

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, December 21, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair

Absent: Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Jared Clark (JC); Andrea Holm (AH)

Agenda

- November 16th, 2021 notes
- Chairs Report (NPP)
 - Native Eco-Systems
 - Human Capital: NOSB support - International acceptance in Sunset reviews
 - Confirm Subcommittee rosters
 - NOP Risk Mitigation Table - Agenda item acceptance and subcommittee assignment
- NOP news and update (JT/EH)
 - Native Eco-Systems
 - NOSB support with international acceptance in Sunset reviews
 - Federal Register updates, Rules and Notices
 - NOSB nominations update
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **November 16th, 2021 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - **Native Eco-Systems** - NOSB would like to hear the NOP's thoughts on the limitations of the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA). Discussed in NOP news and update below.
 - **Human Capital: NOSB support - International acceptance in sunset reviews** - The NOSB would like assistance with completing the international acceptance portions of the sunset review documents and an explanation on why only some countries are listed in the sunset template. Discussed in NOP news and update below.
 - **Confirm Subcommittee rosters** - Rosters will change slightly after new board members are onboarded.
 - **NOP Risk Mitigation Table - Agenda item acceptance and subcommittee assignment** - The NOP Risk Mitigation Table agenda item was accepted and assigned to the CACS Subcommittee.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - **Native Eco-Systems** - The 36-month transition period and wild crop scope in OFPA was discussed. Changes to OFPA through Congress and the Farm Bill was discussed.
 - **Human Capital: NOSB support - International acceptance in Sunset reviews** - The NOP will explore developing a guide for the NOSB to use to assist their work.
 - **Federal Register updates, Rules and Notices** - Origin of Livestock (OOL), Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE), Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS), Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR), and the Spring 2022 NOSB Meeting Federal Register Notice (FRN)

are in different stages of clearance. The NOP is addressing comments on the Inerts ANPR from the Office of General Counsel (OGC).

- **NOSB nominations update** - Nominee selections from the Secretary are anticipated soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs)** - The NOSB Chair reported that CACS continues work on a discussion document that includes comments from the Plains communities.
 - **Handling (HS) (KS)** - All but one 2024 sunset review have been completed. HS is now working to submit the Spring 2022 documents to the NOP. A few petitions and Research Priorities are to be discussed in the upcoming calls.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)** - MS is collecting Research Priorities from the other Subcommittees. The distilled tall oil petition and Excluded Methods continue to be worked on.
 - **Crops (CS) (RG)** - CS had a call today and is finishing up the ammonia extract proposal. A few more sunsets need to be completed but are on the schedule to be completed in time. So far this is a lighter year compared to the previous workload.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)** - An NOSB Policy and Procedure Manual (PPM) proposed revision is being drafted regarding public comment submission. PDS also continues to develop informal exit interview questions for outgoing board members.
 - **Livestock (LS)** - The NOSB Chair reported that LS continues to progress through their sunset reviews.
- **Additional Items**
 - **Farm Bill (NPP)** - Discussed the role of the NOSB in the upcoming Farm Bill and how it may affect OFPA.
 - **NOSB email best practices (NPP)** - The NOSB Chair expressed interest in developing an informal best practice guide for managing NOSB emails. Such as including email subject lines that allow for email exchanges to continue in one email conversation (by using 'reply-all').
 - **Spring 2022 NOSB meeting (JT)** - The Spring 2022 NOSB Meeting FRN plans for an in-person board meeting with a virtual component, with room to change to all-virtual as needed.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

January 18, 2022

February 15, 2022 - Last call before proposal deadline

March 1, 2022

March 15, 2022

April 19, 2022

May 17, 2022

June 21, 2022

July 19, 2022

August 16, 2022

September 20, 2022

October 18, 2022

November 15, 2022

December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, November 16, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Steve Ela (SE) - observer
Absent:

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Andrea Holm (AH)

Agenda

- October 12th, 2021 notes
- Chairs Report - NPP
 - New Officers
 - New Subcommittee rosters (to follow)
 - Work agenda vision for year
- NOP news and update - JT/EH
 - Recap of CACS call, and NOP Priorities FR Notice.
 - Rulemaking update (OOL, SOE, OLPS, plus others)
 - Inerts ANPR update
 - Nomination update
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Fall 2021 meeting finalization
 - Spring 2022 timeline (see below)
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Handling (HS) - KS
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - ADB
 - Crops (CS) - RG
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **October 12th, 2021 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report - NPP**
 - **New Officers** - The new Subcommittee rosters are drafted and will be updated again after new board members are announced.
 - **New Subcommittee rosters** - Emailed to NOSB members right before the meeting.
 - **Work agenda vision for year** - The NOSB Chair hopes to elevate the role of Subcommittee Vice-positions this year.
- **NOP news and update - JT/EH**
 - **Recap of CACS call, and NOP Priorities FR Notice (JT)** - The NOP has a draft Federal Register Notice in review that contains a summary of the NOP priorities for rulemaking. On the last CACS

call, there was a good discussion of organic industry topics, the NOSB work agenda, and the scope of the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA).

- **Rulemaking update (OOL, SOE, OLPS, plus others) (EH)** - Origin of Livestock (OOL), Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE), and Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) are in different stages of clearance. There are also three different National List rules addressing several NOSB recommendations in various stages of completion.
- **Inerts ANPR update (EH)** - The Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) is in clearance. The NOP is addressing comments from the Office of General Counsel (OGC).
- **Nomination update (JT)** - Nominations are under review and selections may be announced in December.
- **New work agenda for the NOSB (JT)** - The International Organization for Standardization (ISO) has updated how impartiality is viewed and managed by accreditation organizations. A peer review of the NOP resulted in a recommendation that the NOP evaluation of risks to impartiality be formalized. The NOP will send a work agenda request to the NOSB seeking a recommendation at the Spring 2022 meeting. The Executive Committee will determine which Subcommittee would work on this.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - **Fall 2021 meeting finalization** - Final recommendations and coversheets are due Thursday, 11/18/2021. The NOP received the meeting transcripts, which will be posted soon, along with the voting sheets, final recommendations, and the NOP's response to recommendations.
 - **Spring 2022 timeline** - See milestones table below. The group discussed new NOSB member start dates and call attendance.
 - **NOSB Charter** - The NOSB charter expires every two years (expiring on 06/30/2022) and the NOP is drafting the renewal notice.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Handling (HS) - KS.** All 2024 sunsets have been assigned and preliminary discussions are moving forward. Some subjects need HS leads assigned and some subjects need reassignment due to roster changes and new members.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT.** MS has discussed research priorities and tall oil and will continue working on both for the Spring 2022 meeting. MS is hoping to use the open docket to solicit public comment on some definitions for excluded methods that are on the To-be-determined (TBD) list.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) - MJ.** Developing exit interview process and questions for outgoing board members.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - ADB.** Working through current agenda items, developing discussion documents, and identifying additional work agenda items to prioritize, such as the proposal for NOSB Support.
 - **Crops (CS) - RG.** All sunsets have been assigned and CS is making good progress.
 - **Livestock (LS) - KH.** Reassignments from the roster change are nearly complete. LS has a light agenda this year and is a third of the way through reviewing their sunsets. LS is waiting for a Technical Report on glucose and is working to return their Research Priorities to MS soon.
- **Additional Items**
 - The group discussed the culture and interrelationships of the NOSB, the NOP, and the organic industry.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

October 12, 2021 - Second Tuesday

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

January 18, 2022

February 15, 2022 - Last call before proposal deadline

March 1, 2022

March 15, 2022

April 19, 2022

May 17, 2022

June 21, 2022

July 19, 2022

August 16, 2022

September 20, 2022

October 18, 2022

November 15, 2022

December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, October 12, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Logan Petrey (LP) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Approve notes of September 21, 2021
- Chairs Report - SE
 - Fall Agenda: Crop's schedule, Pre-meeting meeting (M), Debrief meeting (T)
 - Webinar practice - October 7 at 1:00 ET, October 8 at 2:00 ET
 - Tenor of written comments
 - Last Exec Committee meeting for Steve Ela as Chair
 - Officer elections
- NOP news and update - JT
 - New Organic Policy Advisor
 - Rulemaking update (OOL, SOE, OLPS)
 - Inerts ANPR update
 - Policies regarding posting written comments (Possible PDS work agenda item)
 - Nomination update
 - Clarification of temporary confinement and pasture days requirement (in Learning Center webinar) written guidance?
 - Climate change initiatives and NOSB work
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Fall meeting - COI/DOI, approval of Spring 2021 minutes (In binder materials)
 - Spring 2022 timeline (see below)
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP
 - Crops (CS) - RG
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of September 21, 2021** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - The NOSB Chair highlighted some of the Fall meeting agenda items, such as the Crops section, which is all day on Wednesday, the Debrief meeting on Tuesday, and the webinar practice sessions on October 7 at 1:00 and October 8 at 2:00 ET.

- Tenor of written comments. The NOSB included the guidance from the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM) about public comment etiquette in the communications to oral commenters and will reiterate it at the beginning of the comment webinars.
- Members discussed the webinar format, pace, and time for questions from NOSB members.
- The Chair noted that this is his last Executive Committee meeting as Chair and expressed his thanks to the Board members.
- Officer elections. Two outgoing NOSB members will facilitate the officer elections via an anonymous Survey Monkey poll during the Board meeting. A member shared that virtual elections are less than ideal as it is hard to know who is interested in the positions.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - New Organic Policy Advisor. Marni Karlin was appointed a couple of weeks ago as the Organic Policy Advisor and will attend the NOSB meeting to introduce herself.
 - Rulemaking update:
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL), Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE), Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). All three rules are at the Office of General Counsel (OGC) for review. OLPS is a top priority. Once approved, OOL and SOE are expected to be published as final rules.
 - A proposed National List rule is in clearance and addresses three NOSB recommendations: paper pots from Fall 2020, low acyl gellan gum from Spring 2021, and a technical correction for wood “resin” to wood “rosin”.
 - The NOP has been actively talking with EPA on inerts and is working on an advanced notice of proposed rulemaking (ANPR) to solicit feedback from stakeholders. After the ANPR phase, it may be followed by a proposed rule.
 - The proposed rule for the sunset removals of colors is open for public comment. The comment period closes October 25.
 - A draft Federal Register Notice regarding NOP work agenda priorities is in review. If approved, the intent of the notice would be to solicit public comments about prioritization of items for rulemaking.
 - Website update - The NOP is updating and reformatting the petitioned substances database.
 - Written comments. The USDA has (and all Government agencies have) rules about posting comments and can choose to redact or not post comments. The PDS is considering a work agenda item to strengthen the language in the PPM for best practices for written public comments.
 - Nominations update. AMS is reviewing applications and will move the nominations package forward soon. Selections are unlikely to be announced at the Fall meeting.
 - Clarification of temporary confinement and pasture days requirement (Learning Center webinar) A member asked if there was written guidance to share with clients. The NOP noted that it would be in the regulations or in the NOP handbook as guidance. That same member asked if it would be useful for the NOSB to work on clarifying this. The NOP suggested the NOSB discuss the scope and goal for such a project.
 - The Executive team asked how the NOP and NOSB can poise themselves to make progress with the climate change conversation. The NOP looks forward to a strategic visioning conversation at the NOSB meeting. To increase time for discussion, the program posted an NOP update in the Learning Center ahead of the NOSB meeting.
 - A member asked about the proposed annotation for zein, and enforcement of an annotation that includes pharmaceuticals and nutraceuticals, since this is something the FDA regulates. The NOP shared its perspective on its regulatory authorities in this area.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting - Conflict of Interest/Declaration of Interest (COI/DOI). The NOP received replies from all the NOSB members and there were no COIs.

- At the Fall meeting, the NOSB members will approve the Spring 2021 meeting minutes, which were provided in the binder materials.
- Spring 2022 timeline (see below)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) - KH. The LS work agenda is fairly light, and they will cancel some of the upcoming calls. LS has 10 sunseting substances for the Fall meeting and will have 6 sunsets for the next review.
 - Handling (HS) - JD. Handling is prepared for the Fall meeting. The Subcommittee has a full agenda, and the conversations should be robust.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT. The MS will talk about two documents at the Fall meeting: Excluded methods and research priorities. The MS met today and determined the TR for tall oil (petitioned) to be sufficient.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ. The Chair noted the public comments they received on the PDS discussion document and expressed appreciation to the community for being engaged.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP. The CACS Chair asked if virtual/remote inspections is going to be the norm. It seems that certifiers have been managing their own procedures well, and could use a hybrid model going forward. The CACS reviewed public comments on its two documents during today's call. Both documents received robust feedback and supportive comments. The CACS is expecting lots of technical information on the Integrity document.
 - Crops (CS) - RG. Crops has a busy agenda for the Fall NOSB meeting, and a couple of the materials have garnered lots of attention. In addition to several sunset materials, the CS has 9 proposals, 6 of which are petitioned materials. The CS assigned discussion dates for its 2024 sunset substances.
- **Additional Items.**
 - NOP will send coversheets to the Subcommittee Chairs in the next week or two, and asked that they finalize the documents and get them submitted by November 18.
 - The NOSB Chair thanked the Subcommittee Chairs for their support and service.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

September 21, 2021

October 12, 2021 - Second Tuesday

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Oct 19 - 21, 2021
Final recommendations due	Nov 19, 2021

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, September 21, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer; Logan Petrey (LP) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Approve notes of August 17, 2021
- Chairs Report - SE
 - Virtual NOSB meeting
 - October 19, 2021 ES call rescheduled to October 12
 - Public comments open. Posted vs. received
 - Timeline for petitions
 - Voting process for officers - Survey Monkey
- NOP news and update - JT
 - Update re: Under Secretary
 - Rulemaking update (OOL, SOE, OLPP)
 - Inerts ANPR update
 - CBP/NOP - database integration update
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Fall meeting update (Fall proposals status, logistics)
 - Spring 2022 timeline
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - PDS - informal exit interviews
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP
 - Crops (CS) - RG
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of August 17, 2021 were accepted as written**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - The NOSB meeting will be held virtually. Sacramento was rescheduled for Fall 2022.
 - The October 19 Exec call was rescheduled to October 12 since it conflicted with the Fall NOSB meeting.
 - The Chair clarified why there is sometimes a discrepancy in the comment numbers in Regulations.gov. The "received" number is only updated once a day in the morning and may not reflect the posted number, which could be lower or higher. Once NOP reads and posts the

comments, they are visible to the public. Currently there are 137 written comments, and oral comment registration is full. NOP has started a waitlist.

- **Timeline for petitions.** The timeline for review of petitions can be long, and the Chair noted that sometimes it is extended while waiting for technical reports or responses from petitioners. He asked that Subcommittee Chairs keep an eye on submission and due dates to make sure the process is moving forward.
- **Voting process for officers.** The NOSB will conduct the officer elections at the virtual meeting using polling software, like they did at the Fall 2020 meeting. Since the votes are anonymous, two of the outgoing members will tally votes.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - **Under Secretary update.** Jenny Lester Moffitt was confirmed as the Marketing and Regulatory Program (MRP) Under Secretary just after the last Executive call. Mae Wu continues in her role as Deputy Under Secretary. A new Organic Policy Advisor was appointed this week and should be announced soon. Given the recent Under Secretary confirmation, the NOSB nominations will likely be announced after the Fall 2021 meeting. Currently applications are still under review at AMS.
 - **Rulemaking update (SOE, OLPP, OOL) - EH.**
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) final rule has been written and is legal review. Once it is approved, it will move into departmental clearance (AMS/MRP), then be sent to the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) for final approval.
 - The Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) final rule will be in clearance soon and will take the same path as the OOL rule: legal review, AMS/MRP, and OMB.
 - The Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices proposed rule has also been drafted and the legal team is reviewing it.
 - Inerts update. The Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) for inerts was reviewed by the legal team and NOP has received feedback from EPA, which it is currently reviewing.
 - The proposed rule on NOSB recommendations for low acyl gellan gum and paper pots is in clearance and will be available for comment once posted.
 - CBP/NOP - database integration. The SOE proposed rule laid out requirements for import certificates. The Customs and Border Protection (CBP) system is only available to brokers, therefore, NOP is seeking to build a front-end system that is available to certifiers to generate the import certificates themselves. It is likely it will be available before the SOE rule is effective.
 - A member asked about the cooperative agreement based on the CACS recommendation on human capital management: inspector mentorship/apprenticeship/consistency. The NOP received a range of projects from a wide range of organizations and expects to announce awards soon.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - **Fall meeting update.** The meeting will be held via Zoom. NOP will schedule two practices sessions in early October to test mics and cameras, and to review logistics for both the comment webinars and the NOSB meeting.
 - MA provided an update about the Spring 2022 timeline. See table below.
 - The next several NOSB meetings have tentatively been scheduled. The Sacramento meeting was rebooked for Fall 2022, and the Providence meeting was rescheduled for Fall 2023.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Livestock (LS) - KH.** The Livestock Committee has a light agenda at the moment. It consists of only sunset reviews, and members are looking forward to reading public comments. On the last call, the LS found the TR for kaolin pectin sufficient.
 - **Handling (HS) - JD.** Handling met briefly today and determined the TR for Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) sufficient. The TR sufficiency for phosphoric acid was deferred to the next call.

The HS will also discuss how to move ahead with the ion exchange project, given the NOP response regarding EPA regulations.

- **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT.** The MS didn't meet in September. The Subcommittee is looking forward to discussions on Excluded Methods and Research Priorities at the Fall meeting. The National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) already reached out to the NOSB about the research priorities proposal so it could be included in the NIFA call for proposals. The MS will review tall oil for the Spring 2022 meeting.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) - MJ.** PDS is anxiously awaiting comments on its discussion document on the public comment process. The Subcommittee is also considering informal exit interviews of outgoing board members to inform process improvements. NOP has sought information about practices of other USDA Boards, but didn't find any information.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - NPP.** The CACS has two documents for the Fall meeting: a letter to the Secretary regarding climate change and a discussion document on fraud prevention. The Subcommittee is looking forward to hearing an update on the human capital project awards.
 - **Crops (CS) - RG.** Crops has a long list of proposals for the Fall meeting and is anticipating lots of comments.
 - **Additional Items.** None.
- The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 12, 2021 - Second Tuesday

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021
Final recommendations due	Nov 19, 2021

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, August 17, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Approve notes of July 20, 2021
- Chairs Report - SE
 - In-person meeting - Sacramento (Sept. 24 reservation cutoff)
 - NOC survey results
 - Overview of draft Fall meeting agenda (attached)
- NOP news and update - JT
 - Rulemaking update (SOE, OLPP, OOL)
 - Recent sunset renewals, and timeline for sunset removals
 - NOSB Nominations
 - MRP Undersecretary nomination status
 - Administration priorities/agenda
 - Organic Policy Advisor update
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Fall meeting update (Fall proposals status, travel logistics)
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Crops (CS) - RG
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SE for NPP
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of July 20** were approved as written.
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - In-person meeting - Sacramento (Sept. 24 cutoff). The Fall NOSB meeting is currently scheduled to be in-person, and the NOSB and NOP continue to monitor the travel and meeting guidelines. A final determination will be made by late September.
 - NOC survey results. The National Organic Coalition (NOC) surveyed their membership and has chosen to hold their Fall meeting virtually.
 - Overview of draft Fall meeting agenda. The final proposals have been all been submitted, and the NOP is preparing the documents for posting to the website. The NOSB Chair encouraged Subcommittee Chairs to keep in mind the timeline for future meetings, and get proposals

- submitted early, as they are completed. He also added that after the Fall meeting, the Subcomm chairs must submit the final recommendations before the meeting is considered closed.
- NOP will set up a brief training to review best practices for submitting proposals for the meetings, and for submitting final recommendations after the NOSB meetings.
 - Ion Exchange memo from NOP to NOSB. The FDA regulations about whether ion exchange resins are food contact substances or not are unclear. Therefore, the Board is now tasked with making an independent recommendation. The Handling Subcommittee will discuss the complex topic and determine how to move forward.
 - The Crops Chair noted that the pandemic restrictions/policies in CA could shift in the next month.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - The new Marketing and Regulatory Programs (MRP) Undersecretary, Jenny Lester Moffitt, was sworn in this morning. The NOP will let the Board know about any new priorities as that information becomes available.
 - Rulemaking update. The NOP is working towards finishing three significant rules that should be in clearance this Fall. Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE), Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP), and Origin of Livestock (OOL). All three are top priorities in Standards. The OLPP litigation is still outstanding.
 - Recent sunset renewals, and timeline for sunset removals. A sunset renewal notice containing NOSB recommendations completed in 2019 and 2020 was published recently ([86 FR 41699](#)). The Advanced Notice of Rulemaking (ANPR) for Inerts is in progress, and the NOP should have a final draft soon. The proposed rule for sunset removals (86 FR 47242) is in progress and should be published soon. NOP is waiting for a publication date. This rule contains 18 NOSB recommendations to remove colors, Turkish bay leaves, whey protein concentrate, among others. The 60-day public comment period will open when it publishes. The NOSB Chair noted that Handling also has a petition to remove whey protein concentrate from the National List, and depending on the outcome of the sunset review, could be moot.
 - NOSB Nominations. The final decisions may be delayed beyond October since the new Under Secretary was just sworn in today.
 - Administration priorities/agenda. The NOP continues to focus on three priorities: Rulemaking, compliance & enforcement, and import certificates. The NOP is exploring technologies that can assist and support these efforts, and the CACS has developed a discussion document about the same.
 - Update on enforcement - India. Affected operations in India had to apply to a new certifier by July. To date, approximately 2200 operations (about half of the ~4500 operations) have reapplied. The NOP has a successful working group with certifiers in India, and certifiers are working on the new applications, with the knowledge that everyone must be fully certified by July 2022 in order to stay in the system.
 - A member asked about large grain producers possibly filing bankruptcy. The NOP indicated that it is aware of the volatility of the market and is conducting surveillance.
 - Staffing update. The NOP now has 71 staff members, which is double the number from about a year and a half ago.
 - The NOP anticipates making awards for the human capital project proposals, and announcing them after the new fiscal year, October 1.
 - Organic Policy Advisor update. Selection of a new policy advisor is in progress and the NOP anticipates that the new appointee could be on board in the Fall.
 - **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting update (Fall proposals status, travel logistics). The NOP will send travel guidance to the NOSB so new members know how it works, with the caveat that flight arrangements won't be made until after October 1.

