

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, March 19, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kyla Smith - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review February 13, 2024 notes
- 2027 sunsets - leads and schedule
- Ferric phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 13, 2024 notes** were approved via email prior to this call.
- **Update on CS work:** The Crops Vice Chair updated the group about various items as they prepare for the Spring meeting. There are 14 sunsets for the Spring meeting, in addition to one proposal on carbon dioxide and a discussion document on compost. The CS is hosting a panel on compost. The Chair/Vice Chair has worked on the Crops schedule for the coming year, including 2027 sunsets.
- **2027 sunsets - leads and schedule.**
 - The Food Technologists were asked to support the NOSB by reviewing the lists for any potential annotation changes.
 - Technical Reports: The NOSB Chair reminded members to include specific questions when requesting a limited scope TR. She also asked that members rank the need for TRs, as the Board will have the capacity for approximately 15 full TRs. All TR determinations should be completed by May 21, which means the Subcommittees have about 3 meetings to discuss.
 - The sunset templates (2027) will be sent to the Subcommittees by August.
- **Ferric phosphate (BC) - TR sufficiency.** The TR was found insufficient at this time and will seek additional information before proceeding. The lead summarized the technical report and noted several outstanding questions regarding data about concentrations and toxicity to earthworms. The group discussed the best way to relay the questions to the NOP so they can communicate them to the TR writers.
- **Compost panel update.** The Crops Subcommittee invited four individuals, and one of them was unable to participate, so the CS discussed a possible replacement who has expertise in compost manufacturing.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

February 13, 2024

Compost (MJ) - discuss/vote

February 20, 2024 - cancelled

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024
 April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 2.13.23	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	--------------------	----------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 2.9.24. Sufficiency due 4.9.24. CS sent additional questions to the contractor 3.19.24	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “

				TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23		
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Potassium hypochlorite	205.601(a)(2)(iv)	FQ		Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371		Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Soap-based algicide/demosers	205.601(a)(7)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2015 (Soap-Based Algicide/Demosers) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.601(e)(1)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Soaps, insecticidal	205.601(e)(8)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1994 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Sucrose octanoate esters	205.601(e)(10)	FQ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2005 2018/Fall - Rec to REMOVE 02/28/2022 87 FR 10930		“ “
Vitamin D3	205.601(g)	ADB		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Aquatic plant extracts	205.601(j)(1)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 2005 TR: 2006 TR: 2016 (Marine plants & algae) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Lignin sulfonate	205.601(j)(4)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 TR: 2020 (Lignins) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Fatty alcohols (C6, C8, C10, and/or C12)	205.601(k)(2)	BC		Sunset date: 04/22/2027 TR: 2016 (C8, C10) 2019/Fall - Rec to ADD 03/23/2022 87 FR 16371		“ “

Sodium silicate	205.601(l)	MJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 TR: 2011 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
EPA List 4 Inerts	205.601(m)(1)	BC/N L		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Nonylphenol ethoxylates) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Paper – (o) Production aids. (2) Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in § 205.2 . Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks.	205.601(o)(2)	WT		Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TAP: 1995 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2006 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2017 (Newspaper, recycled paper) TR: 2019 (Paper-based crop planting aids) 2021/Spring - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021		“ “
Arsenic	205.602(b)	JD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “
Strychnine	205.602(i)	MJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, February 13, 2024 12:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review February 6, 2024 notes
- Compost (MJ). Discuss vote on discussion document
- Research Priorities (BC/All)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 6, 2024 notes** were accepted with minor changes.
- **Compost (MJ).** The group reviewed the draft document and made some minor changes for clarity. The CS moved to a vote.

Motion to accept the discussion document on compost

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The group reviewed the current list of Crop's priorities and ongoing research. The lead will finalize the list and send it to the Materials Subcommittee, who will compile the entire document for the Spring 2024 NOSB meeting.
- **Additional Items.** The group discussed the addition of a panelist for the compost panel, from either academia or government (State or Federal). The leads will discuss this further and will report back to the Crops Subcommittee.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote

2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review

Compost (MJ) - discuss

Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 13, 2024

Compost (MJ) - discuss/vote

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024
 April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 2.13.23	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	--------------------	----------------

Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “

Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, February 6, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 23, 2024 notes
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 23, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Carbon Dioxide (LP).** The lead summarized the review, highlighting modifications she made since the last discussion, and asked for additional feedback. Members suggested questions for stakeholders and moved to a vote. The lead will submit the proposal to the NOP for posting to the Spring meeting docket.

Motion to classify carbon dioxide as synthetic

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Motion to add carbon dioxide at 205.601(j)

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB).** The lead highlighted the modifications in the draft review and members agreed to the proposed changes. The lead will complete the review and submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC).** The lead reviewer noted that there was an error in the previous sunset review referring to a 2018 TR that does not exist, and indicated that they are currently waiting for a new TR that will address some of the same outstanding questions. The lead will complete the document and submit it to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The lead is seeking feedback from Subcommittee members and will complete the document and send it the Materials Subcommittee for discussion and vote on the February 13 call.
- **Compost (MJ).** The lead presented the draft document, highlighting changes made in this iteration, as well as lingering questions. The group discussed various aspects, made some additional modifications, and the lead will finalize the document so the Subcommittee can vote on the next call, which was added on Tuesday, February 13.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 23, 2024

- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review
- Compost (MJ) - discuss
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 13, 2024

- Compost (MJ) - discuss/vote

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24 2.13.23	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “

				2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024		
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1

Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, January 23, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 16, 2024 notes
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - update
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 16, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All).** One of the co-leads updated the group about the compost panel. The CS would like to invite 3 individuals, and will submit the list to the NOP for consideration. The list includes: a person with organic-specific regulatory expertise; a person with extensive knowledge and expertise with regulations, the compost council, and the compost industry writ large; and a person with expertise in food safety compliance, and composting at a breadth of different facilities (food waste, yard waste, etc.). A member shared a link to an upcoming compost conference being held February 6-9, 2024, and noted that one of the potential panelists will be speaking <https://compostconference.com/featured-speakers/>. The group supported the suggestions, and the leads will forward the to the NOP for approval.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT).** The lead summarized the draft review, commenting that hydrogen peroxide is widely used and common. It's used in post-harvest handling, and has no long-term impacts on environment based on its break-down products. The substance is fundamental and has consistently been relisted every 5 years. The CS will submit the review to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Pheromones (FQ).** The lead introduced the substance, including uses, manufacture, and environmental issues. He also noted that pheromones contain ancillary substances, and that contact with the substance is minimal, as they are used in traps or ties. Two members added that pheromones are critical to fruit growers in the NW and NE, and without them the industry would not exist. The group discussed kairomones vs. pheromones, which was also discussed as part of the review of the pear ester petition. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (FQ).** The lead noted the uses for magnesium sulfate, as well as manufacture, international acceptance and human health concerns. The lead will make some modifications based on feedback from members and submit the review for the fall meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The lead asked that members send suggestions for the research priorities, and he will incorporate them into the document and the CS will complete the review on the Feb 6 call.

- **Additional Items.** Carbon dioxide petition. The lead asked for feedback from members regarding outstanding questions. The group revisited the TR and the petition, and will finalize the document on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 23, 2024

- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR/finalize review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “

				Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024		
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1

Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, January 16, 2024 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair; Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review January 9, 2024 notes
- 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 9, 2024 notes** were accepted with a minor revision.
- **2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP).** The lead summarized the review for ash from manure burning, which is a non-synthetic prohibited substance. There have been two previous petitions seeking annotation changes, neither of which was recommended by the NOSB. The group discussed the larger issue of manure, nitrogen, and carbon dioxide, and drew the distinction between cow and chicken manure. The lead will finalize the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **Carbon Dioxide (LP).** The lead summarized the petition, which was submitted in 2020, seeking to add carbon dioxide to two National List sections. The Board reviewed and approved its use for one section: 205.601(a) - algicide, disinfectant, and sanitizer, and this review focuses on the request to add it to 205.601(j) - As plant or soil amendments. Members discussed various topics, including the Board's commitment to climate smart agriculture, the capture and use of carbon dioxide in greenhouses, necessity, and review of materials/substances for production systems for which there are no standards. Another member urged the group to use definitive language and to keep in mind the role of organic in mitigating climate change. The lead will augment the discussion in the review regarding CO₂-use efficiency. The lead also added that as written, the petition does not restrict use to greenhouses, so theoretically it could be used in an open field. Members discussed the TR, which was focused on greenhouse use. The CS will vote on the proposal on the February 6 call.
- **Research Priorities (BC/All).** The lead suggested each member consider the current list of research priorities and propose additions, deletions, and priorities. A member suggested that because some of the current priorities are foundational it might make sense to consolidate them into a broader topic. Also, other topics feel more pressing/acute, and perhaps easier to answer, and so those could be elevated to the priority list. A member mentioned the need to clarify the term "pest" since pathogens are also pests. The group talked specifically about weed management, carbon sequestration, and trials for pesticides that are already in use in certain regions as three important topics.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous CS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

January 9, 2024 - Additional call (12:00 ET/9:00 AM PT)
 Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 16, 2024
 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
 Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal
 Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 23, 2024
 Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due
 Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR
 Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	Spr 2024
Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “

Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Crops Subcommittee (CS) Notes **Tuesday, January 9, 2024 12:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Wood Turner (WT); Jerry D’Amore (JD); Nate Lewis (NL); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Kyla Smith (KS) - observer

Absent: Javier Zamora (JZ); Amy Bruch (ADB), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review December 19, 2023 notes
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 19, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All).** The leads introduced the discussion document on compost, highlighting that compost is foundational for organic agriculture and is imprinted across the Organic Regulations. And noted that it is important to waste reduction and climate change. The standards are several decades old, and need to be updated. The CS would like to focus on updates to address contamination, such as pesticides, pathogens, plastic, and heavy metals. In addition to the work initiated by the Crops Subcommittee, the NOP forwarded a petition asking that the regulations be changed to include compostable plastic as compost feedstock.
The group discussed the scope of the document and the role of the NOSB. Topics of discussion included: Organic compost as a commodity; audience (consumers of compost, and consumers of products grown with compost); labeling; evaluation for compost; composting/sorting facilities; the issue of post-consumer food waste; and contamination issues, such as fruit stickers. A member mentioned a push in industry to put stickers on clamshells, and not directly on produce. Even if the stickers were compostable, the adhesive is the real issue. The need for stickers arose because organic food is not getting rung up at the point of sale correctly, and producers are losing revenue. A member noted that the regulations say “plant and animal material” allowed, and asked if the CS should address this?
As for sorting facilities, a member added that while it can be expensive, they do invest in sorting and picking, because customers expect a product with little contamination. Several members shared thoughts about this project. One member opposes the use of compost as a means to address plastic waste. Another member asked how far back in the process should the NOSB look when talking about compost. The group agreed that continuous improvement is the best pathway, with the acknowledgment that it’s not perfect.
- **Compost Panel Ideas.** The CS plans on hosting a compost panel at the Spring 2024 meeting. The members suggested a 3-member panel, and discussed ideas for possible panelists. Perhaps a staff member from Organic Materials Review Institute (OMRI) to talk about how compost is currently evaluated; a representative from the compost industry (either someone who composts themselves or advises composters); and an expert on testing/tests that are available on compost quality. A member suggested adding someone on the user side, who is an expert in soil fertility. The group will discuss this further and hope to have a list of potential invitees to finalize on the February 6 Crops call. The NOSB Chair suggested reaching out to someone from the Midwest Organic Services Association (MOSA) for suggestions for someone local, given that the Spring meeting is being held in Wisconsin. A member added that the University in Wisconsin could be a good source.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous CS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 2:00 PM ET | 11:00 AM PT, except where noted)

December 19, 2023

- 2026 Sunset: Oils, horticultural (BC) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 9, 2024 - Additional call (12:00 ET/9:00 AM PT)

- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss

January 16, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Ash from manure burning (LP) - discuss review
- Carbon Dioxide (LP) - discuss proposal/vote
- Compost discussion document and panel (MJ/NL/All) - discuss/vote
- Research Priorities (BC/All) - discuss/finalize

January 23, 2024

- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen peroxide (WT) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Pheromones (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (MJ/FQ) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Hydrogen chloride (ADB) - finalize review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals due

- 2026 Sunset: Ferric phosphate (BC) - discuss TR

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Carbon Dioxide 205.601(j)	LP	Proposal	2006 TR (Handling) Petition sent to CS 01.15.21. Petition suff/TR request due 03.16.21. CS found the petition sufficient 03.2.21 and will not request a TR. Returned to CS for additional work at Fall 2021 NOSB meeting. The CS requested a full TR 2.9.23. Due to NOP late June. Draft TR sent to CS 6.22.23 for preview. Sufficiency due 8.21.23. TR found sufficient 7.18.23	7.18.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

Pear Ester add to 205.601	FQ	TBD	Petition sent to CS 10.05.23. Petition suff/TR request due 12.04.23. Petition found sufficient/CS requested TR 11.21.23.	11.7.23 11.21.23	TBD
---------------------------	----	-----	--	---------------------	-----

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Compost discussion doc/ Compost panel	MJ/NL	NOP memo sent to NOSB October 11, 2023	11.21.23 12.19.23 1.9.24 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Research Priorities	BC	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.19.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (BBMF)	TBD	Previous NOSB work (2012 – 2021) NOP memo sent to NOSB September 8, 2023. Crops will not work on this at this time. On hold.	9.19.23 10.3.23	TBD

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Hydrogen peroxide	205.601(a)(4), and 205.601(i)(5)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Soaps, ammonium	205.601(d)	ADB	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Ammonium Soaps) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Oils, horticultural	205.601(e)(7), and 205.601(i)(7)	BC	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 (Horticultural Narrow Range Oils) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.19.23	“ “
Pheromones	205.601(f)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2012 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “

Ferric phosphate	205.601(h)(1)	BC	Y - L'mtd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 TR: 2012 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Jan 2024	3.21.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium bicarbonate	205.601(i)(9)	JD	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 12.5.23	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.601(j)(6)	FQ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen chloride	205.601(n)	ADB	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 Lmt'd Scope 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR sent to CS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	3.21.23 12.5.23 1.23.24	“ “
Ash from manure burning	205.602(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2021 (Biochar from manure) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 1.16.24	“ “
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined)	205.602(g)	MJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew Sunset renewal: 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 11.21.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5

NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting