

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, December 20, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & Crops & CACS Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - PDS Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC) - Livestock Vice Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair

Absent: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve November 15, 2022 notes**
- **Chairs Report (ADB for NPP)**
 - Sunset templates - universal deadlines
 - NOSB work agenda for Spring meeting and beyond
 - Annotation changes
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). Comment period closed November 10, 2022
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). Comments due December 31, 2022
 - National List Rules
 - Nomination's update
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline reminder (See below)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD)
 - Livestock (LS) (BC)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). Work agenda requests
 - Crops (CS) (RG/ADB)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **November 15, 2022 notes** were approved as written.
- **Chairs Report (ADB in place of NPP)**
 - Sunset templates - universal deadlines. The Chair summarized the new process the Subcommittees are piloting and opened it up for feedback and questions from members. The process was launched quickly with the goal of having all sunset reviews prepped early, so they can be reviewed by a second Subcommittee member before the document is passed to the full Board. Members expressed support for this new process, although it was launched quickly without clear guidelines and was not as smooth as they would have liked. The goal is continuous improvement, and this has improved the review process by requiring members to circulate drafts in advance of discussions.

- NOSB work agenda. The group reviewed the current iteration of the [NOSB Work Agenda](#) for the Spring meeting and beyond. A member asked about the process for getting something added to the work agenda, and was directed to the procedure laid out in the [Policy and Procedures Manual \(PPM\)](#).
- Annotation changes. The NOSB has been discussing a work agenda project on how to manage annotation changes, which often come up during sunset review. The NOSB would like to propose a standing work agenda item in Handling, Crops, and Livestock for annotation changes, then, during sunset reviews, there would be an option to ask questions of the community, and then perhaps request a TR if needed.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). The final rule is in clearance, and NOP anticipates that it will be published soon. NOP recently announced at a conference that publication is weeks, not months, away.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). The comment period closed November 10, 2022, and the NOP is evaluating comments at this time.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). Comments due December 31, 2022.
 - National List (NL) Rules. There are several sunset renewals and NL rules in clearance.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Spring meeting timeline (See below). The deadline to submit proposals for the Spring meeting is mid-February.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) (JD). The PDS met last week and worked on several topics including PPM updates and exit interviews.
 - Livestock (LS) (BC). No quorum so today's Livestock call was cancelled.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) (ADB). The CACS sent four work agenda requests to the Executive Committee members, and is seeking approval to have them added. The Exec Committee approved all four and the CACS Chair will send a follow up email to the NOP seeking final approval.
 - 1. Under the current work agenda item on Enforcement: Continuation of work on certificates to identify and standardize "transition" parcels (Spring 2023).
 - 2. Under Climate:
 - a. Climate induced farming risk and crop Insurance discussion document (Spring 2023).
 - b. What/why organic? Looking at marketing and how to shine a light on the structure and benefits of organic, given that there is not currently a marketing program (Spring 2023).
 - 3. Under Human Capital: Support for transitioning producers (Fall 2023).
 - Crops (CS) (RG). The CS met today and completed a few sunset reviews, and a TR sufficiency determination.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). Handling met today and has reviewed 8 out of 19 sunsets. There are a couple of pending TRs for 2025 sunset substances, and they are anticipating answers to follow-up questions about the rye pollen extracts petition.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The MS Chair prepared a list of topics for consideration for the next iteration of the research priorities. Excluded Methods will go forward for the Spring 2023 meeting, likely as a discussion document. The MS also discussed a TR for induced mutagenesis, which is part of the excluded methods document.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

November 15, 2022

December 20, 2022

January 17, 2023

February 21, 2023

March 21, 2023

April 17, 2023 (Monday)

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Monday, November 15, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), NOSB Secretary & CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve September 20, 2022 notes**
- **Approve October 17, 2022 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall Meeting debrief
 - Reminder re: sharing information. Please remind the public to send comments to NOP for posting to the docket. Information shared with the Board is public.
 - Sunset templates/schedule discussions for Spring 2025
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE).
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). Comment period closed November 10, 2022.
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). Comments due December 31, 2022.
 - National List Rules
 - Nomination's update/process reminder
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Final Fall 2022 recommendations due:
 - Spring meeting timeline (See below). Atlanta, GA
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **September 20, 2022 notes** were accepted as written
- **October 17, 2022 notes** were accepted as written
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall NOSB Meeting debrief.
 - The NOSB Chair heard positive feedback from the community about the in-person meeting.

- The Chair praised the group for their collegiality, professionalism, and cohesiveness. He noted that it will be beneficial going forward.
 - Reminder re: sharing information. Please remind the public to send comments to NOP for posting to the docket. Information shared with the Board is public. Also, please refrain from circulating opinion pieces to all Board members, and try to only circulate and share research and background that the NOSB may need to do their work.
 - Sunset templates/schedule discussions for Spring 2025. Setting universal due dates for drafts, for efficiency and to improve the review process so people have enough time to review before they vote.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). OMB is reviewing.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). Comment period closed November 10, 2022. NOP received 39K + comments. Most were part of a letter writing campaign.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). Comments due December 31, 2022.
 - National List Rules. The final rule on low-acyl gellan gum and paper pots posted yesterday.
 - Nomination's update/process reminder. Application review is in progress.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Final Fall 2022 recommendations due November 30.
 - Spring meeting timeline (See below). Meeting is scheduled for Atlanta, GA
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). Moved today's LS call so folks could tune into the NOP listening session. The LS has six sunsets for the Spring meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS scheduled at least two calls per topic to allow for in-depth conversations before voting. There are two proposed topics under the Oversight improvements to deter fraud: Modernization of organic traceability: 1. A proposal on Minimum Reporting Requirements, and perhaps 2. a discussion document on grower groups (DD). The CACS is discussing whether to work on grower groups without knowing what is in the SOE final rule, since they are not looking to overlap or duplicate work. The CACS will also work on a proposal for Organic and Climate-Smart Agriculture. Amy Bruch will be Chair of the Crops Subcommittee in January once Rick Greenwood completes his Board term.
 - Crops (CS) (RG). Crops met today and scheduled sunset discussions. The Subcommittees are piloting a new process where all sunset review drafts are submitted at the same time, in December, so each one can be reviewed by a second Subcommittee member before it is presented to the rest of the group.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The Handling Subcommittee has nineteen sunsets for the Spring review, one petitioned material for rye pollen extract, and potentially three other topics, including research priorities. Ion exchange resins will be a proposal. The HS also discussed a work agenda item on annotation changes, which they will discuss further before requesting it be added.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). Materials has a light work agenda. After the Spring meeting they issued a call to action for others to engage in the excluded methods work. The MS has begun the 2023 Research Priorities process, and asked that the CS, HS, and LS keep it on the work agendas for the upcoming semester.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ). The new Chair for PDS will be Jerry D'Amore. He is looking forward to working on exit interviews and PPM updates. He noted that exit interviews are useful, and previous members were enthusiastic about sharing.
- **Additional Items.**
 - Feedback about in-person meeting. Angle of screens could have been better for the front table. It was great to be able to meet in person and engage with each other and members of the community.

- The new Subcommittee chairs and members will have a 2-month-long “apprenticeship” to transition, and will take over in January.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

October 18, 2022
 November 15, 2022
 December 20, 2022
 January 17, 2023
 February 21, 2023
 March 21, 2023
 April 17, 2023 (Monday)

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Monday, October 17, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Javier Zamora - observer; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer; Brain Caldwell (BC) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve September 20, 2022 notes (not yet available)**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Oral comment webinars this week (Oct 18 & 20)
 - Fall Meeting agenda review/questions
 - Potential questions for Q and A with NOP
 - Where to talk about topics not on agenda?
 - Public Comment review process
 - Comments from NOSB on rules - allowed?
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Update on hydroponics lawsuit
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule) (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR).
 - National List Rules.
 - Nomination's update.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Oral comment webinars
 - Fall meeting logistics. Travel, Pre-meeting administrative meeting, Board dinner, other gatherings.
 - Work agenda for projection - Subcommittee Chair review
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). Speaker intro at meeting
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **September 20, 2022 notes** were not ready for approval and will be circulated via email or approved at the next meeting.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**

- Oral comment webinars this week (Oct 18 & 20). The group briefly discussed the comment webinar logistics and preparation.
- Fall 2022 Meeting agenda review/questions? The group did a high-level review of the NOSB meeting agenda and will review it more thoroughly prior to the meeting next week.
- Members discussed potential questions for the Q and A with the NOP. The Chair asked that members focus comments/questions to things that are germane to the topic.
- The NOSB Chair asked where during the NOSB meeting is it appropriate to address topics not on agenda. Commenters mentioned several topics that are not on agenda, and the NOSB would like to acknowledge them.
- Public Comment review process. The group discussed the process for analyzing and summarizing both oral and written comments.
- Comments from NOSB on rules - allowed? The NOSB is interested in commenting on the OLPS rule to emphasize the need for finalization. Typically, the Board doesn't comment as a whole on rules and instead could put forth a resolution. The comment period closes November 10.
- The Chair reminded members that the Executive call is a time to share information candidly, and would like to ensure that people feel comfortable expressing opinions.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Hydroponics lawsuit. No update at this time.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). Under review at Office of Management and Budget (OMB). The NOP is anticipating comments soon.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). Comments now due November 10, 2022.
 - The Marketing Rule proposed rule (mushrooms, pet food) is under development.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). The comment period was extended to December 31, 2022.
 - National List Rule containing nitrogen products and fertilizers is in development.
 - Nomination's update. Applications are under review, and it is unlikely the appointee will be chosen or announced before the Fall NOSB meeting.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall meeting logistics. Travel is completed for the most part. The NOSB will have a pre-meeting administrative meeting to review the agenda and receive meeting materials.
 - Work agenda for projection at the meeting. The ACS asked that the Subcommittee Chairs review the list prior to presentation.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ). The PDS cancelled its last call. The NOSB will update the community about the timing of the NOSB meetings during the Chair's report on day 1.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). Livestock has 6 sunsets for the Fall meeting, and they are all straightforward and shouldn't be controversial.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has 5 topics on the Fall agenda, and received lots of thoughtful written comments and is looking forward to hearing oral comments this week.
 - Crops (CS) (RG). The CS has many agenda items for discussion at the Fall meeting: 15 sunsets and 2 proposals. Most are not controversial, although a couple of them, such as CO₂, garnered many written comments. The Chair noted that the sunset review of Biodegradable Biobased mulch Film (BBMF) might take some discussion time, and the CS may rearrange the agenda to allow more time for discussion.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The HS has many agenda items for discussion at the Fall meeting: Three proposals, 2 of which were petitioned, 1 discussion document on resins, and 12 sunset reviews.

- Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The MS Chair will introduce the guest speaker at the meeting, and in addition to proposal for research priorities, the MS will deliver a verbal update on excluded methods.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

September 20, 2022
 October 18, 2022
 November 15, 2022
 December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 23, 2022
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 5, 2022
NOSB - Fall 2022 proposals due to NOP	Aug 11, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 31, 2022
Public comment closes	Sep 29, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2022
Public comment webinars	Oct 18 & 20, 2022
Fall 2022 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 25 - 27, 2022
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Javier Zamora - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH)

Agenda

- **Approve August 16, 2022 notes (attached)**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall meeting planning
 - Speakers at Oct 2022 NOSB meeting
 - Field trips at NOSB meeting
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Update on hydroponics lawsuit
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - The Marketing Rule proposed rule (mushrooms, pet food)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR)
 - National List Rules
 - Nomination's update
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall meeting logistics, travel
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **August 16, 2022 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall meeting planning. The meeting will be live-cast via Zoom, and will be hybrid.
 - Speakers at Oct 2022 NOSB meeting: Brise Tencer from the Organic Farming and Research Foundation (OFRF) will present an update.
 - Field trips - The NOSB considered the possibility of holding a field trip to a local farm or operation prior to the meeting, but due to logistics, will not schedule one.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Update on hydroponics lawsuit. No update, as the court has not ruled at this time.

- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). Under review at Office of Management and Budget (OMB).
- Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) Comments due October 11. 17K comments received so far.
- The Marketing Rule proposed rule (mushrooms, pet food) is under development.
- Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). Comments due November 1, 2022. AMS is reviewing a request to extend the comment period.
- A National List Rule that includes NOSB recommendations on paper pots and low acyl gellan gum is in departmental clearance.
- A National List Rule that includes NOSB recommendations from the Fall 2021 and Spring 2022 is in development. It includes nitrogen products and fertilizers.
- Nomination's update. Applications are under review, and it is unlikely the appointee will be chosen before the Fall NOSB meeting.
- The NOP released a new course September 15 on the Origin of Livestock (OOL) in the Organic Integrity Learning Center (OILC)
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall meeting logistics. The ACS updated the members on travel, and meeting logistics.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) (RG). Crops Subcommittee met today and discussed TR sufficiency for the potassium sorbate petition. The CS had some additional questions for the contractor before they deem it sufficient.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The Chair noted that the Subcommittee is excited to see forward movement on inerts. The MS will discuss potential questions for the Q and A with the OFRF speaker, and will determine who will introduce her.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ). The PDS met last week to talk about the new NOSB designations so they can address any potential questions. The PDS also discussed Covid-19 protocols and precautions for the in-person meeting.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). Livestock is caught up, and will meet in October before NOSB meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS discussed process improvements to improve efficiency to increase discussion time for documents. The members also talked about the alumni panel scheduled for the last day of the NOSB meeting.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The HS met today and discussed long-term planning, a new petition for rye pollen extracts, a potential project on annotation changes, and a refresher on ancillary substances.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

August 16, 2022

September 20, 2022

October 18, 2022

November 15, 2022

December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 23, 2022
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 5, 2022
NOSB - Fall 2022 proposals due to NOP	Aug 11, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 31, 2022
Public comment closes	Sep 29, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2022
Public comment webinars	Oct 18 & 20, 2022
Fall 2022 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 25 - 27, 2022
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, August 16, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer

Absent:

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Erin Healy (EH)

Agenda

- **Approve July 19, 2022 notes (attached)**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall meeting proposal deadline - August 11
 - Fall meeting planning
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - SOE
 - OLPS (How can Board help? Messaging during comment period?)
 - Marketing Rule
 - ANPR Inerts
 - Others
 - Nomination's update
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall meeting documents - next steps; Comment period (Aug 31 - Sep 29)
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **July 19, 2022 notes were approved as written.**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - The NOSB Chair thanked Board members and NOP staff for the iterative review process as they prepare documents for the Fall meeting.
 - The Fall meeting proposal deadline was August 11. The Chair thanked everyone for submitting their proposals and discussion documents on time, and in many cases, early.
 - Fall meeting planning is underway. Members briefly discussed the structure of the meeting.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Meetings hosted by USDA where more than 50 people have to be approved by the USDA Covid Task Force at least 30 days prior. If the Board decides to hold the meeting virtually instead of in person, it would be helpful to decide as early as possible. The last Executive call before the hotel reservation cutoff is September 20.

- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). At Office of Management and Budget (OMB) for review.
- Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) Proposed Rule. The NOSB asked how or if the Board members could help with regard to communication to stakeholders. The NOP is hosting a listening session on August 19, and the rule is open for public comment through October 11, 2022.
- The Marketing Rule (Proposed Rule), which includes pet food and mushroom standards, is in development.
- A National List Rule that includes NOSB recommendations from the Fall 2020 and Spring 2021 meetings is under legal review. It includes paper pots and low acyl gellan gum.
- A National List Rule that includes NOSB recommendations from the Fall 2021 and Spring 2022 is in development. It includes nitrogen products and fertilizers.
- The Origin of Livestock Rule published in April.
- The Fall meeting notice was published in June, and the docket is open. The agenda, proposals and discussion documents should be posted around the end of August.
- The Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) is pending publication, and will likely publish in late August or early September.
- Nomination's update. The NOP received 10 applications for the Environmental/Resource Conservation seat to January 2023. Applications are under review.
- The response to the April 2022 NOSB recommendations is in clearance.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall meeting documents - next steps. The NOP is proofreading and reviewing the documents for technical accuracy, and since many of them were submitted early, has completed most of them. If any need to be edited, the NOP will send them back to the Subcommittee Chair/lead author.
 - The Fall 2022 comment period should be open for 30 days, and close around Sep 29, 2022.
 - Fall meeting planning. The NOP continues to monitor the [CDC guidance](#). Last week the community covid levels in Sacramento were high, this week they are medium. The conference room at the hotel is big (~5700) sq ft. and Board members will be spread out at a U-shaped table. The hotel still has enhanced cleaning measures and ventilation.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The Handling Subcommittee worked on several proposals during the last couple of calls. The HS tried to schedule several pre-conversations while writing and then voting on proposals, which was very helpful. The Chair plans to work on some outstanding projects over the summer, including ancillary substances, and noted that it's efficacious to think about bigger picture items while there is some time before the meeting.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The MS completed the Research Priorities proposal. They will also continue work on updating the Technical Report (TR) template, and the TBD list for the excluded methods project. The MS is considering a TR for induced mutagenesis.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ). The PDS discussed how the NOSB arrived at the April/October meeting time frame and will provide an update at the meeting either during the PDS section or at the beginning of the meeting during the NOSB section. Several members have reached out to stakeholders in farmer communities to talk about the factors that went into the decision. The PDS anticipates community comment about the redesignation of the NOSB members to SGEs. The NOSB doesn't expect much controversy about the public comment being scheduled only during webinars the week before the meeting and not at the meeting. The NOSB and community understand that this is the first in-person meeting, and it's transitory.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). The LS completed its sunset reviews early and has cancelled some calls.

- Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). CACS has five documents for the Fall 2022 meeting: Three proposals and two discussion documents. The Chair is seeking ways to improve efficiency in Subcommittee to complete large projects in a timely manner.
- Crops (CS) (RG). Crops had a full work agenda, with two petitioned proposals and many sunset reviews. The CS has also discussed the robustness of sunset reviews with an eye towards improving the process. This semester the NOSB requested TRs for many of the sunsets that had TRs that were 10 or more years old.
- **Additional Items.** Members expressed support and appreciation for the work that went into these really large, important projects such as the climate change discussion document.
- **Speaker invitations for Fall meeting.** The NOSB is discussing possible speakers for the Fall meeting. Members discussed potential topics and how to be fair and equitable when deciding who to invite. The Organic Farming Research Foundation (OFRF) offered to provide an update on the state of organic research, and the NOSB is considering other topics such as climate change as it pertains to organic, barriers to organic, resources, education, and marketing. The Board is anticipating a thoughtful and thorough conversation about climate smart agriculture to build on the CACS discussion document.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

- June 21, 2022
- July 19, 2022
- August 16, 2022
- September 20, 2022
- October 18, 2022
- November 15, 2022
- December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 23, 2022
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 5, 2022
NOSB - Fall 2022 proposals due to NOP	Aug 11, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 31, 2022
Public comment closes	Sep 29, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2022
Public comment webinars	Oct 18 & 20, 2022
Fall 2022 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 25 - 27, 2022
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, July 19, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Logan Petrey (LP) - MS Vice Chair MS; Javier Zamora (JZ) - observer

Absent: Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- **Approve June 21, 2022 notes (attached)**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall meeting proposal deadline - August 11
 - Meeting timing - background and criteria for decision.
 - BBMF update
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - SOE, OLPS, Marketing Rule, ANPR Inerts, Others
 - Update on recent fraud case/CACS work on oversight to deter fraud
 - Update on Human Capital project
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall meeting logistics/Travel (October 18, 20, 25-27)
 - Spring 2022 - Atlanta April
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
- **Additional Items**
- **Adjourn**

Discussion

- **June 21, 2022 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall meeting proposal deadline is August 11. Please submit proposals as they are completed.
 - Meeting timing - background and criteria for decision. Stakeholders have asked that the meetings be moved to a different time of year, and after two surveys, members have concluded that April/October works best for the majority. The NOSB Chair asked the Subcommittee Chairs to discuss this on upcoming Subcommittee calls so members can address any stakeholder questions. The PDS will talk more about the criteria used to make the decision during its August call, and anyone is welcome to listen.
 - A member asked about having the Subcommittee Chairs gather to discuss overall NOSB workload. For example, Livestock has a light agenda and has cancelled calls, which could be “donated” to other, busier subcommittees.
 - Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) update. BBMF is under sunset review, and Crops is discussing how this intersects with the NOSB recommendation that was voted on at the Fall

2021 meeting. Based on feedback from Board, NOP agrees to hold the rulemaking until after the Fall meeting.

- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**

- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). The final rule is in departmental review. After other agencies have an opportunity to review it, it will then proceed to the Office of Management and Budget (OMB).
- Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). The proposed rule is currently under review at the Office of Management and Budget (OMB). Once OMB returns it, it will get posted in the Federal Register for a 60-day comment period.
- The Marketing Rule, which includes pet food and mushroom standards, is in development.
- Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). In review.
- National List Rules: Final rule on low acyl gellan gum and paper pots is nearly complete.
- Proposed rule on ammonia extracts and associated ammonia recommendations is being drafted in NOP. Update on recent fraud case in Minnesota. An operation in MN that had its certification revoked in 2020, was recently charged with grain fraud by the Department of Justice. Since the CACS has an active work agenda item on oversight to deter fraud, the CACS chair asked if the NOSB can help in any way. The NOP noted that in addition to the work the CACS is already doing, the Strengthening Organic Enforcement Rule is likely to be helpful in situations like this. Members were encouraged to reach out to the NOSB Chair for questions.
<https://www.ams.usda.gov/services/enforcement/organic-enforcement-activity>
- Update on Human Capital project. The human capital project was initiated a year ago, and so far has been a success. It has resulted in apprenticeships, farm days, and intensive trainings, among other things. The NOP is receiving deliverables and will curate them into materials for dissemination. Aspects such as inspector qualifications and training, and work force development will be longer term projects and are likely to be folded into future initiatives.
- Climate smart grants. NOP has no information about timeline for awards.
- NOSB Charter. The Charter is renewed every two years, and in the latest renewal the USDA chose to redesignate four seats on the Board from representatives to SGE's (special government employees). The primary difference is that SGEs have to file financial disclosure forms each year and are held to the government conflict of interest standards. This change will be announced in the Organic Insider this week, and the Charter will be posted on the AMS website. Should any of the four affected members choose to not redesignate, they will be allowed to continue as is, and any new appointees to those seats will be SGEs.. Members discussed the challenges this could pose for future recruitment.
- NOP is participating in BioFach next week in Germany, and will be holding certifier training with the international certification community.
- NOP's Compliance & Enforcement and Accreditation Divisions are busy with many compliance and oversight activities.
- A member remarked on the issue of pesticide drift, specifically dicamba, which is currently affecting a number of organic operations. Farmers who are affected indicate that because there doesn't seem to be any recourse, and because there is a lack of liability, they aren't reporting it. Also, previous attempts at litigation have not been successful. The group wondered if there is a way to address this in the upcoming farm bill.

- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**

- Fall meeting logistics/Travel (October 18, 20, 25-27). Planning for an in-person meeting in Sacramento, but COVID levels in CA are rising, and we will keep an eye on those as the meeting nears.
- The Spring 2023 meeting is scheduled for Atlanta, GA April 25 -27, 2023.

- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Crops (CS) (RG).** The Crops Subcommittee voted on three sunsets today. Making good progress going into fall meeting. Coppers are under review and might garner interest in the community.
 - **Handling (HS) (KS).** Handling added another call to complete five agenda items: two sunset reviews and three proposals. The Chair posed a question for the Executive Team regarding the phosphoric acid annotation change. At the Spring meeting a commenter suggested a wording change from “cleaner” to “sanitizer”, and wondered if that would be better done as a separate work agenda item, or if the HS could suggest a technical correction as part of the phosphoric acid proposal. KS will follow up with email. The distinction is that cleaners are rinsed, and sanitizers are not. The NOP added that there is similar wording in the Livestock and Handling listing, and it might be better to address it as a separate work agenda item.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (LP).** MS has three ongoing projects: Distilled tall oil is on hold until there is some resolution for how to move ahead with reviews of inerts; Research Priorities proposal is in progress; and Excluded Methods. The MS will not have a document on Excluded Methods for the Fall, as it is waiting for the NOP response to its Spring 2022 recommendations. The MS is also working on updating the TR templates to remove some redundancy, add questions about Excluded Methods, and align the TR template with the petition template.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) (MJ).** The PDS will meeting on August 9 to talk more about the meeting timing. The PDS Chair extended an invitation for anyone who wants to listen.
 - **Livestock (LS) (KH).** The Livestock Subcommittee has a light agenda this semester. The LS has completed all sunset reviews for the Fall meeting, and will cancel the next meeting. On the last call the LS discussed making future changes to its research priorities list to remove some redundancy.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB).** The CACS completed one proposal (NOSB tech support) on its last call, and have several other projects in progress for the Fall meeting. The Risk Mitigation Table proposal is moving ahead. The proposal addressing acreage on certificates is in progress. Climate-smart Ag discussion document is underway, and the lead is seeking feedback from other NOSB members by the end July. The CACS may work on the second part of the fraud project having to do with bills-of-lading, but is unsure what it will look like for Fall meeting.
- **Additional Items.**
 - Streamlining work. Members discussed ways to streamline sunset reviews so they can work on other work agenda items. Some ideas included collaboration/co-leads on reviews, and revisiting the idea of using a consent calendar for voting, which was previously proposed and voted down by the full NOSB.
 - A member mentioned the steep learning curve for new members, noting that it can take about 2 years to really get into the rhythm of the role.
 - A member suggested having a separate subcommittee that only does sunset reviews.
 - A member suggested prioritizing sunsets that need more attention.
 - The CACS’s proposal for NOSB tech support would alleviate the sunset load.
 - A member noted that there is a delicate balance between getting assistance with the workload and transparency.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

June 21, 2022

July 19, 2022
August 16, 2022
September 20, 2022
October 18, 2022
November 15, 2022
December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 23, 2022
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 5, 2022
NOSB - Fall 2022 proposals due to NOP	Aug 11, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 31, 2022
Public comment closes	Sep 29, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2022
Public comment webinars	Oct 18 & 20, 2022
Fall 2022 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 25 - 27, 2022
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, June 21, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Javier Zamora (JZ) - observer

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); David Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH)

Agenda

- Approve May 17, 2022 notes (attached)
- Chairs Report (NPP)
 - Fall meeting structure update
 - Reminder: Submit draft documents to Subcommittee members early enough for review
 - Fall meeting prep - 48 items at Fall meeting. Schedule time for reading.
- NOP news and update (JT/EH)
 - Rulemaking update (SOE, OLPS, ANPR on Inerts, Marketing Rule, etc.)
- Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)
 - Fall timeline, proposal submissions
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Meeting timing update
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 17, 2022 notes** were approved as written
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Fall meeting structure update. The Executive team discussed the structure of the Fall meeting. Currently the plan is to meet in-person for the first time in several years, and the NOP is going to live-stream the meeting, which will open viewing access to those who can't or don't want to travel.
 - Reminder: The Chair reminded folks to share Subcommittee documents early enough to allow other Subcommittee members adequate time to review and provide feedback. The NOSB Vice Chair also encouraged thorough, rigorous debates in Subcommittee to produce the best possible product before it goes to the full Board.
 - Fall meeting prep. There are approximately 48 items on the Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda. The Chair encouraged members to schedule adequate time for reading.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Rulemaking update

- Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) Final Rule. Cleared by Office of General Counsel (OGC) and is in USDA clearance. The organic industry is interested in this rule, and can request meetings with the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) once the rule is transmitted to them. NOP cannot share contents of the rule before publication – that is why there is typically a one-year implementation period.
- Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). NOP continues to work with OMB during its review phase .
- National List Rule that includes NOSB recommendations from the Fall 2020 and Spring 2021 meetings is with OGC for legal review.
- The meeting notice announcing the NOSB Fall meeting is due to publish this week.
- Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). In Departmental clearance.
- Marketing Rule, which includes pet food and mushroom standards is under development.
- Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF). NOP has started drafting a proposed rule based on an NOSB recommendation from the Fall 2021 meeting. The Crops Subcommittee is currently considering a sunset review for BBMF and has discussed removal based on some new information in public comments received at the Spring meeting. If the Crops Subcommittee votes to remove BBMF at sunset, it would have implications for any possible rulemaking. The CS will meet again on July 5 to discuss.
- Two of the NOP Divisions, the Compliance & Enforcement and the Accreditation team have grown significantly over the last year and are meeting in DC this week.
- NOP has begun projects focused on import certificates technology.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall timeline. See table below
 - Proposal submissions. Fall 2022 proposals are due to NOP August 11. The NOP asked that members submit proposals as they complete them rather than wait until the deadline.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACs) (ADB). The CACS is working on several projects for the Fall meeting:
 - Risk management table - focusing on the items that are in-scope.
 - Climate change framework based on the memo from NOP
 - Modernization of organic traceability. The CACS is decoupling the two parts of the document so they can work on them separately. 1. Acreage/mass balance of yields and 2. Bills-of-lading . NOP mentioned a talk the Secretary of Ag gave earlier this month about the organic transitions program and thinks it will assist with several aspects of this project, such as Organic System Plans (OSPs). A member added that the FDA has a program that uses something similar to the OSP and it might be helpful to engage them to see if it's something that could be helpful.
 - Human Capital Management: NOSB Technical Support. In progress.
 - Crops (CS) (RG). Crops reviewed and voted on 3 sunsets today. The Subcommittee has 15 sunset reviews and 3 proposals, and is currently waiting for a couple of TRs.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The HS discussed the phosphoric acid petition/proposal, several sunset reviews, and the research priorities. The HS will also continue work on the ion exchange proposal.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The MS has 3 ongoing projects. The review of distilled tall oil will be put on hold as the NOP is working on an advance notice of proposed rulemaking (ANPR) on inerts which is relevant to for reviewing inerts. Research Priorities (RPs) will move ahead for the Fall meeting, and the MS will look at how best to disseminate them better for the next iteration. The Subcommittee will not put forth a document for Excluded Methods for the Fall meeting.

- Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Meeting timing update. The NOP polled the NOSB members twice about the timing of the Board meetings, and the majority chose to continue holding meetings in April/October. The PDS will provide a verbal update at the Fall meeting. Access, equality, participation, and transparency are paramount, and the PDS and NOSB wants the community to know they heard their concerns.
 - The NOSB would like to pursue a transitional format for the Fall meeting as we move out of the pandemic to in-person meetings. This includes live-streaming the meeting, and holding all public comment during the webinars the week prior to the meeting.
- Livestock (LS) (KH). The LS has 6 sunset substances and is finalizing the research priorities for the Fall meeting.
- **Additional Items.** Members discussed add-on labels/terms to organic such as regenerative and sustainable.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

- May 17, 2022
- June 21, 2022
- July 19, 2022
- August 16, 2022
- September 20, 2022
- October 18, 2022
- November 15, 2022
- December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 23, 2022
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 5, 2022
NOSB - Fall 2022 proposals due to NOP	Aug 11, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 31, 2022
Public comment closes	Sep 29, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2022
Public comment webinars	Oct 18 & 20, 2022
Fall 2022 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 25 - 27, 2022
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, May 17, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); David Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH)

Agenda

- Approve April 18, 2022 notes (Attached)
- Chairs Report (NPP)
 - NOSB Spring meeting recap
 - Writing conventions (Subcomm vs NOSB)
 - Final recommendations due May 20
 - NOSB paths forward
- NOP news and update (JT/EH)
 - Rulemaking update (SOE, OLPS, ANPR on Inerts)
 - Ammonia Extract
 - NOP Listening Session Priorities
- Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)
 - Fall timeline
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 18, 2022 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - NOSB Spring meeting recap. The Chair expressed appreciation to everyone for their hard work and contribution, noting that the group was cohesive, respectful, and professional. The meeting went well and the NOSB had great discussions.
 - The Chair mentioned the need for outreach to distinguish between what is actionable at the Board/NOP/Congressional levels, and perhaps provide some guidance to stakeholders about the most effective way to engage with Congress.
 - Writing conventions (Subcomm vs. NOSB). The NOSB Chair asked that members be cognizant of attributions with regard to what comes from the NOSB vs the Subcommittee.
 - Sunset review and sharing of drafts. The Chair asked that members please send draft documents ahead of time, so folks have plenty of time to read them before Subcommittee calls.

- Members discussed best practices for summarizing stakeholder feedback, and shared ideas for being more precise about stakeholder groups when summarizing comments. Members also mentioned the importance of capturing the Board discussion in the final recommendation coversheet, so all views are articulated, especially when there is a split vote.
- Final recommendations due May 20.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Rulemaking update
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) - Under legal review.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) - Under OMB review.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) - In departmental (USDA) clearance.
 - Market development proposed rule - in development (mushrooms and pet food).
 - National List proposed rule on NOSB recommendations (Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film, (BBMF), Sodium Nitrate, Ammonia Extract, and 20% soluble nitrogen) in development. NOP bundled several recommendations from the Fall 2021 and Spring 2022 meetings into one rulemaking, since they are related or similar, but each component will be considered independently.
 - Final rule for paper pots and low-acyl gellan gum in development.
 - The NOP communicates to the industry via NOSB meetings, Executive Committee notes, the Regulatory Agenda, memos to the Board, and the NOSB recommendation library.
 - NOP Listening Session Priorities. The NOP asked the NOSB if it wanted to work on the Native Ecosystems topic again, noting that it received strong support from the community, but there continue to be challenges about its alignment with the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA).
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)**
 - Fall timeline (see table below).
 - Notice for Fall 2022 NOSB meeting. In clearance and should publish in the next few weeks. The groups briefly discussed the pros and cons of having oral public comment at the meeting itself – this was a topic explored in a discussion document last Fall. Variables include contingency planning due to changes related to Covid, and fairness in access/equity. The group will continue to discuss.
 - Notice announcing call for nominations for NOSB seat starting January 2023. In clearance and should publish soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Livestock (LS) (KH).** The Chair noted that the Spring meeting went well. Livestock will have six sunset reviews up for votes this Fall. None seem controversial. The LS met today and scheduled discussion dates for its sunset reviews, and will work on the research priorities in conjunction with the Materials Subcommittee.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB).** The CACS met last week and reviewed the feedback and outcomes of the Spring NOSB meeting, and discussed the current work agenda. There are four projects slated for the Fall NOSB meeting.
 - Discussion document for NOSB technical support - garnered support from stakeholders at the Spring meeting and the CACS is going to develop a proposal.
 - Risk Mitigation Table Proposal - sent back to the CACS and they may revisit the project for the Fall meeting.
 - Climate Smart Agriculture framework - discussion document planned for Fall NOSB meeting.
 - Oversight to deter fraud - The CACS will decouple topics into two separate projects: one for acreage/mass balance of yields and one for bills-of-lading. Certifiers indicated that

~half of non-compliances are for records compliance and sometimes this leads operations to look for a new certifier. The CACS is assessing both of these issues, and will reach out to stakeholders for deeper insight and feedback as they develop the documents.

- **Crops (CS) (RG).** Crops voted on three sunset substances during today's call, which will now be sent to the full NOSB for the Fall meeting. The group discussed ongoing issues with Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF) and use of plastic. The NOSB Chair is interested in working with Crops to do some outreach about BBMF issues to assist with controversial aspects, such as phthalates.
 - **Handling (HS) (KS).** The HS is working on completing its Spring recommendations, and has also blocked out its summer schedule, in preparation for the Fall NOSB meeting. On its call today, the HS discussed ion exchange, and how to decouple recharge materials from resins. The Subcommittee will move forward with a proposal for recharge materials, which are in use already, and will continue to discuss resins.
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT).** The Materials Subcommittee is working on several items for the Fall meeting including research priorities and excluded methods. The MS discussed the NIFA presentation they heard at the Spring meeting, and will reassess the format and distribution of the research priorities proposal so it is more impactful for the research community. The MS also continued to discuss inerts, and specifically the petition for distilled tall oil (DTO). Currently there is not a process in place for reviewing inerts and the NOP is working on an Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) to solicit ideas about how to proceed.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) (MJ).** The PDS met last week to discuss outcomes from the Spring meeting and to discuss projects for the Fall meeting. In June the PDS will discuss the timing of NOSB meetings, and possible alternatives to the April/October schedule. Other NOSB members are welcome to join to listen to the discussion.
- **Additional Items.** None.
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

March 15, 2022

April 18, 2022 - Monday

May 17, 2022

June 21, 2022

July 19, 2022

August 16, 2022

September 20, 2022

October 18, 2022

November 15, 2022

December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Fall 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2022
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 5, 2022
NOSB - Fall 2022 proposals due to NOP	Aug 11, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 31, 2022
Public comment closes	Sep 29, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2022
Public comment webinars	Oct 18 & 20, 2022
Fall 2022 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 25 - 27, 2022
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Monday, April 18, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Javier Zamora (JZ) - observer; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer; Logan Petrey (LP) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- Approve March 15, 2022 notes
- Chairs Report (NPP)
 - NOSB April meeting/Notes for new members
 - Excluded methods proposal
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) final rule
- NOP news and update (JT/EH)
 - Listening session follow up
 - Rulemaking update
 - NOP OOL webinar April 20, 2022
 - NOP update videos
- Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update (MA)
 - Spring meeting logistics (comment webinars and NOSB meeting)
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Excluded methods proposal
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 15, 2022 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - NOSB April meeting/Notes for new members. The Chair is hoping to set the stage for a successful meeting and have the new members feel comfortable at their first NOSB meeting.
 - The NOSB Chair is interested in highlighting the “wins” from this last year, and asked members to share any successes or outcomes.
 - Members discussed questions for the NOP update. Topics for which they would like an update include inerts, international supply chain issues with grain, temporary variances, use of the organic seal in restaurants, and packaging.

- Excluded methods proposal. Public commenters support the proposal but asked for a terminology change. The Materials Subcommittee asked the NOP to assess whether the change would be substantive and if the proposal would then have to be sent back to Subcommittee. NOP will let the NOSB know before the meeting.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - **Rulemaking Update**
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) - The final rule was published, and the NOP is holding a webinar this Wednesday, April 20, to summarize the rule, and discuss next steps for implementation.
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) - Under legal review.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) - NOP responded to feedback from the Office of Management and Budget and sent it back for further review.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) - Under legal review.
 - [NOP Priorities Listening session](#). Regulatory priorities webinar was held March 21. NOP is currently reviewing comments and will provide an update at the NOSB meeting. Initially the highlights including seeds, containers, and native ecosystems. A member had a follow up question about international use of organic seed.
 - [Proposed Rule](#) that includes paper pots, low-acyl gellan gum, and proposes the correction to the spelling of “wood resin” was published, and the comment period closed April 4, 2022. NOP is reviewing comments.
 - NOP is discussing the ammonia extracts recommendation, and hopes to have an update to share soon.
 - National Organic Program Update: recorded presentations are available in the [Organic Integrity Learning Center](#) (OILC)
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update - MA**
 - Spring meeting logistics reminder. Comment webinars are this week, and the meeting commences next week. NOP will log in early each day next week, so members can join early to test mics and cameras.
 - NOP will draft the coversheets for the final NOSB recommendations and send them soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ). The PDS has reviewed public comments and is ready for discussion at the Spring meeting.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). The LS has six sunsets for the Spring meeting. The Subcommittee met recently to talk about research priorities around livestock feed, including oils which can be used in both food and feed. The NOSB Chair thanked the LS for suggesting this topic, which has been a topic of conversation at several recent industry meetings.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). The CACS has been impressed with stakeholder feedback on their documents, noting the wide range and thoroughness of comments. On the last call, the CACS discussed upcoming work, and would like to incorporate more identity-framing issues and marketing opportunities.
 - Crops (CS) (RG). Crops received many written comments on nitrogen fertilizers and ammonia. The majority of them were part of a letter writing campaign. Crops spent the last call scheduling discussion dates for its work agenda items.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). The HS Chair summarized the trends in comments for the Spring meeting. On its last call, the Handling Subcommittee scheduled discussions for the upcoming semester.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT). The Materials Subcommittee has three projects for the Spring meeting: Distilled tall oil (DTO), research priorities, and excluded methods. The MS is anticipating an update on inerts as it touches many projects the NOSB is working on. There are

two invited speakers: National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) and the Organic Seed Alliance (OSA). The MS is seeking an update from NIFA on the status of research priorities and whether the current process and format is valuable.

- **Additional Items.**
 - The Chair indicated interested in promoting civil discourse and respect at the meeting. A member added the value in coming together as a cohesive group and supporting each other.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

- March 15, 2022
- April 18, 2022 - Monday
- May 17, 2022
- June 21, 2022
- July 19, 2022
- August 16, 2022
- September 20, 2022
- October 18, 2022
- November 15, 2022
- December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 3, 2022
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	Mar 16 - 18, 2022
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 19 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, March 15, 2022 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Javier Zamora (JZ) - observer; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer

Absent: Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); David Glasgow (DG)

Agenda

- Approve February 15, 2022 notes
- Chairs Report (NPP)
 - NOSB April meeting (tentative agenda attached)
 - New member training March 16 - 18
 - April Exec call moved to Monday, April 18
- NOP news and update (JT/EH)
 - Rulemaking Update
 - NOP Listening session March 21
- Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update - MA
 - Spring meeting logistics
 - Comment period - open March 3 through April 1
 - Spring meeting practice webinars (April 13: public comments and April 14: meeting)
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 15, 2022 notes**
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Grain sourcing and Ukraine invasion. Ukraine is a large supplier of corn and soy, and the current situation will likely affect global supply. It touches many aspects of US agriculture as well as organic specifically. The Chair asks that the NOSB think about possible initiatives or solutions on how to grow domestic supply of grains. Several other members added thoughts about the humanitarian crisis having worked closely in the region.
 - NOP added that two certifiers in Ukraine/Russia have indicated that they no longer have the administrative capacity to work in this region. While the circumstances are very different, in terms of supply constraints, similar concerns with respect to certification and supply are being raised as when NOP first announced the transition away from the India organic recognition arrangement.

- A member asked about temporary variances given the current situation in Ukraine. The NOP shared language regarding requests for exceptions to the USDA organic regulations (temporary variances). Requests come from certifiers to the NOP, and it is long-standing published policy and practice that temporary variances may not be granted for feeding non-organic feed to organic livestock. The use of only organic feed for organic animals is a core expectation for consumers, and is essential to maintaining a fair and competitive market for organic producers.
- A member mentioned a research priority regarding yields and acreage, and asked if it possible to weight or rank the priorities for NIFA and/or ARS. The NOSB is free to reframe the document to highlight its top priorities.
- The NOSB is interested in engaging with the USDA regarding fertilizer and climate-smart agriculture.
- NOSB April meeting. The Spring meeting is about one month away, and will be held virtually.
- New member training will be held this week, March 16-18. NOP sent an invitation to all NOSB members, who are welcome to join to listen in.
- April Executive Team call moved to Monday, April 18.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - **Rulemaking Update**
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) - NOP reviewing/addressing comments from Office of Management and Budget (OMB).
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) - Under legal review/reviewing feedback from OGC.
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) - NOP reviewing/addressing comments from OMB.
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) - Under legal review.
 - Fall 2019 NOSB recommendations (fatty alcohols, potassium hypochlorite, and dairy cultures) is in USDA review.
 - [Final rule amending the National List](#) posted. Addresses 16 substances; 14 were removed and 2 were renewed, including oxytocin and sucrose octanoate esters.
 - [Proposed Rule](#) that includes paper pots and low-acyl gellan gum is open for comments. Comments due by April 4, 2022
 - The NOP will provide an update on the status of rulemaking at the April NOSB meeting.
 - [NOP Priorities Listening session is March 21](#). The NOP will hear oral public comment on March 21, and is seeking written comments through March 30. NOP will provide a summary of comments at the April NOSB meeting.
- **Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update - MA**
 - Spring meeting logistics. The NOP will soon send the proposals and instructions for identifying Conflicts of Interest.
 - Comment period: Open March 3 through April 1.
 - Spring meeting practice webinars: April 13: public comments and April 14: meeting
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)**. The MS will present the Research Priorities discussion document at the Spring meeting, and discuss how to rank the priorities. The MS will also present a proposal on excluded methods and a discussion document on distilled tall oil. The National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) was invited to provide an update at the Spring meeting, as was the Organic Seed Alliance. Both will be scheduled close to the materials Subcommittee section.
 - **Policy Development (PDS) (JD)**. The PDS will present one proposal with updates to the Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM) regarding the public comment process.

- **Livestock (LS) (KH).** The LS completed its 2024 sunsets for the Spring meeting, and began considering 2025 sunsets. On the last call they assigned leads and will determine the TR needs. They also onboarded new members.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB).** The CACS added a work agenda item on climate smart agriculture, which came to them via a memo from the NOP. There are two discussion documents on the April 2022 meeting agenda: Oversight efforts to deter fraud: Modernization of organic traceability; and Human Capital Management: Supporting the Work of the NOSB.
 - **Crops (CS) (RG).** The CS has a busy work agenda, including 14 sunset substances for 2025. On today's call they assigned leads and determined the need for TRs. For straightforward substances they determined it is not necessary to request new TRs, but will request new TRs for any that are older than 10 years. Two reviews were reassigned to new members: Highly soluble nitrogen, and carbon dioxide.
 - **Handling (HS) (KS).** The HS met today to discuss its work agenda. The group completed the initial review of nineteen 2025 sunsets and determined the need for TRs for most of them. They will complete the list on the next call. On the next call they will schedule discussion dates for the Fall work agenda items, including ion exchange and a petition for peroxy-lactic acid (PoLA). The Final Rule that removed whey protein concentrate was published, and now the petition to remove, which is on the Handling work agenda is moot. The NOP will contact the petitioner and let them know.
- **Additional Items.** None.
 - **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

- March 15, 2022
- April 18, 2022 - Monday
- May 17, 2022
- June 21, 2022
- July 19, 2022
- August 16, 2022
- September 20, 2022
- October 18, 2022
- November 15, 2022
- December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 3, 2022
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	Mar 16 - 18, 2022
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022

NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 19 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, February 15, 2022, 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Dilip Nandwani (DN) - observer; Javier Zamora (JZ) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Approve January 18, 2022 notes
- Chairs Report (NPP)
 - Welcome new members
 - Proposal submission deadline (Feb 16)
 - Spring 2022 meeting
 - Potential questions for the NOP Q & A at the NOSB meeting
 - Open docket - Not available for posting of draft documents or for submission of comments. Has hindered NOSB work this past semester.
- NOP news and update (JT/EH)
 - Rulemaking Update
 - NOP Listening session March 21. Are NOSB members allowed to comment?
- Advisory Committee Specialist (ACS) update - MA
 - Subcommittee proposal status
 - Spring meeting logistics
- Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 18, 2022 notes** were approved as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - New members. The Chair welcomed the new NOSB members who joined the call today, and they each introduced themselves. They will join Subcommittee calls soon.
 - Proposals for the Spring meeting are due tomorrow, February 16. Many are already submitted.
 - Spring 2022 meeting. The Board decided to move to a virtual platform for the Spring meeting.
 - Q & A at the NOSB meeting. The NOSB would like to pose some questions to the NOP at the NOSB meeting, as per the usual process, and will discuss questions at a future time.
 - Open docket. The NOSB emphasized the need and usefulness of opening the docket early so the Board can post draft documents on which they are seeking early public feedback.
 -

- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Rulemaking Update. The NOP summarized the rulemaking flowchart for the benefit of the new members, and provided an update on the following rules:
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) - NOP reviewing/addressing comments from Office of Management and Budget (OMB);
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) - Under legal review;
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS) - NOP reviewing/addressing comments from OMB;
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR) - Under legal review;
 - 2022 sunsets rule is in USDA review;
 - Fall 2019 NOSB recommendations (fatty alcohols, potassium hypochlorite, and dairy cultures) is in USDA review.
 - NOP Listening session March 21. Written comments are critical, and the NOP is encouraging stakeholders to submit via the comment docket, as this will aid in a thorough analysis of the priorities. NOP encouraged the NOSB members to share the announcement with stakeholders.
 - A member asked about combining multiple recommendations into one rule. NOP sometimes does this, for example, the sunset renewals from both Spring and Fall 2021 were combined.
 - NOP is currently working on a draft rule for the Fall 2022 NOSB recommendations, not including ammonia extracts.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Subcommittee proposal status. The NOP thanked the NOSB for submitting the documents for the Spring meeting on time and in some cases, early.
 - Spring meeting logistics. The NOP will finalize the proposals and discussion documents, and complete the draft meeting agenda with the intention of posting everything by March 3, 2022.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - **Handling (HS) (KS).** The Subcommittee completed its Spring proposals today, and will be discussing the TR requests for the next round of sunset reviews (2025).
 - **Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT).** The Subcommittee completed its 3 proposals for the Spring 2022 meeting: Excluded methods, distilled tall oil, and research priorities. The MS Chair asked about inviting two guest speakers to provide updates at the NOSB meeting; One from the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) and one from the Organic Seed Alliance (OSA).
 - **Policy Development (PDS) (MJ).** The PDS has one document for the Spring meeting; a proposal with an update to the Policy & Procedures Manual (PPM) regarding written public comment.
 - **Livestock (LS) (KH).** The LS cancelled today's call since they have completed all of the Spring reviews. The LS will start looking at 2025 sunset documents at the first meeting in March.
 - **Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB).** The CACS held a couple of extra calls to complete projects for the Spring NOSB meeting. The members discussed a potential work agenda item about the history of the NOSB and the sunset process, and if they decide to work on this it would need to go through the formal process to get added to work agenda first. The NOP is finalizing the memo to the Board regarding the climate change project, and is scoping another project on equity.
 - **Crops (CS) (RG).** The Crops Subcommittee has 15 sunsets and two proposals for the Spring meeting. The CS will discuss the 2025 sunset TR requests next month.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The NOSB Chair noted that the pacing of the workload during the time of transition from previous members to new members can be disruptive to continuity. The NOSB Vice Chair encouraged people to slow down and not try to rush projects if the timing is off.
 - RG offered to help prepare members for the Fall meeting, given that he is now the only board member that has attended an in-person meeting.

- The draft Spring meeting agenda will include time for USDA leadership, NIFA, and OSA.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

January 18, 2022

February 15, 2022 - Last call before proposal deadline

March 1, 2022

March 15, 2022

April 18, 2022 - Monday

May 17, 2022

June 21, 2022

July 19, 2022

August 16, 2022

September 20, 2022

October 18, 2022

November 15, 2022

December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	March 16 - 18, 2022
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 19 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**Executive Committee (EC) Meeting Notes and
Summary of National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Subcommittee Activities
Tuesday, January 18, 2022, 4:00 pm ET**

Present: Nate Powell-Palm (NPP), NOSB Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), NOSB Vice Chair & PDS Chair; Kyla Smith, NOSB Secretary & HS Chair; Rick Greenwood (RG) - Crops Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Materials Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), CACS Chair; Kim Huseman (KH), Livestock Chair; Steve Ela (SE) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD)

Absent: None

Staff: Jennifer Tucker (JT); Dave Glasgow (DG); Erin Healy (EH); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- December 21, 2021 notes
- Chairs Report (NPP)
 - Farewell to outgoing members (Steve, Asa, Sue)
 - Research Priorities update at Spring 2022 NOSB meeting (NIFA?)
 - Subcommittee progress on Spring agenda items
 - Identifying actionable work agenda items (SC Chairs --> Program)
- NOP news and update (JT/EH)
 - Update on NOP actions regarding seed guidance (NOP 5029)
 - Organic Seed Alliance request to update the NOSB on the third [State of Organic Seed](#) report
 - Federal Register updates, Rules, and Notices:
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL)
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE)
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS)
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR)
 - Spring 2022 NOSB Meeting Federal Register Notice (FRN)
 - NOSB nominations update
 - Spring 2022 NOSB meeting update
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Sunset list/templates for 2025 sunsets
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) (RG)
 - Handling (HS) (KS)
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Distilled tall oil in light of inerts review
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ)
 - Livestock (LS) (KH)
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 21, 2021 notes** were approved as written.
- **Chairs Report (NPP)**
 - Farewell to outgoing members (Steve, Asa, Sue). The Chair thanked the outgoing members for their service.

- Research Priorities update at Spring 2022 NOSB meeting. The NOSB is interested in learning about the status of past research priorities and getting more clarity about which items are moving forward and which ones might not be. The group discussed inviting NIFA to the Spring 2022 meeting to provide a detailed update.
- Subcommittee progress on Spring agenda items. Each of the Subcommittees is making good progress on agenda items, and should have a total of about 45 agenda items.
- Identifying actionable work agenda items (SC Chairs --> Program). The NOSB is interested in collaborating more with the program as they (the NOSB) are developing proposals to make sure recommendations are actionable. The Chair asked for open dialogue between the NOP and NOSB to identify possible barriers to implementation. They are looking to improve the success rate and to respect the Board members and community's time. The group discussed challenges and the NOP expressed its commitment to continue engaging in open, direct, transparent conversations.
- **NOP news and update (JT/EH)**
 - Response to question from Board on NOP actions regarding seed guidance (NOP 5029). The NOP has no plans for more updates to the guidance at this time. The program recently published training to help certifiers and producers better understand the regulatory requirements that already exist in this area.
 - The Organic Seed Alliance offered to update the NOSB on the third [State of Organic Seed](#) report. NOP and NOSB Officers will determine if there is time on the Spring agenda for an update. Both NOP and the NOSB feel it is valuable to get the information out to certifiers and the community.
 - Federal Register updates, Rules, and Notices:
 - Fall 2019 NOSB recommendations (fatty alcohols, potassium hypochlorite, and dairy cultures) final rule is in clearance
 - A proposed rule with the Fall 2020 and Spring 2021 NOSB recommendations including paper pots and low-acyl gellan gum, is in clearance and are under review by the Office of Budget and Program Analysis (OBPA).
 - Origin of Livestock (OOL) Final Rule is under review by the Office of Management and Budget (OMB).
 - Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE). Under review by the Office of General Counsel (OGC).
 - Organic Livestock and Poultry Standards (OLPS). Proposed Rule under review at OMB
 - Inerts Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). Currently under revision in NOP based on feedback from OGC and the EPA. It will be returned to OGC after edits are completed.
 - Spring 2022 NOSB Meeting Federal Register Notice (FRN). Sent to OGC in the Fall, and is under review.
 - New member training. The NOP is updating the training slides to add tools to help with writing recommendations. The training is tentatively scheduled for early March.
 - NOSB nominations update. The nomination package is in the final stages of clearance and NOP hopes to be able to announce the new appointments soon. There will be a gap between the current members terms ending and the new members terms beginning.
 - Spring 2022 NOSB meeting update. The notice announcing the Spring 2022 meeting is in clearance at OGC. The Department is monitoring a number of other meetings to gauge whether or not they are being held in person or virtually, and will also look to NOSB members to determine comfort levels about traveling. The hotel reservation cutoff date is April 4, which would be the latest possible time to decide.

- Support for the NOSB (CACS work agenda item on capital management). The NOP drafted a description of what a technical support team could do based on Board discussions to date. Given questions about whether there are any external organizations that could objectively provide and administratively support this service, there has been some useful discussion about whether there should be a call for applications, or whether the support should come from an independent team in USDA such as the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA). The CACS will add questions to the document to solicit feedback from stakeholders.
- **Advisory Board Specialist (ABS) update - MA**
 - Sunset list and templates for 2025 sunsets. The NOP is finalizing the new lists and templates and will send them to the Subcommittees soon.
- **Subcommittee Reports/Updates (5 minutes each)**
 - Crops (CS) (RG). Crops met today and completed several proposals and sunset reviews for the Spring meeting. The CS has just a couple more sunset reviews to complete for the Spring NOSB meeting.
 - Handling (HS) (KS). Handling has completed most of its work for the Spring meeting and has a couple more calls before the deadline. Today the HS discussed two petitioned materials and has one more in the queue.
 - Materials/GMO ad hoc (MS/GMO) (WT)
 - Distilled tall oil in light of inerts review. The Chair summarized the lingering issues with reviewing substances without clarity about inerts. NOP is working in parallel on inerts, and the Board is interested in NOP's input about how best to move forward at this time.
 - Research Priorities (RPs). The SM Chair echoed the NOSB Chairs comments about the RPs and would like to hear an update on the status; i.e., which ones are being worked on, which ones are completed, etc.
 - Policy Development (PDS) (MJ). PDS members are working on exit interviews with the three outgoing members. Additionally, the PDS is working on a minor edit to the PPM to align the guidance from oral and written comments.
 - Livestock (LS) (KH). Livestock met today and discussed research priorities. The LS sought to improve the current list by rescoping a priority that was too broad, and by refining others. The LS has only one sunset review to complete for the Spring meeting.
 - Compliance, Accreditation, & Certification (CACS) (ADB). CACS added an extra call in late January to complete their agenda items for the Spring meeting. The CACS should have three documents ready for the Spring meeting: Supply Chain Verification, NOSB technical support, and review of the NOPs risk management table. The CACS also requested an addition to its work agenda to build upon the climate change letter. NOP indicated that they have drafted a framing document to aid them in this endeavor and will send it to the CACS soon.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous ES Notes](#)

Future call schedule (3rd Tuesday 4:00 PM ET | 1:00 PM PT, except where noted)

December 21, 2021

January 18, 2022

February 15, 2022 - Last call before proposal deadline

March 1, 2022

March 15, 2022

April 19, 2022

May 17, 2022
 June 21, 2022
 July 19, 2022
 August 16, 2022
 September 20, 2022
 October 18, 2022
 November 15, 2022
 December 20, 2022

[NOSB Work Agenda](#)

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 19 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022