- All Fall proposals were submitted and are under review. The NOP anticipates posting the meeting materials around September 1.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Crops (CS) - RG.** Crops has a number of proposals for the Fall meeting, including seven petitioned substances and eight sunset reviews. The Chair noted that some, like biochar and ammonia extracts, could be controversial topics. A member asked about sending references to stakeholders before the proposals are posted. Public background materials used to develop the proposals can be shared.
 - **Livestock (LS) - KH.** The Livestock Subcommittee received the TR for kaolin pectin after the proposal was complete and submitted. The LS will complete TR sufficiency on the next call, and prior to the Fall meeting.
 - **Handling (HS) - JD.** The HS will add discussion time to its next agenda to determine how to move forward with ion exchange. Handling documents for the Fall meeting are submitted, and one is undergoing some final edits. The Handling Chair expressed appreciation for the NOP and NOSB Chair for guiding the process.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT.** The Materials Chair praised Subcommittee members for the thoughtful and thorough documents on excluded methods and research priorities. The MS chose to defer the tall oil review, as the TR was received after the proposal submission deadline.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) - MJ.** The PDS is working on a discussion document addressing the public comment process and is looking forward to having a discussion with the full board. The PDS also has a couple of future projects in mind, and is interested in working on transparency and access to the Board.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SE for NPP.** The CACS is working on two projects for the Fall meeting: A proposal/letter to the Secretary regarding climate change initiatives, which, the lead noted, feels timely given the Administration's priorities; and the Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)/Fraud prevention discussion document.
- **Additional Items.** A member asked about NOSB resolutions, and the group will talk more about it on the next Executive team call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 19, 2021

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021
Final recommendations due	Nov 19, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, July 20, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Approve notes of June 15, 2021
- Chairs Report - SE
- NOP news and update - JT
 - Rulemaking update
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Fall meeting update (Fall proposals due August 13)
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP
 - Crops (CS) - RG
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of June 15** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - The NOP approved the Crops Subcommittee request for a work agenda item on sodium nitrate, and Crops will write a proposal for the Fall 2021 meeting.
 - Progress for Fall meeting. The Chair reminded members to submit final proposals as they are completed. The Subcommittees are making good progress and are on track for the Fall meeting.
 - The Subcommittee Chairs were encouraged to revisit the work agendas and determine if there are any TR needs.
 - Fall meeting. The Chair noted that many of the NOSB members have not met in person, or participated in an in-person meeting, and may need extra support. In light of that the NOSB will likely extend the pre-meeting administrative meeting to allow for more questions about process. In addition to a full agenda, the NOSB will also hold officer elections at the Fall meeting, so it will be a very busy meeting. The group discussed the potential that the Fall meeting will end up moving to a virtual platform instead of in-person, and when and how that decision will be made. The decision will depend NOSB members and the community, and perhaps also restrictions in the State of CA, and/or the Federal Government.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Rulemaking update.
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL). The comment period for the proposed rule was re-opened and closed July 12, 2021. The next stage for the NOP is writing of the final rule.

- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). NOP is working on the final rule and expects that it will be submitted for clearance later this year and published in the Spring of 2022.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) is in litigation and is moving towards a resolution.
 - There are several National List rules in progress that address NOSB recommendations on sunsets and petitioned substances.
- Nominations. NOP is reviewing applications and hopes to be able to announce the new members at the Fall meeting.
- Ion exchange update - response from NOP re: FDA. NOP will follow up with the NOSB as soon as path forward is decided. Could be a memo to certifiers or could be a memo to the NOSB.
- Administration updates. The confirmation hearing for the candidate for the MRP Deputy Administrator was just held and now has to be voted on by Congress.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting update. The Fall proposals are due August 13. Currently NOP is expecting 18 proposals, two discussion documents, and 33 sunset reviews.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP. The CACS discussed the potential for database integration between the Organic Integrity Database and other agencies, such as the Farm Service Agency and the Risk Management Agency. The Subcommittee is working on three documents for the Fall 2021 meeting: A proposal on Human Capital Management/NOSB Assistance; a proposal on a Letter to the Secretary on Climate Change, which was posted to the open docket for comment until August 3; and a discussion document on Fraud and Building Infrastructure for Transparency in the Supply Chain.
 - Crops (CS) - RG. The CS voted on a number of documents today during its call. The sunset review for copper sulfate was completed, and the CS discussed adding a research priority exploring alternatives to copper. The Subcommittee also completed the biodegradable biobased mulch proposal as well as a proposal for kasugamycin (petitioned). The Subcommittee added an extra call at end of July to complete the rest of the Fall meeting documents.
 - Livestock (LS) - KH. The Livestock Subcommittee will meet in early August to finish one sunset and its research priorities, which will be forwarded to the Materials Subcommittee.
 - Handling (HS) - JD. Handling is well organized and on track to complete all projects for the Fall 2021 meeting. The HS Chair noted the limited time for discussion during the calls and praised the members for getting their work completed. Several documents are in progress, such as Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) and Zein.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT. The Materials Subcommittee has three work agenda items; Excluded Methods, Research Priorities; and petition for Tall Oil.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ. The PDS is working on a discussion document about oral and written comments and is seeking a way to ensure equity with regard to access to NOSB members.
- **Additional Items. None.**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

June 15, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 19, 2021
November 16, 2021
December 21, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021
Final recommendations due	Nov 19, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, June 15, 2021, 4:00 pm ET

Attending: Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Logan Petrey (LP) - observer

Absent: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Approve notes of May 18, 2021
- Chairs Report - NPP/MJ for SE
 - CACS Climate Change Proposal/Letter
 - Open docket - opened June 3. Comment deadline September 30, 2021.
 - Crops will be submitting work agenda request to add sodium nitrate to 205.602
 - Board is progressing with Fall work agenda items.
- NOP news and update - JT
 - Rulemaking update
 - RFA for NOSB support - progress and process
 - Technical Report cooperative agreement
 - Nominations update
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Fall meeting update (Logistics, live casting, travel planning, draft agenda).
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP
 - Crops (CS) - RG
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of May 18** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report - NPP/MJ for SE**
 - CACS Climate Change Proposal/Letter to the Secretary. The CACS will request a work agenda item and is seeking to write a proposal for the Fall meeting
 - Open docket. The Fall meeting docket opened June 3, and the comment deadline is September 30, 2021. The docket is open and available to solicit feedback from the public before the earlier than the 30-day period prior to the meeting
 - Crops will be submitting a work agenda request to add sodium nitrate to 205.602.
 - The Subcommittees are progressing with Fall work agenda items and are on track to complete everything for the Fall 2021 NOSB meeting.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Rulemaking update.

