

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, December 19, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** Jared Clark (JC)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO); Jo Mirenda (JM)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: December 5, 2023
- 2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss reviews
- 2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (*Undaria pinnatifida*) (DN) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **December 5, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL).** The lead summarized the reviews for both citric and lactic acid, noting that citric acid is widely used, and foundational to organic processing, and lactic acid has a wide array of uses. The group discussed GMOs, excluded methods, and the connection to citric acid. In the interest of starting a conversation and to glean feedback only, the group chose to include a question about an annotation for commercial availability. The intent isn't to make changes at this sunset review, but to collect information for a future board to consider. The two substances will be reviewed and voted on separately, as they were last time, even though they are listed together on the National List. The HS finalized the review and will submit it to the NOP for the Spring NOSB meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN).** The lead summarized the review, noting that is an allowed non-synthetic, used for tablet coating and as an alternative to gelatin in capsules. The Food Technologists are working on flushing out the International Use section for all the sunset reviews, including pullulan, and will complete them in January. The lead will complete the document and submit it to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN).** The lead summarized the fish oil review, including uses, manufacture, and International Standards. Members contributed ideas for additions and edits. A member noted that the 2020 NOSB recommendation on Wild, Native Fish for Liquid Fish Products would resolve many of the questions in all the marine and fish listings. NOP indicated at a previous NOSB meeting that it would not move ahead with that recommendation.
- **2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu; Wakame seaweed (*Undaria pinnatifida*) (DN).** The lead summarized the two seaweed substances – noting the differences. They are used in food, cosmetics, thickeners, and animal feed. Both substance reviews are nearly identical except for the species name.
- **Research Priorities (DN, LP, All).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** The January 2 calls were moved to Jan 23
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

## [Previous HS Notes](#)

### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

December 5, 2023

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss proposals  
Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss proposal  
Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss reviews  
2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review  
Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote  
Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote  
2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD) - TR sufficiency  
Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

January 23, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review  
2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

### **Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. <a href="#">2019 TR</a>	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 1.16.23	Spr 2024

**2026 Sunset Review**

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Feb.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	" "
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due <a href="#">2.11.24</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due <a href="#">2.13.24</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "

				TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24		
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “

<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “

<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5

Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, December 5, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

**Absent:** Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair

**Staff:** Jared Clark (JC); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: November 21, 2023
- Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss proposal
- Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss proposals
- Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss
- Additional Items
  - Update on TR timeline
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **November 21, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD).** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of rye pollen extracts, as indicated in the petition, and also summarized the technical information from the TR. The petitioner is seeking addition to the 205.606, for use in vegan honey production, because there is currently no organic rye seed that has the particular property they are seeking. The TR indicated that the manufacturing process is not well described in the petition, and so it uses parallels in the manufacture of bee pollen. Several members asked follow-up questions. The HS found the TR sufficient and will relay that to the NOP via email. Members discussed market need and commercial availability, and may include several questions in the proposal about demand and non-organic breeding stock.
- **Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS).** The lead summarized the draft review for the group. Both substances are being petitioned for use in organic chicory production. The HS developed a discussion document in the Fall of 2023 and didn't receive many comments. Since that was prior to receipt of the TR, they will include additional questions for the public in the Spring 2023 proposal. The lead incorporated information from the petition and TR, and summarized the data as it pertains to the OFPA criteria, including manufacture, human and environmental health concerns, and alternatives. There are alternatives currently on the National List. Members contributed to the discussion and posed several questions about equivalency, alternatives, and mining. The lead is going to add information about international acceptance, noting that it is relevant. The HS will vote on the proposal on a later call.
- **Research Priorities (DN, LP, All).** The HS members discussed two top priorities, which they identified as sanitizers and plastics. The HS previously discussed doing a gap analysis on plastic use in handling and processing. WT noted that these priorities are already on the list, and asked if the HS would like to refine the questions.
- **Additional Items.**
  - The NOP provided an update on due dates for two TRs: calcium chloride (due Feb 2) and perlite (due Feb 23).
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

November 21, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - TR sufficiency

2026 Sunset: Calcium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Potassium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Sodium citrate (CD)

December 5, 2023

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss proposals

Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss reviews

2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN) - discuss review

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review

Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

January 23, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

## Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

## Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. <a href="#">2019 TR</a>	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23	Spr 2024

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024

			d with citrates?)	TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	12.19.23	
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Feb.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due late Feb 2024</b>	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due early Mar 2024</b>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “

<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, November 7, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

**Absent:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO); Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair;

**Staff:** Jared Clark (JC); Johanna Mirenda (JM)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: October 3, 2023
- Fall 2023 NOSB meeting debrief
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: Celery powder (WT) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **October 3, 2023 notes** were approved as written.
- **Fall 2023 NOSB meeting debrief:** Lots of discussion around annotation changes and how they move forward on that. One idea is to have the Vice Chair do a comprehensive look at the sunsets' annotations to take some pressure off the Chair. A member raised the question about exploring sanitizers again (how to review, listing separately on the National List, etc.). May be a good work agenda item for the Materials Subcommittee to request and they can ask Food Technologists can help. Fermentation in general may be another topic for a work agenda request.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) – discuss:** The lead presented their review and questioned whether this substance needs an annotation to clarify allowed uses. A member asked if there are there concerns about disposal. The lead wasn't sure. Members will see if this is addressed anywhere and, if not, may add the question to the document. A member asked if this substance is an alternative to other more problematic sanitizers, and whether this substance is used in direct contact with food. The lead isn't sure may add these questions to the document. A member asked whether the Board wanted to add general questions about essentiality and use for all sanitizers up for sunset.
- **2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT) – discuss:** The lead presented their review of this substance. A member voiced support for this substance because it is relatively safe and less corrosive. They want to make sure any revised sanitizer process leaves room for adding safer, effective sanitizers to the National List. Another member noted the clear annotation for this substance.
- **2026 Sunset: Celery powder (WT) – discuss:** The lead presented their review of this substance. There was discussion on why this was reviewed in both 2017 and 2019. These reviews seem to be from the reorganization of sunset dates that occurred around that time. A member brought up the negative impacts of conventional celery production and how that might be incorporated into the document. Another member asked for a general question about commercial availability in all 205.606 sunsets. Another member noted that this item was included on the NOSB's Research Priorities.
- **Additional Items**
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

October 3, 2023

## Review public comments

November 7, 2023

Fall 2023 NOSB meeting debrief

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss

2026 Sunset: Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT) - discuss

2026 Sunset: Celery powder (WT) - discuss

November 21, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Calcium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Potassium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Sodium citrate

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - discuss proposals

2026 Sunset: Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities (KS/All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review

January 2, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

## Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

## Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	----------	--------	------------------	----------------

Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	12.5.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23	Spr 2024

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. <a href="#">2019 TR</a>	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23	Spr 2024

### 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. <b>Sufficiency due 12.18.23</b>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024

<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Dec	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to</a> <a href="#">add</a> <a href="#">07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated</a> <a href="#">Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “

<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. <b>Sufficiency due 12.18.23</b>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>9.5.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 <b>11.7.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>9.5.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 <b>11.7.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. <b>Sufficiency due 12.18.23</b>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “

<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. <b>Sufficiency due 12.18.23</b>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 <b>11.7.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>9.5.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20

NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, October 3, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)  
**Absent:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN)  
**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: September 19, 2023
- Fall meeting preparation
- Review public comments
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **September 19, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Tech representatives introduction.** The Subcommittee welcomed the newest NOSB technical support person.
- **Fall meeting preparation.** The group discussed logistics for travel to Providence.
- **Review public comments.** The HS had a brief discussion about public comments.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned early.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

