inerts. The CS will complete the reviews on Biodegradable biobased mulch film, paper pots, and research priorities on the next call.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB. The Livestock Subcommittee completed its sunset reviews for the Fall 2020 meeting, and on the most recent call voted to not remove the listing for EPA List 4 Inerts, unlike

the Crops Subcommittee. The LS Research Priorities were forwarded to the Materials Subcommittee.

- Handling (HS) - SE for AB. The HS will complete its sunset reviews on the next call. Additionally the Subcommittee is working on several proposals and discussion documents on petitioned substances including ion exchange filtration, whey protein concentrate, cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC), and zein.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. The marine materials proposal is under discussion and will likely be brought to the Fall meeting. The MS will put forth a document on Excluded Methods at the Spring. The research priorities will be finalized later this month. The document is nearly identical to the document the NOSB discussed at the Spring meeting, with one addition for the Livestock Subcommittee on fenbendazole.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG.
 - The PDS has been discussing the use of a consent agenda/calendar to streamline voting. Consent agendas are used by many state and local Boards to bundle similar items that have unanimous support into one item for voting. The PDS wrote a discussion document for the full Board to consider, and for the public to comment on.
 - Diversity on NOSB. The NOSB is looking at ways to improve diversity - cultural, ethnic, and geographic. The PDS considered ways to engage with the public before and during the nomination process. Ideas include posting videos from the current NOSB members discussing what they do, and hosting an informal webinar akin to “Coffee with the Deputy”, as discussed above.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS met last week and discussed a work agenda item on human capital in the inspector and certifier community. The NOP will send an official request to the CACS soon. The group discussed possible topics to focus on including workforce planning, recruitment, retention, and performance evaluation. The CACS also discussed the recent webinar and draft version of the rule for SOE.
- **Additional Items.** None.
 - **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

- July 21, 2020
- August 18, 2020
- September 15, 2020
- October 13, 2020 (Second Tuesday)
- November 17, 2020
- December 15, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 28-30, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, June 16, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), PDS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer

Absent: Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair; Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer;

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of May 19, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
- **NOP news and update - JT**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - RG for JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SR for SB.
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of May 19, 2020** were approved as written.
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Update on Marine Materials proposal. The Materials Subcommittee is working on a proposal for the Fall NOSB meeting, and the lead reviewer has reached out to a large number of stakeholders for feedback about the most useful way to move forward.
 - L-Malic Acid reclassification. The Handling Subcommittee will present a discussion document at the Fall NOSB meeting while they continue to discuss associated issues like fermentation, and how far back in the manufacturing process the Board should look when evaluating substances. The HS discussed the need to review the classification decision tree, to ensure that results are consistent.
 - Whey protein concentrate (petition and sunset review). The NOSB has both a sunset review and a petition to remove whey protein concentrate. The Handling Subcommittee will complete the sunset review this Fall, then will proceed with the petition.
 - Fenbendazole petition. The Livestock Subcommittee is working on a proposal for Fall.
 - The NOSB is planning to host the panel on sanitizers at the Fall meeting, if the meeting occurs in person.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - The new National List Manager, Jared Clark, introduced himself.

- NOSB Nominations update. The NOP received more than 40 applications, and has a large pool of qualified candidates. The NOP Deputy Administrator noted that reference letters will be accepted at any time but are more valuable if received by the end of July. The NOSB emphasized the need for diversity, in race, ethnicity, gender, and geography.
- Rulemaking update.
 - The Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) rule is currently at the Office of Management and Budget (OMB). Conversations are ongoing, and NOP does not know when the publication date will be.
 - An NOSB member remarked that the Cost Share program has been delayed, which is impacting organic operations. NOP indicated that the USDA is aware of the delay and is working to resolve the delays.
 - The Origin of Livestock final rule entered legal review at the end of March.
- Issues/challenges.
 - There are several items pending clearance.
 - Implementation of the new import certificate will be a very significant step for NOP, and will require extensive coordination with other agencies (CBP), importers, certifiers, and exporters in other countries. The Chair of the CACS asked about providing an update about import certificates at the Fall NOSB meeting. NOP is planning to hold a webinar this summer for certifiers and will give an update at the NOSB meeting as well.
 - NOP is undergoing a hiring surge, which despite some challenges, has been going very smoothly.
- Remote inspection update. The NOP Accreditation team is conducting remote audits, and is getting good results and feedback. There have been a few concerns from certifiers about certification inspections, but there may be a drop in the number of operations that will become certified this year because of the restrictions on in-person inspections.
- The NOSB Vice Chair communicated that Washington State Department of Agriculture (WSDA) has gotten good results using a hybrid approach to inspections, and also echoed that new applications are delayed due to limitations for in-person inspections, resulting in fewer new operations being certified.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall timeline. See table below. The deadline for Subcommittees to submit proposals for the Fall meeting is August 13.
 - Fall meeting announcement/Comment docket. The Federal Register Notice announcing the Fall meeting is in clearance.
 - NOP is moving forward with planning for the NOSB Fall meeting planning for Cedar Rapids, and will assess the current situation as the summer progresses to determine if it is advisable to meet in person or if the NOSB will hold a virtual meeting. The NOP will make a final decision based on the best available science and guidance and community/Board feedback, with enough lead time to allow stakeholders to cancel reservations if needed.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS discussed inspector human capital on the last call. The NOP will send a memo to CACS to help drive the discussion about inspectors, and the CACS may have a document ready for the Spring NOSB meeting. During the CACS call members shared various positive experiences they've had with virtual and hybrid inspections.
 - Crops (CS) - RG for JB. The Crops Subcommittee met today and completed several sunset reviews for the Fall NOSB meeting, and also found the ammonia extract petition sufficient.
 - Livestock (LS) - SR for SB. The Livestock Subcommittee deemed the fenbendazole TR sufficient on its last call, and will develop a proposal for the Fall NOSB meeting. The Subcommittee also completed a couple of sunset substance reviews and deferred the discussion of EPA list 4 inerts to a later call to coincide with the review of the same substance in Handling.

- Handling (HS) - AB. The Handling Subcommittee is working on completing its sunset reviews as well as several petitions. The HS also has several petitions that are pending responses from petitioners. On the last call, the group had a robust conversation on starches, which resulted in a split vote to remove from the National List.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. The Materials Subcommittee is working diligently on the marine materials proposal for the Fall NOSB meeting. They are also planning to move ahead with the next iteration of the excluded methods project, and are set to complete the Fall research priorities, which will be very similar to the spring document with some minor updates.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG. The PDS will submit a short discussion document for the Fall NOSB meeting on using a consent calendar for voting. They are seeking feedback from the community on how best to maintain transparency while also attempting to make the NOSB meeting more efficient. The PDS is also considering a work agenda project to look at ways in which the NOSB members can help with recruitment and increased diversity.
- **Additional Items.** None.
 - **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

June 16, 2020
 July 21, 2020
 August 18, 2020
 September 15, 2020
 October 20, 2020
 November 17, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 1, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, May 19, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer

Absent: Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), PDS Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of April 16, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Debrief from NOSB meeting
 - Fall 2020 meeting planning - livestream?/# of proposals
 - Sanitizer panel
 - Chlorine materials early review?
 - Paycheck Protection Program (PPP) eligibility for farmers
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Update on nominations.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)/Origin of Livestock (OOL) update
 - Cost Share update
 - Feedback/Follow up from NOSB meeting
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall timeline
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - SE for RG.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
 - Handling (HS) - AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of April 16, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Debrief from NOSB meeting. The Chair solicited feedback from the members about the Spring meeting. Member felt that overall the meeting went well although meeting virtually isn't ideal and there are limitations.
 - Fall 2020 meeting planning - livestream?/# of proposals. The NOSB Chair asked about the possibility of broadcasting the Fall meeting. NOP is exploring whether the audio and video capabilities are available.
 - Sanitizer panel. The panel was rescheduled for the Fall meeting.
 - Chlorine materials early review. The NOSB will review all the chlorine materials early (four listings in each of the three Subcommittees – Crops, Livestock, and Handling). The chlorine

substances are part of a group of substances due to sunset in 2024 that the NOSB will review early to even out the workload.

- Paycheck Protection Program (PPP) eligibility for farmers. Although this is outside of NOP's purview, public commenters indicated that it was unclear whether or not organic farmers were eligible. The NOSB wanted to flag this issue for NOP.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - The new National List manager will begin June 8. Jared Clark was formerly a processing technical specialist with Oregon Tilth and also a product reviewer at OMRI.
 - Nominations. The NOP sent a reminder yesterday in the Organic Insider about the deadline to submit applications. NOSB members were encouraged to recruit future Board members and to write reference letters. Letters are optional, and will be accepted after the deadline.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)/Origin of Livestock (OOL) update. Both SOE and OOL are in clearance. NOP responded to some additional Office of Management and Budget (OMB) questions.
 - Cost Share update. The organic community is hoping to get some updates from FSA on the cost share program, and have indicated that things have been delayed.
 - Feedback/Follow up from NOSB meeting. The NOP echoed the NOSB's sentiment that things went well, but many people mentioned how much they missed meeting in person, and being able to interact with the community outside of the meeting room. One member mentioned that it was disappointing to not meet the five new Board members in person.
 - The OTA policy conference will be held the same week that the NOSB April 2021 meeting will be (April 28-30) in Washington DC, and there will be a lot of organic stakeholders in town.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall timeline (See below)
 - The proposal deadline for the Fall Meeting is August 13. This will allow NOP to post the documents ahead of the meeting and allow for public comments.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) - SE for RG. The PDS is discussing different options for a streamlined voting process given the large number of voting items at each meeting, and will put forth a document for discussion. The PDS is considering the possibility of grouping items to vote and is looking to procedures used by many state and county governments.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS and NOP had a good discussion about ideas for work agenda projects. Specifically about contract inspectors and how this group could be better served. Ideas included liability insurance, and benefits. The CACS and NOP discussed the different groups involved in this work, including the International Organic Inspectors Association (IOIA) and the Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA). NOP has some ideas to help support a public discussion and will develop some discussion points.
 - Crops (CS) - JB. The Crops Subcommittee is on track to complete its Fall sunset reviews. On the last call the CS had a robust conversation about liquid fish fertilizers, and plan to have a proposal for the Fall meeting. The CS also completed petition sufficiency on sodium carbonate lignin.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB. The LS met today and assigned dates to discuss the sunset substances and a proposal for the Fall meeting. The Subcommittee recently received a TR for Fenbendazole and will determine sufficiency on its next call. Fenbendazole will likely be a topic of interest to the community. The LS has one additional research priority suggestion, and will send that to the Materials Subcommittee for the Fall meeting.
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB. The Handling Subcommittee met this week and talked about many work agenda items, including sunset reviews and petitions. The HS members had a good discussion on the petition for zein, which centered around classification. The HS is also actively working on proposals or discussion documents for low acyl gellan gum, ion exchange filtration, cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC), and several sunset reviews.

- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. The Materials Subcommittee met last week and had a constructive conversation about how to engage the other Board members on complicated materials, like Marine Materials, earlier in the process. The Marine Materials document garnered lots of public comment, and the members discussed how to move forward given the complexity. In support of that the MS scheduled an additional conference call to discuss this more in depth.

A new NOSB member volunteered to work on excluded methods, and the MS also discussed research priorities for the Fall meeting. There was some public comment suggesting expansion of a prior research priority topic, but they were not substantive changes that would require a lot of work by the Subcommittee.

The MS also anticipates hosting the sanitizer panel at the Fall meeting, with the hope that we will be meeting in person.

- **Additional Items.** A member mentioned the potential benefits of having a robust group conversation prior to the NOSB meeting, and would like to explore ways to engage the Board earlier and more thoroughly while still obeying FACA rules about Board deliberations.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

- April 16, 2020
- May 19, 2020
- June 16, 2020
- July 21, 2020
- August 18, 2020
- September 15, 2020
- October 20, 2020
- November 17, 2020
- December 15, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Thursday, April 16, 2020, 3:30 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), PDS Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Wood Turner (WT) - observer

Absent: Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Shannon Nally Yanessa (SNY)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of March 17, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - NOSB Meeting April 2020
 - Logistics, Sanitizer panel update, Comment webinars (registration required), Public meeting, Virtual debrief, Back-up plan in case of technological difficulties
 - Sunset reviews - 2024 sunset substance reviews moved to 2023 to balance workload
 - Cost share update
 - Handling petitions
- **NOP news and update - JT**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Practice sessions/Comment webinars/Meeting logistics
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
 - Handling (HS) – SE for AB.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of March 17, 2020** were approved as written
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - NOSB Meeting April 2020
 - The NOSB Chair summarized the logistics for the upcoming NOSB meeting and comment webinars, and noted that the panel on sanitizers was postponed to the Fall 2020 meeting.
 - Sunset reviews. Approximately 14 substances due to sunset in 2024 will be moved forward one year for early review to balance the subcommittees' workload. Most of the substances are for the Livestock Subcommittee. Additionally, the Board may advance the sunset reviews of chlorine materials (4 substances; 12 listings) to next year (one year early) to further balance the sunset workload.