- Origin of Livestock (OOL). The comment period for the proposed rule was re-opened and will close July 12, 2021.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). NOP is working on the final rule, and expects that it will be submitted for clearance later this year and published in the Spring of 2022.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) is in litigation and is moving towards a resolution.
 - Inerts is listed on the regulatory agenda and continues to be a priority for the NOP.
 - Request for Applications (RFA) for NOSB support - progress and process. The RFA for Human Capital contains multiple projects; one includes support for the NOSB. The NOP anticipates several proposals, and if none of the proposals include a component for NOSB support, the NOP may send out a more specific RFA.
 - Technical Report (TR) cooperative agreement. NOP entered into a cooperative agreement with the Organic Materials Review Institute (OMRI); we anticipate this will be more flexible/nimble than the previous contracting format. OMRI will provide subject matter experts dedicated to work on NOP technical reports. With regard to potential COIs, for any TRs that OMRI cannot work on, the NOP will seek another entity qualified to do the analysis. The new process shortens the time that it takes to get a TR by about 2 months, which improves the NOSB's workflow.
 - Nominations update. The NOP received a total of 31 applications for 4 positions. A member asked about the diversity of the pool of candidates given the enhanced outreach efforts. Members discussed potential barriers to getting people to apply, including time commitment, funding for members, etc.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Fall meeting update (live-casting, travel planning, draft agenda). Meeting planning for Fall is underway. The NOP is working on live-casting the meeting from Sacramento to increase participation by those who cannot or would prefer not to travel. The NOP will update the NOSB members about travel arrangements.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Policy Development (PDS) - MJ.** The PDS is working on a discussion document on the public comment process and should have a document ready for the Fall 2021 meeting.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - NPP.** The CACS is working on three projects: a letter to the Secretary regarding climate change; a discussion document about SOE, specifically integrity and fraud prevention in the grain market; and a list of potential work projects for Board support.
 - **Crops (CS) - RG.** The Crops Subcommittee requested a work agenda item to relist sodium nitrate at 205.602 (prohibited) with an annotation. In 2012 the NOSB voted to prohibit use of sodium nitrate altogether, and that recommendation was not implemented. Currently sodium nitrate appears on the National List but is considered an invalid listing. The request was approved by the Executive Committee and the Chair will submit the request to the NOP for approval. The CS plans on writing a proposal for the Fall 2021 meeting.
 - **Livestock (LS) - KH.** The Livestock Subcomm is making good progress on its work agenda for the Fall meeting. The LS is waiting for a TR on kaolin pectin.
 - **Handling (HS) - JD.** The HS is proceeding with its work agenda items for the Fall meeting, and each call is very busy. The HS completed its request for TRs for 2024 sunsets, is working on 2023 sunset reviews, and is reviewing several petitions: zein, cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC), and phosphoric acid.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT.** The MS Chair reminded the Crops, Livestock, and Handling Subcommittee Chairs to submit research priorities to the MS before August 10, which is the Materials Subcommittee's last call before the proposal deadline. Materials is working on a discussion document on excluded methods, specifically the TBD list, and would like to invite guests to a future MS call(s) to discuss seed breeding.
- **Additional Items.** None.

- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

May 18, 2021

June 15, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 19, 2021

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021
Final recommendations due	Nov 19, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, May 18, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Carolyn Dimitri (CD) - observer; Brian Caldwell (BC) - observer

Absent:

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Approve notes of April 19, 2021
- Chairs Report - SE
 - Feedback about Spring meeting
 - Intensity and quality of discussions at NOSB meeting
 - Final recommendations - process for completion
 - Fall deadlines (TR requests due to NOP mid-June)
 - Fall meeting: Comment time /Live broadcast/hybrid re: NOSB members
- NOP news and update - JT
 - Feedback from the Spring NOSB meeting
 - Call for nominations - outreach efforts
 - Hydroponics lawsuit - outcomes?
 - Update on rulemaking
 - Update on enforcement – specifically, India timeline
 - Human Capital project - call for proposals update
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Final recommendations due May 21
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP
 - Crops (CS) - RG
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of April 19, 2021** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Feedback about Spring meeting. The Chair praised members for a successful meeting, noting the intensity and quality of discussions. Members echoed those sentiments adding that the virtual meeting went very smoothly.
 - The group discussed the public comment process and noted that the Policy Development Subcommittee (PDS) will be working on this topic. A member emphasized the need to make the

comment process fair and efficient and allow the Board to complete its work given that they only meet twice a year.

- Final recommendations - process for completion. Due May 21, 2021. Please send coversheets with the executive summary and OFPA justification to the Subcomm Chair, NOSB Chair, and NOP.
- Fall deadlines. The CS, HS, and LS scheduled discussion dates today and should have TR requests to NOP by early June.
- Fall meeting: Comment time/Live broadcast/hybrid. The NOP is working with the hotel AV team in Sacramento to work on logistics for the Fall meeting, including the possibility of live broadcasting the meeting.

- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Feedback from the Spring NOSB meeting. NOP expressed its appreciation for the Board members organization and professionalism.
 - Call for nominations. The NOP sent out a reminder today that the deadline for applications is approaching. NOP has expanded its outreach efforts to engage stakeholders and communities that are underrepresented, and asked the NOSB members to reach out to their stakeholders.
 - Hydroponics lawsuit. NOP has not yet briefed the new administration about this topic. The topic of containers in general will be considered as NOP reviews the list of outstanding NOSB recommendations with the Administration.
 - Update on rulemaking.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). NOP is working on the final rule.
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL). The comment period for the proposed rule was re-opened and will close July 12, 2021.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) is in litigation - no update at this time.
 - National List rules and inerts are priorities. The NOP will review the outstanding recommendations to determine which ones could move forward.
 - Update on enforcement - India timeline. NOP received a request to extend the deadline for affected operations to apply to USDA certifiers, which is in July 2021. Operations must have, at a minimum, applied to a new certifier by this deadline. A member noted that some stakeholders are struggling with this deadline due to aspects such as freight, logistics, and the pandemic. Another member asked about the potential for fraud in the interim, prior to new applications and the transition to a new certifier. NOP will continue to evaluate feedback as to whether a deadline is necessary. In the meantime, applicants in India will be listed in the Organic Integrity Database.
 - Human Capital project - call for proposals update. The call for proposals was published recently, and the NOP is anticipating a number of applications.
 - Technical Report update. Recently the NOP and NOSB had some challenges with the Technical Reports (TRs) and has entered into a TR cooperative agreement with the Organic Materials Review Institute (OMRI). The NOSB should not experience delays.

- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Final recommendations due May 21. The Subcommittee Chairs and /or lead reviewers should complete the coversheets for the final recommendations and submit them to NOP for posting.

- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT. The MS Chair will send out a summary of comments from the Spring Research Priorities document to the Subcommittees as they begin work on the Fall iteration of the proposal. Final proposals for the Fall NOSB meeting are due to NOP August 13. The MS discussed the TBD list for the Excluded Methods document and is seeking feedback from the NOP about how to move forward. The MS will continue this discussion on its next call.

- Policy Development (PDS) - MJ. On its last call the PDS discussed the current comment process - both oral and written. The Subcommittee is interested in illuminating all options, how the NOSB interacts with commenters, and community expectations. The PDS will continue to discuss this over the summer and may have a discussion document for the Fall NOSB meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - NPP. The CACS voted in favor of the recommendation on Human Capital Management and is looking forward to the final awards for proposals. The CACS is working on the second part of the Human Capital project, addressing NOSB support, and should have a document for the fall meeting.
 - Crops (CS) - RG. The Subcommittee spent today's call scheduling discussion dates for all its work agenda items and assigned leads for the 2024 sunset reviews. The CS also discussed the chitosan petitions (two in Crops and one in Livestock).
 - Livestock (LS) - KH. The LS scheduled discussion dates for all its work agenda items and assigned leads for the 2024 sunset reviews. The Subcommittee is on track to complete all its work for the Fall meeting. There are six sunsets for 2024, and the LS will determine the need for TRs during the next call. Some substances have not had a recent TR. The LS is waiting for a TR on a 2023 sunset substance, kaolin pectin, and is reviewing one petitioned item - chitosan.
 - Handling (HS) - JD. Handling spent today's call scheduling discussion dates for all its work agenda items and assigning leads for the 2024 sunset reviews. The HS will complete petition sufficiency for peroxyacetic acid ("PLA") on its next call. The HS also discussed the public comment procedures that the PDS will be reviewing, as well as sanitizers, and will discuss how to move forward given the complexity of the topic.
- **Additional Items.** A member mentioned receiving a request to sign a petition regarding NOSB recommendations that have not been implemented. The NOSB expressed public support as a group at the Spring meeting, and he asked if others had received the same request to sign on as an individual.
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

April 19, 2021 - Monday

May 18, 2021

June 15, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 19, 2021

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 14, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021
Final recommendations due	Nov 19, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Monday, April 19, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Approve notes of March 16, 2021
- Chairs Report - NPP for SE
 - NOSB April 2021 meeting
 - Coffee with the Board - nominations outreach
 - Fall meeting invitations
- NOP news and update - JT
 - Call for nominations - outreach efforts
 - Hydroponics lawsuit outcome
 - Update on other rulemaking
 - Human Capital project - call for proposals update
 - Letter writing campaigns
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Spring 2021 meeting prep questions, needs?
 - Upcoming NOSB meetings
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP
 - Crops (CS) - WT for RG
 - Livestock (LS) - NPP for KH
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of March 16, 2021** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report – NPP for SE**
 - NOSB April 2021 meeting. The Vice Chair noted that the public comment webinars begin Tuesday, April 20.
 - Coffee with the Board is a Zoom event scheduled for May 4 meant to support outreach for NOSB nominations. The NOP will send an Organic Insider notice next week.
 - Fall meeting invitations. The Fall meeting is scheduled for the week of October 18, 2021 tentatively in Sacramento, CA.
- **NOP news and update – JT**
 - Call for nominations. Outreach efforts are underway, including “Coffee with the Board”, and the NOSB members are encouraged to reach out to their stakeholders. The NOP noted that the USDA is committed to equity issues. The group discussed the challenges to create a more

- diverse Board, including such things as institutional barriers, diversity of the agriculture community in general, and the time commitment. Members of the Policy Development Subcommittee will discuss outreach and ways to expand diversity.
- Hydroponics lawsuit. The Court decided in favor of the USDA, and the motion to dismiss the lawsuit was upheld. Many in the organic community remain interested in this topic and in establishing more specific standards for container systems. The Accredited Certifiers Association is one group compiling a list of current issues related to this topic. NOP will be briefing the Administration on this topic in the coming weeks.
 - Update on other rulemaking.
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) Notice of proposed rule with request for comments is at the Office of Management and Budget (OMB). Once it is approved, it will be published in the Federal Register.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) – the NOP is writing the final rule now.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) is in litigation.
 - A Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) for inerts is underway. The writing is challenging, because NOP wants to focus on the key issues while providing enough history as background. There is strong support for this project.
 - Wild Caught Fish Report for Congress is in development. The NOP will include a brief update about this at the NOSB meeting next week.
 - Human Capital project - call for proposals update. Based on work the NOSB has done as well as public comments, the NOP will issue a call for proposals soon. There will be a 60-day response period. The NOP intends on granting multiple awards to non-profit institutions, with an emphasis on equity and diversity.
 - Letter writing campaigns. The NOP considers comments in several different ways. Letters to the NOSB arrive as either unique responses or a letter writing campaign. Comments that are part of a letter writing campaign are often considered to be the equivalent of one unique comment, with a note about the number of people who took the time to submit a comment. Letters sent directly to the Secretary enter the Controlled Correspondence System and receive a response. Email campaigns sent directly to the Deputy Administrator's email is the least effective outlet for submitting comments. A member added some thoughts about how to make the process more efficient for all involved.
 - **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
 - Spring 2021 meeting prep. The public comment webinars are being held this week on April 20 and 25. NOP will send the schedule of commenters soon.
 - Upcoming NOSB meetings. The Fall 2021 NOSB meeting is tentatively scheduled for Sacramento, CA October 19 - 21, 2021. The Spring 2022 meeting is scheduled for Crystal City, VA the week of April 26, 2022.
 - **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) – JD. The Handling Subcommittee is presenting one proposal (ion exchange filtration), two discussion documents (zein and fish oil), and 15 sunset substances at the Spring 2021 meeting.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) – WT. The Materials Subcommittee discussed the public comment summaries during the last call. At the Spring meeting, the MS will present two discussion documents; one for the NOSB Research Priorities, and one on Excluded Methods. NIFA, the National Institute of Food and Agriculture, will present an update at the NOSB meeting next week, on its Research Priorities.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ . The PDS plans to assess the public comment process and may develop a discussion document for the Fall meeting. The PDS also discussed several ways to illuminate their process for potential applicants, such as shadowing, or having members at large. NOP will seek clarification from the USDA Committee Management Officer about these suggestions.

- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) – NPP. The CACS met briefly last week to discuss public comments. The proposal and discussion document on the two Human Capital projects elicited robust discussion and comments.
- Crops (CS) – WT. Biochar. On the last call, Crops found the TR for biochar sufficient and will proceed to a proposal. The Subcommittee is looking forward to public comment and what will likely be a vigorous conversation at the Fall meeting.
- Livestock (LS) - NPP. On its last call, the LS found the TR for activated charcoal sufficient. The members also prepped for the Spring meeting by discussing comments for a couple sunset substances including mineral oil and calcium borogluconate.
- **Additional Items.**
 - On Wednesday, Mae Wu, Marketing and Regulatory Programs (MRP) Deputy Administrator, will deliver welcoming remarks to the NOSB.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

March 16, 2021

April 19, 2021 - Monday

May 18, 2021

June 15, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 19, 2021

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 18, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	Feb 3-5, 2021
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 14, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, March 16, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC) - observer

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Dave Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- Approve notes of February 16, 2021
- Chairs Report - SE
 - April 2021 meeting (Four voting items)
 - Public comments
 - Reminder to focus on and summarize comments for the substances you are lead on
 - 2024 sunsets TR requests
- NOP news and update - JT
 - List of recommendations not implemented (e.g. Excluded Methods - next steps and path forward)
 - Update on priorities for Organic under new Administration
 - Update on current rulemaking (OLPP, OOL, SOE)
 - Call for nominations - outreach
 - NOP Enforcement update
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
 - Meeting prep/comment webinars
 - Spring Meeting timeline
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SE for NPP
 - Crops (CS) - RG
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of February 16, 2021** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - April 2021 meeting.
 - There are four voting items for the Spring meeting.
 - Public comment closes April 5.
 - The Chair reminded members to focus on comments for the substances on which they are lead, for presentation at the Spring meeting. Members are invited to ask questions of commenters.

- 2024 sunsets TR requests. The Subcommittees will begin reviews for TR needs after the Spring meeting.
 - The NOSB noted some recent issues with TRs that were lacking information and not well researched, which creates extra work for both the NOP and NOSB. The NOP is reviewing the current process to seek a solution.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Update on current rulemaking (OLPP, OOL, SOE).
 - The NOP responded to a public letter regarding the Origin of Livestock rule, reaffirming the USDAs current plan to do a second proposed rule, which will include a public comment period.
 - The NOP expects the Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) rule to be in clearance at the USDA this fall.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) is still in litigation, and a temporary stay was ordered while discussions are underway.
 - Update on priorities for the Organic Program under new Administration. Accreditation and compliance continue to be a priority, along with three rulemaking actions, and an Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) for inerts.
 - Call for nominations - outreach. The announcement for NOSB nominations is in clearance and should be posted by early April. The NOSB is seeking to fill four seats in January 2022. The NOP is expanding outreach to underserved communities, and the NOSB is considering hosting an informal webinar so interested parties can ask questions of current and past Board members. The group discussed some ideas, such as perhaps holding two sessions in May, with past and present NOSB members. The NOP and NOSB Chair will discuss this further.
 - NOP enforcement update. Compliance & Enforcement (C & E) is focusing on the India equivalency arrangement that was recently terminated. NOP will be hosting a webinar at the end of March to provide guidance to certifiers and operations.
 - A fraud case regarding grain was recently settled and the person responsible for the fraud received a 51-month prison sentence.
 - List of recommendations not implemented (e.g. Excluded Methods) - next steps and path forward).
 - NOP has acted on ~90% of NOSB recommendations.
 - There are various reasons that some recommendations have not been implemented. The primary constraint given current staffing levels is the rulemaking pipeline. Most significant rules involve many layers of review and approval by USDA departments as well as other Government agencies. Additionally, every administration chooses its priorities on which to focus, and must also consider statutory authority.
 - When rules have broad support, it is more likely they will be implemented. For example, SOE and OOL both have broad support.
 - Some examples of NOSB recommendations that have not been implemented for various reasons, include pet food, apiculture, aquaculture, and mushroom standards. Excluded Methods. Excluded Methods is already an important part of the organic regulations. The NOP encouraged the NOSB to consider several questions regarding this work agenda item, such as: What is the problem that needs solving? What is the goal of the project? Would it require guidance or a change in OFPA? What are the impacts with respect to definitions held by other agencies and departments? One NOSB member noted that the NOSB is interested in being proactive and not reactive, for example, addressing a rapidly evolving field such as synthetic biology as it expands into food processing and the organic industry. The Materials Subcommittee, who is lead on the excluded methods project, feels that this would aid in promoting confidence in the organic seal.

- The NOP is hosting a townhall on wild caught fish later this week. After the webinar the NOP will summarize feedback for Congress.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Meeting prep/comment webinars. See dates below. The NOSB will have two practice webinars on April 15 and 16.
 - Spring Meeting timeline. See dates below
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Livestock (LS) - KH.** The Livestock Subcommittee met today and talked about mineral oil and propylene glycol. Members are preparing for the Spring NOSB meeting and will be reviewing the next set of sunsets (for 2024).
 - **Handling (HS) - JD.** Handling is well positioned for the Spring meeting, and will present two proposals and three discussion documents. The HS did not find the technical report (TR) for cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) sufficient, and members also proposed that the NOSB review the current templates for TRs and proposals to suggest improvements.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT.** The Materials Subcommittee is working on a document on excluded methods. The lead reviewer and NOP will discuss the document to focus the direction. The MS Chair discussed the Research Priorities document with a new member to gain a broader perspective. A representative from the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) will present at the April NOSB meeting, and the MS Chair will connect with them prior to the presentation. The Materials Subcommittee is also considering the suggestion by the Handling Subcommittee to update the TR and proposal templates.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) - MJ.** The PDS cancelled its last call since there are no documents for the Spring meeting. The Subcommittee is looking at several projects for the Fall 2021 meeting, including a review of the list of past recommendations, exit interviews, and an update to the member guide.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SE for NPP.** The CACS cancelled the last call because both of the documents on human capital have been voted on and are ready for the Spring meeting.
 - **Crops (CS) - RG.** The CS is prepared for the Spring NOSB meeting, so the last call was cancelled. The CS is looking forward to voting on paper pots at the upcoming meeting.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The HS would like extra time at the Spring meeting to discuss Carrageenan.
 - The CACS thinks that there will be a robust conversation on the two human capital documents.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

February 16, 2021

March 16, 2021

April 19, 2021 - Monday

May 18, 2021

June 15, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 19, 2021

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 18, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	Feb 3-5, 2021
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 14, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, February 16, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Kyla Smith (LP) - observer

Absent: Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Dave Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- Approve notes of January 19, 2021
- Chairs Report - SE
- NOP news and update - JT
- Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA
- Spring Meeting timeline
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Crops (CS) - RG
 - Livestock (LS) - KH
 - Handling (HS) - JD
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes of January 19, 2021** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - NOSB meeting update: The NOSB Chair reminded the Executive team of the impending proposal deadline of February 18, 2021. This early deadline will allow the NOP to prepare the documents for web posting, so the public has a 30-day comment period.
 - Board/Subcomm call agenda and management. The Chair asked that Subcommittee Chairs strive to send call agendas out the Friday before the meeting, to give folks enough time to review any documents and provide constructive feedback.
 - April Executive call was rescheduled for Monday, April 19 because it conflicts with the public comment webinar.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Update on Human Capital project. NOP has compiled several projects for possible multi-award cooperative agreements. It is likely the call for proposals will move forward after the Spring NOSB meeting, and after the NOSB has received feedback from the public.
 - Rulemaking update:
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL). The NOP responded to a letter from stakeholders reaffirming the USDAs current plan to do a second proposed rule. This proposed path forward will be held until the new Secretary is appointed.

- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). The NOP has analyzed all the comments and is working on the rule.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP). NOP cannot comment on ongoing litigation.
 - National List. There are a couple of rules underway that address NOSB recommendations for National List materials, including fatty alcohols, collagen gel, oxalic acid, and pullulan.
 - A rule addressing NOSB recommendations from the Fall 2020 for several sunset removals is in development.
 - The NOP noted that clearance times vary depending on the complexity of a rule. For example, sunset renewals move more quickly than sunset removals, and other rulemaking generally takes longer and may have to go through multiple levels of approval both within the USDA and other agencies.
- New Administration updates. The new deputy undersecretary for the Marketing and Regulatory Program (MRP) is Mae Wu. The USDA Secretary will likely be confirmed in the coming weeks. There are four key goals for the new administration: Covid-19/Pandemic relief, economic recovery, climate change, and racial equality.
- National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) update at the Spring NOSB meeting. The NOSB is interested in hearing an update from NIFA about organic research. The NOP will identify a representative and will send invitation.
- Rule writing training for NOSB members? Members are interested in having a training or tutorial about rule writing best practices, to aid proposal writing and ultimately rule writing. The NOP supports the idea and also noted that because the program is required to write an independent analysis, and include an economic analysis, training could solve some challenges and not others, with regard to the rule making process.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - April NOSB meeting logistics. Final recommendations are due February 18. The NOP will send out the list and instructions soon for NOSB members to identify any conflicts of interest. The next milestone will be the comment webinars on April 20 & 22.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) - RG. Crops met earlier today and during the call voted on the proposal for biobased mulch film and the discussion document for ammonia extract. There is some indication from the community that there are potential fraud issues associated with ammonia extract especially in mixed operations. Two sunset substances under initial review at the spring 2021 meeting may garner attention - coppers and EPA List 3 inerts.
 - Livestock (LS) - KH. The petition for chitosan is pending, and the LS is waiting for a response from the petitioner. The Crops Subcommittee also has a chitosan petition from the same petitioner, and LS is coordinating with them to set a deadline for response so they can move forward. The LS completed its sunset reviews and is working on three materials that seem to have overlap with electrolytes: calcium borogluconate, calcium propionate, and nutritive supplements. The LS Chair indicated that there doesn't seem to be inconsistency among these listings as far as certifiers are concerned.
 - Handling (HS) - JD. The HS Chair noted the importance of being timely with agendas and documents to allow members enough time to prepare before a call. The HS Subcommittee discussed four items during its call earlier today: Sunset review of glucono-delta lactone (GDL), a zein, fish oil, and ion exchange. There are twelve sunset rev none seemed too concerning.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT. The MS has two documents completed and ready for the Spring meeting: Research Priorities and Excluded Methods.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ. The PDS has submitted a work agenda request for a discussion document to look at the process for public comment to make sure it is fair and transparent. The PDS is also discussing an exit survey for members, and updates to the member guide. The

Executive committee approved the request to review the process for public comment and will forward the request to the NOP. Any guidance that results from this project would likely be added to the PPM.

- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - NPP. The CACS has two documents as part of the Human Capital Project for the Spring meeting: One on Inspector mentorship/ apprenticeship/consistency and one on support for the NOSB.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday except where noted

January 19, 2021

February 16, 2021

March 16, 2021

April 19, 2021 - Monday

May 18, 2021

June 15, 2021

July 20, 2021

August 17, 2021

September 21, 2021

October 19, 2021

November 16, 2021

December 21, 2021

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 18, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	Feb 3-5, 2021
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)
Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, January 19, 2021, 4:00 pm ET**

Attending: Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Chair; Nate Powell-Palm (NPP); NOSB Vice Chair & CACS Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Secretary & PDS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG), Crops Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD), Handling Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR); Logan Petrey (LP) - observer; Amy Bruch (AB) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- **Approve notes of December 15, 2020**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Spring meeting plans - virtual
 - New member training, mentors
 - Meet and Greet Zoom call - January 22, 2021
 - Reminder about proposal deadline - February 18, 2021
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - Welcome Erin Healy - Acting Director, Standards
 - Update on rulemaking (Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE), Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP), Origin of Livestock (OOL)
 - Updates about new administration priorities
 - Cost Share
 - Update on Human Capital Management project
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
- **Spring Meeting timeline**
 - Next round of sunset reviews (2024)
 - Proposal deadline - Tracking sheet sent Jan. 6
 - Comment period
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - NPP.
 - Crops (CS) - RG.
 - Livestock (LS) - KH.
 - Handling (HS) - JD.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT.
 - Policy Development (PDS) - MJ. Work agenda request on public comment process.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **Notes of December 15, 2020 notes were approved as written.**
- **Chairs Report - SE**
 - Spring meeting plans. The NOSB supports meeting virtually in April due to ongoing travel restrictions. A member noted that some stakeholders expressed support for virtual meetings

and found it increased participation. The NOSB is interested in moving to a hybrid model of meeting in person and broadcasting live.

- New member training, mentors. New member training is scheduled for three days in early February. The NOSB Chair will assign mentors soon.
- Meet and Greet Zoom call - January 22, 2021. All members, outgoing and incoming, are welcome to join to meet each other.
- Proposal deadline. Each Subcommittee is working through its work agenda and reviews for the fall meeting, which are due to NOP February 18, 2021.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
 - The NOP introduced and welcomed Erin Healy - Acting Director for the Standards Division. Erin will be with NOP until at least April.
 - Update on rulemaking. NOP key priorities:
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). NOP is currently analyzing public comments.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP). The OLPP rule is currently in the court system and NOP has no update at this time.
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL). NOP plans to discuss this rule and the options with the new Administration.
 - New administration priorities. Today is the last day of the current administration, and the new administration begins tomorrow. The Marketing and Regulatory Programs (MRP) is expecting a new Deputy Undersecretary soon. NOP noted that non-Senate-confirmed positions are filled more quickly than positions that need to be confirmed.
 - Cost Share. The incoming administration is aware of the concerns from industry/stakeholders about the reduction in the cost-share funding.
 - Update on Human Capital Management project. The NOP received increased funding in the most recent budget appropriation, and is developing a paper with possible ideas for moving forward with the human capital project. The NOP should have more information for the next NOSB Executive Team call.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Spring meeting timeline. See table below. The two major impending milestones are the proposal due date (February 18) and the Spring meeting (April 28 - 30, 2021).
 - Next round of sunset reviews. The NOP will compile the list of sunsets due to sunset in 2024, so the Subcommittees can determine the need for technical reports (TRs).
 - Proposal deadline. The NOP sent a tracking sheet to the Subcommittee Chairs on January 6 to help track which proposals have been completed and submitted as we approach the Spring deadline.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - NPP. The CACS is working on two projects as part of the Human Capital Management work agenda item: Support personal for NOSB members; and Inspector Recruitment and Retention.
 - Crops (CS) - RG. The Crops Subcommittee has had a full agenda on each call, and the Chair praised members for having candid, thorough, discussions. The CS is working through sunset reviews and discussed biodegradable biobased mulch film (BBMF) and its relationship to plastic. The CS finalized the proposal for paper pots for discussion at the Spring 2021 meeting, and chose to defer several projects to the Fall 2021 meeting while waiting for technical reports or additional information from the petitioner. Those projects include biochar, hydronium, chitosan, and ammonia extract.
 - Livestock (LS) - KH. On the most recent call, the LS finalized two sunset reviews, and the research priorities, which will be forwarded to the Materials Subcommittee soon. The LS also discussed two sunset substances under review for the first time - calcium borogluconate and calcium propionate. The NOP clarified questions as to why these two substances are listed individually

and are not covered under the listing for electrolytes: Both have restricted use while electrolytes are used more broadly.

- Handling (HS) - SE for JD. The Handling Subcommittee discussed sunset reviews on today’s call and is working on several petitions and proposals, including cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC), zein, and ion exchange filtration. The research priorities were completed and forwarded to the Materials Subcommittee. All other sunset reviews have been scheduled for discussion.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - WT. The MS will finalize the research priorities’ discussion document once it receives the lists from the other Subcommittees, and is also working on the next iteration of the excluded methods document. The MS is also waiting for the technical report (TR) for tall oil. Tall oil was sent to the Materials Subcommittee for review rather than the CS, HS, or LS since it cuts across all Subcommittees and is petitioned as an inert.
- Policy Development (PDS) - MJ. The PDS intends on submitting a work agenda request to assess the public comment process. Specifically, written comments submitted after the deadline, and requests from oral commenters to be placed in a specific speaking order. The Board is seeking fairness for all commenters. NOP finalized the member guide and resent it to the PDS, who may review it again. The PDS is also considering developing an exit surveys for outgoing NOSB members. NOP will contact the USDA’s Committee Management Officer (CMO) to ask if other Boards use/have an exit survey.
- **Additional Items.** The NOSB Chair thanked the outgoing NOSB members for their service and mentioned the transition of their work agenda items to remaining members.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous ES Notes](#)
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Future call schedule: All calls 4:00 ET/1:00 PT 3rd Tuesday

- December 15, 2020
- January 19, 2021
- February 16, 2021
- March 16, 2021
- April 20, 2021 - public comment webinar
- May 18, 2021
- June 15, 2021
- July 20, 2021
- August 17, 2021
- September 21, 2021
- October 19, 2021
- November 16, 2021
- December 21, 2021

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021

NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021