

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and  
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, November 9, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Chair, Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR), NOSB Secretary, CACS Chair; Steve Ela (SE), NOSB Vice Chair, Crops Chair; Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair emeritus; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair

**Absent:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair

**Staff:** Jenny Tucker (JT); Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Clarissa Mathews (CM)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of October 12, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - HB**
  - Debrief of Fall meeting
  - Work agenda suggestions from Subcommittees
  - Check work agenda for accuracy
  - Questions for Jenny and Paul?
  - Status of paper pots/NOP notice to certifiers
  - Biodegradable-biobased mulch work agenda request response
  - Early posting of documents for public comment
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Finalize Fall 2018 recommendations
  - Notice announcing Spring 2019 meeting
  - Spring milestones
  - Timeline for posting Subcommittee notes, work agendas, Exec notes
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
  - Crops (CS) - SE.
  - Livestock (LS) - AS.
  - Handling (HS) - LD.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of October 12, 2018** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - HB**
  - The new NOSB Chair and outgoing Chair met to discuss the transfer of duties. They discussed Subcommittee rosters and the succession plan for the transition that will occur in 2020 when

- five members rotate off. The NOSB Chair will contact the Subcommittee Chairs to discuss these changes.
- **Debrief of Fall meeting.**
    - Members provided feedback about their impressions of the Fall meeting, praising the collaboration between the NOP and NOSB, and the transparency, respectfulness, and support.
    - Members also commented on the sound and microphone issues, comfortable chairs for prolonged sitting, and the process of using the petition discussion document while waiting for a TR or prepping a proposal.
  - **Work agenda suggestions from Subcommittees.** There were no new suggestions.
  - The LS thanked the NOP for approving the vaccines for excluded methods work agenda item. The entire board expressed their appreciation to the NOP for its consideration and decision to extend the deadline for use of paper pots.
  - Fatty alcohols was re-petitioned, and is currently under review by NOP. The NOP anticipates it will be sent to the Subcommittee soon.
  - Status of paper pots/NOP notice to certifiers. Members thanked the NOP for making the decision to extend the expiration date for use of paper pots. The NOP and the Crops Subcommittee will keep this a high priority so it comes to conclusion quickly.
  - Biodegradable biobased mulch. The NOP will likely issue a memo to the NOSB requesting the Board move this from the “hold” list and resume its review once it determines the scope of the request. The Board has received and continues to receive public comments on this topic, and appreciates the NOP’s willingness to move it forward.
  - Early posting of documents for public comment.
  - A member emphasized the importance of making sure that the public has 30 days to submit comments. At the Board meeting in St. Paul the NOP and NOSB discussed posting proposals as they are submitted, as opposed to submitting them all at once at the end.
  - NOP is enthusiastic about the use of the open docket, and will explore a way to clear the documents for posting at the NOP level.
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
    - NOP reminded the group about the upcoming webinar on the Management Learning System (MLS) on November 15. The webinar was announced in an Organic Insider.
    - The NOP recently held the third webinar in a series of three on verifying documents in International Trade. The webinar was well attended by accredited certifiers. These documents will eventually be added to the LMS.
    - There are a couple of National List rules in clearance.
    - The NOP emphasized the importance of clear language and strong justifications in the NOSB recommendations, sunset reviews, and petition reviews. This will support the next phase of rule writing.
  - **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
    - Finalize Fall 2018 recommendations. Recommendations are due to NOP November 16.
    - The Federal Register Notice announcing the Spring 2019 meeting is in clearance and should be published soon.
    - The Spring NOSB/NOP milestones were updated and can be found on the table below.
  - **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
    - Crops (CS) - SE. Crops met earlier this week. During the call they discussed outcomes from the NOSB Fall meeting, discussed the Allyl Isothiocyanate (AITC) petition, discussed the approval by NOP to resume work on biodegradable biobased mulch, assigned leads for the 2021 sunset substances, and discussed paper pots and how best to move forward. The CS is leaning towards broadening the review to include all paper products, and considered the need for a TR. The Subcommittee also rescheduled a call in January, because the first call fell on January 1.

- Livestock (LS) - AS. The Livestock Subcommittee has not met since the Fall NOSB meeting, but received the approval to work on vaccines produced through excluded methods. The LS would also like to discuss additional work agenda items and will do that on a future call.
- Handling (HS) - LD. HS has had one call since the Fall meeting. The group discussed potential work agenda items, the sunset review of lecithin and whether to split the listing or annotate it, and petitions for substances for 205.606. The NOSB is seeking a process by which they can determine commercial availability by asking more pointed questions of the petitioners. During the call, the HS assigned leads to some of the 2021 sunsets, and have some to complete.
- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The Materials Subcommittee will reconvene next week for the first time after the Fall NOSB meeting. The group will be working on the integrity of seed document, for which the NOSB received positive feedback. The MS will also proceed with its work on sanitizers. The group discussed whether to convene an expert panel or request a TR. While a panel could be useful to the immediate Board, the MS felt that a TR would be most useful to them when developing a reference document for future Boards. At this time, the Subcommittee is still discussing the options and questions they are seeking answers to. The MS Chair shared her experience of touring the Ecolab facility in St. Paul.
- Policy Development (PDS) - DS. The PDS Chair would like to convene the PDS in December and January to make some minor modifications to the PPM that we have been collected over the last several months.
- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACCS) - SR. The CACCS continues to discuss the oil and gas extraction request, and will also be discussing how to move forward with the import integrity projects. The CACCS is meeting next week and anticipate sending a work agenda request to the NOP regarding the oil and gas extraction. The CACCS has discussed various formats and will continue to discuss the goals. This could take the form of formalized best practices that would give organic producers a tool to use if they are affected by oil and gas extraction activities, and provide support for mitigation.
- **Additional Items.**
  - The outgoing NOSB Chair offered words of support and encouragement for the incoming Chair.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)  
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

October 12, 2018  
 November 9, 2018  
 December 14, 2018  
 January 14, 2019  
 February 11, 2019  
 March 11, 2019  
 April 8, 2019  
 May 13, 2019  
 June 10, 2019  
 July 8, 2019  
 August 12, 2019  
 September 9, 2019  
 October 14, 2019 Columbus day  
 November 11, 2019 Veterans day  
 December 9, 2019

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 2 <del>6</del> , 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and  
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, October 12, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Jesse

**Absent:** Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Ashley Swaffer (AS), Livestock Chair

**Staff:** Jennifer Tucker (JT); Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Clarissa Mathews (CM)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of September 21, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
  - Status of open NOSB work agenda requests
  - Status of Mexico equivalency
  - Impacts on NOP and NOSB of the Farm Bill not being finalized
  - Status of funding for enforcement activities
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Webinar practice reminder
  - Meeting logistics
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
  - Crops (CS) - SE.
  - Livestock (LS) - AS.
  - Handling (HS) - LD.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of September 21, 2018** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - The NOSB Chair has been working with NOP on meeting details.
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
  - Status of open NOSB work agenda requests
    - Use of antibiotics in pre-two-day old chicks. The USDA reviewed the work agenda request and denied it, citing a lack of authority by the USDA over this specific topic area. An Executive Committee member asked about the possibility of appealing USDA's decision. The NOP indicated it must follow provisions of OFPA, which says that antibiotics cannot be used after the first day of life. While there is no formal appeal

process, stakeholders could engage their congressional representatives if they would like modifications to OFPA.

- Use of vaccines made with excluded methods on organic livestock - annotation. This request is under review by the USDA.
- Celery powder panel. The NOSB and NOP are working together to identify possible panelists, including a person with expertise in exposure to nitrates/nitrites and possible human health effects.
- Status of Mexico equivalency
  - USDA is continuing discussions with Mexico about organic equivalency. Compliance and enforcement is a key component, and Mexico is currently addressing activities in this area. NOP will provide an update to stakeholders during the Fall 2018 NOSB meeting.
- Impacts on NOP and NOSB of farm bill not being finalized.
  - Technology. Technology modernization is a top priority, and the NOP was able to spend the FY 2018 funding designated for technology upgrades to enhance the organic integrity database, develop an export certificate system, and procure an accreditation management system.
  - Cost share. Effects may be minimal at this time as the money is paid out in the future. Since the Cost share program was moved to the Farm Service Agency (FSA), it does not impact NOP's budget. The government is currently operating under a continuing resolution (CR) at 2018 budget levels, and the cost share program had a \$12M appropriation in the FY 2018 budget.
  - Enforcement activities. The FY 2018 funds dedicated to enforcement activities have been spent.
- Learning Management System (LMS). The NOP will hold a virtual townhall on November 15 to gather community feedback.
- There was a recent publication about fraudulent grains in Iowa/Nebraska. The NOP is aware of the case, which is ongoing, and is pleased at the support from other agencies in the protection of organic integrity.
- There are several National List rules in progress. One rule (AMS-NOP-14-05), currently in clearance, contains 35 substances and likely won't be completed before the Fall 2018 NOSB meeting. The second rule (AMS-NOP-17-09) addresses two (2) NOSB recommendations from the Fall 2017 NOSB meeting. Regarding the process for rules, the NOP publishes a proposed rule and provides an opportunity for public comments. NOP then considers the comments while developing a final rule. Preparation of proposed and final rules includes a Department clearance process, which includes a review by USDA's Office of General Counsel (OGC).
- The NOP noted that the rule with 35 items (AMS-NOP-14-05) would likely publish first.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Webinar practice reminder. The NOSB Chair will have to leave the webinar a little early and the NOSB Vice Chair will facilitate.
  - The ABS mentioned meeting logistics including travel arrangements and various documents.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The CACS has two proposals: Inspector qualifications and training, and accreditation criteria and oversight. The CACS Chair noted that these are not controversial and doesn't anticipate them being sent back to Subcommittee for additional work. The CACS will also provide a verbal update on the oversight of imports
  - Crops (CS) - SE. The CS identified a couple of topics that will likely elicit more comments and need more time for discussion: Natamycin, and paper pots. The Chair doesn't anticipate sending anything back to Subcommittee. The lead for the proposal on Strengthening the Organic Seed Guidance intends on talking about seed searches in relation to the doc. There is great interest

- among the community about paper pots. Sodium citrate is also a substance that will require a bit more discussion.
- Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS will have a longer discussion about vaccines, but don't anticipate it will be removed from the list. Sucrose Octanoate Esters will also warrant additional discussion as they are not currently EPA registered. A member noted that while they are not used in the US, they are in use internationally, and most of it comes from Brazil.
  - Handling (HS) - LD. The HS has several proposals and many sunset reviews. The Subcommittee received lots of comments on sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS has two proposals – excluded methods determination, and the genetic integrity of seed on organic land. The Subcommittee may need to add some wording to clarify the excluded methods document, which they feel would not be substantive. Many commenters suggested the proposal be reorganized. An MS member suggested writing a coversheet to attach to the original proposal with explanation of the clarified format.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. No update. If the use of the petition discussion document goes well, then the NOSB proposes that it get codified in the PPM.
- **Additional Items**
    - Coversheets were sent to the Subcommittee Chairs last month for use with the final recommendations.
    - Slides with proposals for projection at the meeting. The slides contain a summary for each of the sunsets, and the proposals. MA will forward the slide deck to the NOSB members so they can see it ahead of time.
    - Webinar logistics and questions. The NOP will initiate a practice webinar today to make sure folks are familiar with the process.
    - The NOSB Chair mentioned that the NOP Deputy Administrator is speaking at the NOC meeting, the day before the NOSB meeting in St. Paul, and encouraged anyone who arrives early to attend.
  - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)  
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

September 14, 2018

October 12, 2018

November 9, 2018

December 14, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018

NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

<b>Spring 2019 Milestones</b>	<b>Target dates (tentative)</b>
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 2, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and  
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, September 21, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair

**Absent:** Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary

**Staff:** Jennifer Tucker (JT); Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Clarissa Mathews (CM)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of August 10, 2018**
- **Chairs Report** - TC
- **NOP news and update** - JT/PL
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates** (5 minutes each)
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - TC.
  - Crops (CS) - SE.
  - Livestock (LS) - AS.
  - Handling (HS) - LD.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
- **Additional Items.**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of August 10, 2018** were approved with a modification to the Livestock section to remove a sentence that referred to the Crops Subcommittee.
- **Chairs Report** - TC
  - The NOSB Chair noted that the Fall meeting agenda is full and will let each of the Subcommittee Chairs expound below.
- **NOP news and update** - JT/PL
  - The end of the fiscal year is approaching, and the NOP has successfully completed FY '18 spending.
  - The NOP provided an update on suspension notices, which can be found on the AMS website: <https://www.ams.usda.gov/services/enforcement/organic/ams-decisions>
  - Expo East participation. Several NOP staff members attended the Expo East trade show and staffed an exhibit booth. The NOP Deputy Administrator delivered two talks: one about the state of organic policy, and one about blockchain technology. The latter was very well attended.
  - Relationship with Amazon and other online retailers re: organic claims. As many as 15% of compliance inquiries and complaints to the NOP relate to products sold through Amazon.com.

- The NOP has developed a relationship with the Amazon regulatory team, to address fraudulent organic claims, and has a process in place for reviewing incoming complaints. Amazon's regulatory program is very collaborative and has taken a leadership role in organic oversight in the last couple of years.
- Paper pots. The NOP explained the justification for its decision to not extend the allowance for the use of paper pots for another growing season while the NOSB completes its review of the pending petition to add paper pots to the National List. The question about the use of paper pots arose from a disagreement between certifiers: some were approving its use, and some were not. Members discussed the disparity between the allowance of newspaper and paper pots. The adhesive used in the paper pots is not on the National List, and allowance of a substance not approved for use in organic is the key issue for the NOP. The Crops Subcommittee will continue to work on the paper pots petition after the Fall meeting. The Crops Subcommittee chair extended an invitation to the Deputy Administrator to sit in on a future Crops call to discuss this further.
  - BPA and other packaging materials. This was an NOP-initiated work agenda item, however, the NOP wishes to move it to the inactive/hold list as there are other key priorities. Additionally, it is not clear if this is within the regulatory scope of authority under OFPA. The HS Chair will discuss it with the Subcommittee members and let them know the status. Members discussed several aspects of this work agenda item. Based on a survey by the Organic Trade Association (OTA) none of the respondents are using BPA, and it appears that consumers are driving the decision for many manufacturers to change their packaging. The work agenda spreadsheet was updated to reflect the NOP decision.
  - AMS is currently reviewing the Livestock work agenda request on pre-day-old chicks.
  - EPA registration and National List substances. A member asked if the NOSB should consider a generic material if it is not registered for use at EPA, with the intention that if it was on the list someone could develop a product using that material. The NOP added that if a substance is inconsistent with EPA regulations, it would be difficult to justify a rulemaking action to add it to the National List. It was noted that because the organic seal is international, feedback from growers in other countries where the substance is allowed is always a factor.
  - The NOP recently spoke with the USDA tribal office about the Board and its role, at the suggestion of one of the NOSB members.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
    - Public comments. The comment period will close October 4. Of the 228 written comments there are 20-25 about paper pots.
    - Travel update. The NOP reminded members to make flight reservations.
    - Fall 2018 meeting agenda. The NOP has invited two guests to give opening remarks: The Minnesota Commissioner of Agriculture, and a professor from the University of Minnesota.
  - **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
    - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. The PDS has not met and there is nothing to report.
    - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - TC. In addition to the two CACS proposals, the Subcommittee will provide a verbal update at the St. Paul meeting on the import panels that were held at the last two meetings.
    - Crops (CS) - SE. For the Fall 2018 meeting, the CS has several complex issues including paper pots and sucrose octanoate esters (SOEs). The CS will discuss these substances on its next call in preparation for the fall meeting discussion. NOP approved the work agenda request for the liquid fish products annotation. The CS is seeking to annotate the listing to prohibit the use of whole, native caught fish as fertilizer.
    - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS sent a work agenda request to the Executive team about use of vaccines made with excluded method. Vaccines are currently undergoing sunset review, and during the review, the LS discovered an inconsistency in the way in which it's being