- Cost share update. A member noted that there have been some difficulties with distribution at the State level. NOP indicated that they have contacted colleagues in USDA to inquire about the delay.
- Handling petitions. The NOSB Chair noted that the HS has received a number of petitions recently, which are in various stages of review.
- **NOP news and update - JT/DG**
 - The Strengthening Organic Enforcement rule (SOE) is currently at the Office of Management and Budget (OMB). OMB is reviewing responses from the USDA to its earlier comments, as well as feedback from several other agencies and offices including the Small Business Administration, Customs and Border Protection, and US Trade Representative.
 - The Origin of Livestock Rule is progressing through clearance, which includes a legal review, departmental review by the Agricultural Marketing Service (AMS), Marketing and Regulatory Programs (MRP), and the USDA, then will move onto OMB review.
 - The NOP's new electronic import certificates should be available soon. The certificates are currently optional.
 - NOSB Nominations outreach. The NOP uses various methods to advertise open positions: the Organic Insider, GovDelivery email distribution lists, and direct contact with advocacy groups.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
 - The Advisory Committee Specialist reminded the members about the upcoming practice sessions for using Zoom, the dates for the public comment webinars, and the NOSB meeting logistics.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. On its previous call, the Materials Subcommittee discussed marine materials and public comments on its research priorities discussion document. The MS plans future work on excluded methods.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG. The PDS has not met recently. The PDS Chair indicated that he had some ideas for future work that the Subcommittee will discuss after the April meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS met this week. While they have no proposals or discussion documents for the Spring meeting, the CACS discussed the current state of certification with regard to remote audits. The entire community is exploring new ways to conduct audits while maintaining safe social distancing practices, and is working on best practices for continuity of service. The CACS is anticipating the publication of the SOE rule.
 - Crops (CS) - JB. The CS recently received a draft TR for sodium carbonate lignin and will be reviewing that after the Spring NOSB meeting. During the last call, the Chair assigned leads for next year's 2023 sunset reviews, and the Subcommittee discussed best practices for reviewing comments.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB. The Livestock Chair praised Subcommittee members for their hard work. During the last call, the LS members discussed sunset substances in preparation for the Spring meeting, as well as the next set of sunset reviews.
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB. During the last HS call, the group assigned leads for the 2023 sunset substances, and discussed several petitions that are under various stages of review. The HS has sent additional questions for clarification to the petitioner about the petitioned uses of phosphoric acid. Other substances under review include low-acyl gellan gum, cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC), whey protein concentrate, and zein. The Subcommittee also provided feedback to the NOP on the TR for konjac flour, and discussed public comments on ion exchange and the EPA List 4 inerts.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

March 17, 2020

April 16, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 15, 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 29 - 30, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, March 17, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), PDS Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair; Kim Huseman (KH) - observer

Absent: Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of February 18, 2020 (see attached)**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Sunset reviews - 2023 and 2024
 - New member training recap
 - Whey protein petition/sunset review
 - Meeting lodging expenses and advances
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - NOP Operational update
 - Spring meeting update
 - Status of 2021 nominations
 - ACA/BioFach recap
 - Hiring updates
 - SOE status update
 - Ex-parte communication - parameters
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall milestones (see table at bottom of February notes)
 - Travel/flights for April
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) - SE for AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - EO for DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of February 18, 2020** were approved as submitted.
- **Chairs Report – SE**
 - Sunset reviews - The NOP and NOSB discussed an early review of some substances due to sunset in 2024 to 2023 to balance out the workload. The Subcommittees will determine the need for TRs during the April/May calls.

- New member training recap. The Chair felt the training went well, and he praised the five new members. He also noted that having one and half days for training, instead of one, was valuable and allowed the group to talk more in depth about topics.
- Whey protein concentrate (WPC) petition review/sunset review. The NOSB is conducting simultaneous reviews for whey protein concentrate: both the sunset review and a petition to remove, and have been discussing strategies to move forward. A previous NOSB voted to remove WPC, but based on comments received during rulemaking indicating that it was still in use, the NOP did not remove it. The NOSB is seeking feedback from stakeholders at the Spring NOSB meeting.
- Meeting lodging expenses and advances. The group discussed the process for paying for lodging expenses and getting reimbursed for the NOSB meetings. The NOSB Chair is seeking input from NOP regarding the possibility of providing advances to the members.
- **NOP news and update – JT/DG**
 - Spring NOSB meeting update. The NOP is discussing options for the April meeting. The Deputy Administrator has reached out to NOSB members and stakeholders to get a sense of the will of the community. The NOSB and the community are supportive of a virtual option over cancellation or postponement. Several members provided thoughts and feedback about the logistics, and both the NOP and NOSB will continue to discuss the options.
 - Advances for meeting costs. NOSB reimbursement for meeting costs can include an advance if members initiate that through a process with the travel coordinators. Reimbursement for travel is generally very quick once travel is completed.
 - NOP Operational update. Most of NOP staff is on telework. The Deputy Administrator is currently working from the USDA building.
 - Organic oversight- Certifiers are considering options for verifying compliance while still staying safe. NOP is encouraging certifiers to work on solutions for continuity of operations, and also working together. The goal is to promote community problem solving.
 - Certifiers have been discussing a working group to talk through current challenges. 30+ participants have signed up thus far.
 - Status of 2021 nominations. The announcement for the call for nominations is in AMS clearance.
 - ACA/BioFach recap. The BioFach meeting went very well, and focused on enforcement. There was a lot of good engagement among certifiers, and an emphasis on critical thinking and problem solving.
 - Hiring updates. NOP is moving forward with hiring virtually, and will be interviewing for the National List Manager position this week. The USDA continues to announce positions via Organic Insider emails and on social media as a way to reach a wider audience.
 - SOE status update. Response to comments by Office of Management and Budget is underway.
 - Ex-parte communication - parameters. Once a rule is published the NOP encourages any discussion and comments to be submitted via public comment.
 - NOSB Chair asked how to respond to Qs about active lawsuits (i.e. hydroponics). Cannot comment on litigation. No constraint on what Board talks about. Containers and hydroponics is not currently on work agenda for NOSB.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall milestones (see below)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) - SR for AB. The Handling Subcommittee is working on petitions and TR sufficiency for several substances.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. The MS is focused on updates for the sanitizer panel, and the marine materials discussion document. The members also discussed the need to share background documents from previous and ongoing projects, such as excluded methods, with new members.

- Policy Development (PDS) - RG. The PDS has not met and there is no update at this time.
- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. CACS has not met, as it is waiting for the SOE rule to be published.
- Crops (CS) - JB. The Subcommittee had a very robust discussion on the biochar petition on the last call. The CS has asked for a TR. The CS found the TR for insecticidal soaps sufficient.
- Livestock (LS) - SB. No update.
- **Additional Items.** A member noted that it is encouraging and heartening to hear many stories of the organic community pulling together to find solutions to the current situation. In particular he noted a West coast certifier who has been connecting operations with local restaurants who are in need of produce suppliers.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

February 18, 2020

March 17, 2020

April 16, 2020

May 19, 2020

June 16, 2020

July 21, 2020

August 18, 2020

September 15, 2020

October 20, 2020

November 17, 2020

December 15, 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020

NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020
NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, February 18, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), PDS Chair; Sue Baird (SB), Livestock Chair

Absent: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of January 21, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SR for SE**
 - Sanitizer panel
 - EPA List 4 inerts update
 - Research priorities discussion document
 - Final proposals to NOP - February 20th
 - New member training
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - NOP hiring update
 - Pres budget request update
 - Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC) - RFP response
 - ACA Training update
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - 2021 Call for nominations
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
 - Handling (HS) - SR for AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - EO for DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of January 21, 2020** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - SR for SE**
 - Sanitizer panel. The Materials Subcommittee is working on panel logistics and refining the scope and goals for the panel. The primary focus will be how to review and compare sanitizers (for petitions and sunset reviews) in consideration of OFPA criteria.
 - EPA List 4 inerts update. The Crops and Livestock Subcommittees are reviewing listings for EPA List 4 inerts during this year's sunset review and have identified this as a priority topic. The EPA no longer maintains this list, but organic regulations use the EPA list to establish allowances for inert ingredients in pesticides. The NOSB made a recommendation in 2015 on how to resolve

- this issue. The NOP encouraged the NOSB to summarize the history in their sunset documents for the Spring 2020 meeting.
- Research priorities discussion document. The NOSB chose to post a discussion document in the Spring, instead of moving directly to a proposal in the Fall, to solicit community feedback before they vote on the document.
 - Final proposals to NOP - due February 20th. Most or all are complete and should be submitted on time.
 - New member training is scheduled for Feb 25-26, 2020 in DC. The NOSB Chair and Vice-Chair will also attend.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - NOP hiring update. The NOP continues to hire new staff and several job postings have been shared via Organic Insider announcements and social media. The National List Manager is a priority hire and the NOP hopes to have that position filled soon.
 - President's 2021 proposed budget update. The Deputy Administrator described the government budgeting process and noted how long the process could take. The NOSB offered to support the USDA in any way it could.
 - Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC) - RFP response. The deadline for proposals for additional topics in the learning center was last Friday. The NOP received seven proposals, and a technical review committee will review and choose.
 - The Deputy Administrator and other NOP staff attended BioFach last week. There were about 80 people in attendance for NOP's certifier training, which included training on yield analysis, the adverse action process, and residue testing.
 - Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) training update. The NOP attended and participated in the ACA training in San Antonio. Approximately 200 people were in attendance. The focus was on compliance topics.
 - The NOP noted a recent fraud case in the news concerning the arrest of a person for selling nonorganic livestock feed as organic.
 - Late last week the USDA received the Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) Rule back from the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) with comments. The Program is reviewing comments and preparing responses/revisions to go back to OMB.
 - A member mentioned an organization called the California Organic Institute started by the University of California, and asked if the USDA was involved. NOP has not been directly involved.
 - **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - 2021 Call for nominations. The call for nominations for the next five NOSB vacancies is in development and will be published this spring. The new members will begin their terms in January of 2021.
 - **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) - SB. The LS completed its sunset reviews and will cancel the next couple of calls. The Subcommittee will meet again on April 7 to discuss public comment.
 - Handling (HS) - SR for AB. The HS is reclassifying L-Malic acid in response to comments from certifiers at the Fall 2019 meeting. The HS will post this as a discussion document at the Spring meeting. The Subcommittee is also working on a couple of petitions at various stages of review.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - SR for DM. As noted above, The Materials Subcommittee is working on panel logistics and refining the scope of goals for the Sanitizer panel.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG. The PDS completed updates to the member guide for the upcoming training of new members.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS did not meet this month, but on the last call members had a good discussion of the last ACA/International Organic Inspectors Association (IOIA) training in San Antonio. The CACS Chair noted that there were ~40 inspectors there that added great value to the discussion.

- Crops (CS) - RG for JB. CS completed all its work for the Spring NOSB meeting and had discussions about ammonium carbonate and its potential effect on beneficial insects. The CS will add questions to its sunset review of ammonium carbonate for community feedback. Crops also has a couple of petitions under review, including chitosan and biochar. Both petitions were found sufficient and the CS requested a TR for chitosan and will discuss one for Biochar on the next call.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

January 21, 2020
 February 18, 2020
 March 17, 2020
 April 21, 2020
 May 19, 2020
 June 16, 2020
 July 21, 2020
 August 18, 2020
 September 15, 2020
 October 20, 2020
 November 17, 2020
 December 15, 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Fall 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 21, 2020
NOSB Request for TRs for 2023 sunset materials	Jul 23, 2020
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 1, 2020

NOSB - Fall 2020 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 2, 2020
Public comment closes	Oct 2, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 9, 2020
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 15, 2020
Public comment webinars	Oct 20 & 22, 2020
Fall 2020 NOSB meeting - Cedar Rapids, IA	Oct 27-29, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities
Tuesday, January 21, 2020, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Chair Emeritus; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB), NOSB Secretary & Crops Chair; Dave Mortensen (DM), Materials Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), PDS Chair; Sue Baird (SB), LS Chair

Absent: Asa Bradman (AB), Handling Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Devon Pattillo (DP); Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of December 17, 2019**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - New member training/orientation.
 - Sanitizer panel
 - Work agenda review (See attached)
 - Farewell to outgoing members
 - Subcommittee assignments (See attached)
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - ACA and IOIA training meeting update
 - NL manager hiring update
 - NOP response to NOSB recommendations
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - New member training
 - 2021 Call for nominations
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - JB.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB.
 - Handling (HS) - AB.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - RG.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of December 17, 2019 were approved with no changes.**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - New member training/orientation. New member training is scheduled for Feb 25-26, 2020 in DC. The NOSB Officers and NOP are working on the agenda for training, which will be one-and-a-half days long and will have more hands-on activities than in the past. The NOSB Chair has assigned each of the new NOSB members a mentor.
 - Sanitizer panel. The Materials Subcommittee is currently discussing potential panelists and guidance for the panel, and will send it to the NOP soon.
 - Work agenda review. The Subcommittee Chairs will discuss work agenda items during the Subcommittee time below.

- Farewell to outgoing members. The NOSB Chair thanked the four outgoing members for their service to the USDA and NOSB.
- Subcommittee assignments. The five new NOSB members have been assigned to various Subcommittees. No new members were assigned to the PDS, since they are not working on any projects at this time.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - JT thanked outgoing NOSB members for their service on Board.
 - NOP will be opening a recruitment soon for three (3) positions: one for the National List Manager, one for the Supervisor for the audit team, and one for an Accreditation Manager or Compliance Specialist. The NOP asked that the NOSB members pass that information along to stakeholders when the announcements are published.
 - The International Organic Accreditation Services (IOAS) has completed its country-commodity studies for NOP. The work reaffirmed the need for the different sections of the proposed rule for SOE.
 - The NOP Deputy Administrator and staff will be attending various trainings and conferences in the immediate future, including: Eco Farm in California later this week; Certifier training in San Antonio next week, where the Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) and International Organic Inspectors Association (IOIA) are also conducting collaborative training; BioFach in Germany; Expo West in Southern CA; a trade symposium for Customs and Border Protection (CBP) and the Midwest Organic and Sustainable Education Service (MOSES).
 - New member training is scheduled for February 25 and 26, 2020 in DC.
 - The NOP Deputy Administrator attended the GOPEX (Global Organic Produce Expo) in Florida last week, as well as the Florida Organic Growers meeting. There is a podcast available.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - New member training is scheduled for February 2020 in DC. The NOP and NOSB Officers are updating the training materials and will provide them to the new members soon.
 - The NOP is working on the next call for nominations, which will fill five seats beginning January 2021.
 - The NOP, NOSB officers, and new NOSB members had a video conference so everyone could meet.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - JB. The Crops Subcommittee will send to the full Board a proposal on paper pots and a discussion document on biodegradable biobased mulch film (BBMF) for the Spring NOSB meeting. The Research priorities are nearly finished and ready to be sent to the Materials Subcommittee. On the last call, Crops members also discussed the sunset review of the EPA List 4 inerts and is planning on further work to fix the now defunct list.
 - Livestock (LS) - SB. The LS has one petition (fenbendazole) for which they are awaiting a limited scope TR. While they are waiting, they will put forth a discussion document for the Spring meeting. The Livestock Subcommittee also has several sunset reviews. Two of the sunset substances will need to be reassigned to new Board members.
 - Handling (HS) - SE. Handling has been making good progress with its work agenda items, including several petitions and eighteen sunset listings, once of which has multiple entries (colors). The Subcommittee discussed seeking a contact at NOAA to discuss NOAA standards with regard to fish oil, because the NOAA standards are relevant and should be linked. On the last call, the HS found the petition for jalapeno peppers insufficient. The review of the Konjac TR is moving forward.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - DM. The Material's Subcommittee met last week and discussed the sanitizer panel, including the charge to the panel. Once completed/updated, the MS will pass it along to the NOP and the panelists. The panel will consist of three (3) speakers, with a breadth of expertise. The MS is expecting the research priorities from Crops, Handling, and Livestock, and plan to vote on the document on the February 11 call. Work on the marine

materials discussion document continues and may be finalized for the spring meeting. The MS also plans on working on the excluded methods project on its next call.

- Policy Development (PDS) - RG. The PDS reviewed the member guide to ready to ready it for new member training. The NOP will finalize the document.
- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS met last week and the Chair shared feedback from a recent IOIA/ACA call. He also shared the news that the NOP sent a memo to certifiers seeking proposals to develop a module for the Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC) addressing energy infrastructure topics. The Chair indicated that he expects discussion about this at the IOIA/ACA training. He also noted that it is important to engage this community as a critical outreach point.
- **Additional Items.** The NOP shared with the Board that there may be visitors from USDA at the NOSB meeting since the meeting is local.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

- December 17, 2019
- January 21, 2020
- February 18, 2020
- March 17, 2020
- April 21, 2020
- May 19, 2020
- June 16, 2020
- July 21, 2020
- August 18, 2020
- September 15, 2020
- October 20, 2020
- November 17, 2020
- December 15, 2020

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Dec 9, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020