

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, April 2, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Kyla Smith (KS); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Esu Obu (EO)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK);

Agenda

- Review notes: March 19, 2024
- 2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency
- Petition sufficiency: Potassium phosphate (CD)
- Petition sufficiency: Ethylene (NL) - TR needed?
- 2027 Sunsets TR determinations
 - Kaolin (WT)
 - Sodium bicarbonate (DN)
 - Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)
 - Ammonium carbonate (DN)
 - Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)
 - Orange shellac (KS)
 - Ozone (JD)
 - Cornstarch (native) (CD)
 - Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)
 - Glycerin (CD)
- Standing item: Work items for food techs
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 19, 2024 notes** were approved with no changes
- **2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency.** The HS reviewed the new information provided by technical report contractor. The lead noted that the additions clarified some questions but still did not completely answer the questions about the Solvay manufacturing process. Despite that, the HS finds the TR sufficient, and it provides the information they need to proceed with the review. The lead also expressed appreciation to the TR writer for adding headings, which was helpful and clear.
- **Petition sufficiency: Potassium phosphate (CD).** The lead noted that potassium phosphate is currently restricted to 'made with' organic, and the petitioner is asking that the restriction be removed so it can be used in organic products. The HS has some additional questions for the petitioner regarding the justification for removal and therefore deem the petition insufficient at this time. The lead will send questions to the NOP to forward to the petitioner.
- **Petition sufficiency: Ethylene (KS for NL) - TR needed?** The lead proposed two paths given that ethylene is already on the National List, and the petitioner is seeking to expand its use to onions and potatoes. The first option would be to request a limited scope TR, and the second to ask the Food Technologists to conduct a literature review. The HS discussed the two options and decided to request a limited scope TR. The NOSB Chair will respond to the email and relay the conversation to the NOP to focus questions on human and environmental health.
- **2027 Sunsets TR determinations.**

- The Food Technologists have been evaluating the sunset lists for possible annotation updates/changes and will provide the list soon. In the interim, the HS proceeded with determinations for updated TRs.
- **Kaolin (WT)** - deferred to next call
- **Sodium bicarbonate (DN)** - deferred to next call
- **Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)** - deferred to next call
- **Ammonium carbonate (DN)** - deferred to next call
- **Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)**. Low-acyl gellan gum was recently added to the National List and is undergoing its first sunset review. The lead would like to sync its review with the rest of the gums for the next sunset review, which means it would get reviewed a year early. There was a 2018 TR for gums, and the HS will not seek a new one at this time.
- **Orange shellac (KS)**. The lead noted that orange shellac is listed at 205.606, and is used in food coatings and confectionaries. The last TR was from 2014, and given that there hasn't been a change in manufacturing, was found to be adequate. The HS will not request a new one.
- **Ozone (JD)**. Supported by a 1995 TAP and added to the list in 2001. The last sunset review (in 2020) indicates that the positive uses outweigh any negative aspects. The lead recommended a new TR, and the HS will send a message to the NOP.
- **Cornstarch (native) (CD)**. The lead noted that there has never been a TAP or TR so recommended that the HS request one.
- **Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)**. The last TR was from 2015. The HS will not request a new TR.
- **Glycerin (CD)**. The HS will not request a new TR.
- **Additional Items**. The group discussed the Spring meeting process e.g., how much time to devote to each sunset, what to include in the discussion, and a summary of public comments.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

March 19, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency

Potassium phosphate - Amend to remove annotation

2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and assign leads

April 2, 2024

Calcium Chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency

Potassium phosphate (CD) - Amend to remove annotation. Petition sufficiency.

April 16, 2024

2027 sunsets - TR determinations

Kaolin (WT) - deferred to next call

Sodium bicarbonate (DN) - deferred to next call

Ammonium bicarbonate (DN) - deferred to next call

Ammonium carbonate (DN) - deferred to next call

Sodium hydroxide (NL)

Colors (AJ)

May 7, 2024

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Will send back to petition for additional information 4.2.24	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	----------------------	----------------

L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 4.2.24	“ “
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “

Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “

				TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates)	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

				2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	2.6.24	
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 2.20.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
--	------------	----	---	--	--------------------------------	-----

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “

Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	“ “
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “

Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes **Tuesday, March 19, 2024 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: February 20, 2024
- Potassium Iodide - TR sufficiency
- 2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency
- Ethylene - petition sufficiency (NL)
- Potassium phosphate - Assign lead, Need sufficiency determination by May 10
- 2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and leads
- Work items for Food Technologists
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 20, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Potassium Iodide (AJ for LP) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the TR and indicated that it was found sufficient. She highlighted the inclusion of information regarding environmental concerns and manufacturing. The HS Chair will let the NOP know, so the NOP can get the TR posted as soon as possible.
- **2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the uses of perlite, which is a filtering aid. The draft review was already posted for the Spring meeting, before receipt of the TR, so some of the information from the new TR will be added prior to the Fall meeting review. The lead noted that the TR included detail about different types of filtering aids, was objective, written in plain language, thorough, and provided detailed information. The Handling Subcommittee deemed the TR sufficient.
- **Ethylene - petition sufficiency (NL).** Ethylene was reviewed recently for its sunset review. The NOSB received a petition to expand its use to include sprout inhibition in potatoes and onions in storage. A member questioned the dichotomy that ethylene is used to ripen bananas, yet it inhibits sprouting in potatoes and onions. The group discussed the use, essentiality, and efficacy. A member mentioned the timing of the use, which may be for shipping purposes. The petition was found sufficient, and the HS doesn't feel the need to request a full TR, but will discuss the possible need for a limited scope TR on a future call.
- **Potassium phosphate - petition to amend annotation.** CD volunteered to lead the review and will determine petition sufficiency on the April 2 call.
- **2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and assign leads.** The NOSB Officers and Subcommittee Chairs updated the work schedules for each of the Subcommittees, noting that there will be 5 members rotating off, and 5 new members starting in the middle of the review cycle. HS has 24 sunsets, 10 of which are colors, and they are targeting the end of May to determine TR needs. The group scheduled discussion dates for TR determinations. Draft proposals will be due to the HS Chair 5/16/24.
- **Work items for Food Technologists.** Working on annotations and setting up the 2027 sunset templates, and will flag the substances that have possible annotation changes.
- **Additional Items.**

- The group discussed TR rankings, questions for limited scope TRs, and what other projects may be ready for the Fall meeting. The NOP will send the HS links to where they can find the evaluation questions for the TRs.
- Inerts. The Food Techs are working on functional groups, and the Handling Subcommittee is seeking to begin work on the proposal in June.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

February 20, 2024

Tocopherols (KS) - TR sufficiency

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency

Potassium phosphate - Amend to remove annotation

2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and assign leads

April 2, 2024

Calcium Chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency

Potassium phosphate (CD) - Amend to remove annotation. Petition sufficiency.

April 16, 2024

May 7, 2024

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. May request limited scope TR.	3.19.24 4.2.24?	TBD
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 4.2.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "

				2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “

Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 2.20.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Schedule d/status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “

Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS		Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	“ “
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ “

Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, February 20, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: February 6, 2024
- Tocopherols (KS) -TR sufficiency (due 4.16.24)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 6, 2024 notes** were accepted as written
- **Tocopherols (KS) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the TR, and noted that tocopherols are manufactured in various ways, and can be synthetic or non-synthetic. The group discussed seeking information about the relative percentages of synthetic vs. non synthetic supply, and if the TR is the correct place to ask that. The TR was found sufficient. The HS will send an additional question about availability to the NOP to add to the Spring sunset review, which was already submitted.
- **Additional Items.**
 - **NOSB workflow.** The NOSB Officers and Subcommittee Chairs will meet to review work agendas, workflow, and schedules for the upcoming semester/year. The group discussed the idea of projects for the Food Technologists, and how they may be able to help with the workload, such as having them create the initial review templates for the sunsets, and perhaps do an initial review of the upcoming 2027 sunsets and flagging which ones could use an updated TR. A member mentioned that the goal was to refresh the TRs approximately every 10 years or so, and cautioned against delegating that determination to the NOP. Members asked about deadlines and due dates, and supported the goal of getting the sunsets on a better schedule. The NOSB Officers will talk about best practices.
 - **Fermentation panel:** A member introduced the idea of hosting a fermentation panel, which is a topic that intersects with several sunset reviews this term: yeast, enzymes, microorganisms, etc. He noted there are lingering questions, both specific and more general, and a panel might be helpful. The HS Chair suggested the idea of inviting speakers to future Handling Subcommittee calls before the Fall meeting, to help focus their thoughts and questions, and to inform their votes at the Fall meeting. The member noted that the cornerstone is “continuous improvement”, and this could help move the topic in a forward trajectory. Members will think about potential speakers and talk about this at a future call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
 Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

Tocopherols (KS) - TR sufficiency

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS). TR sufficiency, if available.

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency

2027 Sunsets; Review initial list and assign leads

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	------------------	----------------

L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermented gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 3.19.24	“ “
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “

				TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.		
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “

Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 2.20.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes **Tuesday, February 6, 2024 12:00 pm ET**

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH)

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: January 23, 2024
- Review steps to finalize spring meeting documents
- 2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review/TR sufficiency
- 2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review/TR sufficiency
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize
- 2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 23, 2024 notes** were approved as written.
- **Review steps to finalize spring meeting documents.** February 15 is the due date. Please send final documents to Allison and NOP.
- **2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS).** The lead summarized the substance and TR, noting that the last TR was from 1995. The new TR contained comprehensive information about the material, however, the HS wanted to clarify two items before deeming the TR sufficient: the trona process (manufacturing) and whether it is synthetic or nonsynthetic; and commercial availability. Members posed several questions, and the lead modified the review based on feedback. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH).** The lead summarized the substance. This is the first sunset review since it was added to the National List. Members asked a couple of questions, and the lead will complete the document and submit it to the NOP for the Spring 2024 meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ).** The lead summarized the TR and indicated that it was sufficient. She incorporated the pertinent information into the review document for the Spring meeting and will send an email to the NOP indicating the determination. The lead also summarized the substance review (uses, manufacture, etc.) and the HS accepted the review for the Spring 2024 meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP).** The lead summarized the substance uses and manufacture. Potassium phosphate is used in "made-with" products. There were no additional questions from members. The lead will forward the final document to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (LP, All).** The HS liaison reviewed the HS research priorities, and the group approved the top three priorities, and deemed the remainder of the list important, but not pressing. The HS will forward the completed list to the Materials Subcommittee for review.
- **2026 Sunset: Microorganisms, Enzymes, Yeast (JD).** The lead summarized all three substances (Microorganisms, Enzymes, and Yeast) for use, manufacture, and health aspects. The group discussed the questions to stakeholders, focused on excluded methods and ancillary substances, and looks

forward to hearing public comments. The lead will submit three separate reviews/documents for the Spring meeting.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

January 23, 2024

- Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

- 2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS). TR sufficiency, if available.

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 2.20.24	“ “

				clarification from the TR writer.		
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. TR sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “

				TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “

Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes **Tuesday, January 23, 2024 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: January 16, 2024
- Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 16, 2024 notes** were approved with no changes.
- **Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS).** The lead summarized modifications made to the draft review since the last discussion and members provided feedback. The group agreed that neither substance is essential for organic chicory powder production, given that it is synthetic and there are currently many alternative organic agricultural substances as well as other anti-caking agents that are already listed on the National List. The HS moved to a vote.

Motion to classify magnesium carbonate and magnesium carbonate hydroxide as non-agricultural, synthetic.