- implemented. The Executive Committee supports, without objection, the addition of this project to the Livestock work agenda.
- Handling (HS) - LD. On its last call the HS discussed the two Materials' proposals (Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land and Excluded Methods Determinations). The TR for pullulan was received and the HS will determine sufficiency on next call.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS is bringing forth three (3) proposals and one (1) discussion document to the fall meeting. The MS did not meet this past month, but the MS Chair sat in on three other Subcommittee calls to discuss the MS proposals on the Genetic Integrity Transparency of Seed Grown on Organic Land and Excluded Methods Determinations. The MS Chair noted support of the new process of posting petitioned-materials' discussion documents, which are very useful to glean early feedback from other NOSB members and the community.
  - **Additional Items.** A member asked the NOP which TRs were ultimately contracted for the 2021 sunset substances. The NOP indicated there were TRs for ascorbic acid, malic acid, and trace minerals for livestock feed.
  - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)  
[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

- August 10, 2018
- September 14, 2018
- October 12, 2018
- November 9, 2018
- December 14, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and  
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, August 10, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair

**Absent:** Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair

**Staff:** Jennifer Tucker (JT); Paul Lewis (PL); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Clarissa Mathews (CM)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of July 13, 2018**
- **Chairs Report** - TC
  - Work agenda review
- **NOP news and update** - JT/PL
  - Status of pending NOSB work agenda requests: Liquid fish work agenda item, day old chicks.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
  - Fall 2018 meeting notice - published August 9
  - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting agenda
  - Fall proposals submission date
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates** (5 minutes each)
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR.
  - Crops (CS) - SE.
  - Livestock (LS) - AS.
  - Handling (HS) - LD.
- **Additional Items:**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of July 13, 2018** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report** - TC
  - The NOSB Chair had no specific updates.
- **NOP news and update** - JT/PL
  - The NOP Deputy Administrator just returned from an interesting and productive trip to visit two different ports-of-entry in the Miami area. While there, she met with Customs and Border Protection (CBP) and Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) to look at fumigation sites and observe processes for organic shipments. AMS is looking at additional port visit opportunities in the coming months
  - The [NOP response to a recent OIG report](#) was posted on the AMS website. The OIG report included four findings with nine recommendations, including a recommendation that AMS needs to strengthen its controls over the approval and oversight of international trade arrangements and agreements for the import of organic products into the United States. AMS provided a response to the OIG, with a summary of actions taken to date and planned actions.
  - The Fall 2018 meeting notice was published August 9. The notice opened the public comment docket, which will be open through October 4, 2018.

- Several NOP staff members participated in a multi-day tour of specialty crop farms and handling facilities in the California Central Valley and Central Coast during the week of August 6. Staff learned about pest pressure and pest control tools for various specialty crops, as well as supply chain traceability.
- The NOP Deputy Administrator described the process and possible gaps that exist that could lead to fumigated shipments being sent to market. AMS is working with CBP and APHIS to close the gaps, which may include uncertified brokers. .
- The Deputy Administrator provided background about recent approval for the use of specific prohibited substances to control mosquitos after Hurricane Harvey and for a specific localized storm event this Spring in TX. The Deputy Administrator indicated the USDA reviewed the specific incoming requests and does not consider the specific type of treatment used to be an application that would impact the organic status of certified organic crops and livestock. This allowance is based on information provided by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and based on the specific application process used.
- NOSB work agenda requests. Livestock has requested to add to its work agenda ‘antibiotics in pre-two day old chicks’, and Crops has requested to work on an annotation to prohibit whole, wild caught fish as fertilizer. Both are currently under review by AMS leadership. The Livestock Chair added that antibiotics are considered a substance that is used on livestock, and therefore it falls squarely under the purview of the NOSB and NOP.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Fall 2018 meeting notice - published August 9
  - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting agenda. Members reviewed scheduling information and the NOP made some modifications based on feedback.
  - Fall proposals. NOP asked that the Subcommittee Chairs submit proposals as they are completed.
  - NOP will add a sentence to the proposals indicating the Subcommittee’s intent, so it is clear. Particularly on the sunset reviews, since the motion is a “motion to remove”.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS is bringing forward three proposals and one discussion document to the Fall meeting. Proposals on excluded methods, genetic integrity of seed, and research priorities, and a discussion document on marine materials (marine algae and extracts) on the National List. The MS has two work agenda items to complete before the deadline on August 24.
  - Policy Development (PDS) – DS. The PDS is gathering a list of minor changes for the PPM for a proposal at the Spring meeting.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS has three documents for the Fall 2018 meeting: Criteria to establish risk-based accreditation oversight proposal; inspector qualifications, skills and training; and summary document of import activities such as feedback from the import panel. The Deputy Administrator will be on the next CACS call to talk about the learning management system (LMS) and provide insight as it relates to training and reviewer qualifications.
  - Crops (CS) - SE. The Crops Subcommittee has completed the majority of its work agenda items, and has four sunset reviews and one more petition proposal to complete. Crops received a petition addendum for allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) that contains commentary on the Limited Scope TR, after they voted on the proposal. The group discussed the options and timing for reviewing the addendum, and will consider the addendum along with the public comment received for the Fall meeting. Members discussed the possibility of codifying this process in the Policy and Procedures Manual. The proposal for paper pots was resubmitted and the Crops Subcommittee will review it for the Spring 2018 meeting, as there is not enough time to

complete it before the Fall meeting. The petition is for plant pots/containers made from hemp paper or other paper. The petition is available online. Crops asked that the NOP consider extending the deadline for the use of this material while the Board undertakes its review, so it does not affect growers in the interim. The NOSB Chair noted that it would be helpful if the NOP could provide further clarification of policy to certifiers on the use of paper-based pots, as there is some discrepancy between certifiers. The Subcommittee requested an update on biodegradable biobased mulch, as there has been ongoing research.

- Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS has two sunset reviews to complete (biologics and glycerin) and one petition discussion document on oxalic acid. The NOP asked that Subcommittees submit any additional requests for TRs before the end of the fiscal year, and the LS had none.
- Handling (HS) - LD. The HS has a few items to finish on the next call. The Subcommittee will bring five petition proposals, two petition discussion documents and 18 sunset reviews to the Fall meeting.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

- June 8, 2018
- July 13, 2018
- August 10, 2018
- September 14, 2018
- October 12, 2018
- November 9, 2018
- December 14, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and  
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, July 13, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair

**Absent:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Paul Lewis (PL); Jenny Tucker (JT)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of June 8, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates** (5 minutes each)
  - Handling (HS) - LD
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - HB
  - Crops (CS) - SE
  - Livestock (LS) - HB
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of June 8, 2018** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - New member training. Training will be held next week in DC. The two new NOSB members joined Subcommittee calls as of June, and have been assigned mentors.
  - The NOSB Subcommittees are working towards completion of documents for the Fall 2018 NOSB meeting.
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
  - The NOP is hosting a virtual town hall on strengthening organic enforcement Tuesday, July 17 at 1:00 pm ET. There's no need to preregister, and the webinar will be recorded for those who can't attend.
  - New NOSB member training. Wednesday, July 18. The training materials have been revised to focus on hands-on activities.
  - National List Rules. The comment period on the proposed rule (NOP 14-05) that responded to 35 materials' recommendations is now closed and NOP is reviewing comments.
  - The National List rule (NOP 17-09) addressing two NOSB materials recommendations from the Spring 2018 meeting was posted and the NOP received four (4) comments. This rule proposes to add elemental sulfur to the National List for use in organic livestock production, and reclassify potassium acid tartrate from a nonagricultural substance to an agricultural substance and require the organic form of the ingredient when commercially available

- Liquid fish work agenda item. NOP is talking with AMS leadership about this project.
- The announcement for the Fall 2018 NOSB meeting is in clearance and should be published soon.
- The members congratulated Jenny Tucker on her promotion to NOP Deputy Administrator.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Fall timeline - See table below.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
  - **Handling (HS) - LD.** The Subcommittee has completed the silver dihydrogen citrate proposal, as well as several sunset reviews. The HS is also working on proposals for ethiopian pepper and japones pepper, as well as a discussion document for the pullulan petition. If the TR arrives in time they will complete a proposal.
  - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB.** The Materials Subcommittee has met only once since the last Executive call, and members have not yet met Clarissa Mathews, the new National List manager. The MS is working on several projects, including liquid fish products, seed integrity, for which there may be a proposal for fall meeting, excluded methods, and the 2018 research priorities. Public commenters asked that the NOSB be more specific with excluded methods definitions. The Subcommittee has discussed the review of sanitizers and a possible sanitizer panel. In support of this, the MS Chair is working on a list of potential topics and questions for the panel. The NOP indicated its support for a panel in place of a TR, as a panel is more likely able to provide answers to the NOSB's questions. Given the timeline, it is likely a panel would be convened at the Spring 2019 meeting. The research priorities proposal is in progress. The MS added an additional call on July 24.
  - **Policy Development (PDS) - DS.** The PDS Chair and NOP spoke about future revisions to the PPM, including the addition of the new pilot procedure for writing a petition discussion document while awaiting a TR.
  - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - HB.** The CACS met earlier this week, and subdivided the project on enforcement activities into discrete pieces. Some will become discussion documents and some proposals. HB will work on learning management systems, SR will work on the accreditation aspect (proposal) and TC will capture the feedback from the Spring 2018 panel and comments and do a high level analysis, so the CACS can determine which areas provide opportunities to move forward.
  - **Crops (CS) - SE.** The next few Crops call agendas are full, and they are making good progress on projects for the Fall 2018 meeting. Crops has completed half of its sunset reviews, the proposals on sodium citrate and natamycin, and is expecting TRs for ammonium citrate, ammonium glycinate, and calcium acetate. If the TRs do not arrive in time, the CS will put forth petition discussion documents. The Subcommittee will discuss and vote on the allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) proposal on the next call, and expects to finish the proposal to strengthen and clarify the requirements for use of organic seed (NOP 5029). Crops is also working on its research priorities, which will be submitted to the Materials Subcommittee. Members discussed a potential update by NIFA (National Institute of Food and Agriculture) about the status of previous research priorities. The NOP suggested an update at the Spring 2019 meeting given that NIFA is currently under brand new leadership. The group also discussed other topics for the Spring 2019 meeting, which include a panel on celery powder, and a possible panel on sanitizers.
  - **Livestock (LS) - HB.** The 2020 sunset reviews are underway. The LS will put forth a petition discussion document for oxalic acid if the TR does not arrive in time to complete a proposal. Livestock has requested the addition of a work agenda item on the use of antibiotics in pre-two day old chicks, and outdoor access for swine. NOP noted that the request for the use of antibiotics in pre-two day old chicks is under review, and since it relates to authorities under



OFPA, the NOP elevated the request to OGC and AMS leadership. The AMS Administrator is interested in reviewing the requests, which could delay the response.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

June 8, 2018

July 13, 2018

August 10, 2018

September 14, 2018

October 12, 2018

November 9, 2018

December 14, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	pending
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, June 8, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair

**Absent:**

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Paul Lewis (PL); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of May 18, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - New member committee assignment
  - Petition discussion draft
  - Work agenda updates
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
  - Update - Liquid fish products annotation work agenda request
  - NOP presentation to OTA policy conference
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update – MA**
  - Updated “current members” page
  - Updated meeting page (voting summary, transcripts, and import panel presentations)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
  - Livestock (LS) – AS
    - Work Agenda Request: Antibiotics in day old chicks
  - Handling (HS) - LD
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
  - Crops (CS) - SE
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of May 18, 2018** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - New member committee assignments. Eric Schwartz will sit on the Handling and Crops Subcommittees and Rick Greenwood will sit on the CACS and Materials Subcommittees.
  - Petition discussion draft. The NOSB is seeking to bring forth discussion drafts on petitioned materials while waiting for TRs. This will allow the Board to solicit feedback on questions that the TR doesn't usually provide, and to foster additional conversation among board members earlier on the process prior to final discussions and voting. Several Subcommittees are piloting this new process now, and the PDS will write language to add it to the PPM. A draft template was sent to group. It will be brief – one to two pages - and will contain a summary of the petition, a brief review, and questions for public comment.

- Work agenda updates. The group reviewed the work agenda during Subcommittee updates below.
- **NOP news and update - PL**
  - Update - Liquid fish products annotation work agenda request. Crops is refining the request to add a work agenda item to develop an annotation for native wild caught fish, restricting its use as a fertilizer. Crops will talk further with the NOP next week.
  - The NOP presented a talk on import oversight activities at the OTA policy conference in May.
  - Clarissa Mathews was hired as the National List Manager and will be starting next week. She has been with the NOP AIA team as an Accreditation Manager since December 2017.
  - The comment period for the proposed rule AMS–NOP–14–0079, with 35 amendments to the National List of Allowed and Prohibited Substances (Crops, Livestock and Handling), closed May 14 and the NOP is analyzing comments.
  - The comment period for the proposed rule AMS–NOP–17–0080 closes June 29, 2018. This rule proposes to add elemental sulfur to the National List for use in organic livestock production, and reclassify potassium acid tartrate from a nonagricultural substance to an agricultural substance and require the organic form of the ingredient when commercially available.
  - Training update. The NOP will condense the new member training to spend more time on practical, day-to-day work examples and less on background. The NOSB Chair suggested using a previous Subcommittee meeting agenda to illustrate the work flow and mechanics. Perhaps the last CS call agenda since it had a variety of topics at different stages.
  - MA will send the member guide to the entire Board as well as the new members.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - The “current members” webpage was updated with the two new member’s bios.
  - The Spring 2018 meeting page was updated with the voting summary, transcripts, and import panel presentations.
  - The FR notice for the Fall meeting is in clearance.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
  - **Livestock (LS) - AS**
    - Work Agenda Request: The LS sent a request to the Exec team this week to add a work agenda item on the ‘prohibition of antibiotics in pre-second day-of-life poultry’. Currently antibiotics are sometimes applied to chicks in-ovo as well as on first day of life. This topic was brought to the NOSB’s attention from a consumer group, and has community wide support. The Executive team approved the written request provided by the LS Chair and will send it to the NOP for consideration. Members added that currently there is a discrepancy between livestock and poultry and this project would bring consistency to the organic regulations. Additionally, conventional producers are already practicing this and the NOSB indicated that this would help align organic. The NOP noted that although this has been mentioned at several previous NOSB meetings, NOP will have to seek approval to add it to the work agenda.
    - Work agenda items: The 2020 sunset reviews have been scheduled, and are set to be completed for the Fall meeting. The LS has one petition and a pending TR for oxalic acid. The TR is due in mid-July, and they may be able to complete it for the Fall meeting. If timing does not allow the proposal to be completed before the deadline, the LS will put forth a petition discussion document, using the new process as described above. The LS requested TRs for two (2) 2021 sunsets: atropine and xylazine. The Subcommittee is also working on research priorities.
  - **Handling (HS) – LD.**
    - The HS will schedule all of its sunset discussions by the next call. The Subcommittee voted on two petitions (sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, and

tamarind seed gum) and has three more to vote on (the two pepper petitions and silver dihydrogen citrate). The HS will also be drafting petition discussion documents for two petitioned materials that are awaiting TRs - pullulan, and collagen gel (casing).

- The NOSB Chair will provide an update to the HS on the next call on BPA and Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals (NVM) annotation change.
- Celery powder panel. The NOP reached out to OTA seeking suggestions for possible panelists for a celery powder technical advisory panel. The NOSB members have been discussing the use of a technical panel rather than a technical report, and feel that celery powder would be a good test case. The panel would convene either between the Fall and Spring meetings, or at the Spring meeting.
- **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) – HB.**
  - The Materials Subcommittee did not meet in May, but will be meeting next week. The group plans to discuss marine materials and the genetic integrity of seed. The MS will also be working with the other Subcommittees to compile this year's list of research priorities. The Materials Subcommittee Chair mentioned that there was specific language in the appropriation for USDA regarding the NOSB research priorities. The Materials Chair and the NOSB Chair will discuss the status of the project on sanitizers to determine the next steps.
- **Policy Development (PDS) – DS.**
  - The NOSB is piloting a two-phase petition discussion, and if it is successful the PDS will draft language for addition to the Policy and Procedures Manual. Two other small edits to the PPM will be added at that time.
- **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) – SR.**
  - During the last CACS call, the NOP updated the CACS about ongoing enforcement work and will speak more about it with the CACS during the next call. The NOSB Chair had questions about uncertified handlers and would like to talk further with the program next week.
- **Crops (CS) – SE**
  - Sunset reviews are scheduled and on track to meet the August deadline.
  - The CS hosted a guest speaker on the last call to discuss possible collaboration. Dr. Meg McGrath of Cornell University Plant Pathology joined the call to talk about how the NOSB can collaborate with IR4, which is a program that registers pesticides for specialty crops. Dr. McGrath suggested some online resources the NOSB can use to aid in its materials reviews, and offered to be a resource for future inquiries.
  - During the last conference call the CS worked on TR questions for the liquid fish annotation proposal. The discussion and vote on Allyl Isothiocyanate (AITC) was deferred to a later call. The CS has some additional questions and work to complete on two petitions - sodium citrate and natamycin. Crops will coordinate with Livestock to talk about sodium citrate, and once the CS votes on the proposal, will refer it to the LS to consider its listing at §205.604.
  - The CS will be working on the discussion document on strengthening and clarifying the requirements for use of organic seed (NOP 5029) for the Fall 2018 meeting.
  - Biodegradable biobased mulch annotation change. The CS will not be working on this for the Fall meeting. The group discussed the status, and the current research underway, and will revisit the proposal after the Fall meeting.
  - Crops will have three petition discussion documents for the fall meeting, as the TRs are pending: Ammonium citrate; ammonium glycinate; and calcium acetate.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

May 18, 2018

June 8, 2018

July 13, 2018

August 10, 2018

September 14, 2018

October 12, 2018

November 9, 2018

December 14, 2018

Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	pending
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and  
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, May 18, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair

**Absent:** Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA); Paul Lewis (PL); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of April 13, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Spring meeting review
  - New members' workload
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
  - AMS Administrator position
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Spring meeting recommendations finalization
  - Fall timeline (see below)
  - Travel documents
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates since last ES call (5 minutes each)**
  - Crops (CS) - SE
    - Work agenda requests – Wild fish prohibition; add natamycin to the prohibited list at 205.602
  - Livestock (LS) - HB
  - Handling (HS) - LD
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
  - Policy Development (PDS) - TC
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of April 13, 2018** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Spring meeting review. Members offered feedback about the Spring 2018 meeting.
    - Board members received positive feedback about the imports panel. The NOP found the question and answer portion of the panel very helpful. A member added that the public comment was very thoughtful and useful.
    - The NOSB expressed an interest in convening expert panels between in-person meetings via webinar, which could be very useful to the Board when reviewing large or complex topics. A member suggested one on sanitizers.
    - Members discussed the timing of the Board dinner.
    - NOSB members expressed their appreciation that Mr. Ibach, MRP Under Secretary, joined the meeting and met with Board members

- A member voiced a concern that organic is still thought of as elitist or for rich people, and sees a need to dispel that falsehood. That seems to have been the sentiment during the conversations with the USDA.
    - Members discussed a process change so all Board members have more time to review petitions and comments on those petitions, earlier in the process, without extending the time it takes to review a petition. The NOSB will post draft discussion documents while waiting for technical reports, which will not affect the timing but will allow more public engagement and transparency during the process.
  - New members' workload. The NOSB Chair reached out to the two new members, and will follow up with them regarding Subcommittee assignments. They will begin joining calls in June. New member training will likely occur in July, in DC. The group discussed reassigning current reviews to the new members, and decided to keep them as assigned and let the new members begin reviewing 2021 sunset substances. A member suggested assigning mentors, as she found it very helpful when she was a new member.
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
  - Hiring updates. The AMS Administrator position was filled by Bruce Summers, who had been Acting Administrator for the past year and a half. Ruihong Guo will continue to be acting Deputy Administrator for NOP until the position is filled permanently. The position for National List manager was advertised and the department received applications from several well qualified candidates. The NOP is finalizing the process, and should have an announcement soon.
  - The National List proposed rule that closed on May 14 (AMS-NOP-14-0079) was reopened to allow for additional public comment. There are 35 substances included in this proposed rule.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Spring meeting recommendations finalization. Due to NOP May 25.
  - Fall timeline (see below).
  - Travel documents. MA asked that any outstanding travel documents be submitted as soon as possible.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates since last ES call (5 minutes each)**
  - Crops (CS) - SE
    - The Crops Subcommittee had one call since the Tucson meeting, which it used to schedule future discussions. The Subcommittee is requesting two technical reports for sunset 2021 substances: One for horticultural oils and one for ammonium soaps. The group is also reviewing a couple of complex petitions; sodium citrate, and natamycin. Sodium citrate is used as a processing aid (anticoagulant) in blood meal products and is likely used to manufacture products currently listed by OMRI. The NOP expressed interest in learning more about substances being allowed as "processing aids" in fertilizers.
    - Work agenda requests. The Executive team is supportive of adding the following work agenda item to Crops. NOP will draft a response approving the addition.
      - Wild fish products. The Board seeks to prohibit use of whole wild-caught fish for use as fertilizer. The group discussed either adding wild-caught whole fish to 205.602, and/or annotating its listing (liquid fish products pH adjusted with synthetic acids) at 205.601.
    - Paper pots. The NOP and NOSB are anticipating a petition, based on conversations at the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting.
    - Meg McGrath, of Cornell University and the IR-4 project, will join the Crops call June 5 to discuss coordination with NOP and NOSB. IR-4 is a USDA/NIFA funded project that supports the registration of pesticides on "minor crops".
  - Livestock (LS) - HB. The Livestock Subcommittee has one petition for fall: oxalic acid.

- Handling (HS) - LD. The Handling Subcommittee is currently reviewing several petitions, and anticipates bringing 5 proposals for vote to the Fall 2018 meeting: silver dihydrogen citrate, tamarind seed gum, sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas, japonese pepper, and Ethiopian peppers. The petition for collagen gel was found sufficient and the HS requested a TR. The TR for pullulan was requested in April 2018, and if it is back in time, the HS could bring a proposal to the fall meeting. The HS also requested TRs on two 2021 sunset substances - gelatin/casings (to be combined with collagen gel), and celery powder.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The Materials Subcommittee is working on a discussion document on marine materials for Fall 2018. This was a project that originated in both Crops and Handling, and was consolidated and moved to Materials for completion. The MS is also discussing next steps for sanitizers. The MS Chair will draft a document for discussion, which will include the ultimate goal, and questions about how to collect the necessary data. The Subcommittee is also working on proposals on protecting integrity of organic seed, and excluded methods.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - TC. The PDS is currently keeping a list of minor changes for the Policy and procedures manual (PPM), and will embark on an update in the future. The NOSB Chair suggested adding the new process discussed above, for a two-stage petition process, whereby a Subcommittee would post a brief discussion document while waiting for the technical report, in order to give Board members more time to read the proposal and comments, as well as to collect additional feedback earlier in the review process.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS met once since the Spring meeting and discussed several components that may be included in the CACS proposal on import oversight. The NOP provided feedback about how to move forward. The CACS also discussed uncertified handlers, but given there is currently regulatory activity in progress, including in the Farm Bill, the CACS will not focus on this. The CACS also discussed the issue of fracking and put forth a couple of ideas to narrow the focus so they can develop t a request to the NOP to add it to the work agenda.
- **Additional Items.** None
  - **The meeting was adjourned**

### [Previous ES Notes](#)

#### **Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

April 13, 2018

May 18, 2018

June 8, 2018

July 13, 2018

August 10, 2018

September 14, 2018

October 12, 2018

November 9, 2018

December 14, 2018



Fall 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	TBD
NOSB Request for TRs for 2021 sunset materials	Jun 6, 2018
New NOSB member training	July 18, 2018
NOP - Draft Fall 2018NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 9, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2018 proposals due to NOP	Aug 23, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 5, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 4, 2018
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 12, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 8, 2018
Public comment webinars	Oct 16 & 18, 2018
Fall 2018 NOSB meeting - St. Paul, MN	Oct 24-26, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting notes and  
summary of NOSB Subcommittee activities  
Friday, April 13, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Jesse Buie (JB)

**Absent:**

**Staff:** Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Paul Lewis (PL)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of March 16, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Imports panel update
  - Meeting agenda
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
  - Carrageenan decision
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Webinar preparation
  - Spring meeting logistics
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates since last ES call (5 minutes each)**
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
  - Crops (CS) - SE
  - Livestock (LS) - AS
  - Handling (HS) - LD
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of March 16, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Imports panel update. There are nine (9) confirmed panelists representing the organic industry and the organic certifier community. There will be three one-hour long sessions: one industry-focused panel, one certifier-focused panel, and then one hour for all nine panelists. After introduction of the panelists, there will be a question and answer session with the Board. Scott Rice, the Chair of the CACS, will moderate the certifier panel, and Tom Chapman, NOSB Chair, will moderate the industry panel. Then Scott will moderate a discussion with the entire panel.
  - NOSB meeting agenda and logistics.
    - Greg Ibach, Under Secretary of the USDA Marketing and Regulatory Programs, will be in attendance, and will address the Board. He will be communicating about the Secretary's priority: Imports and enforcement. There will be some time for Q and A with the NOSB after his presentation.

- Ruihong Guo, NOP Acting Deputy Administrator, will also be in attendance and will open the meeting. There will be a USDA update by Greg Ibach and Jenny Tucker, and Q and A with the NOSB facilitated by the NOSB Chair. After the USDA/NOP update, the NOSB Chair will provide the NOSB update. The NOSB will prepare some questions for the Under Secretary and NOP. A member suggested two questions: one about the status of the Farm Bill, and one about the new NOSB nominees.
    - Materials update. The NOP and NOSB agreed to omit this update since the same information will be presented during the work agenda discussion at the end of the meeting.
    - Mr. Ibach's schedule is still in flux, but there may be a meet and greet opportunity for the Board members.
    - The NOSB Chair noted that there are two topics that will likely be raised: OLPP, and Carrageenan
  - The Chair reviewed the remainder of the agenda for the NOSB meeting, including the two webinars.
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL.**
  - The two new NOSB appointments are still under consideration by the Secretary's office.
  - The sunset rule (NOP 17-05) comment period was recently reopened based on several requests by commenters.
  - Carrageenan decision. The USDA declined to implement the 2017 NOSB recommendation to remove carrageenan from the National List. The NOSB asked for the justification as to why, and clarification for the USDA's definition of essentiality, noting that there seems to be a disconnection between what the NOP and NOSB weighs when determining essentiality. The Chair emphasized the need to align the NOSB criteria and what the USDA considers when implementing or not implementing a recommendation, to eliminate any future discrepancies. Carrageenan was recommended for removal based on essentiality to organic production, not human health or environmental health criteria. The group discussed the role that FDA plays in the determination regarding human health.
  - There is no update on the vacancies for the NOP Deputy Administrator position or the AMS Administrator position.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Webinar preparation – MA asked that Board members let her know if they would like to test the software for the webinars prior to the first webinar.
  - MA summarized the spring meeting logistics and travel.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates since last ES call (5 minutes each)**
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The Chair reiterated the information about the Imports panel, as was noted above. The CACS has two proposals for the Spring meeting: Inspector qualifications, and Eliminating the Incentive to Convert Native Ecosystems into Organic Crop production
  - Crops (CS) - SE. The Crops Subcommittee is working on two proposals for petitioned materials: sodium citrate and natamycin. During the last call the CS assigned leads for 2021 sunsets, and will be evaluating the need for Technical Reports (TRs).
  - Livestock (LS) - AS. During the last call the LS assigned leads for 2021 sunsets, and will be evaluating the need for Technical Reports (TRs).
  - Handling (HS) - LD. The HS is working on several petitioned materials. The Subcommittee recently approved two TRs, one for sodium chlorite and one for tamarind seed gum, and has one TR for silver dihydrogen citrate pending review. The HS requested a TR for pullulan, and received a new petition for collagen gel.

- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The MS had a productive meeting with Fan Li Chou, biotech coordinator at USDA. Dr. Chou sat in on the most recent call and discussed biotechnology priorities at USDA, which could have implications for the NOSB work on excluded methods. The Chair offered to share her notes with the group. Dr. Chou offered to connect some of her colleagues to the MS to discuss biotechnology with regard to livestock. The MS Chair suggested inviting the Livestock Subcommittee to participate on that call.
- Policy Development (PDS) - DS. No updates at this time.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

- March 9, 2018
- April 13, 2018
- May 11, 2018
- June 8, 2018
- July 13, 2018
- August 10, 2018
- September 14, 2018
- October 12, 2018
- November 9, 2018
- December 14, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, "Open" public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting - Tucson, AZ	Apr 25 - 27, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Committee (ES) Meeting Notes and Summary of NOSB Subcommittee Activities  
Friday, March 16, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Jesse Buie (JB) - observer; Dave Mortensen (DM) - observer

**Absent:** Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair

**Staff:** Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Paul Lewis (PL); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of February 9, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Imports panel update
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL**
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Spring meeting timeline/deadlines
  - Webinar preparation
  - Update: Document posting
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates since last ES call (5 minutes each)**
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
  - Crops (CS) - SE
  - Livestock (LS) - AS
  - Handling (HS) - LD
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of February 9, 2018** were approved as written
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Imports panel update. The NOP and CACS received applications from a number of interested candidates to convene two panels at the Spring 2018 meeting. Eight people have been invited and the NOSB is seeking a ninth person who is an international certifier. There will be four representatives from the certifier community, and five industry representatives. Between now and the next CACS meeting in early April, the CACS will be working on questions for the panel.
- **NOP news and update - JT/PL.**
  - On March 12, 2018, USDA announced the decision to withdraw the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) final rule published on January 19, 2017. The withdrawal becomes effective May 13, 2018.
  - The meeting materials for the April NOSB meeting, including the agenda and proposals, were posted Friday, March 9.
  - The Department is aware of both the vacant environmental protection/resource conservation and organic handler position on the NOSB, and are considering next steps.
  - Planning for the import panels is in progress.

- AMS and APHIS continue to collaborate with Customs and Border Protection to assess imports of shipments that may be falsely labeled as organic.
- The National List proposed rule announcing actions for 35 substances is open for comment. The comment period closes next week, and thus far the NOP has received about 75 comments.
- The NOP is assessing the NOSB's Fall 2017 recommendations on elemental sulfur and potassium acid tartrate.
- The NOSB's revised work agenda is posted on the NOSB meeting webpage, and will be updated monthly after the Executive Committee call. Executive Committee notes will also continue to serve an important function summarizing NOSB subcommittee actions. The NOSB Chair received praise for developing a revised work agenda so quickly; NOP noted that the work agenda spreadsheet, and the Executive Committee Notes and Subcommittee Summary will replace the individual Subcommittee notes that were previously posted on the website.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Spring meeting timeline/deadlines
    - Travel planning is in progress. MA asked that the members make flight arrangements soon.
    - Public comments for the Spring meeting opened March 9 and will close April 4.
  - Webinar preparation. The NOSB members felt that there was no need for a practice session, as everyone has used the software before.
  - Document posting: Since Subcommittee notes will now be posted in summary form each month, Subcommittee Chairs discussed a way to track the work flow for all items on the work agenda, in order to develop the agendas for the Subcommittee calls. The NOP will update the work agenda (Excel workbook) after each call, and will recirculate it to subcommittees. The work agenda will be posted on the NOSB webpage once a month along with the Executive Committee and Subcommittee summary notes. The NOP will ensure that the Executive notes are more comprehensive so the community is aware of Board activities.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates since last ES call**
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. No update as the Subcommittee has not met.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. Planning for the import panels is in progress. The CACS has three documents for the Spring NOSB meeting: a discussion document on import oversight, a proposal on inspector qualifications, and a proposal on eliminating the incentive to convert native ecosystems to organic production.
  - Crops (CS) - SE. Reviews of allyl isothiocyanate (AITC) and natamycin are in progress. The CS is continuing to discuss the classification of natamycin. It was previously classified as a synthetic, but according to the NOP materials classification guidance is likely a nonsynthetic substance. The CS is also reviewing a petition to add sodium citrate for the production of blood meal. The proposal on marine materials will move from Crops to the Materials Subcommittee for completion.
  - Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS has two proposals for the spring NOSB meeting: Defining emergency treatment for parasiticides, and glycolic acid, and also several sunset reviews. The Subcommittee Chair asked about the possibility of moving forward with an organic poultry task force. This request was on hold until the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) rule was finalized, and now that it has been withdrawn, the LS Chair would like to move ahead with convening a task force to look at such things as methionine. Members discussed the confusion in the industry with regard to methionine, and emphasized that a refusal to address the issues is perceived as poor customer service and does not serve the industry well. The NOP suggested the LS identify discreet, specific, materials-oriented questions related to livestock, and that the NOSB work to align their priorities with the Administration's priorities, so work can continue in the areas that are most critical to the organic integrity of the entire industry.

- Handling (HS) - SR. The 2020 sunset reviews are ready for the first posting in Spring 2018, and the HS will also be looking at the need for technical reports for the 2021 sunsets. The HS has two proposals for the Spring meeting: Sodium dodecylbenzene sulfonate (SDBS) (petitioned), and magnesium chloride reclassification. The review of sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine dioxide gas (petitioned) is still in progress, and the technical report (TR) was found sufficient. The TR for tamarind seed gum (petitioned) is under review. The HS recently received a petition for pullulan. The HS is waiting for additional information from petitioners on two petitions: Ethiopian peppers and Japones peppers, and also waiting for additional information from the TR contractor about silver dihydrogen citrate.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. Dr. Chou, the USDA biotechnology coordinator, was unable to participate on the last MS call as planned, and was rescheduled to April 10. The NOSB is seeking to open communication channels with USDA with regard to excluded methods. The MS will be presenting and discussing a document on protecting the genetic integrity of seed grown on organic land at the Spring 2018 meeting. Other projects in progress include contaminated inputs, research priorities, and marine materials, which the MS will take over from Crops and Handling. The request to review sanitizers was verbally approved by NOP and will be officially added to the MS work agenda. The next step for this project is to develop questions for a technical review. The NOP had some follow up questions about the goal of this project and will talk further with the MS Chair. The NOSB Chair suggested a panel or task force on sanitizers instead of a TR, to provide the data the NOSB is seeking. Next steps - written communication back from the program that this work item is officially approved for addition to the work agenda.
- **Additional Items.** None
  - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

- February 9, 2018
- March 9, 2018
- April 13, 2018
- May 11, 2018
- June 8, 2018
- July 13, 2018
- August 10, 2018
- September 14, 2018
- October 12, 2018
- November 9, 2018
- December 14, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018

NOP - Post proposals, "Open" public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting - Tucson, AZ	Apr 25 - 27, 2018



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes  
Friday, February 9, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Harriet Behar (HB), NOSB Vice Chair, Materials Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Steve Ela (SE), Crops Chair; Asa Bradman (AB) - observer; A-Dae Romero-Briones (ARB) - observer

**Absent:** None

**Staff:** Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Paul Lewis (PL); Devon Pattillo (DP)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of January 12, 2018**
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Imports
  - Update re: NOSB vacancy
  - Update re: NOP Deputy Administrator position
- **NOP news and update - JT**
  - Change to reviewing work agenda at NOSB meeting
  - Sanitizers
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Spring meeting timeline/deadlines
  - Travel
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. S
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
  - Crops (CS) - SE
  - Livestock (LS) - AS
  - Handling (HS) - LD
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of January 12, 2018** were approved with no changes
- **Chairs Report - TC**
  - Imports. The Chair noted that the call for panelists is a little behind scheduled but should be ready soon.
  - NOSB vacancy: Joelle Mosso resigned her position on the NOSB due to professional demands of her new job. The NOP is considering the options for filling Joelle Mosso's seat. A Board member asked about the potential for getting it filled before the Spring meeting.
- **NOP news and update - JT**
  - Update on recent Accredited Certifier Association (ACA) training. The NOP noted that the attendees were engaged and energetic. NOP presented training and updates on imports, pasture compliance, appeals, and accreditation, and there was an emphasis on audits. The NOP

will be reprising the training at BioFach next week. The NOP also announced the intention to hold a panel on imports at the April NOSB and received a lot of interest.

- Work agendas. The NOP and NOSB discussed the recent changes to the NOSB work agenda. The NOP clarified that they are asking the NOSB to focus on petitions and sunset reviews for the Spring meeting, and defer any other projects to a later date. The NOSB has several other projects that are complete or nearly complete, and requested that they be allowed to bring those forth to the Spring meeting. The NOSB Chair indicated the need for clarity around work agenda changes, so that it can be communicated to the organic community. Members expressed the desire to foster a collaborative environment between the program, the NOSB, and the community. The NOSB Chair will continue the discussion with the NOP to map out the path forward with regard to the remainder of the work agenda, as well as way to track items that are not going to be worked on in the immediate future. The group discussed the current NOP priorities, which are to strengthen enforcement and improve oversight of imports. Sanitizers is also an NOP priority, and the Materials Subcommittee will focus the scope of this project to highlight the importance to oversight and integrity. Members also discussed the value of their work in addressing inconsistencies in the implementation of the Organic Regulations, which helps to alleviate uncertainty among certifiers and the organic community. The NOSB feels that this can be accomplished through clarification of existing regulations.
- Subcommittee notes. The group discussed the recent decision to stop posting the NOSB Subcommittee notes. The NOP is considering other options to communicate to stakeholders what the Board is working on, such as adding additional detail to the Executive subcommittee notes, which will continue to be posted.
- Update on new NOSB nominee. Nomination package is still under review by the Secretary.
- Deputy administrator position vacancy – The Acting Deputy Administrator indicated that the hiring process is on track and the initial goal was to fill the position in the next month or two.
- Proposed rule on National List changes: Comments due March 19.
- NOP is reviewing the NOSB recommendations from the Fall 2017 meeting.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Spring meeting timeline/deadlines. See table below
  - Travel. Travel planning is underway and members will be able to proceed with flight arrangements soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
  - Handling (HS) - LD. The HS voted on the proposal for SDBS (petitioned) on the last call, and have a couple of sunset materials to complete. The next call agenda is very full. Joelle Mosso completed her work for the Spring meeting and the Chair will transition her work agenda items to other members.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. The document on excluded methods is moving forward, but the NOP asked that the MS delay work until Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) develops their framework for Genetic Engineering. NOSB asked for the opportunity to work more closely with APHIS as they are developing the framework, as opposed to contributing after it is complete. The MS and NOP will discuss this further on the next MS call. The project on the integrity of organic seed is moving forward, and the MS Chair is attending a seed breeders meeting next week. The request to add sanitizers to the MS work agenda is still in revision, and is close to NOP approval.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. The PDS has not met, and had no update.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) - SR. The proposal on inspector qualifications is nearly complete. The Chair noted the great conversations about this topic that occurred at the recent ACA training.

- Crops (CS) - SE. Crops has completed their sunset material reviews for the Spring meeting. There are several petitioned substances - polyoxin D zinc salt, natamycin, and sulfur (as molluscicide) - that could potentially be ready for the Spring meeting. Crops is waiting for TRs for three petitioned materials: allyl isothiocyanate, ammonium citrate, and ammonium glycinate. The proposal on marine materials is finalized and ready for a vote, and the CS is waiting to hear from NOP about whether or not it will be put on the Spring 2018 meeting agenda.
- Livestock (LS) - AS. The LS has two petitioned materials: glycolic acid, which will be ready for the Spring meeting; and oxalic acid, which is awaiting a TR. The Subcommittee would like to bring forth a discussion document to the Spring meeting on defining emergency treatment for parasiticides. The LS sunset reviews are completed.
- **Additional Items.** Members asked for an update about the work agenda for the spring meeting, as the proposal deadline is approaching.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

- January 12, 2018
- February 9, 2018
- March 9, 2018
- April 13, 2018
- May 11, 2018
- June 8, 2018
- July 13, 2018
- August 10, 2018
- September 14, 2018
- October 12, 2018
- November 9, 2018
- December 14, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, "Open" public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018

Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting - Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Executive Subcommittee (ES) Meeting Notes  
Friday, January 12, 2018, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Harriet Behar (HB), Materials Chair; NOSB Vice Chair; Dan Seitz (DS), PDS Chair; Jesse Buie (JB); Ashley Swaffar (AS), Livestock Chair; Scott Rice (SR), CACS Chair, NOSB Secretary; Steve Ela (SE) - observer  
**Absent:** Tom Chapman (TC), NOSB Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Handling Chair; Asa Bradman (AB) - observer  
**Staff:** Jenny Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Paul Lewis (PL); Lisa Brines (LB)

**Agenda**

- **Approve notes of December 8, 2017**
- **Chairs Report** - HB for TC
  - Subcommittee assignments update
  - Update on appointment of new NOSB member
- **NOP news and update** - JT.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update** - MA
  - Final posting of Fall 2017 meeting materials
  - Notice of Spring meeting status
- **Subcommittee Reports** (5 minutes each)
  - Livestock (LS) - AS
  - Handling (HS) - SR for LD
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR
  - Crops (CS) - SE
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

**Discussion**

- **Notes of December 8, 2017** were approved with no changes.
- **Chairs Report** - HB
  - Subcommittee assignments update. The new Subcommittee assignments were completed in December. There were a couple of minor changes.
  - Update on appointment of new NOSB member. The nomination package is still under review.
- **NOP news and update** - JT.
  - Greg Ibach, Under Secretary of Marketing and Regulatory Programs (MRP) held a Town Hall meeting yesterday. Organic integrity was mentioned, indicating that it is a priority.
  - Bruce Summers is still the acting Agricultural Marketing Service (AMS) administrator.
  - The Organic Policy Advisor position is vacant and there are no immediate plans to refill the position.
  - The AMS Deputy Administrator position was advertised recently, and is not yet filled. Ruihong Guo will continue to act in that role.
  - Lisa Brines, the National List Manager is leaving NOP January 19. NOP will seek to fill her position.
  - Comments on the Organic Livestock and Poultry Practices (OLPP) final rule are due January 17, 2018.

- The NOP is hosting a certifier training in San Antonio in February, and is currently preparing materials. There are several focus areas: a review on the pasture rules; supply chain and imports; and appeals.
- A member asked about the next steps for OLPP once the comment period closes. The NOP noted that the USDA is in exparte communication while in the rulemaking phase, and cannot discuss details.
- There are two Federal Register notices that should be published soon: The meeting announcement for the Spring 2018 NOSB meeting, and the National List rule for various substances.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
  - Final posting of Fall 2017 meeting materials. Meeting materials should be posted on the NOSB webpage soon.
  - Notice of Spring meeting status. The notice will preview on January 16 and publish on the 17th. The written comment period will open when the notice publishes but the oral comment sign up will open later, when the proposals are posted.
  - Travel planning for the Spring meeting could be conducted towards the end of February or beginning of March.
- **Subcommittee Reports (5 minutes each)**
  - Livestock (LS) - AS. Livestock is working on sunset items, several petitions and the emergency treatment proposal. With regard to the sunset reviews, the LS Chair noted that one may be controversial: vaccines.
  - Handling (HS) - SR. The HS focused on the SDBS petition on the last call, and is also working on sodium chlorite for the generation of chlorine gas. Both proposals should be completed soon. The Handling sunset materials are under review, and the HS is waiting for TRs for some substances.
  - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) - HB. Materials is actively working on the proposal on the genetic integrity of seed, and may collaborate with the Crops Subcommittee members. The MS has also discussed the document on excluded methods and the Chair will talk with NOP about the direction of the document, and how to collaborate with APHIS. The contaminated inputs project is delayed for now as the lead hasn't had a chance to work on it.
  - Policy Development (PDS) - DS. The PDS does not have any calls scheduled at this time. The PDS Chair and NOSB Chair discussed some minor edits to the Policy & Procedures Manual (PPM), and chose to defer them to a later date.
  - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) - SR. The CACS is prepping for the imports panel that will be held at the Spring NOSB meeting. The panel will be composed of certifier and industry representatives (e.g. traders and brokers). The NOP provided a timeline to the CACS for choosing panelists and determining the focus. The CACS has a related project; looking at inspector qualifications. A document on native ecosystems that was sent back to Subcommittee at the Fall 2017 meeting is being developed for the Spring 2018 meeting. The Subcommittee has a full agenda and added some additional calls to support the workload.
  - Crops (CS) - SE. The Crops Subcommittee is busy reviewing sunset materials, which the Chair noted are non-controversial. There are eight petitions on the work agenda, at various stages in the review process. Some will be completed for the Spring meeting, and some are still awaiting TRs. Field and Greenhouse Container Production is still on the work agenda, as it was a discussion document at the Fall 2017 meeting. The lead reviewer expressed an interest in working on this further. The NOP suggested that the group focus on sunset materials and petitions for now. The lead felt strongly about summarizing the last round of comments and acknowledging those comments so the community knows they were heard.

- **Additional Items.**
  - The members verified the accuracy of the roll call in the December 8 meeting notes.
  - A member urged people to comment on OLPP by the January 17 deadline.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

**Future call schedule: All calls 1:00 ET/10:00 PT**

December 8, 2017  
 January 12, 2018  
 February 9, 2018  
 March 9, 2018  
 April 13, 2018  
 May 11, 2018  
 June 8, 2018  
 July 13, 2018  
 August 10, 2018  
 September 14, 2018  
 October 12, 2018  
 November 9, 2018  
 December 14, 2018

Spring 2018 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member orientation	TBD
NOSB - Spring 2018 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2018
NOP - Complete Spring 2018 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 6, 2018
NOP - Post proposals, "Open" public comment	Mar 6, 2018
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 9, 2018
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2018
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 9, 2018
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 13, 2018
Public comment webinar(s)	Apr 17 & 19, 2018
Spring 2018 NOSB meeting – Tucson, AZ	Apr 25-27, 2018