September 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: L-Malic acid (NL)

2026 Sunset: Ascorbic acid (NL)

Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - TR sufficiency

October 3, 2023

Review public comments

November 7, 2023

Fall 2023 NOSB meeting debrief

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)

Celery powder (WT)

November 21, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Calcium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Potassium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Sodium citrate

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - discuss proposals

2026 Sunset: Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities (KS/All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review

January 2, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

February 20, 2024

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23 12.5.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 9.19.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 9.19.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. <a href="#">2019 TR</a>	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change</a> <a href="#">FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Dec	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “

				TR due early Dec		
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to</a> <a href="#">add</a> <a href="#">07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated</a> <a href="#">Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “

<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “

<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

### Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, September 19, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Absent:** Dilip Nandwani (DN)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: September 5, 2023
- 2026 Sunsets:
  - L-Malic Acid (NL)
  - Ascorbic Acid (NL)
- Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - TR sufficiency
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **September 5, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2026 Sunsets:**
  - L-malic acid (NL). The lead summarized the uses, manufacture, and international standards for L-malic acid. He noted that there are no ancillary substances, the manufacturing process is benign, and there are no significant health impacts listed in the TR. The Subcommittee will submit this sunset review for the Spring 2024 meeting.  
The Subcommittee also discussed a work agenda item for an annotation change to L-malic acid that has been on hold. L-malic acid is listed at 205.605(a) as non-synthetic, although the predominant production method is synthetic, so the NOSB is considering moving it (or perhaps adding it) to 205.605(b). The lead provided background and history of production, noting that it is produced through fermentation, and the primary "fuel" is fumaric acid, which is synthetic. The group reviewed the questions to stakeholders, and the HS Chair added thoughts about fermentation, 205.606 items, and commercial availability. The lead will summarize the spectrum of options in the review document, and the HS will talk about this again before the Spring 2024 meeting.
  - Ascorbic Acid (NL). The lead summarized the uses of ascorbic acid. It is a fermentation product starting with glucose, and is essential for humans as we do not synthesize it naturally. There were no ancillary substances identified. There were no additional questions from members. The lead will finalize the review document for the Spring 2024 meeting.
- **Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the work to date, noting that the NOSB will review two discussion documents at the Fall 2023 meeting, which were written prior to the receipt of the TR. The TR included a table listing many forms of magnesium carbonate, each having unique CAS numbers. The group discussed how to consider this in light of the current petitions and review. The TR was deemed sufficient, and the Chair will send an email to NOP indicating that.
- **Additional Items.** The HS Chair will be unavailable for the October 3 call, and the Vice-Chair will preside. The only item on the agenda will be to review public comments.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

September 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Ferrous sulfate (AJ) - discuss

2026 Sunset: Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ) - discuss

2026 Sunset: Orange pulp, dried (KS) - discuss

September 19, 2023

L-Malic acid (NL)

Ascorbic acid (NL)

Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - TR sufficiency

October 3, 2023

Review public comments

November 7, 2023

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)

Celery powder (WT)

November 21, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Calcium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Potassium citrate (CD)

2026 Sunset: Sodium citrate

December 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - discuss proposals

2026 Sunset: Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss proposal

Research Priorities (KS/All) - discuss

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review

January 2, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

February 20, 2024

## Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

## Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23 12.5.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 9.19.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 9.19.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. <a href="#">2019 TR</a>	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	7.18.23	" "

				<a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23		
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006 (Gellan Gum)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “

Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Dec	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	" "
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	" "
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	" "
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due early Feb 2024</b>	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due early Mar 2024</b>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	" "

<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to add</a> <a href="#">07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due late Feb 2024</b>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 <b>9.5.23</b>	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

				<a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>		
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

### Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, September 5, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Absent:**

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: August 15, 2023
- 2026 Sunset: Ferrous sulfate (AJ) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: Orange pulp, dried (KS) - discuss
- Review fall schedule
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **August 15, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset: Ferrous sulfate (AJ).** The lead summarized the review for ferrous sulfate, and discussed the annotation, which is stricter than the one for nutrient vitamins and minerals (NVM). A member asked about requesting an updated TR, which they will mention in the review for the next review cycle.
- **2026 Sunset: Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ).** The lead summarized nutrient vitamins and minerals, highlighting the past discussions about the annotation, which refers to the FDA guidance. She also summarized the information from the 2015 TR, and noted two outstanding issues: A 2012 interim rule that never got finalized and a [2016 Handling proposal/discussion document](#) for an annotation change that never proceeded. A member noted that the Livestock Subcommittee is also working on vitamins (for use in livestock). and perhaps should also be mentioned. The group discussed excluded methods, ancillary substances (already included in the review), and inerts, and highlighted the parallels between excipients, vitamins, and minerals. A member asked about 2012 interim rule <https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2012/09/27/2012-23748/national-organic-program-nop-sunset-review-2012-for-nutrient-vitamins-and-minerals> and would like to ask NOP to comment on it at the Fall 2023 NOSB meeting, to close the loop, since it never went to a final rule.
- **2026 Sunset: Orange pulp, dried (KS).** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of orange pulp. During the last sunset review, the HS voted to remove it from the National List based on incompatibility with organic, and non-essentiality, however, it was noted that the petitioner testified that it is in use, and therefore it was not removed. There was a split vote, so the motion to remove failed. The group discussed the patent, and would like more information about it. Patent: <https://patents.google.com/patent/WO2012016190A1/en>. The lead researched the Organic Integrity Database (OID) and found this substance listed as orange powder (29), and orange pulp (6). A member suggested adding a question about barriers to organic production, and another member mentioned its low volume. Given that the HS is discussing the sunset early, they plan to recap all the sunsets closer to the submission deadline for the Spring meeting.
- **Review fall schedule.** Deferred due to time.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

- 2026 Sunset: Ferrous sulfate (AJ) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ) - discuss
- 2026 Sunset: Orange pulp, dried (KS) - discuss

September 19, 2023

Magnesium Carbonate/ Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide (KS) - TR sufficiency

October 3, 2023

Review public comments

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

**Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

**Petitioned Substances**

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23 12.5.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 9.19.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 9.19.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

**Other Projects**

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change</a> <a href="#">FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	7.18.23	“ “

				<a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23		
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: <a href="#">2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> (Lactic acid, <a href="#">fermntd gluc</a> ) TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> (Citric acid) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Citric acid and <a href="#">salts</a> ) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Lactic Acid, Sodium <a href="#">Lactate, and Potassium Lactate</a> ) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Dec	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “

<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “

<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

### Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, August 15, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: August 1, 2023
- Review fall schedule.
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **August 1, 2023 notes** were accepted with modifications to the format of the magnesium carbonate discussion.
- **Review fall schedule.**
  - The Subcommittee reviewed the dates for sunset discussions. The Chair noted the substances that are awaiting TRs and highlighted the fact that the information in the TR might not be available for incorporation into the Spring review.
  - The group reviewed the work agenda schedule for the next several months. The Chair asked about conflicts with personal/work schedules. LP's reviews were moved to January instead of February.
  - NOP sent the 2026 sunset templates to the Chairs of the Handling, Crops, and Livestock Subcommittees, and they are saved in Cloudvault as well.
  - A member noted that January has a 5<sup>th</sup> Tuesday if they need to add an additional call.
  - The Chair will circulate a resource document from a stakeholder group with comments about substances that are candidates for annotation changes. The HS may use this initial list as a foundation document and make modifications as needed.
  - The HS Chair assigned co-reviewers for each sunset, and will leave it up to the members to choose which sunsets might benefit from a second reviewer.
- **Additional Items.**
  - The NOSB technical assistants will not likely be on board to analyze comments for this meeting, but might attend the meeting.
  - A member asked about substance assignments given that sometimes there are changes in Subcommittees rosters after the Fall meeting. It's likely the current Subcommittee roster will remain the same.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### **[Previous HS Notes](#)**

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote

2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

2026 Sunset: Ferrous sulfate (AJ) - discuss

2026 Sunset: Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ) - discuss

2026 Sunset: Orange pulp, dried (KS) - discuss

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

Review public comments

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23 12.5.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 8.1.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23 12.5.23	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Con tact	TR Re quest?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change</a> <a href="#">FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due	7.18.23	“ “

				3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23		
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “

Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Dec	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “

<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to</a> <a href="#">add</a> <a href="#">07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated</a> <a href="#">Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and</a> <a href="#">Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel,</a> <a href="#">Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due late Feb 2024</b>	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.2.24	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 12.19.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.16.24	“ “

## Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, August 1, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Jerry D’Amore (JD); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: July 18, 2023
- 2025 Sunsets: Gellan gum (high-acyl form only); Xanthan; Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean); Tamarind seed; Tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **July 18, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2025 Sunsets: Gellan gum (high-acyl form only); Xanthan gum; Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean); Tamarind seed gum; Tragacanth gum (CD).** The lead summarized the gums as a group, as most were addressed in the same 2018 TR. She noted that all have different properties and unique uses, and are imperfect substitutes for each other, as noted in the table in the review document. The group discussed language in the document regarding fermentation products and possible GMOs, as well as the gums that are on the list at 205.606: Nonorganically produced agricultural products allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as “organic.”. The lead will amend some language based on comments from members. The HS moved to individual votes on the 5 listings for gums.

#### **Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)**

Motion to remove gellan gum (high-acyl form only) from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: NL

Further discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

**Xanthan gum.** Xanthan gum is essential for gluten free products. It is a fermentation product. Xanthan is synthetic, although there are a couple of manufacturing processes – some synthetic and some not. Commenters noted this as well. The group discussed the manufacturing processes as they relate to the listing and the possibility of having a future Board revisit the listing at 205.605 (b)

Motion to remove xanthan gum from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: KH

Further discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

**Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean).** Gums are used as thickeners and stabilizers in various products. They are not fermented as others are, so no concerns with GMOs. At the last meeting a public commenter asked if there was an organic version available.

Motion to remove gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean) from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: JD

Further discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

**Tamarind seed gum.** Tamarind seed gum was added to the list in 2018, and is undergoing its first sunset review. It's a fairly new product and the lead questioned whether it's being used. There was no discussion at the Spring meeting, and no public comments.

Motion to remove tamarind seed gum from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: AJ

Further discussion: None

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

**Tragacanth gum.** Tragacanth is not widely used. At the last meeting commenters discussed whether organic supply would be available and how the supply could be increased.

Motion to remove tragacanth gum from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: KS

Further discussion: Members discussed whether it's helpful to include questions to stakeholders in the Fall document given the timeline. The lead will revise the document accordingly.

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Magnesium carbonate petition and magnesium carbonate hydroxide petition (KS).** The HS is reviewing **two petitions; magnesium carbonate for use as a drying agent or anticaking agent for organic chicory powder, and magnesium carbonate hydroxide as a processing aid.** The HS is waiting for TR, which is due this fall, and in the interim is putting forth discussion documents at the Fall meeting to get the conversation and public comment started. History of magnesium carbonate: On list and removed during sunset review in 2017 (reviewed in 2015). No comments to oppose. Also petitioned as a filtering aid in 2005 (but it is unclear how that proceeded as there is no follow-on proposal on the PSI?). MA will review transcripts from 2005. A member asked about the "made with" organic category, and how this intersects. Would it be listed as an ingredient? Likely not - it's a processing aid. Members also discussed silicon dioxide, which is noted in the petition. ACS post-call note: The 2005 petition was found ineligible for review, as the petitioner was seeking to add magnesium carbonate at 205.606, and it is not an agricultural ingredient. The HS moved to a vote on both documents.

Motion to accept the discussion document on magnesium carbonate

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: JD

Further discussion: None

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to accept the discussion document on magnesium carbonate hydroxide

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

July 18, 2023

2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote

2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023 - may cancel

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

#### **Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

#### **Petitioned Substances**

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Spr 2024

Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018); 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “

Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “

Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Dec	3.21.23 4.4.23	" "
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23	" "
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	" "
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid Jan 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23	" "
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23	" "
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due early Feb 2024</b>	3.21.23 4.4.23	" "
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due early Mar 2024</b>	3.21.23 5.16.23	" "

<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to add</a> <a href="#">07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due early Dec	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due late Nov	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> TR due mid-Oct	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a> <b>TR due late Feb 2024</b>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

				<a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>		
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

### Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, July 18, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Absent:** Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: June 20, 2023
- 2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **June 20, 2023 notes** were approved as written.
- **2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP).** The lead summarized the review for flavors, noting that the annotation was added in 2019. There hasn't been much new data since the annotation was added, although the HS anticipates some feedback at the Fall meeting from one of the organic trade groups. The HS Chair will follow up with that trade group about compiling the data. Stakeholders are supportive of moving to an organic supply. The group discussed sourcing, which is complex given the vast number of flavors in use. A member also added that the relationship between organic flavors and natural flavors also complicates the matter. The HS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove flavors from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP).** The lead summarized the uses and manufacture of ethylene. She noted that there was a 2008 petition to expand the use to pears, which the Board voted against. The group discussed essentiality, and while ethylene is not essential to production, it is essential for transport and organic supply, and without it, items like organic bananas and tomatoes would not be readily available. A member mentioned that the lack of a definition of "tropical" fruit is problematic. The lead will re-review the TR for any additional information about the definition, and make some minor modifications based on the conversation. The HS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove ethylene from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT).** The lead summarized the oxygen review. There were no comments from the Spring 2023 meeting suggesting removal. The CS had no additional discussion, and moved to vote.

Motion to remove oxygen from the National List

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT).** The lead summarized the review for potassium chloride, including uses, manufacture (mined), international acceptance and health/environmental issues, which are minor. There was unanimous support from commenters at the Spring 2023 meeting for retaining the listing. The HS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove potassium chloride from the National List

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD).** The lead summarized the uses and manufacture of FOS. Most commenters at the Spring 2023 meeting were supportive (5 in favor, 2 opposed, and one non-committal). The group had a brief discussion and moved to vote.

Motion to remove fructooligosaccharides (FOS) from the National List

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD).** The lead summarized the review for lecithin, and noted that the public comments centered around availability, suitability, and supply. A member asked about previous reviews of organic lecithin, and couldn't recall if there were food safety concerns due to the Food Safety Modernization Act (FSMA) that prevents it from being an alternative. Members suggested minor modifications to the document and the HS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove lecithin - de-oiled from the National List

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Additional Items.** The HS reviewed the list of items for the next call. See below.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote  
 Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss

July 18, 2023

2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote  
 2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote  
 Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote  
 2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote

August 15, 2023 - may cancel

September 5, 2023  
 September 19, 2023  
 October 3, 2023  
 November 7, 2023  
 November 21, 2023  
 December 5, 2023  
 December 19, 2023

**Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

**Petitioned Substances**

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 8.1.23	Fall 2023

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change</a> <a href="#">FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	8.1.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	8.1.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">04/2019 recommendation to</a> <a href="#">add</a> <a href="#">07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated</a> <a href="#">Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

## Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023

Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, June 20, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: June 6, 2023
- 2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss
- Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - discuss
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **June 6, 2023 notes** were accepted with modifications to the discussion on the 2026 TR requests for yeast, enzymes, and microorganisms.
- **2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN).** The lead summarized alginates and members had a conversation about bioremediation of heavy metals, which was a topic brought up by commenters at the Spring meeting. A member asked about oversight of heavy metals. A member mentioned that there are two different forms of alginates although it is not annotated. The lead will seek additional information and will report back. The HS Chair suggested the lead summarize today's conversation and add it to the review. The Handling Subcommittee moved to a vote.

Motion to remove alginates from the National List

Motion by: DN

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN).** The lead introduced calcium hydroxide and summarized the discussion from the Spring 2023 meeting. The HS had a brief discussion and moved to a vote.

Motion to remove calcium hydroxide from the National List

Motion by: DN

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Rye Pollen Extracts (CD).** The HS is waiting for the TR, and will prepare the review for the Spring 2024 meeting.
- **Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS).** The HS will develop a discussion document for the Fall 2023 meeting, while awaiting the TR. The lead will present a draft for discussion in July or August.
- **Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS).** The HS will develop a discussion document for the Fall 2023 meeting, while awaiting the TR. The lead will present a draft for discussion in July or August.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### Previous HS Notes

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

June 6, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (All). Discuss/vote, send to MS
- 2026 sunset TR determinations: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD)

June 20, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss

July 18, 2023

- 2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - discuss DD/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

#### **Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

## Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 7.18.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Disc. Doc	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 7.18.23	Fall 2023

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	" "

Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “

Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

### Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, June 6, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

**Absent:** Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: May 16, 2023
- Review notes: May 30, 2023
- 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - Vote
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - Vote
- 2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - Vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - Vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (All). Discuss/vote, send to MS
- 2026 sunset TR determinations: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD)
- Additional Items.
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **May 16, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **May 30, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS).** (From May 30 HS notes: The lead summarized the uses of phosphoric acid and noted the feedback from commenters at the Spring meeting. Commenters indicated that phosphoric acid is widely used and essential. They also highlighted the need to discuss sanitizers more broadly, and discussed inconsistencies in annotations. The Chair mentioned the recently approved work agenda request for annotations.) The HS Chair asked for additional comments before moving it a vote.

Motion to remove phosphoric acid from the National List

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: AJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ).** (From May 30 HS notes: The lead reported that there was no discussion on glycerides from the NOSB at the Spring meeting, but there were comments from stakeholders. Most commenters expressed support for relisting. The HS left a question for stakeholders about use of glycerides in ORGANIC products, and if there are alternatives. Earlier comments seemed to focus on conventional products.) The HS Chair asked for additional comments before moving it a vote.

Motion to remove glycerides (mono and di) from the National List

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ).** (From May 30 HS notes: The lead summarized the uses of magnesium stearate and noted comments that it's only used in "made with" organic products. There are little-to-no human health or environmental impacts, and there isn't any concern with this listing. The lead left in questions about alternatives.) The HS Chair asked for additional comments before moving it a vote.

Motion to remove magnesium stearate from the National List

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ).** (From May 30 HS notes: The NOSB discussed at the Spring 2023 meeting the use of sulfur dioxide, but there were not many public comments. The lead noted that no winemakers commented, and the HS would like to hear from them at the Fall 2023 meeting. The HS discussed an updated TR for next time, to include information about metabisulfite and potassium bisulfite, which was mentioned in comments by an Organic certifier.) The HS Chair asked for additional comments before moving it a vote.

Motion to remove sulfur dioxide from the National List

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH).** The lead summarized calcium carbonate noting that it has a wide range of uses: Fruit and vegetable production, antacid, stabilizer, wine production, dietary supplement, etc. All commenters were supportive of re-listing, with one commenter asking that the specific uses be listed. The HS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove calcium carbonate from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH).** Potassium carbonate is an allowed synthetic. It is similar to calcium carbonate in that it has many uses, including the Dutching of cocoa and reduction of sodium. The NOSB received few comments, and most were supportive. One commenter asked that the specific uses and essentiality be listed. The HS moved to a vote.

Motion to remove potassium carbonate from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Research Priorities (All).** The Chair didn't receive any additional comments from members; Therefore, the HS will submit the same list from the Spring meeting to the Materials Subcommittee. A member supported the inclusion of #6 on the list, noting the lack of data – Evaluation of the essentiality of 205.605(a), 205.605(b), and 205.606 substances and the suitability of organic alternatives in applicable

food formulations via laboratory testing, sensory evaluation, and/or market analysis. The Chair will send the list to the MS Chair.

- **2026 sunset TR determinations: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD).** The lead summarized the three substances, and is not recommending new TRs for any of them. He noted that the last round of TRs were from 2014/2015, and upon review, all seemed thorough and comprehensive. Additionally, stakeholders have supported relisting of these three substances, which are all related, but listed separately. Another member mentioned that the CS requested a limited scope TR for citric acid, with specific questions to determine information about GMOs, and perhaps these three substances may also be good candidates for a Limited Scope TR with the same focus. He also noted that certifiers often use the TRs when they are assessing brand name products. The HS will seek information about excluded methods for enzymes, microorganisms, and yeast.

A member mentioned a recent conference she participated in and indicated that the industry is working on enzymes, and the NOSB could potentially receive a petition.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

May 30, 2023 - additional call

- 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (All). Discuss/vote, send to MS
- 2026 sunset TR determinations: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD)

June 20, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss
- Magnesium Carbonate petition - discuss
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - discuss

July 18, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due  
 August 15, 2023  
 September 5, 2023  
 September 19, 2023  
 October 3, 2023  
 November 7, 2023  
 November 21, 2023  
 December 5, 2023  
 December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	DD?	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	DD?	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	DD?	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change</a> <a href="#">FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.20.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a>	7.18.23	“ “

				<a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23		
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: <a href="#">2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> (Lactic acid, <a href="#">fermntd gluc</a> ) TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> (Citric acid) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Citric acid and <a href="#">salts</a> ) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Lactic Acid, Sodium <a href="#">Lactate, and Potassium</a> <a href="#">Lactate</a> ) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - low-to mid-priority	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - if capacity Lower priority	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

## Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, May 30, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Dilip Nandwani (DN); Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT)

**Absent:** Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: May 16, 2023
- 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items.
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **May 16, 2023 notes** were not reviewed due to lack of quorum on today's call.
- **2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS).** The lead summarized the uses of phosphoric acid and noted the feedback from commenters at the Spring meeting. Commenters indicated that phosphoric acid is widely used and essential. They also highlighted the need to discuss sanitizers more broadly, and discussed inconsistencies in annotations. The Chair mentioned the recently approved work agenda request for annotations. The HS will hold the vote on the next call, as there was no quorum.
- **2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ).** The lead reported that there was no discussion on glycerides from the NOSB at the Spring meeting, but there were comments from stakeholders. Most commenters expressed support for relisting. The HS left a question for stakeholders about use of glycerides in ORGANIC products, and if there are alternatives. Earlier comments seemed to focus on conventional products. The HS will hold the vote on the next call, as there was no quorum.
- **2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ).** The lead summarized the uses of magnesium stearate and noted comments that it's only used in "made with" organic products. There are little-to-no human health or environmental impacts, and there isn't any concern with this listing. The lead left in questions about alternatives. The HS will hold the vote on the next call, as there was no quorum.
- **2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ).** The NOSB discussed at the Spring 2023 meeting the use of sulfur dioxide, but there were not many public comments. The lead noted that no winemakers commented, and the HS would like to hear from them at the Fall 2023 meeting. The HS discussed an updated TR for next time, to include information about metabisulfite and potassium bisulfite, which was mentioned in comments by an Organic certifier. The HS will vote on the next call, as there was no quorum.
- **Additional Items.**
  - The NOSB is discussing a work agenda request on sanitizers and will talk further to determine which Subcommittee(s) it would be assigned to. It's likely it will go to Materials as it is crosscutting.
  - Research Priorities. The HS will not modify the research priorities from the Spring 2023 version. The group discussed celery powder, which was previously on the research priorities list, but was removed because it was being researched.

- HS will compile its TR requests and send those to the NOP soon.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### Previous HS Notes

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

May 16, 2023

2026 sunset TR determinations

May 30, 2023 - additional call

- 2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (All). Discuss/vote, send to MS
- 2026 sunset TR determinations: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD)

June 20, 2023

- 2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss proposal/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate petition - discuss proposal
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - discuss proposal

July 18, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

#### **Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

## Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	DD	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	DD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	DD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23	Fall 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018); 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	7.18.23	" "

Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.6.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	6.6.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “

Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	5.30.23 6.6.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	6.20.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	6.20.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - low-to mid-priority	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - if capacity Lower priority	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin) 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

### Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, May 16, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT)

**Absent:** Jerry D'Amore (JD); Logan Petrey (LP)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: April 4, 2023
- 2026 Sunset TR Determinations
  - Calcium citrate, Potassium citrate, Sodium citrate (AJ)
  - Pullulan, Fish Oil, Seaweed (Pacific kombu), Wakame seaweed (DN)
  - Potassium iodide, Potassium phosphate, Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP)
  - L-Malic acid, Ascorbic Acid, Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)
  - Hydrogen peroxide, Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid, Celery powder (WT)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **April 4, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 Sunset TR Determinations**
  - **Calcium citrate, Potassium citrate, Sodium citrate (CD).** The previous TR for these 3 substances is from 2015, and the lead recommended a limited scope TR for any new information regarding use and manufacture.
  - **Pullulan (DN).** No new TR needed.
  - **Fish Oil (DN).** No new TR needed.
  - **Seaweed (Pacific kombu), Wakame seaweed (DN).** No need for new TR.
  - **Potassium iodide (LP).** Requested new TR if there is capacity.
  - **Potassium phosphate (LP).** No new TR needed.
  - **Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP).** No new TR needed.
  - **L-Malic acid (NL).** The TR is more recent, so no need for a new one. The lead noted that L-Malic acid is misclassified. Reclassification is a work agenda item.
  - **Ascorbic Acid (NL).** TR is from 2019, so no new TR requested.
  - **Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL).** The lead noted that the conversation about citric and lactic acid is similar to the calcium potassium and sodium citrates, and they involve fermentation. The last TR for lactic acid was in 2015, and the HS may request a limited scope TR. The lead will do some additional reading/research to determine whether they need to request a TR.
  - The Materials Subcommittee has been talking about adding a work agenda item to look at fermentation products as a whole. The group discussed the merits of a TR versus a panel. Given the broad nature of the topic, and that it's a process, not a substance, and panel may be better mechanism to address fermentation/processes.
  - **Hydrogen peroxide (WT).** May request a new TR.
  - **Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT).** The group discussed these substances in relation to sanitizers. May request a TR.
  - **Celery powder (WT).** There has never been a TR for celery powder. Given the precedent of requesting TRs for substances that have never had one, or are more than 10 + years old, the HS will request a TR. The group also mentioned a celery powder working group convened several years ago by a Trade Organization, and will review the outcomes. A member mentioned that

celery powder was removed from the NOSB Research priorities because research was underway.

- **Additional Items.**
  - The 2026 draft sunsets will be due shortly after the Fall NOSB meeting. Given that the Crops Subcommittee's 2026 sunsets are due November 28, Handling sunset drafts will be due to the Chair December 1, for discussion on December 5.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

## [Previous HS Notes](#)

### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

2026 sunset TR determinations

April 18, 2023 - No call, public comment webinars

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

2026 sunset TR determinations

May 30, 2023 - additional call

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote

Research Priorities (All). Discuss/vote, send to MS

2026 sunset TR determinations: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD)

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote

Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss proposal/vote

Magnesium Carbonate petition - discuss proposal

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - discuss proposal

July 18, 2023

2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023  
 November 7, 2023  
 November 21, 2023  
 December 5, 2023  
 December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	DD	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	DD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	DD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR due to NOP 8.25.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	6.6.23	Fall 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023

Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 3.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23 7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	3.15.22 11.27.23 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “

Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 5.30.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	3.15.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “

Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
----------------	------------	----	---	---	--------------------------------	-----

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (maybe combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> (Animal Enzymes) TR: <a href="#">2015</a> (Animal Enzymes) <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - low-to mid-priority	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “

<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - if capacity Lower priority	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 6.6.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WD	TBD	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

## Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, April 4, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Absent:** Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Nate Lewis (NL); Logan Petrey (LP)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: March 21, 2023
- 2026 sunsets: Assign sunsets to NL, assign TR determination dates, assign editing buddies
- Discuss public comments
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **March 21, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 sunsets: Assign sunsets to NL, assign TR determination dates, assign editing buddies.**
  - The group discussed the list of 2026 sunsets, and will request new TRs for 5 substances: perlite, activated charcoal, tocopherols, calcium chloride, and magnesium sulfate (low to medium priority). The LS Chair supported requesting a TR for magnesium sulfate in Handling since it is also being reviewed in Livestock.
  - The HS discussed review buddies, and the process for determining who will review what, as well as the timeline and deadlines for reviews.
- **Discuss public comments.** The NOSB has received few unique comments at the moment, and many comments pertaining to two letter writing campaigns.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

March 21, 2023

2026 sunset TRs - assign leads

Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss draft proposal

Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - Assign lead

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - Assign lead

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

2026 sunset TR determinations

April 18, 2023 - No call, public comment webinars

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

May 30, 2023 - additional call

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

- 2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss proposal/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate petition - discuss proposal
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - discuss proposal

July 18, 2023

- 2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote
- 2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	TBD	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	TBD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	TBD

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	TBD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	TBD
-------------------------------	---------	----	-----	--	--------------------	-----

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	12.20.22 1.17.23	Spr 2023
Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal	KS	<a href="#">NOP request to review ion exchange filtration 08/2019</a> <a href="#">NOP response memo sent to HS 10/2021</a>	1.17.23 2.7.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 3.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23 7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also request in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22.	3.15.22 1.17.23 7.18.23	“ “

				Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23		
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	3.15.22 11.27.23 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 5.30.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “

Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009 (Lecithin-bleached)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	3.15.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Animal Enzymes)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Animal Enzymes)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - low-to mid-priority	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y – Lmt’d Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, March 21, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Logan Petrey (LP); Nate Lewis (NL); Jerry D'Amore (JD)

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: March 7, 2023
- New member introductions
- 2026 Sunset Selection
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD +) - discuss draft proposal
- Magnesium Carbonate petition - Assign lead, Petition sufficiency
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - Assign lead, Petition sufficiency
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **March 7, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **New member introductions.** The Handling Subcommittee welcomed a new member.
- **2026 Sunset Selection.** The Chair assigned the 2026 sunsets and will revisit the list to re-assign some to the new member.
- **Rye Pollen Extracts (CD).** CD completed the initial review to determine if the petition was complete. The petitioners responded to additional questions from the Subcommittee, and the HS will request a TR.
- **Magnesium Carbonate petition.** The HS Chair volunteered to be lead author and summarized the petition for the group. Magnesium Carbonate was previously listed, and allowed in "made with" organic. It was removed from the list in 2017. The lead finds the petition sufficient, and the HS determined the need for a TR.
- **Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition.** The HS Chair volunteered to be lead author and the HS will combine both petitions (Magnesium Carbonate and Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide) and review them together.
- **Additional Items.** The members discussed using buddy reviewers and the Chair will send out information about that with her next email.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

March 7, 2023

2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - TR Sufficiency  
Magnesium Carbonate petition - Assign lead  
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - Assign lead

March 21, 2023

2026 sunset TRs - assign leads  
Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss draft proposal  
Magnesium Carbonate petition (KS) - Assign lead  
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition (KS) - Assign lead

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

2026 sunset TR determinations

April 18, 2023 - No call, public comment webinars

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

2026 sunset TR determinations

May 30, 2023 - additional call

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote

Rye Pollen Extracts (CD) - discuss proposal/vote

Magnesium Carbonate petition - discuss proposal

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - discuss proposal

July 18, 2023

2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023

October 3, 2023

November 7, 2023

November 21, 2023

December 5, 2023

December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	TBD	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	TBD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	TBD
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	TBD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23	3.21.23 6.20.23	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	12.20.22 1.17.23	Spr 2023
Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal	KS	<a href="#">NOP request to review ion exchange filtration 08/2019</a> <a href="#">NOP response memo sent to HS 10/2021</a>	1.17.23 2.7.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 3.7.23 7.18.23	" "

Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 <b>12.20.22</b> 6.20.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 <b>1.17.23</b> 7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	3.15.22 <b>1.17.23</b> 7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 <b>12.6.22</b> 6.6.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	3.15.22 11.27.23 <b>12.6.22</b> 6.6.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 <b>1.17.23</b> 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 <b>1.3.23</b> 5.30.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 <b>1.3.23</b> 5.30.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 <b>12.20.22</b> 5.30.23	“ “

Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	3.15.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)	CD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)	LP		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)	JD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Animal Enzymes)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Animal Enzymes)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)	KS		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)	AJ		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)	JD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)	KH		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)	LP		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)	DN		Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)	JD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)	KH		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)	KS		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)	CD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)	KH		Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)	AJ		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)	WT		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)	AJ		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)	WT		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)	CD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)	LP		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)	LP		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)	CD		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)	KS		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)	WT		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)	DN		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)	KH		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)	KS		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)	DN		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)	DN		Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, March 7, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP)

**Absent:** Logan Petrey (LP); Allison Johnson (AJ), Vice Chair

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: February 7, 2023
- Review 2nd Semester schedule
  - 2025 sunset reviews
  - 2026 sunsets assignments (TR sufficiency and due dates after fall meeting)
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD + ) - discuss proposal
- 2025 Sunsets: Flavors (LP) - TR Sufficiency
- Magnesium Carbonate petition - Assign lead
- Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - Assign lead
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **February 7, 2023 notes** were approved as written.
- **Review 2nd Semester schedule.** The 2025 sunset reviews are due to the HS Chair May 19, 2023, and the discussion dates are noted in the table below. Fall proposals are due to NOP by August 10, 2023.
- **2025 sunset reviews.** The HS will strive to submit the final drafts of the 2025 sunsets to the HS Chair by May 19, so the HS can discuss and vote on them prior to the August submission deadline. The HS scheduled presentation dates (see below) and the Chair will follow up with AJ to schedule the few remaining substances. The group discussed the review process and shared ideas about how to be most efficient while still being thorough. NOP will prep and send the draft sunset templates for the Fall review. The Chair and lead scheduled the following three sunsets after the HS meeting, and the discussion dates were added below.

2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote

- **2026 sunsets assignments (TR determinations and due dates after fall meeting).** The HS Chair will assign the 2026 sunsets and let everyone know by early April.
- **Rye Pollen Extracts (CD + ) - discuss proposal.** Deferred to next call.
- **2025 Sunsets: Flavors (LP) - TR Sufficiency.** The lead summarized the Limited Scope TR, and the HS determined it was sufficient. The Chair will send an email to the NOP confirming.
- **Magnesium Carbonate petition - Assign lead.** Deferred to next call.
- **Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - Assign lead.** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

February 7, 2023

Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS) - discuss proposal

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Potassium carbonate (KH)

Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - TR sufficiency

February 21, 2023 - cancelled

March 7, 2023

2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - TR Sufficiency

Magnesium Carbonate petition - Assign lead

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - Assign lead

March 21, 2023

2026 sunset TRs - assign leads

Rye Pollen Extracts (CD + ) - discuss draft proposal

Magnesium Carbonate petition - Assign lead

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - Assign lead

April 4, 2023

Discuss public comments

2026 sunset TR determinations

April 18, 2023 - No call, public comment webinars

May 2, 2023 - canceled

May 16, 2023

2026 sunset TR determinations

May 30, 2023 - additional call

2025 Sunset: Phosphoric acid (KS) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Magnesium stearate (AJ) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Sulfur dioxide (AJ) - discuss/vote

June 6, 2023

2025 Sunset: Alginates (DN) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Calcium hydroxide(DN) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Calcium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss/vote

June 20, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Gums (Gellan gum, Xanthan, (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean), Tamarind seed, tragacanth (CD) - discuss/vote

Rye Pollen Extracts (CD + ) - discuss proposal/vote

Magnesium Carbonate petition - discuss proposal

Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide petition - discuss proposal

July 18, 2023

2025 Sunset: Flavors (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Oxygen (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Potassium chloride (WT) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Ethylene (LP) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD) - discuss/vote

2025 Sunset: Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - discuss/vote

August 1, 2023 last call before proposals due

August 15, 2023

September 5, 2023

September 19, 2023  
 October 3, 2023  
 November 7, 2023  
 November 21, 2023  
 December 5, 2023  
 December 19, 2023

### Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

### Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD + TBD	TBD	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23.	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.21.23 6.20.23	Fall 2023
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	TBD	TBD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23.	3.21.23 6.20.23	TBD
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	TBD	TBD	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23.	3.21.23 6.20.23	TBD

### Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Fall 2023 list Due to MS by Jul 21, 2023	12.20.22 1.17.23	Spr 2023
Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal	KS	<a href="#">NOP request to review ion exchange filtration 08/2019</a> <a href="#">NOP response memo sent to HS 10/2021</a>	1.17.23 2.7.23	Spr 2023

### 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Con tact	TR Re quest?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023

Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 3.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 3.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23 7.18.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 7.18.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	3.15.22 11.27.23 12.6.22 6.6.23	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also request ed in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “

Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 5.30.23	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 6.6.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 5.30.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 7.18.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 2.7.23 7.18.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	3.15.22 1.3.23 6.20.23	“ “

Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22 6.20.23	“ “
----------------	------------	----	---	---	--------------------------------	-----

## 2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
<a href="#">Acids (Citric and Lactic)</a>	205.605(a)(1)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc)</a> TAP: <a href="#">1995 (Citric acid)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric acid and salts)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
<a href="#">Calcium chloride</a>	205.605(a)(7)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Enzymes</a>	205.605(a)(11)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011 (Animal Enzymes)</a> TR: <a href="#">2015 (Animal Enzymes)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">L-Malic acid</a>	205.605(a)(16)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Magnesium sulfate</a>	205.605(a)(18)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Microorganisms</a>	205.605(a)(19)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Perlite</a>	205.605(a)(22)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1996</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium iodide</a>	205.605(a)(24)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">1995</a> TR: <a href="#">2011</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Pullulan</a>	205.605(a)(25)			Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2018</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Yeast</a>	205.605(a)(30)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2014</a> TR: <a href="#">2014 (Microorganisms)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Activated charcoal</a>	205.605(b)(2)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Activated Carbon)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ascorbic acid</a>	205.605(b)(6)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Calcium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(7)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Collagen gel</a>	205.605(b)(13)			Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Ferrous sulfate</a>	205.605(b)(15)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 NVM</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Hydrogen peroxide</a>	205.605(b)(17)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Crops)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Nutrient vitamins and minerals</a>	205.605(b)(20)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid</a>	205.605(b)(22)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 Handling</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(25)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Potassium phosphate</a>	205.605(b)(28)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium acid pyrophosphate</a>	205.605(b)(30)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate)</a> TR: <a href="#">2016 (Phosphates)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Sodium citrate</a>	205.605(b)(31)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015 (Citric Acid and Salts)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Tocopherols</a>	205.605(b)(36)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Celery powder</a>	205.606(c)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Fish oil</a>	205.606(f)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2015</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 Fish-based fertilizers</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Gelatin</a>	205.606(h)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: <a href="#">2002 (Gelatin)</a> TR: <a href="#">2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “

<a href="#">Orange pulp, dried</a>	205.606(m)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Seaweed, Pacific kombu</a>	205.606(q)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.23	“ “
<a href="#">Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)</a>	205.606(t)			Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: <a href="#">2016 (Marine Plants &amp; Algae -Organic Production and Handling)</a> <a href="#">2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699</a>	3.21.23 4.4.2323	“ “

## Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, February 7, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Kim Huseman (KH); Allison Johnson (AJ); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Absent:** Logan Petrey (LP)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: January 17, 2023
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Potassium carbonate (KH)
  - Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - TR sufficiency
  - Flavors (LP/KS) - TR Sufficiency
  - Ethylene (LP/KS) - TR Sufficiency
- Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS) - discuss proposal
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **January 17, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2025 Sunsets: Discuss review**
  - **Potassium carbonate (KH).** The TR was found sufficient on the last call. The lead summarized the uses and manufacturing processes of potassium carbonate, and the group had a brief discussion. The lead will make some minor modifications and will send the final version to the Chair/NOP for posting for the Spring meeting.
  - **Lecithin - de-oiled (JD).** The lead indicated that the Limited Scope TR is sufficient, and it provided the information they were seeking. At the last sunset review the Board voted to retain de-oiled lecithin and noted that organic supply was adequate but not necessarily suitable. The lead will finalize the document and the HS will submit it for the Spring meeting.
  - **Flavors (LP/KS).** The lead looked briefly at the newly received TR, and found it comprehensive, but indicated that she is not ready to call it sufficient at this time. Once the HS finds it sufficient, the NOP will post it on the website, and it will be available for public review. The group discussed flavors and organic availability, and will add a question for public comment about the potential impacts of removing flavors from the list. The lead will make some minor modifications to the draft document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
  - **Ethylene (LP/KS).** The lead summarized the uses of ethylene and noted that she updated the draft review with the information from the new TR. The TR was found sufficient, and the HS will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS).** The lead edited the previous version of the document to highlight feedback from the Subcommittee members and comments from stakeholders, and the HS discussed it. The proposal will be included on the agenda for the Spring meeting.

Motion to approve the recommendation that resins used in ion exchange do not need to be on the National List.

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: WT

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

**Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

January 17, 2023

- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Flavors (LP)
  - Ethylene (LP)
  - Oxygen (WT)
  - Potassium chloride (WT)
  - Potassium carbonate (KH)
- Research Priorities (KS) - discuss list
- Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS) - discuss proposal

February 7, 2023

- Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS) - discuss proposal
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Potassium carbonate (KH)
  - Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - TR sufficiency

February 21, 2023

- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD + ) - discuss proposal
- Flavors (LP) - TR Sufficiency

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

**Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

**Petitioned Substances**

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD + TBD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23.	9.20.22 10.4.22 3.7.23	Fall 2023

**Other Projects**

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD

Research Priorities	KS/All	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	12.20.22 1.17.23	Spr 2023
Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal	KS	<a href="#">NOP request to review ion exchange filtration 08/2019</a> <a href="#">NOP response memo sent to HS 10/2021</a>	1.17.23 2.7.23	Spr 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend</a> <a href="#">Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23 2.21.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006 (Gellan Gum)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.17.23	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “

Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	3.15.22 11.27.23 12.6.22	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023. TR sent to HS 1.25.23. Sufficiency due 3.26.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 1.17.23 2.7.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 2.7.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “

Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009 (Lecithin-bleached)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 2.1.23. Sufficiency due 4.2.23. TR found sufficient 2.7.23	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 2.7.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	3.15.22 1.3.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## **Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes** **Tuesday, January 17, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Kim Huseman (KH); Allison Johnson (AJ); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

**Absent:** Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### **Agenda**

- Review notes: January 3, 2023
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Flavors (LP)
  - Ethylene (LP)
  - Oxygen (WT)
  - Potassium chloride (WT) - TR sufficiency
  - Potassium carbonate (KH)
- Research Priorities (KS) - discuss list
- Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS)
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD +) - review next steps
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### **Discussion**

- **January 3, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2025 Sunsets: Discuss review**
  - **Flavors (LP).** The lead summarized the draft review. Flavors are used in a wide array of products, are used internationally, and there are little-to-no environmental or human health issues. The lead included questions to stakeholders about organic alternatives. The group discussed the similarity to the colors listing.
  - **Ethylene (LP).** The lead summarized the uses, manufacture, and international acceptance, and will flush out the review once the TR is available. Waiting for a TR for ethylene in both Handling and Crops. For Crop use, ethylene is used for pineapple flowering. The group suggested questions for public comment.
  - **Oxygen (WT).** The lead summarized the draft review of oxygen, including uses, manufacture, and international acceptance. Members discussed the international section and how best to complete it.
  - **Potassium chloride (WT) - TR sufficiency.** The lead presented a summary of the review, noting that it is under review in both Crops and Handling. He also discussed the TR, which was meant to cover both scopes, but seemed to focus more on crops than handling. The TR was found to be thorough and comprehensive, and the Handling Subcommittee found it sufficient, but will verify that with the Crops subcommittee before sending the final confirmation to the NOP.
  - **Potassium carbonate (KH).** Deferred to next call.
- **Research Priorities (KS).** The group reviewed the previous list of research priorities and the lead asked for help augmenting some of the draft language. The Chair will finalize the document and send it to the Materials Subcommittee.
- **Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS).** The lead summarized the current draft review, and will follow up with an email to members seeking advice on how to move forward.

- **Rye Pollen Extracts (CD +) - review next steps.** Waiting for a response from the petitioner with answers to questions.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### Previous HS Notes

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

January 3, 2023

- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Tamarind seed gum (CD)
  - Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ)
  - Magnesium stearate (AJ)
  - Sulfur dioxide (AJ)
  - Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD)
  - Lecithin - de-oiled (JD)
  - Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss TR sufficiency

January 17, 2023

- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Flavors (LP)
  - Ethylene (LP)
  - Oxygen (WT)
  - Potassium chloride (WT)
  - Potassium carbonate (KH)
- Research Priorities (KS) - discuss list
- Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS) - discuss proposal

February 7, 2023

- Ion Exchange - Resins proposal (KS) - discuss proposal
- Rye Pollen Extracts (CD + ) - discuss proposal (pending petitioner response)
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Potassium carbonate (KH)
  - Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - TR sufficiency (if available)

February 21, 2023

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

#### **Work Agenda**

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

## Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD + TBD	TBD	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to petitioner 10.4.22. Response due ~1.15.23	9.20.22 10.4.22 2.7.23	Spr 2023

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	12.20.22 1.17.23	Spr 2023
Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal	KS	<a href="#">NOP request to review ion exchange filtration 08/2019</a> <a href="#">NOP response memo sent to HS 10/2021</a>	1.17.23 2.7.23	Spr 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend</a> <a href="#">Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023	3.15.22 1.17.23	" "
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	" "
Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23	" "

Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 2.7.23	“ “
Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “

Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009</a> (Lecithin-bleached) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR due end Jan. 2023	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 2.7.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	3.15.22 1.3.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “

### Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

## Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes Tuesday, January 3, 2023 1:00 pm ET

**Present:** Kyla Smith (KS), Chair; Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Kim Huseman (KH); Allison Johnson (AJ); Logan Petrey (LP)

**Absent:** Dilip Nandwani (DN)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

### Agenda

- Review notes: December 20, 2022
- 2025 Sunsets: Discuss review
  - Tamarind seed gum (CD)
  - Lecithin - de-oiled (JD)
  - Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD)
  - Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss TR sufficiency
  - Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ)
  - Magnesium stearate (AJ)
  - Sulfur dioxide (AJ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

### Discussion

- **December 20 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2025 Sunsets: Discuss review**
  - **Tamarind seed gum (CD).** The lead summarized the uses of tamarind seed gum, noting that it was added to the National List in 2020 so this is its first sunset review. Tamarind seed gum is sourced from a tree, and is considered Generally Recognized as Safe (GRAS). The HS will add a note to the review about including tamarind seed gum in any future TRs and summary tables on gums.
  - **Lecithin - de-oiled (JD).** The HS is expecting a limited scope TR, and will discuss lecithin again once they receive it. The lead summarized the draft review, including uses, manufacture, and international uses. During the last sunset review, it was determined that there was not sufficient organic supply, and the HS added a question to the current review to determine if that is still the case. A member suggested adding a question about other oil seeds and whether or not they are used to produce lecithin. The group also discussed sufficient and suitable organic alternatives.
  - **Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD).** The lead summarized the review, including uses, manufacture, and international uses. At the last sunset review, the NOSB and stakeholders were supportive of relisting. The HS will include a question about the availability of organic supply. The lead will forward the review to the HS Chair for submission to the NOP.
  - **Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the new TR, and the HS found the TR thorough and sufficient. The HS is also recommending that the TR writer clarify the use of the phrase "pearl ash". The lead will complete the sunset review for discussion on the next call.
  - **Magnesium stearate (AJ).** The lead summarized the review, noting that it is not used much in organic because it is limited to products with the "made with organic" label. Mainly used as a flow agent and in supplements. The lead will forward the review to the HS Chair for submission to the NOP.

- **Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ).** The lead summarized the review of glycerides. The HS included question about alternatives. The lead will forward the review to the HS Chair for submission to the NOP.
- **Sulfur dioxide (AJ).** The lead summarized the review for sulfur dioxide, which has been used since Greek and Roman times as a preservative in wine and food. Internationally, the EU, Canada, and Codex allow sulfites in some form or quantity. The US has robust labeling requirements regarding sulfites. The lead included a distinct section in the review on health issues. The lead included several questions for stakeholders about use, forms, and labeling.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

### [Previous HS Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule (1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).**

December 20, 2022 (Allison out)

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Phosphoric acid (KS)

Gellan gum (high-acyl form only) (CD)

Xanthan gum (CD)

Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean) (CD)

Tragacanth gum (CD)

January 3, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Tamarind seed gum (CD)

Glycerides (mono and di) (AJ)

Magnesium stearate (AJ)

Sulfur dioxide (AJ)

Fructooligosaccharides (FOS) (JD)

Lecithin - de-oiled (JD)

Potassium carbonate (KH) - discuss TR sufficiency

January 17, 2023

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Flavors (LP)

Ethylene (LP)

Oxygen (WT)

Potassium chloride (WT)

Potassium carbonate (KH)

Research Priorities (KS) - discuss list

Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal (KS) - discuss proposal

February 7, 2023

Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal (KS) - discuss proposal

2025 Sunsets: Discuss review

Lecithin - de-oiled (JD) - TR sufficiency (if available)

February 21, 2023

March 7, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 4, 2023

April 18, 2023

## Work Agenda

\*Highlight indicates discussion. \*Highlight indicates action needed. \*Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

## Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD + TBD	TBD	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23	9.20.22 10.4.22	Spr 2023

## Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc	TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	KS/All	Due to MS by Jan 20, 2023	12.20.22 1.17.23	Spr 2023
Ion Exchange - Resins Proposal	KS	<a href="#">NOP request to review ion exchange filtration 08/2019</a> <a href="#">NOP response memo sent to HS 10/2021</a>	1.17.23 2.7.23	Spr 2023

## 2025 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2022), Summary (Spr 2023), Review (Fall 2023)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Calcium carbonate	205.605(a)	KH	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22	Summary: Spr 2023 Review: Fall 2023
Flavors	205.605(a)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2005</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">2015/Fall - Rec to Amend</a> <a href="#">Annot</a> <a href="#">83 FR 66559 (Annotation change FR) (2018);</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Gellan gum (high-acyl form only)	205.605(a)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> (Gums) <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> (Gellan Gum) <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “

Oxygen	205.605(a)	WT	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 TR: NA <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Potassium chloride	205.605(a)	WT	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 1.31.23	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Alginates	205.605(b)	DN	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Calcium hydroxide	205.605(b)	DN	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> TR sent to HS 11.25.22. Suff due 1.24.23. TR found sufficient 11.27.22	3.15.22 12.6.22	“ “
Ethylene	205.605(b)	LP	Y - also requested in Crops	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1999</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 1.17.23	“ “
Glycerides (mono and di)	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Magnesium stearate	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Phosphoric acid	205.605(b)	KS	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2021</a> <a href="#">TR: 2003</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Potassium carbonate	205.605(b)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew 05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a> Draft TR sent to HS 12.2.22. Sufficiency due 01.31.23. TR found sufficient 1.3.23	3.15.22 1.3.23 1.17.23	“ “

Sulfur dioxide	205.605(b)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2011</a> <a href="#">TAP: 1995</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Xanthan gum	205.605(b)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Fructooligosaccharides (FOS)	205.606(g)	JD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2015</a> <a href="#">TR: 2006</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23	“ “
Gums - water extracted only (Arabic; Guar; Locust bean; and Carob bean)	205.606(j)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “
Lecithin - de-oiled	205.606(l)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2009 (Lecithin-bleached)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 4.5.22 5.17.22 1.3.23 2.7.23	“ “
Tamarind seed gum	205.606(r)	CD	N	Sunset date: 12/7/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Add</a>	3.15.22 1.3.23	“ “
Tragacanth gum	205.606(s)	CD	N	Sunset date: 6/22/2025 <a href="#">TR: 2018 (Gums)</a> <a href="#">2018/Fall - Rec to Renew</a> <a href="#">05/07/2020, 85 FR 27105</a>	3.15.22 12.20.22	“ “

## Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week

Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	