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to add magnesium carbonate and magnesium carbonate hydroxide to the NL for use as an anti-caking agent in chicory powder

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH).** The lead introduced the review for perlite and noted there is a pending TR. Perlite has been on the National List since 1996, and the last technical review was done then as well. The lead summarized use, manufacture, and health and environmental concerns. The HS added a question to the review, and will add any new info from the TR once it is available. The HS will submit the final review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS).** The lead summarized tocopherols, and noted that the HS is awaiting a Limited Scope TR, which is not expected back before the proposal due date. The TR will be available before the Fall meeting. The main focus of the discussion was the classification and annotation. The group discussed a potential annotation change, and will talk more about it at the Spring meeting, since they should have the TR back by then. A member suggested the possibility of posting the updated review (after the information from the TR is included) to the open docket between meetings. The group added questions for stakeholders and the HS will submit the final review for the Spring NOSB meeting.

- **2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP).** The lead indicated that there is a pending TR due back in March. She summarized the draft review including use, manufacture, and human health and environmental issues. There were no additional edits, and the HS will submit the review for the Spring meeting
- **2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP).** The lead summarized the draft review including use, manufacture, and human health and environmental issues. The group discussed the impacts of phosphorous on the human diet, with particular focus on health effects of phosphorous provided by phosphate additives versus natural phosphorous in foods. The HS will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP).** Deferred to later call.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The Research Priorities co-lead (LP) will send the Handling priorities to the group for discussion on the next call.
 - The HS added an extra hour to the call on February 6.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review

Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD) - TR sufficiency

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

January 23, 2024

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. **Highlight** indicates action needed. **Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “

Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “

Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, January 16, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN);

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: December 19, 2023
- 2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review
- Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD) - TR sufficiency
- Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 19, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH).** The lead summarized both the substance review and the TR, and the group discussed them. The HS requested a new TR, since the previous TAP was from 2002. The TR was found to be well written and comprehensive, specifically with regard to use of activated charcoal. The HS found the TR sufficient, and will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH).** The lead summarized the review of gelatin, noting the lack of organic gelatin. The HS included a question about barriers to production of organic gelatin, and the lead will complete the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD).** After a brief introduction by the lead, the group discussed the review for rye pollen extracts. The primary use is for vegan sweetener syrup, replacing honey from bees. The lead will make revisions based on the conversation, and will recirculate the document prior to submitting it to the NOP for the Spring 2024 meeting. The Subcommittee is not supportive of adding this to the National List. The group felt that the changes would not alter the document in such a way that it would change their vote, so moved to a vote on this call.

Motion to classify rye pollen extracts as agricultural

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 9 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to add rye pollen extracts to the NL

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS).** The lead summarized the two reviews, which were combined into one document. Members discussed nano-particles, essentiality, and alternatives, such as chicory powder. Magnesium carbonate is allowed in many of the International Standards, and a member asked about equivalency agreements and how that impacts the use of

magnesium carbonate. A member added that the criteria to add substances to the NL should be a high bar, and members should take that into consideration with all substance reviews. Another member mentioned that magnesium carbonate was previously listed for use in made-with category of organic only, and it was removed. Additionally, the industry seems to have grown without it. The group discussed the questions that were part of the discussion document, and whether to include them again in the proposal. The lead will make some modifications and keep the questions, and the HS will vote on a future call.

- **2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD).** The lead summarized the limited scope TR, which was focused on excluded methods. The TR was found sufficient, consistent, thorough, and well written. He also noted that the TR is broad enough to apply to other substances that are produced via fermentation. The group discussed the TR and its content, and the lead posed some questions for the group, which they may include in the Spring review. The three substances are scheduled to be reviewed on the February 6 call.
- **Research Priorities (DN, LP, All).** Deferred.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss reviews
2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review
Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote
Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote
2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD) - TR sufficiency
Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

January 23, 2024

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote
2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review
2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review
Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024
 April 2, 2024
 April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 2.6.24	“ “

Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “

Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting